THE

BENGAL LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

PROCEEDINGS.

(Official Report.)

FOURTH SESSION.

1921.

VOLUME IV.

(August 29th to September 6th, 1921.)

CALCUTTA:
Bengal Secretariat Book Depôt.
1921.

GOVERNMENT OF BENGAL.

GOVERNOR OF BENGAL.

His Excellency the Right Hon'ble LAWRENCE JOHN LUMLEY DUNDAS, Earl of Ronaldshay, G.C.I.E.

MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER, K.C.S.I., K.C.I.E., C.S.I., Vice-President, in charge of the following portfolios:—

1. Appointment.
2. Political.
3. Police.
4. Ecclesiastical.
5. European Education.

The Hon'ble Sir BIJAY CHAND MAHTAB, K.C.S.I., K.C.I.E., I.O.M., Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan in charge of the following portfolios:—

1. Land Revenue.
2. Land Acquisition.
3. Forests.
4. Irrigation.
5. Excluded areas.

The Hon'ble Mr. J. H. KERR, C.S.I., C.I.E., in charge of the following portfolios:—

1. Finance.
2. Separate Revenue.
3. Commerce and reserved Industrial subjects.
4. Marine.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM, Kt., in charge of the following portfolios:—

1. Judicial.
2. Jails.
3. Emigration.
4. Immigration.
5. Jurisdiction.

MINISTERS.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA, Kt., in charge of the following portfolios:—

Local Self-Government and Public Health.

The Hon'ble Mr. PROVASH CHUNDER MITTER, C.I.E., in charge of the following portfolio:—

Education.

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur, C.I.E., in charge of the following portfolios:—

Agriculture and Public Works.

PRINCIPAL OFFICERS OF THE BENGAL LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

PRESIDENT.

The Hon'ble Nawab Sir SYED SHAMS-UL-HUDA, K.C.I.E.

DEPUTY-PRESIDENT.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY.

Secretary to the Council—C. TINDALL, C.I.E., I.C.S. (services placed temporarily at the disposal of the Government of India, Legislative Department, 29th April 1921). A. M. HUTCHISON (offg.).

Assistant Secretary to the Council—K. N. MAZUMDAR (offg.).

Registrar to the Council—J. W. McKAY.

C

Carey, Mr. W. L. (Indian Mining Association.)
Cathcart, Mr. M. [Dacca and Chittagong (European).]
Chakrabarti, Babu Rasik Chandra. [Noakhali (Non-Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, Babu Kishori Mohan. [Rajshahi (Non-Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, Babu Tankanath. [Dinajpur (Non-Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Hafizar Rahman. [Bogra (Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad. [Malda *cum* Jalpaiguri (Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath. [24-Parganas Rural North (Non-Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, Sir Ashutosh. [Bogra *cum* Pabna (Non-Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur. [Minister, Mymensingh East (Muhammadan).]
Cochran, Mr. A. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
Cohen, Mr. D. J. [Calcutta South Central (Non-Muhammadan).]
Currie, Mr. W. C. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce).

D

Das, Babu Bhishmadev. (Nominated Non-official—Depressed Classes.)
Das, Mr. S. R. [Calcutta North-West (Non-Muhammadan).]
Das, Rai Bahadur Amar Nath. (Nominated Official).
Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra. [Bakarganj North (Non-Muhammadan).]
De, Babu Fanindralal. [Hooghly *cum* Howrah Rural (Non-Muhammadan).]
Dey, Mr. G. G. (Nominated Official.)
Donald, Mr. J. (Nominated Offical.)
Doss, Rai Bahadur Pyari Lal. [Dacca City (Non-Muhammadan).]
Dutt, Mr. Ajoy Chunder. [Bankura East (Non-Muhammadan).]
Dutt, Rai Bahadur Dr. Haridhan. [Calcutta North Central (Non-Muhammadan).]
Dutta, Babu Annada Charan. [Chittagong (Non-Muhammadan).]
Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan. [Tippera (Non-Muhammadan).]

F

Faroqui, Mr. K. G. M. [Tippera (Muhammadan).]
Forrester, Mr. J. Campbell. [Presidency and Burdwan (European).]
French, Mr. F. C. (Nominated Official.)

G

Ghatak, Rai Sahib Nilmani. [Malda (Non-Muhammadan).]
Ghose, Mr. D. C. [24-Parganas Rural South (Non-Muhammadan).]
Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder. (Calcutta University).
Gordon, Mr. A. D. (Indian Tea Association).
Gupta, Mr. N. B. (Nominated Official).

H

Haq, Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul. [Khulna (Muhammadan).]
Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul. [Tippera (Muhammadan).]
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S. (Nominated Official.)
Huq, Maulvi Ekramul. [Murshidabad (Muhammadan).]
Hussain, Maulvi Md. Madassur. [Burdwan Division North (Muhammadan).]

J

James, Mr. R. H. L. Langford. (Indian Jute Mills Association.)
Janah, Babu Sarat Chandra. [Midnapore South (Non-Muhammadan).]

K

Karim, Maulvi Abdul. [Faridpur North (Muhammadan).]
Karim, Maulvi Fazlal. [Bakarganj South (Muhammadan).]
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H. (Member, Executive Council.)
Khan, Babu Debendra Lal. [Midnapore North (Non-Muhammadan).]
Khan, Maulvi Hamid-ud-din. [Rangpur East (Muhammadan).]
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin. [Mymensingh East (Muhammadan).]
Khan, Mr. Razaur Rahman. [Calcutta North (Muhhammadan).]
Khan Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Md. Ershad Ali. [Rajshahi North (Muhammadan).]

L

Lang, Mr. J. (Nominated Official.)
Larmour, Mr. F. A. (Calcutta Trades Association.)
Law, Raja Reshee Case. (Bengal National Chamber of Commerce.)

M

Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble. (Member, Executive Council.)
Makramali, Munshi. [Noakhali (Muhammadan).]
Marr, Mr. A. (Nominated Official.)
McKenzie, Mr. D. P. (Indian Jute Mills Association.)

Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra. [Hooghly Municipal (Non-Muhammadan).]
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. Provash Chunder. (Minister, Presidency Landholders.)
Moitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath. [Faridpur North (Non-Muhammadan).]
Morgan, Mr. G. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
Mukharji, Babu Satish Chandra [Hooghly *cum* Howrah Rural (Non-Muhammadan.)]
Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhon. [Howrah Municipalities (Non-Muhammadan.)]
Mukherji, Professor S. C. (Nominated Non-Official—The Indian Christian Community.)
Mukhopadhaya, Babu Sarat Chandra. [Midnapore South (Non-Muhammadan.)]
Mullick, Babu Nirode Behary. [Bakarganj South (Non-Muhammadan.)]
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath. [Calcutta South (Non-Muhammadan).]

N

Nakey, Mirza Muhammad Ali. [24-Parganas Municipal South (Muhammadan).]
Nasker, Babu Hem Chandra. [24-Parganas Rural Central (Non-Muhammadan).]

P

Pahlowan, Maulvi Md. Abdul Jubbar. [Mymensingh West (Muhammadan).]
Pal, Rai Bahadur Radha Charan. [Calcutta East (Non-Muhammadan).]
Payne, Mr. C. F. (Nominated Official.)
Poddar, Babu Keshoram. (Bengal Marwari Association.)
Pugh, Colonel A. J. [Presidency and Burdwan (European).]

R

Rae, Mr. W. R. [Presidency and Burdwan (European).]
Raheem, Mr. Abdur. (Nominated Non-Official.)
Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Ad-ur. (Member, Executive Council.)
Raikat, Mr. Prasanna Deb. [Jalpaiguri (Non-Muhammadan).]
Rauf, Maulvi Shah Abdur. [Rangpur West (Muhammadan).]
Ray, Babu Bhabendra Chandra. [Jessore North (Non-Muhammadan).]
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath. [Deputy President, 24-Parganas Municipal South (Non-Muhammadan).]

Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar. (Rajshahi Landholders.)
Ray, Rai Bahadur Upendra Lal. (Chittagong Landholders.)
Ray Chaudhuri, Babu Brojendra Kishor. (Dacca Landholders.)
Ray Chaudhuri, Mr. Krishna Chandra. (Nominated Non-Official Labouring Classes.)
Ray Choudhury, Raja Manmatha Nath. [Mymensingh West (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Babu Bijoy Prosad Singh. [Burdwan (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Babu Jogendra Krishna. [Faridpur South (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Babu Jogendra Nath. [Dacca Rural (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Babu Nalini Nath. [Jessore South (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra. [Nadia (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Mr. J. E. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
Roy, Mr. Tarit Bhusan. (Bengal Mahajan Sabha.)
Roy, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh. (Burdwan Landholders.)
Roy, Raja Maniloll Singh. [Burdwan (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Sailaja Nath. [Khulna (Non-Muhammadan).]

S

Salam, Khan Bahadur Abdus. [Jessore North (Muhammadan).]
Sarkar, Babu Jogesh Chandra. [Rangpur (Non-Muhammadan).]
Sarkar, Babu Rishindra Nath. [Bankura West (Non-Muhammadan).]
Sinha, Babu Surendra Narayan. [Murshidabad (Non-Muhammadan).]
Stark, Mr. H. A. (Anglo-Indian.)
Suhrawardy, Dr. A. [Dacca West Rural (Muhammadan).]
Suhrawardy, Dr. Hassan. [Hooghly *cum* Howrah Municipal (Muhammadan).]
Suhrawardy, Mr. H. S. [Burdwan Division South (Muhammadan).]
Swan Mr. J. A. L. (Nominated Official.)

T

Travers, Mr. W. L. [Rajshahi (European).]

W

Watson-Smyth, Mr. R. M. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry. (Member, Executive Council.)
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C. (Nominated Official.)

THE BENGAL LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL PROCEEDINGS.

(Official Report of the Fourth Session.)

VOLUME IV.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Monday, the 29th August, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers and 101 nominated and elected Members.

Oaths.

The following members took an oath of allegiance to the Crown:—

Mr. F. C. FRENCH.

Mr. E. E. BISS.

The PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): Gentlemen, in accordance with the provisions of rule 3 of the Bengal Legislative Council Rules, I nominate the following members of the Council to form a panel of four chairmen for the ensuing session, namely,

Sir Asutosh Chaudhuri,

Mr. R. M. Watson-Smyth,

Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur, and

Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul Haq.

Unless otherwise arranged, the senior member amongst them present, in the above order, will preside over the deliberations of the Council in the absence of the President and the Deputy President.

Starred Questions

(to which oral answers were given).

Calcutta University Budget.

*I. **Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU:** (*a*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education been drawn to the fact that the budget of the University of Calcutta is placed before the Senate several months after the commencement of the financial year?

(*b*) What steps are being taken to ensure a more regular procedure?

(*c*) Is it a fact that in November or December, 1920, the University of Calcutta pledged with the Bank of Bengal Government Treasury Bills of the value of rupees two lakhs held in deposit in a Special Fund as security against overdrafts?

(*d*) Has the University authority to borrow money on the security of the Treasury Bills appertaining to the Special Fund?

(*e*) If not, what action are the Government taking in the matter to prevent such dealings on the part of the University in future?

(*f*) Was the borrowing of money by the University on the security of the above Treasury Bills done with the previous sanction of the Senate?

(*g*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to lay on the table the resolutions, if any, of the Senate and Syndicate of the University in the matter?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter): (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) None.

(*c*), (*d*), (*f*) and (*g*) The member is referred to the published proceedings of the University and to the statement laid on the library table at this meeting supplementing the answer to unstarred question No. 188, which was asked at the meeting of this Council on the 4th July, 1921.

(*e*) The question does not arise.

Civil and Military Assistant Surgeons.

*II. **Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state the number of appointments of Civil Surgeons specially reserved for the Civil Assistant Surgeons and Military Assistant Surgeons?

(*b*) Are the Civil and Military Assistant Surgeons, having special knowledge in different branches of tropical medicine, eligible for appointment as professors in the School of Tropical Medicine?

(*c*) If so, will they be entitled to the same emoluments and privileges as other professors there?

(*d*) Is it a fact that the designation of service of Assistant Surgeons has been recently changed from "Subordinate Medical Service" to "Bengal Medical Service (Upper)"?

(*e*) Does the Government intend to mean by this change of name that it is a provincial medical service on the same footing as other provincial services?

(*f*) Will the officers of the Bengal Medical Service (Upper) be still styled as "Assistant Surgeons" or simply as "Dr. X.Y.Z., Bengal Medical Service (Upper)," as recommended by the Public Service Commission?

(*g*) Is there any difference in the allowance granted to Civil and Military Assistant Surgeons while serving as Medical Officers on the Eastern Bengal Railway?

(*h*) Is it a fact that the Civil Assistant Surgeons so appointed are allowed free railway passes in the second class, and the Military Assistant Surgeons are allowed free railway passes in the first class, and, if so, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the reasons for this preferential treatment?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of Local SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): (*a*) The number is 7 for Civil Assistant Surgeons and 5 for Military Assistant Surgeons.

(*b*) and (*c*) The question of the appointment of professors is under the consideration of the Government of India, and this Government is not at present in a position to make a statement.

(*d*) and (*e*) Yes.

(*f*) Officers of the service will be entitled to affix the designation "Bengal Medical Service (Upper)" to their names and to prefix the designation of "Doctor" if they are entitled to it either by right or courtesy.

(*g*) No special allowance is granted on account of railway duties. They receive pay and allowances in virtue of their rank or class.

(*h*) Second class free passes over home and foreign railways are given to all Military and Civil Assistant Surgeons, with the exception that Military Assistant Surgeons who hold commissioned rank are allowed the privilege of first class passes over a home railway only.

Record-suppliers.

*III. **Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether any distinction was introduced in the year 1919 under the provisions of article 396 of the Civil Service Regulations by classifying the service of the record-suppliers in the Secretariat as "superior service;" and

(*ii*) whether an *ad-interim* allowance of 30 per cent. was given to them, and not war allowance, which was given to the menials?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of FINANCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): (*i*) The record suppliers of the Bengal Secretariat were transferred from inferior to superior service on the 29th July, 1919.

(*ii*) War allowance was given to them up to 31st March, 1920, subsequent to which they received *ad-interim* allowance at 30 per cent.

Diet allowance in Medical College Hospital.

*IV. **Mr. SYED ERFAN ALI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state the amount of daily diet allowance per head for—

(*i*) Indian;

(*ii*) Anglo-Indian; and

(*iii*) European patients

in the Medical College Hospital?

(*b*) Are Indian patients admitted into the Presidency General Hospital? If not, why not?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) 8 annas for Indians and Re. 1 for Europeans and Anglo-Indians.

(*b*) The admission of patients is governed by rule 67 of the Rules for the Management of the Hospital, which is as follows: "The Hospital is intended for the treatment of Europeans, but other cases may be admitted under the orders of the Superintendent, if of extreme urgency."

Subordinate staff of the Sundarbans area of the Irrigation Department.

*V. **Babu FANINDRALAL DE:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state the numbers of subordinate officers employed in the Sundarbans area of the Department?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of increasing the present staff to cope with the work of the continuous inspection of the rivers in these areas?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of IRRIGATION (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (*a*) There are no Irrigation Department subordinates who are exclusively employed on Irrigation Department work in the Sundarbans. When urgent occasions arise, subordinates are specially deputed temporarily.

(*b*) No.

Rajbansis of Rangpur.

***VI. Babu JOGESH CHANDRA SARKAR:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state the number of Kshatriyas (Rajbansis) in the district of Rangpur, and also how many of them are now in the employment of Government as judicial, executive or ministerial officers?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the number of soldiers contributed by the above community to the Bengali Regiment during the war, and how many discharged soldiers among this community have been given suitable employment under the Government?

MEMBER in charge of APPOINTMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) The Rajbansis in the Rangpur district number 477,121. There are no members of this class employed in the judicial or the executive service. In the Rangpur district three are employed as ministerial officers and ten as police constables. The number employed outside the Rangpur district has not been ascertained.

(*b*) The number of recruits enrolled in the Bengali Regiment from the above community in the district of Rangpur is reported to have been 69. Information as to the number who received employment under Government is not on record.

Well irrigation.

***VII. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY, Bahadur:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state whether the Government are considering the desirability of making an experiment with well irrigation in those parts of Bengal where canal or tank irrigation is impossible?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether the tube-well has been tried for irrigation purposes in Bengal?

(*c*) If the answer to (*b*) is in the negative, are the Government considering the desirability of experimenting in this direction in Bengal?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR BURDWAN: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) The answer is in the negative.

Committee on Public Accounts and next year's Budget.

*VIII. **Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether he intends to consult the Standing Committee on Public Accounts in preparing the next budget?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: The functions of the Committee on Public Accounts, as laid down in the Devolution Rules and in the Bengal Legislative Council Rules and Standing Orders, are concerned purely with expenditure and have nothing to do with the preparation of the budget. Government do not, therefore, propose to take the action suggested in the question.

Committee on Budget estimates.

*IX. **Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state if it is the intention of the Government to constitute a Finance Committee, consisting of some non-official and official members of the Council, for the purpose of assisting and advising Government in the preparation of the budget estimates?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: Government have no present intention of adopting the course suggested in the question, but the procedure to be followed in framing next year's budget has not yet been settled.

Railway station between Tarakeswar and Bahirkhund.

*X. **Raja MANILOLL SINGH ROY:** (a) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works aware of the great inconvenience to the public owing to there being no railway station between the stations Bahirkhund and Tarakeswar?

(b) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the public of that place approached the railway authorities in this matter, but owing to the great war, the scheme was dropped for the time, though it was sanctioned?

(c) Are the Government considering the desirability of moving the Railway Board to make necessary arrangements for the establishment of a railway station by the name of "Baligore" at an early date?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of PUBLIC WORKS (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (a) The question of inconvenience to the public has not been brought to the notice of Government.

(b) Yes. The proposal was dropped in 1915 for want of funds.

(c) The prospects of goods and passenger traffic do not warrant the immediate provision of a new station; and Government do not therefore consider that they would be justified in moving the Railway Board in the matter.

Separation of Judicial and Executive services.

*XI. **Mr. AJOY CHUNDER DUTT:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state what steps, if any, have been taken to give effect to the resolution of this Council regarding the separation of judicial and executive services and functions?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: A copy of the resolution indicating the action proposed to be taken by Government in this matter is laid on the table.

Resolution referred to in the reply to starred question No. XI.

GOVERNMENT OF BENGAL.

Appointment Department.

CALCUTTA, THE 19TH AUGUST, 1921.

RESOLUTION—No. 6287A.

THE Governor in Council has had under consideration the action to be taken on the following resolution which was carried at the meeting of the Bengal Legislative Council held on the 5th April 1921 :—

"This Council recommends to the Government that early steps be taken for the total separation of the judicial from the executive functions in the administration of this Presidency."

The local Government adhere to the view expressed on their behalf in Council that, as a preliminary step, it is desirable that a committee should be formed to elaborate a practical working scheme for the separation of executive and judicial functions in the administration of Bengal and to report on the cost thereof. Upon receipt of their report it will be possible to decide upon a line of future action with a more definite appreciation of what is actually involved than is at present practicable. The committee which the Governor in Council has decided to appoint for the purpose will be composed as follows:—

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice W. E. Greaves, Bar.-at-Law, *President.*

Mr. F. C. French, C.S.I., I.C.S.

Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri, KT., M.L.C.

Dr. A. Suhrawardy, M.L.C.

Raja Manmatha Nath Ray Choudhury of Santosh, M.L.C.

Mr. G. Morgan, M.L.C.

ORDER.—Ordered that a copy of the resolution be forwarded to the President and each member of the committee for information.

ORDERED also that the resolution be published in the *Calcutta Gazette* for general information.

By order of the Governor in Council,

J. DONALD,

Chief Secretary to the Government of Bengal (Offg.).

Madaripur bil route embankment.

***XII. Babu FANINDRALAL DE:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation aware that a breach has recently occurred in the embankment of the *bil* route in the Faridpur district between Baultali and Olpur?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the breach has caused, and is still causing, extensive damages to the crops on the eastern side of the canal?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the capacity of the improved canal is not sufficient to discharge properly the volume of water coming down from the north, and there is often a difference of level as much as two cubits between the two sides of the embankment, the result being a flooding of the tracts in the north and west of the canal and the destruction of crops on the other side whenever a breach occurs?

(*d*) Is there any arrangement for recording the water levels on the two sides of the embankment?

(*e*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the gates are neither sufficient nor very safe for the country boats?

(*f*) Is there any record of the number of boats capsizing in any year when passing through the gates?

(*g*) Is it a fact that breaches have occurred on several occasions during the last few years?

(*h*) What steps, if any, are the Government taking to mitigate the distress, and the abovementioned inconveniences of the people, and to indemnify them in the affected area?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) Yes, from a surreptitious cut by villagers.

(*b*) No extensive damage is apprehended.

(*c*) The works in connection with the Madaripur channel have not affected the flooding of the tracts to the north and west of the canal to any appreciable extent and do not affect the crops grown there ordinarily or in case of a breach. As regards the loss to crops to the other side of the *bil* in case of a breach, it is very little in each case.

(*d*) Yes; gauges are fixed and observations are recorded.

(*e*) The cross drainage works are considered fairly sufficient and additional waterways will be provided if it is found necessary at any time at particular localities. The locks are safe.

(*f*) No records are maintained and no reports of boats capsizing in the locks have been received.

(*g*) Yes; since the construction of the embankment two cuts have been made previously by villagers and there were extensive breaches in the cyclone of September, 1919.

(*h*) No general question of compensation arises for which action by Government is necessary. As regards individual cases of loss as a result of cuts or breaches the question of compensating will be dealt with by the local officers where the Public Works Department is responsible.

School of Tropical Medicine.

***XIII. Mr. SYED ERFAN ALI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether there are any arrangements for taking in Indians as assistants for research work in the School of Tropical Medicine?

(*b*) If so, how many Indians are working there in such capacity at the present moment?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) There are at present five Indians engaged on research work, three as assistants and two as research scholars.

Subordinate Educational Service.

***XIV. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state the scales of salary for different classes of officers in the improved Subordinate Educational Service, shortly to be introduced?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: Details are being worked out, and it is expected that orders will soon be passed, but Government are not able to give details at present.

Educational Service Scheme.

***XV. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state (*a*) from what date the new scheme regarding the Educational Service will come into effect, and (*b*) if the details of the reconstituted service are likely to be announced before the expiry of September next?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: The scheme is under consideration, its details being worked out, and it is hoped to issue Government orders soon. The date cannot be stated.

Registration Department.

***XVI. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education aware that much hardship is being felt by the members of the several grades of the Registration Department on account of the high prices of the necessaries of life?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state when the reorganisation and improvement of the Department is to be taken in hand?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the proposed scheme for reorganisation before final acceptance will be published in the Gazette, and the officers concerned and the public will be given an opportunity of submitting any representation, if necessary?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether it is a fact that—

(*i*) the District Sub-Registrars will be given an allowance only, and no permanent increment to their pay;

(*ii*) no time-scale increment is going to be allowed to the District Sub-Registrars and that the grade system is being retained; and

(*iii*) the special grades for the District Sub-Registrars are going to be abolished?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) A scheme has been prepared and is now under consideration.

(*c*) It is not proposed to take this course, which would lead to delay in issue of orders.

(*d*) (*i*), (*ii*) and (*iii*) No decision has yet been arrived at by Government.

Light railway from Contai to Contai Road.

***XVII. Babu BIJOY PROSAD SINGH ROY:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state whether the construction of a light railway from Contai to the Bengal-Nagpur Railway station, Contai Road, is in contemplation; if so, when will the scheme be taken up, and by whom?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: The Government of Bengal have no information as to when the construction of the line will be taken up or by whom.

The gauge and the alignment were approved by the Bengal Government in 1918.

Jute lands.

***XVIII. Babu BIJOY PROSAD SINGH ROY:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to say whether he is in a position to give any reasons for the sudden decrease in the area of jute lands in Bengal?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of fixing a minimum price of jute?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of AGRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (*a*) The member is referred to the Director of Agriculture's preliminary forecast of the jute crop in Bengal, 1921, a copy of which is laid on the library table.

(*b*) No.

Imperial and Bengal police services.

***XIX. Babu BIJOY PROSAD SINGH ROY:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state whether the officers of the Imperial Police Service, brought out from the United Kingdom, and who are allotted to Bengal, receive their training at Sarda Police Training College along with the officers of the Provincial Service, and whether there is any distinction in the training of the officers of the two grades of the service?

MEMBER in charge of POLICE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): The reply to the first part of the question is in the affirmative. There is no distinction in the training of the officers of the two grades, except that the deputy superintendents are not required to take the vernacular course; mainly on this account the duration of their course is fourteen months as compared with eighteen in the case of Assistants.

Scheme of local self-government for Darjeeling district.

***XX. Mr. S. M. BOSE:** (*a*) With reference to the speech of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler on the 6th July last in the debate in this Council on resolution No. 27, moved by Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri, will

the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state what are the orders of the Secretary of State for India on which the Government of Bengal propose to take executive action regarding a scheme of local self-government for the Darjeeling district?

(b) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table the correspondence that has passed between the Government of Bengal, the Government of India and the Secretary of State for India, on the subject of the exclusion of the Darjeeling district from the Reforms Scheme?

(c) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to furnish detailed information about the scheme of local self-government that is being worked out by the Government for the Darjeeling district?

(d) Will the above scheme be submitted for suggestion and criticism from the public before being finally adopted?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (a) and (b) Government are not prepared to publish the correspondence. The scheme of local self-government for Darjeeling was initiated by the local Government.

(c) As a detailed scheme has not been worked out it is impossible to give detailed information; it is at present proposed to establish a District Board and Local Boards under the Local Self-Government Act of 1885.

(d) It has not yet been decided whether the scheme will be published for criticism before being finally adopted. If the Local Self-Government Act of 1885 is applied, publication would be unnecessary.

Cinchona plantations.

***XXI. Mr. S. M. BOSE:** (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state whether there is any proposal for the sale or transfer of the cinchona plantations under the Government of Bengal to the Government of India?

(b) If the answer is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table the correspondence that has passed in this matter between the local Government and the Government of India?

(c) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the terms of the proposed transfer of the cinchona plantations to the Government of India?

(d) Are the Government considering the desirability of laying the matter before the Legislative Council and of consulting the opinion of the various public bodies before the local Government sanctions the proposed sale or transfer?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE [Land Revenue (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (*a*) and (*b*) The members is referred to the answers to (*a*) and (*c*) of starred question II asked by Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur at the meeting of the Legislative Council held on the 1st April, 1921.

(*c*) The Government of Bengal made a definite offer to the Government of India in 1919 and the matter is still under correspondence. But an inquiry is being made of the Government of India whether they have any objection to the publication of the proposed terms of transfer.

(*d*) As the matter was fully considered by this Government before the offer was made, it is not proposed to lay it before the Legislative Council.

Inspectors of Bengal Police.

***XXII. Babu FANINDRALAL DE:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department aware that great discontent has been created amongst the inspectors of the Bengal police by the recent announcement regarding their pay?

(*b*) Is it a fact that in the case of the sister services, such as the Subordinate Civil Service and inspectors of excise, the pay of these services has been fixed at a much higher rate than that of the inspectors of police?

(*c*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reasons for this difference in pay?

(*d*) Do the Government propose to reconsider the question of further increment of pay of inspectors of the Bengal police to bring it to the level of the sub-deputy collectors? If not, will the Government be pleased to state their reasons for not doing so?

(*e*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether they are going to extend the privilege already granted to sub-deputy collectors, of treating the latter as gazetted officers to other appointments like inspectors of police?

(*f*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table a copy of the memorial submitted by the inspectors of police for their further increments of pay together with any orders passed thereon?

(*g*) Is it a fact that the European inspectors get a monthly allowance of Rs. 50 which is not given to the Indian officers?

(*h*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reason for this distinction?

(*i*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the present proportion of promotion of inspectors to higher rank (viz., deputy superintendents) in relation to the total cadre of the two respective services?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Government are aware that the recent revision of pay has not given entire satisfaction to the inspectors.

(*b*) and (*c*) The pay of sub-deputy collectors and of inspectors of excise and salt is Rs. 150 rising ultimately to Rs. 400 with a selection grade of 3 per cent. of the cadre on Rs. 450 a month. Inspectors of police receive Rs. 175 rising to Rs. 300. They also get rent-free quarters or an allowance in lieu thereof, and a conveyance allowance, privileges which are not granted to all sub-deputy collectors or inspectors of excise and salt. In other respects, too, the circumstances of these services differ. With the exception of a few court inspectors, police inspectors are not directly recruited but attain that rank by promotion from sub-inspector or sergeant.

(*d*) Government will examine the position.

(*e*) No.

(*f*) A copy dated April, 1920, is placed on the library table.

(*g*) and (*h*) No. The facts are as stated in the answer to question No. 24 at a meeting of the Council on the 27th March, 1919.

(*i*) The present proportion of inspectors promoted to the rank of deputy superintendent is 5·6 per cent.

Unstarred Questions

(answers to which were laid on the table).

Mitford Hospital, Dacca.

1. **Khan Bahadur KHWAJA MOHAMED AZAM:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether there is any prescribed hour for the attendance of the doctors in Dacca Mitford Hospital?

(*b*) If so, are such rules duly observed?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware of a public impression which exists that it is necessary for patients to make payments for treatment in the said hospital?

(*d*) If so, what steps are being taken to remove the impression?

(*e*) Is there any truth in the rumour that it is the practice in the said hospital to settle terms privately before any major operations are performed?

(*f*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware of the fact that the rooms in the paying wards are not available to patients so long as tips and *nazars* are not offered to the staff?

(*g*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware of a public impression which exists that students cannot obtain admission in the Dacca Medical School unless some amounts are spent other than legal fees?

(*h*) Are there any grounds for such an impression?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) It appears from the daily attendance book that they are observed.

(*c*) The answer is in the negative. No complaints have reached Government.

(*d*) This does not arise.

(*e*) Government are not aware of this rumour.

(*f*) No. It is reported that it is not a fact.

(*g*) The answer is in the negative.

(*h*) The school authorities state that the impression has no foundation so far as they are concerned. A selection committee has recently been appointed.

Mitford Hospital, Dacca.

2. Khan Bahadur KHWAJA MOHAMED AZAM: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government aware of the fact that the teachers of the Dacca Mitford Hospital cannot find any time to deliver clinical lectures in the different wards?

(*b*) Is there any truth in the statement that they spend most of their time in private practice?

(*c*) Is there any time fixed for such lectures? If so, how long? And is the rule in this regard duly observed?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) and (*b*) No.

(*c*) The ward attendance hours are from 8-30 to 10-30 A.M. and clinical instruction and operations, etc., are given and performed respectively between these hours. A time-table of other lectures and demonstrations is drawn up and the number held is reported monthly to the Surgeon-General. The session lectures and demonstrations occupy four to five hours daily, except Saturdays, Sundays and holidays.

Mitford Hospital, Dacca.

3. Khan Bahadur KHWAJA MOHAMED AZAM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether the Superintendent of the Dacca Mitford Hospital has any other duties to perform over and above the superintendentship of the Medical School and the Mitford Hospital?

(*b*) Have the Government considered the desirability of making an inquiry to ascertain whether the duties of the Superintendent are too heavy for one man to perform and of taking such action as they think fit to relieve this officer?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) Yes. He is also Civil Surgeon and holds charge of the Lunatic Asylum.

(*b*) There are Deputy Superintendents both at the Mitford Hospital and Medical School to afford relief to the Superintendent. No change is contemplated at present.

Mitford Hospital, Dacca.

4. Khan Bahadur KHWAJA MOHAMED AZAM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state how many Governors there are for the said Mitford Hospital?

(*b*) How often during the last three years have such Governors inspected the said hospital and recorded their remarks in the hospital inspection book?

(*c*) Is there any prescribed period for the transfer of medical officers?

(*d*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware of the fact that there are many in the staff of the said hospital who have been there for about two decades?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) Fifteen.

(*b*) Quarterly meetings are held. Consequently in the last three years about 12 meetings have been held and remarks recorded.

(*c*) Yes. The tenure of appointment of teachers is ordinarily limited to five years and that of resident medical officers to one year.

(*d*) No. None of the staff have occupied their present posts for more than five years.

Dacca Medical School.

5. Khan Bahadur KHWAJA MOHAMED AZAM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to say whether there is any fixed proportion of seats reserved for the Mussalman students in the compounder class of the Dacca Medical School?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of appointing a Muhammadan Assistant Surgeon in the teaching staff of the Dacca Medical School?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the proportionate number of Mussalman students were admitted into the Dacca Medical School last year? If not, why not?

(*d*) Is it a fact that many Mussalman students, matriculates of the first and second division, were refused admission?

(*e*) Is it a fact that many third division Hindu ates were admitted?

(*f*) If in case a sufficient number of Mussalman candidates are available, are the Government prepared to admit them in excess of the allotted proportion reserved for the Mussalmans?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) No.

(*b*) The question will be considered when there is a vacancy.

(*c*) Thirty-one Muhammadans were admitted out of a total of 130. This is one short of 25 per cent., but there was no suitably qualified candidate who had complied with the conditions of admission. Under the rules his place was filled up by a non-Mussalman.

(*d*) No Muhammadan candidate, who had passed the Matriculation Examination in the first division, and who presented himself for admission with complete papers, was refused admission. Several Muhammadan candidates, who had passed in the second division, had to be refused, because the number of such candidates was largely in excess of the number of vacancies. The preliminary selection was made by a Muhammadan member of the school staff and confirmed by the Superintendent.

(*e*) Only three such candidates were admitted.

(*f*) Considering the number of applications from properly qualified Hindu candidates, Government do not consider that it would be fair to reserve more than 25 per cent. of the seats for Muhammadan students.

Dafadars and Chaukidars.

6. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state whether any contribution will be made by the Government for the salaries of the dafadars and chaukidars, as contemplated in section 37 (*a*) of the Bengal Village Self-Government Act, 1919 (Bengal Act V of 1919)? If so, when?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The member is referred to the discussions on the Bengal Village Self-Government Bill, 1919, at pages 750—752 and 803—806 of the Bengal Legislative Council Proceedings, Volume LI, 1919. It was not contemplated by section 37 (*a*) of the Act that Government should be under an obligation to contribute towards the cost of dafadars and chaukidars. The principle that Government should contribute generally was not accepted. The reference in the section to "the contribution, if any, made by the local Government" was inserted in view of the practice in force in one district under which, as an experimental measure, Government has contributed to the pay of dafadars.

Sub-Deputy Collectors.

7. **Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether it is in the contemplation of Government to give promotion to the sub-deputy collectors to the provincial service in consideration of their—

(1) seniority;

(2) competency; and

(3) services rendered?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing, district by district, the number of such officers?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) and (*b*) The member is referred to Government notification No. 1650 A.—D., dated the 31st July, 1913, in which are contained the rules for the recruitment of the Bengal Civil Service. Consistently with these rules, the qualifications referred to by the member are duly considered in making promotions from the subordinate service. No departure from the present procedure is under contemplation. The Civil List shows the distribution of officers as between different districts.

Mortality in Jails.

8. **Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing the number of deaths that have occurred in the jails of the province during the last three years, with the number of Muhammadans shown separately for each jail?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE (JAILS) (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): A statement giving the information is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 8.

JAILS.	Year and total number of deaths.			Year and number of Muhammadan prisoners died.		
	1918.	1919.	1920.	1918	1919.	1920
Burdwan	13	20	15	3	5	6
Suri	4	6	5	3	2	2
Bankura	3	8	4	2	2	1

JAILS.	Year and total number of deaths.			Year and number of Muhammadan prisoners died.		
	1918.	1919.	1920.	1918	1919.	1920.
Midnapore—*District and Central* ...	27	21	22	2	5	7
Hooghly	10	11	20	1	2	3
Howrah	8	6	...	1	...	...
Alipore—*District and Central* ...	27	16	17	12	9	4
Ditto—*European*	...	1	1	...	...	..
Alipore—*Juvenile*	1	2	1	...	1	1
Presidency - *District and Central* ...	34	35	25	13	13	10
Ditto—*European*	...	...	...	...	...	...
Krishnagar	7	9	4	4	6	2
Berhampore	6	2	3	4	1	1
Jessore	30	6	7	23	4	5
Khulna	15	16	9	10	11	7
Barasat	1	5	6	...	4	4
Rajshahi—*District and Central* ...	17	10	18	12	8	14
Dinajpur	8	6	5	4	3	2
Jalpaiguri	12	10	15	3	3	5
Darjeeling	4	2	5	3	1	2
Rangpur	30	6	7	24	4	3
Bogra	10	14	5	7	11	5
Pabna	2	3	4	2	3	4
Malda	6	9	9	4	5	5
Dacca—*District and Central* ...	15	33	10	11	24	10
Mymensingh	17	43	24	11	37	20
Faridpur	8	8	24	5	7	20
Barisal	8	13	29	6	12	24
Comilla	4	6	3	4	5	3
Noakhali	9	6	7	8	3	7
Chittagong	...	2	3	...	2	2

Undergraduates rendering war service appointed as Sub-Deputy Collectors.

9. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state how many undergraduates who accepted war service, have been taken in as sub-deputy collectors; and how many of them are Muhammadans, and how many are Hindus?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: Sixteen such persons have been appointed sub-deputy collectors. Of these, 15 are Hindus and one is a Muhammadan.

Unbearding of Muhammadan prisoners.

10. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state whether the Muhammadan prisoners are required to have their beards clean shaved immediately after admission into the jails even against their will?

(*b*) Are the Government aware that this is against the *Shariat*?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of abolishing the practice?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) No, unless the prisoners themselves wish to be clean shaved.

(*b*) Yes. It has accordingly been ruled in the Jail Code that the beards of Muhammadans shall be left one inch in length.

(*c*) The question whether the present rule on the subject requires any modification is under consideration.

"Bakr-Id" disturbances.

11. Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state the number of disturbances that have occurred in Bengal during the past ten years on the occasion of the cow *Qorbani* at the time of the *Id-uz-zuha* (*Bakr-Id*) festival, with the decisions arrived at by the Government in each case?

(*b*) Are the disturbances mentioned in (*a*) confined to a few districts only?

(*c*) If so, are the Government in a position to state the reasons for this?

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) No serious disturbances are reported to have occurred in Bengal during the last ten years on the occasion of the *korbani* at the celebration of the *Bakr-Id* festival.

(*b*) and (*c*) These questions do not arise.

Muhammadan Marriage Registrars.

12. Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state why the duty of registering the *kabin-nama* is not done by the Muhammadan Marriage Registrars but by the Sub-Registrars?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge in a position to say what is the average income of a Muhammadan Marriage Registrar?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of crediting the income of the Muhammadan Marriage Registrars of Bengal to Government revenue, and of placing them in the category of paid Government servants with a scale of pay similar to that of Sub-Registrars?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) The Member is referred to the following extract from Government resolution No. 1410 T.—R., dated the 24th September, 1917:—

The fourth proposal is to legalise the registration by Muhammadan Marriage Registrars of such deeds of dower and divorce as do not deal in any manner with immoveable property. It is also proposed to forbid the registration of these documents by Sub-Registrars appointed under the Indian Registration Act. This proposal involves the amendment of the Indian Registration Act, under which the public are entitled to present such deeds for registration to a Sub-Registrar. A similar proposal has been negatived by the Government of Bengal on two previous occasions. The Governor in Council has again examined the question and he is not convinced that it would be generally acceptable. The public have confidence in Sub-Registrars and would prefer that the registration of documents, as distinct from the registration of ceremonies, should remain with them. He is therefore unable to accept this proposal.

(*b*) It is reported that the average annual income of a Muhammadan Marriage Registrar in 1920 was about Rs. 487.

(*c*) The answer is in the negative.

Mufassal Jurors.

13. Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) why the mufassal jurors receive only daily allowance for the days they actually attend Court, and not for the short intervening periods which sometimes occur, and during which they have to remain in the town; and

(*ii*) why the said jurors are not given travelling allowance?

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): (*i*) and (*ii*) This is in accordance with the notification No. 2529 J., dated the 31st March, 1904 (copy of which is laid on the table), which guides the payment of expenses to assessors and jurors when summoned to attend criminal trials.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 13.

NOTIFICATION.

No. 2529 J., dated the 31st March, 1904.—It is hereby notified for general information that the Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal has been pleased to prescribe the following rule for the payment by Government of a daily allowance to jurors and assessors summoned to attend in criminal trials in Bengal:—

"The District Magistrate shall order payment on the part of Government to any juror summoned to attend his Court, and the Sessions Judge shall order payment on the part of Government to any juror or assessor summoned to attend his Court, of a daily allowance, *for days of attendance at Court only*, of not less than one rupee and not exceeding five rupees, in the case of any juror or assessor who may apply orally or in writing for such allowance, and provided that the distance between the usual residence of the juror or assessor and the Court-house which he attends exceeds five miles."

W. C. MACPHERSON,
Chief Secretary to the Government of Bengal (Offg.).

Milk supply.

14. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state what efforts, if any, have been made in recent years by the local bodies in the direction of improving the quality of the milk supply in their respective areas?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: A statement, which has been compiled from reports received from the local bodies, is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 14, showing efforts made by the local bodies in Bengal to improve the milk supply.

Burdwan Division.—The Howrah municipality owns a dairy farm in the market which is leased out, the lessee giving a guarantee to sell pure milk. Cattle sheds and milk depots are inspected by the Sanitary Department and care is taken to see that milk is not adulterated. In the Bankura municipality the Sanitary Inspector examines the milk that is daily brought into the town for sale, but there has been no improvement, as the demand is greater than the supply. In the Vishnupur and Sonamukhi municipalities milk vendors are warned not to adulterate milk, and in the former the principal supplies of milk are inspected by the Sanitary Inspector. The District Board of Midnapore has three bulls which are intended to improve the breed of cattle and consequentially the milk supply.

The Burdwan District Board maintains a veterinary dispensary with a stationary veterinary assistant and also three itinerant veterinary assistants for the treatment and inoculation of cattle, etc., and the cows of the district are benefited by their treatment The Health Officer under the Howrah District Board is trying to improve the milk supply of the district with the help of the Presidents of the newly formed union boards

Presidency Division —The Tittagarh municipality takes action under section 251, Bengal Municipal Act, and vendors of adulterated milk are prosecuted and fined Similar action is also taken by the Basirhat municipality In the Maniktala municipality steps have been taken to prevent overcrowding of cattle in cattle sheds, in the Cossipur-Chitpur municipality stud bulls are occasionally maintained for improving the breed of cattle and steps taken to keep the surroundings of the cattle marts in a sanitary condition Action is also taken under section 263 when necessary. The Sanitary Inspector of the Azimganj municipality inspects the farms of milkmen in the municipality to see that wholesome milk is supplied

In the Krishnagar municipality the public has been warned against selling adulterated milk, and the Sanitary Inspector watches cases of adulteration The milk offered for sale in the Santipur municipality is examined by the Health Officer, and in the Nabadwip municipality the Sanitary Inspector has been asked to take immediate action for the improvement of the milk supply The Khulna municipality undertakes prosecution in cases of detected adulteration and the Khulna District Board has resolved to take steps to improve the supply of milk in the district by providing suitable grazing grounds for village cattle The Co-operative Department has by its milk societies in the neighbourhood of Baraset done something to improve the milk supply of Calcutta

Dacca Division —In the municipalities of Dacca and Narayanganj milk is regularly examined by the Sanitary Inspectors and the Health Officer, and whenever it appears to be adulterated it is sent to the laboratory of the Director of Public Health. The Dacca municipality has also a by-law prohibiting vendors from exposing milk to dust and flies In the municipalities in the Mymensingh district milk is generally examined by the municipal subordinates and on detection of adulteration the offenders are prosecuted In the Faridpur municipality the Sanitary Inspectors examine milk from time to time and seize adulterated milk which is destroyed under section 251C, Bengal Municipal Act In the Madaripur municipality also action is taken under section 251 In the Bakarganj district milk is examined by the municipal officers and whenever it is found adulterated, the seller is prosecuted in case he refuses to destroy the milk The Sanitary Inspectors employed by the District Boards of Mymensingh and Faridpur have instructions to examine the milk of the rural markets in the course of their tours and to report for prosecution the names of persons found selling adulterated milk

Chittagong Division —In the Noakhali municipality milk has been occasionally examined and offenders prosecuted under section 251 In the Tippera district the Comilla municipality has deputed medical commissioners to examine milk during the last three years, and the Sanitary Inspectors of all municipalities have inspected milk and offenders have been warned and prosecuted The Chittagong municipality has sometimes had milk in the market-places examined and destroyed it when found adulterated

Rajshahi Division —In the Rajshahi Division some of the Sanitary Inspectors have been supplied with lactometers with which they occasionally test milk and in some municipalities prosecutions under section 251 have been instituted, but rarely An attempt is being made by the Darjeeling municipality to improve the cow sheds and milk depôts within the municipal limits Certain District Boards maintain stud bulls of superior quality to improve the breed of cattle and consequentially the yield of milk.

Nursing staff, Medical College Hospital.

15. **Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state what arrangement is there in the Calcutta Medical College Hospital for supervising the work of the nursing staff, particularly their treatment of the Indian patients at the Eden Hospital?

(*b*) Is the Lady Superintendent assisted in her work by the House Surgeon and the Resident Surgeon?

(*c*) Is there any arrangement for receiving the complaints, if and when made, of Indian patients in the Eden Hospital, against the treatment of nurses?

(*d*) Do the patients receive individual attention from the Sister in charge?

(*e*) Do these Sisters understand the language of the patients?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The work of the nursing staff is supervised by five nursing Sisters and a Lady Superintendent.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) Yes. Complaints are received by the Resident Surgeon and submitted by him to the Professor of Midwifery, who calls for inquiry from the Lady Superintendent.

(*d*) Yes.

(*e*) The Sisters understand Hindi fairly well, but Bengali imperfectly.

Motor-car stand under Medical College Hospital portico.

16. **Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether it is true that motor-cars of Indian doctors of the Calcutta Medical College are not allowed to stand under the portico of the hospital, whereas the cars of European doctors are allowed the privilege?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: The answer is in the negative. No differentiation is made between the motor-cars of European and Indian doctors, but according to a custom of long standing the portico to the north of the hospital is reserved for the cars of professors of the College both European and Indian.

Azimganj sub-registry office.

17. SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether a largely signed memorial praying for the transfer of Azimganj sub-registry office from Azimganj to Jiaganj in the district of Murshidabad reached the Government some time ago?

(*b*) If so, have the Government come to any decision as regards the memorial?

(*c*) Are the Government aware that the location of the sub-registry office at Azimganj has been causing inconvenience to the public for want of approach roads, drinking water-supply and arrangement for *purdah* ladies?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) The answer is in the negative. The Inspector-General of Registration reports that a memorial has been received by him and is under his consideration.

(*b*) This does not arise.

(*c*) Government have no information at present and are awaiting the report of the Inspector-General of Registration

Chaukidari-tax.

18. Babu HEM CHANDRA BHATTACHARJI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that chaukidari-tax is realised from the villagers of Bengal, irrespective of the fact whether they are poor or not?

(*b*) Is it a fact that in cases of failure to pay the tax, the belongings of these villagers are attached?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) No. Attention is invited to section 15 of the Village Chaukidari Act, which runs as follows:—

> The rate to be levied in any village for the purposes of this Act shall be an assessment according to the circumstances and the property to be protected of the persons liable to the same:
>
> Provided that the amount to be assessed on any one person shall not be more than one rupee per mensem, and that all persons who, in the opinion of the panchayat, are too poor to pay half anna a month shall be altogether exempt from assessment under this Act.

If this provision of the law is properly observed by the assessing panchayats, a discrimination should be made in favour of the very poor.

(*b*) Under section 27 of the Act, the collecting member of the panchayat has power to levy arrear rates from defaulters by the distraint and sale of a sufficient portion of their moveable property.

Reporting of Bengali speeches in the Legislative Council.

19. Babu HEM CHANDRA BHATTACHARJI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Legislative Department be pleased to state the reasons for not reporting the speeches of those members who speak in Bengali in the Bengal Legislative Council?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of making proper arrangements for the reporting of the speeches of such members?

MEMBER in charge of LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) The reason is that the official reporters are unable to take down *verbatim* the speeches of members speaking in the vernacular.

(*b*) The matter is under consideration.

Bengal Secretariat Press, Confidential Section.

20. Babu HEM CHANDRA BHATTACHARJI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance aware of the fact that formerly Hindus and Muhammadans used to be employed in the confidential section?

(*b*) Are they still employed in work in this section?

(*c*) Do they receive the usual allowance allowed for men working in this section?

(*d*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware of the fact that special facilities are given to Indian Christians for working in the confidential section? If so, what is the reason for this?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) and (*b*) Yes. The pressmen and proof pressmen, the impositor and the forme carriers are and have always been Hindus or Muhammadans

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) All the men employed as lino operators and hand compositors in the confidential section are at present Anglo-Indians or Indian Christians. The Superintendent is personally responsible for preserving the secrecy of the work done in this section, and it would be impossible to maintain that responsibility, unless he were allowed full discretion to select for the work men in whom he has complete confidence. The number of lino operators and hand compositors employed in the confidential section is only 17 out of a total establishment of nearly 300 men of this class.

Bengal Secretariat Press, Apprentice lino operators.

21. Babu HEM CHANDRA BHATTACHARJI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased

to state whether it is a fact that the apprentice lino operators in the press get an allowance from the confidential section?

(b) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking the Hindu and Muhammadan employees who may be willing as apprentices for this work?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (a) The apprentice lino operators get no allowance from the confidential section

(b) The Hindu and Muhammadan compositors in the press are not sufficiently educated in English to be able to work up to the necessary speed in linotype work Since the introduction of linotype machines, only one hand compositor has asked for a transfer to the lino section He was given a trial after the usual preliminary training, but had to be removed as he was only able to work up to half the ordinary rate of work.

Bengal Secretariat Press employees: alleged differential treatment.

22. Babu HEM CHANDRA BHATTACHARJI: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the clerks in the press, who do the work of the composing and reading branches, are under the Civil Service Regulations, while the other employees of those branches are under the Factory Act?

(b) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reasons for this differential treatment?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (a) and (b) No clerks in the press work in the composing or reading branches. As regards the application of the Civil Service Regulations and the Factories Act, the member is referred to the answer given to unstarred question No. 62 asked by him at the meeting of Council on the 14th March, 1921.

Payments to Press employees.

23. Babu HEM CHANDRA BHATTACHARJI: (a) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance aware of the following grievances of the employees in the press, viz.:—

(i) that the payments for piece-work are often made to the wrong person;

(ii) that the computers often assess piece-work at an unduly low figure, especially when the compositor is absent;

(*iii*) that payment for work done in one whole month is often not made in that month, it being allowed to run on to the next month; and

(*iv*) that payment of wages is often delayed?

(*b*) What steps are the Government taking to remove these grievances?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) (*i*) No.

(*ii*) The value of piece-work is calculated by the computers in accordance with rules laid down for their guidance. It makes no difference whether the compositor is present or absent. Rule 208 of the Printing Rules lays down that an employee should check his own accounts and, if he can show that his account is wrong, he can obtain orders from the Superintendent or Deputy Superintendent to have his charge files and register of earnings checked. Complaints on the ground of incorrect computation are extremely rare.

(*iii*) Payments for all work completed within the month, the charge files for which have been sent to the computing branch by the day fixed for closing the monthly accounts, are duly made. Only incompleted work is carried over.

(*iv*) Slight delays have occurred recently, due to the recent revision of the pay of the press establishment which led to certain audit difficulties. These difficulties have now been removed.

(*b*) In view of the replies to (*a*) no action appears to be necessary.

Sub-Registrars.

24. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state how many Sub-Registrars were appointed during the last six years who have the qualifications mentioned in rule 3 (*e*) (*ii*) of the rules for appointment in the Registration Department on page 223 of the Bengal Registration Manual, 1918?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that every year a large number of students pass the higher standard or the final examination of the Arabic Department of recognised Madrasahs?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister also aware of the fact that these students have a good knowledge of English?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of reserving a number of Sub-Registrarships for such students each year?

(*e*) If the answer to (*d*) is in the affirmative, will the Government be pleased to state the number they propose so to reserve?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) Six.

(*b*) and (*c*) The following table shows the number of students who passed the higher standard or the final examination of the Arabic Department of the Calcutta and Hooghly Madrasahs during the years 1916 to 1921, and those who passed with English as a subject:—

Year	Calcutta Madrasah.		Hooghly Madrasah	
	Number passed.	Passed with English	Number passed	Passed with English.
1916	31	7	7	4
1917	47	8	14	8
1918	51	9	7	3
1919	44	7	4	1
1920	50	10	9	5
1921	48	14	10	7
Total ..	271	55	51	28

(*d*) and (*e*) Two such students were appointed in 1914 and one has been appointed in each subsequent year. It is not considered necessary to make a special reservation.

Sheristadar of Dacca Collectorate.

25. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue be pleased to state whether any Muhammadan has been appointed as a sheristadar of the Collectorate of Dacca or head clerk of the Dacca Magistracy?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the negative, are the Government considering the desirability of appointing a Muhammadan on a vacancy occurring in either of these posts?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) The answer is in the negative.

(*b*) Such appointments are not made by Government, but by the District Officer. According to the rule they are to be made with regard to special fitness for the post.

Malarious districts and subdivisions.

26. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing a list of the districts and subdivisions which are classed as malarious?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: A statement is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 26, showing districts and subdivisions in the Bengal Presidency which are classed as malarious.

Districts	Subdivisions
Burdwan	Burdwan, Kalna, Katwa and Asansol
Birbhum	Sadar and Rampurhat.
Bankura	Bishnupur
Midnapore	Sadar and Ghatal
Hooghly	Sadar, Arambagh and Serampur
24-Parganas	Barrackpur, Barasat and Basirhat
Nadia	Sadar, Ranaghat, Chuadanga, Kushtia and Meherpur
Murshidabad	Sadar Lalbagh, Kandi and Jangipur.
Jessore	Sadar, Narail, Magura, Jhenida and Bongaon.
Khulna	Sadar and Satkhira
Rajshahi	Sadar and Nator
Dinajpur	Sadar Balurghat and Thakurgaon
Jalpaiguri	Sadar and Alipur Duars
Darjeeling	Siliguri
Rangpur	Kurigram.
Bogra	Bogra Sadar.
Pabna	Sadar.
Malda	Malda Sadar.
Faridpur	Goalundo.
Dacca	Manikganj.
Mymensingh	Tangail.

Medical Practitioners of Munshiganj and Manikganj.

27. Mr. TARIT BHUSAN ROY: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state the total number of Assistant and Sub-Assistant Surgeons attached to hospitals and practising privately within the subdivisions of Munshiganj and Manikganj, respectively, in the district of Dacca during the years 1918, 1919 and 1920?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: A statement is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 27, showing the total number of Assistant and Sub-Assistant Surgeons attached to hospitals and practising privately within the subdivisions of Munshiganj and Manikganj.

	MUNSHIGANJ.			MANIKGANJ		
	1918	1919.	1920.	1918.	1919.	1920
Number of Assistant Surgeons attached to hospitals and dispensaries	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil
Number of Sub-Assistant Surgeons attached to hospitals and dispensaries	2	2	2	2	2	2
Number of private medical practitioners of Assistant Surgeon status attached to hospitals and dispensaries	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil
Number of private medical practitioners of Sub-Assistant Surgeon status attached to hospitals and dispensaries	8	8	8	8	8	8
Number of private medical practitioners of Assistant Surgeon status practising privately.	2	2	2	3	2	2
Number of private medical practitioners of Sub-Assistant Surgeon status practising privately.	56	55	57	40	41	41

Primary and Middle English Schools at Rangpur.

28. Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing the number of lower primary, upper primary and middle English schools in each subdivision of the district of Rangpur for the last five years?

(*b*) What has been the ratio of increase of the school-going population in the above areas?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) and (*b*) The statements are laid on the table.

Statement A referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 28 showing the number of schools in Rangpur district, subdivision by subdivision, for the last five years.

Subdivision	Class of school	1916-17	1917-18.	1918-19.	1919-20.	1920-21
Sadar ...	Middle English ...	27	26	29	28	28
	Upper primary ...	37	49	41	39	38
	Lower primary ...	476	460	508	522	517
Kurigram ...	Middle English ...	12	13	13	13	13
	Upper primary ...	27	27	26	26	25
	Lower primary ...	282	307	285	283	293
Gaibandha ...	Middle English ...	30	29	27	25	26
	Upper primary ...	31	32	32	33	32
	Lower primary ...	445	620	584	565	590
Nilphamari ...	Middle English ...	11	11	12	11	9
	Upper primary ...	36	37	38	41	41
	Lower primary ...	474	494	479	461	465

Statement B referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 28, showing ratio of increase or decrease of the school going population in the different subdivisions of the district of Rangpur.

Name of subdivision	1916-17	1917-18.	1918-19.	1919-20.	1920-21
	Per cent.	Per cent	Per cent	Per cent.	Per cent.
Sadar subdivision ...	...	− 1·5	+ 0·6	+ 3·4	+ 1·5
Kurigram subdivision ...	...	− 5·8	+ 11·0	+ 7·9	+ 3·1
Gaibandha subdivision ...	...	+ 10·8	− 9·7	+ 3·5	+ 0·7
Nilphamari subdivision ...	...	+ 6·3	− 2·9	+ 1·4	+ 5·9

Ministerial Officers in Courts in Rajshahi Division.

29. Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing—

(*i*) the number of Muhammadan and non-Muhammadan ministerial officers in the Civil and Criminal Courts in each district in the Rajshahi Division under heads—

(*1*) permanent,

(*2*) temporary, and

(*3*) probationers,

at present and as in 1914?

(*ii*) How many Muhammadan candidates applied for appointments in the ministerial staff of the Civil and Criminal Courts in the district of Rangpur from 1914 to 1920?

(*iii*) How many got appointments?

(*b*) Is it a fact that five appointments have recently been sanctioned by the Government for the Civil Courts of Rangpur?

(*c*) If so, how many of these appointments are to be given to the Muhammadan candidates?

(*d*) If the appointments have already been made, how many Muhammadans have been appointed?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*b*) The answer is in the negative.

(*c*) and (*d*) Does not arise

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 29.

(a) (i) Statement showing the number of Muhammadan and non-Muhammadan ministerial officers in the Civil and Criminal Courts in the districts in the Rajshahi Division —

Year	Rajshahi and Malda.			Dinajpur and Jalpaiguri			Darjeeling			Rangpur			Pabna and Bogra.		
	Permanent.	Temporary.	Probationer.	Permanent.	Temporary.	Probationer.	Permanent.	Temporary	Probationer.	Permanent.	Temporary	Probationer.	Permanent.	Temporary.	Probationer.
1914															
Muhammadan ..	47	48	3	29	6	3-7*	8	7	...	30	20	4	60	...	6
Non-Muhammadan	147	50	6	174	8	7	59	12	2	130	22	11	119	1	12
1921															
Muhammadan ...	55	5	8	34	4	8	7	1	1	29	5	3	51	7	6
Non-Muhammadan	126	17	8	175	18	11	70	27	4	135	13	13	120	6	12

* Detailed information regarding the two classes of officers is not available.

(ii) Twenty-two Muhammadan candidates applied for appointment in the Criminal Courts. No information as regards the number of applications made in Civil Courts is available.

(iii) Sixteen persons have received appointments, ten in the Civil and six in the Criminal Courts.

Cost per patient, Indian or European, and Governing Body, Calcutta Medical College Hospital.

30. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state what was the total average cost per Indian patient in the Calcutta Medical College Hospital in 1900, 1910 and 1920 and also the total average cost per European patient in the same hospital in those years?

(*b*) Is there any Governing Body for the Medical College Hospital, Calcutta?

(*c*) If so, who are the members of that body, when were they last appointed and for what period?

(*d*) What are their functions?

(*e*) How many meetings were held during the years 1918, 1919, 1920, and on what dates?

(*f*) Who were the members present on each of those dates?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The figures are:—

Indian patients

	Rs.	A.	P.
1900	2	5	10¾
1910	3	0	7½
1920	5	3	7¼

European patients

1900	5	4	6½
1910	7	13	11⅞
1920	10	1	3⅜

(*b*) and (*c*) There is a Council for the Medical College and the Medical College Hospitals in accordance with the following rule:—

The government of the Medical College and Hospitals is vested in the Principal, aided by a consultative Council composed of all the professors, subject to the general control of the Surgeon-General with the Government of Bengal.

The professors serve *ex-officio* on the Council.'

(*d*) The Council takes cognizance of all matters which in any way concern the constitution and work of the College and the welfare of the students attached thereto.

(*e*) 1918.—One on the 20th June.

1919.—Four: One on the 5th July, one on the 24th July, o on the 30th August and one on the 25th October.

1920.—Five: One on the 3rd January, one on the 16th Marc one on the 1st May, one on the 19th June and one the 14th December.

(*f*) *Members present on the 20th June, 1918.*

Lieutenant-Colonel B. H. Deare, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel C. R. Stevens, I.M.S.
Major W. V. Coppinger, I.M.S.
Major H. B. Steen, I.M.S.
Captain Green Armytage, I.M.S.
Captain J. A. Shorten, I.M.S.

Members present on the 5th July, 1919.

Lieutenant-Colonel B. H. Deare, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel D. McCay, I.M.S.
Major W. V. Coppinger, I.M.S.
Major F. P. Connor, I.M.S.
Captain J. A. Shorten, I.M.S.
Assistant Surgeon D. P. Ghosh, M.B.

Members present on the 24th July, 1919.

Lieutenant-Colonel B. H. Deare, I.M.S.
Major W. V. Coppinger, I.M.S.
Major N. P. Sinha, I.M.S.
Captain J. A. Shorten, I.M.S.
Rai Bahadur Chunilal Bose, M.B., F.C.S., I.S.O
Dr Nanilal Pan, M.B.
Dr. Ekendra Nath Ghosh, M.SC., M.D*
Major H. B. Steen, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel F. P. Connor, I.M.S.

Members present on the 30th August, 1919.

Lieutenant-Colonel B. H. Deare, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel D. McCay, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel F. P. Connor, I.M.S.
Rai Bahadur Chunilal Bose, M.B., F.C.S., I.S.O
Dr. Ekendra Nath Ghosh, M.SC., M.D.
Dr. Nanilal Pan, M.B.
Dr. D. P. Ghosh, B.A., M.B.

Members present on the 25th October, 1919.

Lieutenant-Colonel B. H. Deare, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel D. McCay, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel J. C. H. Leicester, I.M.S.
Captain R. B. Lloyd, I.M.S.
Captain J. A. Shorten, I.M.S.
Rai Bahadur Chunilal Bose, M.B., I.C.S., I.S.O.
Dr. Nanilal Pan, M.B.
Mr. Tulsi Das Kar, M.A.

Members present on the 3rd January, 1920.

Lieutenant-Colonel B. H. Deare, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel R. P. Wilson, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel J. C. H. Leicester, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel D. McCay, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel F. P. Connor, I.M.S.
Major W. V. Coppinger, I.M.S.
Captain J. A. Shorten, I.M.S.
Captain R. B. Lloyd, I.M.S.
Rai Bahadur Chunilal Bose, M.B., I.C.S., I.S.O.
Dr. Ekendra Nath Ghosh, M.Sc., M.D.
Mr. Tulsi Das Kar, M.A.

Members present on the 16th March, 1920.

Lieutenant-Colonel B. H. Deare, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel J. C. H. Leicester, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel W. V. Coppinger, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel F. P. Connor, I.M.S.
Major R. Knowles, I.M.S.
Major J. A. Shorten, I.M.S.
Major R. B. Lloyd, I.M.S.
Professor Tulsi Das Kar, M.A.
Dr. Nanilal Pan, M.B.

Members present on the 1st May, 1920.

Lieutenant-Colonel B. H. Deare, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel F. P. Connor, D.S.O., I.M.S.
Major R. B. Lloyd, I.M.S.
Captain W. O. Walker, I.M.S.
Dr. Ekendra Nath Ghosh, M.Sc., M.D.
Dr. Nanilal Pan, M.B.
Mr. Tulsi Das Kar, M.A.

Members present on the 19th June, 1920.

Lieutenant-Colonel B. H. Deare, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel J. C. H. Leicester, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel W. V. Coppinger, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel F. P. Connor, I.M.S.
Major H. B. Steen, I.M.S.
Major J. D. Sandes, I.M.S.
Major R. B. Lloyd, I.M.S.
Captain W. O. Walker, I.M.S.
Dr Nanilal Pan, M.B.
Professor Tulsi Das Kar, M.A.

Members present on the 14th December, 1920.

Lieutenant-Colonel B. H. Deare, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel J. C. H. Leicester, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel D. McCay, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel W. V. Coppinger, I.M.S.
Lieutenant-Colonel F. P. Connor, I.M.S.
Major R. B. Lloyd, I.M.S.
Major H. B. Steen, I.M.S.
Major J. A. Shorten, I.M.S.
Captain W. O. Walker, I.M.S.
Dr. Nanilal Pan, M.B.
Dr Ekendra Nath Ghosh, M.Sc., M.D.

Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: With reference to the answer to this question, may I inquire whether the figures given are for a day or a month or a year?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: I must have notice of that question.

Calcutta Medical College Hospital, Cholera Ward.

31. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state the reasons which led to the abolition of the cholera ward from the Medical College Hospital?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the students of the Calcutta Medical College now find it very difficult to learn the technique of up-to-date cholera treatment?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the students of the Calcutta Medical College have to go to the Campbell Hospital, a distance of more than a mile, to attend the practical demonstration of the modern treatment of cholera held by the local Sub-Assistant Surgeons?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of restoring the cholera ward to the Medical College as before?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The ward was closed in view of the expense of maintenance and the paucity of the number of patients suffering from cholera who sought relief. The largest number admitted on any one day in 1920 was 2.

(*b*) The difficulties of the students have been represented by them to the Principal of the Medical College and a scheme for the fullest instruction in up-to-date treatment is now under discussion.

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) The member is referred to the reply to (*b*).

Calcutta Medical College, Cottage Wards.

32. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the cottage wards attached to the Calcutta Medical College were constructed by public philanthropy?

(*b*) If so, what purpose were they originally intended to serve?

(*c*) Is it a fact that out of the total number of twelve such cottages, as many as eight have been allotted to the officers of the Medical College for residential purposes?

(*d*) If so, has this use of the cottages the approval of the Government?

(*e*) Has the attention of Government been drawn to the fact that the Surgeons and Physicians of the Calcutta Medical College are generally irregular in attending the patients admitted into these cottages?

(*f*) If so, are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps to ensure prompt medical and surgical relief to the patients admitted there?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) They were intended for patients who were desirous of paying for their accommodation while availing themselves of the advantages of the treatment to be obtained there.

(*c*) No. No cottages have been allotted for the use of the staff of the hospital. Some of the House Physicians and Surgeons have, however, been allowed to occupy some of them as a temporary measure, in view of the fact that they were empty and there were no applicants for them. For some years past the number of cottages occupied by patients has rarely exceeded 2, and no application for admission to the cottages has been refused on account of the House Physicians and Surgeons being in temporary occupation.

(*d*) The arrangement was made by the Principal with the sanction of the Surgeon-General and was not referred to Government. Government see no reason to take exception to it.

(*e*) No complaints of irregular attendance have been received.

(*f*) This does not arise.

Roads and road cess in Faridpur.

33. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state what has been the total collection of road cess in the district of Faridpur in the years 1918, 1919 and 1920?

(*b*) What has been the actual amount of expenditure on roads in those years?

(*c*) How many new roads have been constructed in those years in that district?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: A statement is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 33, showing the net road cess receipts in the Faridpur district, the amount spent on roads, and the number of new roads constructed by the District Board during the last three years.

	Net road cess receipts	Expenditure on roads	Number of roads constructed, including local board roads
	Rs.	Rs.	
1918-19	1,14,182	1,09,260	25
1919-20	96,707	1,54,640	27
1920-21	1,05,448	1,10,641	29

Medical College Hospital, out-door work.

34. Mr. D. C. GHOSE: (*a*) Are the Government aware that the work in the out-door department of the Medical College Hospital is too heavy for the Resident Surgeon and Resident Physician to cope with?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether the Government are considering the advisability of appointing Honorary Surgeons and Honorary Physicians to attend out-door patients and help the Resident Surgeons and Resident Physician in their work at the Medical College Hospital?

(*c*) Are there Honorary Surgeons and Honorary Physicians in the Sambhunath Pundit Hospital and Mayo Hospital?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) and (*b*) Out-patients are not attended by a Resident Surgeon and Resident Physician only. They are attended by two resident medical officers, one emergency resident medical officer (Eden Hospital), three senior house surgeons and physicians, three junior house surgeons and physicians, who are recruited from the ranks of private practitioners, and two supernumerary officers. In addition to these, students are detailed for duty in the out-patient department, while the Principal of the Medical College visits it daily and also whenever needed; there are two visiting surgeons and two visiting physicians for cases requiring more detailed attention. Government have no reason to believe that this staff is not adequate for the purpose and do not at present propose to add to it. If the number of patients goes on increasing, the matter will be further considered.

(*c*) Yes.

Amendment of Calcutta Municipal Act.

35. Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether it is intended to introduce a Bill for the amendment of the Calcutta Municipal Act, 1899, during the next session of the Council?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: The answer is in the affirmative. The Bill has already been submitted to the Government of India for sanction.

Ward Commissioners of Tollygunge Municipality.

36. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state what are the principles governing the distribution of commissioners of a municipality by wards?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the number of commissioners of the various wards of the Tollygunge Municipality varies disproportionately in comparison with the area and population? If so, what are the reasons for this?

(*c*) What are the principles for selecting a Government nominee on a Municipal Board?

(*d*) Will the Government be pleased to state the reasons for nominating two Muhammadan commissioners against one Hindu in the Tollygunge Municipality?

(*e*) Is it a fact that the number of Hindus is nearly double that of the Muhammadans in that municipality?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The distribution of elected commissioners among the different wards of a municipality is usually made on the basis of the population and area, the number of voters in each ward, and the amount of municipal rates paid by each ward.

(*b*) Area and population are not the only factors to be considered. When the Tollygunge Municipality was formed in 1900 by the partition of the old South Suburban Municipality, the constitution of the wards and the number of elected commissioners in each ward were retained unchanged on the recommendation of the local authorities.

(*c*) There is no hard and fast rule, but the object of Government nomination is to correct possible inequalities in the operation of the elective system and to safeguard the interests of the minorities in particular, and of the rate-payers in general.

(*d*) Two Muhammadan commissioners were appointed by Government in 1919, because it was thought that they would be useful members of the Municipal Board. The number of Muhammadan and Hindu commissioners appointed by Government was the same as in 1916.

(*e*) Yes.

Butwara fees.

37. Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state—

(*i*) the time when the scale of fees leviable for the partition of estates, was last fixed by the Board of Revenue under section 42, sub-section (*3*) of Bengal Act V of 1897;

(*ii*) whether the receipt is balanced by expenditure as provided for in the said sub-section;

(*iii*) if not, what becomes of the surplus or deficit, if any;

(*iv*) whether recoveries exceeded expenditure by Rs. 42,513 in 1919-20, Rs. 19,260 in 1918-19, Rs. 30,750 in 1916-17, Rs. 16,621 in 1914-15, Rs. 19,274 in 1913-14 and Rs. 23,624 in 1912-13;

(*v*) whether expenditure exceeded recoveries only in two years, *i.e.*, in 1917-18 by Rs. 6,248 and in 1915-16 by Rs. 1,840; and

(*vi*) whether in the revised estimate of 1920-21, recoveries exceeded expenditure by Rs. 39,000 and in the budget estimate of the current year the excess is estimated at Rs. 29,000?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of asking the Board of Revenue to revise the scale of fees leviable for the purpose, and, if so, when?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) (*i*) In 1919.

(*ii*) The scale has been fixed with the intention that receipts may be balanced by expenditure as nearly as possible

(*iii*) Any surplus remaining is to be refunded to the proprietors under section 40 (*2*) of the Act. Difficulty is experienced when the number of co-sharers is large and the amounts due to each consequently small, but every endeavour is made to secure that the money is refunded, and, according to the rules, a proprietor can obtain payment of the sum due to him at any time even after the accounts of the partition of the estate have been closed.

(*iv*), (*v*) and (*vi*) The figures are correct. There is necessarily a surplus, since fees are recovered in advance when the partition of large estates is about to be taken up. The surplus may rise to a considerable sum, but this tends to be automatically adjusted as the operations near completion The scale of fees prescribed by the Board applies only to districts where there is an Estates Partition Fund, viz., during the period specified in the question, only in Dacca and Mymensingh and in Jessore up to 1919, and therefore affects only to a very slight extent the surplus of the whole province

(*b*) The last revision was made only in 1919 and there is nothing to show that a further revision is required.

Extra passenger traffic owing to extension of port limits, Calcutta.

38. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Marine Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that, owing to the recent extension of port limits to Konnagar, the Port Commissioners, with the approval of the Government, have since February, 1921, been carrying passengers for cross traffic between stations which were formerly outside the port limits, without providing more steamers for this extra traffic?

MEMBER in charge of MARINE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): It is a fact that the Port Commissioners are running ferry steamers within the area which was added to the port of Calcutta by notification No. 18 Mne., dated the 22nd January, 1921, and that no new steamers have been provided for this additional service. The arrangement does not require the approval of Government and was not referred to Government. The Port Commissioners report that the average number of passengers carried on these cross trips is about 26 per run, and that these additional passengers are within the capacity of the boats during this part of their journey.

Work-houses.

39. Babu HEM CHANDRA BHATTACHARJI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Commerce aware that the work-houses of labourers, other than those under the Government, are unhealthy?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, are the Government considering the desirability of compelling all employers to see that the work-houses of labourers in Calcutta are made healthy within at least one year?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of COMMERCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): (*a*) and (*b*) Government do not agree that the work-houses of labourers in Bengal are unhealthy. The member is referred to the provisions of Chapter III of the Indian Factories Act, which apply to all factories in which more than 49 persons are employed and in some cases to smaller factories. An amendment of the Act which will give Government power to extend it to all factories and workshops employing not less than ten persons is now under the consideration of the Indian Legislature.

Press strikes.

40. Babu HEM CHANDRA BHATTACHARJI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether there was any strike in the press on the introduction of the piece system in 1875?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the number of strikes that have occurred in the press during the period from 1878 to 1921, stating the causes for such strikes in each case?

(*c*) What steps have the Government taken from time to time to put a stop to strikes in the press?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) No.

(*b*) There are records of only two strikes of the whole press—(*i*) in 1905 and (*ii*) in 1920:—

(*i*) In 1905, the grievances put forward were numerous. The principal one appears to have been the insufficient supply of type and other material. There was also a complaint that many men were on the temporary establishment and therefore non-pensionable, and there were also complaints regarding promotion.

(*ii*) In 1920, the strike was on the question of an increase of piece rates Certain improvements in the conditions of service were also asked for.

(c) In 1905, the slight differences existing between the rates for piece work in the Bengal Press and those existing in the Government of India Press were removed where these were disadvantageous to the men of the Bengal Press. In 1908, a new Typecasting Department was started and ample type and material have been provided ever since. About half of the posts on the piece establishment were made permanent and pensionable, and nearly all the posts of the salaried establishment were treated in the same way. Other minor grievances were removed and the general conditions of work improved. In 1920, the piece rates were enhanced and the salaries of the remainder of the establishment improved. The question of further improvements in the conditions of service is under the consideration of Government.

Nautical education.

41. Babu JOGENDRA KRISHNA ROY: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Marine Department be pleased to state whether the attention of the Government has been drawn to the views expressed by Mr. P. N. Guha in his minority report in connection with the problem of nautical education in Bengal?

(b) If so, have the Government referred the matter to the Bengal Chamber of Commerce, in order to ascertain whether the allegations made by Mr. Guha regarding the appointment of Indian apprentices on board the vessels owned by European companies are true?

(c) If not, are the Government considering the desirability of doing so now, and of publishing the views of the Chamber?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (a), (b) and (c) The member is referred to Bengal Government resolution No. 2772 Mne., dated the 8th August, 1921. Mr. Guha's report shows that the point was specifically referred to representatives of the leading steamship companies who served on the Committee. Government have not, therefore, considered it necessary to consult the Bengal Chamber of Commerce.

Sub-jail clerks.

42. Babu JOGESH CHANDRA SARKAR: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state what action, if any, has been taken by the Government on the memorial submitted by the sub-jail clerks in March, 1921?

(b) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to say why these officers were not classed with the ministerial officers as regards their pay and promotion?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) The memorials have been considered, but final orders will not be issued until a decision is reached about the recommendations of the Committee appointed to advise on the revision of pay of ministerial officers in Bengal.

(*b*) They are treated as ministerial officers in all respects and the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee have considered their pay.

Sub-jail clerks.

43. Babu JOGENDRA KRISHNA ROY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state whether the Government have received any representation from the sub-jail clerks of Bengal, complaining with regard to the inadequacy of their pay and prospects?

(*b*) If so, has any step been taken to redress the grievances of the sub-jail clerks?

(*c*) If not, is there any likelihood of considering this matter at an early date?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) The member is referred to the answer given to a similar question asked at this meeting by Babu Jogesh Chandra Sarkar.

Minister's salary.

44. Mr. AJOY CHUNDER DUTT: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to lay on the table the legal opinion taken in England upon the question whether a Minister's salary is to be regarded as a voted or non-voted item?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: Legal opinion from England on this question has not yet been received.

Minister's salary.

45. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether the Government have received the opinion of the English constitutional lawyers on the question whether the salary of the Ministers should be submitted to the vote of the Council?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to place the same on the table?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The member is referred to the answer given to a similar question asked at this meeting by Mr. Ajoy Chunder Dutt.

Proficiency of members of the Indian Civil Service in Bengali and Urdu.

46. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state what special steps, if any, are in the contemplation of Government under which Indian Civil Service officers will be taught to speak Bengali and Urdu more proficiently than they do at present?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The Departmental Examination rules provide for the colloquial examination of officers of the Indian Civil Service in Bengali and Hindustani, and instructions have been recently issued for the stiffening of these tests. Officers in Bengal are not required to pass departmental examinations in Urdu but may, under certain conditions, appear for examination in that subject and earn rewards in the event of passing.

Tuition fees during vacations.

47. Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state why fees are realised from students in educational institutions during the period of vacations?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: In terms of Government order No. 1574 Edn., dated the 21st December, 1917, fees are charged for the whole year, but for the convenience of the parents and guardians of pupils, payment is permitted monthly. The annual charge is necessary, since the salaries of teachers and other expenses have to be met all the year round. It is probably more convenient for all concerned that this annual fee should be divided into twelve instalments than that the suggestion in the question should be followed, and the instalments be fewer and larger.

Financial relations of Bengal with Government of India.

48. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether the Government of India have taken any action upon the representation made by the Bengal Government for the readjustment of the financial relations of the Presidency of Bengal with the Government of India?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: No orders have yet been received from the Government of India on the representations submitted by this Government regarding the financial situation.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: Will the Hon'ble Member be pleased to state when orders are expected to be received from the Government of India?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: I am afraid I cannot answer for the Government of India.

Muhammadan Sheristadars.

49. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state whether there is any Muhammadan sheristadar or head clerk in any of the Commissioners' offices in the province?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to make a statement, district by district, showing the number of Muhammadans who are serving as sheristadars or head clerks in the offices of (1) Judges, (2) Collectors, and (3) Magistrates?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) The answer is in the negative.

(*b*) In none of the offices of the District Judges and Magistrate-Collectors is the head ministerial officer (sheristadar) a Muhammadan.

"Juma" Prayer.

50. Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department been drawn to the fact that it is against the tenets of Islam for a Muhammadan to attend to any worldly business on Friday before the *Juma* prayer is over?

(*b*) Have the Government considered the feasibility of transferring the half-holiday granted on Saturday to the early hours of Friday, so that all Government institutions may remain closed up to 2 P.M. on Friday?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) No. (*b*) No.

Transfer of Kotalpur Munsifi to Vishnupur.

51. Mr. AJOY CHUNDER DUTT: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department aware of the great inconvenience

caused to the inhabitants of Kotalpur (Vishnupur subdivision, district Bankura) by the transfer of the Munsif's Court from that place to Vishnupur?

(*b*) Is it the intention of the Government to reconsider its order, passed by the Judicial Department of the Government of Bengal on the 16th December, 1918, in this connection?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) Some petitions have been received complaining of the inconvenience caused by the transfer of the Munsif's Court from Kotalpur to Vishnupur.

(*b*) The answer is in the negative.

Projected railways in Dinajpur and Jalpaiguri.

52. Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state—

(*a*) when the question of opening a railway from Raiganj on the Eastern Bengal Railway to Tetulia in the Jalpaiguri district is likely to be taken up;

(*b*) what has become of the project of a light railway by Messrs. Gillanders, Arbuthnot & Co. from Dinajpur to Kissenganj;

(*c*) whether there is any other railway project that is likely to be taken up soon in the district of Dinajpur?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Government have no information in regard to this project since the year 1914, when it was given seventh place in the list submitted to the Railway Board for consideration of railway projects in Bengal.

(*b*) It has been decided by the Railway Board that the further consideration of railway projects in the Dinajpur and Purnea districts must await the results of the traffic investigation of the whole area north of the Ganges and west of the Parbatipur-Siliguri line to be undertaken by the Eastern Bengal Railway administration.

(*c*) This will depend on the result of the investigations noted against (*b*).

Improvement of district board roads.

53. Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) With reference to my unstarred question No. 248, a reply to which was delivered on the 15th July by the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of

Public Works, will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether the Government are considering the desirability of financing such district boards as cannot properly maintain their roads?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the names of the district boards which need such help and to what extent the same is required?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) and (*b*) Government already give district boards a grant known as the augmentation grant averaging about Rs. 8 lakhs a year, one of the objects of which is expenditure on roads and bridges. The general principles observed by Government in this matter are—

(*1*) that, generally speaking, local needs should be met primarily by local resources and that the local authority must accept responsibility for local roads; and

(*2*) that a district board requiring money for capital expenditure on roads should apply to Government for a loan and not for a grant.

I may add that in my opinion the improvement of the public health is a more urgent matter and has stronger claims to Government grants than the improvement of the roads.

Military education in Bengal.

54. Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state what steps, if any, have been, or are being, taken by the Government for the introduction of military education in Bengal?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: It is understood that the reference is to military training. Auxiliary Force units for European British subjects have been formed under the Auxiliary Force Act, 1920. Under the Indian Territorial Force Act, 1920, the 2nd (Calcutta) Battalion, University Training Corps, and the 1st (Territorial) Battalion, 94th Russell's Infantry, have been constituted for Bengal by the Army Department notification No. 1582 published in the *Gazette of India* of August 6th, 1921. Rules relating to the organisation of the Indian Territorial Force have been published in the same *Gazette*, and steps will now be taken for the formation of the sanctioned units.

Government Pleaders and Muktears in the several subdivisions of Bakarganj.

55. Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state for the years 1918—20—

(*i*) the number of Government pleaders and muktears in each of the subdivisions of the Bakarganj district.

(*ii*) the amount of fees granted to each, and the amount of fees received yearly; and

(*iii*) the number of successful and unsuccessful cases conducted by each?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*i*) There are in the Bakarganj district no other retained pleaders or muktears than Babu Ganesh Chandra Das Gupta, senior Government pleader, and Babu Rajendra Lal Banerji, junior Government pleader. In the three outlying subdivisions, however, there are three selected pleaders, Babu Satish Chandra Sen at Pirojpur, Rai Shyama Charan Simlai Bahadur at Patuakhali, and Babu Mahendra Chandra Ray Chaudhuri at Bhola, who are generally appointed to conduct the civil and criminal cases of Government. When these pleaders cannot cope with the work, private pleaders and muktears are also sometimes engaged.

(*ii*) and (*iii*) Statements showing (*1*) fees obtained and the number of successful and unsuccessful civil cases conducted by each pleader and (*2*) the fees obtained by each of the pleaders and muktears in conducting criminal cases and appeals during the three years 1918—20 are laid on the table. It has not been found possible to ascertain how many criminal cases and appeals have been conducted by each pleader or muktear and how many were successful and how many unsuccessful.

Statement (1) referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 55, showing the number of civil cases conducted by pleaders in Bakarganj district and the amount of fees paid to them for the years 1918—20.

N B—There are no muktears in permanent employment of the Government.

NAMES OF PLEADERS	NUMBER OF SUCCESSFUL CASES				NUMBER OF UNSUCCESSFUL CASES.				Total number of cases conducted.	AMOUNT OF FEES PAID.			
	1918.	1919.	1920.	Total	1918.	1919	1920.	Total.		1918.	1919	1920	Total.
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14
										Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs.	Rs. A. P.
Babu Ganesh Chandra Das Gupta M.A., B.L., S.D.P., Barisal.	16	19	4	39	2	1	...	3	42	2,629 4 6	2,321 14 9	1,604	6,555 3 3
Babu Rajendra Lal Banerji, M.A., B.L., junior Government pleader, Barisal	4	.	1	5	...		1	1	6	191 8 0		180	371 8 0
Babu Indu Bhusan Sen, M.A., B.L., pleader, Barisal			2	2	..		.		2	.....		20	20 0 0
Babu Syama Charan Dutta, B.L., pleader, Barisal	1		..	1	.	1	.	...	1	15 8 0	.	.....	15 8 0
Rai Syama Charan Sinha Bahadur B.L., pleader, Patuakhali	.	1	...	1	..			.	1	.....	18 8 0	5	23 8 0
Babu Satish Chandra Sen, pleader, Pirojpur.	..	1	.	1			.	.	1	.....	5 0 0	.....	5 0 0
Babu Mahendra Chandra Roy Choudhury, pleader, Bhola.	...	.	4	4	..		.		4	1 0 0	1 0 0	.....	*2 0 0

* The Rs. 2 drawn by Babu Mahendra Chandra Roy Choudhury in 1918-19 was his fees for two execution cases.

Statement (2) referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 55, showing the amount of fees paid to pleaders and muktears in Bakarganj district during the years 1918, 1919 and 1920 in criminal cases.

Names of pleaders and muktears	1918.	1919	1920.		Total.	
SADAR.	Rs.	Rs	Rs	A	Rs	A.
Babu Ganesh Chandra Das Gupta, senior Government pleader.	6,064	7,904	6,632	0	20,600	0
Babu Rajendra Lal Banerjee, junior Government pleader.	5,899	6,330	5,713	0	17,942	0
Babu Syama Charan Dutta, pleader ..	3,286	2,944	2,996	0	9,226	0
,, Indu Bhushan Sen, pleader ...	1,027	2,724	391	0	4,142	0
,, Sudheswar Karmakar, pleader ...	144	824	352	0	1,320	0
,, Hrishikesh Mukerjee, pleader ...	56	562	200	0	818	0
,, Bepin Behari Guha	261	328	32	0	621	0
,, Binode Behari Gupta, pleader ...	...	152	112	0	264	0
,, Jitendra Nath Sen, pleader	...	25	40	0	65	0
,, Tarak Nath Chandra, pleader ...	...	...	32	0	32	0
,, J. K. Mukerjee, pleader ...	...	..	30	0	30	0
,, Nagendra Nath Bose, pleader ...	80	66	210	0	356	0
Maulvi Hosain Ali	...	...	50	0	50	0
Babu Niranjan Mukerjee muktear ...	...	..	127	8	127	8
,, Harihar Bhattacharjee, muktear ..	...	...	130	0	130	0
,, Pulin Behari Banerjee, muktear .	...	...	...		...	
,, Kailash Chandra Sen, muktear ...	36	54	81	0	171	0
PIROJPUR						
Babu Satish Chandra Sen, pleader ...	55	132	704	0	891	0
,, Bhuban Mohan Sarkel, pleader ...	24	8	...		32	0
PATUAKHALI.						
Rai Shyama Charan Simlai Bahadur, pleader	112	...	562	0	674	0
Babu Annada Charan Mukerjee, Muktear	51	...	...		51	0

N.B.—There are no muktears in permanent employment of the Government.

Rivers of the Rajshahi Division.

56. Babu FANINDRALAL DE: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state whether any responsible officer was deputed to inspect and report on the rivers in the Rajshahi Division, since the floods in the rivers Atrai, Baranai and Nagar in August, 1918? If not, why not?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: The Chief and Executive Engineers paid visits after the floods and their reports were duly received, but owing to the depleted staff, the deputation of a special officer to make a thorough, complete and extensive inquiry which the problem demands was not possible.

Income-tax deduction on back pay in the Dacca Division.

57. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether it is a fact that income-tax was deducted last year in the Dacca Division from arrears of salaries drawn by certain officers on account of the revision of their pay, even when the arrears thus drawn amounted to less than Rs. 2,000 per annum, and that no such deduction was made in the Burdwan Division?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reason for this differential treatment in two separate divisions?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state in this connection the rule which is observed in the matter of making income-tax distinction?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: The income-tax law is uniform throughout the Presidency. Government have no information regarding the adoption of differential treatment in different divisions of the matters referred to in the question and no instructions have been issued on the subject by Government. The amount of the assessment is regulated in individual cases by the provisions of the law, and it is open to any person who considers that he has been improperly assessed to appeal against his assessment to the proper authority.

Listed posts and Bengal Civil Service (Judicial).

58. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased—

(*a*) to lay on the table a list showing the names of officers of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) who were first appointed to officiate in "listed" posts during 1919, 1920 and 1921, with

their respective ages at the time of obtaining such appointments; and

(*b*) to state whether it is a fact that no member of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) has up till now got a permanent appointment in the first grade of District Judges?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) During the period in question, the listed posts in the Judicial Service were held throughout by permanent men. A statement is laid on the table which shows officers who acted in temporary posts created on the recommendation of the High Court or in posts for which no civilian officer was available.

(*b*) Yes.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 58 showing officers of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) who were first appointed to officiate in Indian Civil Service posts (in excess of the sanctioned number of listed posts) during 1919, 1920 and 1921.

Name	Date of first appointment	Age.		
	1919.			
		Yrs	M	D
Mr. Durga Das Chakrabatti	18th January	51	3	3
,, Sashi Bhushan Banarji	28th May	50	0	15
,, Paresh Nath Ray Chaudhuri	19th ,,	49	9	5
,, Barada Kinkar Mukharji	13th June	49	9	29
,, Krishna Kumar Sen	8th September	47	2	24
,, Amrita Lal Mukharji	30th June	48	5	1
	1920.			
Mr. Hem Kumar Neogi	12th January	49	0	6
,, Iradatulla	11th ,,	46	7	8
,, Phanindra Mohan Chatarji	18th ,,	47	9	24
,, Bijoy Gopal Chatarji	19th ,,	47	4	5
,, Rajendra Lal Sadhu	31st May	48	3	16
,, Banamali Sen	7th July	46	10	26
	1921.			
	Nil.			

Stationery articles in court offices of Chittagong and Dacca Divisions.

59. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state whether he intends to go on tour in the year 1921?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that considerable hardship exists among the employees of the civil courts in the Dacca and Chittagong Divisions for want of stationery articles, such as paper, blotting paper, ink and thread?

(*c*) If the answer to (*b*) is in the negative, does the Hon'ble the Member intend to make an inquiry into the matter from the District Judges in those two divisions?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) If necessity arises, not otherwise.

(*b*) He has no such information.

(*c*) The District Judges concerned may be relied on to bring the matter to the notice of the authorities if the suggestion in (*b*) is well-founded.

Amendment of Act XII of 1887.

60. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state whether it is in the contemplation of the Government to move the Government of India to amend Act XII of 1887 with a view to having a self-contained Act for this Presidency only?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: The answer is in the negative.

Privilege leave to Bengal Civil Service (Judicial).

61. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state whether any reply has been received from the Government of India regarding the grant of privilege leave on full pay to officers of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial)?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: No final communication from the Government of India has yet been received on the subject.

Quarters for Munsifs.

62. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to lay on the table a list of subdivisions and munsifis—

(*i*) where munsifs' quarters are provided by Government; and

(*ii*) where no such quarters are provided?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether the Government contemplate making any provision in the next year's budget for the construction of quarters for munsifs where there are no quarters at present?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) (*i*) and (*ii*) A list of subdivisions and munsifis is laid on the table. Asterisks show the places where munsifs' quarters are provided by Government. The list does not include the places where such residences are under construction.

(*b*) That will depend upon the necessities of each case and availability of sufficient funds

List of subdivisions and munsifis referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 62.

Division	Subdivision	Munsifi
Burdwan ...	Burdwan (Sadar) ...	... Burdwan
	Katwa ...	.. Katwa.
	Kalna ...	.. Kalna
	Asansol .	.. Asansol *
	Burdwan (Sadar) ..	... Suri.
		Durgapur
		Bolpur.*
	Rampurhat ...	... Rampurhat.
	Bankura (Sadar) ...	... Bankura
		Khatra.*
	Vishnupur ..	... Vishnupur.
	Midnapore (Sadar)	... Midnapore.
		Garhbeta *
		Dantan
	Ghatal ...	... Ghatal
	Tamluk ...	... Tamluk.*
	Contai ...	... Contai
		Dantan.*
	Hooghly ...	.. Hooghly.
	Serampore ...	... Serampore
	Arambagh ...	... Arambagh *
	Howrah (Sadar) ...	... Howrah.
	Ulubaria ...	... Amta
		Ulubaria.*

Division.	Subdivision.	Munsifi.
Presidency ...	24-Parganas (Sadar) ...	Alipore
		Baruipur.
	Diamond Harbour ...	Diamond Harbour.°
	Barrackpore	Sealdah.
	Barasat	Barasat.°
	Basirhat	Basirhat.°
	Nadia (Sadar)	Krishnagar
	Kushtia	Kushtia
	Meherpur	Meherpur.
	Chuadanga	Chuadanga. °
	Ranaghat	Ranaghat.
	Murshidabad (Sadar) ...	Berhampore
	Lalbagh	Lalbagh.
	Jangipur	Jangipur °
	Kandi	Kandi.
	Jessore (Sadar)	Jessore.
	Magura	Magura.°
	Narail	Narail °
	Bangaon	Bangaon
	Jhenida	Jhenida °
	Khulna (Sadar)	Khulna
	Satkhira	Satkhira.°
	Bagerhat	Bagerhat °
Dacca	Dacca (Sadar)	Dacca.
	Narayanganj	Narayanganj.
	Manikganj	Manikganj.
	Munshiganj	Munshiganj.°
	Mymensingh (Sadar) ...	Mymensingh
		Iswarganj. °
	Jamalpur	Sherpur. °
		Jamalpur.°
	Tangail	Pingna.
		Tangail.°
	Netrakona	Netrakona.
	Kishorganj	Kishorganj °
		Bajitpur.
	Faridpur (Sadar)	Faridpur.
	Gopalganj	Bhanga.
	Madaripur	Madaripur.
		Chikandi.
	Goalundo	Goalundo.°
	Patuakhali	Patuakhali °
	Pirojpur	Pirojpur.°
	Bakarganj (Sadar) ...	Barisal.
	Bhola	Bhola.°

Division	Subdivision	Munsifi
Chittagong ...	Chittagong (Sadar) ...	Chittagong.
		Fatikchari.°
		Hathazari °
		North Raojan.
		South Raojan.
		Patiya °
		Satkania °
	Cox's Bazar	Cox's Bazar.°
	Tippera (Sadar)	Comilla
	Brahmanbaria	Brahmanbaria.
		Kasba °
		Nabinagar °
	Chandpur	Chandpur.°
	Noakhali (Sadar)	Sudharam ° (a)
		Hatiya °
		Lakshmipur °
		Sandwip °
	Feni	Feni.
Rajshahi ..	Rajshahi (Sadar)	Boalia.
	Naugaon	Naugaon °
		Nawabganj
	Nator	Nator.
	Dinajpur (Sadar)	Dinajpur.
		Raiganj.
	Balurghat	Balurghat °
	Thakurgaon .	Thakurgaon.°
	Jalpaiguri (Sadar) ...	Jalpaiguri.°
	Alipur	Alipur (b)
	Rangpur (Sadar)	Rangpur.
	Nilphamari	Nilphamari.°
	Kurigaon	Kurigaon.°
	Gaibandha	Gaibandha.°
	Bogra (Sadar)	Bogra.
	Pabna (Sadar)	Pabna.
	Sirajganj	Sirajganj
	Malda (Sadar) . ..	Malda
		Nawabganj.
	Darjeeling	.....
	Kalimpong	.....
	Kurseong	.....
	Siliguri	.....

(a) Temporary residences have been built at Sonapur

(b) In Alipur Duars there is no munsif, but the Subdivisional Officer exercises the powers of a munsif.

Admission into Presidency College.

63. Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether it is a fact that only those boys who have passed the Matriculation Examination in the first division are allowed admission to the first year class in the Presidency College? If so, why?

(*b*) Is it a fact that in this year the College authorities denied admission to a candidate who was otherwise duly qualified exclusively on the ground that he happened to attend a political meeting?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) There is no rule to this effect, nor is admission to the College made entirely on the basis of matriculation results. Other factors are taken into consideration, the aim being to secure that all classes of the community, and all parts of the province, are represented so far as accommodation permits. The competition for admission is, however, so keen that the majority of those admitted have passed the Matriculation Examination in the first class.

(*b*) It is not a fact. Such information is not communicated to the Principal, and the reference in the question is not known.

Strikes and "hartals" and business licenses.

64. Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether it is a fact that a circular has been issued to all municipalities, enjoining upon them the advisability of withholding licenses from shop-keepers and tradesmen participating in *hartals* and strikes?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to lay on the table a copy of the circular in question?

(*c*) Have the Government any information as to the action taken by the municipalities on the aforesaid circular?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) and (*b*) A copy of Government letter No. 229-33 T.—L.S.-G., dated the 13th June, 1921, is laid on the table.

(*c*) Government have no information, except that the municipal commissioners of Faridpur have expressed their inability to comply with the suggestions made in the Government letter.

Letter referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 64.

No. 229-33 T.—L.S.-G., dated Darjeeling, the 13th June 1921.

From—L. S. S. O'MALLEY, ESQ., C.I.E., I.C.S., Secretary to the Government of Bengal, Department of Local Self-Government,

To—All Commissioners of Divisions

I am directed to say that in order to safeguard the public against the general inconvenience and dislocation of business caused by the mischievous activities of non-co-operationists, the Government of Bengal (Ministry of Local Self-Government) consider it desirable that it should be made a condition of the licenses granted under the Hackney Carriage Act that they will be liable to be cancelled by the municipal commissioners if the owners or drivers refuse to ply hackney carriages for hire. It is further considered desirable that it should be made a condition of the licenses for markets granted under section 338 of the Bengal Municipal Act, that the markets shall not be closed without the permission of the municipal commissioners, and that closure without such permission may entail the cancellation of the licenses. The commissioners of municipalities in which the Calcutta Hackney Carriage Act and Part X of the Bengal Municipal Act are in force, should be informed accordingly.

Suspension of business owing to "hartals."

65. Mr. M. AHMED: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government aware of the hardship and inconvenience caused to the public owing to the sudden and wholesale closure of shops and stalls within the jurisdiction of mufassal municipalities, etc.?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of asking the local bodies in question to frame such by-laws as will prevent the sudden closing, in future, of shops and stalls?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The answer is in the affirmative.

(*b*) The attention of the member is drawn to Government letter No. 229-33 T.—L.S.-G., dated the 13th June, 1921, to all Commissioners of Divisions, a copy of which is laid on the table in reply to a similar question asked at this meeting by Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur.

Bengal Civil Service (Judicial).

66. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state whether any representation has been received from individual members of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) regarding their pay, pension, nomenclature, etc.? If so, what is the total number of such representations and what action, if any, are the Government going to take thereon?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: Representations have been received from a large number of members of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial). They are under consideration.

Alleged illegal gratifications taken by railway employees.

67. Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: (*a*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works been drawn to the allegations that illegal gratifications are taken by most of the station staffs of the railways of Bengal for the supply of empty wagons for the conveyance of goods from one station to another?

(*b*) If so, are the Government considering the desirability of directing that an inquiry be made into the matter?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) No.

(*b*) The question is one into which the Railway Department of the Local Government has no authority to direct that an inquiry should be held.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: With regard to question 67 (*a*), it appears that the answer is in the negative. Am I to understand that no illegal gratifications are taken by most of the station staffs of the railways of Bengal for the supply of empty wagons for the conveyance of goods from one station to another?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: Government has no information

Pay and prospects of Sub-Registrars.

68. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether any scheme for the improvement of the pay and prospects of Sub-Registrars has been formulated and when it is likely to be published?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: A scheme has been prepared and is now under consideration. I regret I am not at present in a position to say on what date it will be promulgated

Provincial Loan Account.

69. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to say with regard to the Provincial Loan Account, what are the considerations that led Government to pay off the entire outstanding balance thereof on the 31st March, 1921, from the Provincial balance on that date to the Government of India?

(*b*) What was the amount of the said outstanding balance on that date?

(*c*) In how many instalments and of what amount each could Government have, in the alternative, paid of the said outstanding balance?

(*d*) What would have been the rate and actual amount of interest on such instalments?

(*e*) Did Government make any inquiries from the Government of India regarding the questions referred to in clauses (*c*) and (*d*) above, before deciding to pay off the entire amount on the 31st March last? If so, with what result?

(*f*) What is the average rate and actual amount of interest recoverable by Government from parties to whom advances have been made from the said loan fund?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*), (*b*), (*c*) and (*d*) The number is referred to the speech of the Hon'ble Finance Member on page 230 of Volume I—No. 4, of the Proceedings of this Council.

(*e*) No inquiries from the Government of India were necessary as regards the questions in (*c*) and (*d*) in view of the *provisions* of rule 23 of the Devolution Rules.

(*f*) The rates of interest are: for advances under the Land Improvement and Agriculturists Loans Act, 6¼ per cent.; for advances to co-operative societies, 4 per cent.; for drainage and embankment advances, 4, 5 and 6 per cent.; for advances to land-holders, etc., 4 per cent., for advances to local bodies, 4, 5, and 6 per cent.; for miscellaneous advances, 6 and 6¼ per cent.

The estimated amount recoverable during the current year is shown on page 27 of the Financial Statement for 1921-22.

Provincial Loan.

70. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to say whether it is a fact that the Government of Bengal asked the Government of India to sanction a loan of one crore of rupees during the year 1921-22, of which fifty lakhs have been sanctioned by the Government of India?

(*b*) What are the projects other than the Grand Trunk Canal to be financed from the said loan?

(*c*) What would be the rate of interest payable on the said loan?

(*d*) At the time of making the proposal of the said loan, did the Government consider the other alternative of financing the said schemes from the balance of the Provincial Loan Account due to the Government of India, and paying off such balance in instalments to the Government of India instead of in one lump on the 31st March, 1921?

(*e*) Did Government consider the merits of such an alternative, or make any reference to the Government of India regarding its feasibility? If so, with what result?

(*f*) Are Government aware that the Governments of Madras, Bombay, the United Provinces and the Central Provinces have decided to pay off the balance of the Provincial Loan Account to the Government of India in instalments, and have been permitted to do so?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The whole sum of Rs. 50 lakhs will be required in part payment of the three dredgers which are being built at the instance of the Irrigation Department.

(*c*) One-half per cent. above the rate of interest at which the Rupee Loan of 1921 has been floated. As that rate is 6 per cent., free of income-tax, the Government of Bengal will pay practically 7 per cent interest on their loan.

(*d*) and (*e*) The member is referred to the speech of the Hon'ble Finance Member on page 230 of Volume I—No. 4 of the Proceedings of this Council.

(*f*) Government have no information.

Partition of Midnapore.

71. Babu DEVENDRA LAL KHAN: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state what effect, if any, has been given to the resolution on the annulment of the partition of Midnapore carried in this Council during the last July session.

(*b*) If none, what action do the Government contemplate giving to it?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) and (*b*) Government, for the reasons already given to the Council, do not propose to abandon the scheme for the partition of Midnapore.

Grievances of Press employees.

72. Babu HEM CHANDRA BHATTACHARJI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state when effect will be given to the Government orders of July, 1920, as regards the following:—

(*i*) that the services of all those in the Printing Department who were working before the date of the orders were to be reckoned as permanent from the date of their appointment;

(*ii*) that a committee should be formed to consider the grievances of the press employees;

(*iii*) that a provident fund should be established for the benefit of the newly-appointed men of the press in lieu of the pension system;

(*iv*) that the compositors should be promoted to the posts of copy-holders and computors; and

(*v*) that the employees should be reclassified according to the new system?

(*b*) Will the Government be pleased to state the reasons for the delay in giving effect to the orders of July, 1920?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) and (*b*) Presumably the member refers to the orders contained in the Government of India resolution No. A.-31, dated the 15th July, 1920. That resolution applies only to presses under the Government of India and not to those under the Government of Bengal.

Financial crisis of High English Schools owing to non-co-operation.

73. Mr. M. AHMED: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education aware that many long-standing high English schools of established reputation are in a state of financial crisis owing to the temporary desertion of boys consequent on the non-co-operation movement?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps to safeguard the interest of these schools by sanctioning temporary additional grants till normal conditions are restored?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of calling for statements showing the names of aided and unaided institutions in the Presidency, and the number of boys on the rolls before and after the non-co-operation movement, with a view to the exact knowledge of the financial position of these schools.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Rs. 10,000 has been placed at the disposal of the Inspectors of Schools, Rajshahi, Chittagong, and Dacca Divisions, to help good schools threatened by the non-co-operation movement.

(*c*) Figures have been collected showing the net decrease in attendance in Government and aided schools, and it does not appear that any object will be served at the present time by specially collecting the statistics of the decrease in the attendance at unaided schools—a matter of great labour. The required statistics will be obtainable in due course from the annual reports issued by the Department of Public Instruction.

Madaripur water-works.

74. Mr. M. AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state what steps, if any, are being taken by the Government for the establishment of water-works within the Madaripur Municipality?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the Government would be prepared to contribute half of the total estimated cost if the other half is borne by the Madaripur public?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) In February last the Sanitary Board forwarded a scheme, proposed by the Commissioners of the Madaripur Municipality, for a filtered water-supply system, at an estimated cost of Rs. 1,65,100. The Commissioners asked for a Government grant equivalent to half the cost of the scheme, but Government were unable to accede to this request owing to financial stringency.

(*b*) Government regret that they are not in a position to make a promise to this effect.

Port Commissioners ferry steamers.

75. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Marine Department be pleased to refer to paragraph 5 of the note of dissent, dated the 21st August, 1920, by Mr. W. C. Banarji, recorded in the proceedings of the 1776th meeting of the Port Commissioners, held on the 23rd August, 1920, and state whether the figures furnished therein about the ferry steamers conveying passengers beyond their licensed capacity are substantially correct?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to say whether the Government are considering the desirability of directing the Port Commissioners to take steps—

(*i*) to prevent such overcrowding on board the ferry steamers; and

(*ii*) to provide additional facilities so that passengers may not suffer from want of accommodation?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Port Commissioners, in calculating the expenditure on ferry service, take into account a very high percentage for depreciation, far in excess of the actual figures, as pointed out in paragraph 3 of the note of dissent, dated the 21st August, 1920, by Mr. W. C. Banarji?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR. (*a*) Mr Banarji's remarks were as follows:—

As regards the adequacy of the present facilities, not to speak of the extension of the service or opening of new stations, it will be seen from the proceedings of the 1775th meeting, held on the 16th August, 1920, that in July, 1920, these steamers carried 1,109,975 passengers, or, in round figures, 110,000 passengers were carried by each steamer during the month, there being 10 steamers at work on the lines. This comes to 3,548 passengers per day per steamer. Assuming that each steamer makes five up and five down trips to the terminii daily, which means more than 12 hours' work, the average number of passengers carried on each trip is 354, against the carrying capacity of 300 by day and 145 by night. It will be remembered that this is the average of the whole day and it can easily be conceived what the rush is during the busiest parts of the day.

His figures as regards the numbers of passengers carried and the number of steamers employed in July, 1920, were correct, but, as the total number of trips per day is 237 and not 100, as assumed by Mr. Banarji, his calculations as to the average number of passengers carried per trip were not correct. Moreover, two of the steamers employed on the service carry 1,200 passengers by day and 578 by night.

(*b*) This question does not therefore arise, but the Port Commissioners have two new ferry steamers under construction, which will help the traffic during the busy parts of the day.

(*c*) Depreciation at 5 per cent per annum was accepted as reasonable by those Commissioners who are interested in shipping and river steamer companies. Although the loans from which their ferry steamers are provided are repayable in 30 years, the Port Commissioners report that it is unlikely that any of these vessels will have a life of 30 years; that the percentage of depreciation taken must cover the possibility of loss by accident as well as ordinary wear and tear; and that the cost of replacing the old boats will certainly be much higher than their original cost on which the percentage has been taken.

Sub-Registrars.

76. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether the sub-registrars are governed by article 459 of the Civil Service Regulations so far as the age of retirement is concerned;

(*ii*) if so, whether any relaxation of the rule is contemplated with regard to the older officers who are now completing superannuated age; and

(*iii*) whether the services rendered under the Commission system are counted towards pension?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*i*) The retirement of sub-registrars is governed by article 459 (*b*) of the Civil Service Regulations, viz., "Officers, other than ministerial, who have attained the age of 55 should ordinarily be required to retire, and should not be retained in service except where unquestionable public grounds for retention exist, and there is no doubt as to the physical fitness of the officer."

(*ii*) and (*iii*) The answer is in the negative.

Case of one Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker and a head constable and chaukidar of Rajbari.

77. Maulvi ABDUL KARIM: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department aware—

(*i*) that in December, 1920, one Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker complained to the Magistrate at Rajbari in the district of Faridpur charging a head constable named Nibaran Chandra Guha and a chaukidar named Raghunath with having entered his house and assaulted him;

(*ii*) that almost simultaneously the said head constable brought a counter case against the said Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker under section 34 of Act V of 1861,

(*iii*) that in the former case the chaukidar was found guilty and sentenced to 3 months' rigorous imprisonment by the court, while in the latter case the Dhunker was fined by an Honorary Magistrate named Babu Madhab Chandra Bagchi; and

(*iv*) that thereupon the Dhunker having filed an appeal to the District Magistrate, was acquitted by the latter, who disbelieved the case for the prosecution?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member also aware—

(*i*) that in connection with the above case Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker in his appeal to the District Magistrate charged the Honorary Magistrate with having tampered with the record and changed dates of his orders and asked for an inquiry about the same; and

(*ii*) that the Magistrate in his judgment on appeal remarked as follows: "Very serious allegations have been made against the Honorary Magistrate in this case and have been supported by an affidavit. They may or may not be true, but, if true, they render him unfit to hold the position of an Honorary Magistrate. The Subdivisional Officer should personally make an inquiry into these allegations and submit a report by the 10th April."

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of making an inquiry as to what action has been taken by the Subdivisional Officer in pursuance of the orders of the District Magistrate?

(*d*) Has any inquiry been made—

(*i*) why the said head constable, Nibaran Chandra Guha, was not tried and dealt with under the law, while his accomplice, the chaukidar, was punished with imprisonment; and

(*ii*) whether the said head constable has been departmentally or otherwise punished for having "trumped" up a false case as found by the trying Magistrate?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) (*i*) On the 10th December, 1920, one Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker filed a complaint before the Subdivisional Officer of Rajbari, charging an assistant sub-inspector, Nibaran Chandra Guha, Raghunath chaukidar, and others with offences under sections 448, 323 and 379, Indian Penal Code.

(*ii*) On the same day the assistant sub-inspector instituted a case under section 34 of Act V of 1861 against Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker.

(*iii*) In the former case the chaukidar Raghunath was found guilty under sections 448, 352 and 342, Indian Penal Code, and was sentenced to 3 months' rigorous imprisonment under each section, and in the latter Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker was fined Rs 5 by Honorary Magistrate Babu Madhab Chandra Bagchi at Goalundo.

(*iv*) The District Magistrate acquitted Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker on appeal, and observed that he had the greatest doubt as to the truth of the case.

(*b*) (*i*) In his petition of appeal Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker charged the Honorary Magistrate with having changed the date of his orders, but it does not appear that he asked for an inquiry.

(*ii*) Yes.

(*c*) The Subdivisional Officer of Rajbari made a local inquiry in pursuance of the orders of the District Magistrate and reported on the 26th April, 1921, that Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker's statements were not proved satisfactorily.

(*d*) (*i*) A local inquiry was made under section 202, Criminal Procedure Code. As there was evidence only against the chaukidar, he was placed on trial, and, in the absence of evidence, no process was issued against the assistant sub-inspector.

(*ii*) Action on the report, dated the 26th April, 1921, of the Subdivisional Officer of Rajbari was postponed until the appeal of chaukidar Raghunath was disposed of. That appeal was dismissed on the 25th June by Babu Akhoy Kumar Sen, Deputy Magistrate of Faridpur. The Magistrate brought the matter to the notice of the Superintendent of Police, who has instituted departmental proceedings, the result of which is not yet known.

Irrigation of land around the Ajai and Damodar.

78. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state whether the question of the possibility of irrigation being carried on on an extensive scale in Bengal has been examined?

(*b*) If so, what has been the result of that examination?

(*c*) Has the question of the irrigation of the country around the Ajai and Damodar rivers been examined to see whether the same results can be achieved as in the case of the Sone?

(*d*) If so, with what result?

The Honble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) Yes, by the Irrigation Commission, 1901—1903.

(*b*) The only recommendation for extension of irrigation works in Bengal, as now constituted, in paragraph 398 of Part II, Provincial Report, viz., for a weir across the Damodar river.

(*c*) and (*d*) As a result of investigations, a scheme for an irrigation canal with a weir across the Damodar river has been prepared and it has received the sanction of the Secretary of State recently. The scheme for the Ajai river irrigation will not be satisfactory, as the discharge in the river in the rains in a year of drought is so low that the cost of any work of saddling the river will be prohibitive when its utility is considered.

Sanitation of rural areas.

79. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether he has drawn up any scheme of sanitation for the rural areas, to which reference was made by him at the Editors' Conference in Calcutta?

(*b*) If so, is the Hon'ble the Minister considering the desirability of supplying copies of the schemes to members of this Council and of inviting their opinions?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state what amount of money will be necessary, both for the capital and the recurring expenditure, to carry out the scheme?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the sources from which the scheme is to be financed?

(*e*) If it is to be financed from a loan, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state how a sinking fund is to be provided and the interest charges are to be met?

(*f*) Has the Hon'ble the Minister consulted any experts and, if so, will he be pleased to name the experts with their qualifications and experience?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The answer is in the negative. I would invite the attention of the member to the following remarks made by me in my speech at the Conference:—" You and I, the Government and the people, must co-operate to rid the country of malarial fever, or at any rate to reduce its scope and the range of its malignant influence. Popular information and expert knowledge must be combined and co-ordinated for one great and common purpose. With this object in view I have invited the District Boards to hold conferences of all leading men in their districts, with a view to formulate, in the light of local knowledge and information, schemes of water-supply and anti-malarial operations, together with the cost thereof and the means of meeting them. I am prepared to be present at some of these conferences, if so desired. These conferences will stimulate local interest, focus local wants and views, and expert knowledge and local opinion will act and re-act upon one another and strengthen one another by their mutual inter-action."

(*b*) to (*f*) This does not arise.

Murder of a boy of Dhalla (Mymensingh).

80. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: (*a*) Has the attention of the Member in charge of the Police Department been drawn to the murder of a young boy of 15 or 16, son of a widow named Birohini Malini, of Dhalla, district Mymensingh?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the mother and grandmother of the murdered boy recognised the murderers and at once reported the matter to the local zamindar and panchayat and subsequently to the local police?

(*c*) Will the Government be pleased to state what the local police has done in the matter?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*). Government are not aware of the facts; inquiry is being made.

Accommodation of witnesses in law courts.

81. Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department aware of the hardships experienced by the witnesses in law courts for want of proper arrangements for their accommodation?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking such steps as may be necessary to remove this grievance?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) There are courts in connection with which the arrangements for the accommodation of witnesses are defective.

(*b*) When specific proposals are received with reference to particular courts they are taken up in order of urgency and as funds permit.

"Ramzan," "Shabi-Kader" and "Ayyam-i-Tashriq."

82. Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to say why no holiday is granted on the occasion of the *Ramzan*, *Shabi-Kader* and *Ayyam-i-Tashriq* festivals as in the case of other religious festivals?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) The *Ramzan*, which is a season of fasting and not a festival, lasts for a month, and it would be impracticable to secure a general suspension of business during that period. As far as Government are aware, it is not the practice in any Muhammadan country to close the public courts and offices during the *Ramzan*, nor do private Muhammadan employers in India suspend their business during this period. It is indeed understood that abstention from ordinary business during the season of fasting would be contrary to the tenets of the religion of Islam. Two days' holidays are, however, allowed for the festival of the *Idul-Fitr*, which marks the close of the *Ramzan*

(*b*) The *Shabi-Kader* is observed on varying dates by different sections of the Muhammadan Community during the last ten days of the *Ramzan* month. It is understood that its observance necessitates the recitation of prayers during the night only, and no suggestion has ever been made that a holiday is necessary on this account.

(*c*) The *Ayyam-i-Tashriq* forms part of the *Id-uz-zoha* festival, for which two days' holidays are already allowed, one being a holiday under the Negotiable Instruments Act, and the other a special holiday for Muhammadan employees of Government.

Action on resolutions carried in Council.

83. Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Legislative Department be pleased to state, in each case, what steps have been or are being taken on the resolutions of this Council passed at the last two sessions?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: A list of resolutions carried in the Legislative Council during the last three sessions will be found posted up in the lobby, and the action taken by Government on each is also shown therein, to the extent that final orders have so far been passed.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: In connection with this matter the public appears to be under the impression that no steps are taken on the recommendations of this Council. It appears from the answer that a list of resolutions carried in the Legislative Council has been posted up in the lobby, and the action taken by Government on each is also shown therein. May I take the indulgence to suggest that it should be circulated amongst the members?

The PRESIDENT: I do not think that is a supplementary question.

Action on resolutions carried in Council.

84. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Legislative Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing in detail the action taken on the several resolutions carried in the Bengal Legislative Council since February, 1921.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The member is referred to the answer given to a similar question asked by Babu Amulya Dhone Addy.

Partition of Midnapore.

85. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state whether any effect is intended to be given by the Government to the resolution of this Council passed in the last sessions regarding the proposed partition of the district of Midnapore?

(*b*) What was the annual total cost of administration of the district of Midnapore last year?

(*c*) What is the estimated annual cost of administration of this district if it be partitioned into two?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Government, for the reasons already given to the Council, do not propose to abandon the scheme for the partition of Midnapore.

(*b*) and (*c*) The extra annual cost of establishments on account of the division of Midnapore into two districts was estimated in 1917 to be Rs. 97,618. This estimate is now being revised with reference to the revised scales of pay sanctioned.

Mr. Turner as Librarian of Dacca University.

86. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether Mr. Turner has been appointed Librarian of the Dacca University?

(*b*) If so, what special qualifications does he possess for the office of a Librarian?

(*c*) Has he any previous experience as a Librarian in any library in India or Europe?

(*d*) Was the post of the Librarian advertised?

(*e*) If so, how many applications were received?

(*f*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to lay on the table a statement giving the names and qualifications of the candidates who applied for this post?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) Mr. Turner has been so appointed by the Dacca University acting under Statutory powers.

(*b*) and (*c*) As Principal of Chittagong and Dacca Colleges he had necessarily to become conversant with library management and organisation and, with a view to his present appointment, he spent 3½ months in England on deputation, studying librarianship and, visiting libraries.

(*d*) The post was not advertised. Mr. Turner was appointed to it by the Vice-Chancellor with the previous sanction of the Governor of Bengal as Chancellor under section 50 (*b*) of the Dacca University Act.

(*e*) and (*f*) Do not arise.

Mr. K. C. De's letter to Chief Secretary.

87. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (*a*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department been drawn to a copy of a letter published in the *Servant* in its issue of 25th July last, which is alleged to have been addressed to the Chief Secretary to the Government of Bengal, Political Department, by Mr. K. C. De, the Commissioner of the Chittagong Division?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the said letter was addressed to the Chief Secretary by Mr. K. C. De?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) and (*b*) The reply is in the affirmative.

Licenses to make alimentary salt in Midnapore.

88. Babu SARAT CHANDRA JANAH: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether it is a fact that on the recommendations of the Government of Bengal, the Government of India, in exercise of the powers conferred under section 6 of Act XII of 1882 (The Indian Salt Act), withdrew the restrictions with regard to the excavation and removal of saline deposits and efflorescence for the purpose of making alimentary salt therefrom in certain parts of the district of Midnapore?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the recent orders of Government withholding the said license to the people to make alimentary salt for their own consumption has been very keenly felt by the people, especially by the poorer classes?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of extending the said privilege to the people for a further period of time?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) No orders have been issued by the Government of India, and the prohibition which was imposed in 1898 on the manufacture of salt in the saline tracts bordering on the Bay of Bengal has never been withdrawn. Owing to the dislocation of the salt trade caused by the war, the Government of Bengal in December, 1917, issued instructions to the Commissioner of Salt to refrain from instituting prosecutions on account of petty breaches of the law in those areas, in cases when the manufacture was on a small scale and primarily for personal and domestic consumption.

(*b*) It has recently been reported that this concession is being abused and that salt is being manufactured in large quantities for sale at the local *hâts*. As there is now an ample supply of licit salt in the country, Government have decided that the manufacture of illicit salt can no longer be permitted, and the inhabitants of the saline tracts have been warned that after the 1st October next, prosecutions will be instituted for any breaches of the law. Only one protest has been received against these orders, and Government are not aware that they are likely to cause serious hardship.

(*c*) In the circumstances explained, Government are not prepared to permit infringement of the law for any further period.

Decline in the population of Murshidabad.

89. Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: (*a*) With reference to statement No 2, which was laid on the table in answer to my starred question No. LIV (*f*) asked at the meeting of the 4th July, 1921, will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self Government be pleased to lay on the table a supplementary statement showing the number of births and deaths in the thanas of—(*1*) Farakka, (*2*) Saktipur, (*3*) Hursh, (*4*) Kagram, and (*5*) Bhakuri, in the district of Murshidabad, as these thanas were not shown in the statement already laid on the table?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the figures shown against Sujaganj thana include the figures for Berhampore town?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The thanas mentioned in the statement, refer to revenue thanas. The figures relating to the five police-stations named by the member are included, respectively, in the statistics furnished with regard to revenue thanas Shamshirganj, Beldanga, Raninagar, Bharatpur and Sujaganj. Separate figures relating to these police-stations are not available.

(*b*) The answer is in the negative.

Deputy Inspector-General of Police.

90. Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) what duties are assigned to the post of the Deputy Inspector-General of Police; and

(*ii*) the number of such appointments that existed before, and the number after, the partition of Bengal?

(*b*) If there were any alterations in the number of such posts as before and after the partition of Bengal, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reasons for the alteration?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) (*i*) The duties of Deputy Inspector-General of Police are indicated in rules 75 to 81 of the Police Regulations, Bengal, Volume I, a copy of which is placed on the library table.

(*ii*) Before the territorial changes of April, 1912, there existed the following posts:—

In Bengal.

Deputy Inspector-General, Presidency Range.

Deputy Inspector-General, Burdwan Range.

Deputy Inspector-General, Bihar Range.

Deputy Inspector-General, Criminal Investigation Department and Railways.

Deputy Inspector-General, Intelligence Branch (temporary).

In Eastern Bengal and Assam.

Deputy Inspector-General, Western Range.

Deputy Inspector-General, Eastern Range.

Deputy Inspector-General, Criminal Investigation Department and Railways and River Police.

The number of posts at present is seven, viz.:—

Deputy Inspector-General, Presidency Range.

Deputy Inspector-General, Burdwan Range.

Deputy Inspector-General, Dacca Range.

Deputy Inspector-General, Rajshahi Range.

Deputy Inspector-General, Bakarganj Range, and River Police.

Deputy Inspector-General, Crimnal Investigation Department.

Deputy Inspector-General, Intelligence Branch (temporary).

(*b*) The alterations were made with the sanction of the Secretary of State in order to secure adequate supervision over police work in the province.

Mr. Biss's Report on primary education.

91. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to say whether the Government are considering the desirability of publishing a translation of Mr. Biss's report (or of its substance) on primary education in Bengal?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: This has been prepared and is being printed for circulation

Damodar reservoir works.

92. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state whether it is a fact that no progress has been made in the reservoir works of the river Damodar?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to say when it is intended to start the work?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) There has been certain amount of delay lately in getting the reports printed owing to the strike in the Government Press.

(*b*) The opinion of Civil Officers and the Inspector-General of Irrigation will now be obtained and until they are received no action can be taken.

Damodar and Barakar reservoir works.

93. Mr. SYED ERFAN ALI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state what progress has been made towards the construction of storage reservoirs in the basin of the Damodar and Barakar rivers for the prevention of flood?

(*b*) Is it in the contemplation of the Government to commence the work soon?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) A detailed project for the reservoirs has been prepared by Mr. E. L. Glass who was put on special duty for this purpose and

this project has been technically examined by an expert officer, viz., Mr. C. Addams-Williams, C.I.E., Superintending Engineer. These papers have now been printed.

(*b*) It is now proposed to obtain the opinion of civil officers and the Inspector-General of Irrigation and, until they are received, no further action can be taken as already stated in reply to an unstarred question put by Rai Lalit Mohan Singh Roy Bahadur at this meeting.

Proposed forest reserves in the Western Duars.

94. Rai Sahib PANCHANAN BARMA: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) aware of the fact that large areas of land are being acquired for the extension of the Reserve Forests in the Government *Khas Mahals* of the Western Duars in the Jalpaiguri district?

(*b*) Is it a fact that some lands on the river side are made *khas* and included in the *khas* lands in order to increase the revenue of the Forest Department and grazing fees?

(*c*) What action, if any, are the Government taking to put a stop to the abovementioned practice?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) It is not clear to what the question refers. Proposals for the reservation of certain areas in the Western Duars have been received and notifications under section 4 of the Forest Act have been issued. Objections, if received, will be duly considered.

(*b*) No. It is not clear to what river the question refers. Proposals for the exclusion of professional graziers from certain river-bed areas in the Duars in the interest of local inhabitants have been received.

(*c*) There is no such practice.

Cattle improvement.

95. Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state what steps have been, or are being, taken by the Government and the local authorities for the provision of public pasture grounds, public bulls for breeding purposes, and the establishment and maintenance of veterinary charitable dispensaries, in Bengal?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: The member is referred to the replies given to questions 4 (*c*) (*i*), (*ii*) and (*iii*) asked by him in the Council meeting of 7th February, 1921.

Separation of Judicial and Executive functions.

96. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether any effect is intended to be given by the Government to the resolution of this Council passed in the winter sessions regarding the separation of the Judicial and Executive functions in Bengal?

(*b*) If so, what steps, if any, have been taken by the Government for the purpose of arriving at a suitable scheme for an effectual separation?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) and (*b*) The member is referred to the answer given to a starred question on the same subject asked at this meeting by Mr. Ajoy Chunder Dutt.

Sanitary Commissioner, Eastern Bengal and Assam.

97. Babu JOGENDRA NATH ROY: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to lay on the table the report of the work done by the Sanitary Commissioner, Eastern Bengal and Assam, during the last official year?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: The appointment of Sanitary Commissioner, Eastern Bengal and Assam, ceased to exist in 1912 on the abolition of the province of Eastern Bengal and Assam.

Illegal exactions by zamindars in Rangpur.

98. Rai Sahib PANCHANAN BARMA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state whether he is aware that reports of realisations of *abwabs*, illegal exactions, threats of violence, wrongful confinement and some such other *zulum* made by zamindars or zamindars' men upon the poor raiyats, are numerous in the district of Rangpur?

(*b*) What action, if any, are the Government taking to prevent possible future disturbances arising out of the present state of affairs?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) From the annual report on the Land Revenue Administration in the Rajshahi Division it appears that *abwabs* or illegal cesses are levied by zamindars of Rangpur from their tenants.

(*b*) Government are not aware that any special action to prevent disturbances is required. It is, however, proposed to commence survey and settlement operations in Rangpur district next year.

Assistant Secretary, Judicial Department.

99. Sir ASHUTOSH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state--

(*a*) why a deputy magistrate has been appointed as Assistant Secretary in the Judicial Department;

(*b*) whether provision was made in the last Budget for this new appointment;

(*c*) why no officer of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) has been appointed to this post;

(*d*) whether any attempt was made to procure a suitable judicial officer for this newly-created post;

(*e*) if the answer to (*d*) be in the affirmative, what has been the result of that attempt;

(*f*) how long will the newly-appointed gentleman continue to occupy this post and what are his special qualifications for this post;

(*g*) whether it is the intention of Government to exclude officers of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) from this post if and when it comes to be permanently filled up;

(*h*) whether it is a fact that a large number of officers of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) submitted representations to Government claiming that this post should be filled up from their rank; if so, were their representations taken into consideration when filling the post;

(*i*) whether it is a fact that there are at present four Assistant Secretaries under the Bengal Government who are members of the Bengal Civil Service (Executive) and none from the ranks of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial)?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) A deputy magistrate has been appointed as the post requires administrative experience of a character which a member of the executive service has opportunities of acquiring. The incumbent of this post has to deal with administrative work not only of the Judicial Department but also of the Police and the Political Branches of the Chief Secretary's Department.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) The duties attached to the post are in no sense of a judicial character. Further it would ordinarily be doing a disservice to the Judicial service if a munsif were to be withdrawn from the Bench for a number of years and employed in work of a purely administrative character and then sent back to the Bench probably as a Subordinate Judge when he has reached the maximum pay allowed to an Assistant Secretary.

(*d*) Several applications from the members of the Judicial Branch of the Bengal Civil Service were received and duly considered.

(*e*) *Vide* answer to (*a*).

(*f*) No definite term has been assigned to the appointment. The officer selected is a deputy magistrate of 12 years' service and he has had previous experience of Secretariat work.

(*g*) The officers of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) are eligible for the post and it is not the intention of Government to exclude them. The cases of suitable candidates for that service will be duly considered when the occasion arises.

(*h*) Yes.

(*i*) Yes.

Country liquor.

100. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state (if he is in a position to do so) the strength of the country liquor which is generally sold—

(*i*) in Calcutta; and

(*ii*) in the suburbs of Calcutta?

(*b*) Is the strength higher than that suggested by the Excise Commission?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) (*i*) and (*ii*) 25°, 40° and 70° under proof.

(*b*) No.

Privilege to Steamer Companies plying boats and vessels through Circular and Eastern Canals.

101. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether the cargo boats and vessels of the India General Steam Navigation and Rivers Steam Navigation Companies, plying through the Circular and Eastern Canals, enjoy any privileges in the matter of the payment of tolls;

(*ii*) whether the tolls on such boats and vessels are charged on way bills and manifests furnished by the employees of the Companies; and

(*iii*) whether the way bills of the Companies are checked by the canal officers, and, if so, how often have they been so checked since 1913?

(*b*) If the answer to (*i*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state when and why such privileges were granted to the said Companies?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) (*i*) There are no special privileges beyond those allowable by the navigation rules for the Calcutta Canals and Tolly's Nulla system.

(*ii*) Yes.

(*iii*) No.

(*b*) The privilege was granted from 1913 with a view to avoid detention of vessels belonging to approved firms whose manifests could be accepted as reliable and authorised under amendment of rules published under Irrigation Department notification No. 7 of the 15th July, 1913.

Drunkenness in Calcutta and its suburbs.

102. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether it is a fact that there has been a steady increase in drunkenness and convictions arising therefrom in Calcutta and its suburbs during the last five years?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: The number of convictions for drunkenness has increased in Calcutta, but has decreased in the suburbs. The increase in the number of convictions, however, does not necessarily indicate an increase in drunkenness.

Waiting-room at Barisal steamer station.

103. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Marine Department be pleased to state--

(*i*) whether he is aware of the fact that there is no waiting-room at Barisal for any class of passenger whatever;

(*ii*) whether he is aware of the fact that passengers from Patuakhali and other parts of the district of Bakarganj have got to wait for six and seven hours at Barisal for the Khulna steamer; and

(*iii*) whether the Government are considering the desirability of inviting the immediate attention of the Rivers Steam Navigation Company to this grievance?

(*b*) Whether he is aware of the fact that there is no steamer service between Patuakhali and Kelowpara in the Sundarbans?

(*c*) Whether it is a fact that a large sum of money is spent annually by Government for the Sundarbans colonisation scheme at Kelowpara and the neighbourhood?

(*d*) Whether he is aware of the fact that a considerable number of men and women have got to come to Patuakhali from Kelowpara and the neighbourhood for purposes of trade and litigation?

(*e*) Whether the Government are considering the desirability of addressing the Rivers Steam Navigation Company on the desirability of introducing a steamer service between Patuakhali and Kelowpara?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) (*i*) Government are informed that the Rivers Steam Navigation Company's office at Barisal contains a spacious room and verandah for Indian female passengers, and a verandah space for male passengers. Arrangements are being made to close in a portion of the verandah space for male passengers.

(*ii*) There are two services to Barisal from Patuakhali, viz., the "Express," which arrives at about 8 hours and suits court litigants and the "Inter," which arrives at about 22 hours and forms connection with the Amtali and Galachipa feeders. In the case of the "Express," passengers for Calcutta travel by the Barisal-Khulna Express steamer, which leaves at 16-30 hours and thus have to wait about 8½ hours. Passengers by the "Inter" for Calcutta leave by the down Khulna night mail at 5 hours after a wait of about 7 hours. The Steamer Companies report that there are insufficient passengers for Calcutta to warrant making any change and any change that might be made would be to the disadvantage of the local passengers, who are much more numerous than passengers for Calcutta.

(*iii*) In view of the facts mentioned in (*ii*) Government do not propose to take any action.

(*b*) There is no steamer service between Patuakhali and Kelowpara. Steamers run to Amtali, which is about 14 miles by boat from Kelowpara. The Steamer Companies hope to establish a service to Kelowpara when steamers are available.

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) Government have no information.

(*e*) Government have already addressed the Steamer Companies with the result stated in (*b*).

Bengal Civil Service (Judicial).

104. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: With reference to the reply to my unstarred question No. 196 (*b*) (*ii*) asked at the meeting of the 4th July last, will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state—

(*a*) whether he is at present in a position to state when the probationary system is going to be introduced in the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial);

(*b*) the reasons for not issuing salary slips for Rs. 300 to those munsifs who joined the service in 1919 and have completed one year's service; and

(*c*) the names of those munsifs who joined the service in 1919 or in 1920 and have completed one year's service, with the respective dates when each of them completed such service?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) The local Government is in communication with the High Court and therefore no definite statement can be made at present.

(*b*) Salary slips for Rs. 300 have been issued to those munsifs who have completed one year's service.

(*c*) A list is laid on the library table.

Baitun Najat Imambara at Garden Reach.

105. Mr. SYED ERFAN ALI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state the full history of the Baitun Najat Imambara at Garden Reach and its present condition?

(*b*) What steps are taken for the preservation and upkeep of this building, and under whose care is it placed?

(*c*) Is it in charge of a private person or in charge of one of the sons of the King of Oudh?

(*d*) Is it a fact that the major portion of the purchase money of this building was paid out of the assets of the property left by the late King of Oudh?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) and (*d*) Some lands with buildings belonging to the estate of the late King of Oudh were sold by public auction in 1894, and the purchasers wished to demolish the buildings. The Muhammadan community objected on the ground that some of the buildings were used for religious purposes, and it was arranged that the building known as Baitun Najat Imambara, together with its site, should be repurchased for Rs 25,000, half of the cost being met by subscription from the Muhammadan community and the other half from the estate of the late King of Oudh, subject to the condition that the surplus land not required for the purposes of the Imambara should be sold and the proceeds credited to the Oudh estate. A managing committee was chosen by the subscribers, and it was decided that the deed of conveyance of the property should be executed in favour of the Secretary of State for India, and that the Imambara and its approach way should then be conveyed to the members of the managing committee, and the surplus land to the purchasers who might be found for it. The property was repurchased in the name of the Secretary

of State for India in 1895, and the managing committee was given possession of it, though no deed conveying it to the committee appears to have been executed. The surplus land was subsequently sold to the managing committee for Rs. 4,000 and the amount credited to the Oudh estate.

It was reported to Government in 1919, that the conveyance of the property to the committee had not been effected, and that most of the members of the committee elected in 1895 were dead. The question of the formation of a new committee, to which the property might be transferred, has since been under consideration, the delay having been due to the difficulty of tracing the original subscribers or their present representatives.

(*b*) and (*c*) Government have no information as to its present condition. The property has been in the possession and under the management of the committee since 1895 and Government are not responsible for its maintenance.

Hindus and Muhammadans in the Police Service.

106. Khan Bahadur Maulvi HAFIZAR RAHMAN CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement giving the following information regarding the Bengal Police force, viz., the total number of—

(*a*) sub-inspectors—
(1) Hindus;
(2) Muhammadans;

(*b*) inspectors—
(1) Hindus,
(2) Muhammadans;

(*c*) deputy superintendents of police—
(1) Hindus;
(2) Muhammadans,

(*d*) superintendents of police—
(1) Hindus;
(2) Muhammadans?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: A statement is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 106.

	Total number	Hindus	Muhammadans.
Sub-inspectors	1,833	1,100	719
Inspectors	251	191	23
Deputy superintendents	30	20 (*a*)	9 (*a*)
Superintendents	58	4 (*b*)	1 (*c*)

(*a*) Including officers on deputation.
(*b*) Two of them are sub. *pro tem.*
(*c*) Sub *pro tem.*

Chaukidari tax.

107. Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state what action, if any, has been or is being taken by the Government on the resolution passed by the Bengal Agriculturists' Association (13, Mirzapur Street, Calcutta), recommending the abolition of the village chaukidari tax on agriculturists?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: No such resolution as that referred to in the question has been received by Government.

Local boards in smaller areas.

108. Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether the districts boards and local boards have been asked to express their opinion on the subject of the formation of local boards in areas smaller than that of a subdivision?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the names of the boards that have expressed—

(*i*) their opinion in favour of the scheme;

(*ii*) their opinion against the scheme; and

(*iii*) no opinion up to date?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) Only the district boards were asked to express their opinion.

(*b*) (*i*) Murshidabad, Burdwan, Faridpur, Bakarganj, Mymensingh, Jessore, Birbhum, Midnapore, Hooghly, Dinajpur, Jalpaiguri, Bogra and Malda.

(*ii*) Rajshahi, Dacca, 24-Parganas, Khulna, Bankura, Rangpur, Pabna, Nadia and Howrah.

(*iii*) Chittagong, Tippera and Noakhali.

"Vakalatnamas" in Calcutta Police Courts.

109. Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state why *vakalatnamas* are not required in the Calcutta Police Courts?

(*b*) Do the Government propose to introduce the system?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) In accordance with the long-standing practice, pleaders appearing in the Calcutta Police Courts do not file *vakalatnamas*. The question was once raised in 1902 and,

on the advice of the Advocate-General, it was decided not to sanction any rule requiring *vakalatnamas* from pleaders appearing in the Police Courts.

(*b*) No.

Bengal Civil Service age-limit.

110. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (*a*) With reference to the answer to question No. 103 at the last July sessions of the Bengal Legislative Council, in which the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department was pleased to state that the question of the age-limit of candidates for appointment to the Bengal Civil Service is under the consideration of the Government, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state when the new rules are likely to be published?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of giving effect to these rules from the current year, to enable candidates to get the advantage of these rules before the year's appointments are made?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) The question of framing revised rules for the recruitment of the Bengal Civil Service is still under the consideration of Government. It is not possible to say at present when the new rules are likely to be published.

(*b*) No.

Salt imported into Bengal.

111. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state the quantity of salt imported into Bengal during the last financial year:—

(*i*) from foreign countries;

(*ii*) from other parts of India?

(*b*) Is any salt produced in Bengal?

(*c*) If the answer to (*b*) is in the affirmative, then, where and in what quantities is salt produced in Bengal?

(*d*) What steps have been taken or are proposed to be taken by the Government in order to encourage the manufacture of salt in Bengal?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) (*i*) 15,606,330 maunds.

(*ii*) 647,235 maunds.

(*b*) and (*c*) Salt is not produced on a large scale in Bengal. A certain quantity, amounting last year to 780 maunds, is educed in the process of refinement of saltpetre, and last year 300 maunds of impure salt (*sitta*) were left in the course of refinement. There are five licensed saltpetre refineries at Maniktala, Sulkea, Kakurgachi, Bahirsura and Baranagar. Last year the people in the saliferous districts, such

as Midnapore and the 24-Parganas, were permitted to manufacture salt in small quantities and primarily for domestic consumption, but orders have recently been issued withdrawing this concession with effect from the 1st October, 1921.

(*d*) Formerly the manufacture of salt in Bengal was absolutely prohibited, but it is now permitted under license granted by Government.

One firm has taken out a license, but it is understood that manufacture has not yet started. Government are prepared to consider applications for further licenses.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: It appears from the answer to questions (*b*) and (*c*) that last year the people in certain saliferous districts were permitted to manufacture salt in small quantities. Will the Hon'ble Member be pleased to state why this concession has been withdrawn this year?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: The answer to that is given in more detail in another question. The fact is that the manufacture of salt in those areas was against law, but during the war, owing to shortage of salt, Government gave instructions to the Commissioner of Salt that he should not institute prosecutions for petty breaches of the law in those areas. As there is now plenty of salt available, Government have decided that the law must take its course in the future.

Irrigated areas.

112. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state the figures for the last three years:—

(*i*) of the area irrigated in Bengal;

(*ii*) how it is irrigated;

(*iii*) how much area is beyond the means of any kind of irrigation;

(*iv*) how much of the area irrigated is productive, and how much preventive;

(*v*) what expenditure is incurred annually both for the productive and the preventive measures; and

(*vi*) what annual income is derived from the productive measures?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*i*) The area irrigated in Bengal from canals during the last three years is shown below:—

		1918-19	1919-20	1920-21.
		Acres	Acres.	Acres.
By the Midnapore Canal	...	80,749	89,692	91,066
By the Eden Canal	...	20,539	20,799	22,245
Total	...	101,288	110,491	113,311

(*ii*) By flow or gravitation system by water drawn from the rivers Cossye and Damodar.

(*iii*) The total area commanded by the two systems of canals is 230,400 acres and the rest of the area in Bengal is beyond the command of any artificial system of irrigation.

(*iv*) The Midnapore Canal system is the only work classified as "Productive," and the areas are given in (*i*) above. There is no system of irrigation works in Bengal under classification "Protective," which presumably the member refers to as "Preventive."

(*v*) The expenditure on Productive Irrigation Works in Bengal for the last three years is given below:—

				Rs
1918-19	...	...	...	1,74,913
1919-20	...	..	...	1,91,110
1920-21	...	...	...	1,89,662

Expenditure on Productive Irrigation Works is—Nil.

(*vi*) The income derived from Productive Irrigation Works during the last three years is given below:—

		Gross receipts	Working expenses	Net receipts
		Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
1918-19	...	2,36,111	1,74,913	61,198
1919-20	...	2,40,089	1,91,110	48,979
1920-21	..	2,40,215	1,89,662	50,553

Navigation tolls on certain canals.

113. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing the receipts from the navigation tolls on the Calcutta and the Eastern Canals and the Hijili Tidal Canal, from January, 1921, and also the corresponding figures of the last ten years?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: A statement showing the receipts from navigation tolls on the Calcutta and Eastern Canals and the Hijili Tidal Canal, from January to July, 1911—1921, is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 115 showing navigation receipts from January to July 1911—1921.

Month.	Circular and Eastern Canals										
	1911	1912.	1913.	1914	1915.	1916.	1917.	1918.	1919	1920.	1921.
	Rs.	Rs	Rs	Rs.	Rs	Rs.	Rs	Rs.	Rs	Rs.	Rs.
January	46,262	49,884	45,646	39,521	33,491	30,548	29,990	38,919	44,871	41,931	40,304
February	43,723	53,501	54,744	42,165	31,557	31,091	30,425	44,506	48,633	41,758	38,603
March	39,889	54,909	37,829	37,849	31,562	30,281	28,182	49,001	55,185	30,762	30,589
April	26,822	29,949	41,870	24,649	22,618	20,218	23,193	34,986	34,880	28,524	19,883
May	33,778	34,399	22,376	21,676	20,046	18,125	22,569	30,177	31,507	27,393	24,054
June	27,103	26,953	21,376	20,247	22,001	19,710	21,159	27,155	22,544	25,827	24,410
July	22,408	26,456	22,697	22,051	21,001	19,547	20,037	29,342	27,209	24,408	26,884

Month	Hijili Tidal Canal.										
	1911	1912	1913	1914.	1915.	1916.	1917	1918	1919	1920.	1921
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs	Rs.	Rs.	Rs	Rs	Rs.	Rs.	Rs
January	.	.	3,529	1,332	2,555	4,099	3,596	3,154	4,174	4,733	3,428
February	.		4,658	1,146	2,791	5,145	5,345	940	5,249	6,399	3,968
March	...	*	4,993	1,487	4,021	6,283	5,991	1,003	7,772	6,176	5,348
April	.	3,680	6,971	1,177	5,227	6,657	6,011	807	7,388	4,772	6,027
May		7,400	6,278	3,840	4,825	6,737	6,303	4,834	8,748	7,086	7,136
June	.	5,494	4,508*	3,040	3,809	4,457	6,814	7,544	7,739	8,415	6,485
July	..	5,695	4,589	2,143	3,406	5,115	6,927	7,473	5,938	6,660	6,769

* Up to March 1912 the canal was under the Orissa Circle and figures are not available here.

Department of Ports and Pilotage.

114. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Marine Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing the names of the officials receiving salaries from Rs 300 and upwards per month in the Department of Ports and Pilotage, with their qualifications, period of service and the method of recruitment and promotion of officers holding these posts?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: The member is referred to pages 282-289 of the Bengal Civil List. The members of the Bengal Pilot Service do not draw salaries but receive fees for the ships piloted subject to the following guaranteed minima:—

	Per mensem
	Rs
Branch Pilots	1,800
Senior Master Pilots	1,100
Junior Master Pilots	700
Mate Pilots	500

Copies of the regulations for the recruitment and promotion of the Pilot Service have been placed in the library. The Port Officers and Ship-Surveyors are officers of the Royal Indian Marine deputed by the Government of India.

Behula (Cangoor) river.

115. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state whether his attention has been drawn to a letter under the heading "Bengal and Irrigation" in the *Englishman* of the 22nd July?

(*b*) If so, have the Government considered the desirability of adopting the scheme as proposed therein?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the area through which the river Behula (or the Gangoor as it is called in certain places) flows, suffers much on account of the silting up of the said river and, if so, whether the Government are considering the desirability of taking steps to mitigate the severity of malaria and also to solve the question of scarcity of water in those areas by re-excavating the said river?

(*d*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the probable cost to be incurred?

(*e*) Have the Government considered the desirability of connecting the said Behula river with the Eden Canal as a branch in the Memari thana?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The scheme cannot be adopted at the present stage owing to limited supply in the Eden Canal.

(*c*) Yes, but no improvement is feasible unless an assured supply of water is made available for flushing, and this will only be possible after the Damodar Canal project is carried out.

(*d*) No estimates have been prepared.

(*e*) Please see reply to (*a*), which presumably refers to the same proposal.

Tax on affiliation of secondary schools.

116. Babu HEM CHANDRA NASKER: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Calcutta University Senate has passed a resolution to levy a tax of Rs. 100 annually from secondary schools if they want affiliation?

(*b*) If so, have the Government approved the same?

(*c*) When does the University propose to begin collecting the tax?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) It is a fact.

(*b*) No request for approval has been submitted to Government.

(*c*) It is understood that action on the resolution has been postponed.

Ministerial Officers of the Settlement Department.

117. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state whether it is not a fact that the ministerial officers of the Settlement Department have forwarded to His Excellency the Governor of Bengal a copy of the proceedings of the All-Bengal Settlement Ministerial Officers' Conference, held at Jessore on the 14th February last?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what steps the Government are taking to give effect to the prayers embodied in the resolution?

(*c*) Did the ministerial officers of the Settlement Department pray for a deputation to represent their grievances to His Excellency the Governor of Bengal?

(*d*) Is it a fact that the Revenue Secretary directed them to send their petition for deputation through the Director of Land Records, Bengal?

(*e*) Is it a fact that the ministerial officers of the Settlement Department did send their petition through the Director of Land Records as directed?

(*f*) If so, has the deputation been allowed? If not, why?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The memorial is being considered by the Director of Land Records, Bengal.

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) No

(*e*) They sent a petition to the Director of Land Records, Bengal.

(*f*) No. The Director of Land Records, Bengal, is the proper authority to deal with the petition

Deputy and sub-deputy collectors.

118. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that a deputy collector reaches Rs. 400 in his seventh year, while a sub-deputy collector reaches Rs. 400 in his 24th year of service?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the initial educational qualifications required of deputy collectors and sub-deputy collectors are the same?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Under the time-scale a deputy collector is ordinarily entitled to a pay of Rs 400 in the seventh year of his service. A sub-deputy collector is entitled to a pay of Rs. 400 in the 25th year of service, provided he passes the efficiency bar.

(*b*) The minimum educational qualifications required of candidates for the two services is the same under the existing rules. Other differences between the two services have been explained on more than one occasion in the Legislative Council.

Sub-deputy collectors and police inspectors.

119. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether it is not a fact that the time-scale of pay sanctioned in the case of police inspectors provided for a bi-annual increment of Rs. 25, while that sanctioned for sub-deputy collectors provides only for a triennial increment of Rs. 25?

(*b*) If so, will the Government be pleased to give the reason for this differentiation?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the present time-scale does not permit of some of the most deserving members of this service (*e.g.*, those who were promoted from lower ranks) reaching Rs. 300 before they complete their career?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of modifying the present time-scale rules by introducing a bi-annual increment of Rs. 25, at least till they reach Rs. 300, on the analogy of police inspectors?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The conditions of the two services are not analogous. The majority of sub-deputy collectors are recruited direct, while inspectors are promoted. No comparison can, therefore, be aptly made.

(*c*) The point in the time-scale reached by a promoted officer at the conclusion of his service will depend on the age at which he was promoted.

(*d*) No.

Gazetting of sub-deputy collectors.

120. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: Has the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department taken any action to give effect to the Government acceptance of the resolution of the Hon'ble Babu Akhil Chandra Dutt, at the Dacca session of the Legislative Council, some time ago, to the effect that sub-deputy collectors should be treated as gazetted officers?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The matter is still under consideration. A reference was necessary to the Government of India whose final orders have only recently been received. An announcement will be made shortly.

Settlement operations.

121. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state whether it has been estimated how long the settlement work will continue in Bengal? If so, what is the period estimated?

(*b*) How do the Government propose to provide for the ministerial officers of the Settlement Department after the completion of the settlement operations in Bengal?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) According to the programme sanctioned by the Government of India in 1915, the preparation of records of rights would have been completed in the year 1931-32. Owing to the reduction of programme caused by the war, the programme cannot now be completed until the year 1933-34; but progress depends on the provision of funds.

(*b*) Ministerial officers in the District Settlement offices are temporary. The reply to (*a*) will show that it would be premature to consider now whether any provision should be made for them or not.

Imperial Police Service.

122. Babu SATISH CHANDRA MUKHARJI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to say whether it is a fact that the European officers of the Imperial Police submitted representations to the Secretary of State regarding further increase in their pay, and is it a fact that their pay has since been further increased?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table a copy of their representation to the Secretary of State and the order of the latter thereon and to state how the order, if given effect to, will affect the Indian officers?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state how it is proposed to meet the increase in the pay of the Imperial Service?

(*d*) Is it in the contemplation of Government to suspend the payment of increment sanctioned for the Imperial Service owing to financial stringency?

(*e*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps to stop further recruitment of assistant superintendents of police in England for the next ten years?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Government do not propose to lay on the table the representation in question which was addressed to the Secretary of State. A copy of the resolution of the Government of India fixing the revised rates of pay for the Indian Police Service is laid on the library table. The only difference in the case of directly recruited Indian officers is that they will not be entitled to overseas pay. The rates of pay for promoted officers are still under consideration.

(*c*) The matter is under the consideration of Government.

(*d*) No.

(*e*) No.

Alleged annoyance to the wife of Babu Basanta Kumar Majumdar.

123. Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the wife of Babu Basanta Kumar Majumdar, who has been staying at Narayanganj, Dacca, since the arrest and removal of her husband, was subjected to personal annoyance and indignity by the local police, who posted a number of constables at her door to keep off visitors and friends from her house?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) be in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether the Government have taken any notice of the conduct of the police officers concerned?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) and (*b*) The facts are as follows:—

After an order was passed under section 144, Criminal Procedure Code, prohibiting the holding of political meetings in Narayanganj, the subdivisional officer ordered the sub-inspector of police to warn the president of the Narayanganj Congress committee not to hold political meetings at or near the house of Babu Basanta Kumar Majumdar, and also instructed the sub-inspector to inform the wife of Babu Basanta Kumar Majumdar of this. As many non-co-operators and others used to gather at or around this house and thus blocked the public road, two constables were deputed there to keep the road clear for use by the public. No annoyance or indignity was offered to the lady in question.

Separate accounts for land revenue.

124. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing the income and expenditure in Bengal on account of the separation of account for land revenue in the Collectorate for the last ten years?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: The collection of the information would involve an expenditure of time and labour which would not be commensurate with the value of the results. It has been estimated that whilst the annual income from separate account fees is Rs. 4,000, the expenses of maintaining separate accounts is not less than Rs. 16,000. The expenditure will be increased if the salaries of ministerial officers are raised.

Accommodation for " purda " ladies on the lower deck of inland steamers.

125. Mr. M. AHMED: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Marine Department aware of the inconvenience caused to the Indian *purdanashin* ladies travelling first and second class in inland steamers of the India General Navigation and Railway and Rivers Steam Navigation Companies for want of accommodation on the lower deck?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware of the fact that accommodation on the lower deck would make it easier for these ladies to enter or leave palanquins?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of asking the steamer companies to provide lower-deck accommodation for *purda nashin* ladies travelling first and second class?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) Yes

(*b*) Yes

(*c*) The steamer companies have been consulted, but report that there is insufficient room on the lower decks for first and second class cabins to be constructed.

Calcutta Police and Small Causes Courts.

126. Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state the reason why the Judges and Magistrates of the Calcutta Court of Small Causes and the Calcutta Police Courts, respectively, are not transferred?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: Because these Magistrates and Judges are appointed for particular courts and not in a service where conditions of transfer prevail

Silting up of the Brahmaputra.

127. Mr. S. M. BOSE: (*a*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation been drawn to the fact that the river Brahmaputra in Mymensingh is being silted up?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the state of the river is causing serious difficulty in navigation and also a bad effect on the health of the town of Mymensingh?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of directing that an inquiry be made as to the means of improving the river?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) No inquiry is possible at present owing to the depleted staff of the Irrigation Department, but the subject will be taken up when the staff is strengthened.

Muhammadan police officers.

128. Maulvi A. H. M. WAZIR ALI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to lay a statement on the table showing the total number of sub-inspectors, inspectors, and deputy superintendents in the Bengal Police, and also the number of Muhammadan officers under each head?

(*b*) What is the reason for such a low percentage of Muhammadan officers in the rank of inspectors?

(*c*) What is the reason for such a paucity of Muhammadan deputy superintendents of police?

(*d*) What is the procedure by which sub-inspectors are promoted to the rank of inspectors, and inspectors to the rank of deputy superintendents?

(*e*) What is the number of inspectors promoted permanently to the rank of deputy superintendents during the last ten years, and the number and names of Muhammadans among them?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) A statement is placed on the table.

(*b*) Appointments of inspectors are not filled by direct recruitment but by promotion of officers from the rank of sub-inspector. Formerly, owing to the dearth of suitable candidates, the number of Muhammadan officers in the rank of sub-inspectors was comparatively small, but for some years past, half the number of direct appointments has been filled by Muhammadans. Most of these officers are still junior in service and when their turn for promotion comes, it is expected that there will be a larger proportion of Muhammadan officers in the rank of inspector.

(*c*) Out of 30 appointments of deputy superintendent, 9 are held by Muhammadans. This is a fair proportion, considering the relative number of senior Muhammadan and non-Muhammadan inspectors.

(*d*) The information is contained in rule 18 (*b*) and appendix VI (A), Volume I, and rule 69 and appendix XV (A), Volume III, of Police Regulations, Bengal, a copy of which may be consulted in the Council library.

(*c*) Twenty inspectors were promoted to the rank of deputy superintendent between the 1st April, 1912, and the 31st December, 1920, of whom three were Muhammadans, namely—

(1) Khan Sahib Ghulam Rabbani (since retired).

(2) Saiyid Rasidun Nabi (substantive *pro tempore*, since died).

(3) Khan Sahib Muhammad Yusuf (substantive *pro tempore*)

Statement referred to in the reply to clause (a) of unstarred question No. 128, showing the total number of sub-inspectors, inspectors and deputy superintendents in the Bengal Police and the number of Muhammadan officers under each head.

SUB-INSPECTORS.		INSPECTORS.		DEPUTY SUPERINTENDENTS.	
Total sanctioned number.	Number of appointments held by Muhammadans.	Total sanctioned number.	Number of appointments held by Muhammadans.	Total sanctioned number.	Number of appointments held by Muhammadans, including those on deputation.
1,833	719	251	23	30	9

Late Maulvi Mir Abdus Sobhan, an officiating deputy superintendent of police.

129. Maulvi A. H. M. WAZIR ALI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that Maulvi Mir Abdus Sobhan, late an officiating deputy superintendent of police, Tippera, applied, on account of ill-health, for a transfer to a healthier place, and, failing this, for leave, but the Inspector-General refused to grant him leave or a transfer and the officer succumbed to his illness?

(*b*) What were the reasons for refusing the requests of the deceased officer?

(*c*) On whose advice were the officer's requests refused?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) The facts are as follows:—

The late Maulvi Mir Abdus Sobhan, when officiating as a deputy superintendent of police at Comilla, applied for and was granted six months' leave with effect from the 22nd April, 1918. He returned to duty on expiry of this leave and since then he neither submitted any application for transfer to a healthier place nor, as an alternative, for

leave. In January, 1919, the Range Deputy Inspector-General suggested his transfer to Dacca, but this could not be arranged as there was no vacancy there at the time. Subsequently on the occurrence of a vacancy in May, 1919, he was transferred to Dacca, where he died on the 28th June, 1919.

Victoria College, Comilla.

130. SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education aware that the privilege of half an hour's time which all the Moslem boys of the Comilla town schools get to say their mid-day prayers, is not given to the Moslem boys of the local Victoria College?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps with a view to the removal of this grievance?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) Government are not aware of this.

(*b*) No action is contemplated, the institution not being a Government college.

Police Service.

131. Maulvi ABDUL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state—(*i*) the minimum, (*ii*) the maximum, and (*iii*) the average pay of the following officers as they were before the recent revision of scale of pay as well as they are or will be after the revision:—

(*1*) superintendent of police;

(*2*) assistant superintendent of police;

(*3*) deputy superintendent of police?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to say what rank, from the point of view of average salary, the Provincial Police Service occupied among Bengal Provincial Service before the recent reorganization, and what rank it now occupies after the reorganization?

(*c*) If there has been any lowering of rank, what is the reason for this?

(*d*) Is it a fact that the Public Services Commission recommended a similar scale of pay for all Provincial Services?

(*e*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to say why a lower scale of pay has been sanctioned for the Provincial Police Service when compared with other Provincial Services?

(*f*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the total number of officers in each of the following positions:—

(*1*) superintendent of police;
(*2*) additional superintendent of police;
(*3*) assistant superintendent of police;
(*4*) deputy superintendent of police?

(*g*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to say what qualifications are essentially necessary for appointment as assistant superintendent of police?

(*h*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to say whether there is any proposal of abolishing either the posts of assistant superintendents or of deputy superintendents?

(*i*) Is it a fact that the assistant superintendents on appointment get a lump sum of money for the purchase of uniform, etc., and the deputy superintendents get no such money on their appointment?

(*j*) If so, will the Government be pleased to say why such grants are made in the case of the former and not made in the case of the latter?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) The figures are as follows, including overseas allowances:—

	Before reorganization.		After reorganization.	
	Minimum.	Maximum.	Minimum.	Maximum.
	Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs.
Superintendents of police ...	700	1,200	725	1,700
Assistant superintendents of police ..	300	500	450	925*
Deputy superintendents of police ...	250	500	200	700

* This figure is the maximum pay admissible under the inferior scale (15th year). Normally before reaching it, an officer would have been promoted to a superior post. The "average pay" has not yet been calculated and figures under (*iii*) cannot, therefore, be given.

(*b*) and (*c*) No attempt is made to rank services with regard to each other in respect of pay.

(*d*) and (*e*) No.

(*f*) The figures are as follows:—

Superintendents of police . .	45
Additional superintendents of police	13
Assistant superintendents of police .	52
Deputy superintendents of police . .	30

(*g*) A copy of the rules for recruitment of the Indian Police is laid on the library table.

(*h*) No.

(*i*) and (*j*) Yes. The question of extending the privilege to deputy superintendents of police is now under the consideration of Government.

Deputy superintendents of police.

132. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to say whether it is a fact that the initial pay of promoted deputy superintendents has been fixed at Rs. 320?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the Government of India had already authorised the local Government to fix it at Rs. 400?

(*c*) Is it under the consideration of Government to give deputy superintendents travelling allowance at the same rates as are given to the assistant superintendents of police?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state why the status of a deputy superintendent has been made inferior to that of an assistant superintendent of police?

(*e*) Is it a fact that the Police Commission held that the departmental status of both the ranks should be practically the same?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The local Government is empowered to fix the initial pay within the maximum limit of Rs. 400.

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) The departmental status of the two classes of officers is similar, but this does not necessarily imply equality in other respects among officers who are members of two services, one of which is Imperial and the other Provincial.

(*e*) The member is referred to paragraph 66 of the Police Commission's Report.

Allowances to circle officers.

133. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department aware that the recent Government resolution regarding the allowances of circle officers has given rise to dissatisfaction among the circle officers?

(*b*) Is it a fact that it is below the standard obtaining in the Settlement and Co-operative Departments for such class of officers?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that at least some of the dry districts, or some subdivisions of them, would require boats during the rains, *e.g.*, Hooghly, Pabna, Bogra, Rangpur, etc.?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of revising the division of districts into river and dry, and of putting Bogra, Pabna Rajshahi, Comilla and others into the category of river districts?

(*e*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the feeling exists that these allowances will fall short of the amount to be required for the moving about of the circle officers with due regard to their position and prestige owing to the rise in prices?

(*f*) Are the Government considering the desirability of increasing these allowances and of reducing the number of days of tour to 15 days a month, as in the case of the Superintendents of Excise, or of keeping the old system intact?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) and (*c*) Representations have been received that the allowance is inadequate in certain areas.

(*b*) Officers of the same class employed in the Co-operative Department receive travelling allowance under the ordinary rules. Comparison cannot, therefore, easily be made. Officers employed in settlement are in camp for long periods. They therefore travel with more baggage than when otherwise employed and at greater cost They have, therefore, been allowed travelling allowance at 50 per cent. above the rate otherwise admissible according to the class to which they belong. Their settlement allowance is the same as that of circle officers (Rs. 50), while the latter enjoy a house allowance of Rs. 25.

(*c*) and (*d*) These points are under the consideration of Government.

(*f*) No.

Calcutta University reforms.

134. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state what steps, if any, have been taken or are proposed to be taken to give effect to those reforms in the Calcutta University which in the opinion of the Sadler Commission "ought not to be postponed whatever scheme be adopted," with a view to enacting and enforcing the recommendations in general of the said Commission?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: While fully appreciating the urgency and importance of reforming the Calcutta University on the lines of the recommendations of the Sadler Commission, Government regret to state that owing to the financial position to which the province has been reduced by the financial arrangements recently promulgated it is not possible to give effect to the recommendations of the Commission The first essential step in the matter is to obtain a more satisfactory financial readjustment for the province. Beyond representing to the authorities concerned their extremely unsatisfactory financial position, Government have not taken any steps.

Aided Hospitals.

135. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY, Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing:—

(*i*) the number of hospitals in Bengal receiving grants from the Government;

(*ii*) the number of hospitals not receiving any grant from the Government; and

(*iii*) the average area served by each such hospital?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*i*) The total number of charitable dispensaries in Bengal at the end of the year 1920 was 714, viz., 22 in Calcutta and 692 outside Calcutta. Of these 28 are maintained by Government; 67 others (non-Government dispensaries) receive monetary grants for maintenance and 91 receive monetary grants for free supply of medicines to Government servants. As 21 of the above number receive both kinds of grants, the actual number of dispensaries receiving monetary grants from Government is 137.

(*ii*) All non-Government dispensaries under Government supervision are helped by Government in some form or other, even if they do not receive a monetary grant. Government supplies them free of cost with books (*e.g.*, nomenclature of diseases, etc.), registers, forms, etc. No excise duty is realised from them on the quantity of spirit required for the preparation of tinctures supplied to them. Occasional monetary grants are also sanctioned by the Commissioners of Divisions from the funds at their disposal.

(*iii*) Each dispensary serves 110·2 square miles on an average.

Training of nurses.

136. Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state what arrangements, if any, there are for the training of nurses in the Calcutta Medical College, Campbell and Sambhu Nath Pandit Hospitals?

(*b*) If no arrangements exist, are the Government considering the desirability of making such arrangements?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The training of nurses at the Medical College Hospitals is managed and controlled by the Calcutta Hospital Nurses' Institution, the actual training being given by a Lady Superintendent of Nursing, assisted by five senior nursing sisters. A copy of the rules of the institution for the admission, training, pay, etc., of nurses and probationers is laid on the library table. As regards the arrangements for training nurses at the

Sambhu Nath Pandit Hospital, the member is referred to the statement laid on the table in answer to clause (*a*) of unstarred question No. 156, asked by Dr. Jatindra Nath Moitra at the meeting of the 1st April, 1921. 'There are no arrangements for the training of nurses at the Campbell Hospital.'

(*b*) There is no proposal before Government for making arrangements for the training of nurses at the Campbell Hospital.

Bhairab river.

137. Maharaja KSHAUNISH CHANDRA ROY Bahadur: (*a*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation been drawn to the fact that the river Bhairab, in the Nadia district, is fast silting up and getting choked with water hyacinth?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the necessity of taking steps to improve the irrigation of this river?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) There is no information before Government regarding any rapid silting up of the Bhairab river bed in the Nadia district in recent years, nor any information regarding the growth of water hyacinth interfering with drainage by the river.

(*b*) A preliminary inquiry will be made.

Listed posts.

138. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state the number of listed posts, both superior and inferior, existing in Bengal on the 1st December, 1920, and those existing at present, and also the proportion which the number of such posts bear to the total cadre of the Indian Civil Service?

(*b*) Has the attention of the Government been drawn to the declarations of the Government of India in paragraphs 9 and 10 of the Government of India, Home Department, resolution No. 2559, dated the 1st December, 1920, published in the *Gazette of India* of the 4th December, 1920, viz., that the number of listed posts will be increased instead of being reduced, and that officers promoted from the Provincial Civil Service to hold posts ordinarily held by members of the Indian Civil Service, will have the same opportunities of promotion as those directly recruited?

(*c*) Has the attention of the Government been drawn to the following resolution passed at the meeting of the Legislative Assembly at Delhi on the 17th February, 1921:—"This Assembly recommends to the Governor-General in Council that the number of Indian Civil Service posts listed as open to members of the Provincial Civil Service in each Presidency or Province should at once be raised to one-fourth of the superior Civil Service posts in each Presidency or Province"?

(*d*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what instructions, if any, he has received from the Government of India to give effect to the recommendations to increase the number of listed posts in Bengal?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) The member is referred to the answer to a similar question asked at this meeting by Dr. A. Suhrawardy.

(*d*) The matter is at present under consideration and a statement cannot now be made.

Listed posts.

139. Dr. A. SUHRAWARDY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state the number of listed posts, both superior and inferior, existing in Bengal on December 1st, 1920, and those existing at present, and also the proportion which the number of such posts bear to the total cadre of the Indian Civil Service?

(*b*) Has the attention of this Government been drawn to the declaration of the Government of India in paragraphs 9 and 10 of the Government of India, Home Department, resolution No. 2559, dated the 1st December, 1920, viz., that the number of listed posts will be increased instead of being reduced and that officers promoted from the Provincial Civil Service to hold posts ordinarily held by members of the Indian Civil Service, will have the same opportunities of promotion as those directly recruited?

(*c*) Has the attention of Government been drawn to the following resolution passed at the meeting of the Legislative Assembly at Delhi on the 17th February, 1921:—" This Assembly recommends to the Governor-General in Council that the number of Indian Civil Service posts listed as open to members of the Provincial Civil Service in each Presidency or Province should at once be raised to one-fourth of the superior Civil Service posts in each Presidency or Province "?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what steps are being taken to increase the number of listed posts in Bengal?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) On the 1st December, 1920, out of a sanctioned Indian Civil Service cadre of 193, thirteen posts were listed, twelve superior and one inferior. Of these, the inferior post (Under-Secretary, Revenue Department) has since been abolished. The listed posts form 6·2 per cent. of the total cadre.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) The matter is at present under the consideration of Government.

Working hours in Press.

140. Babu HEM CHANDRA BHATTACHARJI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the ordinary working day of a Government servant is 7 hours?

(*b*) Is it a fact that Press employees work on an average 10 to 11 hours a day?

(*c*) Do they receive any compensatory pension in view of this at the end of 25 years' service?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) The usual office hours in Calcutta are from 10-30 A.M. to 5 P.M. and in the mufassal 11 A.M to 5 P.M. Most gazetted officers, however, work for considerably longer hours than this and any clerk may be required to work overtime when the business of the office demands it. In many offices a considerable part of the establishment frequently works overtime.

(*b*) In the Bengal Government Press the average day with overtime is about 9 hours.

(*c*) The period of service qualifying for pension in the Press is 30 years. No compensatory pension is given to salaried hands, but piece-workers are allowed to count their earnings on overtime towards the calculation of the amount of their pension.

Purchase of non-judicial stamps.

141. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: With reference to the answer to my unstarred question No. 49 at the meeting of the 1st April, will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether the opinions of the Divisional Commissioners have been received, and what action, if any, the Government propose to take in the matter?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: The opinions of the Divisional Commissioners have been received and orders discontinuing the practice have issued.

Ecclesiastical Department.

142. SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state the annual amount spent in the maintenance of the Ecclesiastical Department in Bengal, and also from what sources of income that amount is met?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The estimated expenditure of the Ecclesiastical Department in Bengal for 1921-22 is Rs. 2,55,000. The expenditure is met from Imperial revenues.

Statement referred to in the answer given by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler to unstarred question No. 30 asked by Mr. Tarit Bhusan Roy on the 14th March, 1921.

District.	Year.	Number of chaukidars including dafadars.	Amount paid as salary.			Amount of chaukidari tax realised.			REMARKS
			Rs.	A.	P.	Rs.	A.	P.	
Bakarganj	1916	5994	3,65,508	0	0	4,07,484	0	0	
	1917	5994	3,65,508	0	0	4,07,477	0	0	
	1918	5994	3,65,308	0	0	4,12,738	0	0	
	1919	6000	3,65,892	0	0	4,08,123	0	0	
	1920	6003	3,65,919	0	0	4,17,961	0	0	
Bankura	1916	2570	1,51,806	0	0	1,76,818	0	0	
	1917	2569	1,51,746	0	0	1,76,566	0	0	
	1918	2573	1,50,986	0	0	1,79,107	0	0	
	1919	2569	1,51,746	0	0	1,84,800	0	0	
	1920	2564	1,51,446	0	0	1,85,842	0	0	
Birbhum	1916	2592	1,86,624	0	0	.....			Figures are not available
	1917	2592	1,86,624	0	0	.....			
	1918	2590	1,86,480	0	0	2,07,447	0	1[a]	[a] This includes rent of chaukidari chakran lands
	1919	2584	1,86,048	0	0	2,09,720	4	1[a]	
	1920	2577	1,85,544	0	0	2,11,427	14	8[a]	
Bogra	1916	1671	1,12,017	10	10	1,32,185	2	8	
	1917	1668	1,13,047	9	9	1,33,326	0	4	
	1918	1663	1,12,451	8	6	1,32,535	9	6	
	1919	1666	1,15,109	5	9	1,35,350	11	8	
	1920	1668	1,15,370	0	9	1,38,101	4	2	

District	Year	Number of chaukidars including dafadars.	Amount paid as salary			Amount of chaukidari tax realised			REMARKS.
			Rs	A.	P.	Rs	A.	P.	
Burdwan	1916	3503	2,52,216	0	0	[c]2,77,942	9	4½	[c]This includes rent of chaukidari chakran lands
	1917	3502	2,52,144	0	0	[c]2,77,543	1	11½	
	1918	3503	2,52,216	0	0	[c]2,79,911	9	9½	
	1919	3510	2,52,720	0	0	[c]2,82,055	1	6½	
	1920	3528	2,54,016	0	0	[c]2,82,292	2	0½	
Chittagong	1916	2631	1,60,310	9	6	1,90,668	15	9	
	1917	2631	1,59,599	1	6	1,88,885	5	3	
	1918	2631	1,60,214	4	3	1,90,595	9	6	
	1919	2626	1,60,147	2	6	1,89,026	11	6	
	1920	2624	1,59,100	14	6	1,89,319	5	3	
Dacca	1916	4101	2,55,804	0	0	2,77,421	15	9	
	1917	4157	2,65,160	0	0	2,97,603	8	6	
	1918	4202	2,72,858	0	0	3,14,096	1	9	
	1919	4213	2,74,464	0	0	3,22,272	8	7	
	1920	4235	2,77,992	0	0	3,24,061	2	11	
Darjeeling	1916	175	.....			.....			Figures are not available
	1917	175	.....			.....			
	1918	175	12,888	0	0	15,682	2	3	The figures relate to Siliguri subdivision, the Chaukidari Act is not in force in the rest of the district.
	1919	173	12,744	0	0	15,512	5	6	
	1920	172	12,792	0	0	15,837	6	8	
Dinajpur.	1916	...	.....			.....			Figures are not available.
	1917	...	.....			.....			
	1918	4053	2,47,116	0	0	2,91,678	0	0	
	1919	4053	2,47,116	0	0	2,91,367	0	0	
	1920	4053	2,91,888	0	0	3,53,012	0	0	

District.	Year.	Number of chaukidars including dafadars.	Amount paid as salary.			Amount of chaukidari tax realised.			REMARKS.
			Rs	A.	P.	Rs.	A.	P.	
Faridpur.	1916	3175	2,07,120	0	0	2,41,297	3	0	Figures for the Goalundo and Gopalganj subdivisions have not been included, as they are not available.
	1917	3157	1,93,176	0	0	2,25,993	11	0	
	1918	3150	1,92,756	0	0	2,26,936	15	4	
	1919	4013	2,46,988	0	0	°3,03,388	14	8	Figures for the Gopalganj subdivision have not been included, as they are not available.
	1920	4953	3,03,696	0	0	3,73,036	8	0	
Hooghly.	1916	2294	1,65,168	0	0	.....			Figures are not available.
	1917	2167	1,56,025	0	0	.....			
	1918	2165	1,55,880	0	0	1,39,674	1	0	
	1919	2165	1,55,880	0	0	1,44,947	11	0	
	1920	2164	1,55,808	0	0	1,45,829	4	0	
Howrah.	1916	1473	1,06,025	0	0	.....			Figures are not available
	1917	1473	1,06,220	0	0	.....			
	1918	1473	1,05,912	0	0	1,12,380	0	0	
	1919	1470	1,05,684	0	0	1,14,746	0	0	
	1920	1472	1,05,663	0	0	1,20,107	0	0	
Jalpaiguri.	1916	1357	86,088	0	0	°92,714	0	0	°Excluding the figures for the Alipur subdivision, which are not available for these two years.
	1917	1357	86,100	0	0	°91,348	0	0	
	1918	1673	1,06,276	0	0	1,15,444	0	0	
	1919	1672	1,06,295	0	0	1,16,294	0	0	
	1920	1672	1,05,781	0	0	1,16,125	0	0	

District.	Year	Number of chaukidars including dafadars	Amount paid as salary.			Amount of chaukidari tax realised.			REMARKS
			Rs.	A.	P.	Rs.	A	P.	
Jessore.	1916	3325	2,10,848	4	2	2,33,192	14	6	
	1917	3329	2,11,523	8	9	2,40,137	8	8	
	1918	3331	2,10,319	1	0	2,38,185	5	5	
	1919	3333	2,09,685	0	0	2,43,962	3	7	
	1920	3332	2,08,733	15	9	2,47,456	5	6	
Khulna.	1916	2329	1,50,034	0	0	1,65,901	4	0	
	1917	2329	1,50,034	0	0	1,65,901	4	0	
	1918	2329	1,50,034	0	0	1,66,861	4	0	
	1919	2329	1,50,034	0	0	1,66,341	0	0	
	1920	2329	1,50,034	0	0	1,72,621	0	0	
Malda.	1916	2012	1,22,980	0	0	1,43,257	0	0	
	1917	1981	1,20,951	0	0	1,44,285	0	0	
	1918	2036	1,23,957	0	0	1,44,107	0	0	
	1919	2036	1,23,939	0	0	1,55,823	0	0	
	1920	2031	1,23,668	0	0	1,31,473	0	0	
Midnapore.	1916	6277	3,45,485	0	0	4,25,346	15	0	
	1917	6277	3,45,485	0	0	4,25,346	15	0	
	1918	6294	3,55,771	3	0	4,37,256	2	0	
	1919	6294	3,55,771	3	0	4,37,256	2	0	
	1920	6294	3,55,771	3	0	4,37,256	2	0	
Murshidabad.	1916	2798	1,71,229	0	0	*1,99,766	0	0	*This includes rent of chaukidari chakran lands
	1917	2798	1,71,236	0	0	*1,99,745	0	0	
	1918	2272	1,39,238	0	0	*1,63,722	0	0	
	1919	2287	1,40,300	0	0	*1,64,036	0	0	
	1920	2304	1,41,334	0	0	*1,71,902	0	0	

District.	Year	Number of chaukidars including dafadars.	Amount paid as salary.			Amount of chaukidari tax realised.			REMARKS
			Rs.	A.	P.	Rs.	A.	P.	
Mymensingh	1916	7744	4,73,892	0	0	5,51,320	0	0	
	1917	7761	4,74,912	0	0	5,52,367	0	0	
	1918	7754	4,74,492	0	0	5,51,905	0	0	
	1919	7750	4,74,264	0	0	5,51,337	0	0	
	1920	7756	4,74,624	0	0	5,52,566	0	0	
Nadia	1916	3756	2,29,737	13	3	2,62,888	3	11	
	1917	3754	2,29,846	9	9	2,62,613	10	3	
	1918	3754	2,29,915	1	9	2,65,483	1	9	
	1919	3750	2,29,636	9	0	2,72,365	1	4	
	1920	3748	2,29,647	9	3	2,77,514	1	2	
Noakhali	1916	2098	1,30,162	0	0	1,46,834	13	9	
	1917	2094	1,29,918	0	0	1,46,604	9	0	
	1918	2036	1,17,778	0	0	1,36,786	0	0	
	1919	2042	1,24,624	0	0	1,46,223	6	0	
	1920	2044	1,42,402	0	0	1,65,776	8	0	
Pabna	1916	2542	1,83,024	0	0	.....			Figures are not available
	1917	2540	1,82,946	0	0	.....			
	1918	2539	1,82,874	0	0	.....			
	1919	2531	1,82,298	0	0	.....			
	1920	2528	1,82,082	0	0	2,07,840	10	7	
Rajshahi.	1916	3529	2,20,782	0	0	.....			Figures are not available
	1917	3527	2,16,969	0	0	.....			
	1918	3637	2,17,774	0	0	.....			
	1919	3517	2,14,357	0	0	2,68,987	11	0	
	1920	3516	2,16,301	0	0	2,69,235	11	0	

District	Year	Number of chaukidars including dafadars	Amount paid as salary			Amount of chaukidari tax realised			Remarks
			Rs.	A.	P.	Rs	A.	P	
Rangpur	1916	5057	3,15,444	0	0	3 68,473	15	8	
	1917	4937	3,10,627	0	0	3,67,908	13	11	
	1918	4898	3,06 711	0	0	3,64,258	1	0	
	19.9	4882	3,06,596	0	0	3,67,962	7	11	
	1920	4869	3,05,986	0	0	3,72 365	3	11	
Tippera	1916	3354	1,96,292	0	0	.....			Figures are not available
	1917	3359	1,96,725	0	0	.....			
	1918	3324	2,01,833	0	0	2,46,111	0	0	
	1919	3370	2,02 376	0	0	2,45,260	0	0	
	1920	3363	2 01,860	0	0	2,51,435	0	0	
24 Parganas	1916	3371	2,05,740	0	0	2,11,790	0	0	
	1917	3373	2,05,860	0	0	2,13,615	9	9	
	1918	3373	2,05,860	0	0	2,20,215	3	6	
	1919	3375	2,05,968	0	0	2,23,115	8	0	
	1920	3379	2,06 208	0	0	2,23,392	14	6	

The Royal Visit.

The PRESIDENT: Gentlemen, I have been informed that there is a general feeling that resolution No. 43 should take precedence over all the other business of the Council. His Excellency being of that opinion has permitted that resolution to come before the commencement of the Government business. I understand that this is the general sense of the Council. As there is no objection, I shall take that resolution first.

Mr, D. C. GHOSE: "This Council recommends to the Government that a message expressing the loyal and dutiful homage of the people of this Presidency be respectfully conveyed to His Majesty the King-Emperor, and that the profound thankfulness and gratitude of the

people be conveyed to His Majesty for the expected visit of His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales to India next cold weather; also the respectful assurance of the unflinching loyalty of the people of Bengal to His Majesty's Throne and person."

It has been truly said that in this vast world-wide Empire there is nothing common except the Throne. It is the one institution that unites all the various component parts. And it unites and binds all because it is above the dust and din of controversies, detached from party and attached only to the common interest. The Throne, therefore, means a great deal to us. The future occupant of that Throne is about to visit us. He is coming to us, first and foremost, as a plenipotentiary of the King, his father, and he is welcome not only for what he is but for what he represents. Secondly, he is coming to us as Prince and heir to the Throne and, as such, is entitled to our cordial and respectful greeting. Lastly, he is coming to us as a fellow-subject and a man and will receive from us everything that we, in all brotherhood and affection, can offer him. As we are all aware, His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales has been equipping himself strenuously for the great office he is destined to fill. He has been on the battlefield and has done his share of work in the great conflict for freedom and for civilization. And since the termination of the war, His Royal Highness has been visiting the great dominions which owe allegiance to his father, the King. The tour has been no mere holiday affair. His Royal Highness has himself described it as "an inspiring education which will influence the whole of my life." To him the British Empire implies in his own words "a partnership of free nations, nations living under the same system of law, pursuing the same democratic aims, and actuated by the same human ideals." Animated by this lofty and inspiring idea of the Empire, he is coming to visit India which occupies in his own words "a special position." India has been recognized indeed as a nation by its being invited to be a signatory to the Peace Treaty at Versailles. But nation though it is, it is not yet a free nation. India, however, is on the road to freedom and under the ægis of its Sovereign, it is destined to reach the goal. At this juncture, our country, we fear, will present to His Royal Highness a picture of a great struggle, a struggle for freedom, political, social, intellectual and industrial. He will see us at our best and perhaps also at our worst because, in a time of stress and struggle, things are not always as they should be. But we are certain that His Royal Highness, with that instinct and intuition which we confidently expect he shares with his august father, will not fail to discover the panacea which, while giving an impetus to all that is best and healthy in the great struggle which is now going on in India, will counteract all that is disintegrating, hurtful, and poisonous. That will be the burden of the message which we devoutly hope he will deliver to the King and the people of Britain when he returns after a triumphant tour in India.

And, in the fullness of time, when he himself will occupy the Throne, the lessons of his Indian tour will enable him, we trust, so far as this country is concerned, to see things in their true and proper perspective. It is, therefore, with feelings of thankfulness and gratitude towards His Majesty the King-Emperor, and a sense of keen expectancy that we are awaiting the arrival of His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales in our midst.

Mr. H. BARTON: With deep pleasure I rise to support the resolution. It is one which hardly needs any discussion and I think that we are all unanimous in feeling that a hearty welcome ought to be accorded to His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales and that all of us should march shoulder to shoulder in our wish that he ought to be so received. With these words, I support the resolution.

Babu NIRODE BEHARY MULLICK: On behalf of the backward section of the community, whom I represent, I desire to associate myself with the sentiments expressed by the mover of the resolution.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I beg to associate myself with all that has been said by the mover of the resolution and by the previous speakers. I heartily support the resolution.

Professor S. C. MUKHERJI: As a representative of the Indian Christian community, it is my proud privilege to give this resolution my whole-hearted support.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: It is with profound pleasure and feelings of loyalty that I rise to support this resolution. We are passing through critical times but if we consult the inner feelings of the Indians, there cannot be the least doubt that there is the unflinching feeling of affection to the British Throne. We often look upon the British Throne as a symbol of respect and admiration and we know that the British Government is broad based upon the people's wishes. This is an opportunity for us to express clearly to Government that the Indians, especially Bengalis, are loyal to the core to the British Throne. I am sure that when my voice is heard outside this Council, the people, whether of a village, hamlet, town or city, will share the opinion which I emphatically put before the Council. I hope and trust that this Council will take this resolution into its best consideration and pass it with enthusiasm and unanimity.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: Coming from Northern Bengal, I whole-heartedly associate myself with the message of welcome.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: In voicing the welcome on behalf of the Bengal Legislative Council to His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales, I feel it my duty not to record merely a silent vote. On behalf of my electorate, the zamindars of Bengal, I accord my cordial

support to the resolution welcoming His Royal Highness on the occasion of his gracious visit to his Indian dominions.

Sir, loyalty to the Royal Household is in our blood. It is hallowed with traditions. It is almost our caste. We liken our king to our God, the Preserver. The king is *Chalant Vishnu*, the moving deity. Our traditions have taught us that a king can do no wrong. Royalty is always above politics. Our attitude is of eternal homage to it, of sincerest love and deepest devotion.

We sincerely hope so to receive our future Emperor, that he will ever think kindly of us. Poor though we are and many might be our shortcomings, our reception to him will never fall short in ardour and love. The First Gentleman in the British Empire out of his own generosity of heart will forgive us our failings, for we know full well our best reception can never be worthy of his worth.

Sir, he is coming here, true to his motto *Ich Dien*: "I serve." He is serving his King and Empire. Let us also try to convince him that we, also, in our humble way, endeavour to the best of our abilities to serve; for service alone can please him with such a motto

Sir, we need not heed the buzz of inconsequential people. We can only say—"Forgive them, for they know not what they do."

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: We, the orthodox Hindus, regard the king as an incarnation of God. For us there is a saying in Bengali: "The king is an incarnation of Vishnu." We, the Hindus, cannot but give our heartiest welcome to the heir-apparent to the Throne. People who want to start a movement against giving a hearty welcome to the heir-apparent forget the traditions of the Hindus. This resolution does not require any support. It is hoped that every one would carry this resolution with acclamation.

Raja MANMATHA NATH RAY CHOUDHURY: I beg leave to associate myself whole-heartedly with the resolution which Mr. D. C. Ghose has moved. Sir, great disappointment was felt by a large section of our people of all castes and creeds when the postponement of His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales' visit to India was announced. The Royal visit of his late Majesty the King-Emperor, as Prince of Wales, had to be postponed and history repeated itself some thirty years later when the visit of His Majesty the present King-Emperor, as Prince of Wales, was adjourned. Now, for the third time, it happened, that the visit of the present heir-apparent to the Throne had also to be postponed. Great events seem to have a tendency to run through a similar course and, is it then too much to hope that the proposed visit of His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales would end as gloriously as the two visits which preceded it? It has been rightly said that we are passing through a period of transition and there is good deal of unrest in the country at the present moment; but I think it can be safely said that the sinister events,

which charged the political atmosphere of India with dangerous explosives in 1874, are conspicuous by their absence to-day. The East has after all met the West and sympathy has ultimately taken the place of suspicion. Whatever the go-ahead democrats of England or the Non-co-operators of India may say, I refuse to believe that our people have forgotten all about the benefits which accrued from the personal intercourse of the heir-apparent of the Crown with the princes and peoples of India during his sojourn in this country. I refuse to believe that our people cannot now foresee the educative influence on His Royal Highness the Present Prince of Wales of his tour in their country, and I refuse to believe that they do not really understand that the Prince is coming out not for pleasure but to fulfil a great and noble mission. I, on the other hand, sincerely believe, Sir, that those who are hostile to-day will not be so when the great day will actually dawn upon us and I also believe that those who have gone astray will soon realise that it is the duty of every patriotic Indian to do his utmost to make the impending Royal visit a great success, so that His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales may be able, as surely he will, to rise above the topmost crest of the waves of unrest, which are now sweeping over our land, to guide the waves through a calm and fertilising course in order that they may cease to break their heads against the rocks in ruthless boisterousness and may really carry us forward to the promised land, where, in the fullness of time, the best and the highest civic privileges, which are in the gift of England, will be ours. I have, therefore, no manner of doubt in my mind that this resolution will not only be accepted by this Council but will be received by the whole Indian community in the same spirit in which it has been moved.

Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: I do most heartily support the resolution moved by my hon'ble friend, Mr. D. C. Ghose, in connection with the impending gracious visit of His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales, whom we hope to have the pleasure of welcoming in our midst before long.

We, the people of India, traditionally loyal to our Sovereigns, cannot but look on an auspicious occasion like this with extreme joy and heartfelt gratitude. Difference of caste and creed cannot stand before the emotions called up by the occasion. All communities alike hail the advent of the august personage. Our Hindu brethren regard their king as God incarnate, while the Muhammadans consider him to be the shadow of God (*zil billah*).

We, the Indian subjects of His Imperial Dynasty, live far away from him. He generally knows us not so much from personal contact as from what he hears from others. Our manners and customs, our merits and demerits, our hopes and fears whatever they may be, can be best studied by personal observation. There are our detractors, as there must be everywhere. Let him, therefore, who, God willing, will have the care of

the millions of this land in his charge, see for himself how firm is our devotion to our Sovereign, how earnestly we wish for the regeneration of our native land through the British connection. Such visits, though few and far between, are productive of the highest good inasmuch as they establish that bond of affection and sympathy between the rulers and the ruled on which the future weal of the country so much depends. Our humble efforts to express our deep loyalty cannot but touch the Royal heart and dispel what misapprehensions may exist therein.

Numerous have been the benefits of the visits from our former Princes of Wales. The Reforms, recently introduced into the administration of India, have proved beyond doubt, the noble object with which the British *Raj* holds the country as a sacred trust. It is through the Reforms that we have assembled to-day in this historic Hall. Here, inspired by a noble resolve, the representatives of every shade of political thought and opinion have met. It is not for me, Sir, to recount here the numerous advantages of our connection with the British *Raj*. We are, what we are at present, thanks to their care and protection. The British *Raj* has awakened in us the sense of freedom, justice and equality. The British *Raj* has given us a vivid foretaste of our rights and privileges by giving us a hand in the management of our country's affairs. I am sure, I shall not be called a false prophet, if I say that the day is not far off when the burden of our responsibilities will increase with the acquisition of additional powers delegated to you by His Imperial Majesty—and the coming visit of His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales, will, doubtless, hasten the advent of that auspicious moment.

I trust I am voicing the unanimous opinion of all the members of this House, when I say that the news of the visit has evoked a feeling of sincere gratification amongst us, the representatives of the people and that we are looking forward with eager and joyous anticipations to the day when we shall have the honour of welcoming in our midst the distinguished heir to the British Throne, who has already made himself so genuinely popular in other parts of the British Dominions by his rare personal charm and winning manners. We rejoice that his Royal Highness has included Calcutta in his itinerary and we beg to assure him that the feeling which animates His Gracious Majesty's subjects in this province is one of unshakeable loyalty and unswearing devotion to the Crown.

In all sincerity, I, from my heart of hearts, ask all the hon'ble colleagues and friends, individually and collectively, to show that we are fully alive to what we have received and have been receiving at the hands of our most gracious Sovereign. Let us all show our gratitude to our mighty Sovereign, who so sincerely wishes that our future Ruler, his most beloved son, shall come to our midst to know his Indian subjects and be known by them, thus following the example set by himself and his revered sire. The sky of politics may seem overcast with lowering

clouds at the present moment, but it is no idle vision to expect that this auspicious visit of His Royal Highness will chase those clouds away and show us the silver lining behind them. The times of disquietude, which the country is passing through, will surely pass away, giving place to those of peace and happiness once again.

Once more, I beg to give my whole-hearted support to the resolution which has been so ably moved and seconded.

Mr. W. R. RAE: As a representative of the Europeans of the Presidency and Burdwan divisions, Bengal, and on their behalf, I most heartily support and associate myself with this resolution. His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales can confidently count upon a hearty and sincere welcome in Bengal.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: On behalf of the community which I have the honour to represent, I desire to associate myself wholeheartedly with the resolution that has been moved. Whatever misgivings might have arisen in connection with certain incidents which occurred the other day, I have not the slightest hesitation in saying that the people of Bengal from one end of the country to the other are inspired by one sincere desire to pay their homage to the august Royal visitor, who is coming out to our country. Whatever might be our political differences, whether co-operators or non-co-operators, I am glad to find, even in the ranks of the bitterest opponents of the present system of administration in this country, this signal loyalty to the Throne. At the meeting of the Dalhousie Institute, I find that the leader of the non-co-operators, who presided over the function of that evening, has said, "We are loyal to the Throne, we are loyal to the King, we are loyal to the British nation." What does that show? That shows that the people of Bengal, whatever their differences may be with regard to the political measures or the administration of the country are all united in their loyalty to the Throne, to His Majesty the King and to the British nation, and I am sure that this message will be conveyed not only to the Throne, to His Majesty the King-Emperor, but also to the British nation.

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: On behalf of the community which I have the honour to represent, I beg to associate myself with this resolution of according a hearty reception to His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales. It is not only a lip service that we are going to perform but it is a duty which we ought to discharge at the moment when His Royal Highness has the pleasure of visiting this country. I think that there is not an iota of evidence on behalf of the non-co-operators that the country does not want His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales to visit India and especially to visit Bengal. I think that it is a sufficient guarantee. The expression of opinion of different people of different shades of opinion is, I think, a guarantee that His Royal Highness will

receive a hearty reception from this land and I have the greatest pleasure in associating myself with this resolution.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: On behalf of the Muhammadans of this Province, I beg to associate myself with this resolution of offering a hearty welcome to His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales. Of course at present the Muhammadan minds are exercised over a vital question, but I assure you that no question of whatever importance can stand in the way of expressing loyalty to the Throne and for the matter of that to the representative of His Imperial Majesty. The Muhammadan religion does not allow any dissimulation or any other kind of duplicity. The Muhammadan religion lays down, in clearest possible terms, that if a Muhammadan finds the Government uncongenial to him, the only course left to him is to leave the country. He is not allowed to play the part of a traitor or a dissimulator so long as he remains in the country. So long as he remains in the country he must be loyal to the ruling chief. Muhammadans consider the king as the shadow of God (*zil-Allah*), and the Prince, the representative of His Majesty, will be considered in that spirit. Muhammadans cannot but be unflinchingly loyal to the Throne and to the person of His Royal Highness. I can assure this House that Muhammadans will never fall behind in showing their great respect and loyalty to the high personage.

Raja MANILOLL SINGH ROY: Coming here as a representative of the "non-Muhammadans" of the Burdwan district, I beg to support this resolution, as it should come from a dutiful, loyal, and blunt Rajput.

Khan Bahadur KHWAJA MOHAMED AZAM: As a representative of the Muhammadans of the Dacca district, I heartily support the resolution.

Maulvi EMADUDDIN AHMED: I also heartily support the resolution that has been moved by Mr. D. C. Ghose. As a representative of the district of Rajshahi, which is backward in education and which for the first time has got its due share of representation in this Council, I think it my duty to accord welcome to the expected visit of His Royal Highness. I am sure that when His Royal Highness will come to this place, choruses of joy will prevail all over the country and the atmosphere of bitterness, that is prevailing now in its worst form, will fade away.

With these words, I heartily support the resolution.

Mr. KRISHNA CHANDRA RAY CHAUDHURI: As a representative of the working classes, I take this opportunity to associate myself with the gracious resolution so ably moved and supported. I talked to my working class friends and they all say, "The Emperor's son is coming, the country's woes will end." It clearly shows the deep attachment of the working men to the Throne and their anticipation that great

good would result from the gracious visit of the "Prince of Wales" and "Son of the Emperor."

Babu HEM CHANDRA BHATTACHARJI spoke in Bengali in support of the resolution.

Maulvi SHAH MUHAMMAD CHAUDHURI: On behalf of the Muhammadans of Malda and Jalpaiguri, I beg to give my hearty support to this resolution moved by my friend Mr. D. C. Ghose.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: Allow me respectfully and heartily to support the resolution. Those of my countrymen who are eager to boycott the Prince's visit fail to think that the King-Emperor and his heir-apparent should be above politics. It is true that India is smarting under very great wrongs but that is the fault of the bureaucracy. We want that the Khilafat wrongs should be righted and we desire that Muhammadan sentiments and feelings should be respected. We also wish that all other grievances of India should be redressed. We should, instead of boycotting the Prince of Wales' visit, give him a rousing reception and thus, bringing the Royal Household to our side, we shall be able to get what we want, for the personal interest of His Gracious Majesty the King-Emperor alone can bring peace and good-will in the land.

Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: On behalf of the depressed classes of Bengal, whom I have the honour to represent, I whole-heartedly associate myself with the resolution, and convey the loyal and dutiful homage of the backward people of this Presidency to His Majesty the King-Emperor.

Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: On behalf of the non-Muhammadans of the 24-Parganas Rural (North) whom I have the honour to represent here, I desire to associate myself with the resolution and give it my whole-hearted support.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I did not expect that this resolution would come on for discussion to-day. I very much desired to make a speech dealing with the objections raised throughout my country. I at first thought that I should not speak at all, but if I did not do so, it would have been interpreted that the great educated community of this country, which I represent, are with the non-co-operators. So far as I can gauge their feelings, I believe the great majority of them are on the side of the British Government. When supporting this resolution, I ought not to support it on the sentimental grounds of empire and the divinity of kings. I must give substantial reasons why we should stand by the British rule. It is incumbent upon me to do so, having regard to the fact that the public meeting of the citizens of the town of Calcutta, have declared that no address be given. That was a got-up meeting, I say, a meeting which did not represent the

intelligent classes of this country; it represented the boys and the sentimental people. On one side we hear of unreasoning loyalty, and the divinity of kings and empire, and on the other side we hear of *charkas*, non-co-operation and other things. But, can the substantial benefits of British rule be spoken away by speeches? What were we before the British came here, and what have the British done for us? That must be remembered, and where shall we be if the British left us to-day, and if the Amir of Kabul or any other person——

The PRESIDENT: I think it would be wise if members would not refer to matters like this

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I will not speak any more.

The PRESIDENT: Very good.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: As a representative of the Bengal National Chamber of Commerce, I have the greatest pleasure in supporting this resolution.

Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: As an elected member of the Legislative Council from the district of Faridpur, and as a member of the medical community of Bengal, I whole-heartedly support the resolution moved by Mr. D. C. Ghose.

Maulvi HAMID-UD-DIN KHAN: On behalf of the Mussalmans of the district of Rangpur, I whole-heartedly support the resolution moved by Mr. D. C. Ghose.

Rai UPENDRA LAL RAY Bahadur: As a representative of the landholders of the Chittagong division, I have pleasure in supporting the resolution. In this connection, I might mention, with your permission the cause of the difference in certain quarters regarding this. The fact is that there is no difference of opinion regarding the loyalty to the British Throne, but there is a feeling in the country that much money should not be spent over the reception at the present moment. That is the feeling prevailing in the country, and it is not for want of loyalty to the British Throne. [A voice: "Hear, hear."] Whatever it may be, it is our duty and pleasure to grant a hearty reception to the august person who is coming here.

With these remarks, I have much pleasure in supporting the resolution.

The PRESIDENT: I would ask members to carry this resolution by rising in their seats.

The resolution was carried unanimously, all members standing.

Government Bills.

The Bengal Children Bill, 1921.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM presented the report of the Select Committee on the Bengal Children Bill, 1921.

I am sorry that the report could not be printed until just now. That is the reason why a copy was not available to the members before the meeting.

I wish to point out that the Select Committee has reported that the Bill should be republished as there have been some material alterations. One material alteration is that the Select Committee has included girls within the scope of the Bill. On this point, there was a considerable volume of public opinion in support of the inclusion of girls, especially of the European and Christian communities. There were also some Indian associations which recommended that the girls should be dealt with in the same way as boys. I may say in this connection that Government were inclined not to include girls in the original Bill, not because they were in the fullest sympathy with the case of the girls as with the case of the boys, but the Government felt that, in a measure like this, they ought to proceed as cautiously as possible. In the case of girls, Government did not feel quite sure of their ground as they were in the case of boys, especially as it is well-known that Indian opinion is very sensative on all questions affecting girls. There was also another reason why Government did not include girls in this Bill, and that was because it would be very difficult to have proper institutions for the training of girls, and still more difficult to find suitable employment for Indian girls after training. There was also the financial question. In these days of financial stringency, it was considered advisable that we should make a small beginning and, if we succeeded in the experiment, to extend the scope of the Bill as widely as possible. But, as I have said, there was considerable public opinion in favour of dealing with the case of neglected girls, and that opinion is especially strong in the Christian communities. As regards Indian opinion, it is not very clear at the moment, and that is one reason why the Select Committee decided that the Bill should be republished. Another point, which is rather important, is that an amendment has been suggested by the Select Committee raising the age of the children dealt with under the Bill, from 12 to 14. There are also other amendments suggested, but they are more or less of minor importance. There are two dissenting notes added to the Bill, which will have to be considered when the Bill is discussed.

The Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill, 1921.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN moved "that the Bengal Land Registration Bill, 1921, be taken into consideration."

The motion was put and agreed to.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY moved "that for clause 2 of the Bill, the following be substituted, namely:—

'In the last paragraph of section 70 of the Land Registration Act, 1876, as amended by the Eastern Bengal and Assam Land Registration (Amendment) Act, 1907, for the words "two rupees" the words "five rupees" shall be substituted.' "

This is rather a technical point and its discussion in the Council is naturally inconvenient for its very technicality. Had this Bill been referred to a Select Committee, a talk across the table could have settled it to the satisfaction of everybody. I am afraid that on the surface of it the matter may indeed seem a small one not worthy of any serious attention of the House. But it is not so. Had I not been convinced that a question of principle is involved, I would never have troubled the House with my amendment. The Government has got to keep a record of the revenue-paying estates in its own interests and when you have a record, changes and alterations in it are inevitable, to keep it up to date, as new interests do come in and old ones fall apart. The more accurate and up to date these records are kept, the more it helps the Government in smoothly realising its revenues. It is as well to the benefit of the Government to know who is really liable for its revenues, and we expect the Government to be just and equitable in its dealings so that one's lands be not sold off for another's neglect. If the principle be accepted that you are entitled to demand fees for the keeping of your own records for your own benefits to help you in the realisation of your own dues, I do not know where the limit would be put. I do not know how many new fees cannot be thus held justifiable; your bankers, your grocers, your tailors, in short, everyone with whom you have any business transaction, can demand special *ad valorem* fees to keep your accounts up to date.

Like the Government, the zamindars have also got to keep elaborate accounts of their rent-paying tenants. But the law distinctly prohibits them from charging any fees for the maintenance of their records. But, for the very same kind and quality of work for which the zamindars are prohibited from accepting any fee, the Government now proposes to demand a fee. The ways of the Government are really inscrutable. What is immoral for the zamindars is moral for the Government. It is nothing but a kind of *abwab*, a little extra, which, in the good old days, the Nawabs of Bengal used to extort from the zamindars in addition to their revenue, the latter also in their turn were allowed to do the same in respect of their tenants. But this pernicious system of levying *abwab* was abolished long ago, and it would be a pity if it be revived again.

The idea of this fee is inequitable in its origin. When Act XI of 1859 was passed, this idea of making something out of this matter of maintaining the records, had never occurred to its framers. So also, when

the Land Registration Act of 1876 was passed, it was not thought of. But the angle of vision changed later on. In the amending Bill of 1906, when Mr. Hare was the Member in charge, it was for the first time proposed to levy a uniform fee of Rs. 2 for all applications for registration of names. Babu Ambika Charan Mazumdar, the veteran leader, who was then a member of the Council opposed this proposal, but he was met with the reply that this small fee of Rs. 2 was proposed simply to make it uniform with the other similar fees for registration of names. Even then it was not put forward that this fee was needed to bear the cost of the maintenance of the records. Perhaps it was even at that time thought to be absurd to demand money from other people for maintaining one's own records in order. But it seems that the angle of vision has now changed so far that it has become oblique. And, the funniest part of the whole thing is that when proposing to levy an *ad valorem* fee, the Hon'ble Mover, unmindful of the inherent fallacy, advances the following arguments in his Statement of Objects and Reasons. He says:

> It is not considered equitable that the administration of separate accounts, the opening of which benefits only the applicants, should be a burden on the general tax-payers.

First of all, no one wants it to be a burden on the general tax-payers. The whole income from Land Revenue is there, and any cost of maintenance of the Land Revenue records is eminently a fit charge on that. And then, Sir, whenever you introduce the principle of *ad valorem* fees, you make one who pays the larger revenue suffer for one who pays a lesser amount, because the work involved in both the case is the same. The Hon'ble Member talks of equity, but is this really equitable?

And Sir, is the raising of the fees a necessity? If we examine the Land Revenue Reports of the last few years it will be patent to everybody that, on an average, the fees realised for land registration exceed the expenditure therefor. I am quoting from the Reports:—

> In 1915-16, the fees realised were Rs 13,220 and the expenditure amounted to only Rs 5,083 In 1917-18, the respective figures were, fees realised Rs 9,042, expenditure Rs 4,101, in 1918-19, fees realised were Rs. 7,461, expenditure Rs 8,964 In 1919-20 fees realised were Rs 7,135 and expenditure Rs 4,819.

So on an average the Government has been distinctly the gainer all along, and I think the House will agree with me in thinking that an increment of this gain based on such basically wrong principle, is not a necessity. Then Sir, how many fresh accounts are opened every year. I may mention here that as new accounts are opened, a large number of old ones are closed every year. In some years the number of old accounts closed has even exceeded the number of new ones opened, e.g., in the year 1919-20, the number of new accounts opened was 1,013 and that of old accounts closed was 1,754. The average also of the last few years shows that only about 353 fresh accounts are opened a year and that spread over the

whole province of Bengal. Is it such a heavy task that the existing staff of the different collectorates of the whole Province cannot cope with it?

In conclusion I must enter my emphatic protest against levying any fee on the ground of maintenance of records. I am also opposed to the introduction of the principle of *ad valorem* fees. I also ought to mention that the opinions of three of the public bodies of Bengal, which are all that have been received till now and circulated to the members, are all opposed to the proposed change. The British Indian Association says:—

They think the *ad valorem* fee proposed to be levied, will create great hardship to small owners.

The Dinajpur Landholders Association says:—

In the opinion of the Association it would be inequitable to levy an additional fee for maintaining the separate accounts . . . The proposed additional fee would be something like an *abwab*.

However, Sir, if the Hon'ble Member's intention be only to increase the existing rate of the uniform fee for applications, we are prepared to agree to a reasonable increase. With this end in view, I move my amendment which makes the uniform rate of the fee Rs. 5 instead of the existing rate of Rs. 2 only. And as I have said before this is a small matter, I have no intention of pressing this amendment to a division. I leave it entirely in the hands of the Hon'ble Member; if I have been able to convince him of the reasonableness of my arguments, I appeal to him to accept my amendment.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: At the very outset, I must say that the idea underlying the amendment of the Act is somewhat different not only in principle but in practice as well, from what has been conveyed to this House by Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray. We have been told in so many words that in levying this fee in the past, we have been indulging in profiteering by levying an *abwab* and taking more than we needed or what should have been our share. The Kumar, with his usual flow of language, has found fault with my language in the Statement of Objects and Reasons and he has excelled himself when he has said that while the Government levy an *abwab*, or at least what he terms an *abwab*, the zamindars do not in any way take anything from their tenants for recording in their *sherista* the names of the tenants and their co-sharers; I do not know if the *nazar* or *salami* on the transferred raiyati lands is not, in a round about way, the zamindars' share for this recording in his *sherista*. But, Sir, it is no good entering into details with the Kumar in a matter in which he has taken up the attitude of considering that the Government's desire to increase the fee is absolutely wrong in principle and, as such, is not worthy of support. What we have to consider is this: is the Government

justified in incurring cost in a matter which may possibly, in cases where Government may be the zamindar itself, be to the advantage of Government, but as a matter of general and broad principle, are we to incur this cost from the public, when it is without doubt more or less for the benefit of the parties who come forward for registration? We find that on an average we realise under section 70, at the rate of Rs. 2 for an application, over Rs 4,000 a year. This sum is received but there the Government's duty does not end, because the Government has got to administer the keeping of a separate account and it is a wrong principle that in administering these separate accounts we should meet them out of the general funds. On an average, I do not know, it may be possible that in some years the closing of the old accounts according to the extracts read out by the Kumar Sahib from the Revenue Reports, may have exceeded the number of the opening of the new accounts; but from our official statistics we find that the average number of separate accounts opened every year is 1,644 and that the estimated cost of administering separate accounts is over Rs. 16,000 Now, for that very reason in bringing in this amendment, we have calculated that the estimated receipts according to the scales that we have proposed in the Bill would come to a little less than the amount that I have mentioned; and in doing this, we have taken into consideraton, of course, Rs. 4,000 that we now get on an average under section 70. The reason why we calculated on the new scales is that in view of the cost of establishment which is bound to go up if effect is to be given to the recommendations made by the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee (which will in due course come before this Council for consideration), even what we have estimated will not fully meet the requirements; but it will to a great extent meet what we have now to spend. On behalf of Government in maintaining these records we have thought it necessary to propose in this amendment of the Bill the consolidating of the scales I have mentioned. None of the amendments which are before the Council to-day will bring us anything near the amount which we have estimated by the levying of the new fees If it is the desire of this Council that the present practice should continue that out of the public funds Government should maintain at its cost these records which to a great extent are not to the benefit of the Government as the Kumar Sahib says, but to the benefit of the parties themselves, the responsibility must lie with the Council and not with the Government. Government has thought fit that, in view of the present condition of things and in view of the principle which was brought to the notice of Government by the Salaries Committee of 1905-06, and after consultation with public bodies when the original Bill was drafted, it is not right that public funds should be spent on a matter of this kind. If the Council thinks otherwise, as I have already said, the responsibility must rest with this Council. If in view of the present state of finances the zamindars as well as those who hold land and who have to come under the purview of this Act consider that this extra

amount that we propose to levy should not be granted, it is for this Council to decide that point. On behalf of Government, however, I am sorry that I am unable to accept this amendment.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I thought that when the Bill was introduced Government are losing every year from the general public revenues, in meeting the expenses a very substantial amount for the convenience of the very few, i. e., those who are interested in having their accounts separated. I therefore put a question with a view to ascertaining what was the probable income and the probable expenditure on the subject. In reply to my question (No. 124—unstarred) I am told by the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan that it is very difficult to ascertain the real amount. But it is estimated that the annual income is Rs. 4,000 and the expenditure will be about Rs. 16,000. Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray has shown that there is a conflict of opinions on this matter and that there is no such loss to the public revenues, at least for two or three years, by referring to the Land Revenue Administration Reports; and I was anxiously waiting to hear what reply was given on behalf of Government. I have not been satisfied by the reply that there is really a serious loss to the public revenues. The view that for opening separate accounts the public should not suffer is also applicable to the partition of estates. Numerous small estates are coming into existence but on that account no fee is going to be charged. I do not know whether in that case it covers the expenditure incurred by the amount received on that account. However that may be, in this particular instance, we are not satisfied that there is any real loss. If that is so, and even if there be 1,600 additional accounts annually all over Bengal, there being 25 or 26 districts in Bengal, there will be only about 60 accounts in each district; and it will amount to a small increase. As I do not think that much expenditure will be incurred, I oppose the amendment. What we expect to get by this proposed amendment would not be a very appreciable amount; and for that small expenditure I do not think that we should be justified in raising the amount of fee already charged. We have been heard in the reply that it is not possible to prepare a satisfactory account and I therefore think that it would be improper on our part to support the amendment and to raise the fee for land registration. In this view of the matter I oppose the amendment.

SECRETARY to GOVERNMENT REVENUE DEPARTMENT (Mr. W. S. Hopkyns): There are one or two points in this rather technical matter which I would like to explain. To begin with, perhaps some members of the House do not know what is meant by the opening of separate accounts. The object of opening a separate account is to protect the co-sharers. If a proprietor sells a part of his estate, then two people will become liable for the land revenue payable for the estate.

Supposing one of these persons does not pay his share, then the whole estate will become liable to be sold under the Sale Law when the *kist* becomes overdue. To avoid that risk to the two proprietors in the case I mention, they can open separate accounts. The result of that will be that if one of the proprietors pays his share of the revenue and the other does not, the share of the former will not be put up to sale unless the sale of the defaulting share fails to realise the arrears and the whole estate thus becomes liable.

Then, Sir, as regards the amendment moved by Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray, there is one point to which I would like to draw attention, because it is a point to which objection was made when the original draft Bill was circulated for opinion. It was pointed out then that not every person who files an application for a separate account has his application granted. It will be apparent that, if we accept the Kumar's amendment, which makes the whole fee payable when the application is filed instead of making an additional fee payable after the application is granted but before the account is opened, those persons who pay the application fee and have their application rejected will lose Rs. 5 instead of losing Rs. 2 as they do now. The scheme of the Bill is, I think, quite clear. The present law is that before an application can be received for the opening of a separate account, a fee of Rs. 2 must be paid. It may be said that that fee represents, so far as the Government is concerned, the cost of dealing with the application. The application is dealt with by a department quite different to the one which deals with the maintenance of the revenue accounts. It is dealt with by what is called the *munshikhana* in the Collector's office. Once an account has been opened, it is maintained in the Tauzi department, i. e., the department which keeps the accounts of the collection of land revenue. We find that the receipts from the Rs. 2 fee come to about Rs. 3,600 or, roughly, Rs. 4,000 a year; that sum goes to the maintenance of the establishment necessary for dealing with these applications, and it pays nothing towards the maintenance of these accounts. It should be remembered that these accounts are maintained simply in the interest of the person who wishes to have a separate account. The cost of maintaining separate accounts has been estimated on the figures of the last 5 years to amount to something like Rs. 16,060 and the receipts we estimate to get from the scale of fees proposed in the Bill come to Rs. 16,030. I think that the Council will agree that the people who benefit by this arrangement are the people who ought to pay for it, and that the public should not be required to pay for the keeping of separate accounts which benefit only a small number of people. For these reasons, I hope that the proposals embodied in the Bill will be accepted as reasonable.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I have nothing further to add to what I have already said. I thought that the Hon'ble Member in charge would accept my amendment.

The amendment was then put and a division taken with the following result:—

AYES.

Chaudhuri, Babu Tankanath.
Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Nafizar Rahman.
Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath.
Doss, Rai Bahadur Pyari Lal.
Chose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder.
Khan Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Muhammad Ershad Ali.
Law, Raja Reshee Case.
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra.
Mukhopadhaya, Babu sarat Chandra.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Nasker, Babu Nem Chandra.
Raikat, Mr. Prasanna Deb.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar.
Ray, Rai Bahadur Upendra Lal.
Ray Choudhury, Raja Manmatha Nath.
Roy, Babu Jogendra Nath.
Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra.
Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Sailaja Nath.
Sarkar, Babu Rishindra Nath.

NOES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.
Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Yakuinuddin.
Ali, Maulvi A. H. M. Wazir.
Ali, Mr. Syed Hasim.
Ali, Munshi Amir.
Ali, Munshi Ayub.
Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar.
Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Hath.
Banerjee, Rai Bahadur Abinash Chandra.
Barma, Rai Sahib Panchanan.
Barton, Mr. H.
Basu, Babu Jatindra Nath.
Biss, Mr. E. E.
Bompas, Mr. C H.
Bose, Mr. S. M.
Chaudhuri, Babu Kishori Mohan
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Hawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Cochran, Mr. A.
Currie, Mr. W. C.
Das, Babu Bhishmadev.
Dey, Mr. C G.
Donald, Mr. J.
French, Mr F. C.
Chose, Mr. D. C.
Gupta, Mr. N. B.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
Huq, Maulvi Ekramul.
Karim, Maulvi Abdul.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlal.
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.
Khan, Babu Devendra Lal.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin.
Lang, Mr. J.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble.
Makramali, Munshi.
Marr, Mr. A.
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
Mukherjee, Babu Hitya Dhone.
Mullick, Babu Nirode Behary.
O'Kincaly, Lt.-Col. Frederick.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.
Pahlowan, Maulvi Md. Abdul Jubbar.
Payne, Mr. C. F.
Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur.
Rauf, Maulvi Shah Abdur.
Roy, Babu Halini Nath.
Roy, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh.
Roy, Raja Manilell Singh.
Sinha, Babu Surendra Narayan.
Stark, Mr. H. A.
Watson-Smyth, Mr. R. M.
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry.

The Ayes being 20, and the Noes 53, the motion was lost.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: In view of the amendment just lost, I fear that it may be difficult for me to get my amendment passed by the Council. But I depend upon the sense of justice of this House and, therefore, I press my amendment. It runs thus: "That in clause 2 of the Bill, for the words from 'an additional fee' to the end of the clause, the words 'a fee of four rupees is paid by the applicant' be substituted."

Now, Sir, in the Statement of Objects and Reasons, it has been pointed out that this additional fee is to be levied for the subsequent administration of the separate accounts. It may not be known to many

members of this House that before 1906 no fee was levied. I am reading out from the Board's proceedings of 29th April, 1882, where it has been said that the law does not provide for the levy of fees for application for opening separate accounts and therefore they should not be levied. That was the angle of vision in 1882. Now the angle of vision began to change in 1906 when it was enacted that, notwithstanding anything hereinbefore contained, no application under this section and under sections 10 and 11 of Act IX of 1859 shall be received unless it is accompanied by a fee of Rs. 2. The Hon'ble Babu Ambika Charan Mazumdar said, on the occasion when the Bengal Registration (Amendment) Bill was being discussed in 1905, that "it was not suggested that a separate establishment was required for the purpose and I do not understand why we should impose a tax upon such an application, however small it may be." We have heard at great length what the Hon'ble Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan has said but he has not mentioned the necessity of maintaining a separate establishment. I would point out another thing. It has been proposed that a sliding scale of fees would be levied. I cannot understand why there should be a difference of scale here. The amount of labour required for maintaining the accounts for Rs. 10 would be the same as it would be required for maintaining an account for over Rs. 100 and no case has been made out for proposing a sliding scale. I object to this portion of the Bill on a matter of principle. The subsequent maintenance of the records of the Tauzi department is a charge on the revenue of the province and it is a fallacy to say that the public, the general taxpayer, should be burdened with the cost for the maintenance of these accounts. The landholders have already been paying their revenue and there should be no fresh imposition upon them. It is in the nature of an *abwab* as has been said before. Sir, I would appeal to the members who do not belong to the landholding community that if they now try to help the imposition of this unjustifiable *abwab* upon the landholders they would be doing something which is absolutely wrong. There are men of other classes such as pleaders, mahajans, jotedars, etc., who now invest their money in land and this proposed legislation would affect them as much as the landholding class. Government is not going to raise the salaries of the ministerial officers by more than 100 per cent. any where. It may be reasonable for them to say that when they have to pay higher salary, zamindars should also contribute something. I propose therefore that, instead of Rs. 2, a fee of Rs. 4 be paid by the applicant. I demand bare justice from this House upon this question.

With these few words, I beg that my amendment be carried.

Babu NITYA DHON MUKHERJEE: When the mover first began to speak we all thought that he was going to withdraw his amendment, especially, as he knew the fate of the last amendment. Sir, the aims and objects of the Bill have been clearly stated by the Member in charge, and the mover of the amendment has not made it clear as to why the

ordinary taxpayers should pay money for the benefit of the landlord. Three things are to be considered in this connection. Firstly, that the ordinary taxpayers should not pay the money; secondly, that the amendments have all come from the landlords; and thirdly, that it is only in the interests of landlords that we are being asked to pay. I submit that under these circumstances we should oppose the amendment.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: I oppose this amendment. As has been explained by the mover of the Bill as well as by Mr. Hopkyns that the money realised for maintaining a separate account falls far short of the money which is required for maintaining an account for ever; therefore the fees that are to be realised from the landlord should represent the capitalised value of the cost which is necessary for maintaining the Tauzi office establishment. And when effect is given to the Salaries Committee's Report this expenditure will be greater. So it is reasonable and proper that the fees paid by the landlord should be raised under the Act. I may also mention here that this salutary provision has been embodied in the Act for the benefit of the landlords and to save their estates from the hammer of the Collector. The landlords should thank Government that it has saved the whole estate from being put up to auction. I may mention here that by keeping a separate account small co-sharers will be saved from ruin, as it is not unoften the case in the mufassal that the richer co-sharer wilfully neglects paying the revenue so that the whole estate may be put up to auction and he would have a chance of buying it up. I think, taking into consideration the fact that these provisions are entirely for the benefit of the landlords who are also believed to be rich, that this amendment should be rejected.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: The special pleading made by Babu Tankanath Chaudhuri would have perhaps moved me if the question was that every zamindar was going to suffer under this amending Bill. It has been made quite clear by the statement supplemented by Mr. Hopkyns as to who is really benefited by the opening of these separate accounts. Now, if that statement is accepted by this Council to be the correct view of the situation, the main principle underlying this amending Bill is that the cost of administering separate accounts should be borne by the beneficiaries and not by the general public, and it is with this object that this Bill has been introduced. The existing law regarding the levy of fees on the opening of separate accounts is, as everybody knows, contained in section 70 of the Land Registration Act of 1876. When the Bill to amend the Land Registration Act was introduced in the old Bengal Council in the year 1905, it was explained that the keeping of accounts opened under the Land Registration Act caused much trouble and that there was no valid reason why a fee should not be levied as in the case of applications under sections 10 and 11 of Act XI of 1859. The Select Committee appointed

to consider the Bill were of opinion that a uniform fee of Rs. 2 should be levied. A provision was therefore made in section 70 for the levy of a uniform fee of Rs. 2 in all cases. The Committee appointed by Government in 1905 to draw up a scheme for improving the pay and position of ministerial officers and to suggest measures for the reduction of work had urged the desirability of restricting the multiplication of separate accounts which not only necessitated a larger establishment in Tauzi and Certificates offices but also caused a considerable increase of work in every department of the Collectorate. Reports showed that more than one-third of the cost of the Tauzi establishment was due to the existence of these separate accounts. The opinion was therefore expressed that some limitation to the opening of these accounts should be imposed with the intention of preventing an excessive increase of clerical work. This opinion did not in itself suffice to justify the withdrawal of a benefit which had been conferred upon proprietors by legislation, but it was not in the opinion of Government unreasonable to ask that the expenditure on the additional work involved should be borne by the beneficiaries and not by the general public as figures show to be generally the case at present. In order to impose a check on the opening of accounts two courses might be followed—either a limit might be placed on the amount of revenue for which separate accounts could be opened or a fee might be imposed which would recoup Government the cost of the extra establishment necessitated by it. If the first of these two courses were adopted, it was considered that it would press hard on petty co-sharers and leave them at the mercy of rich co-sharers. This proposal was, therefore, rejected—and rightly rejected. With regard to the second alternative, statistics collected by the Board of Revenue showed that the average number of applications for separate accounts granted every year amounts to over Rs. 1,618. On the basis of a uniform rate of Rs. 2 a fee, now in force, the annual receipts, as Mr. Hopkyns mentioned in his speech on the previous amendment, come to Rs. 3,600. If the applications rejected but for which the fee is realised are taken into consideration, then Rs. 4,000 is a fair figure to calculate as annual receipts. The cost of the collection of separate accounts amounts approximately to one-third of the Tauzi charges, viz., Rs. 22,000. The cost incurred by the estate in administering separate accounts is thus paid for by the holders only to a small extent and a greater portion of the expenditure is borne by the general public. It was considered that the administration of separate accounts the opening of which benefits the applicants only, should not be a burden on the general tax-payers. It was therefore proposed to adopt the second course which, while making the separate accounts staff self-supporting, would also impose some limitation on the undue growth of these accounts. The Board of Revenue, after a detailed examination of the expenditure incurred in the collection of land revenue, reported that the collection of each instalment of revenue for which a separate account had been opened

involved an expenditure in excess of the normal expenditure incurred in the collection of land revenue, the capitalised cost of which at 5 per cent. would be Rs. 3 per instalment or *kist*. The Board, therefore, proposed that the existing fee of Rs. 2, which covers the cost of actually opening a separate account, should continue and that additional fees should be charged for administering separate accounts when opened. The fees thus proposed by the Board were Rs. 3 for estates paying revenue in one instalment, and Rs. 6, Rs. 9 and Rs. 12 for estates paying revenue in 2, 3 and 4 instalments, respectively. This proposal was circulated to various associations for opinion. The opinions received varied. Some accepted the proposals as just. The main objections however made by them were that a small co-sharer would suffer as he would have to pay the same fee as a rich proprietor, and though the proposed fee might be a trifle for the latter they would make it difficult for the former to afford the privilege of opening a separate account. In other words the objection amounted to a preference for some kind of an *ad valorem* scale in order to save the small co-sharer from having to pay too much for opening a separate account Another objection was that persons whose applications for opening separate accounts are rejected should not be required to pay the additional fees which are intended to meet the cost of administering separate accounts. For these reasons it may be stated that the second objection which was taken up by different associations has been met and no additional fee to cover the cost of administration will be imposed in the case of applications which are rejected. The fee will be paid after the application is sanctioned but before the account is actually opened. This is made clear by the Bill which contemplates two stages for the provision in the law, if the Bill is passed, will be — (1) that no application should be received unless it is accompanied by a fee of Rs. 2; and (2) that no separate account shall be opened unless the additional fee is paid. The other objection that a small co-sharer would suffer if the additional fees were to vary in amounts in accordance with the principle of *kists* or instalments in which the land revenue of the estate is payable was carefully considered by Government in consultation with the Board of Revenue. The fact that the number of *kists* or instalments depend on the amount of land revenue payable, although this was the land revenue payable for the whole estate, led to the suggestion, which has now been incorporated in the present Bill, that instead of a fee varying in accordance with the number of *kists* in which the land revenue is payable, there should be substituted a fee proportionate to the amount of land revenue payable for the separate account. It was agreed that this suggestion would meet the objection made in the interest of the small co-sharer and inquiries were then made to ascertain the number of separate accounts paying land revenue of amounts not exceeding Rs. 10, Rs. 50 and Rs. 100 and exceeding Rs. 100. Figures obtained by these inquiries enabled the Board of Revenue to draw

up a scale of fees which would recoup Government for the cost of administering separate accounts and would at the same time make the petty co-sharer's payment more or less proportionate to the revenue payable by him. It is this scale which has now been incorporated in the Bill. Babu Tankanath Chaudhuri's amendment would limit the additional fee in all cases to Rs. 4 which is the amount proposed in the Bill as the additional fee for a separate account for which the land revenue payable does not exceed Rs. 10. It would be clear from what has been stated above that if these amendments were accepted not only would the petty co-sharer be made to pay the same fee as the more wealthy proprietor but the total amount of fees which would be payable on account of separate accounts would not be sufficient to make the separate account pay for the cost of their administration. The amendment, therefore, is not one which can be accepted, if the two principles are to be followed, viz., that the cost of administering separate accounts should be borne by the beneficiaries and not by the general public, and that the scale of fees should be such as not to press too hard on the small co-sharer.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: I have heard what the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur has said but I do not see any reason why I should give up my point. The thing is this that when Government is not going to increase the pay of the ministerial officers by more than 100 per cent., with what sense of justice can they demand and enhance the fee from the landholders to such a high scale. I leave it to the sense of the Council to decide the question and I have nothing further to add.

The motion was put and lost.

Maulvi ABDUL KARIM moved "that in clause 2 of the Bill, for the four proposed additional fees, the following shall be substituted, respectively, in the order mentioned, namely,—

'one rupee;
two rupees;
five rupees;
ten rupees.'"

At present a uniform rate of Rs. 2 is levied for every separate acount irrespective of the value of such accounts. This is, to my mind, highly inequitable and unjust. It cannot be justified on any ground that a separate account with a revenue of Rs. 5 or Rs. 10 should pay the same fees as an account bearing a rental of Rs. 500 or more. If any alteration is to be effected in the existing rate, I think the rates should be made to vary according to the value of each separate account. But the *ad valorem* fee proposed in the Bill under consideration is too high and excessive and will tell very heavily upon the proprietors desiring to open separate accounts. The opening out of separate accounts is also an advantage to Government from an administrative point of view. Good and honest part proprietors suffer severe hardship in case of joint

accounts owing to the laches and dishonesty of other small shareholders who find it convenient for them not to pay regularly and thereby compel bigger shareholders to bear the entire burden, in almost every *kist*, to save their larger interest. This often leads to repeated sales of joint revenue-paying estates and hearing of a large number of appeals and objections by the revenue authorities, while, on the other hand, the innocent shareholders suffer for the wickedness of dishonest parties. Therefore no obstacle ought to be thrown, both in the interest of the Government as well as of the proprietors, in the way of opening separate accounts. On the contrary all reasonable facilities should be allowed in opening out such accounts. The incidence of *ad valorem* fee provided in the Bill would be very heavy and I am afraid if such high fees be levied the collection will be far in excess of the requirements of the Revenue Department for meeting the cost of extra work as mentioned in the Objects and Reasons of the Bill.

With these few words, I commend my amendment to the acceptance of the Council and of the Government.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: I have nothing to add. I oppose the motion for the reasons which I have already given.

Rai UPENDRA LAL RAY Bahadur: I rise to support the amendment on the ground that it is in keeping with the object of Government. Government have proposed a sliding scale of fees, and I think the scale of fees as proposed by the mover is quite reasonable. He has suggested that a scale of Re. 1, Rs. 2, Rs 5 and Rs. 10 should be substituted for the four proposed additional fees. We do not know whether the original amendment has been marked out in consideration of the total expenditure as has been pointed out by the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan. The fact remains there. It seems to be rather very high. Take for instance the first suggestion of Rs. 4——

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: May I explain one thing to the speaker? He evidently thinks that by the sliding scale which we have proposed in the Bill we are going to realise more than is necessary. If we are to accept the mover's amendment, it will only bring in Rs. 5,000 and odd, whereas we have calculated our requirements to be Rs. 10,000 and odd and for, that reason the sliding scale has been proposed.

Rai UPENDRA LAL RAY Bahadur: We have not been able to follow the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan as to whether this calculation is based on the actual facts and over what period it has been spread for arriving at the figure mentioned by him.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: We have calculated on the average of five years; and we

have calculated that our requirements would be Rs. 16,000 and odd, estimating the cost of administering separate accounts. If we accept any of the amendments—two have already been lost—or the amendment that is to be moved hereafter, we will only get Rs. 5,000 and odd out of the Rs. 16,000 and odd we require and we have for that very reason enunciated the principle that public funds should not be diverted but that the beneficiaries themselves should bear the burden in this matter. On that principle it is quite wrong to accept anything except the sliding scale which we have provided in the Bill, and for that reason Government are not prepared to accept the amendment.

Rai UPENDRA LAL RAY Bahadur: It is not proper that a separate account holder with a revenue not exceeding Rs. 10—it may be one rupee or two rupees—should pay the same fee as the holder of an account bearing a rental of Rs. 500. If it is a question of one rupee he will have to pay Rs. 4 which is hardly fair and relying on that principle we have suggested, as the mover of this amendment has proposed, that this scale should be substituted for the scale provided in the Bill. That is the point we are aiming at.

With these remarks, I beg to support the amendment of Maulvi Abdul Karim.

Maulvi ABDUL KARIM: I have nothing further to add.

The motion was then put and a division was taken with the following result :—

AYES.

Chermakar, Babu Rasik Chandra.
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad.
Chuadhuri, Sir Ashutosh.
Doss, Rai Bahadur Pyari Lal.
Karim, Maulvi Abdul.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlul.
Khan, Maulvi Hamid-ud-din.
Makramali, Munshi.
Moitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath.
Mukhopadhaya, Babu sarat Chandra.
Raikat, Mr. Prasanna Deb.
Ray, Rai Bahadur Upendra Lal.
Roy, Babu Jogendra Krishna.
Roy, Babu Jogendra Nath.
Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Sailaja Nath.

NOES.

Afzal, Nawabzada K. M. Khan Bahadur.
Ahmad, Maulvi Azaharuddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Yakuinuddin.
Aley, Mr. S. Mahboob.
Ali, Mr. Syed Nasim.
Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar.
Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath.
Barma, Rai Sahib Panchanan.
Basu, Babu Jatindra Nath.
Biss, Mr. E. E.
Bompas, Mr. C. H.
Bose, Mr. S. M.
Cathcart, Mr. M.
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Das, Babu Bhishmadev.
Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra.
Dey, Mr. C. C.
Donald, Mr. J.
French, Mr. F. C.
Chose, Mr. D. C.
Gupta, Mr. N. B.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.
Khan, Babu Devendra Lal.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin.
Lang, Mr. J.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble.
Marr, Mr. A.
McKenzie, Mr. D. P.
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhone.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Nasker, Babu Hem Chandra.
O'kinealy, Lt.-Col. Frederick.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.
Pahlowan, Maulvi Md. Abdul Jubbar.

Payne, Mr. C. F.
Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur.
Rauf, Maulvi Shah Abdur.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Ray Choudhury, Raja Manmatha Nath.
Roy, Mr. J. E.
Roy, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh.
Sinha, Babu Surendra Narayan.
Watson-Smyth, Mr. R. M.
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry.
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

The Ayes being 15 and the Noes being 47, the motion was lost.

SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ being absent, the amendments standing in his name were deemed to have been withdrawn.

They were as follows:—

SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ: "That in clause 2 of the Bill, for the four proposed additional fees, the following shall be substituted, respectively, in the order mentioned, namely,—

'two rupees eight annas;
three rupees;
four rupees;
five rupees.' "

SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ: "That at the end of clause 2 of the Bill, the following be added, namely,—

'In the case of a proprietor selling a small share of his estate the purchaser of which does not apply for a separate account being opened, the original proprietor may apply for a separate account to be opened in respect of his share, and on payment by him of the above fees shall be entitled to have such separate account opened.' "

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN moved "that the Bill, as settled in Council, be passed."

The motion was put and agreed to.

The PRESIDENT: Shah Syed Emdadul Haq has made a request that the motion standing in his name should be postponed. I postpone it to the bottom of the non-official business.

It was as follows:—

SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ to move for leave to introduce a Bill to amend the Bengal Muhammadan Marriages and Divorces Registration Act, 1876.

Resolutions

(under the rules for the discussion of matters of general public interest).

Calcutta University.

Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: "This Council recommends to the Government that, with a view to determine what financial assistance, if any, should be given to the Calcutta University, a committee,

consisting of two financial experts, and two members of the Senate, to be nominated by the Government, and three non-official members of this Council not holding any office in the University, to be elected by the Council, be appointed at an early date to inquire into and report on the general working of the University, in particular its financial administration, and recommend such urgent measures or reforms as may be necessary."

For some time past the attention of the educated public has been drawn to the affairs of Calcutta University and a strong feeling has been created against the entire administration of the University, particularly its financial administration with special reference to post-graduate studies, necessitating a demand for prompt and searching inquiry.

We, as the people's representatives, cannot and should not adopt as our motto the famous words written over the portals of the University of Aberdeen: "They have said. What they say, let them say." The members of this Council will be failing in their duty if they do not respond to the people's legitimate demand and at the same time if they do not uphold the high honour and prestige of the University. For several years past the Calcutta University has been losing the respect it used to command and it is our paramount duty to restore the University to its former position of high honour and dignity.

It has been frequently said that the Post-graduate Department is out of all proportion to the demand for higher studies at the present moment. It is no doubt highly desirable to have several professors for each student if the University could get an unlimited source of income, sufficient to meet the demands of all the departments now maintained by it.

The department of post-graduate studies in Arts have now got about eighteen subjects. But the University has done very little improvement for the department of Science. The University has, I understand, gradually reduced the contribution to the Science College from the Fee Fund till, in 1920-21, it has stopped contributing anything contrary to the terms of the trust created by Sir Taraknath Palit. Recent proceedings of the University record the average contribution to the Science College though it is a fact that no provision has been made for the Science College in the Budget for 1920-21. This reminds me of the story of crossing of a river by a mathematician after taking its average depth. The University has undertaken to teach all branches of human knowledge under the sun except those which add to the material resources of the country. There was no provision for the study of Agriculture, Industry, Mining, Commerce, Entomology, Nautical Science, Forestry, Metallurgy, Science of leather industries, or of textile industries, etc., though very feeble attempts are beng made now for the creation of some Chairs in some subjects in the Post-graduate Department. What useful purpose will be served by the creation of these Chairs one fails

to understand. Creation of Chairs for higher studies dissociated from preliminary and secondary courses is worse than placing a "marble dome on a mud-built wall."

Laboratories and workshops for Applied Chemistry and Applied Physics and for other such subjects expressly mentioned by Sir Rash Behary Ghosh in his trust deed have not yet been earnestly taken up nor completed though a large sum must have by this time accumulated in the funds of the University. No one explains the unnecessary delay in carrying out the intention of the donor. This perhaps raised a grave doubt, in the mind of Sir Rash Behary Ghosh, and led him to bequeath his residuary estate amounting to about Rs. 12 lakhs to the National Council of Education. The demand for vocational and industrial education has nowadays become so great that there were about 4,000 candidates this year for admission to the National Council of Education, the Board of which is acting up to the direction of its donors for more speedily and successfully than the University with its various advantages.

Then again, it is urged that the Post-graduate Department should be thoroughly remodelled. The number of professors in proportion to the number of students reminds one of the story of a regiment of 200 officers against 250 soldiers.

In Pali there are 8 students paying a monthly fee of Rs. 10 each, but there are 16 professors or lecturers drawing a monthly salary of Rs. 1,475. In Comparative Philology there are 6 students but they have got 4 gentlemen at a monthly pay of Rs. 1,050 to teach them. In Arabic and Persian there are 7 professors or lecturers at Rs. 1,150 a month as against 20 students. In History there are 227 students with 46 professors at a monthly expense of Rs. 8,650. In Anthropology, 22 students have got 10 experts with salary of Rs. 1,400 to teach them. I do not wish to tire your patience by enumerating a long list except by referring to one more instance where the arrangement has reached its climax. There are three instructors in Tibetan language at a monthly pay of Rs. 730 to teach five students. It was found impossible for one of the instructors "to live in the plains except during the depth of winter, which even proved to him to be warmer than summer in Lhassa" so arrangements have been made for the instructor to live at Darjeeling with the students at the cost of the University. Two of the members of the Calcutta University Commission have said—

> The difficulty in the co-ordination of the classes (in the Post-graduate Department) is increased by the employment of staffs which are very numerous in proportion to the numbers of students.

Since that remark numerous additions have been made in the staff. They have also remarked—

> The Post-graduate system suffers from the praiseworthy faults of being organised on overambitious and extravagant lines, and from the evidence given us in some

arrangement," reports one of the Post-graduate teachers, "from the students' point arrangement," reports one of the Postgraduate teachers, "from the students' point of view, too, is far from satisfactory."

It has been asserted that those who have been appointed Post-graduate professors or teachers do not always possess the requisite qualifications for teaching those subjects they are paced in charge of.

Then again, appointments of these professors or teachers are made without proper advertisements so that able and qualified candidates are shut out from applying.

Few of these teachers in the Post-graduate Department have to teach more than six hours a week on the ostensible ground that they may have time enough to devote themselves to research works. The researches done by these teachers have been openly challenged and held in many cases to be instances of plagiarism, or translations and curious specimens of writings not worth the paper that they are written upon. Strange it is that spuriousness of some of these writings had not been noticed by the University Examiners until it was pointed out by outsiders. Research works highly praised to-day are suppressed or destroyed to-morrow. Sir, the Post-graduate Department of the Calcutta University has adopted the motto: "Search for the truth is the noblest occupation of man, its publication a paramount duty." But in the opinion of critics the motto is more respected in its breach than in its observance.

The members of the Calcutta University Commission, already referred to, have said—

> The teaching in the separate subjects is organised by seventeen Boards of Higher Studies of fifteen of which the President of the Postgraduate Councils is the Chairman We consider that the Chairman of a University Board of Higher Studies should be an expert in that subject and usually one of the senior teachers in it

Since that observation the number of these boards has been increased to about 28 and yet the same President is the Chairman of about 24 of these boards. Instead of discontinuing the practice condemned it has been adhered to with a vengeance.

I have already said that the professors are given very little lecture works so that they may devote more time to research works. But want of time has never been complained of by real research workers. Sir J. C. Bose and Sir P. C. Roy had to deliver about 18 hours' lecture in a week still they are the greatest research workers of the world. Sir Leonard Rogers in spite of his hospital duties, *post-mortem* and lecture works could carry out his researches. Mr. Ramesh Chunder Dutt and Babu Bankim Chandra Chatterjee in spite of the duties of an executive officer could leave behind them rich legacies of human knowledge. So want of time cannot be an excuse for real and genuine research workers, But, Sir, the University professors are so ill-paid and their tenure of office so transitory that they are always in search for better employment and generally fall back upon a secondary source of income to meet the

bare necesssities of life. Some of the professors are found in the corridors of the High Court or other Courts, some act as tutors to rich men's sons, while others again carry on a book-stall, a piece-goods or even a shop dealing in excitable intoxicants under *Benami*. These Post-graduate professors have time enough to fill up the columns of newspapers with all sorts of nonsense in abusing people who point out the defects of the present system of the educational policy adopted by the Calcutta University; they have time enough to dance attendance at the residences of selected members of the Syndicate, but they have no time to deliver lectures to the students for which they are paid.

The number of professors and lecturers in the Post-graduate Department should be reduced by retaining really qualified men, and those again who will remain after the reduction should be paid a decent pay but not on such a lavish scale adopted by the Dacca University; and besides the tenure of office of these officers should be made permanent.

There is a general cry that examinations have now become a farce. The percentage of passes has become absurdly high. Examiners' fees have been reduced so low that all sorts of corruption have begun to creep into the system of examination. Libellous statements are made that examiners are appointed convenient to some and inconvenient to others. No less libellous is the statement that regulations are modified to suit the needs of a particular candidate or candidates. Such gross and perhaps malicious statements should never be allowed to pass without inquiry.

Secondary education has practically been neglected. It has been treated as a means to swell the income of the University so that its Syndicate and Senate may have the luxury of spending for its hobby-horse, the Post-graduate Department. A show, it is said, has been maintained by making provision for the teaching in some subjects to undergraduate students. But Secondary education has all along been deprived of the sympathies of the University absolutely. The high English schools are called upon to introduce one or the other of the different courses of vocational education, at their own expense so that the University may combat with the non-co-operation movement without any burden on itself.

There is a wild rumour that if inquiries be made into the way in which the work of the office of the University is administered curious discoveries will be made. Appointments after appointments are made without much improving the efficiency. There is a Controller of Examinations but still we find pages of the *Calcutta Gazette* filled with errata after the results of each examination are published. Who will bear the costs of this extra printing? Results of examinations are published long after they are due. It is alleged that lectures are delivered and attendance of students recorded though the student concerned never knew who the professor was and what lectures were delivered. It is openly

given out that the Registrar is incompetent for the office he holds, as is apparent from the letter he had addressed to Mr. Sharp. Sarcastic remarks are made that the nearness of the fish market has perhaps some bearing on the language used in the letter.

Then again vehement attacks have been made against the administration of the finance of the University. The Budget is never presented until several months of the financial year have passed away. Expenses far in excess of the demand for the whole financial year have been incurred long before the Budget is presented before the Senate. The audit report for 1918-19 contains the following remark—

The objectionable practice of incurring expenditure first and getting it sanctioned afterwards which was brought to the notice in previous reports continued during the year under audit.

The sum thus spent in some of the instances amounted to over Rs. 31,000 during that year. Trust funds are pledged contrary to the express terms of the trust. Different funds are hopelessly mixed up. Funds of particular endowments have been spent for the purposes not intended by the donors. Proceedings of meetings of the Senate and the Syndicate about monetary transactions are so worded that they cannot but raise suspicion in the minds of the best admirers of the University. Resolution No. 73, dated November 25, 1920, runs thus:—

The Registrar made a statement on the state of cash balance on this date and reported the steps he had taken to arrange for payments during the remainder of the current month and December

Resolved—That the action taken by the Registrar be approved, that the proposal contained in the letter of the Bank of Bengal No 26798, dated the 12th October, 1920, be accepted, that the Registrar be authorised to make the necessary endorsements, and that a copy of this resolution be forwarded to the Bank with the countersignature of the Hon'ble the Vice-Chancellor

This is the way in which the University is transacting the financial business and still the University "emphatically repudiates the imputation about the mismanagement of the finance and trust funds or the financial administration of the University." But when an explanation of or elucidation of any proceeding, a sample of which has just been placed, is asked for, the University turns round and says—

No information as to the finances of the University which is not contained in its published proceeding will be supplied by the University for publication.

Sir, this attitude the Government and this Council should never countenance.

Then again, look at the position taken up by the University against the Government of Bengal when they inquired as to the time by which replies to audit reports for 1917-18 and 1918-19 might be expected. The following resolution of the Syndicate will speak for itself:—

Resolved—That the attention of the Government of Bengal be drawn to the fact that, apart from the question whether audit reports should be published as

Act VII of 1921 had come into operation on the 27th March, 1921, papers relating to matters which had taken place at a time when the Bengal Government had no concern with the University should not have been published without the consent of the University specially as the comments of the University upon the reports had not been received.

Sir, no one ever dreamed before that the Senate and the Syndicate of the Calcutta University can be charged with mismanagement of finance and trust funds, but the resolutions passed by the University might have the irresistible effect of turning the most honest and fair-minded man into the worst cynic.

Another system into which the committee, if appointed, will have to make a shifting inquiry is the selections and the publications made by the University as the text-books for different examinations. These are not usually done by efficient men and their productions in many cases are specimens of poor intellect. The principle followed by many of these pseudo-authors are usually instances of unacknowledged quotations and translations and when they try to introduce their own brains with a view to improve them they commit worse blunders.

Sir, in spite of there being University Journals of Letters and Science, the University has purchased the copyright of the *Calcutta Review* at a sum of Rs. 1,500 and has decided to publish it at a monthly cost of Rs. 237 in addition to the printing at the University Press. I do not know whether the University has got any such power. It will be a matter for inquiry by the Committee.

A very strong ground for immediate inquiry is that though the fees for the Matriculation, I.A., I.Sc., B.A., and B.Sc., examinations have been realised in March last, yet the remunerations of the examiners have not yet been paid though the results of the examinations have long been published. There is another very damaging rumour that the Calcutta University is bent upon launching into a money-lending business on mortgages at high rate of interest with money raised by pledging trust funds to the Banks. I do not know whether there can be stronger grounds for inquiry than these.

It is high time for this Council as well as for the Government to appoint a committee of inquiry so that their report may vindicate the high honour and prestige of the University. I do not wish to have a verdict without a fair trial.

I wish the insinuations made against the University were all false or malicious exaggerations; I wish the administration of the Post-graduate Department were as perfect as the rules of this department; I wish that the charges made against the University were gross libel and without any foundation; and I desire that the motto adopted by the Post-graduate Department may be strictly observed.

The PRESIDENT: As this motion and the three other motions which follow relate to the Calcutta University and are much of the same

character, I think that it will be convenient if I take them one after another.

Babu DEVENDRA LAL KHAN: Having regard to the fact that the resolution preceding mine is more constructive and more detailed, I beg to withdraw the resolution which stands in my name in favour of that.

The following resolution was then, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

"This Council recommends to the Government that a non-official committee of experts be formed to inquire into the whole of the finances of the Calcutta University and suggest means for the settlement thereof, after receiving evidence, oral or written, from such public men and associations as are willing to help the committee."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: May I draw the attention of the Hon'ble the President to one thing? Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur's resolution and resolutions Nos. 1, 2 and 4 are slightly different.

The PRESIDENT: They will be put to vote separately but discussed together.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: Will the second and third resolutions be treated as amendments to the first resolution?

The PRESIDENT: I will put them to vote separately: that will meet the point.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: "This Council recommends to the Government that they should, without delay, appoint a committee of twelve members to examine the financial aspect of the proposal for the reconstruction of the University, and of the formation of a Board of Secondary Education, passed by the Council, one-half of the said committee to be elected by the Council from non-official members, one-fourth by the Senate of the Calcutta University, and one-fourth by the Government."

A splendid University has been built up amongst us by the enlightened generosity of successive Viceroys and British educationists. We know that our graduates are in no whit inferior to the graduates of the Universities of the most advanced countries of Europe. I know from personal experience because I have sent hundreds of our graduates to those Universities where they held their own against the best of those Universities. Under the autocratic rule of the present Vice-Chancellor, whatever may be his defects, however much I might disagree with him in his ways, however much I might disapprove of his methods, I must say that the University has progressed to a marvellous degree. Let not personal malice or prejudice decry the services of our present Vice-Chancellor.

Sir, I have less reason to be partial to him than any other person here but I must do him justice. What is the question before us? The question is how are we to finance the University so that it might carry out the progressive ideas of the University Commission? How are we to make it preserve its existence and keep up its rate of progress? We have gone into huge expenditure in starting another University, but our dear *alma mater*, a fabric built up by the labours of generations, cannot be destroyed. The question before us is that our University is being starved. These insinuations that its finances are ill-administered had better wait. We are in a very parlous condition. The University cannot pay its way. There is time to abuse Sir Asutosh Mukherji—there is plenty of time.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I rise to a point of order. Is it a question of abusing Sir Asutosh Mukherji?

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: Finding fault with the administration.

The University has been for years writing to the Government of India to appoint a committee to go into the finances of this question of progressive advancement. The Government of India—there also personal prejudice had its way—had the matter kept from day to day, year to year, waiting. It was brought to the notice of the Secretary of State and the action was imminent when the Government of India washed its hands clean of a province, which is certainly not its favourite, and threw the University upon our shoulders. Now, Sir, what is wanted is a committee which will consider the financial aspect of the University. How is it to carry out improvements recommended by the University Commission? How will it be able to keep up its present, I say, its present high rate of progress? And you have to consider what are our finances.

The PRESIDENT: I am sorry to interrupt you. It is time for adjournment.

The Council adjourned for fifteen minutes.

After the adjournment.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: Let us forget our personal differences. We must remember that if we go on criticising the maladministration of the University, the Government may be reluctant to help us. There is time to criticise the evils and abuses that are in the University but this is not the time for that. I have reason to believe that the resolutions Nos. 1, 2 and 4 have excited the just indignation of the University authorities and if they are passed to-day, I am sure there will be no co-operation from them. The University authorities have refused point blank the jurisdiction of this Council to examine its accounts and it is a very great question, whether the University

should not be independent of any official control. The University should be an independent body entrusted with the administration of education in this country. If a person is autocratic or if his ways are wrong, that is no reason whatsoever why we should disturb a system that has worked so well, and take away the independence of the University. We should not interfere in this light-hearted way with our University by appointing a committee to examine its finances and financial administration and so forth. You do not know Sir Asutosh Mukherji. He will never submit to it and we would be made the laughing-stock of the world. Now, Sir, I am supposed to be a man who dearly loves a fight, but the truth is I am a man who is very weak and therefore of a very peaceful frame of mind. I do not like a fight. I, therefore, when I put in this motion, consulted the most influential men of the University and had it approved by them and then sent it in. I know very well that without the co-operation of the University we can do nothing. We must have the co-operation of the University for the present. We are going to amend the Universities Act and then, I do hope, whatever evils may now be complained of will disappear. Well, change in the law of the administration does not always remedy the evils. However we shall do that. Now, the question is a simple one. The University has for years asked the Government to appoint a committee to examine its finances. Not now, to-morrow, the day after, they said; and the University has been starved. It cannot pay its way. We cannot wait. Let there be a committee. Let it examine the finances and the requirements of the University and say what they require and what we must pay. I am proud of my University as I have said before. Our graduates, as I have said, can hold their own against the graduates of any other University. They have got a hundred generations of intellectual culture behind them and I feel confident that the time is coming when they will be in the vanguard of science and philosophy and advance the bounds of knowledge. It is not a question of local importance. It is a question which affects human progress. No money should be stinted to keep up the University's rate of progress. If you do that, you will be playing false to the best interests of the country. I, therefore, recommend that a committee be at once appointed to consider the financial aspects of the University and not withhold the grants which the University had been enjoying so long. They had been withheld long enough and should not be withheld any longer.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: It was with a sense of surprise that I saw Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur's resolution included in the resolutions that have been moved for the purpose of inquiring into the financial administration of the Calcutta University.

The PRESIDENT: I have asked you to move the resolution which stands in your name and you should confine yourself to that.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: "This Council recommends to the Government that a committee be appointed to inquire into the financial administration of the Calcutta University, particularly of the Post-graduate Department."

Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur's resolution and the other resolutions with which it is mixed up are as far apart as the poles. I had indeed expected that the Rai Bahadur would be able to say something in favour of his resolution, a resolution which I certainly oppose, but instead of that he has done nothing, but, after a prelude, accepted the resolution which has asked for a committee. The Rai Bahadur has been masquerading in sheep's clothing to the detriment, I am afraid, of the flock of sheep which he has sought company in. Straightway I must say that the resolutions that have been brought have not been brought with any ulterior motive than that which appears on paper, that they have not been brought with any personal malice against the great Vice-Chancellor of the Calcutta University. This is not the place to sing a pæan of praise on behalf of any one, but I would not be far wrong if I were to say that in India there are few men that are as able as he. I say once more that this resolution is not levelled against his personality or against his character, but if inspite of my protestations there are some who, judging from themselves, cannot believe me, I ask the members of the House to accept the resolutions on its intrinsic merit and leave the motives to those who grub underneath for them. I am not going to dilate upon the innumerable abuses that have crept into the administration of the Calcutta University. We are more concerned with the financial administration, and if we find, or if we doubt, and doubt with a certain amount of reason, that the finances of the Calcutta University are not being properly administered, a very clear case has been made out for the appointment of a committee to inquire into its financial administration. I must say that we have been considerably aggrieved by the contemptuous way in which the inquiries of the hon'ble members of this Council have been treated by the Calcutta University; and at the desire, the very apparent desire, of the Calcutta University to conceal from us all knowledge of the financial administration, I must say a great doubt has arisen in our minds specially when we realise that no satisfactory audit reports of the Calcutta University are forthcoming and that the budget of the Calcutta University is presented long after the expenditure has been incurred. It is sufficient for our purpose, therefore, if we are not satisfied with the working of the Calcutta University, if we are not satisfied with the way in which the money is being spent, I am sure that the University with the charges that have been levelled against it will itself not shirk the inquiry, and I am sure that the Government will not seek, in view of the fact that there is an earnest desire on the part of the country to see for itself how the finances of the Calcutta University are being administered, to oppose this series of resolutions. I weep no crocodile

tears when I say that I grieve that our beloved University, which we hope would one day be the premier University of the East, has lost the confidence of the people, that it has before it a dark and dismal future clouded by distrust and suspicion; and it is because I seek only to rehabilitate the University in the esteem of the people, and to secure once more for the University the confidence which it enjoyed in ages past, that I crave for a committee of inquiry.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I have great pleasure in seconding the resolution of Mr. Rishindra Nath Sarkar in demanding for a Committee to inquire into and report on the affairs of the Calcutta University generally. I must confess that I am surprised to see Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur putting a resolution in a garb which is not in the interests of the University. All along that he was speaking, he was practically speaking against the resolution, while he professes to be one of the movers of the resolution for an inquiry. In my opinion, I may be wrong, his is a damaskeening resolution, inspired by the authorities of the University. His speech was in support of them and he wanted to say only this and nothing but this, that it is a great University, a beautiful institution, and nothing should be said against it. Nobody here present can at all accede to that desire. I am myself a man of this University, and I do not yield to anybody in my desire that this University should be one which should be above reproach. If these reproaches were of an ordinary kind, I would not have joined in this resolution at all, but the accusations which have been levelled and levelled with so much stress, are such that go deep down to the very existence of the University, and it is abundantly clear that there is ample room for having a very searching inquiry into the affairs of this University. We all know what has appeared in the papers regarding this matter. I am not one of those who believe everything I see in print for I know that the best way of deceiving people is to publish something in print, and more so when it is published over the signature of some responsible officer of Government. Things have to be scrutinised, things are known to us, it is a part of common knowledge in this country at the present moment, that the funds of the University are being spent in a way which does not bear scrutiny. I am almost sure it is a fact—I shall be very happy if it is contradicted—that so far as one of the professors in the higher study of Muhammadan Law is concerned, there was a professor on high pay, but unfortunately there was no pupil to attend his class, and, therefore, one of the lecturers in some other department was made to sit down sometimes as his student. I say it is a fact and I challenge contradiction. I am one of those who consider that it is a matter of regret that the name of our respected Vice-Chancellor should be brought in in this connection. I do not like to attack anyone's name at all; it is not a question at all personal to anybody. What I oppose and what I beg to point out, is the wretched policy of administration of the University being vested

in the men who are controlling it. Our University, a thing which we love, is now the mighty training ground of students in the art of flunkeyism and the science of sycophancy. Moral strength is not always acquired in that University in these days. I say this not out of rancour, but out of deep regret, for I owe a deep debt of gratitude to this University. The fact that I have been selected to represent the cause of my countrymen to the best of my ability in this Council, is due to the little education that I got at the hands of the University, and I desire to say that I do not yield to anybody in my love for this University. Nobody can say that I am acting in a manner detrimental to the interests of my own University. The principal point is that before you continue to make grants, it should be made clear how this money is to be spent. If the money is not properly spent, then in spite of what my friend Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur may say, I assert we ought to stop these grants, and that without a moment's hesitation. If, on the contrary, the fact is this, that the University is doing just as good work as it is expected to do, then by all means continue the grants, nay add to it by asking my hon'ble friend, Mr. P. C. Mitter, to make larger grants to the University. He is a person of whom the University may very well be proud and no one is more anxious than him to help the University. But look at their attitude? They refuse to answer questions. They take money from persons, and refuse to show accounts as to how the money has been spent. This is rather surprising. We want to see how the money has been spent. If it is well spent, where is the fear? If there is nothing wrong, where is the fear? Why do you not come forward and show people how it has been spent? It has been said that the University has now launched into a scheme for raising money; I am told I am not sure, that they are now pledging their securities with the Bank and getting money from them and investing it in mortagages on high interest. They may have good intentions but the question is whether their actions are justifiable and proper. I take it that this shows a thorough want of management on the part of the University. Everything done with good intention may not be proper or legal; if you want to do things like this, you invite criticism. You are asked to show receipts and give replies, and you refuse and get fidgety, this is the kind of thing you would expect from a hysterial girl, and not from such a great academic institution as the University. Why do you not come forward and show your accounts; if everything is all right, why do you refuse?

Then, as regards the resolution of Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur, it is a beautiful resolution indeed; if you will look through it, you will see that in it is hidden a very clever way of shelving the whole question for years. My esteemed friend's resolution runs thus: "This Council recommends to the Government that they should, without

delay, appoint a committee . . . . to examine the financial aspect of the proposal for the reconstruction of the University. . . . ." He is most anxious about it. It is for the need of the University and the reconstruction of the University and the formation of a Board of Secondary Education, etc., etc. My friend knows perfectly well that the formation of a Board will cost a very large sum of money, and therefore there is no chance of its coming into existence for many years to come. This is very cleverly invented, but I do not know by whom. I say that there should be an inquiry. We must have an inquiry. We have a liability to our countrymen; we have a grand University, the University has its own income, larger than our expectations. Because it has a governing body I concede that the public as a whole have no right to control its affairs, but if its affairs are mismanaged, the public have every right to demand an inquiry. My friend is right in saying that the University ought to be free and unfettered from official control; that is so. So far as the internal management of the University is concerned I wish there were more freedom; I wish that there should be nominated member there. I wish that the Vice-Chancellor should not be a judge of the High Court or any other high official. That is quite a different thing, but that is not what is meant The real thing is that the University want to be free from popular control or outside control, or even public control in the sense that no one should ask the University to render an account of its funds. That is not the proper idea at all. I need not go into details. My knowledge of the University is more or less second-hand; I have never visited it since I left it unscathed. But even with that knowledge I know that there have been appointments which should never have been made. Posts have been given to men who have no proper knowledge or training. There are a number of classes to teach subjects which are practically useless at the present moment. If you want for the sake of higher culture that a particular subject of no ordinary interest should receive attention, then why do not you call in your sister universities and ask them to join and establish joint chairs for such subjects to prevent waste? Where is the good of a class with only one or two students in it, studying a subject which nobody on this side of the grave is likely to take any interest in? This is to show that you are spending money, or trying to spend it in a useless manner That is simply preposterous. You must do what will be of benefit to the largest number; that is your only justification for spending public money, and I say that we have a right to stop it, and a right to examine the situation, and a right to know what the amount of money is and how it is being spent.

As regards the University results, I am one of those who have suffered. I am a President of one of my own village schools, and a member of the Managing Board of others. I find that in these days it is difficult to fail in the matriculation examinations. Everybody knows this as well as I do. I refused this year to send up all my boys from

my village school for examination. Of the 12 sent 8 passed in the first and 4 in the second and none in the third division. These are results that attract, so that a large number of students would be forthcoming from the schools and more fees would be realised for spending after the Postgraduate Professors of doubtful utility. This is my view, and I challenge its contradiction. It seems that, according to the University results, it is easier to obtain a pass than a failure; this is an ideal or an approach to an ideal Good boys according to the laws of nature and Providence are bound to be necessarily smaller in number than bad boys, but according to the University, everybody is good, so beautiful were the results, that there were very few second class passes, and none third. These are "faked" results; I say this with all the responsibility of a member of this Council, and I challenge it. I have seen boys passed in the first class who cannot combine two words of English; such is their miserable knowledge. Recently one of such first class pass-holders spelt the word "school" with a "c," and all these passed in the first class!

With a University like this, having an income as large as theirs, I am sure, things are not being carried on in the best interests of the country. Therefore, I think, there is certainly a very strong case made out for an inquiry. I do not for a moment believe that everything that has been levelled against the University is wholly true, but there is room for suspicion. So let there be an inquiry by persons with an open mind and first-hand information and knowledge of things.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: I have listened to the speeches on this resolution. To my mind it is necessary for the fair name of the University that there ought to be an inquiry. Whoever is responsible for the management of the funds of the University ought to come forward and say, "let there be an inquiry." If the facts as are represented to the Council are acceptable then they show conclusively that there is a strong case for an inquiry. I do not know the facts personally, but whenever I had occasion to look at the papers I find in bold relief something said against the administration of the University. Almost all of us had our education in the Calcutta University and we think it is our duty to press this matter for the consideration of the Council. The Council represents the views of the people of the Province. The Council, in my opinion, is in a position to see how the affairs of the University are going on, how it is working, and whether the facts, as pointed out by the speaker, are correct. If an inquiry be made, as suggested by Mr. Rishindra Nath Sarkar, I am sure it will satisfy the critics. The management of the University, I believe, ought not to shirk the inquiry. If the facts, as stated by the various speakers are proved, then it is absolutely necessary that the University ought to be remodelled by the people on a proper basis. The University has lost the confidence of the people and it ought to regain it and this can only be done by a proper inquiry by the people

of the country or their representatives. I press this resolution to the acceptance of the Council and I fully support it.

Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: I rise to support this resolution. So far as our inquiry is concerned I think we should approach the question with an open mind and no aspersions should be directed against the learned body that controls the Calcutta University without gaining first an insight into the real state of affairs. To condemn persons without giving them an adequate opportunity of explaining first is always impolitic and contrary to justice and I request my friends not to use offensive language towards particular individuals on second-hand information only

Those who know the present constitution of the Senate and the Syndicate of the Calcutta University which includes His Excellency the Governor of Bengal at the helm, the Hon'ble Judges of the High Court, the Hon'ble Members of this Council, the Principals of several first grade colleges and others, many of whom have independent means of livelihood, ought to realise that any charge against the University applies not only to the Vice-Chancellor but also to these gentlemen to some extent, and it is for this reason that I want a thoroughly representative committee to inquire into the real state of affairs and suggest urgent remedies commensurate with the exigencies of the situation

Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: I rise to support the resolution moved by Babu Rishindra Nath Sarkar The resolution moved by him asks for an inquiry as to whether financial assistance should be given to the University That, I take it, means that assistance will be given for the working of the University as it is conducted now.

The resolution of Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur also proposes an inquiry, but that is an inquiry for the future financial aspect of the proposed reconstruction of the University not for the present working We have had the report of the Sadler Commission before us, for some length of time. We all know what the reconstruction of the University means: it means practically a duplication of the colleges, the creation of colleges for intermediate studies. There will be a course of higher studies with separate buildings and a separate staff: those connected with the management of colleges know very well what that means: so far as Calcutta is concerned, where there is a large number of colleges, it will mean the purchase of land, erection of buildings, fitting up of colleges and employment of a separate staff, etc. We all know, having regard to our present financial conditions, that the proposal for a reconstruction cannot be carried out now. It is practically an impossible proposition having regard to our present financial position. Therefore, to appoint a committee to consider the financial aspects of the proposal for reconstruction is a futile inquiry at present. The resolution of Mr. Sarkar, on the other hand, asks what financial assistance should be given to the Calcutta University and also to inquire

into and report on the general working of it: that is a more reasonable proposal. We should know what the financial requirements of the University are as it is now conducted, and the inquiry will enable the Council to be in a position to judge what financial assistance should be rendered.

With these few words, I support the resolution moved by Mr. Sarkar and oppose that moved by Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur.

Adjournment

The Council was then adjourned to Tuesday, the 30th August, 1921, at 3 P.M., in the Town Hall Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Tuesday, the 30th August, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers, and 102 nominated and elected members.

Calcutta University.

The PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): I am asked to announce that Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur is not able to be present in the Council to-day owing to illness in his family and he wants the resolution which he moved to be withdrawn. As however the resolution has already been moved the matter is in the hands of the Council

The resolution was then, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

The discussion on Babu Rishindra Nath Sarkar's resolution was resumed.

Dr. A. SUHRAWARDY: I rise to address the Council with a feeling of considerable hesitation and embarrassment. For apart from the relationship in which I stand to the mover of the resolution, Babu Rishindra Nath Sarkar, and apart from the misfortune of holding an office in the University, I find myself in the difficult position (unless, you Sir, grant me some measure of indulgence) of replying within the narrow compass of fifteen minutes to the aspersions and attacks on the University by no less than six speakers who volleyed and thundered for hours yesterday. But, as the Senate has no representative in the House—Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur is not a Fellow of the University—and I have been disappointed in my expectations of finding a special sense of responsibility and fair play pervading the debate and preventing speakers from repeating the parrot-cry of the market and making baseless and unfounded attacks on a public institution, I am compelled to speak. Though not a representative of the Senate in the House, I happen to be a Fellow of the University and a member of the Syndicate—in fact the only Fellow and member of the Syndicate here—I have no hesitation in characterising the statements made by Messrs. Sarkar, Mullick and Company as baseless, unfounded and libellous; and I challenge them, as the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler challenged Mr. Sarkar the other day, to repeat the statements outside this House. As I have already said, there is not a single non-official member here (barring Dr. H. Suhrawardy) who is qualified to speak

on the subject before the House with any claim to first-hand acquaintance with the affairs of the University. I shall not imitate the methods and tactics of the hon'ble gentlemen on the other side by attempting to impress the House with loud vociferations, wild gesticulations, mockery, mimicry and buffoonery. Nor shall I indulge like them, in sweeping generalisations unsupported by facts and figures. I shall try to deal with the matter as calmly and dispassionately as possible; and I shall state chapter and verse for every statement that I make. But as I have already stated, there is a time-limit imposed upon me, and, therefore, before I enter into details, I should like briefly to indicate to you the grounds on which I oppose the resolution. I oppose the resolution of Mr. Rishindra Nath Sarkar on the following grounds: (1) on its merits; and (2) on the question of law.

As regards its merits, I may briefly indicate that it is at once a tissue of lies and libellous and baseless misstatements and places certain restrictions on the qualifications even of those hon'ble members of the Legislative Council whom he seeks to be elected as representatives on the committee. I will enter into details later on.

As regards the question of law, I can state at once that even if the resolution is carried, the Government of Bengal have got no power to interfere with the internal administration of the Calcutta University. So far back as 1857, the only power given to Government to interfere with the internal administration was limited to this—I am reading out from the Act itself—I am sorry, Sir, that I have lost the reference. (Several voices: "Hear, hear.") I have got it now and my friends need not rejoice. Under the Act of 1857 as amended by Act II of 1876 and Act IV of 1904, the only power which has been given to Government is thus defined at page 16 of the Regulations of the Calcutta University:—

> Such fees shall be carried to one General Fee Fund for the payment of expenses of the said University, under the direction and regulations of the Governor-General of India in Council to whom the accounts of income and expenditure of the said University shall once in every year be submitted for examination and audit as the said Governor-General of India in Council may direct

That, Sir, is the only power conferred on Government of examining and auditing the accounts.

Sir, I need not remind the House—perhaps it is within the knowledge of the hon'ble members of this House—that not long ago Mr. J. Chaudhuri put a question of a similar nature in the Imperial Legistive Assembly and the following answer was given by Mr. Sharp who is no friend of the University:—

> Government have been informed that the financial position of the University of Calcutta is precarious. They have no intention of appointing a Committee such as that contemplated by the Hon'ble Member, nor does the existing law provide for the appointment of such a Committee.

(Several voices: "Will the member please speak a little louder?")

The PRESIDENT: I cannot hear clearly what you say. Would you speak a little louder, please.

Dr. A. SUHRAWARDY: I will try my best but I cannot help my physical infirmity. I cannot bellow and roar. I am sorry that I have not got the voice of Mr Mullick. (At this stage, the member came to a seat in front of the presidential chair.)

I have dealt with the question of law; and I now pass on to the merits. First of all, Sir, let me give you a brief history of the Post-graduate Department, its scope and the financial assistance rendered to it by Government. Section 3 of the Indian Universities Act prescribes it as the duty of the University to make provision for the instruction of students with power to appoint University professors and lecturers and to do all acts which tend to the promotion of study and research. In 1916, the Government of India appointed a Committee consisting of Sir Ashutosh Mukharji, Mr. Hornell, Sir P. C. Roy, Dr Seal, Dr. Howells, Sir Henry Hayden, Professor Hamilton, Mr Wordsworth and Mr Anderson to prepare a scheme for the co-ordination and development of Post-graduate teaching. The Committee submitted a unanimous report which was forwarded by Government to the Senate. The Senate framed regulations These were approved by the Government of India on the 26th June, 1916. It is the duty of the University now, under these regulations, to provide post-graduate teaching. The University has done its very best under very adverse circumstances to fulfil its obligations The Government of India has not increased the grant of Rs. 1,250 a month which was sanctioned in 1912, before these new obligations were imposed upon the University. The Government of Bengal up to the present time has not given a farthing as extra grant. The regulations contemplate that the University should arrange for higher instruction in a number of subjects mentioned including Sanskrit, Pali, Arabic, Persian, Comparative Philology. The Government of Bengal instead of spending money for higher teaching has actually made a profit out of it, Rs 34,000 from the postgraduate fund through the Presidency College.

The whole postgraduate system as adopted by the Government of India was scrutinised by the University Commission and was described by the Commission in Volume II, page 70, paragraph 64, as possessing many admirable features and furnishing a satisfactory solution of many difficulties and was in fact made the basis of the new scheme of reconstruction evolved by the Commission.

Mr. Sarkar quotes from the minority report of the Commission. Why does he ignore the majority report, specially the passage at Volume V, page 351, where they declined to accept the accuracy of the statements made by the minority?

Sir, to appoint a committee after the Calcutta University Commission which cost Government about Rs. 6 lakhs is like submitting a judgment of the Privy Council to a Munsif's Court for criticism.

Sir, the gravamen of their charge against the Post-graduate Department is that the number of teachers are very large and the number of students are very few. Apart from the fact that this proposition would occur only to those unacquainted with what prevails in the great centres of learning in the West, the statements are excellent illustrations of the art of *suppressio veri* and *suggestio falsi*. Half truths are more dangerous than whole lies. I will now give a few illustrations. It is stated that the number of Pali students is 8 and the number of lecturers 16; but this statement is false. For these very teachers are also teachers for the undergraduate classes in addition to the Post-graduate classes; and the number of students who go to the University from various institutions, such as the St. Xavier's College and other colleges to get instruction in Pali is 200.

Then, as regards Arabic and Persian. It is, Sir, within your knowledge what difficulty was felt by the Muhammadan students for studying Arabic; and you tried in your own way to solve the difficulty. After that, the undergraduate classes were opened at the University and seven lecturers were appointed. These lecturers teach students in the undergraduate classes in addition to lecturing to Post-graduate students. The number of students taught by them is not 20 but over a hundred. As regards their salaries I may mention that men of eminence and established reputation like Aga Muhammad Kazim Shirazi and Maulana Abu Musa whose works on Persian and Arabic language and literature have been highly spoken of by distinguished German Orientalists draw the lordly salary of Rs. 100 each. If the principle enunciated by Mr. Sarkar is adopted, if this new Theory of Numbers is accepted, then no subject should be taught in which there are not many students, and Arabic and Persian must be abolished at once. Muhammadans are backward in education—only a few go up for the B.A.—fewer still for the M.A. According to Mr. Sarkar and Company then there should be no arrangement for teaching Arabic and Persian to the Muhammadans in the premier University in India, if not in the East. According to the same Theory of Numbers Arabic and Persian should be abolished from the Universities of Oxford, Cambridge and London. Then as to Mr. Sarkar's charge that no provision has been made by the University for Science let me tell the House that it is at once misleading and baseless——

Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: I did not say no provision was made.

Dr. A. SUHRAWARDY: All right, then you say no adequate provision. The University has contributed no less than Rs. 9 lakhs towards the University College of Science which is about 60 per cent. of the total expenditure for its upkeep. Then there is another illustration of the misstatement made, not by Mr. Sarkar but by his friend

Mr. Surendra Nath—I beg his pardon—*Babu* Surendra Nath Mullick. He said that a Professor of Muhammadan Law was appointed at the University Law College and as no student was forthcoming the University Lecturer was made to attend the lectures of the Professor of Muhammadan Law. The statement is wholly misleading. I will presently give you the real facts of the case and leave the House to judge how far the real state of things bear out the truth of the statement made by Babu Surendra Nath Mullick. Three years ago a student applied for taking up the M. L. degree and Muhammadan Law was one of the subjects in that degree. But in the University there was no provision for Muhammadan Law, although provision was made for Hindu Law—one of the subjects for the degree of Master of Law. If I am not mistaken the late lamented Babu Golap Chandra Shastri, the father of Mr Nrishingha Chandra Sarkar, was the Professor of Hindu Law of the University of Calcutta, who, by the way, would have been excluded by the terms of the resolution of his worthy son from the proposed committee had he been a member of the Legislative Council No provision was made for Muhammadan Law and as no student came forward for the M L. degree, the University of Calcutta had a sort of excuse for not having a Professor of Muhammadan Law. Three years ago a student came forward to take up the subject and the matter came up before the Governing Body of the Law College which appointed a Professor of Muhammadan Law, whose qualifications and attainments for teaching the subject I challenge Mr. Mullick to question, on the magnificent salary of Rs 100 a month. This matter drew the attention of Mr. Justice Greaves who was a member of the Governing Body at the time and it was at his instance later on that the original salary was raised to Rs 200 which was the salary of the Professor of Hindu Law. The appointment lasted only for one session as the student gave up the subject I repeat the challenge of Mr. Mullick and challenge contradiction. It is perfectly true that the student who applied to take up Muhammadan Law as one of his subjects for the degree of Master of Law happened to be a University Lecturer. This comes as a great surprise to Mr. Mullick. A little knowledge is a dangerous thing. Every student of any University in the West knows that there is nothing peculiar or strange in this. I have in my possession a *souvenir* from one of the most distinguished German Orientalists of his day who did me the honour of describing me as "his pupil and master." There is nothing strange in the master in one subject being the pupil in another.

The PRESIDENT: Your time is up.

Dr. A. SUHRAWARDY: I already apprehended that. May I have five minutes more?

The PRESIDENT: You may have two minutes.

Dr. A. SUHRAWARDY: Thank you, Sir. Though pressed for time how can I forget the utterances of Mr. Suhrawardy (Junior)? He says that he bears no grudge to the University, nor is he influenced by any feeling of resentment. He reminds me of the well-known French proverb which every educated gentleman knows and which I need not repeat here. He weeps over the affairs of the University, not crocodile but genuine tears, and wants to restore its lost and departed glory. I am glad his laughing days are over and his weeping days have come. I am glad of the dawn of his sense of responsibility, but the House should know that the attainment of his political majority dates from the 17th of May, 1921, when in an ill-fated moment the Governing Body of the Law College failed to reappoint him as a lecturer.

Professor S. C. MUKHERJI: I rise to oppose resolutions Nos. 1 and 4 on the ground that no case has been made out and therefore the appointment of a committee is not necessary. What is the drift of these resolutions? A closer scrutiny of both the resolutions reveals that they are driving at the appointment of a second commission to look into the affairs of the Calcutta University. That great commission—the Sadler Commission—has done its work; great educational experts have gone into the matter in minute details. Mr. Sarkar's resolution contains the expression "to inquire into and report on the general working of the University." This is exactly what the Sadler Commission has done. His resolution speaks of "recommending urgent measures or reforms;" that is exactly what the Commission has done. His resolution goes on to say "with a view to determine what financial assistance, if any, should be given to the Calcutta University." Well, that is exactly what the Commission has done I wonder whether the mover of resolution No. 1 ever took the trouble of going through the five volumes of the Report of the Sadler Commission and studying it in detail. It would have revealed to him the labours of mighty minds—men who may be regarded as the greatest educational experts that any university can think of appointing. What is this Council going to do? Is it going to set aside the detailed recommendations, both general and financial, and appoint a fresh commission to look into the affairs of the Calcutta University? What do these resolutions demand? A committee—a committee of inquiry? On what grounds? So far as I have been able to follow the speeches which were delivered yesterday afternoon, I find that four reasons have been given. I speak subject to correction. The first ground is the multiplicity of subjects and multiplicity of professors and lecturers in the Post-graduate Department and the paucity of students. What is the second ground? Irregularity of procedure in the matter of the budget. The third ground is—insufficiency of information supplied or refusal on the part of the University to supply information. The fourth ground is based on vague suspicions, indefinite surmises, based on reckless and irresponsible

criticisms made by irresponsible people in an irresponsible press. ("Hear, hear.")

As regards the first ground—detailed information has already been supplied in answer to this Council questions Nos. 306 and 114. Question No. 306 was asked by Babu Hem Chander Nasker and No. 114 by Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur. In the Syndicate proceedings of 1st July of this year I find 40 pages of closely printed matter supplied to this Council and detailed information has been placed before this Council regarding subjects, regarding curriculum, regarding professors, regarding lecturers and their salaries, regarding the number of students, regarding everything. Surely a fresh committee cannot elicit any further information on the subject. This Council, if it feels competent enough, can certainly pass its verdict as to whether so many subjects ought to be taught, whether so many professors and lecturers ought to be kept, whether so much money ought to be spent. It is certainly a matter for educational experts to pass its judgment, but if this Council wish to play the rôle of educational experts it can certainly indulge in that luxury, there is nothing to prevent it from passing its judgment on that subject. A committee, however, is absolutely unnecessary. As regards the irregularity of procedure in the matter of the budget, I ask if the mover of the first resolution who has touched upon the subject has placed sufficient data before this Council to help it to make up its mind. If he has, then this Council is in a position to pass its judgment. But where is the necessity for a committee, may I ask? What more data do you want? If there has been any irregularity, it is there. If this Council wants to pass its verdict on that irregularity it is perfectly within its powers to do so and let it do it. A committee is not necessary. The third ground is—insufficiency of information supplied or refusal to supply information. This is true and not true. The University of Calcutta is a statutory body composed of one hundred Fellows of whom 80 are nominated by the Government. They are at least regarded as men of honesty, integrity, probity and character. If there is any insinuation which may be construed as a reflection on the character of such a body, that body is bound to resent it. I would have resented it if I were a Fellow of the Calcutta University, but it is not true. It is not true that the University is not prepared to supply information. The Hon'ble Minister of Education has already paid three visits, if not more, and he has been received most cordially by the Hon'ble the Vice-Chancellor of the Calcutta University. The Vice-Chancellor is prepared to give him every bit of information and to place before him every scrap of paper. Nothing would be kept back from him. The Hon'ble the Minister of Education will be given every opportunity and facility to go into matters in minute details and he will be able to get whatever information he wants. Our popular Minister is an eminent lawyer—a man who is known for his astuteness, for his acuteness, for his

sobriety of judgment. Let the Minister go and find out the facts. Let him be satisfied whether the University—whether the Senate of the Calcutta University—is engaged in any shady transaction, is doing anything nefarious in the dark which will not stand the full glare of the day. The fourth ground is—mal-administration of Trust Funds in the University. This is a grave charge—a very serious allegation against the Senate of the Calcutta University at the head of which I see the name of His Excellency the Governor as the Chancellor of the University. I see there the name of the Lord Bishop of Calcutta, the Metropolitan of India. I see there the name of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler.

The PRESIDENT: Your time is up.

Professor S. C. MUKHERJI: If you would give me another minute, Sir. I find there the name of the Hon'ble the President of the Bengal Legislative Council as a member of that august body. The Senate is ultimately responsible for the administration of its funds. As I have been given a time-limit of one minute within which to finish my speech, my last word is that if there has been any mal-administration, your Committee will not be able to do anything—your remedy is over there in the law Court.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: In supporting this resolution of Babu Rishindra Nath Sarkar, I must frankly confess my feelings which have led me to do so. Being an Allahabad University man, I had never concerned myself with the doings of the Calcutta University, piously hoping all along, that all must be right, because its affairs were in the very ablest hands. But I received the surprise of my life, when I came to know that the University authorities had refused to supply informations to our Education Minister when requested to do so. They have in so many words insulted our Minister. This is cordial reception no doubt as Professor Mukharji says. They have challenged our authority, the authority of the Bengal Legislative Council, to be acquainted with the financial affairs of the University. A public corporation, created by a statute of our own predecessors, for, as regards the University, the Bengal Government has actually stepped into the shoes of the Government of India, a corporation receiving annually financial help from us, and knowing also that by next March it must have to come up to us for a sanction of its demands, that such a body with incomparable petulance can flout our Minister and deny our authority is inconceivable to me. Had it been an individual and not a corporation, I would have considered him moonstruck, fit only to be lodged in an asylum. But this is a corporation, and the mildest remedy to such perversity that we can apply is an inquiry by a committee.

And the queerest part is that this self-conceit or corporate-conceit, whatever name you may be pleased to give it, Sir, does not end here

in a mere refusal. They get up a meeting of that august body called the Syndicate, and pass a bombastic resolution—"Emphatically repudiates the insinuation, etc." Well, Sir, where was the insinuation? Have they or have they not transferred or dealt in other ways with the fish-market fund, any dealing of which was expressly forbidden without the previous sanction of the Government? The answer was a simple one. Yes or no. There was no insinuation, unless it be that the guilty mind is ever suspicious. But what does the Syndicate do? It does not answer! It "emphatically repudiates!"

During the last Budget discussion, Professor S. C. Mukharji was championing the cause of the University. He told us a mournful tale of how the University was starved by us, and to what destitution it was brought. He had almost moved us to tears and a grant, if that were possible. Also to-day the responsible professor has waxed eloquent on the excellent administration of this University. I do not know whether he holds any special brief from the University to shower abuses on the critics of his protegé. When arguments fail have recourse to abuse, is a common adage. Is this the way to inspire confidence? Refusal to answer a question raises the strongest presumption against a man almost enough to mark him down as guilty. Apart from all other questions, as to what is being done in the post-graduate studies, as to what are the motives inspiring these large number of passes, as to whether there are all professors and no students in certain subjects of study, as to whether the University has transformed itself into a money-lending firm—this striking fact of "emphatic repudiation," burking all questions and inquiries, cannot fail to convince an unbiased mind, that something is rotten in that state of College Square, needing an urgent inquiry, led by golden wishes and not merely to pry and peer into its reserve.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: There is one aspect of the case that I would like to bring before the Council. I do not think we are competent to go into the details of what is right and what is wrong. In April last we passed a resolution that a Board for secondary education should be established as early as possible. That question has not been finally settled as yet. If the Board is to be formed and the fees of secondary education are taken out from the University, what would be the position of the University so far as the finance is concerned? That is a very important question which should be considered before you allow the Board to take out the fees from the University. This resolution is a necessary corollary to the resolution which we have already passed. There ought to be a committee to inquire into the state of the University. It is now under the control of the Bengal Government which, I think, has the power to examine its inner working especially in view of the fact that it has got to render financial help to the University. The University cannot deny the right of the Government for

an inquiry. Of course if they do not require any financial assistance from the Government then the matter becomes quite different, but so long as they take financial help they must allow the Government to inquire into their working.

Professor S. C. Mukharji thinks that the information supplied to Government was sufficient. I do not think so. The Calcutta University Commission's report contains recommendations on expert opinions, but we heard yesterday from Government that nothing could be done because of the financial difficulty. So I think it is a matter which cannot be decided upon some information we shall have to inquire into the financial possibilities. We must cut our coat accordingly to our cloth. So I have great pleasure in supporting Mr. Sarkar's resolution.

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: The Legislative Council is a body which legislates upon provincial matters and I think that so long as the University Act which was passed by the Imperial Government is not repealed or amended this Legislative body has no right to go against it. I submit that the Calcutta University has been doing its work splendidly. The Vice-Chancellor has been devoting his energy and time for years past towards the improvement of the University and this is his remuneration at the hands of the new Reforms Council. He deserves a far better treatment at our hands. The University does not get a very liberal grant from the Government of India or from the Provincial Government; and for its inner working in order to make two ends meet it has to struggle hard. It was said yesterday that some amounts have been spent long before it was sanctioned but that is a thing which is done by everybody to save himself from a temporary financial difficulty. That is the explanation which I think the Council ought to take into consideration. It must be remembered that in England, Oxford and Cambridge Universities in addition to endowments are helped by Government liberally, but here in Calcutta the position is not the same. The endowments which the University possesses were due solely to the efforts of the Vice-Chancellor who persuaded Sir Taraknath Palit and Sir Rash Behary Ghose to place lakhs of rupees at the hands of the University. I submit that these funds are spent not for personal gain of the Vice-Chancellor but to meet the expenses of the University. As regards the supply of the information, I submit that Professor Mukharji has given you chapter and verse that the University has not withheld information that was asked for. [MR. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: "Question!"] The working of the University is controlled by the Fellows composed of the élite of culture. They are men of high education and we cannot presume that they do not look after the affairs of the University but sleep soundly. I submit that in point of learning they are superior to the members of this Council and therefore my submission is that this Council can place its reliance implicitly upon that body of Fellows and Syndics who have been

selected and nominated by Government for their character and integrity. Unless and until that body of men want to take action in the matter I do not think the Council can do it, especially so long as the University Act is in force.

Babu NITYA DHONE MUKHERJEE: Enough has been said both for and against the present working of the University. I will only point out one fact which has not been raised. We have heard the mover of the resolution, who read out a speech which was nothing but the summary of what has been appearing in the newspapers for the last three months. I also heard what Babu Surendra Nath Mullick had said. He was pleased to say that if the proposed Committee found that the affairs of the University were being conducted fairly, he would be only too glad to request, nay beseech, the Hon'ble Minister for Education to pay them more money. I hope the University authorities will be grateful to him for this, but the question would then arise whether the Government have enough money to give to the University. Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray has taken Professor Mukherji to task, alleging that Mr. Mukherji used strong languages which were abuses, and in return the Kumar used expressions which were stronger than those of Mr. Mukherji and much more abusive.

Enough has been said but one point has been left out. The University has been working long before we were born, and up till now this question of mal-administration has not been raised, and what is the reason of this sudden revelation? The reason why the University authorities are being taken to task now, is that the Hon'ble the Vice-Chancellor in his various capacities has of late disappointed certain gentlemen, and worked against the personal interests of particular individuals and a class of individuals. This is an open secret now. My statement will be supported by the various correspondence published in the newspapers. The recent party faction in the University and the Paper-Book question of the High Court are responsible for all these imaginary troubles. If any one looks at the Visitors' Gallery, he will be convinced that it is nothing but a Bar Library of the High Court.

Mr. D. C. GHOSE: Is the member entitled to refer to the Visitors' Gallery?

The PRESIDENT: He would not be in order in doing that. I did not hear him very distinctly. I thought he only referred to the Bar Library. Please go on, Mr. Mukherjee.

Babu NITYA DHONE MUKHERJEE: This thing has been made a party affair. Those who are concerned in this affair are personally interested. They have been disappointed in something or other, and

I do not think that this Council should allow itself to be made a party to this. I do not understand why this Council should help one party and not the other. I submit that this Council should be above any party faction.

Maulvi A. K. FAZL-UL HAQ: I rise to support the resolution of my friend, Babu Rishindra Nath Sarkar. I am extremely sorry that the last speaker thought it proper to refer to disappointments of certain sections of the public as being the only reason which in his opinion could have induced my friend to bring forward this resolution for consideration by this Council. It is absolutely nothing of the kind. So far as I am aware, there is a persistent and a genuine demand that there should be a sitting inquiry into how finances are kept not merely of the Calcutta University but of many public bodies. That is only a sign of the times and the reason is that while people sincerely subscribe, those who are charged with the administration of funds have a tendency of being insincere and extravagant. I submit that instead of opposing an inquiry, if our hands are clean, we should seek an opportunity of placing our cards before the public. My friend Maulvi Yakuinuddin Ahmed, has said that the Hon'ble the Vice-Chancellor commands a personality which ought to be sufficient for all of us not to demand an inquiry. Now it is those gentlemen who have opposed the resolution who have dragged personalities into this question. Those of us who want an inquiry never intended to cast aspersions on anybody. All that we said is that there should be an inquiry. My friend forgets that when people subscribe they subscribe because their feelings are overshadowed by the personalities of great men, but, unfortunately, it is also found that there are occasions on which great men whom people have trusted have not shown themselves worthy of the trust. I submit that the Calcutta University should place its accounts fully and freely before the committee and not follow the example of many a public body which collects in public but keeps its accounts in secret. The Calcutta University must not follow that example.

With these few words, I strongly support the resolution of my friend.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: It seems a great pity that on a modest resolution like this, so much heat, excitement and unfortunately blustering have been introduced. I strongly repudiate the idea suggested by my friend Babu Nitya Dhone Mukherjee that this inquiry—this asking for a committee has been engineered by party factions. I have nothing to do with University matters and I do not know of any party factions. I have nothing to do with University matters and I do not know of any party factions. As a matter of fact, I never intended to speak on this resolution, but things were said in this Council yesterday and repeated to-day which show that an inquiry is urgently needed. I am surprised

that my friend Professor S. C. Mukherji—a very modest Professor—who, I think, does not know anything about law or cares anything about law. [A voice: "He is a lawyer himself."] May be, but he is now a professor. He has thrown the gauntlet down and challenged the Council to go to the law court and to find what the affairs of this University are like. This is a most curious challenge to throw into the face of an assembly like this. Does the Professor seriously think that the law courts would be a better tribunal than the Committee suggested by Mr. Sarkar? Then, Sir, I cannot congratulate Maulvi Yakuinuddin Ahmed in his self-condemnation and denunciation in saying that this Council is worse than the Syndicate or the Senate. It is a matter of personal opinion. If he thinks he would rather serve in the Syndicate, it is his lookout. It is not a question whether this Council is worse than the Syndicate—it is a question of who supplies the finance. This Council, I believe, is the Controller of the finance of Bengal, and I hope I am not much mistaken, if I say that in the next budget year, the Calcutta University will have to come to this Council to get funds for the administration of the University. Is it, then, any wonder, if we simple people, though we may not be so august a body as the Senate or the Syndicate, who have the misfortune or the good fortune to pay the piper, like to call the tune and want to see how our money is going to be spent—whether it is going to be spent to the fullest advantage and to the best interests of the country? Is it any crime, is it a matter for going to the law courts? I am surprised to hear Dr. A. Suhrawardy that Government have no power to look into the internal administration of the University. But as far as I have been able to find out, I think the Bengal Government have enough power to look into the affairs of a University, which depends on this Council for some of its funds. Only the other day, in a meeting of the Senate or Syndicate, a sorry spectacle was seen, when one gentlemen had the courage to speak out his mind, he was taunted by some members that he was taking shelter within the four corners of the law; and to-day, I see a member of this Council, who is also a member of the Senate and Syndicate, wishes to take shelter within the four walls of the law. Is this fair, is this proper? This Calcutta University is the training ground—the nursery—of the best brains of Bengal. Is it not natural that the educated people of Bengal should take it to their hearts and be zealous of the fair name and reputation of the University. Professor Mukherji has said that there has been a lot of criticism in some of the irresponsible press. I challenge Professor Mukherji to say if the monthly reviews, like the *Modern Review* or the *Probashi*, are part of the irresponsible press of the country. These reviews command confidence and respect of the people not only of Bengal but of the whole of India—nay outside India—for their honest and fearless criticism. It would have been better for Professor Mukherji not to have recourse to abuse in this Council and say that these critics are irresponsible, but to come out and say clearly that he was ready to meet their arguments with facts

and figures. Professor Mukherji has said that 40 voluminous pages of information were given to us. Sir, even for these 40 pages of information, we had to go to the University through this Council. The University did not supply this information of its own accord, even when persistent criticism was going on all over the country. I cannot understand why this learned body should be afraid of public criticism. In these days of responsible Government, public criticism is the only criterion of good management of any body. Professor Mukherji has said that His Excellency the Governor is the Chancellor of the University and that you, Sir, are a Member of the Syndicate.

Professor S. C. MUKHERJI: The President is a member of the Senate and not of the Syndicate.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: He has said that when these august personages are members of this august body, how dare we criticise the finances of this body? Sir, I believe His Excellency is the head of this Government and of the province. I believe there are august personages in the Executive Council and in the Cabinet, and yet during the budget time, I do not think Professor Mukherji was less vigorous in his criticisms of the financial policy of Government than any of us? Was it any reflection to criticise and give vent to the views of the people? Here we are not casting any reflection on anybody. We say we are going to pay money and we want to see how it is going to be spent. Much has been said yesterday about the Science College. I know that the present tendency of the country is for technical and technological education. There is the Science College, founded by the gifts of two gentlemen whose names are an honour and glory to Bengal. What has this institution been able to do? It is not that there are no professors. There are professors—the very ablest that could be got. It is not that there are not sufficient students. There are students who are anxious to take up the industrial development of the country. How is it that no result has as yet been achieved? I find that there are two clauses, which I wish to mention here, in the Sir Taraknath Palit trust deed. One is—

> In the event of the said entire income being found insufficient for the purpose, the said University should make such a recurring grant or contribution as will supplement such deficiency.

The other is—

> That in connection with the said two chairs, the said University shall from its own funds provide suitable lecture room, libraries, museums, laboratories, workshop and other facilities for teaching and research

Sir, I ask Professor Mukherji—has the University fully given effect to these clauses of the trust deed? I believe it is a fact that in the Science College for want of a suitable workshop, no real practical work can be done. I believe it is a fact that for want of very little

money, model factories cannot be started in that College; and yet, these are the crying needs of to-day. What does it matter to us if we are told that so many lakhs are spent on post-graduate teaching? Of course, post-graduate teaching is a good thing, but my contention is this, that the need of Bengal, at the present moment, is not so much for post-graduate arts teaching as for technical and technological education. If the University comes forward with schemes for technical and technological education, this Council, I believe, will not be miserly but will be ready to pay as much as it can. That is the reason why I want a committee. There is no harm in that. The committee will be the best jury in the world and will be better than the law court to which Professor Mukherji has referred us. The University ought to welcome this suggestion.

Then, Sir, much has been said about the importance of the report of the Sadler Commission. Nobody wants to minimise the value of their opinion. The Sadler Committee's recommendations will be given effect to. The Vice-Chancellor is anxious to give effect to them; so is everybody. There is no question about that. But we want to know something about simple matters. We want to know whether the funds of the University are utilised to the best advantage. This is a very simple inquiry. Professor Mukherji need not have grown so eloquent over the Sadler Commission. It is no use trying to confuse little matters with big bombastic talk.

With these words, I beg to support the resolution of Babu Rishindra Nath Sarkar.

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: I regret very much the tone which the present debate has assumed. It is not worthy of the House, nor worthy of the subject. A more sober tone and a calm consideration are expected from the legislators of Bengal.

No human institutions are perfect, no human measures are altogether beyond reproach. The Calcutta University certainly belongs to the category of a human institution, and as such it was, it is, and it will ever be subject to limitations and defects. I do not for a moment say that the criticisms, some of which very pungent no doubt, that have been levelled against it, are altogether unmerited. It was because that the Reforms were loudly called for, defects had to be removed and improvements to be effected that Lord Chelmsford, in his wisdom, constituted the University Commission at enormous public expense. Savants and university administrators from far and near were on the Commission. They, after infinite toil and trouble scouring the whole continent of India examining a large number of witnesses, seeing educational institutions of the country for themselves, brought out a voluminous report embodying recommendations for remodelling the University on new lines. These reports are by this time moth-eaten and dusty. What have we done with regard to those recommendations?

We are confronted with a huge deficit in our budget. For want of funds, our popular Minister for Education has not yet dared recast the University Act. He is not prepared to face the music. The cries for vocational education, free and compulsory primary education, technical education and so forth, are insistent and persistent. What can he do? We have to turn to the very clever, genial and obliging Finance Member for the redress of our numerous grievances. But he too is a man and no magician, who can turn stones into gold coins. Let us wait and see how he deals with his colleagues in giving them the sinews of war; then and then only, shall we be in a position to judge of the valour, tact and strategy of our Captains of Education, Industries, Health and so forth. Let us wait and watch. Formation of committees is no remedy. It may bring solace to the souls of impatient idealists. Let us be practical men. Instead of promoting strife—instead of showing unnecessary fight engendering bad blood—let us bide our time. If you want to see our University constituted on more democratic lines, let us seize the occasion, when the Act comes up for remodelling and amendment. The time for that, to my mind is not yet. Then comes the legal question. A committee appointed by this House, may maintain only a tug-of-war with the University and the result will be a "draw." Public criticisms will no doubt have their sobering effect upon the University. To my mind, the Post-graduate Department is the crown and glory of the University. It is the only feature which makes the University, a University—a real institution for the advancement of learning. But I must conclude by saying that the graduate and undergraduate teaching is not up to the mark, as noticed by the University Commission.

With these words, I beg to oppose the resolution of Babu Rishindra Nath Sarkar.

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter): Before I enter into the various questions debated to-day, I desire to make one or two observations of a preliminary nature. The first observation that I desire to make is this. I found that some of the speakers referred to the conduct of His Excellency the Governor. Perhaps they did so in ignorance of the spirit of the rules of this House. Rule 14, clause (*ii*), lays down that a member while speaking must not reflect upon the conduct of His Majesty the King or the Governor-General or any Governor or any court of justice. However, I hope and trust that in future, members of this House will remember the spirit of this rule. Another observation of a preliminary nature——

The PRESIDENT: Would you let me know what reflections you refer to?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: One reflection was that His Excellency was the Chancellor of the University and, as Chancellor, by implication he was responsible. However, I am not rising to a point of order, Sir.

The PRESIDENT: I thought you were referring to a point of order.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: No, it was not a point of order. If it were a point of order, I would have drawn your attention to it at the time. My point is that these references should be avoided as far as possible, for they tend to bring questions of conduct into discussion.

In this connection I desire to mention that although in yesterday's debate a high tone was maintained and no specific reference to personalities made but unfortunately in to-day's debate, on both sides, there were specific references to personalities. This House should remember its own dignity and this House ought to remember that reference to personalities should wherever possible be avoided. There was some reference made to me about a certain matter with which I do not propose to deal, as I think that it is best to avoid personalities and personal explanations as much as possible. Along with these preliminary remarks I desire to make another observation. I say, let there be more of light and less of heat when you discuss important questions like these. The members of this House—those who spoke as critics of the Calcutta University and those who spoke as supporters of the Calcutta University—should remember that the object of this House and the object of the Calcutta University is the same, at any rate ought to be the same. I have not the slightest doubt that the better mind of this House and the better mind of that great body, the Calcutta University, are united in the common purpose of improving higher education in this country. Should this House or should that great body start a futile quarrel? Let both these bodies remember that if there be a conflict between this House and that great body, the result will be disastrous to the educational interests of the country. Those responsible for this conflict will be doing a bad turn indeed to the Calcutta University as well as to the youth of the country.

With these observations I would say a few more words with regard to this resolution, and, in doing so, I desire to bring forward to the notice of this House some important considerations, and those considerations, I trust, will convince this House that it will not be right to accept this resolution—at any rate not at this stage. The mover and his supporters have criticised the present administration of the University in general as well as on financial grounds, and perhaps their criticisms have on certain points been somewhat severe. I do not propose at this stage to deal with the criticisms. Indeed I feel it somewhat difficult to deal with detailed criticisms because I have not yet had an opportunity of hearing the other side of the story from the constituted authorities of the Calcutta University. I do not therefore propose to answer these criticisms as to details. But I feel that it will not be right for Government to accept a resolution like his without at any rate giving the Calcutta University a full and fair opportunity of placing their views before the Government. I appreciate that in this House to-day I had

the pleasure of hearing the views of some of my friends who spoke against the resolution and I also had the pleasure yesterday of hearing the member for the Calcutta University, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder Ghose, but I think that in a matter like this we ought to have the considered views of the constituted body itself. The members of this House should remember that the Calcutta University is a responsible statutory body with great traditions and with a proud record of great and good work behind it. It is never right to condemn anyone unheard. It will be a grievous wrong, indeed, if we were to condemn a body like the Calcutta University without giving that body even an opportunity to explain what it may perhaps very legitimately and properly explain. I have used the word "condemn" because it strikes me that the appointment of a committee may be taken by some to represent a censorious attitude. It may be said, "Why did not Government take steps to get the views of the Calcutta University with regard to these resolutions?" I think it right to offer a word of explanation with regard to this point. So far as the short notice allowed, my department communicated the resolutions to a responsible authority of the Calcutta University, but I was told that that University, before expressing its views finally on important questions like these, wanted to consult its Senate or Syndicate as the case may be. They had no opportunity yet, I understand, to do this. Further it must be remembered that we could at this stage only communicate the resolutions and, obviously, there was no opportunity to communicate the detailed criticisms which were brought before this House during this debate. I propose to send a copy of to-day's and yesterday's discussions to the Calcutta University. As soon as the Legislative Department can place me in possession of these proceedings, I will take an early opportunity to request the Calcutta University to place their views before Government with regard to the criticisms and the resolutions. I would, therefore, urge upon this House, apart from other reasons, for this reason alone that we ought not to pass these resolutions in a hurry. There is another important consideration which I will earnestly place before this House. The Council should remember that success of higher education in this province would depend largely upon co-operation, frank, honest, and hearty co-operation between this Council and the Calcutta University. A conflict between this House and the Calcutta University will mean a great blow to the cause of higher education in this province. Any hasty action on the part of this House may bring it into conflict with that body and to-day's speeches fill me with the apprehension that unless we are generous, such a conflict will surely take place. In a matter like this, I again repeat that it would be best both for this House and the Calcutta University to be actuated by one motive and one motive alone, namely, public good. I trust the future will prove that both these bodies, this House and the Calcutta University, will show that they are actuated by that motive alone. At any rate I would give that chance to both these bodies. It

is dangerous to prophesy and I will not prophesy, but I hope that the future will prove that both these responsible bodies are worthy of the great responsibilities imposed upon them. Therefore I appeal to this House and to the Calcutta University to rise superior to petty personal animosities and to be actuated solely by the dictates of public good. Let not the unfortunate and long suffering student community suffer more by an *impasse* brought about by personal prejudice and personal differences and, may I add, perchance by honest differences of opinion on both sides. I would now make a special appeal to this House. Let not this House forget its dignity and responsibility, but let it give a lead to others about their sense of dignity and responsibility. This House is charged with the power of the purse. This House is also charged with the power of legislation. To my mind on these powers to a very great extent the usefulness, the dignity and the constitution of the Calcutta University depend. The larger the power, the higher ought to be the sense of responsibility. If a conflict unfortunately arises in the future, I hope that this conflict will never arise. I hope and trust that this Council being charged with higher responsibilities will show greater forbearance, greater toleration, greater moderation and more of self-restraint. After I have made this special appeal to this House, I think that I shall be justified in making a special appeal to the Calcutta University as well. I would again remind the Calcutta University of its great and good work and its honourable traditions. I would ask that body to bear in mind those traditions in dealing with questions like these. I remind that body that corporate bodies who have to deal with public affairs in any shape or form or, for the matter of that, even individuals who have to deal with such affairs should never be impatient of criticism even where the motives and object of their critics may not be according to their own opinions above question. Although I must frankly state that most of the critics in this House at any rate yesterday refrained from personal criticisms yet, even if there were personal criticisms, great bodies like this House or the great Calcutta University ought not to be swayed by such criticisms. I would venture to remind the Calcutta University that corporate bodies who have to deal with public funds must always be prepared to place their accounts and financial dealings before the public irrespective of narrow interpretations of law. Some criticism has been made by the critics of the Calcutta University both inside this House and outside that certain financial transactions of the Calcutta University require explanation. As I have yet had no opportunity of hearing both sides of the question, I do not propose to pass any opinion on the subject to-day. I trust however that the Calcutta University will appreciate that, as a public body dealing with public funds existing as it does for the good of the public, it is its clear duty to silence its critics by full disclosures of its accounts and its financial dealings. Speaking for myself and weighing every word I say, I have every confidence that the Calcutta University will take

an early opportunity to publish its accounts and financial dealings. I have every confidence that, when such publications are placed before the public, it will enable the University to effectually silence its uncharitable critics. One word more and I have done. I would appeal to the movers of these resolutions to withdraw their resolutions for the present with a view to enable the Government to get necessary facts from the Calcutta University. After all, the matter will always lie with them. It will be against the good of the public, it will be against the interests of the student community to fight these resolutions to a finish. I would therefore earnestly appeal to the movers of these resolutions to withdraw them, but if they do not listen to my advice, I must oppose them because it is against public interest that these resolutions should be passed.

Mr. D. C. GHOSE: I beg to move that the question be now put.

The PRESIDENT: I would like to know whether the movers of the resolutions are inclined to withdraw them.

Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: I am not going to withdraw.

Babu Rishindra Nath Sarkar's motion being put to the vote, a division was taken with the following result:—

AYES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.
Ahmed, Maulvi Emaduddin.
Ahmed, Mr. M.
Ahmed, Maulvi Rafi Uddin.
Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.
Ali, Maulvi A. H. M. Wazir.
Ali, Munshi Amir.
Ali, Munshi Ayub.
Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar.
Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mohamed.
Barma, Rai Sahib Panchanan.
Basu, Babu Jatindra Nath.
Bhattacharji, Babu Hem Chandra.
Charmakar, Babu Rasik Chandra.
Chaudhuri, Babu Kishori Mohan.
Chaudhuri, Babu Tankanath.
Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Hafizar Rahman.
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad
Das, Babu Bhishmadev.
De, Babu Fanindralal.
Dutt, Rai Bahadur Dr. Haridhan.
Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan.
Faroqui, K. C. M.
Chatak, Rai Sahib Nilmani.
Haq, Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul.
Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul.
Huq, Maulvi Ekramul.
Hussain, Maulvi Mahammed Madassur.
Karim, Maulvi Abdul.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlal.
Khan, Babu Devendra Lal.
Khan, Maulvi Hamid-ud-din.
Khan Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Muhammad Ershad Ali.
Law, Raja Reshee Case.
Makramali, Munshi.
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra.
Moitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath.
Mukhopadhaya, Babu sarat Chandra.
Mullick, Babu Nirode Behary.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Nasker, Babu Hem Chandra.
Pahlowan, Maulvi Md. Abdul Jubbar.
Raikat, Mr. Prasanna Deb.
Rauf, Maulvi Shah Abdur.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar.
Ray, Rai Bahadur Upendra Lal.
Roy, Babu Jogendra Krishna.
Roy, Babu Jogendra Nath.
Roy, Babu Nalini Nath.
Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra.
Sarkar, Babu Jogesh Chandra.
Sarkar, Babu Rishindra Nath.
Sinha, Babu Surendra Narayan.
Suhrawardy, Mr. Huseyn Shaheed.

NOES.

Afzal, Nawabzada K. M. Khan Bahadur.
Ahmed, Maulvi Yakuinuddin.
Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath.
Banerjee, Rai Bahadur Abinash Chandra.
Biss, Mr. E. E.
Bompas, Mr C. H.

Bose, Mr. S. M.
Cathcart, Mr. M.
Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath.
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Das, Rai Bahadur Amar Nath.
Donald, Mr. J.
Doss, Rai Bahadur Pyari Lal.
French, Mr. F. C.
Ghose, Mr. D C.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin.
Khan, Mr. Razaur Rahman.
Lang, Mr. J.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble
Marr, Mr. A.
McKenzie, Mr. D. P.
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhone.
Mukherji, Professor S. C.
Nakey, Mirza Muhammad Ali.
O'Kinealy Lt.-Col. Frederick.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.
Pal, Rai Bahadur Radha Charan.
Payne, Mr. C. F.
Ray Chaudhuri, Babu Brojendra Kishor.
Ray Chaudhuri, Mr. Krishna Chandra.
Ray Choudhury, Raja Manmatha Nath.
Roy, Mr. J. E.
Roy, Mr. Tarit Bhusan.
Roy, Raja Maniloll Singh.
Stark, Mr. H. A.
Suhrawardy, Dr. A.
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry.
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

The Ayes being 55 and the Noes 41, the motion was carried.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: I beg leave to withdraw my resolution.

The following resolution was then, by leave of the Council, withdrawn:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that a committee be appointed to inquire into the financial administration of the Calcutta University, particularly of the Post-graduate Department."

The following resolution was also deemed to be withdrawn:—

Babu DEVENDRA LAL KHAN: "This Council recommends to the Government that a non-official committee of experts be formed to inquire into the whole of the finances of the Calcutta University and suggest means for the settlement thereof, after receiving evidence, oral or written, from such public men and associations as are willing to help the committee."

Local Boards.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: "This Council recommends to the Government that local boards be formed in areas smaller than a subdivision."

In every subdivision of Bengal there are local boards which are entrusted with the administration of certain local affairs within their area, but the local boards as they are constituted at present cannot properly discharge their duties, their jurisdiction extending over a large area. If smaller boards could be formed the needs of the people would be better cared for. In section 6 of the Bengal Local Self-Government Act it is laid down that the Lieutenant-Governor may by notification establish a local board in any subdivision or in any one, two or more subdivisions combined; but the Village Self-Government Act of 1919 amends this section in this way:—

The Lieutenant-Governor may by notification establish a local board in any subdivision or part of a subdivision or any one, two or more subdivisions combined

Now, Sir, in places where the Village Self-Government Act has been extended the Government have the power of declaring smaller areas than that of a subdivision to form a local board, but under the Bengal Self-Government Act, the Government have no such power. It is a fact that where union boards have been established the local needs are better looked after than where there are none, so it will be to the interest of the people that local boards should be established in areas where no union boards have been formed.

There is one other point which I wish to mention in this connection. There are many districts in Bengal where it is difficult to get really good men to carry on the work entrusted to union boards, and in those districts if local boards are established for smaller areas than a subdivision the work could be better managed. The local boards can make the union boards join hands in carrying out various works of usefulness, as, for example, sanitation. It may be little too premature on my part to bring forward this resolution, especially as I understand, the Local Self-Government Act is going to be revised soon.

With these remarks, I beg to commend my resolution to the acceptance of the Council.

SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ moved, by way of amendment, "that in motion No. 5 after the word 'subdivision,' the following be added, namely:—

'and not greater than one or two chaukidari circle areas.'"

He spoke in Bengali in support of his motion.

Raja MANILOLL SINGH ROY: I am sorry that I am obliged to oppose this resolution of Babu Tankanath Chaudhuri, inasmuch as I think that there is no necessity for establishing local boards in areas smaller than a subdivision where union boards have already been constituted or are likely to be constituted in the near future, as the union boards are expected to discharge most of the duties previously entrusted to local boards and many more. Hence the local boards will have but very little to do even to justify their existence. Of course the local boards may be so formed in other cases; but I believe there will be no such occasion for this, as union boards are likely to be established soon throughout the province. Moreover, the Government having already modified section 6 of the Local Self-Government Act by inserting the words "or part of a subdivision" after the words "any subdivision" (*vide schedule* I attached to the Village Self-Government Act, 1919), there is no need of the proposed resolution, or the amendment.

Maulvi EMADUDDIN AHMED: I am sorry that I have to oppose this motion which has been moved by Babu Tankanath Chaudhuri. He himself is a chairman of a district board, and I do not know how it has been possible for him to come forward with this resolution. Before forwarding a resolution of this nature, we ought to look at the financial aspect of the question. We are already overburdened with the rates we are

called upon to pay to existing local boards. In addition to those, in every district, union boards have been established and it is an accepted principle that a certain portion of the revenues of district boards should be made over to them, and they have, notwithstanding that, been called upon to hand over a certain portion of the income to these union boards. If we increase the number of local boards, many of my friends, who are members of the district boards, know full well that it will limit the income of the district boards. It has been the policy of Government and a very right policy, to establish union boards all over the province of Bengal. These boards look to the interests of the local areas, and they are in a position to see what reforms are necessary, and what work has to be carried out. Under the circumstances, when union boards already exist, and will be established there is no necessity for local boards. The time will come when we may be able to do away with local boards altogether.

With these few words, I oppose the motion.

Babu JOGENDRA NATH ROY: I have pleasure in according my support to the resolution moved by my friend. At present each subdivision has a local board which supplements the work of the district board. The area of a subdivision is often too big to be properly looked after by a local board. Government officers have the resources of the State at their back and can properly perform the duties that demand inspection. But the local board with the slender resources at its disposal cannot properly discharge the duties entrusted to it. The work of inspection specially is neglected and it is often complained that parts of the subdivision which are near the headquarters receive more attention than the rest. This grievance can only be removed if a local board is created for a smaller area. In that case the grants from the district board would be more equitably distributed and more profitably too. In these days of decentralisation, when people are being encouraged to look after their own affairs and unions are becoming centres for administrative work, it is only proper that areas smaller than a subdivision should have local boards of their own comprising of a group of unions. The adoption of this resolution, moreover, will be a great help to the administration. Commerce and industries will prosper as better roads will be constructed and better arrangements for ferries made. Medical aid will be easily available and educational needs better attended to. It will moreover give the people the opportunity to learn how to manage their own affairs and develop in them a sense of civic responsibility.

Under the circumstance, I hope the Council will recommend to the Government that local boards be formed in areas smaller than a subdivision.

Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: I cannot support the resolution moved by Babu Tankanath Chaudhuri, because I do not find any necessity for establishing separate local boards in areas smaller than a subdivision. Moreover, when it is the policy of the Government to have

union boards gradually established throughout the province under the circle system, we must wait to see how the work of union boards goes on. The mover of the resolution says, in some districts there are no such persons who will be able to manage union boards so I wonder how it will be possible in such districts to have well-managed local boards. Another thing I would like to point out is, that the establishment of separate local boards will certainly increase the recurring expenditure, because every board will have to pay for a sub-overseer and office contingencies. The funds of the local boards, as is well known, are very limited, and there is always clamour for more funds by their Chairmen and of the district boards. Therefore, I say that it is not wise to have local boards in areas smaller than a subdivision.

With these words, I oppose the motion.

Rai ABINASH CHANDRA BANERJEE Bahadur: I rise to oppose both the motion and the amendment. In the first place, I think it is known, and known very widely indeed, that the local boards that exist in the country have not been able to justify their existence as yet. Of course, with all due deference to the local boards, it should be said that perhaps scope was not given to them to show their competence and usefulness. Now that we have had union boards established throughout the length and breadth of the country, the time has come when these local boards should be given further powers to enable them to justify their existence; secondly, to form a greater number of local boards than do exist in the country at this stage, is not very wise; besides, so far as I know, there is no bar existing under the present law against the formation of local boards in areas smaller than a subdivision, if the Government are convinced of the necessity of forming one in that locality. I can quote an example of my own district In Birbhum, at Bolpur, which is not a subdivision, but only a *chauki*, it has already been proposed by the district board, and the proposal has been supported by the District Magistrate and the Divisional Commissioner, that a local board be formed, and, as far as I know, the Government will approve of its formation. Next, as to the question of having a local board for one or two unions, I would say that the idea is absurd. If you have a local board to control the work of one or two unions, what are these union boards meant for? The work suggested to be done by the local boards, in larger areas, is being done by the union boards themselves.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: I rise to oppose the motion as well as the amendment moved by Shah Syed Emdadul Haq. In order to find out whether it is desirable to establish local boards in smaller areas than a subdivision, we have to consider what the functions of a local board are. The local board's activities are confined .to the maintenance of roads that are transferred to it by the district board, and the management of pounds and ferries and payment of grants to schools. On the formation of the union boards, all this work will have to be done

by the union boards. The local board, under the Village Self-Government Act, will be the supervising body; it will have to supervise and act as arbitrator, in the case of works of improvement, if there is a dispute between the union board and the persons asked to effect an improvement; so the local board as constituted will be quite competent to deal with this work. Moreover, we are all aware that we find it very difficult to find competent members for local boards in a subdivision. Now that the number of local boards have been increased, it is more difficult to find suitable members competent to work for the union boards. If these areas are gradually curtailed, difficulties will increase, and it is doubtful whether any real work will be done by the local boards if confined to a smaller area. On the contrary, it will entail expenditure on establishment, and if we have local boards in smaller areas, all the money will go to the maintenance of establishment, and there will be very little left for real work. Where we have union boards, there they will find work for themselves. There are certain works of improvement that are recommended by the district boards to be done by the union boards, and for this work the district boards will have to find funds, and the Chairman of the district board will have to decide which work will be done by the union board and which by the local board.

With these words, I oppose the motion and amendment.

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): I am sorry to say that on behalf of Government, I must oppose both the resolution and the amendment. But, at the same time, I beg leave to observe that I am in sympathy with the scope and object of both these propositions. The underlying idea seems to be that we should curtail the area within which a local board is to be established in order to create the maximum of local interest. I think that is a sound principle: that is the underlying fundamental principle of local self-government; we must awaken local interest in order to stimulate local patriotism. I accept that principle, and if we follow it to its legitimate issue, the obvious conclusion is that we should have union boards in preference to local boards. To my mind—I speak on my own behalf and not on behalf of the Government because it is a matter which has not been considered by the Government as a whole—it seems that these local boards are a useless appendage to the system of local self-government, they are the fifth wheel to the coach, and if on behalf of the Government it is permitted to me to be associated with the amendment of the Local Self-Government Act, it would be my duty to submit for the consideration of the Government and this House, whether it would not be desirable to do away with local boards altogether, and to make the union boards and district boards the sole and entire machinery for the administration of local self-government in the rural areas. As I contemplate the future of local self-government, it seems to me that in the evolution of that great system, the union boards will have a very potential place, and that they will occupy, in relation

to the district boards, the same position which the provincial governments at the present moment occupy in relation to the Central Government, viz., that they will send delegates to the district boards and contribute towards the funds of the district boards, but having their own local institutions, their local town halls, local market places, being self-contained, self-organised, self-sufficient units of a great system. That is my conception of the future of local self-government. But all that is personal.

I would state, on behalf, of the Government, that I oppose both these resolutions. In the first place, you cannot have a local board in an area smaller than a subdivision, unless the Village Self-Government Act has been introduced into that area, and there are union boards. Obviously, therefore, where the Village Self-Government Act is not in operation, this resolution cannot take effect. This is the legal objection, but there are administrative difficulties of a serious character to which my friends over there, and my friends on this side of the House have also referred. If you go on adding to the number of the local boards, you have to add to the clerical establishment, the engineering staff, you must add to the buildings and thus enormously swell the expenditure of these local boards which, as it is, is very small and inadequate. Therefore, you cannot lay down a hard and fast rule as is recommended by my hon'ble friend. If a proposition of this kind is made by any of the district boards Government will consider such a proposition upon the materials placed before it, but I decline, on behalf of the Government, to lay down a hard and fast principle applicable to all districts. On these grounds, I desire to oppose these resolutions, and would ask my friends to withdraw them and they will be at liberty to bring this matter up when the Local Self-Government Act comes up for amendment. I hope my friends will accept the suggestion, and withdraw the resolutions.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: In view of what the Hon'ble Minister in charge has said, I think it will be wise for me to withdraw my resolution for the present.

The resolution was then, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

The following amendment fell through:—

SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ: "That in motion No. 5, after the word 'sub-division' the following be added, namely:—

'and not greater than one or two chaukidari circle areas.' "

Calcutta Electric Supply Corporation.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: "This Council recommends that immediate steps be taken to put a stop to the levying by the Calcutta Electric Supply Corporation of the surcharge of 15 per cent. on their consumers."

In moving this resolution I do not think I shall have to make any very lengthy speech in support of it. This matter was considered by the Corporation of Calcutta on my motion both in the Electricity License Special Committee as well as in the Corporation with the result that it was accepted and a request was made by the Corporation to the Government for getting this surcharge removed.

The Calcutta Electric Supply Corporation began levying this surcharge from January, 1920, on the ground that the cost of production has increased owing to high prices. The question now is whether this claim is justifiable. In this connection it must be remembered that the Electric Supply Corporation is a public utility company enjoying a monoply in their trade. The terms under which they are carrying on their business are also very much advantageous to them. Their business is increasing by leaps and bounds every year so much so that they cannot attend to all the calls made on their service. There is no provision to control the profits which they can make at the expense of the public. Then, again, being a monopoly company, their customers, viz., the public of Calcutta and its surroundings are entirely at their mercy. In this country there is no provision in its Electricity Act for a "sliding scale" as in England—a healthy system of check on extortionate rates by which the dividend would be allowed to be more if the rate for current was less, and if the rate for consumption went up then the dividend would be correspondingly reduced.

In this connection, I would venture to draw the attention of the House to the Government Electrical Adviser Mr. Meares' book *The law relating to Electrical Energy in India* where, at page 87, this system was clearly explained. Mr. Meares has suggested that if the dividend paid by the company was 15 per cent. then the rate for consumption should be 2·5 annas, and if the standard rate went up to 2·8¾ annas the dividend allowable should go down to 10 per cent. The present actual subsisting rate is 3 annas per unit. In view of this, in their committee meeting in the Corporation, the Chairman of the Calcutta Corporation than whom there was none more qualified to express an opinion on the subject, was pleased to observe that this policy of a "sliding scale" should be accepted and that if the dividend was fixed at say 10 per cent. then the standard rate of unit should be fixed at 3 annas, and if the Electric Supply Corporation reduced their charge below 3 annas then the allowable dividend should be correspondingly increased and, he thought, a dividend of 12½ per cent. with a rate of 3 annas per unit would be a reasonable figure. We are now paying 3 annas per unit plus a surcharge of 15 per cent. A distinguished brother Municipal Commissioner of ours, well known for his ability, integrity and outspokenness, who is himself an Engineer and has a very large experience—I mean Mr. Wyness—was also of a similar opinion and thought that there should be a scheme of that character in Calcutta and that the Corporation ought not to be allowed to make any undue profit. The result was the

Committee accepted the view and when the matter came before the full house of the Corporation they accepted the situation *nem.con.* and recommended to the Government, in the Chairman's letter paragraph 8, that this surcharge of 15 per cent. on the ground of increase in working expenses was unjustifiable in view of the dividends which the company have been paying and they strongly recommended that Government should call upon the Electric Supply Corporation to withdraw it forthwith.

That, Sir, is the whole of my present resolution.

There is one other thing that I would beg to place before this House in connection with the alleged justification of the Electric Corporation for summarily levying a 15 per cent. surcharge rate. This justification is merely an excuse and a very lame one too. From the facts that I am going to place before you, you will have no difficulty in finding out that this is merely a counterblast set up by the Company in anticipation of an attempt at cutting down their rate which they knew was overdue and impossible by them to resist any longer on the admitted facts.

In this connection, I would place a few facts before the House. In 1915 the Corporation, at the instance of the general public, took up the question of the very high rates levied by the Electric Supply Corporation and reported to Government recommending a reduction. The Government was pleased to appoint a committee for considering the same and that committee in their report (paragraphs 21 and 22) stated that there was sufficient margin to admit a further reduction in the cost price per unit and that, with the general expansion of business of the Company and consequent increased income, a reduction in the rate could reasonably be looked for at an early date. Owing to abnormal conditions then prevailing the Electric Supply Corporation was spared and no reduction was then insisted upon. This was in 1916. Since then the business of the Company has increased enormously so much so that they cannot meet with the demand on their services now existing. They have been paying high dividends year after year. In 1919 the divided rose to about 20 per cent., 10 per cent. as actual dividend and another 10 per cent. in the value of a bonus share added to every 10 shares, but still in 1920 they contemplated the levying of this surcharge of 15 per cent. and summarily levied it from the 1st of July 1921. This has been done and there can be no doubt about it because with a dividend of 20 per cent. for 1919 and with that Report of 1916 admitting the reasonableness of a demand for reduction of rate per unit at an early date the Company could easily foresee that the Corporation and the public would again make a demand for the necessary reduction and in order to anticipate them the Company levied this 15 per cent. by way of an anticipated counterblast to steal a march over the public. This they did evidently with the idea that if a demand be now again made for reduction of rate, then by a compromise the chances were that this 15 per cent. surcharge would only be taken off and so the old subsisting rate would remain unaltered. I

understand a similar trick is going to be played by another monopoly company of public utility, viz., the Calcutta Tramways Company. They are now seeking, I am told, to raise their fares when it is high time they should reduce them. The Calcutta public must be on their guard against such a trick being repeated if sought to be played by this Company following suit.

This however is the treatment at any rate which the Electric Company has accorded to its customers and this is the commercial honesty displayed by a monopoly company to its customers by keeping the dividend nominally to 10 per cent. and adding another 10 per cent by way of a subterfuge. This again has been done regarding a thing which in Calcutta is no longer a luxury but is a necessity of life Increment of taxation for a necessity of life ought not to be resorted to except as a very last measure but this, the Company sought to do, when they were enjoying a dividend of at least 20 per cent. and when with a much lower dividend the Government committee recommended a reduction at no early date. In 1916, the reduction was not made owing to uncertain and abnormal conditions during the war by way of indulgence and the Company has now taken advantage of that indulgence shown in a way the less said about which the better This is nothing but a glaring instance of the principle that there are many people who mistake kindness for weakness and take advantage of it. And all this is possible because it is a monopoly Company and the consumers are at their mercy. This is the Company again which, only a couple of months ago, asked for an indulgence by way of extension of their period of contract and in their application they based their claim. I quote the language "entirely in the interests of the consumers" Could impudence go any further?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of COMMERCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): Mr Mullick has given us an interesting history of this question; and as far as it goes, it is a correct and complete account of the recent negotiations which have been going on between the Electric Supply Company, the Calcutta Corporation and the Government. What he has omitted to tell us, and what I was hoping he would tell us, is how we are going to give effect to his resolution The resolution asks us to take immediate steps to put a stop to the levying by the Calcutta Electric Supply Corporation of the surcharge of 15 per cent. and as far as I know we have no power to take such steps either under the law or outside the law. The Calcutta Electric Supply Corporation are working under a license and the present term of that license runs till the year 1928. The Company recently addressed the Government and asked them to use their powers under the Act to extend the term of the license from ten years to twenty years. The reason that they gave us was that with the expansion of Calcutta and the growing demands for electric facilities it was necessary for them to build new power stations and to establish a number of new main connections, all of which would cost them a good

deal of money and it was therefore necessary for them to borrow money in order to carry out these improvements. They said that in the present state of the money market they found it difficult to raise money on reasonable terms when their license expired about seven years hence. We consulted the Calcutta Corporation and other public bodies concerned. The Calcutta Corporation were against general extension of the period of license from ten to twenty years and I told the Council in reply to a question on the subject that Government had accepted the views of the Calcutta Corporation on the question about the general extension. The Corporation have, however, recommended that the question of the extension of the existing license for ten years, that is to say, up to the year 1938, should be considered provided the Electric Company in return make certain concessions to their customers. Among these concessions which the Calcutta Corporation suggested is the question of the levy of the surcharge. We have addressed the Electric Supply Corporation on the subject and have asked them what they have got to say about the stipulations which have been proposed by the Calcutta Corporation. When we get the Electric Supply Corporation's answer, we shall consider what action we should take on their original request, but we have no power to compel the Company to remit the surcharge which their license authorises them to impose.

Mr. Mullick has commented on the inconsistency of the Company in levying this surcharge very shortly after they declared a dividend of 20 per cent.—I think it was 10 per cent. *plus* a bonus share which amounted to 10 per cent. We do not know what the Electric Supply Corporation have got to say on that point, but I believe it had something to do with the high rate of exchange which prevailed during 1920. We are waiting to hear what the Electric Supply Corporation have to say before we make up our minds as to the justification or otherwise of their action. Apart from the question of the high dividend declared in 1920 there is, I have no doubt, considerable justification for an increase in the rate charged for electric current. The price of coal, for instance, has gone up enormously since the present rates were fixed and the price of all other materials and of labour has gone up correspondingly. However, I have no wish to stand up here and justify the action taken by the Electric Supply Company. As I have said, we have already addressed them in the matter and when we get their reply we shall consider their original request for the extension of the term of their license for another period of ten years. Meanwhile, as things stand at present, we have no power to interfere with their action in levying this surcharge before the year 1928 when their present contract will come to an end, and it will then be open to the Government and the Corporation to consider with an open mind the arrangements which should be made as to the future. At the present moment, as I have said, it is not possible for us to take the action which is suggested in the resolution, because we have no legal power to do so. I cannot therefore accept the resolution on behalf of

the Government, but I can promise that the remarks which have been made in the course of the debate to-day will be carefully considered before we come to a decision on the request which the Electric Supply Corporation have made to us.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I am glad that the Hon'ble Member in charge has said that my facts were correct, but am very sorry that I have to differ from the Hon'ble Member's view that the Government has got no power under the Act to call upon the Electric Supply Corporation to reduce this surcharge and I am much more sorry that the Hon'ble Member has given expression to this view. I think it would have been better to send it to the Advocate-General for opinion and if he was of this opinion it would have been better to give expression to it. I do not believe that the contract is such that the Government cannot interfere in this matter. So far as my opinion goes, I think the Government can create an earthquake if they like and the view that they cannot call upon the Electric Supply Corporation to do this does not appeal to me. If that was so, why was a Committee appointed in 1916 and why did the Committee recommend that the rate should be reduced? Who was then there to enforce the Corporation to do this? Did not the Government force the Electric Supply Corporation to do this? If they could do it then, why cannot they do it now? If they have no power to do anything, we must have to wait for ten years till the Electric Supply Corporation had had its fill and then the thing might be looked into. If it was good law in 1916, it is quite good law in 1921.

Then the Hon'ble Member has said, with regard to the question of surcharge, that he did not know what the Electric Supply Corporation meant by doing this in 1921. It does not require anybody to find out the reason. They wanted to have 20 per cent. Anybody who gets something is anxious to get something more and that is the long and short of the whole thing. It does not require very strong imagination or very wonderful powers to find out why this was done. They wanted more money and they did it because they are a monopolist company. That is the long and short and nothing more.

Then, the Hon'ble Member has said that perhaps the high prices of coal and other materials and of labour may have been responsible for this high charge. The price of coal has been responsible no doubt. The price of coal was high in 1918 and 1919 as well. They made a profit of 15 per cent. then in spite of these high prices and all that. In view of these facts, Sir, I think I have made out a very strong case for interference and I submit that if this resolution be accepted by my friend here, it will be the duty of the Government to see whether this matter lies in the hands of the Government to take away the surcharge; and if it is so, then by all means, I hope, the Government will be pleased to do it. That is my view of the whole matter.

The resolution was then put and carried.

Pay of Assistant Maulvis.

Maulvi A. K. FAZL-UL HAQ: "This Council recommends to the Government that in giving effect to the scheme for the reorganisation of the Subordinate Educational Service, as formulated by the Wordsworth Committee, the pay of the Assistant Maulvis in the Arabic Department of the Calcutta Madrassah, be placed on a footing similar to that of the Lecturers in the Sanskrit *tols*."

In moving this resolution, I do not wish to raise a communal question so far as the pay and prospects of the members of the Educational Service are concerned; I am only giving effect to a very strong feeling in the minds of the members of this Council, particularly of my community, that in the treatment of pay and prospects of Persian teachers and Maulvis in the Arabic Department of the Madrassahs, these officers have not been fairly treated. A little examination of the statistics of the eastern districts will show that the number of students in the institutions called Sanskrit *tols* is much smaller than the number of students receiving instruction in the Arabic Department of the Calcutta Madrassah. The teachers known as the Arabic teachers of the Madrassah have to put in far more strenuous work than the teachers in Sanskrit *tols*, and while I do not grudge the little improvement that is going to be made, what I feel is that a similar concession may be made as regards other classes of officers doing similar service if not so arduous in the discharge of their public duties. I do not wish to take up the time of the Council any further as I know that the Hon'ble Minister in charge is inclined to consider this question sympathetically. I would only urge upon him the extreme necessity of taking early steps in this matter, and I hope he will translate his sympathy to action and will be pleased to accept this resolution.

With these words, I commend this resolution to the acceptance of this House.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: On the recommendation of the Wordsworth Committee the question of the reorganisation of the Subordinate Educational Service is under the consideration of Government. That service consists of many heterogeneous groups of officers, and as Government have not yet come to a final decision in the matter it is not possible for me to give any definite assurance one way or the other. But I may promise the mover of the resolution that I shall look into the matter and I shall try to deal with the question on its merits and if the facts be as the mover has represented them to be, then no doubt it is a case for careful consideration. At the present moment I am unable to accept the resolution, but I can promise my personal attention to this matter. I must therefore oppose the resolution because the matter is still under consideration. Our position is that we do not say that we do accept it or that we do not accept it. Therefore we cannot promise one way or the other.

Maulvi A. K. FAZL-UL HAQ: I beg leave to withdraw the resolution.

The resolution was then, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

Abolition of Divisional Commissioners.

Babu NITYA DHON MUKHERJEE: Mr. Das, in whose name the following resolution stands, is absent, and he has asked me to move it: "This Council recommends to the Government that a committee, consisting of official and non-official members, be appointed to consider and report whether the posts of Divisional Commissioners may be abolished with due regard to efficiency; and, if their opinion be in the affirmative, to report as to the steps to be taken to give effect to such opinion."

I propose to place before the Council very briefly my reasons for moving this resolution, a resolution which I feel, will commend itself to this House and which, I trust, the Government will accept.

There is no doubt that the Reforms have introduced a good deal of additional expenditure in the administration of the country which Bengal is hardly in a position to meet. Retrenchments are therefore absolutely necessary.

I am, however, not in favour of indiscriminate retrenchment or retrenchment at all costs, but at the same time it is imperatively necessary that this House should take early and energetic steps to effect retrenchment where it is possible without detriment to good administration.

I have selected the Divisional Commissionership as a possible subject in respect of which retrenchment can be effected, principally because the Decentralisation Commission reported against retention, at the same time, of both the Board of Revenue and the Divisional Commissioners. That report favoured the retention of the Divisional Commissioners as against the Board of Revenue, but the abolition of the Board of Revenue appears to me to be a difficult matter and will, from all that I can judge, be somewhat unpopular. We must, therefore, consider whether the post of Divisional Commissioners can be abolished without detriment to the good administration of the country. Like most of the non-official members I have no knowledge of the actual work which the Commissioners have to perform, but this seems to me clear that a good deal of their work has been lightened by the Reforms. So far as I am aware, their works relating to primary education, district boards, municipalities have now been more or less transferred to popular control and their principal work consists of appeals in revenue matters and general supervision of the work of the Collectors. As regards the latter, it seems to me that this may easily be provided for by giving the people concerned a power to appeal direct to the Board of Revenue. It will involve an increase of work so far as the Member of the Board is concerned, but against that the work of the Member of the Board of Revenue has been or should be lightened by

reason of the Reforms. There is only the question of general supervision exercised by the Divisional Commissioners. There is no doubt a good deal to be said in favour of the retention of an officer who can co-ordinate and supervise the work of the different Collectors. This is a matter which will have to be considered by the Committee, which, by this resolution, I am asking, should be appointed.

As I have already pointed out, I am not familiar and, I believe, most of the members of this House are not familiar, with the actual work done by the Commissioners and of their exact function in the administration of this country. I am therefore not prepared to move for their immediate abolition, as my friend Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri desires to do; but I feel that there is a sufficient *primâ facie* case in favour of their abolition to call for an inquiry.

I should like to explain that in my resolution I have not asked that the committee to be appointed should be restricted to the members of this Council. In a matter like this we should have on the committee, if possible, men who have an actual experience of working of the post. We have at present in Calcutta two Bengali retired members of the I. C. S., who have held the position of Divisional Commissioner and I feel their services would be very useful in such a committee

I trust the Government will accept the resolution which does not express any opinion on the subject, one way or the other, but merely calls for an investigation of the matter. I feel sure the Government is as anxious as we are to effect retrenchment when possible.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: "This Council recommends to the Government that the posts of the Divisional Commissioners be abolished and that the clerical staff be provided for in the Secretariat and other Government offices."

I think that a committee is not necessary. These officers were necessary when there was one man rule and the Secretaries had to manage everything with the help of the opinions of these officers possessing special local knowledge. When the Council Government was advocated by the Decentralisation Committee it was thought that the retention of both the Commissioners and the Board of Revenue were not necessary and that Committee suggested the abolition of the Board of Revenue. Whatever might have been said by my friend the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler at the time of the discussion about the abolition of the Board of Revenue as to the competency of that Committee or of the members composing that Committee the Government though did not accept the proposal in its entirety, but after mature consideration it reduced the number of the members of the Board of Revenue. But after the Reforms and after the expansion of the Legislative Council, I think merely for the sake of local knowledge the retention of these officers is not necessary. Final orders are now passed by Government. The Divisional Commissioners now simply collect returns, make inspections and hear appeals and these

are their principal functions. My friend Babu Nitya Dhon Mukherjee in his speech has shown that really the work can be otherwise managed, but he thinks that instead of directly considering the question and coming to a decision as to the abolition of these officers, it is better that the committee should be appointed I do not see, however, the special necessity for it. Madras has been doing without Commissioners from before. With the Council Government it could manage without the Commissioners. Recently the question arose in the Central Provinces Council and the Government suggestion was for the appointment of a committee. That shows that there was some sympathy felt by Government but the Council came to the conclusion that the Commissioners' posts should be abolished. In Bengal we are faced with a financial difficulty. There is a deficit of over Rs 2 crores and we do not know how to meet it To meet the situation by any taxation at the present moment is, I think, out of the question. We must see what economy can be effected in the several departments of Government We appealed to the Government of India months ago and as yet we have not got any favourable reply It is a special case for Bengal Under these circumstances it is useless to spend time or to depend upon a committee for eliciting any special information which can be easily supplied by the members and which I think is well known to all the members. By the increment of the pay of officers all round there has been a tremendous increase in the administrative expenditure If we can abolish these Commissionerships, I think there can be a saving of not less than Rs. 5 to 6 lakhs annually.

If it is an unnecessary expenditure and if we can do without the Commissioners, then why should we lose time and not abolish them at once? The appeal work can safely be managed by the Board of Revenue and the petty appeals by the Collector For these reasons, I think, we should not wait for a committee as nothing new can be expected from it. It is not necessary to go into details. We can at once come to a conclusion Ours is a top-heavy administration and if an economy is possible, we should not lose any time over it. For these reasons, I do not think that a committee is at all necessary.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: It seems that committees are in the air. I do not know how many committees have been appointed by this Council up to now Some seem to have shelved questions for which they were appointed and some have solved them. I do not know whether a committee for the abolition of Commisioners will shelve or solve the problem. The recent committee for the separation of the Judicial and Executive functions does not inspire much hope as I find that the name of the mover of the resolution itself, Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri, has been omitted. Therefore, Sir, as there is no system of Divisional Commissioners in Madras and as the Central Provinces Council has been able to carry the resolution advising the abolition of the Commissioners,

instead of referring the question to a committee, I think, Bengal should try to keep pace with these Provinces.

Why do I suggest the abolition of any of these posts, which have been in existence for such a long time? My reasons are both economic and administrative. Economically, the reasons are obvious. The Reforms have added enormously to the cost of administration and the province has been brought to a state of bankruptcy. The financial condition of Bengal is known to all. Not only have high appointments, with extraordinary high rates of pay been multiplied, but a spirit of extravagance is abroad, and the pay of the higher services has been inordinately increased. As if this were not enough, only recently, an extraordinary step has been taken—the salary of some of the Imperial services has again been increased—and this has been done behind our backs, with a full knowledge of the financial crisis of this province, without even affording us an opportunity for an expression of opinion. We have to pay the cost and we are forced to pay it blindly. No words are strong enough to denounce the unfairness of this procedure, but with no power to control such acts, mere denunciation will bring no tangible result. The most practical course is therefore to scrutinise every item of expenditure with a view to counteract the disastrous consequences of this extravagant onrush, and try to save the Government and the country from the effects of a crash that is bound to follow. What then is the remedy. The administration must be cheapened. This can be done in two ways: first, by reducing the scale of pay of the higher services and utilising a cheaper agency, and secondly, by reducing the number of highly paid appointments. The first method will form the subject of some other resolutions that I hope to move. I am just now concerned with the second method, viz., the abolition of some highly paid and unnecessary posts. So much for the economical grounds. From an administrative view-point also, I believe that some of the posts may be abolished, because there is a duplication and delay in the administrative work, which should be removed. I therefore ask for the abolition of these posts, which are unnecessary, but which the Indian Civil Service, possibly with a motive, perfectly human, but by no means altruistic, holds to be absolutely necessary.

I think it is my duty to indicate the way in which the abolition and the consequent reorganisation may be effected.

By abolishing the five Divisional Commissioners, and having a second member in the Board of Revenue, the cost of administration can be reduced by nearly Rs. 2½ lakhs a year, and at the same time, the prestige of the highest revenue appellate court in the province may be enhanced.

When I urged for the abolition of the Board of Revenue, I suggested that its revenue appellate powers might be exercised by some member

of the Executive Council and that some of its other functions might be delegated to the Commissioners. As the Council has decided against the abolition of the Board, the only course left to me is to attack the great citadel of extravagant expenditure from another side. If the Board must remain, let the Commissioners go. I am happy to find that the reasons that were raised against the abolition of the Board will support the abolition of the Commissioners, as I shall presently show.

When the Commissioners were created by Regulation I of 1829, the preamble gave an account of the reasons that ushered them into existence. They were needed, first to expedite business which the Provincial Courts of Appeal and Circuit could not promptly attend to. Secondly, for relieving the Board of Revenue of land assessment and revenue appeal duties, thirdly, for superintending the work of the magistracy, the Police, the Collectors and other revenue officers. It was added that it was intended that the officers in charge of a moderate tract of the country might be accessible to the people.

Now, between 1829 and 1921, a world of changes has been brought about. The Commissioners are no longer required to go out on circuits in 1921 as they were made to do in 1829. In 1829, the effect of the introduction of the Permanent Settlement was in full swing; many estates were being sold up, dismembered and divided. Old dynasties were being broken up, new dynasties were founded. Appeals were frequent. There was no railway, no telegraph and the postal system was still unorganised. The need of a local appellate authority was undoubtedly felt. But what is the state of affairs now? The realisation of land revenue in permanently-settled estates of Bengal seldom falls below 98 per cent. of the demand. In the year 1918-19, which may be taken as an average year, out of 93,000 permanently-settled estates, only 708 entire estates and 194 shares of estates were put to sale. There were only 88 appeals in the whole province, and only in the case of 18 of them, did the Commissioners intervene and annul the sales. The total amount of revenue affected by them was only Rs. 1,313. In other words, taking an average of 10 co-shares per estate—180 persons had been affected. In a population of 47 millions, in order to save 180 people from the hardships of a rigorous enforcement of the sale law and to avoid a loss of about Rs. 8 per head, a tribunal has been set up, which in five Commissioners alone costs annually Rs. 1,80,000, leaving out the gazetted personal assistant and a large horde of ministerial and other staff. Then again, in the Government and temporarily-settled estates, land revenue settlement is now almost invariably based on a record-of-rights under the Bengal Tenancy Act. According to the recent Government rules under this Act, it is the Director of Land Records and the Board of Revenue who are the confirming authorities, and Commissioners have practically nothing to do with these settlements. It is true that certain other minor appeals, such as certificate cases, income-tax, etc., are heard by the Commissioners. Income-tax

is now an Imperial subject and, I believe, the department is going to be reorganised soon. It is not unlikely that the income-tax appeal will soon go into the hands of an Income-tax Commissioner, thus relieving the Divisional Commissioner of even the petty amount of income tax work that he might have to do and that mainly in the Presidency Division.

As for the third reason for the creation of the posts of Commissioners, viz., the supervision of the magistracy, Police and Collector's work, I think I might be optimistic enough to hope that the separation of the judicial and executive functions will be complete before the term of this Council is over, and none of the revenue officers will have anything to do with the supervision of the magistracy. What effective control the Commissioner exercises over the police, we need not stop to discuss, as the recent orders have reduced the Commissioners' powers to a minimum. Possibly, except in matters like the checking of notifications for new police-stations, this department has, in its right royal police style, already given the Commissioner a left-handed salute, and with its Inspector-General, Deputy Inspectors-General and Assistant Inspector-General, is perfectly able to forego his tender affections. As for the supervision of Collector's work, I do not know why they need supervision at all. They are supposed to be senior men drawing more than Rs. 2,000 a month, a salary which even the Prime Minister of Japan does not get. Why these gentlemen, who are always glorified and held up as the pillars of administration and infallible paragons of virtue, cannot be trusted to get on without occasional contact with and supervision by still greater paragons of the service, passes my comprehension.

The Council here adjourned for 15 minutes.

After the adjournment

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: This is all the more inscrutable, because practically every manual of the Revenue Department has been brought to perfection and there are special staffs and special departments thoroughly trained to tackle all problems. Moreover, what after all, is this annual inspection and supervision of the Commissioner? It is not a rare sight that the Commissioner's sheristadar proceeds in advance, writes up notes of inspection, which are touched up by the Commissioner and passed on as inspection notes.

It is true that certain sanctions for district boards and municipalities have got to come from the Commissioners, but I think the time has come, when they should be freed from the leading strings of officialdom, and with a Minister, supposed to be of the people, in charge of Self-Government portfolio, aided by an official Secretary, it is perfectly possible to do without these middlemen. To come now to the last duty of the Commissioners, viz., that they would be accessible to the people—or to put it in more modern phraseology—that they would ensure greater touch with the people, I need not dilate upon this theory. Suffice it to

say, that in this land of untouchables, the Commissioners have not succeeded in breaking through their class or caste guilds. After a century of this officialised process of touch, the Commissioners are now generally touched only by people having sons and sons-in-law to provide with Government appointments or by candidates for Rai Bahadurships. I think we must frankly confess that their touches have not impressed or elevated, and it must be admitted that this part of the hope has failed miserably. The Commissioners are anachronisms to-day, and if some people have described them as post-boxes fixed between the Collector and the Government, they are post-boxes of a very antiquated type and in a broken state of repair. Even the Decentralization Commission, which advocated the abolition of the Board of Revenue rather than of the Commissioners, were constrained to admit that they agreed with "those who did not find the present position satisfactory." They went on to say :-

> The scant esteem in which the office (of Commissioner) may be held is shown by the suggestions of some witnesses for its abolition as unnecessary, and by the description of Commissioners and Kings whose subjects are unconscious of their existence and as wielding some influence but no control

If Deputy Collectors, instead of being merely sectional superintendents in Collector's offices as at present, be trusted to dispose of cases as Revenue Courts of original jurisdiction, if Collectors be vested with powers to hear appeals, and second appeals be heard by the Board of Revenue, the system will be analogous to the procedure followed in Civil cases—more convenient and cheaper to the applicants, who will have their first appeals disposed of locally.

The only main faults found by the Decentralization Commissioners with the Madras system, which has no Commissioners, were first that there is no intermediate Officer who could inspect districts from the standpoint of general administration, and advise junior Collectors. Sir, I submit that the "junior Collector" itself is undesirable; why should junior officers be made Collectors? Their second point was that there was duplication of secretariats and inadequate inspection by touring.

In Bengal, with the Reforms Scheme, the Secretariat has already been vastly increased and there is no danger of more increase and duplication, even if the Commissioners are abolished. As regards inspection by touring it will appear that tours vary with the temper and attitude of the inspecting officers. In 1918-19, the Rajshahi Commissioner spent as many as 153 days on inspection whereas the Commissioner of the Presidency Division spent only 62 days. I think if any inspecting officer spends 10 days in a district (including the time spent in journeys) in a year, it will suffice for all the supervision that is needed. The two Members of the Board can very well do this; the rest of their time, they can spend in hearing appeals and advising Government. This arrangement will also meet the objections raised against the abolition of the Board, inasmuch as (*i*) they will furnish a better co-ordinating authority, (*ii*) it will lead to a more satisfactory and cheaper

method of disposal of appeals, (*iii*) will keep the number of appellate Courts unimpaired, and (*iv*) will furnish an independent advisory authority to Government and will, I trust, more than satisfy the influential opinion which the Hon'ble Maharajadhiraja was pleased to hint would not take things lying down. This has the supreme advantage—an advantage which ought to outweigh all the threats of influential and vested interests—that instead of an approximate expenditure of Rs. 2,46,000 on a Member of the Board of Revenue, a Secretary and five Commissioners, we shall have the work done, as efficiently as, if not more efficiently than, before with two Members and a Secretary, at Rs. 1,08,000 per annum, effecting a saving of Rs. 1,38,000. If to this we add that the gazetted Personal Assistant to the five Commissioners be reduced and that the offices of the Commissioners and of the Board of Revenue be amalgamated and kept on a reduced scale, we may be sure to effect another reduction of nearly Rs. 1,50,000 a year.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I beg to support the resolution for the abolition of the posts of Commissioners. Sir, I was the first to raise this question in the Council during the last cold weather session, but I withdrew it because there was a bigger question—the general question of retrenchment which was going to be considered.

I think, Sir, that enough has been said as regards the merits of the question and I do not like to add anything more thus taking up the time of the Council. It is well known that Commissioners are perfectly useless in these days. They have no reason to exist now and in view of the financial stringency they must and ought to go. We shall insist upon that. We shall cry ourselves hoarse over it. And if the desire of the Government to make us co-operate with them is at all sincere they must accept the position and not oppose the motion which is of such a reasonable character. But to my mind, Government is bound to oppose it. And why? Because there is the vested interest. Well, if they proceed in that policy then it would be putting a very great strain on our desire to go along with the Government and it is high time that we warn the Government to realize the position for themselves.

Raja MANMATHA NATH RAY CHOUDHURY: I regret I cannot support the resolution, which Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri has brought forward for the consideration of this House. Before I proceed to give my reasons for the attitude I have taken, I may add, most reluctantly taken, in regard to the proposition under discussion, I should like to say with all the emphasis I command, that I have every sympathy with the desire of my hon'ble friend to cut down, by all possible means, the expense of our top-heavy Government, and thus save, as much as possible, the money of the poor tax-payers of Bengal, who have already felt the pinch of poverty to an extent which has driven them almost to the verge of despair. But, apart from the question of economy there is the outstanding question of efficiency, which cannot be neglected,

far less ignored. When I think of the large powers with which the District Magistrates are vested—when I think of the fact that mostly these District Magistrates are young civilians, lacking in experience and not always well versed with Indian life and Indian affairs—of course, there are many exceptions—I cannot but value the appellate authority of, and the general control exercised by, the Commissioner of the Division, whose riper judgment and experience, longer acquaintance with the indigenous population, their customs and usages, their aspirations and sentiments, wants and requirements cannot but stand him in good stead as an administrator, controlling as he does the District Officers of his division to a reasonable extent. Besides, in my opinion, the authority of the Commissioner goes a great way to co-ordinate and harmonize various district administrations and organizations and thus knit them together into a homogeneous whole, which cannot but be conducive to good government and public welfare. If the powers of the District Officers could be curtailed with due regard to efficiency, if a practical scheme for the separation of Judicial and Executive functions could be formulated and placed on a sound, economic basis, if the appellate authority of the Commissioners could be transferred and vested in another body equally competent, and if such a change could be effected in the existing order of things as would lead to the uniformity and co-ordination of different administrations without the unifying and controlling agency of the Commissioner of a Division of which the districts are so many component parts, the posts of the Divisional Commissioner could be abolished with a view to lighten the burden of expenses which it has become extremely difficult for our Government to shoulder any longer. This no doubt points to the necessity of forming a committee to consider this question, in all its bearings, as suggested by Mr. Das's resolution and I must support it and oppose the other resolution. When the committee is formed and when these matters have been seriously dealt with then the time will come for us to decide whether the posts of the Commissioners should be abolished or not. I think, therefore, that Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri will agree with me and withdraw his resolution.

Mr. SYED NASIM ALI: I regret that I have got to oppose the resolution which has been moved by Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri. My reasons simply are these: We all know that the Commissioners of Divisions have certain appellate powers. If this resolution is to be given effect to, there must be corresponding changes in certain Acts, and if we pass this resolution we thereby mean that we have got to transfer that appellate jurisdiction to some other quarters. This resolution would practically mean that the Act will have to be amended without any reference to other provisions of the Act. The proper procedure would be to get first the different provisions in the different Acts so far as appellate powers are concerned, and if the Council decides that in view of the

present circumstances the appellate jurisdiction should be transferred to some other quarters, it is after that we can decide whether these posts are necessary at all. Before we are in a position to decide whether these appellate powers should be transferred to some other quarters it would be rather hasty to decide that these posts should be abloished at once. The resolution which was sent in by Mr. S. R. Das and has been moved by another member of this Council seems to be more reasonable. That resolution rather wants that there should be a committee and the committee should first consider as to whether we can do away with these Commissioners without detriment to the efficiency of the administration, and the committee will then be in a position to report as to what steps should be taken to give effect to it. There is an apprehension in some quarters that the object of this committee is simply to shelve the question and to postpone the matter as long as possible. There may be some instances which may justify such an apprehension in the minds of members of this Council, but I do not think that when Mr. Das wanted the Council to consider this question he meant that the question should be shelved and that this matter should not be decided by the Council. On the other hand, we have appointed many committees for considering many important matters. We have to-day passed a resolution for appointing a committee to inquire into the financial condition of the Calcutta University. Those members who supported the resolution did not for a moment apprehend that the object of the mover of the resolution was to shelve the question as long as possible Therefore, to my mind, it seems that when we want that a committee should be appointed, we want that the committee should also act and the committee should also report as to what should be done. Mr. Das's resolution also says that the committee should consist of official and non-official members, so that both sides may be represented and the question may be considered from a comprehensive standpoint. It is after the committee have decided whether we can do away with these posts without in any way impairing the efficiency of the administration that we can consider whether these posts should be abolished at all.

Then as regards the other functions, namely, the collection of revenues, inspection, superintendence and other matters connected with the duties of the Commissioner, I think the last speaker has clearly explained that, and, to my mind, it seems that it is a committee consisting of officials and non-officials who can really consider this matter from all public standpoints, and after the committee has done so, we can then consider as to whether the efficiency of the administration would be interfered with if these posts are abolished. Therefore, Mr. Das's resolution seems to me to be more reasonable, and I think there ought not to be any apprehension in the minds of the members of this House that the object of this resolution is simply to shelve the question.

With these words, I beg to support Mr. Das's resolution and oppose the other moved by Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri.

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): We have two resolutions before us—one is a recommendation to Government to appoint a committee to go into the question as to whether the posts of Divisional Commissioners could be abolished, and, if so, what steps should be taken in that direction, if the committee recommended that step; the other resolution which has been moved does not wish to wait any longer but wishes to abolish the posts of Divisional Commissioners forthwith.

Before I make any lengthy statement as to what the opinion of Government on the question as a whole is, I deem it my duty to reply to some of the criticisms that have been levelled at us in connection with the posts of Divisional Commissioners. Unfortunately, the criticisms have been of such a nature as do not, on the one hand, demand a lengthy reply; on the other hand, it is difficult to reply to a mentality which, in the race for economy—in the panic that we have to meet this large deficit—considers that the panacea of all evils is to abolish all posts without considering what that abolition may mean towards the impairing of the general machinery of administration. As I say, this is a a mentality which it is very difficult to reply to, especially when that mentality is gingered with remarks such as "vested interests" and other things. Government in a matter of this kind, can and must only look at the broader question of efficiency and at the question of carrying on administration in a proper manner, and it is from that point of view that I shall reply. But before I do so, I should like to make a few observations on some of the remarks that have fallen from the speakers.

Babu Nitya Dhon Mukherjee, who has moved this resolution on behalf of Mr. S. R. Das, considers the resolution inoffensive and among the reasons that he has put forward for the abolition of the Commissioners or at least for an inquiry with that idea in view, he has said that since the Reforms the functions of the Commissioners have been minimised. I do not know how he has arrived at this conclusion, because the functions of the Commissioners remain practically the same before Reforms came into existence and after.

Then comes our friend from Rajshahi, who, without taking the matter into consideration—evidently the weather of Calcutta agrees with him because he comes to us light-heartedly—says there is no need for them—abolish them straight away, by a stroke of the pen remove the Commissioners without considering what the effect on the general machinery of the administration would be if the Commissioners were abolished to-morrow. I must say that it is difficult for anyone who appreciates even to the smallest extent the present system of administration to follow his argument. He has said that Madras had been doing without Commissioners even before the Reforms came into existence, that recently the question was raised at a meeting of the Central Provinces Council, and, at the end of course, he has brought in the

general question of the need of economy. In fact, it cannot be denied that those of the gentlemen who have spoken to-day, have done so more with the idea of retrenchment than with anything else. They have not taken the trouble to enlighten the Council as to what the effect would be on the administration if these posts were abolished without considering what machinery could replace the machinery that has worked well for nearly a century. As I have said already, to these gentlemen at any rate, the panacea for all evils is to undermine efficiency for the sake of retrenchment. One of the arguments put forward by Kishori Babu has been that because we are going to increase the salary of our officers, therefore, we must do away with Commissioners. What about the general administration? What about the replacing of a machinery which, in whatever form you may like to have it, must exist.

Then comes Babu Indu Bhushan Datta. I do not wish to go into any detail with his methods of chiselling or his principle of a cheaper service for the whole province. All I wish to say is this: if the services are going to be Indianised more and more—and they must be so even then we must follow a principle which is to govern our administration, and I say that in our race for economy let us not impair efficiency. He has gone on to give us some sidelights of Commissioners' Personal Assistants and sheristedars. Probably he knows more about them than we do. It is not for the Members of Government to enter into the sidelights. It is for the Central Government to consider and advise to the best of its ability as to the possible means of economy and not to go in for a change without properly considering what the effects of such a change might be on the administration.

Babu Surendra Nath Mullick has, with his usual style, said that they are useless—dismiss them at once—and has given us a warning that if Government expect co-operation from Babu Surendra Nath Mullick and others, we must not oppose the resolution on the ground of vested interests. I may tell him at once that it is far from the intention of Government to put in such a plea; Government's duty is clear and that duty is to see that the general administration is not impaired.

Raja Manmatha Nath Ray Choudhury has spoken in favour of the system, and although he might have spoken with a greater strength, I think he has struck the right note when he has said that before a change is made we should consider the question in all its aspects and that is the line which has been taken by Mr. Nasim Ali also.

Now let me go to a little length into this question. It is easy enough to advocate abolition, but it is not quite the same thing to propose a substitution for the posts which we are asked to remove, and Kishori Babu's resolution has been worded in such a way as to convey that the posts of Commissioners are wholly useless and unnecessary and that, therefore, on the ground of economy they should be abolished. To every sensible member of this Council, I am sure, it must be clear that

the posts are neither useless nor unnecessary, and that in case we have to contemplate seriously abolishing these posts, we could only do so by such substitution or by creation of a new system, and a new system must mean a certain number of changes. If this is once granted, then we at once come to the question as to whether such a substitution would really result in retrenchment and would be more economical than the system which now prevails. If the Commissioners are now abolished it is obvious that their duties will have to be performed by other authorities, and even a radical change in the system would, I am sure, not reduce the present recurring cost. On the other hand, the introduction of a new system would involve a very large initial cost which, to my mind, would not be justified The Commissioner has, as we all know, administrative duties, to perform, both general and land revenue, and what is perhaps most important, discharges important duties as a court of revenue appeal. If these duties are to be given to others they can only be given to a superior authority, and here I must mention that Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta has now come round to the idea that the Board of Revenue should be kept if the Commissioners are to be abolished and he is probably in favour of granting another member to the Board, or that these duties may be given to the Executive Government itself—which is highly objectionable. And if these duties are to be given to an inferior authority, then it will be to the Collector; or else the Commissioner's work will have to be divided between the Collector, the Board of Revenue, and the Central Government. In India, Madras is the only province in which there are no Commissioners, and though any comparison between Bengal and Madras is vitiated by the wide difference in land and revenue systems, it furnishes some basis for a comparison of costs. In Bengal we have a Board of Revenue with one member which costs in round figures Rs 1,19,000 annually and we have five Commissioners costing Rs. 3,71,000 inclusive of pay and allowances; the total cost is about Rs. 4,90,000. In Madras, there are four members of the Board whose salary alone amounts to something like Rs. 1,62,000 a year. It may be argued that four members of the Board would not necessarily cost four times as much as one member. In Bengal the Collectors perform many duties which, in Madras, are performed by officers of lower rank and which, if Commissioners were to be abolished, would have to be taken from Collectors and given to subdivisional and other officers, and all this would involve expenditure It will therefore be clear that we cannot abolish the Divisional Commissioners in Bengal and save money. Then regarding cost, to my mind, the recurring cost of the Madras system, if applied to Bengal, would not in any way be less than the cost of the present system. It is for the Council to consider whether, in the circumstances, these posts should be abolished by a stroke of the pen as Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri seems to suggest. Then again, as I have said in my opening remarks, if a system similar to that of Madras

had to be introduced into Bengal, the initial cost would be great. Not only would officers have to be found for the new members of the Board, but, in the districts, there would have to be a reorganisation of accommodation which would certainly prove expensive. Much of the work which is done at Collectors' offices in Bengal is done at subdivisional offices in Madras, and the subdivisions are further divided into taluks under tahsildars. It is quite apparent, therefore, that if the Collectors were given some of the Commissioners' duties, it would probably be necessary to give subdivisional officers some of the Collectors' duties, involving increased expenditure in subdivisions not only on establishments but also on buildings.

I have mentioned above the wide difference in the land and revenue systems of Bengal and Madras. This is very clearly brought out by the report written by Mr. Oldham in 1910, written with special reference to the proposals for decentralization, the report of the Royal Commission upon Decentralization having been published in 1909. He pointed out that in Madras the last unit for administrative purposes was the village, in which there was a headman responsible for the collection of revenue and exercising powers as a village Magistrate. Decentralization to a degree quite unknown in Bengal had in the case of revenue work been rendered possible by, and was in fact in great measure a logical result of, the local system of organization under which the village was the ultimate unit on which the superstructure of the administration was built; and the system was intimately bound up with the *raiyatwari* settlement of the land, two-thirds of the settled area being under *raiyatwari* tenure. He summed up the difference as follows:—

The essential difference between the two provinces may be said to be that while in Madras there is a system of territorial jurisdiction in all revenue matters starting from the village at the bottom, and leading up by successive stages to the Collector at the top, in Bengal practically all the revenue work is concentrated under different officers according to subjects at the headquarters station of the district, and filters down from there to the people While in Madras supervision over the Collector is exercised by the Board or Government direct, and by subjects, in Bengal the supervision is by territorial Commissioners In other words, in Madras the work is distributed among the district authorities territorially, but among the higher controlling authorities by subjects, in Bengal the work is distributed in the district by subjects, but control and supervision by Commissioners is territorial

If the suggestion that the Madras system should be followed be accepted, Mr. Oldham's report contains ample evidence to show that this is impossible. A weighty opinion on the question of the retention of territorial Commissioners was recorded by the Royal Commission upon Decentralization in India. This opinion is to be found in Chapter XII, page 168, of the Report, but the following quotations are particularly relevant to the present resolution:—

Paragraph 463.—A number of witnesses considered that it was unnecessary to have a Board of Revenue in addition to Divisional Commissioners, and that one

or other of these should be abolished We hold that Commissioners should be retained, as a most valuable link in the chain of administration between individual districts and the headquarters administration of the province To put the districts directly under the latter in revenue matters would inevitably lead to further centralization in the Secretariats.

Paragraph 484 —The Commissioner is, or should be, a picked man with long experience of district administration, who can maintain closer personal relations with the officials subordinate to him and the people of his division than is possible for any headquarters authority, while his greater experience and range of view should enable him to assist the Government with more mature and comprehensive views that can be formed by a Collector

Well, Sir, I shall not go into any greater length There are many arguments but I should like to say that for the public, especially of districts remote from Calcutta, a Board is a somewhat vague and impersonal authority The feelings of local officials, especially district officers, would be similar. The Commissioner has an up-to-date and personal knowledge of districts and of the principal people in them; he can see things for himself and knows his officers personally. A Board of three or four members could not have these advantages. Such a Board too could not act as a co-ordinating authority over the work of the different departments in the districts, if for no other reason, probably it would itself be departmentalised Neither could a Collector act as such an authority, for departmental specialization has now gone so far that the Collector is becoming merely one of several departmental officers in the district If a general co-ordinating control is to be exercised over the various departments, it is only the Commissioner who can exercise it

To sum up, therefore, my arguments against the acceptance of Kishori Babu's resolution are—the abolition of Commissioners would not mean economy, the recurring cost of a new system would probably be as great, and the initial cost would be heavy. In India, Madras is the only province in which there are no Commissioners, the Madras system is complete in itself and cannot be applied to Bengal owing to the land and revenue systems being entirely different. Then we have the opinion of the Decentralization Commission which went into the question thoroughly and was decidedly in favour of the retention of Commissioners But, Sir, if it be the desire of the Council that in view of the question of expenditure and retrenchment occupying the minds of the public at large and those of the members of the Council, a committee is thought to be essential, although Government in view of the statement that I have made, cannot look to the abolition of the Commissioners without due consideration of the question in all its aspects, I am prepared to accept the resolution of Mr. S R. Das which has been moved by Babu Nitya Dhon Mukherjee, but I must oppose the resolution of Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY moved that the question be now put.

Mr. S. R. Das's resolution, which was moved by Babu Nitya Dhon Mukherjee, was then put and carried.

The resolution of Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri was then deemed to have failed.

Adjournment.

The Council then adjourned to Wednesday, the 31st August, 1921, at 3 P.M. at the Town Hall, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Wednesday, the 31st August 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers, and 105 nominated and elected members.

Starred Questions

(to which oral answers were given).

Adulteration of "ghee" in Darjeeling.

***XXIII. Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) aware that the fat of boa constrictors is mixed with *ghee* in the Darjeeling district and sold in the market as *ghee*?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps to put a stop to this?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE [LAND REVENUE] (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (*a*) No; from the "Fauna of British India" it appears that the boa constrictor is not found in India; and it seems unlikely that any one would go to the trouble and expense of importing it for the purpose of adulterating *ghee*.

(*b*) Government do not consider that any action is necessary.

Dacca University, Professor of English.

***XXIV. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Dacca University has got no Professor in charge of English and that a Reader is now in charge of the same, and the English classes are generally taught by lecturers.

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the reasons for this?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter): (*a*) The Department of English is under a Reader acting as head of the Department, with the assistance of two Honorary Readers, who were formerly Professors of English at Dacca College and seven lecturers, of whom six have been professors in colleges of the Calcutta University.

(*b*) Mr. Egerton Smith, formerly of the Dacca College, was appointed University Professor of English, but was unable to accept the appointment for personal reasons. As by this time it was clear that the University would have to curtail its expenditure owing to the financial stringency of the province, retrenchment was made in the English as in other Departments.

Director of Physical Education, Dacca University.

*XXV. **Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether a European gentleman has been placed in charge of drill and physical exercise on a salary of Rs. 1,150 a month in the Dacca University?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to explain the reason which led to the creation of the post on so high a salary?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) The post to which Mr. Mainwaring Holt has been appointed is not as described in the question. He has been appointed Director of Physical Education on a salary of Rs. 1,250—50—1,800.

(*b*) The appointment was made by His Excellency the Chancellor under section 50 (*c*) of the Dacca University Act. The matter is not one that has come before the Government of Bengal, but presumably the salary was fixed in view of the responsibilities of the post and the qualifications of the gentleman appointed, who is M.B., Ch.B. of the University of Leeds, and M.B., B.S. of the University of London.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: Is not such a man available in this country?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: The Dacca University is a statutory body and the appointments for it are in the gift of His Excellency the Governor.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what are the responsibilities attached to the post referred to?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: I have no information on the point. The Dacca University is a statutory body and the internal management of that body must be conducted by that body itself.

Service of processes in mufassal courts.

***XXVI. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department aware that much hardship and inconvenience is being felt by the public for service of processes and notices in the mufassal civil courts?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking the necessary steps, either through the Calcutta High Court or by moving the Government of India, for removing the grievances and inconveniences by the introduction of rules similar to those obtaining in the original side of the High Court or like those provided in the Provincial Insolvency Act?

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): (*a*) Government have no information But inquiries will be made.

(*b*) Does not arise.

Land revenue sales.

***XXVII. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state whether the Government are considering the desirability of taking up legislation as early as possible for enabling the persons aggrieved by sales under Act XI of 1859 and Bengal Regulation VIII of 1819 to have the sales set aside by deposit as provided by section 22 of the Public Demands Recovery Act (Bengal Act III of 1913)?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: The answer is in the negative.

Rule debarring Members and Ministers from participating in political movements.

***XXVIII. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether there is any ruling by Government debarring the Hon'ble Members and the Hon'ble Ministers from participating in any political movement or from joining any political organisation?

(*b*) If so, what is the ruling?

MEMBER in charge of APPOINTMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) and (*b*) The position of Hon'ble Members towards political movements is defined in rules 22 and 23 of the Government Servants' Conduct Rules, which run as follows:—

RULE 22.—(1) A Government servant may, for the purpose of removing misapprehensions, correcting misstatements and refuting disloyal and seditious propaganda,

defend and explain in public the policy of the Government. Save, however, as provided in rules 17, 18, 19 a Government servant may not make any communications to the press in regard to the policy or acts of the Government without the sanction of the local Government or such superior authority as the local Government may prescribe.

(2) In any action taken by them under sub-paragraph (1) Government servants should, so far as possible, refrain from making any reference to the personality of parties or individuals who may be in opposition to the Government and, when elections are impending, they must give no ground for the suggestion that any statements of facts or views made by them have been made with the object of influencing electors in favour of or against any party or individual candidate.

RULE 23.—(1) Save as provided in rule 22 or when acting under the express instructions of the local Government, a Government servant may not take part in, or subscribe in aid of, any political movement in India or relating to Indian affairs. Where there is room for doubt whether any action which a Government servant proposes to take will contravene this provision, he should refer the matter to the local Government to which or to the Government servant to whom he is immediately subordinate.

(2) A Government servant, who is a whole-time Government servant, may not, by canvassing or otherwise, interfere or use his influence in any way in an election to a legislative council except that he may record a vote, if he is qualified to do so, and in that case he should, as far as possible, avoid giving any indication beforehand of the direction in which he intends to vote.

(3) A Government servant, who is a whole-time Government servant, may not, save to the extent permissible in the case of elections to legislative councils or unless he is himself a candidate, who is legally eligible and has obtained from proper authority such permission, if any, as is required to enable him to stand for election, take part in elections to municipal committees, district boards and local boards

Ministers are not debarred from participating in political movements or from joining political organisations.

Tax on public amusements.

***XXIX. Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether the imposition of any tax upon amusements, such as cinemas, theatres, etc., is in contemplation, and, if so, to state what steps, if any, are being taken to introduce necessary legislation on the subject?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of FINANCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr: The question of the measures that can be adopted to increase the resources of the local Government is under consideration, but no definite statement can be made at present as to the nature of the action that will be taken.

Muhammadan hostel for Chittagong College.

***XXX. Rai UPENDRA LAL RAY Bahadur:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education aware that the

Chittagong College requires a Muhammadan hostel for accommodation of the gradually increasing number of its Muhammadan students?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the question of constructing a suitable building for the purpose?

(*c*) If so, by what time is it expected to have the work of construction taken in hand?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Yes. The District Magistrate has been asked to select a site.

(*c*) Next year, if funds are available and if Council agree to the provision of funds. There is no provision in this year's budget.

Students of the Dacca University.

***XXXI. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state—

(*i*) the total number of students admitted to the Dacca University;

(*ii*) how many of these belong to the Science side, and how many to the Arts side, and how many are in postgraduate classes?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*i*) Up to 24th August, 1921, the number was 734.

(*ii*) Arts 468, Science 123. The admission of postgraduate students is now proceeding: Government have not yet been informed of the number admitted.

Unstarred Questions

(answers to which were laid on the table).

Agricultural, industrial and commercial education.

143. Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state fully what steps, if any, have been, or are being, taken by the Government and the Calcutta University, respectively, for the encouragement of agricultural, industrial and commercial education in Bengal?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of AGRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): As regards the steps which have been taken or are being taken by the Government of Bengal, the member is referred to the answer given by the Hon'ble the Minister to the question asked by him at the meeting of the Bengal Legislative Council held on 7th February, 1921.

The following steps have been taken by the University:—

Adequate provision has been made in the Postgraduate Department for the teaching of Commerce, which has been included in the list of subjects for the M.A. Examination.

In accordance with the scheme framed by the Hon'ble Justice Sir Ashutosh Mukharji, KT., C.S.I., and accepted by the Senate on 6th August, 1921, for the use of the Khaira Fund, a Chair of Agriculture, named Guru Prosad Singh Professorship of Agriculture, has been established. The duty of the Professor shall be—

(*a*) to carry on original research in his subject with a view to extend the bounds of knowledge;

(*b*) to take steps to disseminate the knowledge of his special subject with a view to foster its study and application;

(*c*) to stimulate and guide research by advanced students and generally to assist in postgraduate work so as to secure the growth of real learning among our young men.

With a view to consider what steps may be taken up by the University to facilitate the introduction of scientific and vocational education in schools recognised by the University, a Conference of the Head Masters of recognised schools was held at the Senate House on the 7th May, 1921. Another Conference of the representatives of the Managing Committees of those schools was held on the 9th, 11th and the 12th June, 1921, for the same purpose. The proceedings of the Conference were placed before the Syndicate on 29th July, 1921, and the whole question has been referred to a joint meeting of the Faculties of Arts and Science.

Consumption of liquor.

144. Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state the quantity of liquor, both foreign and country-made, consumed last year in Bengal, except for medical purposes?

(*b*) What amount of revenue was derived last year by the Government on liquor, both as custom duties and as excise?

(*c*) What steps have been and are being taken by the Government to stop the consumption of the said liquors, except for medical purposes?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) 766,572 L.P. gallons of country spirit and 572,548 bulk gallons of foreign liquor were consumed during the year 1920-21. The latter figure is only approximate, as accurate statistics of the sale of such liquors are not yet available.

(*b*) Rs. 55,97,155 were realised as custom duties and Rs. 10,35,077 as duty on foreign liquor manufactured in this country and Rs. 74,44,563 as duty on country spirit during the year 1920-21. The

license fees derived from foreign liquor and country spirit were Rs. 3,22,358 and Rs. 15,52,750, respectively.

(*c*) No steps have been and are being taken by the Government to stop the consumption of liquor, but adequate steps are taken to restrict the consumption thereof.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: May I ask what steps have been taken to restrict the consumption of liquor?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: There are resolutions on this subject and I shall be pleased to reply to this question in that connection?

Promotion of Sub-Registrars.

145. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state what action, if any, has been taken with reference to his answer to clause (*j*) of my starred question No. XXIII in the meeting of this Council of the 1st April?

(*b*) Is it a fact that some Sub-Registrars who have passed the "Special Test" for a District Sub-Registrarship have applied for promotion to higher appointments?

(*c*) How have these applications been disposed of?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) The matter is under the consideration of Government

(*b*) The answer is in the affirmative.

(*c*) The applications could not be entertained as, under the existing rule, the passing of the special test does not entitle an officer to supersede another officer senior to him, if the latter is otherwise qualified.

Circle Officers, Department of Industries.

146. Maulvi A. H. M. WAZIR ALI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state what is the minimum qualification required for a Circle Officer, Department of Industries, Bengal?

(*b*) How many Circle Officers were appointed during the last six months, and how many of them are Muhammadans?

(*c*) If no Muhammadan has been appointed, why not?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) The minimum qualification required for a Circle Officer is a training in mechanical engineering or in services of general industrial application.

(*b*) Five Circle Officers were appointed in 1920. No such officer was appointed during the last six months. None of them are Muhammadans.

(*c*) None of the Muhammadan applicants for the posts of Circle Officers were considered to possess adequate qualifications.

"Tols" and "muktabs."

147. Raja MANILOLL SINGH ROY: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing:—

(*i*) the amount of expenditure incurred in each district on *muktabs* in the years 1919-20 and 1920-21; and

(*ii*) the amount contributed in each district on Sanskrit *tols* during the corresponding period?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*i*) and (*ii*) A statement is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 147, showing the amount of expenditure incurred in each district on "muktabs" in the years 1919-20 and 1920-21 and also the amount contributed in each district on Sanskrit "tols" in 1919-20 and 1920-21.

PRESIDENCY DIVISION.

DISTRICT.	1919-20				1920-21.			
	Provincial revenues	District Board funds.	Municipal funds.	Other sources (private)	Provincial revenues	District Board funds.	Municipal funds	Other sources (private).
Muktabs	Rs.	Rs.	Rs	Rs	Rs.	Rs	Rs	Rs.
Calcutta ...	15,794	Nil	8,352	27,970	15,248	Nil	8,637	30,109
24-Parganas ...	12,676	4,900	5,449	17,662	12,143	4,897	6,233	16,921
Nadia ...	9,388	8,017	714	5,660	9,961	8,026	781	5,292
Murshidabad...	6,658	5,641	654	9,365	6,816	4,730	558	11,722
Jessore ...	11,392	7,150	288	15,482	12,394	7,433	276	15,690
Khulna ...	12,528	8,309	264	14,037	13,091	8,261	420	13,034
Sanskrit tols								
Calcutta* ...	13,062	Nil	Nil	492	16,019	Nil	Nil	493
Do. † ...	4,249	Nil	1,160	66,050	2,404	Nil	1,319	47,209
24-Parganas ...	2,231	Nil	1,557	3,007	2,807	Nil	2,172	1,966
Nadia ...	10,190	Nil	216	5,170	10,766	Nil	216	4,274
Murshidabad ...	442	334	48	7,438	192	384	60	7,463
Jessore ...	328	924	180	1,341	388	974	180	700
Khulna ...	1,132	1,980	Nil	1,372	987	1,956	Nil	505

* For the titis and vedic classes, which constitute a part of the Sanskrit College, Calcutta.
† For other *tols*, which also impart collegiate (not primary) education.

BURDWAN DIVISION.

EXPENDITURE INCURRED ON MAKTABS DURING THE YEAR—

NAME OF DISTRICT	1919-20					1920-21				
	Provincial revenues.	District Fund	Municipality.	Private sources	Total	Provincial revenues.	District Fund	Municipality	Private sources.	Total.
	Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs	Rs	Rs
Burdwan	6,305	7,503	647	9,843	24,298	7,289	7,588	858	11,639	27,374
Birbhum	8,249	5,841	120	10,167	22,377	8,129	4,085	118	11,543	23,875
Bankura	556	554	114	981	2,205	895	613	84	1,051	2,643
Midnapore	9,788	3,579	309	12,639	26,315	9,175	4,602	506	13,301	27,584
Hooghly	4,810	3,302	633	12,380	21,125	3,805	3,704	732	13,520	21,761
Howrah	4,373	1,780	2,264	8,615	17,032	4,362	1,940	2,120	14,004	22,426

EXPENDITURE INCURRED ON SANSKRIT TOLS DURING THE YEAR—

NAME OF DISTRICT.	1919-20.					1920-21				
	Provincial revenues	District Fund	Municipality	Private sources.	Total.	Provincial revenues	District Fund.	Municipality	Private sources	Total
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs	Rs.	Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs.	Rs
Burdwan	552	1,920	60	9,924	12,456	548*	2,329	60	8,112	11,049
Birbhum ..	392	..	.	3,608	4,000	541	139	..	3,950	4,633
Bankura ..	397	94	96	7,182	7,769	262	94	96	1,488	1,940
Midnapore .	1,915	240	58	6,613	8,826	1,606	240	114	4,492	6,452
Hooghly ...	486	1,628	1,034	10,964	14,112	380	2,290	989	9,714	13,373
Howrah ...	40	55	1,540	..	1,635	48	115	1,662	1,026	2,851

DACCA DIVISION.

NAME OF DISTRICT.	EXPENDITURE INCURRED FOR MUKTABS.						EXPENDITURE INCURRED FOR TOLS.					
	Provincial revenues	Local Funds.	Municipal Funds.	Fees	Subscriptions and other sources	Total	Provincial revenues	Local Funds	Municipal Funds	Fees.	Subscriptions and other sources.	Total.
1919-20.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs.	Rs.	Rs	Rs.	Rs	Rs.	Rs.
Dacca	17,384	8,871	958	20,484	1,723	49,420	1,772	1,553	155	735	2,225	6,240
Mymensingh	25,508	19,498	713	35,127	3,217	84,063	519	2,093	300		6,020	8,932
Faridpur	15,720	14,798	144	22,264	1,561	55,487	148	328	36		..	512
Bakarganj	22,687	3,047		37,740	16,181	79,655	2,759	731	.	.	2,689	6,179
Total for the Division ...	82,299	46,214	1,815	115,615	22,682	268,625	5,198	4,705	491	735	10,734	21,863
1920-21												
Dacca	21,299	9,869	3,471	26,269	3,396	64,304	1,836	1,401	300	.	3,254	6,791
Mymensingh	38,836	23,908	911	24,524	4,745	92,924	492	2,013	324		6,070	8,905
Faridpur	21,253	8,282	236	22,606	4,153	56,530	388	462	36	...	505	1,391
Bakarganj	23,557	3,115	56	41,858	11,745	80,331	2,954	708		...	2,648	7,310
Total for the Division ...	104,945	45,174	4,674	115,257	24,039	294,089	5,670	4,590	660	...	13,477	24,397

CHITTAGONG DIVISION.

	Expenditure incurred in—	
	1919-20.	1920-21
	Rs.	Rs.
For *muktabs*—		
Tippera	75,735	93,626
Noakhali	54,666	62,737
Chittagong	45,283	56,321
For Sanskrit *tols*—		
Tippera	6,171	5,178
Noakhali	3,911	5,829
Chittagong	5,928	6,259

RAJSHAHI DIVISION.

District	Muktabs.		Tols.	
	1919-20	1920-21.	1919-20.	1920-21
	Rs	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Rajshahi ...	9,318	13,248	1,145	2,280
Dinajpur ...	12,531	19,470	2,832	1,560
Jalpaiguri° ...	5,259	7,412	.....	.....
Rangpur ...	27 225	31,871	1,673	1,268
Bogra ...	14,489	14,765	2,485	3,032
Pabna ...	30,909	34,954	2,498	2,990
Malda ...	16,956	19,132	436	448
Darjeeling° ...	1,472	2,133	.....	.....

° There are no *tols* in these districts.

"Added Members" in the Faculty of Medicine.

148. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether there is any provision for appointing "Added Members" by the different faculties of the Calcutta University and, if so, how many have been so appointed in the Faculty of Medicine since its creation as compared with the total number of such members in other faculties?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: Under section 5, Chapter III of the Regulations of the Calcutta University, the Faculties have power to elect Added Members. No Added Member was ever elected by the Faculty of Medicine since its creation.

The information regarding number of Added Members in the other Faculties is contained in the statement below.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 148, showing the number of Added Members elected by the different Faculties under Section 5, Chapter III of the Regulations.

YEAR.	NUMBER ELECTED BY THE FACULTY OF—				
	Arts.	Science.	Law.	Medicine.	Engineering.
1906-07 ...	Nil	1	4	Nil	1
1908 ...	Nil	5	2	Nil	2
1909 ...	3	5	4	Nil	3
1910 ...	4	4	4	Nil	2
1911 ...	3	Nil	1	Nil	1
1912 ...	3	2	3	Nil	Nil
1913 ...	9	6	3	Nil	3
1914 ...	1	3	Nil	Nil	1
1915 ...	1	6	2	Nil	2
1916 ...	Nil	8	3	Nil	3
1917 ...	Nil	5	Nil	Nil	Nil
1918 ...	Nil	5	4	Nil	Nil
1919 ...	2	7	7	Nil	3
1920 ...	1	1	6	Nil	2
1921 ...	Nil	2	6	Nil	2

NOTE.—When none of the nominees had secured a majority of the votes of the Fellows on the Faculty, no Added Members were elected to that Faculty.

Accommodation in colleges.

149. Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education aware

that a large number of students could not get admission into colleges in Bengal for want of accommodation?

(*b*) If so, what steps are the Government taking to meet the situation?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) Such evidence as has been obtained tends to show that this is not the case. The successful candidates at Matriculation this year were probably about 11,000. The maximum capacity of first year college classes in the province was 7,418 in 1919, the last year for which we have figures at hand, though it is known that this capacity has been increased. If circumstances were normal, it is probable that accommodation would be in slight defect. But a large number of colleges report a falling off in numbers in the college year just begun. Much of this is explained by the very late publication of the University Intermediate and Final results, and the strikes and other inconveniences of communication which prevented students from joining colleges at the proper time; but there is reason to believe that the accommodation available in the colleges will not be fully utilised.

(*b*) The question does not arise.

Service of processes in mufassal courts.

150. Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state whether he is aware—

(*i*) that processes in mufassal courts, especially in the civil courts, are often returned unserved;

(*ii*) that this has been put down as being due to the negligence of the process servers?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps to remedy this grievance?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: The member is referred to the answer given at this meeting to a starred question on the same subject asked by Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri.

Fish supply.

151. Mr. RAZAUR RAHMAN KHAN: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether he is aware of the progressive exhaustion of the sources of fresh fish supply in Bengal;

(*ii*) what steps are the Government taking to improve the fresh fish supply of Bengal?

(*b*) Is there any close season in the fish trade?

(*c*) In case there is no such close season, are the Government considering the desirability of fixing one, during the breeding season of the fresh water fishes and of penalising the capture of fishes during such season?

(*d*) If there is a close season, are the rules strictly enforced?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur : (*a*) (*i*) Yes, this is probably the fact owing to the gradual silting up of rivers and tanks and refers mainly to the river and jheel fisheries, but not to the estuarine and sea fisheries, which have hardly yet been tapped.

(*ii*) The Department of Fisheries is encouraging in every way possible the stocking of tanks with fry and systematic carp culture. The better management of tanks is advocated on all possible occasions. A survey of the fisheries is being made in the four districts where there are fishery officers, and fishermen are being encouraged to improve their methods by the opening of co-operative societies.

(*b*) No.

(*c*) The possibility of enforcing a close season has been considered by Government from time to time, but without any definite result.

(*d*) In view of the answer to (*b*) above the question does not arise.

Khasmahal Tahsildars of Faridpur.

152. Babu JOGENDRA KRISHNA ROY: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether the Government have received any representation from the khasmahal tahsildars of the district of Faridpur, praying for an increment to their salary? If so, has any action been taken yet? If not, do the Government propose to take any action in the matter soon?

(*ii*) whether the "collecting agency" referred to in the report of the McAlpin Committee include the khasmahal tahsildars;

(*iii*) whether the Government are aware of the fact that the khasmahal tahsildars of Eastern Bengal feel that they were unkindly treated by the late Eastern Bengal and Assam Government by the retrenchment of the amount drawn by them at the licensed rate of pay which was granted in 1910 to all the ministerial officers under the provisions of order No. 1738-86 F., dated the 27th March, 1911?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*i*) Yes. It is under the consideration of Government.

(*ii*) Yes.

(*iii*) The retrenchment was made in order to keep the cost within the prescribed limit of 6 per cent. Their pay has, however, since been raised.

Patuakhali Jail building.

153. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state whether the new sub-jail to be built at Patuakhali will be a two-storied building?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE (JAILS) (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): No; but the foundations are being built to take another story, if found necessary hereafter.

Touts and deed-writers in mufassal sub-registry offices.

154. Maulvi ABDUL KARIM: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education aware that there are touts and professional deed-writers in the offices of sub-registrars in the mufassal?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister also aware that these professional deed-writers very often write in combination and charge exorbitant rates from the registrants?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that these touts and professional deed-writers are not under the control of the sub-registrars or the Department?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of introducing a system of license with a table of fees for remuneration of the licensed deed-writers, as was done by the Eastern Bengal and Assam Government (*vide* their circular No 9 of the 8th October, 1910), or any other suitable system?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The deed-writers make their own terms with the clients who come to them to have their deeds drawn up and engrossed; and there is reason to believe that their terms are often exorbitant

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) The question of dealing with the deed-writers and touts who frequent registration offices is one of considerable difficulty. Some are unprincipled and fleece the registrants: on the other hand, it is necessary for registrants to employ persons who can write deeds, petitions and applications, make searches and take delivery of documents, the

registration of which has been completed. In order to prevent abuses the Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam in 1910 issued the orders referred to in the question, by which a certain number of deed-writers were licensed for each office and a scale of fees for their services was drawn up. This system, however, proved a failure and led to serious malpractices and corruption. It appeared that some sub-registrars and their staff took bribes from the licensed touts and that the latter made illegal exactions from registrants and defrauded Government of their legal dues. Orders were accordingly passed in 1912 that all existing licenses should be cancelled and that no licenses should be granted in future. It is not proposed to revive this system. Government will welcome any practical suggestions to prevent abuses of the kind referred to in the question.

Muhammadans in the Calcutta police.

155. Maulvi ABDUL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) the total number of appointments, and

(*ii*) the number held by Muhammadans in the Calcutta police as—

(1) assistant commissioner;

(2) inspector,

(3) sub-inspector;

(4) assistant sub-inspector?

(*b*) Is it a fact that recently a few new appointments have been made as inspectors in the Calcutta police?

(*c*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state how many of such appointments have been made, and how many of them have been given to Muhammadans?

(*d*) Is it a fact that recently a few junior sub-inspectors have been made inspectors, superseding certain senior officers?

(*e*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the names of the officers who have been so promoted, as well as the names of those who have been superseded?

MEMBER in charge of POLICE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) The figures are as follows:—

	Total number of appointments.	Number of appointments held by Muhammadans.
Assistant commissioner ...	13	Nil
Inspector	60	4
Sub-inspector	109	29
Assistant sub-inspector	145	42

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) Seventeen. The appointments were filled by the promotion of 14 experienced officers to hold charge of important sections, and of three specially trained officers for the Public Vehicles Department. Two of the appointments were filled by Muhammadan officers.

(*d*) and (*e*) The promotions were made according to seniority and selection, officers considered unfit for the post of inspector being superseded. It is not proposed to state the names of the officers so passed over and promoted.

Sergeants and sub-inspectors of police.

156. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state the status and the rank of a sub-inspector of police with reference to that of a sergeant?

(*b*) Have the Government decided whether the rank of a sergeant is equal or inferior to that of a sub-inspector of police?

(*c*) In case their positions are relatively equal, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state why a distinction has been made with regard to their pay?

(*d*) Is it a fact that the sergeants are given free kits, which are not given to the sub-inspectors?

(*e*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reason for this distinction?

(*f*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that there is great discontent amongst the sub-inspectors on account of the above differences, and also over the scale and rate of increment allowed by the time-scale pay?

(*g*) Are the Government considering the advisability of removing the distinction in pay with regard to the sub-inspectors and sergeants?

(*h*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table a copy of the memorial submitted by the sub-inspectors for their increment of pay, together with any order passed thereon?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) to (*e*) It is understood that the reference is to the Bengal police. The distinction between sergeants and sub-inspectors is in respect of the duties they perform. The duties of sub-inspectors relate mainly to the investigation and prosecution of cases, while sergeants are employed chiefly in training the armed police and in patrol work in towns and at important railway stations. The pay of these two classes is fixed in consideration of the qualifications required for these duties and the rate necessary to secure suitable candidates. Free kit is part of the remuneration given to sergeants. Sub-inspectors do not receive it, their pay and allowances having been fixed on the understanding that they pay for their own uniforms.

(*f*) Government are aware that sub-inspectors are not satisfied with the time-scale of pay and rate of increments recently sanctioned.

(*g*) No.

(*h*) A copy* of the memorial dated April, 1920, is laid on the library table.

Excise policy.

157. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether Government contemplate appointing a committee to inquire into their excise policy and administration, with a view to restricting consumption and of suggesting means for recuperating the loss of revenue therefrom?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: No. Government have recently issued a press *communiqué* detailing their excise policy, a copy* of which is placed on the library table.

Commercial Institute Board.

158. Mr. SYED ERFAN ALI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state who are at present on the Government Commercial Institute Board?

(*b*) Has there been any change of members since it was first constituted?

(*c*) How long has each member been serving on the Board?

(*d*) Are there any Muhammadan members on the Board? If not, why not?

(*e*) Is there any Muhammadan on the teaching staff of the Institution?

(*f*) How long has Babu Girindra Kumar Sen been acting as Principal of the Institution?

(*g*) Have the Government been advertising the vacancy in the permanent post of Principal?

(*h*) Have the Government considered the desirability of filling up the vacancy by the appointment to it of the present acting Principal?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) and (*b*) The member is referred to the answer given by the Hon'ble Minister to clauses (*d*) and (*e*) of question No. 205 asked by Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur at the Council meeting of the 4th July, 1921.

---

* Not printed in these proceedings.

(*c*) The respective periods of the service of the members named in clause (*d*) of the question referred to above are given below:

(1) Nine years.

(2) Eight years.

(3) Two years

(4) A few months.

(5) Five years.

(6) Eight years.

(7) Two months

(8) Recently appointed.

(9) Ten years.

(*d*) No. Four of the members are appointed *ex-officio*; two members are nominated by the Bengal Chamber of Commerce and one by the Bengal National Chamber of Commerce Thus there are only two vacancies available for free appointment. They are at present held by well-qualified gentlemen. Government, however, are considering the increase of the strength of the Board to 10 and to lay down the condition that a Muhammadan shall be appointed

(*e*) No, but a Muhammadan gentleman held one of the evening lectureships during several recent years.

(*f*) About ten years.

(*g*) No. But the permission of the Secretary of State has been asked for to advertise the post in this country if there is no prospect of an officer being recruited in England.

(*h*) Yes. But in view of proposed further developments in commercial education the recruitment of an officer possessing specially high European qualifications has been deemed to be necessary.

Subordinate Educational Service.

159. SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ: (*a*). Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether the pay of the officers of the Subordinate Educational Service is going to be increased?

(*b*) If so, when and on what plan?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) and (*b*) Reference is invited to the reply given on the 29th August last to starred question No. XIV asked by Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri.

Subordinate Educational Service.

160. Maulvi HAMID-UD-DIN KHAN: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether the Government have come to a final decision as regards the recommendations of the Wordsworth Committee?

(*b*) If so, how has it been decided to reorganise the Department in order to benefit the classes concerned?

(*c*) Have the minimum and maximum of the Subordinate Educational Service been fixed with an eye to those recently introduced in the other branches of Government service of a similar standing and status?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: Reference is invited to the reply given on the 29th August last to starred question No. XIV asked by Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri.

Munsifs' quarters at Patuakhali.

161. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether it is a fact that the compounds of the residences of gazetted officers, except those of Munsifs at Patuakhali, are enclosed by some sort of fencing;

(*ii*) if so, what is the reason for this differential treatment?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) (*i*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether it is intended to make provision in the next budget for enclosing the compounds of the Munsifs' residences by some sort of fencing?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing the total amount that was spent during the last five years for all sorts of repairs to Munsifs' residences at Patuakhali?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of PUBLIC WORKS (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (*a*) (*i*) Yes.

(*ii*) The necessity for fencing was not represented to Government and the omission is not confined to the compounds of Munsifs at Patuakhali.

(*b*) The answer is in the negative.

(*c*) A statement is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 161 (c), showing the expenditure on Munsifs' quarters at Patuakhali for the last five years.

(1) MUNSIFS' QUARTERS No. I.

		Rs
1916-17	...	130
1917-18	...	80
1918-19	...	608
1919-20	...	82
1920-21	...	104
	Total ...	1,010

(2) MUNSIFS' QUARTERS No II.

1916-17	...	141
1917-18	...	159
1918 19	...	610
1919 20	...	147
1920-21	...	129
	Total ...	1,186

(3) MUNSIFS' QUARTERS No. III.

1916-17	...	172
1917-18	...	167
1918-19	...	473
1919-20	...	107
1920-21	...	133
	Total ...	1,052

(4) MUNSIFS' QUARTERS No. IV.

1916 17	...	389
1917 '8	...	367
1918-19	...	363
1919 20	...	173
1920-21	...	105
	Total ...	1,397

Recommendations of the Jail Committee.

162. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) in a position to state approximately the amount of recurring and non-recurring expenditure that will be necessary for the purpose of giving effect to the different recommendations of the Jails Committee?

(*b*) Have the Government formulated any scheme for giving effect to the recommendations of the Jails Committee in order of their urgency?

(*c*) If so, what specific recommendations do they propose to carry out during the current year?

(*d*) What is the number of prisoners, male and female, respectively, belonging to Bengal, who are at present serving out their term in the Andamans?

(*e*) In regard to the female prisoners, what action has been taken for bringing them back to India, as recommended by the Jails Committee in paragraph 572 of their report?

(*f*) What policy do Government propose to adopt in regard to the male prisoners at present in the Andamans?

(*g*) Have any prisoners been deported there from Bengal since the publication of the report of the Jails Committee?

(*h*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the Government of Madras have passed orders that no more deportation of prisoners should take place to the Andamans, that the male prisoners already there are to be brought back in the course of the next ten years, and that the female prisoners are to be brought back at once?

(*i*) Is the Hon'ble the Member also aware that the Government of the Central Provinces are also taking measures in these matters?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) No, it is impossible to state what would be the total cost of giving effect to all the recommendations of the Committee.

(*b*) The order of urgency is affected by financial considerations. Government are endeavouring to give early effect to recommendations accepted by the Government of India or the local Government which do not involve large expenditure. Other recommendations must await the provision of funds.

(*c*) Action has already been taken in the following matters:—

Paragraph 63, recommendation No. 54 in Chapter XXIII of the Committee's report.—The pay of the warders has been raised from Rs. 16 rising to Rs. 19 to Rs. 16 rising to Rs. 20. Sanction has also been given to the supply to each warder, free of charge, of a pair of *dhotis* (*saris* in the case of female warders) every year.

Paragraph 279, recommendation No. 221 in Chapter XXIII of the Committee's report.—Superintendents of jails have been instructed to appoint voluntary preachers to impart religious instruction to Muhammadan prisoners.

Paragraph 285, recommendation No. 225 in Chapter XXIII of the Committee's report.—Orders have been issued to provide every male Muhammadan prisoner with longer trousers, as recommended by the Committee.

Paragraph 287, recommendation No. 226 in Chapter XXIII of the Committee's report.—Sikh prisoners have been allowed to retain their religious symbols and are given soap or soap-nut and oil once a week.

Other changes in accordance with the Committee's recommendations have been made or are likely soon to be made under the orders of the Government of India.

(*d*) Exact figures are not available, but it may be assumed that the normal number of convicts from Bengal is 950, of whom 2 per cent. are females.

(*e*) The Chief Commissioner, Andaman and Nicobar Islands, is taking action for the retransfer of female convicts from Port Blair to jails in their provinces in India.

(*f*) It has been decided that lepers, lunatics, phthisical cases and those convicts whose health renders it inadvisable for them to remain in the Andamans will have the first claim for retransfer to India, and action is being taken in this direction. Other convicts will be brought back to India as soon as accommodation can be provided for them.

(*g*) No.

(*h*) and (*i*) No; but it is presumed that all local Governments are taking action on the recommendations of the Indian Jails Committee.

Fencing on the sides of Bengal-Nagpur Railway.

163. Babu DEVENDRA LAL KHAN: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works aware:—

(*i*) that no fence is provided on either side of the Bengal-Nagpur Railway;

(*ii*) that in consequence thereof very often serious accidents occur, especially to animals?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the Government contemplate drawing the attention of the said Railway authorities to the necessity of arranging for such fencing?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) (*i*) and (*ii*) The answer is in the negative.

(*b*) The question is one which should be put in one of the Chambers of the Central Legislature.

Income-tax.

164. Mr. AJOY CHUNDER DUTT: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state—

(*a*) what amount of income-tax was derived from Bengal last year;

(*b*) what amount of the said tax was derived from within the municipal limits of Calcutta; and

(*c*) the number of persons who paid the said tax within the aforesaid limits?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) Rs. 4,39,30,978.

(*b*) Rs. 3,46,08,056.

(*c*) 19,229.

The above figures of collections (*a*) and (*b*) show the total collections made, and include realizations on account of branch firms and business concerns situated, in some instances, outside the province. The figure against (*c*) does not include the number of persons from whose salaries income-tax is deducted by the Accountant-General, Bengal, as this figure is not available.

Proposed reserves in the Western Duars.

165. Mr. PRASANNA DEB RAIKAT: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Government have acquired, or have surveyed for acquisition, several plots of jote lands and khas grazing blocks in the Western Duars in the district of Jalpaiguri, especially near Jhar Asthagram, for the purpose of reserved forests?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the number of holdings that have been, or are proposed to be acquired?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether any, and if so, what, compensation is to be made to the present tenants of these lands?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) Proposals have been received for the reservation of certain areas in the Western Duars in order to prevent erosion along the banks of the Torsa, Raidak and Jaldhaka rivers. Notifications under section 4 of the Forest Act have been issued, and objections, if received, will be duly considered.

(*b*) In the Raidak Reserve it is proposed to include 59 acres of precarious cultivation in five jotes. A strip of uncultivated and barren land along the edge of the three other jotes is also included. Exact

areas are not yet available. In the Torsa Reserve, as the proposal at present stands, eleven jotes in taluk Khairbari will each lose a negligible strip of waste land along the river bank. Besides these, only five jotes are affected, three in Parangarpar and two in Salkumar East. In the Ramshahi Reserve on the Jaldhaka river, 37 jotes and two tea gardens are affected

In eight jotes the area, which is being taken up, has been entirely washed away by the river and now consist of stony river bed.

(*e*) Tenants in the Western Duars hold their lands subject to the condition that the land will be given up free of cost, when required for a public purpose. They are entitled only to compensation for houses, trees and other improvements on the land. According to the estimate, the amounts payable vary from Rs. 23 up to Rs. 2,825.

Cadre of deputy superintendents of police.

166. Maulvi A. K. FAZL-UL HAQ: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state what is the present strength of the cadre of the deputy superintendents in Bengal?

(*b*) When was this strength of the cadre fixed?

(*c*) Did the Public Services Commission recommend that the Provincial Police Service should be developed, and that there should be no hesitation in adding to the cadre to meet administrative requirements?

(*d*) How many officers have since been added to the cadre?

(*e*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware of the discontent amongst the deputy superintendents of police in connection with the revised scale of pay?

(*f*) Is it a fact that the pay of the deputy superintendents is the lowest amongst all the Provincial Services with regard to their maximum and minimum pay as well as the rate of increment?

(*g*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reason for this distinction?

(*h*) Is it a fact that the deputy superintendents submitted a memorial to the Secretary of State about a year ago for improvement of their pay and prospects and protesting against the treatment accorded to their service?

(*i*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay a copy of the memorial and also the recommendations made by the Government on the table?

(*j*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to say what orders, if any, have been passed by the Secretary of State on the memorial?

(*k*) If no orders have been received, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state at what stage they are pending and what attempts are being made to get early orders on the same?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) The cadre of deputy superintendents at present consists of 28 permanent and two temporary posts.

(*b*) and (*d*) It was fixed at 24 at the time of the constitution of the Presidency in 1912: six posts have since been added.

(*c*) Yes.

(*e*) Representations on the subject have been received from officers of this service.

(*f*) and (*g*) It is difficult to make a full comparison of the rates of pay for the several Provincial Services, as their conditions differ. Looking at the one matter of pay only the answer is in the affirmative.

(*h*) Yes.

(*i*) and (*j*) A copy* of the memorial is laid on the library table. The local Government do not propose to publish the subsequent correspondence.

(*k*) Orders have been received from the Government of India on the memorials in question, and the action to be taken thereon is under the consideration of the local Government.

Murder of, and injury to, raiyats in Rangpur.

167. Rai Sahib PANCHANAN BARMA: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department aware of the following deaths of three raiyats, and outrages upon others, within the jurisdiction of two police-stations in the district of Rangpur in the course of three months beginning from April last:—

(*i*) of the death in April last of Bani Sekh, a raiyat of the village of Isorkol, within the jurisdiction of the police-station of Kaliganj;

(*ii*) of the attack in May last upon the house and family of Ader and Sader, two brothers, raiyats of the village of Dharmapal, within the jurisdiction of the police-station of Jaldhaka;

causing in the course of the attack—

(*1*) the death of a son of Ader or Sader;

(*2*) serious injury to the bodies and properties of Ader and Sader; and

(*3*) outrage and serious injury to an old woman of the family?

(*b*) In connection with the occurrences stated in the preceding question, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what steps are being taken to bring the offenders to justice?

* Not printed in these proceedings.

(*c*) What steps are being taken to remove the feeling of unsafety and helplessness of the people in the area caused by these and other similar occurrences?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) Government are not aware of the facts; inquiry is being made.

Calcutta Electric License.

168. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Commerce aware that the Corporation of Calcutta has recommended to the Government that the extension of the periods of contract from 10 years to 20 years, as asked for by the Calcutta Electric Supply Corporation, be not granted?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether the Government have accepted the said recommendation?

(*c*) If the said recommendation of the Corporation has not been accepted by the Government, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether the Government have acceded to the request of the Calcutta Electric Supply Corporation to extend the period from 10 to 20 years?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of COMMERCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) The Corporation of Calcutta has recommended that a general extension of the period from 10 to 20 years should not be granted and Government have accepted this recommendation. The Corporation of Calcutta have, however, proposed that the existing option which falls due in 1928 should be extended to 1938, provided the Electric Supply Corporation agree to certain conditions. Government have asked for the views of the Electric Supply Corporation on these conditions and will await their reply before coming to a decision as to the extension of the existing period of the contract.

Closing of drainage cuts in Bhagwangola.

169. Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to lay on the table the report of the officers concerned, deputed under Government order, to ascertain whether the practice to close the drainage cuts by the villagers to protect their *aus* paddy be stopped or not, in the area of the Bhagwangola thana in the Murshidabad district, in connection with the answer given by the Hon'ble the Member to my question No. 25 at the meeting of the Council of 28th February, 1921?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of IRRIGATION (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): The drainage conditions of the locality are under observation and a preliminary report has been received lately. It is not proposed to lay the report on the table.

Black Hole Memorial.

170. Mr. RAZAUR RAHMAN KHAN: Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department considering the desirability of removing the present Black Hole Memorial monument?

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): The reply is in the negative.

Expenditure: "35.—Industries."

171. Mr. S. M. BOSE: With reference to the supplementary grant of Rs. 1,06,200 made without discussion on the 15th July last under the head "35.—Industries," will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to make a statement showing the necessity for the expenditure?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: The grant which is made from year to year was required for payment of grants-in-aid to technical schools. The items of expenditure covered by the amount are:—

	Rs.
(1) Maintenance grants for special technical and industrial schools	73,700
(2) Maintenance grants for miscellaneous schools ...	11,000
(3) Building grants for special technical and industrial schools	15,000
(4) Furniture grants for special technical and industrial schools	1,500
(5) Other grants for encouragement of scientific and industrial education	5,000
Total ...	1,06,200

This sum, which used to be provided in the Education Department budget, should have been included in the estimates of the Industries Department owing to the transfer of technical education to the control of the latter, but through oversight this was not done when the budget estimates for the current year were being prepared.

Listed posts for members of Bengal Provincial Civil Service.

172. Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state—

(*1*) the date from which effect is going to be given to the increased rate of pay sanctioned by the Secretary of State for the members of the Bengal Provincial Civil Service holding listed appointments;

(2) what provision has been made in the current year's budget for the amount which will be required for allowing the above increment;

(3) if no provision has yet been made, when is the demand for an additional grant for the above purpose going to be made in the Council;

(4) from what date can the officers expect to draw their pay at the increased rate?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (1) Effect will be given to the increased rate from the 1st December, 1919 (*vide* Home Department resolution No. 1053, dated the 5th May, 1921).

(2) and (3) No provision has been made in the current year's budget for the increased expenditure involved, but it will be met by reappropriation within the grant voted by the Council under the head "V.—Land Revenue—Charges of District Administration," to which head the expenditure is debitable.

(4) The orders of Government have been communicated to the Accountant-General, Bengal, who will now issue the necessary salary slips

Teachers in secondary high schools.

173. Babu HEM CHANDRA NASKER: (a) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education been drawn to the resolution passed at the teachers' conference held at Gaibandha under the presidency of Sir P. C. Roy?

(b) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware of the distress of the teachers in secondary high schools in Bengal, aided and unaided, on account of inadequate salaries?

(c) Has the Wordsworth Committee recommended anything for the aided and unaided secondary school teachers?

(d) Does the Hon'ble the Minister propose to allot any sum for private secondary school teachers?

(e) If so, when, and how much?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (a) No.

(b) Yes.

(c) The Committee's reference was limited to teachers in Government service.

(d) and (e) Government does what is possible by grants-in-aid, but the financial condition of the province prevents any further action in this direction at present.

Ministerial officers of Settlement Department.

174. Mr. RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to

state whether the ministerial officers of the Settlement Department are transferred by the Director of Land Records from a closing settlement to a new operation; or is it at the discretion of the Settlement Officers to select their own staffs as they choose?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that sometimes raw hands are taken in, in preference to experienced hands already serving in another settlement?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) Under rule 140 of the Survey and Settlement Manual, the Director of Land Records sanctions the appointment of ministerial officers with a pay exceeding Rs. 50 per mensem, and Settlement Officers sanction appointments below this pay.

Sometimes in the case of a new settlement the Settlement Officer is selected before the time comes to appoint the ministerial staff. In that case he makes his own selections from the list of old hands who are available in consultation with the Director of Land Records. In other cases the Director of Land Records has made preliminary appointments direct.

(*b*) The Director of Land Records knows of only one case in recent years, where a man with no previous settlement experience was appointed to a superior ministerial post. The appointment was made with great reluctance on the ground that none of the closing settlements could at the time provide a man with the necessary qualifications.

Public dairies and milk supplies.

175. Babu SARAT CHANDRA JANAH: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether the Government have considered the desirability of amending the Bengal Municipal Act and the Calcutta Municipal Act so as to give wide powers of supervision and control over public dairies and milk supplies in the mufassal towns and in Calcutta?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state when the Bills for these amendments are likely to come up before the Council?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): (*a*) Necessary provisions have been incorporated in the Calcutta Municipal Amendment Bill. The question of amending the Bengal Municipal Act, on similar lines is also under the consideration of Government, and the opinions of the mufassal municipalities have been invited on the proposal.

(*b*) It is proposed to introduce the Calcutta Municipal Amendment Bill in the November session of the Council. Government are not at present in a position to state when a Bill to amend the Bengal Municipal Act will be introduced.

Nurses of the Medical College Hospital.

176. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state, of the 21 Indian nurses employed in the Eden Hospital, how many are pupil nurses; and how many of the rest can speak and understand Bengali?

(*b*) What is the average number of patients per nurse in the—

(*i*) European; and

(*ii*) Bengali wards,

respectively?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware of the shortage of nurses at the Medical College Hospital?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) There are 16 pupil nurses. It is reported that all the rest speak and understand Bengali.

(*b*) The Eden Hospital with 105 beds has an establishment of 66 nurses, of whom 33 are allotted to the European wards (45 beds) and 33 to the Indian wards (60 beds). The duties connected with the care of the larger number of patients in the Indian wards are, however, generally so heavy that some of the nurses are frequently taken away from the European wards and employed for duty with Indian patients.

(*c*) The Superintendent, Medical College Hospitals, is making an inquiry into the nursing resources and requirements of the hospitals under him and the matter will be considered by Government on receipt of his report.

Public Health Department.

177. Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement of the staff employed in the Public Health Department drawing pay of more than Rs. 250 per month, showing—

(*i*) their names;

(*ii*) the period of their service in the department;

(*iii*) which of them are in the permanent list and which in the temporary list;

(*iv*) the nature of their work; and

(*v*) how many of them can deliver lectures in Bengali, and what are their names?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: A statement is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 177.

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH, BENGAL.

Rank and name.	Appointment	Period of service in the Department.	Whether permanent or temporary.	Nature of work.	Whether can deliver lectures in Bengali.
Dr. Charles Albert Bentley, M.B., D.P.H., D.T.M. & H.	Substantive *pro tempore* Director of Public Health, Bengal, with effect from 9th November, 1915, and substantively from 29th May, 1917. *Ex-officio* Joint Secretary to the Sanitary Board and Professor of Hygiene, Calcutta Medical College (On privilege leave for six months from 21st April, 1921.)	(8th May, 1911) 10 years 3 months.	Substantive ...	See column 2 ...	No.
Lt.-Col. Arthur Brownfield Fry, C.I.E., D.S.O., M.D., D.P.H., D.T.M. & H., I.M.S.	Special Assistant Director of Public Health for Malaria Research, Bengal.	On deputation as Officiating Public Health Commissioner with the Government of India from 1st February, 1921.			
Dr. Ratanshaw Bomanji Khambata, M.R.C.S., L.R.C.P., D.P.H.	Substantive *pro tempore* Special Assistant Director of Public Health, Malaria Research, Bengal, from 28th June, 1919. (Officiating Director of Public Health, Bengal.)	(18th January 1913.) 8 years 8 months.	Permanent ..	See column 2 ...	No.

Dr. Muhammad Ibrahim Sufi, B.A., L.R.C.P. & S., L.R.F.P.S., D.P.H.	Assistant Director of Public Health, Dacca Circle.	(7th April, 1913.) 8 years 4 months.	Permanent ...	See column 2 ...	No.
Dr. Bipin Bihari Brahmachari, L.M.S., D.P.H.	Substantive *pro tempore* Assistant Director of Public Health, Presidency Circle, Bengal, Calcutta.	(4th May, 1916.) 5 years 4 months.	Temporary ...	Do. ...	Yes.
Dr. Syama Prasanna Gupta, L.M.S., D.P.H.	Substantive *pro tempore* Assistant Director of Public Health, on special duty, Anti-Hookworm Campaign, Rural Areas, 4th March, 1919.	(14th December, 1916.) 4 years 8 months	Do ...	Do. ...	Yes.
Dr. Sachindra Nath Sur, M.B., D.P.H., D.T.M.	Substantive *pro tempore* Assistant Director of Public Health, on special duty, Kala-azar Inquiry, 3rd June 1919	(18th December, 1916.) 4 years 8 months.	Do. ...	Do ...	Yes.
Dr. Rajendra Chandra Ray, L.M.S., D.P.H.	Officiating Assistant Director of Public Health, Burdwan Circle, 16th July, 1919.	(19th March, 1919.) 2 years 4 months	Do. ...	Do. ...	Yes
Dr. Sourendra Mohan Ghosh, M.R.C.S., L.R.C.P., D.P.H.	Officiating Assistant Director of Public Health, Rajshahi Circle.	(28th November, 1919.) 1 year 9 months	Do. ...	Do. ...	Yes.
Dr. Giridhari Lal Batra, M.B., Ch.B., D.P.H.	Special Officer, Calcutta and Chittagong Port Stegomyia Investigation	(24th March, 1919.) 2 years 5 months	Do. ...	Do. ...	No.

Rank and name.	Appointment.	Period of service in the Department	Whether permanent or temporary	Nature of work	Whether can deliver lectures in Bengali
Dr. Satyendra Nath Mitra, M.B., Ch.B., D.P.H.	Assistant Director of Public Health, School Hygiene.	(13th September, 1920.) 11 months.	Temporary ...	See column 2 ...	Yes.
Dr. Rachel Nathan Cohen, M.B., F.R.C.S.	Medical Inspectress of Girls' Schools.	(12th October, 1920.) 10 months.	Do. ...	Do. ...	No.
Dr. Cecil Henry Elmes, C.B.E., M.B., Ch.B.	Health Officer, Port of Calcutta (On continued leave for 5 months and 15 days from 21st July, 1921.)	(1st March, 1918.) 3 years 6 months.	Permanent ...	Do. ...	No.
Dr. J. B. McVail, M.R.C.S., L.R.C.P. (Offg.)	Ditto ...	.....	Temporary ...	Do. ...	No.
Military Assistant Surgeon Alfred Holehouse.	Assistant Health Officer, Port of Calcutta.	(12th February, 1920.) 1 year 7 months.	Permanent ...	Do. ...	No.
Civil Assistant Surgeon Manindra Nath Bhattacharji, L.M.S.	Second Assistant Health Officer, Port of Calcutta.	(3rd December 1901.) 19 years 9 months.	Do. ...	Do. ...	Yes.
Dr. Upendra Nath Ray, M.B., D.P.H.	Third Assistant Health Officer, Port of Calcutta.	(1st May, 1921.) 4 months.	Do. ...	Do. ...	Yes.
Temporary Assistant Surgeon Rash Bihari Dutta, M.B.	Health Officer, Port of Chittagong.	(6th September, 1920.) 1 year.	Temporary ...	Do. ...	Yes.

Temporary Assistant Surgeon Murari Mohan Basu, M.B.	Health Officer, Port of Chittagong.	(20th September, 1919.) 2 years.	Do. ...	Do ...	Yes.
Temporary Assistant Surgeon Haripada Sarkar.	Ditto ...	(1st May, 1920.) 1 year 4 months	Do. ...	Do. ...	Yes.
Temporary Assistant Surgeon Banamali Ghosh, M.B.	Ditto ...	(1st May, 1921.) 4 months	Do. ...	Do. ...	Yes.
Temporary Assistant Surgeon Jyotirmoy Banarji, M.B.	Assistant to Assistant Director of Public Health, School Hygiene.	(27th September, 1920.) 11 months	Do ...	Do. ...	Yes.
Civil Assistant Surgeon Mahendra Kumar Chakravarti, M.B.	Superintendent, Bengal Vaccine Depot, Calcutta.	(27th August, 1902.) 19 years	Permanent ...	Do. ...	Yes.
Rao Saheb Vellore Govinda Raju Mudahar, B.A.	First Bacteriologist, Bengal Public Health Laboratory	(7th July, 1910.) 11 years 1 month	Do ...	Do. ...	No.
Rai Sahib Surendra Nath Dey, B.A., F.C.S.	First Chemist, Bengal Public Health Laboratory and Public Analyst for Bengal	(1st August, 1910.) 11 years	Do. ...	Do. ...	Yes
John Dallas (Marine Engineer)	Inspector of Septic Tank Installations, Bengal.	(2nd April 1909.) 12 years 5 months	Do ...	Do ..	No.
Miss J. F. Mackintosh ...	Special Lady Assistant for Publicity Work	(1st August, 192[illegible]) 1 year 1 month.	Temporary ...	Do. ...	No.

Rank and name.	Appointment	Period of service in the Department.	Whether permanent or temporary.	Nature of work.	Whether can deliver lectures in Bengali
Kali Prasanna Ray, M.A., B.L.	Demonstrator, Travelling Public Health Laboratory.	(1st April, 1913.) 8 years 5 months.	Permanent ...	See column 2 ...	Yes.
Dr. Sarat Chandra Das Gupta, M.B.	Entomologist, Stegomiya Survey.	(1st September, 1920) 1 year.	Temporary ...	Do ...	Yes.
Dr. Manoranjan Chakrabartti, M.B	Assistant Surgeon, Sonarpur Malaria Observatory.	(1st May, 1921.) 4 months	Do ...	Do. ...	Yes.

Statement of staff in the Public Health Department, Engineering Branch drawing more than Rs. 250.

Name	Period of service in the Department.	Permanent or temporary	Nature of work.	Whether can deliver lectures in Bengali.
G. B. Williams	12 years 6 months	Permanent ...	Designing, preparing and executing sanitary engineering schemes	Lectures in Bengali are not required in the Engineering Branch, Public Health Department.
F. C. Griffin *	7 years 10 months	Service under agreement.	Ditto	
W. J. Berry ..	1 year 11 months	Temporary ..	Ditto	
S. N. Ghosh	2 years 9 months	Do ...	Ditto	
A. Webster †	10 months ..	Do ..	Ditto	
K. C. Banerjee	16 years ...	Permanent ...	Ditto	
P. L. Sen	10 years 4 months	Do ...	Ditto	

* On leave for 20 months from 21st February, 1921.

† Acting.

Veterinary assistants.

178. Babu SATISH CHANDRA MUKHARJI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to say whether the Government are considering the desirability of increasing the pay of veterinary assistants, as in the case of the pay of sub-inspectors of police, sub-inspectors of excise, sub-assistant surgeons and sub-inspectors of schools?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware of the complaint of the veterinary assistants that they suffer much owing to the absence or inadequacy of quarters?

(*c*) If so, are the Government taking any action in the matter?

(*d*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Minister been drawn to another complaint that the scale of travelling allowances to these officers is at present insufficient?

(*e*) If so, are the Government taking any steps to readjust the same?

(*f*) Are the veterinary assistants allowed any cycle or house allowance?

(*g*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that these officers are required to make long journeys in the interior and much of their time is lost by travelling on foot?

(*h*) Are the Government considering the desirability of issuing orders insisting on each such officer keeping a cycle, and of providing him with a suitable allowance for the same?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) The matter is under consideration.

(*d*) Yes.

(*e*) The matter is under consideration.

(*f*) The stationary veterinary assistants, and the itinerant veterinary assistant in Darjeeling and elsewhere, if, in charge of a dispensary, get a house allowance of Rs. 5 a month or free quarters. No cycle allowance is allowed.

(*g*) No.

(*h*) No.

Location of liquor shops.

179. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the rule regulating the location of a liquor shop is not observed in practice, and that, as a matter of fact, it is broken in about 75 per cent. of locations?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: The rule is rarely violated.

Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: In how many instances has the rule been violated in the present year and under what circumstances?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: I am not in a position just now to reply to this question. I should like to have fresh notice of it.

Platforms and overhead bridges on certain stations on the Eastern Bengal Railway (Murshidabad section).

180. Maharaja KSHAUNISH CHANDRA ROY Bahadur: (*a*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works been drawn to the great inconvenience felt by the passengers, especially the females, on account of the absence of an island platform and overhead bridge at Krishnagar city station and Beldanga station on the Eastern Bengal Railway (Murshidabad branch) where the up and down trains meet?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister considering the desirability of moving the railway authorities to take early steps to construct such island platforms and overhead bridges at this station?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) No.

(*b*) Government will bring the matter to the notice of the authorities of the Eastern Bengal Railway administration.

Expenditure: " 33.—Public Health."

181. Mr. S. M. BOSE: With reference to the supplementary grant of Rs. 80,000 made without discussion on the 15th July last, under head " 33—Public Health," will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to make a statement showing the necessity for the expenditure?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: A supplementary grant of Rs. 80,000 was not made, but that sum, which was included in the sums already voted by the Council, was transferred from the head " 33—Public Health " to the head " 42—Waterways and Embankments—Public Works Department," so that it might be available for expenditure by the Irrigation Department, which executes anti-malarial drainage schemes and makes surveys of them for the Public Health Department. Of the total of Rs. 80,000, the sum of Rs. 15,000 is required for expenditure on surveys and Rs. 65,000 for expenditure on the Arapanch drainage scheme. This scheme provides for the drainage of the Arapanch basin, a waterlogged area of about 30 square miles in the 24-Parganas. The work is estimated to cost altogether Rs. 1,10,000 and is being carried out at the entire cost of Government.

Muhammadans on the Dacca University staff.

182. Khan Bahadur Maulvi HAFIZAR RAHMAN CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state the number of Muhammadan officers, professors, lecturers, etc., who served in the Dacca College before the Dacca University came into existence?

(*b*) What monthly salary did each of them draw, and in what capacity?

(*c*) How many of them have been provided for in the Dacca University; in what posts, and with what salaries?

(*d*) What do the Government propose to do for the others?

(*e*) Is it a fact that the services of some lecturers are to be dispensed with; if so, why?

(*f*) Are the Government considering the desirability of providing for those whose services have not been retained for the University?

(*g*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing—

(*i*) the number of posts carrying a salary of Rs. 100 and upwards sanctioned for the Dacca University;

(*ii*) how many of such posts have been filled up by Muhammadans;

(*iii*) the reason why more posts have not been given to them?

(*h*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to indicate what special privileges, if any, are proposed to be provided for the Muhammadan community (students, professors and officers) in the Dacca University?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) Particulars are given in list (A) below.

(*d*) and (*f*) Government are not able to give information about the future of the clerk on Rs. 15—1—20 and the compounder on Rs. 15—1—20.

(*e*) It is not a fact.

(*g*) (*i*) (*ii*) A statement (B) compiled from the latest information that Government has, is laid on the table.

(*iii*) Government are informed by the Vice-Chancellor that few applications have been received from qualified Muhammadan candidates.

(*h*) Attention is invited to His Excellency the Chancellor's reply to a deputation of the District Muslim Association on August 16th, who placed before him representations regarding the University. The reply has been published in the newspapers.

List (A) referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 182 (a), (b) and (c).

In Bengal Educational Service—

1.	Pay Rs 500 ...	Professor of Arabic and Persian.	Provided for elsewhere by Government.
2.	" " 460 ...	Ditto ...	Reader in Persian and Urdu, Dacca University, Rs. 460

In Subordinate Educational Service—

3.	Pay Rs 150 ...	Lecturer in Arabic and Persian.	Provided for elsewhere by Government.

In Lower Subordinate Educational Service—

4.	Pay Rs. 15—1—20 ...	Clerk	
5.	" " 35—2—45 ...	Gymnastic teacher ...	Provided for elsewhere by Government.

Outside the grades—

6.	Pay Rs. 15—1—20 ...	Compounder.

Statement B referred to in the reply to clauses (g) (i) and (ii) of unstarred question No. 182, showing posts in Dacca University carrying a salary of Rs. 100 and upwards.

1 Vice Chancellor.
1 Librarian.
3 Provosts of the Halls (1 Muhammadan)
1 Registrar (Muhammadan).
1 Steward.
1 Sub-Librarian (Muhammadan).
1 Personal Assistant to Vice-Chancellor.
1 Stenographer to Vice-Chancellor
1 Head Accountant.
1 Head Assistant (Muhammadan).
1 Stenographer.
1 Medical Officer.
9 Professors (1 Muhammadan).
19 Readers (3 Muhammadans).
32 Lecturers (6 Muhammadans).
15 Assistants (1 Muhammadan).
9 Demonstrators (1 Muhammadan).

Calcutta University Accounts.

183. Babu HEM CHANDRA NASKER: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to lay on the table the abstract accounts of the Calcutta University for the years 1918—20, as audited by the Government auditor, with the auditor's report on the same?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: A copy of the accounts for the year 1918-19 was laid on the table in reply to a question asked at the meeting of July 4th, 1921. No later accounts have been received from the University.

Classical teachers.

184. SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to say why, under notification No. 229 A., dated the 11th March, 1920, which last sanctioned promotions to the Subordinate Educational Service, some classical teachers were not taken into that service?

(*b*) Was it not the intention of Government to take in all classical teachers into the Subordinate Educational Service?

(*c*) Is it a fact that in some of the schools where there are two maulvis both teaching classical subjects, such as Arabic and Persian, one has been placed in the Subordinate Educational Service and the other in the Vernacular Teachership Service?

(*d*) If the answer to clause (*c*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the reasons for this differential treatment?

(*e*) Is it a fact that the second pandits are holders of Vernacular Teachership Certificates and they teach Bengali, classes III to VIII, generally?

(*f*) Is it a fact that the maulvis who have been placed in the Vernacular Teachership Service are compared with the second pandits?

(*g*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the reasons why some of the maulvis who do not teach vernacular subjects nor hold vernacular diplomas, are in the same category as second pandits?

(*h*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the reasons for promoting the maulvis of the Chittagong and Dacca Moslem High English Schools and of the Anglo-Persian Department of the Calcutta Madrasah to the Subordinate Educational Service?

(*i*) What is the reason why the cases of many senior and able maulvis were left out and many junior men were taken into the Subordinate Educational Service?

(*j*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) why recently six maulvis, ten second pandits and nine drill and drawing masters (all the 25 belonging to the Vernacular Teachership Service) have been enlisted for the Subordinate Educational Service;

(*ii*) why the four maulvis of the Pabna, Malda, Rangpur and Rajshahi Government Schools have not been so enlisted?

(*k*) Are the Government considering the desirability of placing all the maulvis mentioned in (*j*) (*i*) and (*ii*) in the Subordinate Educational Service in order of their seniority?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) Except in the cases of the Hare, Hindu and Sanskrit Collegiate Schools, the Anglo-Persian Department of the Calcutta Madrasah and the two Moslem high schools at Dacca and Chittagong, the secondary education scheme, so far as it related to classical teachers, provided posts in the Subordinate Educational Service only for head pandits and head maulvis in high schools. Accordingly, only the head pandits and head maulvis were promoted to the Subordinate Educational Service when the scheme was given effect to, all other classical teachers being included in the Vernacular Teachers' Service.

(*b*) No.

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) A reference is invited to the answer given to clause (*a*) above.

(*e*) This is not invariably true. There are cases in which junior pandits are holders of Sanskrit Title Examination Certificates and teach Sanskrit.

(*f*) Yes.

(*g*) A reference is invited to answer given to clause (*a*) above.

(*h*) The Moslem High Schools at Chittagong and Dacca each received two posts in the Subordinate Educational Service for maulvis and the Anglo-Persian Department of the Calcutta Madrasah three such posts, partly because of their special importance and partly because of their special requirements as communal institutions.

(*i*) Except in the institutions mentioned in the answer to clause (*a*) above, head maulvis of all high schools were promoted to the subordinate Educational Service. Some of these officers were junior in service to other classical teachers, who could not be admitted to the Subordinate Educational Service; but, in view of the fact that the former were previously appointed as head maulvis in consideration of their qualifications and merits in supersession of the claims of the latter officers the head maulvis were given preference.

(*j*) (*i*) A copy* of this office circular No. 2, dated the 13th January, 1921, which explains itself, is laid on the library table.

(*ii*) These maulvis were not recommended by their Divisional Inspectors of Schools.

(*k*) The cases of the maulvis referred to in (*j*) (*ii*) above cannot be considered unless they can satisfy their Divisional Inspectors as to their suitability for promotion to the higher service. The claims of officers referred to in (*j*) (*i*) are considered in the order of seniority as vacancies arise.

Calcutta University scholars.

185. Mr. SYED ERFAN ALI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing the names of the persons who passed the B.A., M.A. and M.Sc. Examinations with distinction in any subject during the years 1913 to 1920 from the Calcutta University?

(*b*) Which of these persons were awarded the Premchand Raychand studentship in the years referred to?

(*c*) Are any of these persons in Government service at present?

(*d*) If so, where are they employed and what salaries do each draw?

(*e*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister give in detail their career?

* Not printed in these proceedings.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) and (*b*) The names may be seen on reference to the calendar of the University.

(*c*), (*d*) and (*e*) So far as is known to the Department of Education, the only one now in the service of Government is Professor Dhires Chandra Acharyya of the Sanskrit College. His present pay is Rs. 250 in the Bengal Educational Service. He took second class Honours in Sanskrit at B.A. in 1911, M.A. in class II in Group A in 1913, and in class I in Group E in 1917. He obtained the Premchand Raychand studentship in 1919. He was appointed Librarian, Sanskrit College, Calcutta, on Rs. 50 in the Subordinate Educational Service on 23rd November, 1914, and was appointed Professor in the Bengal Educational Service from 13th October, 1920.

Admission of students into the Dacca University.

186. Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to lay on the table a statement indicating the number of students, class by class, admitted this session into the intermediate colleges at Dacca, and the various departments of studies conducted by the Dacca University?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to say whether it is a fact that less than half the residential and teaching accommodation provided by the University of Dacca has been filled up?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*b*) The University anticipated and provided accommodation for 1,000 students this year. Up to 24th August, 1921, 734 had been admitted, of whom 259 were resident and 475 non-resident. It is not known to Government what proportion of the residential accommodation is still vacant.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 186 (a), showing the number of students, class by class, admitted this session into the Intermediate Colleges at Dacca and the various departments of studies conducted by the Dacca University.

INTERMEDIATE COLLEGES AT DACCA.

	Number of students.
1. Dacca Intermediate College—	
First year Arts	91
" Science	93
Second year Arts	9
" Science	5

			Number of Students.
2. Jagannath Intermediate College—			
First year	Arts	... ...	130
,,	Science	... .	31
Vocational	Commerce	... ...	92
,,	Dyeing	... ...	41
Second year	Arts	... .	47
,,	Science	... .	9
3. Islamic Intermediate College—			
First year	..	... ...	21
Second year	...	... ...	1
4. Eden Girls'—			
First year	Arts ...	... ...	15

DACCA UNIVERSITY

Arts	468
Science	123
Law	143
Total ...	734

Alumni of Calcutta University.

187. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing the respective ages at which the different alumni of the Calcutta University appeared at the Entrance Examinations before 1910 who subsequently obtained—

(*i*) the Premchand Raychand Scholarship;
(*ii*) the degree of D.L.;
(*iii*) the degree of M.D.; and
(*iv*) the degree of M.A. (first in the first division), but not included in (*i*) to (*iii*)?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: A statement is laid on the table.

Statement A referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 187, showing the respective ages at which the undermentioned alumni of the Calcutta University appeared at the Entrance Examination before 1910 who subsequently obtained the Premchand Roychand Scholarship.

Name		Age of passing the Entrance Examination.	
		Yrs.	M.
Mukhopadhyay, Asutosh	... ..	16	0
Trivedi, Ramendrasundar	... ...	16	4
Basu, Abinaschandra	... ...	15	0

Name			Age of passing the Entrance Examination.	
			Yrs.	M
Majumdar, Upendralal	...	...	15	0
Wheeler, E M.	...	..	13	3
Bhattacharyya, Janakinath	...	...	16	0
Dutt, Hirendranath	...	...	17	0
Ghattak, Mohinikanta	...	...	15	0
Bhaduri, Jyotibhusan	...	...	14	2
Bandyopadhyay, Satishchandra	...	...	14	9
Chakrabarti, Jnansaran	...	...	14	0
Sarkar, Jadunath	...	...	16	2
Brahmachari, Indubhusan	...	...	14	0
Sen, Priyanath	...	...	15	1
De, Krishnaprasad	...	...	13	0
Bhattacharyya, Krishnachandra	...	...	17	3
Sen, Jatindranath	...	...	14	0
Mukhopadhyay, Adityanath	...	...	16	0
Gangopadhyay, Phanindralal	...	...	15	0
Mukhopadhyay, Radhakumud	...	...	13	0
Niyogi, Panchanan	...	...	15	10
Ghose, Praphullachandra	...	...	14	11
Basak, Nabagauranga	...	..	17	0
Bagchi, Haridas	...	...	15	3
Sarkar Anukulchandra	...	...	14	6
Sengupta, Hemendrakumar	...	...	15	2
Ray, Manmathanath	...	...	15	6
Majumdar, Surendranath	..	...	14	10
Majumdar, Rameschandra	...	...	14	11
De, Bimanbihari	...	...	14	3
Mukhopadhyay, Girindralal	...	...	15	2
Bandyopadhyay, Gauranganath	...	...	15	5
Mukhopadhyay, Bhupangabhushan	...	...	12	11
Gangopadhyay, Surendramohan	...	...	16	11
Mukhopadhyay, Radhakamal	...	...	13	2
Law, Narendranath	...	...	15	11
Bandyopadhyay, Sudhansukumar	...	...	14	11
Dutt, Rasiklal	...	...	14	11
Ghosh, Brajendranath	...	...	15	0
Chattopadhyay, Sunitikumar	...	...	15	2
Maitra, Susilkumar	...	...	16	2
De, Susilkumar	...	...	12	11
Sen, Surendranath	...	...	15	0
Dutt, Bibhutibhushan	...	...	15	2
Bhattacharyya, Mohinimohan	...	...	16	5
Mitra, Panchanan	...	...	15	0

Name.			Age of passing the Entrance Examination.	
			Yrs.	M.
Ghosh, Jnanendrachandra	...	...	14	11
Banerjee, Pramathanath	...	...	14	2
Acharyya, Dhireschandra	...	...	16	0
Bhattacharyya, Haridas	...	...	16	2
Saha, Meghnad	...	...	15	1

Statement B referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 187, showing the respective ages at which the undermentioned alumni of the Calcutta University appeared at the Entrance Examination before 1910 who subsequently obtained the D.L. degree.

Name.			Yrs	M.
Bandyopadhyay, Saratchandra	...	...	17	0
Sen, Priyanath	...	...	15	1
Basak, Saratchandra	...	...	14	0
Mitra, Dwarkanath	...	..	13	9
Sengupta, Nareschandra	...	...	13	3

Statement C referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 187, showing the respective ages at which the undermentioned alumni of the Calcutta University appeared at the Entrance Examination before 1910 who subsequently obtained the M.D. degree.

Name.			Yrs	M.
Sarkar, Nilratan	...	...	18	0
Sarbadhikari, Suresprasad	...	...	16	0
Sen, Hemchandra	...	...	15	1
Brahmachari, Upendranath	...	...	13	5
Mitra, Ganendranath	...	...	15	0
Mallik, Indumadhab	...	...	16	0
Ray, Bidhanchandra	...	...	14	4
Ghosh, Harinath	...	...	17	0
Maitra, Jitendranath	...	...	15	11
Sengupta, Naliniranjan	...	...	14	11
Das, Harendranath	...	...	16	0
Ghosh, Ekendranath	...	...	18	0
Gangopadhyay, Harihar	...	..	15	0
Raychaudhuri, Amalkumar	...	...	15	0

Statement D referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 187, showing the respective ages at which the undermentioned alumni of the Calcutta University appeared at the Entrance Examination before 1910 who subsequently obtained the M.A. degree, standing first in the first class.

Name.			Age of passing the Entrance Examination.	
			Yrs.	M.
Das, Kailasgobinda	...	...	17	0
Rajabahadur	...	...	19	0
Bandyopadhyay, Kumudinikanta	...	...	16	0
Niyogi, Gotikrishna	...	...	16	0
Abdur Rahim	...	...	17	0
Ghosh, Gopalchandra	...	...	17	0
Goswami, Bidhubhushan	...	...	19	0
Nag, Girischandra	...	...	18	4
Sen, Jagadischandra	...	...	17	0
Majumdar, Syamaprasanna	...	...	17	0
Mukhopadhyay, Satyachandra	...	...	15	6
Das, Gobindachandra	...	...	17	0
Bandyopadhyay, Lalitkumar	...	...	14	0
Bandyopadhyay, Jnanranjan	...	...	13	10
Kanfarma, Surjokumar	...	...	17	8
Chattopadhyay, Brajendranath	...	..	17	0
Chattopadhyay, Jyotiprasad	...	...	15	0
Suhrawardy, Zahadur Rahim Zahid	...	...	15	0
Sen, Binoyendranath	...	...	15	0
Chattopadhyay, Rakhaldas	...	...	13	3
Bhaduri, Kulabhushan	...	...	16	0
Chaudhuri, Pramathanath	...	...	18	2
Thakur, Akshaykumar	...	...	16	0
Bandyopadhyay, Murahdhar	...	...	19	0
Bhaduri, Indubhushan	...	...	15	2
Mitra, Jyotischandra	...	...	15	5
Bhattacharyya, Asutosh	...	...	17	8
Sen, Bipinbihari	...	...	17	6
Biswas, Kunjabihari	...	...	16	0
Mukhopadhyay, Nandalal	...	...	14	0
Lala, Digambarlal	...	...	15	8
Chakrabarti, Hrisikesh	...	...	16	0
Pal, Asutosh	...	...	14	3
Mukhopadhyay, Bankimchandra	...	...	17	0
Bandyopadhyay, Upendralal	...	...	19	6
Bhadra, Satyendranath	...	...	12	0
Sen, Priyanath	...	...	16	5
Ray, Srischandra	...	...	14	3

Name.			Age of passing the Entrance Examination.	
			Yrs.	M.
Chakrabarti, Brajalal	...	...	16	0
Chakrabarti, Saratkumar	...	...	15	0
Bandyopadhyay, Sikharnath	...	...	15	4
Ray, Jnanendranath	...	...	13	9
Mukhopadhyay, Bijaygopal	...	...	16	0
De, Harinath	...	...	14	10
Guha, Abinaschandra	...	...	15	9
Bhattacharyya, Krishnachandra	...	...	15	6
Mitra, Apurbakrishna	...	...	14	0
Mukhopadhyay, Aswinikumar	...	...	14	4
Gangopadhyay, Haricharan	...	...	15	0
Majumdar, Jadunath	...	...	15	6
Kundu, Purnachandra	...	...	15	5
Mukhopadhyay, Harendrakumar	...	...	16	2
Suhrawardy, Abdul'a-al-Mamun	...	...	14	0
Chattopadhyay, Santosh	...	...	12	6
Basu, Hemchandra	...	...	15	0
Chaudhury, Harilal	...	...	17	0
Dutt, Saratchandra	...	...	16	8
Sen, Saileswar	...	...	13	9
Goswami, Bhagabatkumar	...	...	17	2
Chattopadhyay, Pramathanath	...	...	17	10
Mitra, Khagendranath	...	...	13	0
Sen, Nirmalchandra	...	...	13	10
Basu, Karunamay	...	...	13	3
Bhattacharyya, Bamacharan	...	...	16	2
Saha, Bandyanath	...	..	16	0
Pandeya, Ramavatara Sarma	...	...	18	9
Acharyya, Satischandra	...	...	17	5
Bandyopadhyay, Durgacharan	...	...	17	6
Chakrabarti, Bagalaprasanna	...	...	14	0
Bandyopadhyay, Jitendralal	...	...	14	5
Syed, Ata Husain	..	...	15	6
Guha, Lalitchandra	...	...	14	10
Basu, Anukulchandra	...	...	15	10
Gangopadhyay, Sitalakanta	..	...	17	0
Bhattacharyya, Purnachandra	...	...	16	11
Mukhopadhyay, Amalkrishna	...	...	14	1
Bandyopadhyay, Dharmadas	...	...	16	0
Chakrabarti, Praphullakumar	...	...	15	0
Ghosh, Rabindranarayan	...	...	13	6
Chaudhuri, Jogeschandra	...	...	13	9
Kar, Tulsidas	...	...	15	0

Name.			Age of passing the Entrance Examination.	
			Yrs	M.
Maitra, Manoranjan	...	...	13	11
Gupta, Atulchandra	...	...	14	11
Ghosh, Nareschandra	...	...	15	0
Mallik, Surendramadhab	...	...	13	11
Basu, Debendramohan	...	...	14	2
Maitra, Nikhilnath	...	...	14	11
Lala, Asutosh	...	...	17	1
Das, Pulinbihari	...	...	14	9
Mukhopadhyay, Dhirendranath	...	...	12	5
Ghosh, Panchanan	...	...	13	0
Mukhopadhyay, Jogeschandra	...	...	15	7
Ghatak, Nishithanath	...	...	16	8
Biswas, Charuchandra	...	...	14	8
Bandyopadhyay, Krishnadhan	...	...	13	5
Ghosal, Girijabhushan	...	...	15	5
Bagchi, Bireswar	...	...	15	5
Maitra, Asutosh	...	...	15	0
Ghosh, Phanindranath	...	...	15	2
Mukhopadhyay, Kantichandra	...	...	15	8
Chattopadhyay, Rebatinath	...	...	13	5
Chattopadhyay, Laksminarayan	...	...	15	4
Sen, Nepalchandra	.	...	14	11
Kar, Siteschandra	...	...	15	0
Dutt, Sailendranath	...	..	18	4
Chattopadhyay, Phanibhushan	...	...	16	4
Khaitan, Kaliprasad	...	...	14	0
Bhattacharyya, Pasupatinath	...	...	17	7
Mukhopadhyay, Subodhchandra	...	...	13	6
Chandra, Nirmalchandra	...	...	16	2
Chattopadhyay, Basantakumar	...	...	14	[illegible]
Ray, Priyadaranjan	...	..	14	0
Bandyopadhyay, Srikumar	...	...	11	11
Mukhopadhyay, Nahinmohan	...	...	13	7
Maitra, Sailendranath	...	...	14	10
Dutt, Satyendranath	...	...	17	9
Mukhopadhyay, Panchanandas	...	...	16	0
Sarkar, Ambujaksha	...	...	14	5
Majumdar, Narendrakumar	...	...	14	11
Ghosh, Satischandra	...	...	14	0
Baruya, Benimadhab	...	...	17	3
Raychaudhuri, Hemchandra	...	...	14	9
Niyogi, Jitendraprasad	...	...	13	3
Dutt, Rabindramohan	...	...	14	1

Name.			Age of passing the Entrance Examination.	
			Yrs	M
Mahammad Sanaullah	...	...	16	1
Gupta, Kisorimohan	...	...	16	2
Das, Gobindacharan	...	..	17	9
Basu, Hemendrakumar	..	...	15	4
Sarkar, Madhusudan	...	...	16	9
Ghosh, Debaprasad	...	...	13	10
Bhattacharyya, Bishnupada	...	...	14	2
Chattopadhyay, Phanibhushan	...	...	18	11
Dutt, Nalilaksha	...	...	14	4
A. N. M. Ali Hasan	..	...	16	5
Bandyopadhyay, Rabindranath	...	...	14	1
Singha, Jogischandra	...	...	15	10
Pal, Bholanath	...	...	16	9
Guha, Jitendranath	...	...	16	10
Bhattacharyya, Gopalchandra	...	...	16	2
Chakrabarti, Prabhatchandra	...	...	13	10
Law, Bimalacharan	..	...	17	1
Banerjopadhyay, Indubhushan	...	...	18	9
Chattopadhyay, Satischandra	...	...	18	0

Research work entitled "Society in Evolution."

188. Babu HEM CHANDRA NASKER: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to lay on the table a copy of the research work of Dr. Ram Das Khan on "Society in Evolution"?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: The University of Calcutta reports that no such work is available.

Staffs of the Calcutta and Dacca Universities.

189. Rai RAHDA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to place on the table a statement containing the salaries (with grades if any) of the officers and members of the teaching staffs of the Calcutta and Dacca Universities?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: The statement* is laid on the library table.

* Not printed in these proceedings.

Resolutions

(under the rules for the discussion of matters of general public interest).

Typists and Copyists.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: "This Council recommends to the Government (*i*) that the typists and copyists of the Civil, Criminal and Revenue Courts be organised into a regular establishment with fixed salaries on a time-scale basis, on such conditions and privileges as are attached to Government services; and (*ii*) that the services of the existing typists and copyists be counted towards their pension."

It is not known when the system of remunerating copyists of Civil and Criminal Courts by means of fees was first introduced. It appears that the system was first introduced in the Revenue Courts in 1850 and we also find that the system was in existence in the Civil and Criminal Courts in 1861. It is not clear what was the basic principle of this system. The present scale of fees, I believe, was introduced in the year 1890. The late Hon'ble Babu Saligram Singh in 1904 drew the attention of the Government of Bengal to the case of the copyists, which hoped to be able to effect some improvement in their position. The Government of Bengal recommended to the Government of India that those copyists in Civil and Criminal Courts in Bengal who were permanently employed should be brought within the scope of article 380 of the Civil Service Regulations. But, unfortunately, the Government of India considering that the works performed by them being to a large extent mechanical and therefore rightly paid by the piecework system did not accept the recommendation of the Government of Bengal and hence no improvement resulted from this correspondence.

Typists and copyists, compared with ministerial officers, possess almost similar qualifications. Though they are almost at a par at the time of admission into their services their career, emoluments, prospects and privileges vary enormously at the subsequent stages. The latter class enjoys many and varied privileges in the shape of fixed salaries, increments to pay, promotion, leave and other allowances, occasional bonuses and pension in old age, while all that the former gets is strictly limited to the wages they earn by copying documents on the piecework system, without a single one of the very many privileges enjoyed by the latter class. Even admission of the former class to the appointments held by the latter class at any subsequent stage is, as a rule, denied to the former class. So, to all intents and purposes, the typists and copyists are much in the same position as ministerial officers so far as conditions of service and discipline are concerned minus the attendant privileges relating to leave and pension enjoyed by the latter class. Hence the typists and copyists are entitled to the same considerations as have been shown by

the Government to the latter class in ameliorating their condition in the shape of proposed grant of increased pay and allowances recommended by the McAlpin Committee.

The following are the grievances of typists and copyists:—

(*a*) The typists and copyists are not classed as Government servants with the attendant privileges relating to leave, pension and gratuity, etc.

(*b*) The appointment of a copyist or a typist to a pensionable post is of rare occurrence, and even when it is made their previous services do not count towards pension.

(*c*) That additional works which were formerly used to be done by ministerial officers have now devolved upon the typists and copyists under rule 5, Chapter XII, page 300 of High Court Circular, Civil, Volume I, and rule 4, Chapter X, page 227 of High Court Circular, Criminal, Volume I; for these they receive no remuneration. The absence of payment for such additional work adds greatly to their numerous hardships.

(*d*) At present only a portion of the income derived from the copying department by the sale of folios and special fees for copying maps is devoted towards the payment of their wages but the income derived from court-fee stamps for certified copies, and in the shape of expedition fee, searching fee and court fees on application for copies, are totally denied to them.

(*e*) They are considered to be officers without substantive appointment, *vide* article 140 (3), Civil Service Regulations. The payment of the typists and copyists by the piecework system is a great grievance.

(*f*) The typists and copyists have no means of earning a livelihood during the periods of holidays which extend over three months or so in a year. They are unable to earn anything during the period of their illness.

(*g*) These men do not enjoy privileges as to leave and having spent the best of their lives in Government service they have to retire from it without any pension or gratuity to fall back upon, in times of pecuniary distress in old age.

(*h*) They cannot ask nor are they entitled to any extra or additional income, such as grain compensation allowance, war allowance, etc., which was granted to others.

(*i*) They are liable to be turned out at any time if their earnings fall short of the minimum fixed under High Court rules however long and faithful their services may be.

The prices of food-stuffs and all other necessaries of life have gone up immensely and it is simply impossible to make two ends meet in these hard days. These men are subject to the same needs of money, so far as living and demands of society are concerned as the members of the

ministerial staff and they too require respite and rest at the end of their service like other officers in the employ of Government.

The Government has taken steps to ameliorate the condition of their permanent employees. Almost all the services have got their increase.

The typists and the copyists deserve sympathy and assistance from the Government. They are recruited from the *bhadralog* class. They are poor. They have no fixed income. They get their remuneration according to the number of folios copied. The usual earnings of these men are between Rs. 30 and Rs. 50 in a working month. It is not sufficient now for a person belonging to the class from which they are recruited. The relative value of money has considerably changed during the last 2 or 3 decades while values have increased everywhere, the value of work contributed by the typists and copyists has, it appears, considerably decreased. The result is considerable discontent amongst them.

No attempt has been made to ameliorate the condition of these poor men. They are treated as persons without substantive appointment and on this plea their status has not been improved. This is hardly fair to them specially as they materially assist in bringing about a substantial income to the Government.

Government will not have to incur any additional expenditure over and above that they are required to do at present. The income derived from the copying department by the sale of folios and court fee stamps for certified copies and in the shape of expedition fee, searching fee, special fee for copying maps and court-fee stamps on the application for copies, is sufficient for the purpose of organising the typists and copyists into a salaried service and hence this reform can easily be introduced without any additional charge on the public exchequer.

Objection to organising typists and copyists into a regular establishment has often been made on the ground (*a*) that these men are rightly paid by piecework system as their work is mainly mechanical and unskilled; and (*b*) that the outturn of work would be less than what it is at present if they are organised into a salaried service; and (*c*) the expense to Government will increase enormously.

As regards (*a*), I may point out that the Sub-Registrars and other officers (*i. e.*, Nazir, etc.,) were formerly paid by fees in reference to the amount of work they actually did, but these men have now been included in permanent establishment and been paid fixed salaries. I hope Government has no reason to repent on that score.

As regards (*b*), there is every reason to believe that the hope of getting a pension on retirement and a fixed salary at the end of a month would throw a life and stimulus into their work and in my opinion will result in increased efficiency and hence this apprehension is groundless.

As regards (*c*), *i. e.*, the question of expense, I have shown above that there will be no increase if my resolution be accepted and hence this objection is also without any foundation.

After the notice of my resolution was sent, the Hon'ble High Court has, on 23rd June last, issued a general letter (No. 8) to the District and Additional District Judges stating that it has decided that the standard of the earnings of the copyists and typists should be raised by reducing their numbers and also addressed the Government of Bengal regarding the creation of a Provident Fund for them. The minimum now proposed for the copyists is Rs. 40 and that of the typists is Rs. 65, while the maximum aimed at is Rs. 50 for the former and Rs. 80 for the latter class.

This reply of the Hon'ble High Court, I am sorry to say, is disappointing and means almost nothing. These men having got no age-limit for their discharge or retirement from their employment and voluntary retirement being out of question in these hard days, the number of the typists and copyists cannot be appreciably reduced till some of them are dead or compulsorily discharged from their employment. The former is uncertain and may take many years. The latter will mean starvation to many if the proposed reduction be suddenly carried into effect as there is no provision for pension or gratuity or provident fund for the men to be discharged. This being the case, it is very doubtful whether the present generation of the typists and copyists will ever be able to get the benefit of the increment now proposed by the Hon'ble High Court. Moreover, owing to the non-co-operation movement, works of the Courts might fall and in that case there is every apprehension that instead of reaching even the minimum now proposed by the Hon'ble High Court, their present earnings might fall at any moment.

Nothing has been mentioned in this general letter to make any provision for them during the time in which courts remain closed. In my humble opinion this general letter of the Hon'ble High Court instead of ameliorating their lot and solving this question has brought uneasiness and apprehension in the minds of many of the existing typists and copyists that they may be turned out at any time and be beggars in the streets. Instead of nebulous increments proposed by the Hon'ble High Court something definite should be done, or recommended by the Government, which will assure these men of a fixed income all round the year with prospect of progressive increment for the future.

In spite of the general letter No. 8 issued by the Hon'ble High Court nothing substantial has yet been done to ameliorate the lot of the typists and copyists. They are in the same condition as before though the world has changed a great deal. With changed circumstances brought about by the late war it is well nigh impossible for them to eke out their existence decently in these hard days with an income remaining almost stationary. Hence, I appeal to the generosity, kindness and sympathy of the Hon'ble Member in charge to consider favourably the case of these poor and hard working and deserving class of officers in the employ of Government and accept my resolution for organising them into a regular establishment with fixed salaries on a liberal time-scale basis and thus brighten their lives.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: This is such a necessary resolution that I hope there won't be any opposition from any part of this House. This system of typists and copyists is on a par with the piece-work system in the Government Printing Department, about the iniquities of which, we have been hearing so much lately. It seems to me, that this system, which has been leading indirectly to some sort of sweating of labour, should not be allowed to continue in any Government office any longer. In civil and criminal courts, there is generally a large number of typists and copyists who have to depend on the favour of their senior officers for copies. Sometimes, the number of these poor copyists is so large that there is a scramble for copies and this generally leads to a system of favouritism and sometimes to bribery, which we are trying to drive away from the precincts of Government offices. To use rather strong language, this system seems to remind me of the pound of flesh system, because every copyist is told that he is to get such and such an amount of money for so many words written. Is it possible to extract this amount of work every day, year in and year out from every copyist? Is it fair to tell them that they should not count upon a certain amount of income every month? It may happen that in one month a copyist gets Rs. 40, the next month Rs. 30, and in another month something less. Therefore, his income is most uncertain. Then again, after 25 or 30 years' service under Government, when he gets old, he finds that he is driven out of the office without any pension or without anything for the maintenance of his family. Is it fair to those who are serving Government?

Then again, there is a curious system—a minimum of income is fixed for typists and copyists. It may so happen under that system that a poor clerk, who has not been in good health, has not been able to do the requisite amount of work; in that case, he gets less than the minimum fixed by the High Court. What is the natural consequence? He is in danger of being driven out of office. Is this the way to treat the poor copyists? The income they earn is barely sufficient for decent living. They are always struggling for their very subsistence, and in these days when the other clerks are fortunate enough to hope for an increase of their emoluments all round, it is only fair and just that these poor copyists should be placed on the cadre of clerks and given a fixed income, permanent posts and pensions.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I have very great pleasure to support this resolution of my esteemed friend, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin Ahmed, but I do not think that I can add anything more which is useful to what has already been said. So, I do not propose to take up the time of this House by saying things which have already been said. There is one thing, however, to which I beg to draw the attention of this House, that is, this distinction between typists and clerks is purely artificial. There is no reason for it and possibly it must have

been made by a man who must have been himself a clever quill driver. There is nothing more than that. The difference between a typist and a clerk is that one man writes with the help of a machine and the other with the help of a pen, and the incidence is that in one man's life for eight months in a year his income is uncertain, and for the remaining four months it is absolutely certain which is nil. This is during his life—his official life—and when he leaves Government service, pension is nil. This is the kind of treatment he gets.

Then again, there is another aspect of the case to which I will draw the attention of this House and it is this, that these poor men only get two-thirds of the fees, the ordinary folio fees, that is the rule The other one-third goes to Government. Out of the two-thirds, these poor men have got to purchase and maintain a machine and find out the accessories for it. This is indeed injustice of a very high character. This is not justifiable in any circumstance and I have every reason to hope that this will be accepted by the Council and by all the members who are interested in this question.

Mr. KRISHNA CHANDRA RAY CHAUDHURI: The Khan Bahadur's resolution should appeal to those who want to see the poor typists and copyists doing Government work fully protected Their present uncertainty of employment must be, as far as practicable, removed and they must enjoy all the privileges due to His Majesty's servants, no matter how humble their work is I therefore support this resolution.

Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF: I have great pleasure in supporting this resolution moved by Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin Ahmed. Indeed, the condition of the typists and copyists is deplorable. If you look into their wretched condition, you will find that their maximum income does not exceed Rs. 50. Generally it ranges from Rs. 20 to Rs. 50. This is not quite sufficient in the present days. Moreover they are guided by the strict rules by which the other Government servants are guided but they are not given the attendant privileges of Government service. You will also find that during the holidays which extend for over three months, they do not get anything, while other Government servants enjoy their monthly salaries during that time. Further, in their old age, these poor fellows have to retire empty-handed and without any pension. If you compare the lot of the poor copyists and typists with their brother ministerial officers, you will find that a vast distinction has been made; although men of the same qualifications are recruited for both the services, the attendant privileges are quite different. Recently the Hon'ble Judges of the High Court in reply to a representation that was submitted by the typists and copyists suggested that the standard earning of a copyist should be Rs. 40 rising to a maximum of Rs. 65 and that of a typist Rs. 50 to Rs. 80. This shows

that the Hon'ble Judges of the High Court realise that there is a great necessity for increasing the income of copyists and typists. They want to give them increments by increasing their work and by chucking out a lot of those poor fellows who have given the best portions of their lives in the service of Government. These people will have to leave their service in order to give place to others, while Government proposes to give an all-round increase of pay to the ministerial officers on the ground of the great economic distress in the country, and not on the ground of the increase of their work It is therefore equally necessary that the case of the poor typists and copyists should also be considered by Government. Therefore, I accord my whole-hearted sympathy to the resolution and ask my friends to support it.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: I support this resolution on principle. The copyists and typists are equally responsible Government officers, and they belong to the ministerial class Is there any reason why their treatment should be different from that of others? Are they not equally responsible officers like other ministerial officers? By some irony of fate it has been found that when apprentices cannot be provided with permanent appointments within a certain period, say before they attain the age of 25, they are usually sent down to the copyists' department; they are in no way inferior to the others who are more fortunate in securing an appointment in the regular establishment. Their responsibilities are the same; they copy very important documents which are entrusted to them, and as a general rule it has been found that these poorly-paid people, who are poorer than anybody else, perhaps have no other means of adding to their resources, which are open to their more fortunate brothers of the service, such as the peshkars, etc. It is found that these people discharge their duties with an honesty anybody could be proud of, and they have the responsibility and the position of Government ministerial officers. In fairness to them, and in recognition of their honesty, I think the authorities should very fairly and equitably consider their case; and unless they are also embodied in the general establishment of the ministerial officers and are given whatever privileges are given to all ministerial officers, I think equity and justice will suffer.

With these words, I support the resolution.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: I rise to support the motion of my friend, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin Ahmed. I will not not make any lengthy observation. I only wish to say that this is a very hard case, and will leave people discontented after faithful service to Government because they do not get any pension. They have to go without any remuneration for three months in the year. How can you expect these faithful workers to be loyal and contented in these

circumstances? I think, therefore, that we ought to take into consideration the case of these deserving and faithful servants of Government, and put them in the same cadre and in the same status as the ordinary copyists and typists in the ministerial service of Government.

With these words, I support the resolution.

Maulvi EMADUDDIN AHMED: I beg to support the motion that has been moved by my friend, Khan Bahadur Wasimuddin Ahmed. All the previous speakers have spoken on the subject at considerable length and I do not wish to detain the House for a long time. I only wish to draw the attention of the House to one important aspect of the question. It generally happens that some of these men who are out of employment, go to the superior authorities, and with much importunity get employment as a copyist. In this way the number of copyists is increased and the result is that the earnings go down. The result of this was the circular of the High Court suggesting reduction in the number of copyists. It is difficult to curtail the number; having once taken them into service, it is cruelty to turn them out; they should be organised into a regular department, a certain number being employed. I hope Government will take this aspect into consideration.

With these words, I support the motion.

Babu UPENDRA LAL RAI CHAUDHURI: I beg to support this resolution on the grounds set forth by the mover and the other previous speakers. I have one word to add and that is this: Typists and copyists are generally paid on the volume of work performed, and in their zeal to earn as much as possible in the course of the day, they make out copies which are unintelligible to the public. I know that several documents issued by these copyists, compared by and certified to be correct by other clerks, are very often wrongly copied. The cause of this is that they are anxious to earn as much money as they can in the shortest time possible and do their work indifferently. If they are placed in the general establishment and their status be the same as that of other ministerial officers, I think they will do better work. That is one of the grounds on which I support the resolution.

Babu Annada Charan Dutta has made a comparison between the other ministerial officers and the copyists, but I am not inclined to make this distinction. If there is anything to be said it applies equally to both sections. However, I think there is a just grievance on the part of these typists and copyists and I am of opinion that they should all be treated in the same way as the other ministerial officers.

With these few words, I support this resolution.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: May I explain? I did not make any distinction between the two classes.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: It is clear from what has been said in this House by so many persons that the typists and copyists of Bengal have got numerous friends here. I do not thereby wish to minimise the strength of their case; they have, in certain respects, a good case, but I must point out that several important factors ought to be borne in mind in dealing with this question. First of all, it has to be remembered that this system has stood the test of time for nearly a century. The question has been raised more than once, it has been considered by various responsible authorities, and it has been found that the system is quite appropriate to the nature of the work they are expected to turn out. As far back as 1904, the Government of India considered this question very carefully and came to the conclusion that, having regard to the nature of the work, the system was an appropriate one. The work that is done by the typists and copyists is entirely of a mechanical character, and there is no discretion to be exercised by them. They have simply to copy the document before them, and the system of payment is by piecework, that is according to the amount of work which a man does. It must be remembered that these documents are copied at the instance of parties, and it is only right that those who want copies of those documents should pay for them. At present the charge is so much per folio of the copying done; I believe three annas is the charge out of which two annas goes to the remuneration of the copyist. As regards the remaining one anna there is the salary of the comparing clerk and other incidential charges and the pay of the record-keeper that have to be met out of the amount. Therefore, it cannot be farily stated that the system is an unjust one. But when I say this, I also admit that, having regard to the present conditions of living, the heavy rise in prices, the question of the remuneration of the typist has to be regulated on much the same lines as that of other persons similarly employed in Government service. They are not ministerial officers, as one of the speakers has supposed; they are not in the regular service of Government and, in fact, that is the complaint before the Council. But all the same, although they are not regular servants of the Government, the Government are anxious to help them as far as possible. As this Council knows, these copyists and typists are really under the control of the High Court, who are primarily responsible for them, and they have to decide upon their case. They recently considered their case and came to the conclusion that the system of payment by piecework was quite suitable, and ought not to be changed, but having regard to the increased cost of living they proposed that the minimum which is to be earned by the copyists and typists should be raised and a Provident Fund, if possible, should be established. They have proposed that the minimum should be raised in the case of copyists to Rs. 45, and in case of typists to Rs. 65. If you compare this with the remuneration of the clerks it cannot be said that the copyists and typists would be really worse off. No doubt complaint has been made by some of the speakers

that they do not enjoy the status and privileges of Government servants. I do not know whether the typists and copyists, if their remuneration is increased, will have very much of a grievance if the status of Government servants is not conferred upon them. At present they are free to do other work if they have time, and earn more money; I believe some of the typists actually earn more than the clerks in their position; some undoubtedly earn less. No doubt they do not earn anything from the courts during the vacation, that is, because they are paid by piecework, and I do not think the Council expects the Government to pay them when they are not doing any work.

If you turn these persons into members of a regular Government establishment, many questions will have to be considered very carefully. For instance, their number. If, for instance, the present number is more than sufficient for the work available, you could not expect Government to entertain this number unnecessarily. Then, again, supposing some typists have been working out for a few days, do you expect Government to entertain them, although their services may not be wanted? Then you have to consider what the entire establishment would cost. These are questions which should be weighed carefully, and due consideration given to them. Without considering these aspects of the question, it is not possible for the Government to commit themselves to the resolution.

On behalf of Government, I am prepared to say, without making any promise, that we shall very carefully consider the position. At present the High Court have issued a circular that seems to us to be a very reasonable one; if it be found that that circular does not relieve the situation, Government will be prepared to consider the question again. This is all I am prepared to say on behalf of Government at present.

Maulvi KHANDAKAR ARHAMUDDIN: The income derived from the copying department fully justified the organisation of the copyists and typists into a regular staff with the fixed salary on a time-scale basis as proposed by my colleague, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin Ahmed, especially as they are at present required to do much office work for which no remuneration is paid.

These officers are recruited from the same class of people with the same education as the clerks in Government offices. So it is only just that they should be given the same advantages as the clerks of the several departments under Government.

With these few remarks, I fully support this resolution.

Mr. KRISHNA CHANDRA RAY CHAUDHURI: I move that the question be now put.

The motion that the question be put was put and agreed to.

The original motion was then put and agreed to.

Calcutta Police.

Mr. AJOY CHUNDER DUTT: "This Council recommends to the Government that the principle be accepted that the cost of the Presidency police should no longer form a charge upon the existing revenues of Bengal, and that, in this view, the Council recommends the appointment of a committee consisting of nine persons, including at least two officials and four non-official members of this Council, for the purpose of framing a scheme to give effect to the said principle."

I expect that every member of this Council will warmly and heartily support this resolution. The facts necessitating my bringing this resolution are the following:—As every member of this Council is aware, the police expenditure of Bengal, including the Presidency police, amounts to about two crores of rupees. In other words, about one-fourth of the entire revenue of Bengal is appropriated by the police. The Calcutta police, or rather the Presidency police, appropriates about Rs. 35 lakhs every year; in other words, about one-fifth of the entire police expenditure is devoted for the purpose of maintaining the Presidency police. The money that we spend for the maintenance of the Presidency police, will be sufficient to police one-fourth of the whole of Bengal under the present system of administration. The cost is extremely heavy; practically the whole amount of two crores of rupees is paid by Bengal. Calcutta contributes very little towards the maintenance of the police system. The Bengal police costs, I believe, one crore and 50 lakhs a year. The Calcutta police, or rather the Presidency police, costs Rs. 35 lakhs a year. My proposal is this: let Calcutta bear the expenses of the Calcutta police. Bengal is perfectly willing to continue bearing the expenses of the Bengal police. This suggestion which I am making is not a novel one and it has found acceptance in Europe. It may be contended on the other side that no distinction ought to be made between Calcutta and Bengal, because Calcutta is geographically within Bengal, and therefore a benefit to Calcutta is a benefit to Bengal. It is not necessary for me to deal with the principles of taxation, but I think every member of this Council will agree with me that according to the most elementary principle of taxation, a person who pays a tax is entitled to some benefit from the tax he pays. That principle will, I think, be accepted. Here is Bengal contributing nearly Rs. 35 lakhs every year for the maintenance of the Presidency police. What benefit, may I ask, does Bengal get for paying this amount year by year? Calcutta is not the same as Bengal, the two are quite distinct. The prosperity of Calcutta does not connote the prosperity of Bengal. We know during the last fifteen years Calcutta has been gaining in wealth, but during this period Bengal has been rapidly getting poorer. In a few years' time Calcutta may claim, possibly, to rival the large cities of Europe from the point of view of wealth and commerce, whereas Bengal is getting poorer every day. My proposal, therefore, is let Bengal continue to maintain

the Bengal police, but let the Calcutta police, or rather the Presidency police, be maintained by the inhabitants and residents of Calcutta. The principle that I advocate has found general acceptance in Europe. During the last few weeks, I have been studying the police systems in Europe, and I find that this principle has been practically unanimously accepted in Europe and partially in America. France has accepted it, Germany and England also. It is not possible for me, within the short space of time given to me, to deal with the police systems in Europe. I shall confine my remarks to the police system that prevails in London. London is policed by two distinct and different sets of forces, the Metropolitan police and the City police. Let me take the second first. The jurisdiction of the City police is strictly limited within London. The jurisdiction of the Metropolitan police is confined, I believe, to a fifteen-mile radius from Charing Cross. The City police is maintained entirely by those who get the direct benefit of that police. Not a penny is contributed by Parliament for the maintenance of the City police. The Metropolitan police is maintained partially by a police rate and partially by a contribution made by the Parliament. This contribution that Parliament makes is levied from properties situated within the Metropolitan district, so that I think I am right in saying that the City police is maintained entirely by the Londoners and England does not pay a single penny towards the maintenance of that police. There is no reason why the same system, which has worked so satisfactorily in London, should not be imported to this country and be applied to the Presidency police. It may be contended that Calcutta is already overburdened with taxes and that it would be unfair to fix another rate upon the ratepayers of Calcutta. It may further be contended that Calcutta pays a very large share of the total Income Tax—Calcutta pays almost as much as the rest of Bengal—and, therefore, it would be inequitous to lay a further burden upon the Calcutta tax-payers. Now I think this income-tax argument strengthens my position, because income-tax is fixed upon the income that a person or a community makes; and it furnishes a very accurate test of the wealth of that individual or community; so if Calcutta pays an income-tax which is almost as much as is paid by the rest of Bengal, it only shows that Calcutta is as wealthy as the rest of Bengal. Well, if Calcutta is as wealthy as the rest of Bengal, there is no earthly reason why the inhabitants of Calcutta should not pay for the maintenance of the police of Calcutta, as the Londoners pay for the maintenance of the London police. I may further add that the tax to be imposed upon the inhabitants of Calcutta would practically be the same as is now imposed on the inhabitants of London. I think, therefore, that the present system has got to be changed and the suggestion on the lines that I have made will have to be accepted. A change of the system is urgently needed. To-day the police expenditure is Rs. 35 lakhs. Calcutta is rapidly expanding; within a few years Tollygunge and Dum Dum will be parts of Calcutta

and I should not be surprised if Barrackpore is added to the Metropolis. The result of all this will be that the police expenditure will be enormously increased. I can quite imagine that within the next ten years the police expenditure may rise up to, say, Rs. 60 or even Rs. 70 lakhs. It is therefore not fair that Bengal should be burdened with an increasing police expenditure—for a police which is maintained entirely for the benefit of Calcutta. My object of moving this resolution is to effect a saving of about Rs. 35 or Rs. 40 lakhs every year. The tax-payers of Calcutta pay but a very small fraction of the cost of maintenance of the Bengal police, which is maintained for the benefit of the people of the country. I suggest that we should apply the money which might thus be saved for purposes which are more closely associated with the welfare and well-being of the people of Bengal. We are going to pass a large number of resolutions in this Council, but what is the use of passing resolutions when you have not got the money to give effect to these resolutions. The money which may be saved may be used for the purpose of improving the health of the country. There are numerous schemes which are at present being starved and they may properly be financed from the saving. I see that one of our Hon'ble Ministers has launched a programme for combating the ravages of malaria. Now, if malaria is to be successfully fought it requires a good deal of money, so let a portion of that money come from the saving of this Rs. 35 or Rs. 40 lakhs. That is really the object of my resolution and if you put this sum to the credit of Bengal year after year, I think the people of Bengal may be able to get out of the unhappy position in which they exist to-day. These are the reasons why I suggest that the inhabitants and residents of Calcutta should bear the expenses of the Calcutta police. I know that some members of this Council will feel themselves justified in opposing my resolution, on the ground that the resolution may affect their personal interests or the interests of their constituencies. I shall ask those gentlemen in this matter to throw aside the petty considerations of self-interest and vote for my resolution which has on its side justice, fairness and common sense. We are striving for democracy, our political goal is democracy within the empire. Now democracy always involves equality of taxation and if you are not prepared to make that sacrifice it is possible we may never be able to attain the goal we seek. Therefore, I particularly appeal to these gentlemen to make that sacrifice for the good of the community. I feel, however, certain that those gentlemen who represent the mufassal areas will support me.

With these observations, I commend my resolution to the acceptance of the House.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: This is a very important resolution and I wish to submit a few observations touching upon it. This resolution brings to my mind the ancient history in connection with this matter. It brings to my mind the petitions that were

received during Lord William Bentinck's time—I refer to the year 1829. Later on, we find that this subject was discussed in 1845. Lord Dalhousie formed a committee and Mr. Panton was the President of that committee. In 1887, Mr Guise also submitted a report and his suggestion was that the police cost ought to be taken into consideration—the port and the municipality contributing to it. We find that this brings us to the ancient history when the municipality of Calcutta had chiefly to bear the cost. Then we come to the modern history. The Police Commission's Report swept away all this idea and the whole expenditure is now met in the way now in vogue, that is that the whole cost of the police is met from provincial revenues. The question has therefore arisen whether, under such circumstances, Calcutta ought to bear the entire cost regarding the Presidency police. It is difficult to discuss all these matters without bringing to the notice of the Council the principles upon which the police expenditure ought to be met. Police taxation is to my mind out of the question. There are house-owners in Calcutta who will come forward and say that they have already been heavily burdened with taxation and, consequently, the house property ought not to be a factor for the incidence of the police rate. That is a problem which will have to be dealt with; and the learned mover of the resolution has not brought forward a scheme by which the principles could be put into practice. Whenever a resolution is put in a drastic way before the Council, my humble submission is that the mover should be prepared with a scheme for the purpose; but no such scheme is before us and the whole matter is left to the committee expected to be formed for the purpose.

Now there are other principles to be dealt with. We should remember that the Calcutta people are required to pay an income-tax and that upon the actual income they derive from trade or profession. Can that be a safe test for the purpose of settling the incidence of taxation? It is not necessary for me to discuss these principles now. There would be a proper time for discussion later on. But there is another view of the matter and that is that the learned mover wishes to relieve the rural population of Bengal of the cost of the Presidency police. It is a matter of gratification to me that such a proposal is brought before the Council by which the rural people will be saved from paying this large amount. If I welcome such a resolution, I do it on that ground. I may however honestly say that I am not entirely a rural man—I am also a Calcutta man. My position is this, that, when on the one side I welcome the resolution, on the other side, I am afraid that I am in a position of great embarrassment when dealing with my property in Calcutta. Therefore, it is necessary for the Council to consider under what circumstances the principles of taxation are to be based in Calcutta. If the greater portion of the police expenditure be placed upon the shoulders of the Calcutta people it would be rather an unwelcome thing. A part of the cost may be thrown upon Calcutta and the other part upon the rural population of

Bengal. If that can be done, I think the problem can be solved satisfactorily by the expected committee. It is impossible to put forward before the Council definite schemes relating to this matter unless, as I say, we have a definite scheme before us. All that I can suggest to the Council is that a committee be formed and those questions which are brought to the notice of the Council taken up with all sincerity and enthusiasm. If that be done, we shall then be in a position to deal with this important factor. On the one side we are afraid of a fresh imposition of taxation, while on the other side we consider it necessary upon the precedents which the learned mover has brought to your notice, that, such a thing is always to be found in many important cities in Europe. I do not like to speak further on this matter and my only hope is that a committee may be formed for the purpose of going into these questions; and if these questions are answered satisfactorily by the committee, the whole matter will be brought before the Council and the Council will then be in a position to say " yes " or " no."

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I accord my hearty support to the first part of the resolution, namely,— " This Council recommends to the Government that the principle be accepted that the cost of the Presidency police should no longer form a charge upon the existing revenues of Bengal."

In this is involved a question of principle which, I suppose, was already settled when we passed the Village Self-Government Act. The police employed for watch and ward in villages are now to be supported by the village union themselves with the union rates levied in the unions. So it is beyond contention now that the local police has been and is being gradually municipalised. And although in the Fraser Police Commission Report, it is stated, that in small municipalities, for want of adequate funds, the police is undermanned and is inefficient for want of co-ordination with the district police, that argument cannot hold good in the case of Calcutta. The Calcutta police, even as it now is, is totally distinct from the provincial police, and its present inefficiency is not due to that . And the Fraser Commission Report itself says:—

> The Commission fully recognise that the cost of the police is a fair charge upon municipal revenues, but for the reasons just stated, the system does not work well in any but the largest cities. . . The cost of the police in a presidency town, however, may call for special treatment.

So we see the Commission had practically left the matter open, acknowledging the justice of the cost of the Presidency police being defrayed from municipal funds.

Sir, I do not think a cry could now be raised that the police are municipalised only in backward countries. I hope that none here will dare assert that England is a backward country. There we find that nearly the whole police system is municipalised. There, there are the City of London police, the Metropolitan police, the County police and the

Borough police; and almost all of them are being paid from the local rates. The City of London police is mainly paid from local rates, and the Mayor and Alderman appoint the Commissioner and Assistant Commissioners of Police, the police fund being in the hands of the City Chamberlain, and is supplied, as to the quarter of the sum required, by payment out of the revenues of the City of London, and as to the remaining three quarters by a police rate not exceeding eight pence in the pound and assessed in the several wards by the Alderman or his Deputy, and the majority of common Councilmen of each ward. Then, as regards the Metropolitan police, its fund is recruited mainly from two sources— (*i*) a police rate, and (*ii*) an Exchequer contribution. The police rate is limited by Statute to eleven pence in the pound and is levied on the full and fair annual value of all property in the Metropolitan police district. The Exchequer contribution is paid annually through the medium of the County Councils, whose area is wholly or partly within the Metropolitan police district. It is also worthy of note here that in England the maintenance of police is one of the subjects administered by local bodies under the local government, carried out under the central control of the Ministry of Health, which superseded the various local government boards in 1919.

Sir, we, the poor villagers of Bengal in addition to all the taxes to which the citizens of Calcutta are subject, pay about Rs. 55 lakhs as chowkidari tax for the maintenance of peace and order in the villages. We, villagers, also can as well argue that it is one of the duties of the Government to protect its subjects and that it should be the just charge on the General Revenues, and that the Government cannot shirk the responsibility and throw the whole burden on the people themselves. However inequitable a fresh taxation for peace and order may appear, the British Government is already committed to the principle and has already set its seal of sanction by taxing for the purpose the poorest of the land. The only palliative that has been offered is that the villagers through their unions and president punchayats may have some control over the chowkidars. That has been the bargain, although the present control of the villagers is not quite enough and satisfactory. Now, it would be unworthy of the rich citizens of Calcutta to say that they cannot and will not maintain their own police, that the payment may be all right for the poor, but not so for the rich; and the Government itself can in no conscience avoid the responsibility of carrying out its own principle to its logical end.

And, Sir, I think the Calcutta people themselves should not object to this municipalisation of the police. No doubt, the Calcutta police, along with its sister branch is inefficient, and the Calcutta people know it and feel it, its champions' contradictions notwithstanding. The only way to wean the police of its arrogance, haughtiness and oppression, and an inordinate love of lucre, is to make this department feel directly

responsible to the people and its representatives. When once the police is municipalised and is paid from municipal funds, the demand of control over it cannot for any length of time be resisted. It must come. He who pays the piper has a right to call the tune. The Calcutta police will gradually come under the control of an elected Mayor or Sheriff or Chairman of the Calcutta Corporation whatever his designation might be and in the Corporation, along with the General Committee, the Water Committee, the Gas Committee, we will also have a Police Committee. That is the day which the Calcutta public would sincerely hope for.

As I have said before I support the first part of this resolution. But I do not find any necessity for a new committee; already a committee has been appointed under the presidency of Mr. French to examine and suggest improvements in the whole system of police administration of Bengal. If the principle of municipalising the Presidency police be accepted by the House, the ways and means may very well be left to the French Committee. I would therefore request the mover to withdraw the latter part of his resolution.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: It might perhaps shorten the discussion if at this stage I were to explain generally how this matter is viewed by the Local Government. Underlying this resolution, there are two considerations of much strength, about which we have heard a great deal in recent months; and in view of their strength, it is not altogether surprising that a proposal of this kind should be made to-day, the more so as it is a proposal which in last year's resolution on the Calcutta police Government itself hinted at. The first consideration, to which I allude, is the well-known fact that the police is expensive, about which I have spoken much and often in this Council, and the Council will be pleased to hear that I do not now intend to speak more, since the details of police expenditure are scarcely relevant to this resolution. We assume that the police costs x rupees, and the question at issue is how that sum of x rupees is to be met. The second consideration is the fact, about which we have heard much lately, of the straitened circumstances of the provincial revenues and the desirability of expanding them; for that, in effect, is what the net result of this resolution would be. The resolution at first sight is somewhat curiously worded, as it might be taken to mean that the Legislative Council is washing its hands of all responsibility for the Calcutta police and proposes to leave them in mid-air. But, of course, just as it is obvious that Calcutta requires a police force, it is equally obvious that it must be paid for somehow, either from general provincial revenues, or, as the mover of the resolution has proposed, in whole or in part by a police rate upon the town. The idea of a police rate is not a new one, as has been mentioned by Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur, but as it is desirable that the members of the Council and the public outside should appreciate the earlier history of this question, I will briefly run through its most salient features.

In the old days, that is before 1847, the cost of the police charges in Calcutta used to be borne by the Justices, who then had at their disposal a house tax and the akbari receipts from the town. The akbari receipts were absorbed in general revenues in 1845, and with effect from 1847, when a Board of seven Commissioners was created for the improvement of Calcutta, a complete change of system was made and Government assumed the whole responsibility and defrayed the entire cost. This went on for some years till in 1864 Lieutenant-Colonel Bruce wrote a very interesting report on the question of the inadequacy and inefficiency of the Calcutta police. At that time, it is interesting to note, the police cost only Rs. 3,34,000 a year, and even this included certain salt preventive establishment which now-a-days we should regard as Customs, and prison guards which now would be debited to Jails. Colonel Bruce brought forward many of the old complaints which we so often hear now —insufficiency of strength, inadequacy of pay, failure to move with the times (he particularly described the river police as effete and ineffective), the unsuitability of buildings and the heavy cost of hiring them. He made various proposals for reorganization, and brought forward the idea that the town should meet the cost either in whole or in part. He wished to transfer the control of the police to the Justices, while Government contributed towards various sanitary improvements which were long overdue in the town. Another idea of his was that Government should contribute one-fourth of the cost, or even the whole for one more year, until the sanitary improvements had made progress, the sum being gradually reduced from year to year. That was, of course, only Colonel Bruce's proposal, but in 1864 the Government of India, who were then hard up, brough forward a very important resolution which enunciated three principles very relevant to the discussion which we are having this afternoon. These were:—(*i*) the cost of the police maintained expressly for the service of any town should, as far as practicable, be defrayed by the inhabitants; (*ii*) the inhabitants should raise the funds in such manner as they thought proper; and (*iii*) the transfer of police charges to local funds should take place as soon as details could be dealt with.

These are more or less the principles which Mr. Dutt has advocated this afternoon.

Directly that resolution was issued there was the usual wrangle—a three cornered wrangle—between the Government of India, the Local Government and the Justices as to the details which should be adopted in the new system; and the Local Government estimating the cost of the police proper at Rs. 3,18,000, and recognising the need of other works of improvement in the city, proposed a fixed contribution of Rs. 1,50,000, the rest falling on the town. They were thus willing that the incidence should not be wholly one-sided, but that Government should contribute something, though the bulk, of course, fell on the town. But the Government of India refused to mix up the question of sanitary improvements, and said that they would pay nothing for the police force. The Justices

protested emphatically and revived the old claim to the abkari receipts. The Local Government backed up the protest, but the Government of India would not go beyond Rs. 1,00,000 promised for 1866-67, with no guarantee of its continuance. The Justices again protested, and eventually they prevailed upon the Government of India to accept the liability for a quarter of the cost of the police.

That new system was embodied in Act XI of 1867, which distinctly stated in its preamble that "it was expedient that the expenses of maintaining the police force of Calcutta and of maintaining pauper hospitals in the said town should be defrayed by rates to be levied upon the said town." The Act gave to the Justices wide powers over the budget, and enabled them to levy an annual police rate not exceeding 3 per cent. on the value of houses, buildings and lands It was the occasion of considerable discussion in the Legislative Council, which centred round the obligations imposed in respect of the pauper hospital, the degree of control over the budget to be accorded to the Justices, the amount of the rate and the method of its levy.

The powers of the Justices over the budget were taken away by Act IV of 1876, when control passed to the Local Government, but the same distribution of cost continued until the well-known resolution of 1882 on local self-government which sought to relieve municipalities in general from these police charges, in the hope that the money thereby saved would be spent on education, medical and sanitary improvement. Naturally under that resolution the case of Calcutta became one of considerable importance, and in 1884 the Calcutta Corporation asked to be relieved in accordance with its terms. There was again a lengthy discussion, but eventually by Act II of 1888, the obligation was removed the Corporation being simultaneously bound to spend Rs. 3,00,000 annually on sanitary improvements in the added areas. The Government of India assigned to the Local Government two-thirds of the police charges assumed by the latter, and that is the system which obtains to-day. That is to say, from that time onwards the Corporation have been relieved of police charges, but have been bound to devote a certain sum towards sanitary improvements, Government assuming entire responsibility for the police. One important matter has a bearing on the question which we are considering to-day. In a letter dated the 2nd August, 1889, the Government of India, discussing the possibility of misunderstanding hereafter if further legislation in connection with the Calcutta police became necessary, said:—

> If a rate has at any time to be levied in the new municipality for any police purpose, the Governor-General in Council is of opinion that it must be levied as a police rate, and it will be understood: . . . that the Government is free at any time to initiate legislation for the levy of such a rate. This understanding . . . is in no way dependent upon the Government contribution to the Calcutta municipality in aid of charges for the city police becoming superfluous.

So although Government at that time assumed the liability, they definitely safeguarded themselves from any inference that they had done so for all time. It is interesting to note that whereas the cost of the police in those days was Rs. 3,64,000, the cost of the police at the present day is Rs. 26,76,000 and it is that larger sum which is in issue in the case now before us.

That, Sir, is, in brief, the old history of the matter, and the Council will observe that we have had several changes of system throughout these years. Once we had the town practically paying the whole; then we had Government paying the whole; then we moved back to the town paying the bulk and the Government contributing a part, and then back again to Government assuming the whole charge. So for all these courses historical precedent can be claimed, while mention has been made by various speakers of precedents from other countries. These generally support the theory that the cost of the police should be, at any rate in part, a local charge, and they also have an interesting bearing upon the distribution of control. Especially in view of what Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray has said, I would like to explain to the Council what the position is. The Kumar has given the Council to believe that if this change of system of payment was made, the complete municipalisation of the police would follow as a matter of course. That suggestion is not supported by the experience of other countries, and I may read from a handbook on European police systems, which says:—

> In all the capitals and large commercial centres the police are under the control of the State rather than of the city

That is to say, in most European cities a large degree of control over the police rests with Government. The position of the London metropolitan police is of particular interest. Its cost is mainly met by a rate on the parishes, though a percentage thereof is contributed by the Exchequer which also makes certain other specific grants. But as regards control the police are subordinate to the Home Office alone. The County Council has no power, and no control is even exercised by Parliament. The budget is not even seen in full by Parliament.

As regards other cities in England and Scotland, the cost of the police is a charge upon the town, control being exercised by a watch committee appointed from the local municipality. The Exchequer, however, contributes a sum not exceeding half of the total cost of pay and clothing, subject to certificates of efficiency, and by this means there are few matters which the Home Office cannot compel. They in fact exercise a very extensive control.

The position of the Home Office is stronger, and the position of the local bodies is weaker, in the case of the county police, who are controlled by a standing joint committee formed of an equal number of Justices, appointed by quarter sessions, and of County Councillors, appointed by the County Council. The County Council is bound to meet the budget

as approved by this committee. The central Exchequer makes grants similar to those in the case of towns, and through them can exercise the same degree of control.

In Continental towns the position is somewhat similar. In the three large cities of Paris, Lyons and Marseilles, the control of the police by Government is definite and undoubted; even in other French towns, while control is nominally vested in the local councils, yet in practice the central Government exercises considerable powers of direction. In Germany before the war the local bodies, with two exceptions, were practically debarred from the local management of their police. State control was paramount. In Italy the police are practically a State affair. In Holland and Belgium only is a considerable control exercised by local bodies.

I have now endeavoured to explain to the Council what was the old history of the Calcutta police in this aspect, and also to indicate most cursorily the systems current elsewhere. Turning to this particular resolution, I have already stated that it is not surprising that it has been brought forward, and in view of what I have said of the ancient history, I think it is a matter which well deserves to be ventilated, and a committee is an obvious means of doing so. Obviously various parties are concerned. There is the Calcutta tax-payer, there is the Corporation and there is the *mufassal* tax-payer. Obviously also various incidental issues have to be examined—if a rate is justifiable upon what scale should it be levied and upon whom should it fall; should the State contribute anything towards the cost, and if so, how much? All these are matters for discussion after hearing persons representing the various interests involved. I therefore take no exception to the general principle of the resolution, though I would like to modify its wording a little. If we are going to have a committee I suggest that it is better to leave open the question of accepting the principle of a local rate. Let the committee hear all sides and let them say what their views are as regards this point. Further I would prefer not to be absolutely bound as to the number on the Committee. Without consulting various interests we cannot definitely say what a suitable number would be. There would, of course, be a non-official majority; otherwise there are certain Calcutta interests and the interests of the mufassal tax-payer to be considered. I would like to have a free hand as to these details. If Mr. Dutt will move his resolution in the following form, the local Government will raise no objection to it:—"This Council recommends to the Government that a committee consisting of officials and non-officials be appointed to consider the incidence of the cost of the Calcutta police, with special reference to the possibility of its being met in whole or part from the proceeds of a police rate."

There was a suggestion by Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray that this inquiry should be entrusted to the Police Retrenchment Committee which has recently been appointed. As regards that I have an open mind, but

I would point out to the Council that this is particularly a matter in which Calcutta is interested, and I think that in the Retrenchment Committee Calcutta representation was not conspicuous. In a matter of this kind we must let the Corporation of Calcutta, as representing the public of Calcutta, have their say, and *primâ facie* it would seem best to have a separate committee.

Mr. A. C. Dutt having accepted the modified resolution the President put it to the Council whether the mover would be allowed to move the resolution in the modified form.

The Council agreed.

The President then stated that the discussion would proceed on the resolution as amended.

Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: I decided to oppose the motion of Mr. Dutt but since it has been modified in a very important aspect, I do not think it is worth while for us to oppose it Sir, I stand here as a representative of the citizens of Calcutta and I find that the members of this Council, at least some of them, think that the Calcutta people or their representatives in the Council are bound to take partial and one-sided view of the whole question. This is not fair and before I proceed further I would give them an assurance that I am not disposed to do so. If it be thought just and proper that Calcutta should bear the whole burden of its own police, I for myself would accept the situation. But, Sir, what struck me most was the unfair and partial comparison drawn by some of the members here between Calcutta and certain European cities without knowing how matters stood. My friend Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray has made a mistake in placing Calcutta on the same line with other cities. We know that European cities pay taxes much higher than Calcutta My friend, the mover of the resolution, is, I presume, aware that certain taxes and rates are levied from the citizens of Calcutta and there are certain revenues which should have come to them but are not allotted to them. The most important among them is the excise duty If the excise duty does not come to the citizens of Calcutta why should Calcutta people bear the burden of police? They may justly say give us the revenue and then give us the burden. If you do not give us the ways and means but only ask us to shoulder the burden will that be fair? My friend, the Kumar, says that he who pays for the piper has the right to call the tune. I quite agree with him. But does not Calcutta contribute heavily towards the revenues of Bengal? Now can we undertake the upkeep of police without help from the public revenue? Another important factor is this—is Calcutta only a city for the citizens of Calcutta or is it a city for the convenience for the whole of Bengal, including my friends, the Rajas, the Maharajas, the Council Members; and the "poor villagers" of the Kumar?

There is another factor. If we have to take up the whole burden of the Police the Corporation will have to levy an additional tax of 7½ per cent. over and above the 19½ per cent. we are now paying. Will the citizens of Calcutta and the gentlemen coming from mufassal and other places be prepared to bear an additional burden of 7½ per cent.? If they are able and willing to do so, then it is all right. There are many other important factors and I am glad to find that Sir Henry Wheeler has given the history of the case and has tried to put before us the different aspects of the question. I do not object to the whole thing being threshed out in the Committee and I am sure that if there is an impartial inquiry, we have got nothing to fear. The other day we heard a comparison between Bombay and Calcutta and very often analogy is drawn between these two cities, but we know that the Bombay system is very much different to that of Calcutta. Their requirements are quite different from those of ours, and the gentlemen who draw such comparison often do so without trying to find out what the differences are. I hope that the gentlemen who draw comparisons between Calcutta and other cities should study their comparative sources of revenue. Give the citizens of Calcutta the revenue of European cities and, I am perfectly sure, they would be prepared to undertake the police charges. Why should not they? Where is the difficulty in taking over the upkeep of the police if we have the funds? There is another point that strikes me. Some of the provincial cities of India have undertaken the police charge, but it must be remembered that they have got the octroi duties. Would you like to have octroi duties introduced here by the Corporation of Calcutta? If you seriously do so you may ask Calcutta to undertake the charge of the Police. I do not like to take more time of the Council. I think it is the wisest policy to have an inquiry and we do not like to burke an inquiry. Let there be an inquiry by all means and it would clear the air. Let it not be said that Calcutta is enjoying certain privileges at the cost of the province. It would be quite unfair to do so.

With these words, Sir, I support the amended resolution and I welcome an inquiry.

Dr. A. SUHRAWARDY: I beg to move that the question be now put.

The PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): I think I should allow one more representative of Calcutta to speak before I put the closure.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: We are in a democratic age, enjoying the fruits of a democratic institution, and I am sure the members on the official bench will be enjoying a sight or rather will be congratulating us, that this is democracy with a vengeance. I have listened to the speech of Mr. Dutt and what I find is this: that

the whole idea that dominates his mind is that the cost of the Presidency police should be borne by the rate-payers of Calcutta. The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler finding that this will naturally raise a storm of opposition to the proposal has come forward with an amended resolution, which I am, for the time being, prepared to accept. But in this connection may I suggest that a slight change in the wording of the resolution will perhaps make the intention of the mover of the amendment and those who are prepared to accept his amendment more clear? His amendment runs thus:—"This Council recommends to the Government that a Committee consisting of officials and non-officials be appointed to consider the question of the cost of the Calcutta police with special reference to the possibility of this being met in whole or in part from the proceeds of a police rate." In lieu of the word "possibility" I think perhaps it will be more clear if the word "desirability" or "advisability" be substituted. From the speech of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler, as far as I understand, he does not want the House to commit itself to any definite views on the subject. It is the intention of the House, I am sure, to get the public opinion on the subject, to consult all public bodies and then to form their opinion on this very important question. Having regard to that fact, I think if the word "desirability" or "advisability" is substituted for the word "possibility," the intention of the Council will be very clear. I do not know whether the Hon'ble mover is inclined to accept this suggestion.

Then with reference to the speech that has been delivered by Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray, one feature of that speech is that wherever the people tax themselves, they should have the power to administer the proceeds of that taxation. From this proposal Sir Henry Wheeler has strongly dissented.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: I have merely endeavoured to point out that this theory is not entirely supported by evidence in other countries. Beyond that I have not said anything, but have simply tried to explain the facts.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: The history that has been given of the police rates by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler is very interesting. But I come to the modern history commencing from the time of the Justices. We all know that when the police rate was imposed in Calcutta by the Justices, the whole administration of the police, including the budget, was entirely in the hands of the Justices. Reading some of the old proceedings of the Corporation, I find that the pay of the Deputy Commissioner of Police could not be raised by Rs. 100 without the sanction of the Justices and without discussion in the Corporation. In 1884, when it was proposed to extend the town of Calcutta by adding the suburban areas to it, there was a great opposition from the people of Calcutta and a great debate in the Council and

in the Corporation as to how to meet the cost of the sanitary improvements of Calcutta and especially of enlarged Calcutta. The Government of Lord Dufferin came forward with the offer that the burden of maintaining the police would be taken off the shoulders of Calcutta, and Calcutta would have to spend, as has been stated by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler, not less than Rs. 3 lakhs for the improvement of the added area. We all know that Calcutta is now a changed city, and it is due to the steady improvements that have been effected by the Corporation, and it is quite clear that from the funds at present at the disposal of the Corporation it is impossible for them to pay any contribution for the maintenance of the police force in Calcutta. As has been very correctly observed or rather estimated by Rai Dr. Haridhan Dutt Bahadur one per cent. will raise about Rs. 4 lakhs and if we have to pay roughly Rs. 26 to Rs. 30 lakhs, it will come to 7 or 8 per cent. I do not know whether not only the people of Calcutta but the people of the mufassal, who largely reside in Calcutta, would be prepared to pay this double taxation, *i.e.*, taxation in Calcutta for the maintenance of the police as well as taxation for the maintenance of police in their own place. I think, therefore, having regard to all these facts the matter should be left entirely open, and in that view I suggest that the word "possibility" should be substituted by the word "desirability" or "advisability." For my part I may say this: that Calcutta is not a city for the people of Calcutta only: it is the premier city of India, it is the provincial capital of Bengal, and people from all parts of Bengal come and reside here. The question of further taxation will naturally be a very intricate question because it will not be possible to levy rates only on the property-holders of Calcutta. If taxation is to be levied it must be levied on all people coming and sojourning here. And then the question of income-tax has been touched upon by the mover of the original resolution. The total yield of income-tax from the entire province is about Rs. 3½ crores, and I understand that barring Rs. 30 or Rs. 40 lakhs the whole of the rest is realised in Calcutta. Therefore it will be seen that the police force, if necessary, is more necessary for not only the people of Calcutta but also for the trade and commerce of Calcutta which means the trade and commerce of the entire province of Bengal.

Then reference has also been made to the excise tax—whether the excise tax will endure or vanish I do not know—but this also brings in a large amount to the coffers of Government. In Bombay, Madras and in other Presidency towns, the municipalities have got this extra revenue to their Exchequer, but in Calcutta they have none. I think, therefore, all these points should be considered and the matter should be kept entirely open. I therefore think that, if the Hon'ble Member is prepared to substitute the word "advisability" or "desirability" in lieu of the word "possibility," it would make the intention of the Council more clear.

Raja MANILAL SINGH ROY: I beg to move that the question be now put.

The motion for closure was then put, and on a division being taken it was lost.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: I must first of all congratulate the poor villager, like Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray, who having paid his quota to the Rs. 55 lakhs of chowkidari tax, now comes to support a proposal which means his paying something more, as a rich citizen of Calcutta. After the history of the Calcutta police which has been given by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler, it is hardly necessary to go into the details of this question. While moving a resolution in the last Council for the retrenchment of the police expenditure, I suggested that the Calcutta police and the Bengal police might be amalgamated. Now, it is a question of very great importance, because the supervision of the Calcutta police has practically been taken away from the hands of the Inspector-General of Police, Bengal, who is mainly responsible to the Government of Bengal and through the Government of Bengal to this Council. On the principle that the man who pays the piper calls for the tune, a separate establishment for the Calcutta police has no justification. As has been said by the Kumar Bahadur of Tahirpur, a new committee has been appointed to go into the question of the organisation of the police of Bengal. If this question of the maintenance of the Calcutta police is referred to a separate committee, then there is great danger that the deliberations of these two committees may come into conflict and that there may be want of co-ordination. Therefore, I would request both the mover of the resolution and the Hon'ble Member of Government to consider whether it would not be advisable to refer this matter to the committee which has already been appointed. As regards the question of the extraordinarily high expenditure that the Calcutta police costs the people, my friend Rai Dr. Haridhan Dutt Bahadur has deprecated comparison between Calcutta and Bombay because he seems to think that there is a great deal of difference between the conditions of Calcutta and those of Bombay which difference in his opinion is not known to the critics. I hope my friend, the Rai Bahadur, will admit that the Government of India, at any rate, may be supposed to know the difference that exists between the system prevailing in Calcutta and that in Bombay. I hope it will not surprise him to hear that the Finance Committee of the Government of India, as early as 1887, directed an inquiry to be made as to the relative cost of the Presidency police of the three towns of Madras, Calcutta and Bombay, and the result of that inquiry showed that the cost of the Calcutta police was the heaviest of all. The reason given was that in a big industrial and rich city like Calcutta, the cost was bound to be great. I ask, in all seriousness, is it fair to ask the whole of Bengal to pay for the special cost of policing an industrial and rich town like Calcutta? We have lately learnt from Mr. Clarke's

report, that goondaism, which is a special feature of the city of Calcutta, requires a large amount of police force, necessitating a great deal of expenditure. In order to protect the industrial citizens of Calcutta from goondaism, is it fair to ask the villagers to pay? Does Calcutta pay for the cost of the village chowkidar? I think it is only fair that the citizens and industrialists of Calcutta should come forward to bear their share of the cost. Government have been pleased to say that they have accepted the principle of the resolution, but I again suggest to the mover of the resolution and the Hon'ble Member of Government that this matter should be referred to the committee that has already been appointed, so that the question of the amalgamation of the Calcutta and the Bengal police and the question of transfer of the financial responsibility from one head to the other, may not be jeopardised.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: I oppose not only the original resolution but also the one for a committee as suggested by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler. I have much pleasure in seconding the amendment which has been moved by Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur. I understand he has suggested that in the resolution which has been moved by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler the word "possibility" should be substituted by the word "desirability." I beg to submit that if it is to be referred to a committee, the committee should inquire into the question of the desirability or advisability of asking the Calcutta Corporation to pay for the maintenance of the police of Calcutta. We are informed that the cost of the maintenance of the Presidency police is Rs. 35 lakhs per annum. It appears that one per cent. of the rate of the Calcutta Corporation totals about Rs 5½ lakhs, and, therefore, if the Corporation is called upon to pay this sum they shall have to increase the rates which are at present 19½ per cent. by about 6½ per cent Not only that They are already committed to several schemes and for that purpose also they shall increase the rates further. The Calcutta Corporation has just sanctioned a scheme for the improvement of the water supply costing Rs. 2 crores and for the improvement of the drainage, I understand, they shall have to incur an expenditure of another crore of rupees. So far as the Calcutta Improvement Trust is concerned, it has already committed itself to the improvement of Barabazar, and the citizens of Calcutta shall have to pay additional rates and taxes for these improvements. The citizens of Calcutta pay a huge sum as income-tax. It appears from the answer which has just been given that, out of Rs. 4,39,000 Calcutta contributes Rs 3,46,000 as income-tax. All the proceeds of stamps are utilised by the Government of Bengal and not a single farthing is paid to the Calcutta Corporation. Calcutta is the centre of commerce of Bengal; it is also the centre of industries. In other civilised cities which have been just referred to—I mean the cities of Europe—I understand that the police charges are met by the State and not by the local authorities. As in the case of

the commercial cities of Europe similar is the state of things in Calcutta. I urge that the police charges should, on the same ground, be paid by the Government and not by the Corporation. It is well known to you that the Calcutta Corporation has to contribute a substantial sum towards the maintenance of the hospitals of Calcutta and in these hospitals not only the citizens of Calcutta but also the people from the mufassal are interested. Government is primarily responsible for the protection of life and property of the people and therefore this charge should be met by the Government and not by the local people. It may be said that the chowkidari tax is realised from the villagers; I am opposed to it on that ground, but that is no reason why the citizens of Calcutta should be called upon to pay for their police.

With these remarks, Sir, I beg to submit that as Calcutta is the premier city of India and as Calcutta is the capital of the province of Bengal, this charge be met, not by the Calcutta Corporation, not even by the Government of Bengal but, by the Government of India.

Maulvi MAHAMMED MADASSUR HUSSAIN: In these days of financial stringency, in these days when we are faced with an overwhelming deficit, it is our duty to find out means whereby the inroads on the general revenues of the country may be decreased. In England, and in all the other European countries, all the cities pay for the maintenance of their own police. Now, in this very Bengal, the village police is maintained by an organisation called Panchayat. If the Bengal rural police is maintained by the levy of local rates from the villagers, I think that there can be no reason why the Calcutta police and the town police which are maintained for the benefit of Calcutta and particular towns respectively should not be maintained by local rates. If the villagers are compelled to maintain their own police force, I do not know what can be the reason to exempt the dwellers of Calcutta and other towns from maintaining their own police. Are the dwellers of the villages richer and wealthier than those of Calcutta and other towns? I do not think they are. I do not think that any one will assert that the dwellers of Calcutta and other towns are poorer. I think that every one will agree that the people of Calcutta are far wealthier than the villagers. Therefore, in order to remove the differential treatment between the villagers, and town and Calcutta people and also to free the general revenues, I would support this resolution. Rai Dr. Haridhan Dutt Bahadur says that they do not get any excise revenue. In other larger towns of Europe, they get excise revenue. Therefore, the Calcutta people should not be made to pay for their police. Whether the Calcutta Corporation should or should not get a portion or whole of the excise revenue is a different question altogether. If the Calcutta Corporation pays for the police, then they may ask for the excise duty. We are not now considering whether the Calcutta Corporation are entitled to any excise revenue or not, but

what we are considering is whether the Calcutta Corporation should not be made to pay for their own police. If this principle is accepted, then the other question of the demand of the Corporation for a portion of the excise revenue may be considered at another time.

Then my friend Babu Amulya Dhone Addy says that the Corporation is going to incur enormous expenditure on other schemes: therefore, they should not be made to pay for their police. If they are going to spend enormous sums, it is only for their own benefit and not for the benefit of Bengal. It must also be borne in mind that the Calcutta people get their income from the mufassal. The industrial and commercial magnates get their income from the mufassal.

Mr. R. M. WATSON-SMYTH: Certainly not.

Maulvi MAHAMMED MADASSUR HUSSAIN: That may not be your opinion, but, in my opinion, the grains of Bengal contribute not a little to the prosperity of these merchants, and where do these grains come from? They come from the mufassal and it is by dealing on these grains that these merchants make their money.

Then those cloths which they import from England and other foreign countries. To whom do they sell? They sell all these to the mufassalites and it is from there they make their piles.

Then again where do these Calcutta lawyers earn their money from? It is from the mufassal litigants that they earn their money. Therefore I say that all these industrial magnates and commercial magnates and the lawyers of Calcutta earn their money from the mufassal and it is not for them to say that we shall not spend anything for the benefit of the mufassalites, and the mufassal people also do not want that they should spend anything for them. What they want is bare justice. As I have already submitted, look to London and other industrial and commercial cities. They all maintain their police. Look even to your own villages. They maintain their own police. Why should not Calcutta people be compelled to pay for their police? Will they grudge this Rs. 35 lakhs, which is not a very large sum for the industrial and commercial magnates and big lawyers. Compare the wealth of the whole of Bengal with that of Calcutta and you will find that the whole wealth of Bengal is concentrated in Calcutta. When that is the case, they should be made to pay not only for the maintenance of their own police by which they are benefited but also for some other things. I think that the proposition that has been brought before this Council by my friend Mr. Dutt is quite correct and he is quite right in saying that the Calcutta people should bear their portion of the expenditure. Under the Bengal Local Self-Government and Municipal Acts, the town people must be made to pay for their own police. Their turn will come next. Another time a resolution may be moved in this Council. The Bengal Self-Government Act may also be amended. These arguments may be

repeated then. The only question now before the House is whether the Calcutta people should be made to pay for their police or not, and I submit for the reasons, which I have adduced and also for the reasons which my friend Mr. Dutt has submitted, the principle that the Calcutta people should be made to pay for their own police should be accepted, especially so when the villagers are paying for the maintenance of their own police. The inequity is extreme. Formerly the chowkidars were maintained by the assignment of Government lands. Later, these lands were confiscated by Government and subsequently settled with the landlords. The villagers were then exempted from paying any chowkidari tax, but now in virtue of the Village Chowkidari Act and also by virtue of this new Act, which has recently been passed and which is going to be enforced under the Village Self-Government Act, the villagers are made to pay for the maintenance of their police. I do not know what earthly reason can be assigned for exempting these rich people who have impoverished rural Bengal and why should they not be compelled equally to pay for their police?

With these words, I beg to support the resolution which has been moved by my friend.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: This resolution is, to my mind, a very mischievous one, though apparently it looks as innocent as the mover himself. One thing that strikes me is that it leads to a quarrel between Calcutta and the mufassal and my esteemed friend the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler has, by his speech, helped the mufassal people and is now sitting quietly enjoying the fun. There may be two ideas in his mind: one to see how we quarrel and how we divide and they rule, or there may be another that is the more reasonable view that is, that this Rs. 35 lakhs must come out of Calcutta. Mr. Dutt thinks that by making Calcutta pay this sum, they will be required to pay less. Not the least, do not think so. You will be made to pay all the same. You will not get this Rs. 35 lakhs to be utilised in the mufassal for sanitation. Never think so. The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler has certainly not given you any hope that this Rs. 35 lakhs, or it may be Rs. 55 lakhs, is going to be spent by Government in the mufassal for sanitary improvements. Never think so. Why quarrel over nothing? Calcutta and the rest of Bengal is but one. Unnecessary waste of time and unnecessary quarrel. The money is ours. We are the children of the soil. We are all one and the same and belong to the same household. It is useless quarrelling over nothing.

As regards the liability of Calcutta to pay, I think that it is well for hon'ble members to remember that so far as the Calcutta Corporation is concerned, we have come absolutely to the end of our tether. Under the Act, the maximum rate which can be levied is 23 per cent. and our esteemed Chairman, Mr. Payne, reminds me about the 2 per cent. more for the Calcutta Improvement Trust. Thus the maximum

rate amounts to 25 per cent. We are now levying 19½ per cent. We have come up to the topmost rung of the ladder. If we have got to pay Rs. 35 lakhs, plus something every year which the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler has not got to collect, you will expect that in that matter you will not have the opposition of the whole Council. It is the poor people that will shout; if they are to pay Rs. 10 lakhs, Rs. 20 lakhs, go on *ad infinitum*. The result will be this: We are now levying 19½ per cent. and if we add 7 per cent. more it becomes 26½ per cent. far more than what is provided in the Act, far more than the people of Calcutta can pay. But you may very well say, "we do not care if you have reached the topmost limit of taxation." That is very good. So long as you come to Calcutta, drink our first class water and use our sewage, you may choose or can afford to be ungrateful, but you must remember that but for this splendid town and the great improvements in its public health, where will these mufassal gentlemen, who are suffering from malaria or other diseases, go to if they want to recoup their health? Calcutta has not been doing any good to them. You simply say, "let Calcutta pay." I shall be the last person to suggest that we have a right to be selfish. Oh, no! If we are paid our dues by the Government, we have not the slightest objection to pay this Rs. 35 lakhs, plus something or plus something. Let them pay us the excise revenue. Let them pay us a portion of the income-tax. We shall do all these. Otherwise, where will the money come from?

My esteemed friend is a member of the Bar here. He is a mufassal man. He will have to pay here and will have to pay there also. The gentleman was born in the mufassal but brought up in a town. Bengal is one. Interest is the same. The difference is merely nominal, simply an eye-wash. Let it not be divided into two—Calcutta and non-Calcutta. Useless fight!

There is another matter. I just thought whether I should support this resolution or not but as a rule as it was said of Richard Cobden that whenever the *Times* took a certain attitude, he always took the opposite view, so, as soon as I found that Government is willing to accept this resolution, I found out that there must be something in it. I must oppose it and am bound to oppose it. Why is Government anxious to support it? Everybody can very well see that the object is to get Rs. 35 lakhs from Calcutta, but the Rs. 2 crores from the mufassal will always be the same. Who will be there to oppose it? Divide the Council into Calcutta and non-Calcutta and make our rule more firm. I will ask my friends not to listen to the friendly advice of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler. Let us suffer together. Suffering together is the only chance of doing good to ourselves. Do not try to make yourself ultra loyal. We are brothers. Let us suffer together. Let us make our protests also together. Let us join in a common undertaking to have our own money for our own use, not to be beggars for our own money. That is

what we should do and not what you want. That is not the correct attitude at all.

Professor S. C. MUKHERJI: I beg to move that the question be now put.

The motion was carried.

A division was then taken with the following result:—

AYES.

Afzal, Nawabzada K. M. Khan Bahadur.
Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Emaduddin.
Ahmed, Mr. M.
Ahmed, Maulvi Rafi Uddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Yakuinuddin.
Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.
Arnamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar.
Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mohamed.
Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath.
Banerjee, Rai Bahadur Abinash Chandra.
Barma, Rai Sahib Panchanan.
Biss, Mr. E. E.
Bompas, Mr. C. H.
Charmakar, Babu Rasik Chandra.
Chaudhuri, Babu Kishori Mohan
Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Hafizar Rahman.
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad
Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath.
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Das, Babu Bhishmadev.
Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra.
Donald, Mr. J.
Dutt, Mr. Ajoy Chunder.
Dutta, Babu Annada Charan.
Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan.
Faroqui, K. C. M.
French, Mr. F. C.
Ghatak, Rai Sahib Nilmani
Gupta, Mr. N. B.
Haq, Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
Huq, Maulvi Ekramul.
Hussain, Maulvi Mahammed Madassur.
Karim, Maulvi Abdul.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlul.
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.
Khan, Babu Devendra Lal.
Khan, Maulvi Hamid-ud-din.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin.
Khan, Mr. Razaur Rahman.
Lang, Mr. J.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble.
Makramali, Munshi.
Marr, Mr. A.
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra.
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
Mukharji, Babu Satish Chandra.
Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhone.
Mukherji, Professor S. C.
Mukhopadhaya, Babu Sarat Chandra.
Mullick, Babu Nirode Behary.
Nasker, Babu Hem Chandra.
O'Kinealy, Lt.-Col. Frederick.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.
Pahlowan, Maulvi Md. Abdul Jubbar.
Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur.
Rauf, Maulvi Shah Abdur.
Ray, Babu Bhabendra Chandra.
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar.
Ray, Rai Bahadur Upendra Lal.
Ray Chaudhuri, Mr. Krishna Chandra.
Ray Choudhury, Raja Manmatha Nath.
Roy, Babu Bijoy Prosad Singh.
Roy, Babu Jogendra Krishna.
Roy, Babu Nalini Nath.
Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra.
Roy, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh.
Roy, Raja Manilall Singh.
Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Sailaja Nath.
Sarkar, Babu Jogesh Chandra.
Sinha, Babu Surendra Narayan.
Suhrawardy, Dr. A.
Suhrawardy, Dr. Hassan.
Suhrawardy, Mr. Huseyn Shaheed.
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry.
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

NOES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.
Aley, Shaikh Mahboob.
Ali, Mr. Syed Erfan.
Basu, Babu Jatindra Nath.
Bose, Mr. S. M.
De, Babu Fanindralal.
Dutt, Rai Bahadur Dr. Haridhan.
Law, Raja Reshee Case.
McKenzie, Mr. D. P.
Maitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Pal, Rai Bahadur Radha Charan.
Payne, Mr. C. F.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Sarkar, Babu Rishindra Nath.
Stark, Mr. H. A.
Watson-Smyth, Mr. R. M.

The Ayes being 77 and the Noes 17, the resolution was carried.

State Medical Faculty.

Babu HEM CHANDRA NASKER: "This Council recommends to Government the establishment of a State Faculty of Examiners to control the existing institutions of Homœopathy, Ayurvedi and Unani, thereby standardising the system of education followed in the several kinds of institutions."

One of the crying needs of the day is to have as many qualified medical practitioners as possible with the limited resources at our command. Besides the Allopathist, our countrymen resort to other medical practitioners, viz., the Homœopathist, the Kaviraj and the Hakims, but I am sorry to say that although there is no dearth in number of these practitioners, their qualifications are hopelessly meagre and some of them do not at all possess even the rudimentary knowledge of medical science. To combat this evil and in order that duly qualified practitioners of Homœopathy, Ayurvedi and Unani may be turned out in large numbers, some arrangement should be made to foster the existing institutions by framing a standard of the education to be followed there.

As regards Homœpathy there exists as many institutions as there are leading practitioners, the total number known being about a dozen. These so-called institutions bring out annually about 250 students most of whom, I am afraid, have not got even the primary knowledge of medical science, though some of them possess a high sounding diploma closely analogous to the degrees and diplomas of Indian universities. These institutions are neither provided with the requirements necessary to impart even the preliminary knowledge of medical science nor is any sort of discipline maintained whereby the regularity of attendance of the students as well as of the teachers might be secured. The final examinations of the candidates of these institutions are also done in a very perfunctory way so that practically all the examinees come out successful.

As regards Ayurvedi and Unani, I may state that there are practically as many institutions as there are Kavirajes and Hakim. In view of the fact that a committee has recently been appointed to investigate the Ayurvedic and Unani systems of medicine, I think the above committee will be able to divulge the secrets how the existing Kavirajes and Hakims do get their *Upadhis* and *Khitabs* from their respective preceptors. Amongst the institutions now running there are a few of them which may serve the purpose of turning out qualified practitioners if Government control them and arrange for their syllabuses of study providing surgery, midwifery, etc. I may mention the name of the Ayurvedi College at Fariapukur Street founded by Kaviraj Jamini Bhusan Roy, M.A., M.B., with a qualified staff, which may well serve the purpose of sending candidates to such examination. The Homœopathic College founded by Dr. P. C. Mazumdar also has good materials to be the nucleus of a good Homœopathic College.

The financial consideration should not be a bar against instituting such a faculty by Government. The examination fees will go a great way to meet the expenses and if the Government looks sympathetically on Homœopathy, Ayurvedic and Unani systems, I daresay my countrymen will not be wanting to carry on this work by founding good institutions answering to requirements.

In the above circumstances it is desirable that good institutions capable of turning out qualified practitioners in the aforesaid three systems of medicines are sadly needed for the benefit of our poor countrymen. For this purpose the establishment of a State Faculty of Examiners will, I believe, be able to control the existing institutions and will ultimately make them sound ones capable of turning out qualified medical practitioners thereby saving the public from the hands of unscrupulous men.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: I accept much of what has been said by the mover of this resolution, but I am afraid I do not see my way to see eye to eye with him in regard to the resolution which he wants this House to adopt. I am afraid my friend is under some misapprehension with regard to the exact purport and the scope and object of the Bengal Medical Act, and the organisations which have been formed under it. Under the Act, we have got the State Faculty. The State Faculty organises examinations of students of schools and colleges approved by the Council of Medical Registration. That is the system which is at present in vogue, my friend will understand that the whole of this system, and the whole of the organisation is based on the acceptance of one system of medicine by the State, viz., Allopathy. Homœopathy has absolutely no place either among the personnel of the State Faculty or that of the Council of Medical Registration. Obviously, bodies constituted such as these, are not qualified to deal with homœopathic institutions or to suggest means for their improvement. Therefore, if this resolution is accepted, organisations will have to be formed outside the scope of the Bengal Medical Act. That is my first objection to the resolution.

My second objection is that a substantial part of the resolution is now *sub judice*. My friend has already referred to the two committees, one dealing with the Unani system of medicine, and the other with the Ayurvedic system. The object of these committees is to suggest means for the restoration and improvement of those systems.

Therefore, at least two-thirds of the proposition which he asks the House to accept is covered by these two committees, which are sitting to consider these two systems. It seems to me, therefore, and I am prepared to proceed, as far as it is possible for a Government to proceed, in order to satisfy my friend that I should best meet his views if I submit this resolution for the consideration of these two committees, requesting

them to make such recommendations as they may think fit in accordance with the terms of the resolution. I hope this will satisfy my friend, and that he will withdraw his resolution.

Babu HEM CHANDRA NASKER: After the assurance given by the Hon'ble the Minister, I beg leave to withdraw my resolution.

The resolution was, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

Restriction on intoxicating liquors and drugs.

Professor S. C. MUKHERJI: "This Council recommends to the Government that early action be taken to restrict the consumption of intoxicating liquors and drugs in Calcutta and Bengal on the following lines, viz.:—(1) the application of the principle of local option to municipal areas as a first step towards the full realisation of the policy of self-government in excise administration; (2) the acceptance of the policy of restricted consumption by—(*i*) the levying of an enhanced duty and an increase of retail market prices; (*ii*) a reduction in the number of shops and the strict application of departmental rules to the sites of shops; (*iii*) the limitation of hours of sale; and (*iv*) the reduction of the issue of strength."

This resolution is a demand for the irreducible minimum. The country as a whole demands total prohibition. No other subject commands such absolute unanimity. The Hindu, the Muhammadan, the Indian Christian, the Moderate and the Extremist, the co-operator and the non-co-operator stand on a common platform so far as the excise policy is concerned. Nothing would give me greater pleasure than to see Bengal pronounced "dry" to-morrow. Look at resolutions Nos. 15 and 167. Resolution No. 15 runs thus: "This Council recommends to the Government that immediate steps be taken by the issue of circulars to officers concerned, directing them to limit the number of licensed liquor shops, and otherwise to discourage the drink habit in Bengal, with a view to total prohibition within 3 years," and resolution No. 167 runs thus: "This Council recommends to the Government that a committee of members of this Council, with a non-official majority, be appointed without delay, to consider what measures may be adopted to prevent any Moslem from buying or selling wine." There you have an amplification of the Muhammadan attitude towards the subject.

But there are important practical considerations that have prompted me to adopt a policy of restricted consumption. It is no intention of mine to introduce a huge financial dislocation at a time of financial stringency. The Government derives an enormous revenue out of excise. It constitutes one-fifth of the provincial revenue. Total prohibition would mean finding 181 lakhs. I have, therefore, adopted in

my resolution a policy of restricted consumption. How is this policy to be translated into action?

The very first step is the adoption of the principle of local option in municipal areas. The settled policy of the Government in excise administration is maximum of revenue with minimum of consumption. I have no desire to enter into the thorny question as to whether the Government has succeeded in carrying out its policy. The Government thinks it has; the people think it has not. The people think the policy has signally failed. The enormous increase in revenue means a very appreciable increase in consumption. The Government says, and says emphatically, revenue is not its primary consideration. The people say, and say emphatically, revenue is the primary consideration with the Government.

The excise policy of the Government is not the policy of the people of the country. We want restricted consumption and we do not mind if it means a shrinkage in revenue. Our ultimate goal is total prohibition and we are praying for the day when the whole of the excise revenue will be blotted out of our provincial budget. It certainly means taking a huge responsibility, but we are doing it with our eyes wide open. The working out of such an ideal will, perhaps, pave the way for taxation in certain other directions. We would far rather see that that is done than to be a party to a revenue which is derived at the expense of the physical deterioration, the intellectual stagnation and the moral ruination of a people. In a matter like this, the voice of the people must be the determining factor. Excise is no longer a reserved subject. It is a transferred subject and the voice of the people must prevail here. In my resolution I have, therefore, indicated the first step. That first step is the application of the principle of local option to municipal areas. I consider it to be a very modest demand. There are large sections of people who will feel I have not gone far enough. I have already given my reason. I have no desire to bring about a financial crisis.

The Hon'ble Minister has already issued a *communiqué* in which he has enunciated his excise policy. His attitude towards this important matter is reflected there. We are deeply grateful to him. His whole attitude is quite sympathetic. He is the representative of the people and it is his paramount duty to take the people into his full confidence. In a matter like this his policy must be determined by the will of the people.

I have, therefore, advocated the principle of local option. The Punjab Council has already adopted this principle. The Madras Temperance Bill, based on local option, is on the legislative anvil there and I have every reason to believe that it will be passed into law. The Assam Council has accepted total prohibition in ten years.

It may be said there is the provision for Licensing Boards and Excise Advisory Committees. Here you have the testimony of a non-official member of the Licensing Board for the Calcutta district—

The purpose for which the Licensing Board was created, to introduce an element of public control, has never been realised. The officials have always had a majority and Revenue authorities have decided matters. The influence of the Collector has been much too strong and the Board has not been a real licensing authority at all. It has not had anything to do with wholesale licenses, it has not had anything to do with the choice of vendors, it has not had anything to do with the settlement of hours of sale or the strength at which liquor should be sold. It has never been able to influence the department so that the consumption of liquor and drugs was really restricted!

What does this go to show? It goes to show this that the popular control has been practically *nil*. Now, what is wanted is the application of the principle of local option. That is our irreducible minimum. If the Reforms really mean self-government by the people, here is a sphere in which it can be granted.

The only argument that appears to have weight is that this policy interferes with personal liberty and the majority want to tyrannise over the minority. This is what the drinkers of the United States are saying. But social welfare is quite as important as individual pleasure and, in many matters, as in the case of dealing with other poisons, the control of the majority over the liberty of the minority is not regarded as unfair. The real question is: Is it an evil? That is the crucial point. If so, such a tyranny is justifiable. The Government admits it is an evil, or else it would not advocate minimum consumption; it would not advocate the policy of raising taxation as high as possible; it would not be prepared to reduce the number of shops, etc. It is a clear admission that it is a social evil and, as such, must be done away with. We cannot perpetuate an evil for ever.

The Council here adjourned for fifteen minutes.

The Council reassembled at 6-30 P.M.

Professor S. C. MUKHERJI: Now I pass on to the second part of my resolution. The four points mentioned there are not against the declared policy of Government. But this policy is based on a vitiated principle. That principle is set forth in the Bengal Government resolution, No. 1322 S.R., dated the 4th August, 1914. The following sentence occurs in paragraph 5 of that resolution:—

The Government of India have no desire to interfere with the habits of those who use alcohol in moderation; this is regarded as outside the duty of Government and it is necessary to make due provision for the needs of such persons.

Or, in other words, the principle is the Government exists for the moderate drinker. It thinks its duty to supply drink and drugs to him. It must not do anything which would cause any hardship to the moderate drinker. This vitiated principle regulates the operation

of the various means mentioned in the resolution. Whether it be the question of enhancing duty or increasing of retail prices, or whether it be the question of reducing shops or limiting hours of sale, the whole thing must be so managed as not to put the moderate drinker to any trouble or hardship.

We are up in arms against such a principle. Drinks and drugs are not necessaries of life. This parental solicitude on the part of the Government for the moderate drinker is inexplicable to us. To us the moderate drinker of to-day is the confirmed drinker of to-morrow. We want the Government to abandon this principle and to apply the means without any reference to the moderate drinker. This will certainly mean a change in the mentality of the Government. But it will mean a great boon to the country in the shape of restricted consumption. What is needed is to make those who drink and take drugs pay more heavily for their so-called pleasures, deal more drastically with numbers of shops and sites, to reduce the hours of sale and to lower the issue-strength of alcohol.

The resolution contemplates an urgent and much needed social reform. This is the crying need of the hour. I appeal to the Government to come to our rescue, to respect our wishes and to save our people. I appeal to the Hon'ble Minister to rise to the occasion and to uphold the cherished traditions of the country. I appeal to him to identify himself with us in the matter and help us in our struggle. It will mean the salvation of thousands of families in this province. His name will go down to posterity as a great benefactor of humanity. I appeal to the Council to adopt this resolution without a single dissentient voice. We are the accredited representatives of 45 millions of people. Let us be true to the great trust reposed in us.

Mr. RAZAUR RAHMAN KHAN: I wish to amend my resolution in the following form:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that immediate steps be taken by the issue of circulars to officers concerned, directing them to limit the number of licensed liquor shops, and otherwise to discourage the drink habit in Bengal, with a view to total prohibition within as short a period as practicable."

The PRESIDENT: You are permitted to make the alteration.

Mr. RAZAUR RAHMAN KHAN: It is with a full sense of responsibility and not without a keen appreciation of the difficulties that the Government will have to encounter if total prohibition be adopted in Bengal, that I rise to-day to move this resolution. My learned friend, Professor Mukherji, has also just moved a resolution on the same subject. But Professor Mukherji's view-point is quite different from

that of mine. I want total prohibition. Professor Mukherji's is an elaboration of the present excise policy of the Government of Bengal, *i.e.*, so to exercise the excise law as would produce the maximum of revenue from a minimum of consumption.

My resolution goes to the root of the evil of the drink system. What I want to impress upon the Government is the necessity of recognising total prohibition of the manufacture, importation and sale of intoxicating liquor as the ultimate aim of their excise policy.

All sound legislations are the outcome of the solicitude of the Government for the welfare of the governed. And the most convincing pleas for self-determination of nations and of the institution of national Governments derive their greatest momentum from the fact that the natives of a country know best what legislation would be most conducive to the welfare of their country. The success of the Reforms must depend on how far the elected representatives of the people are enabled to determine and fashion the future policy of the country. And so with no uncertain voice we must let the Executive Government know what the inhabitants of the province, rich or poor, irrespective of race and religion, think of the drink problem in Bengal. I do not believe that there is any section of responsible Indian opinion that has not clearly and without ambiguity declared itself for the total prohibition of the liquor traffic in India at the earliest possible date I do not press the time-limit of three years as the essence of my resolution. All I aim at is to make the Government realise its duty of making Bengal dry within as short a period as practicable

I need not inflict a homily on you as to the necessity for total prohibition in Bengal. The evil effects of intoxicating drinks are well known. Both the great religions of India, Hinduism and Islam, condemn the drink habit in no uncertain terms. In former times all legislation used to draw its sanction from religion; but at this late day of the world religious considerations alone are seldom allowed to interfere with the course of legislation But though religion is no more an apparent factor in law-making, yet its latent influence on the lawmakers is quite well known Therefore I do not think it will be quite out of place if I just quote what the Hindu religion and the Muhammadan religion have to say on this question of temperance. Ancient Hindu legislators are quite positive on this point The greatest of Hindu Munis and leaders of thought in the past condemned drinking.

"*Madya* (wine, even of the superior kind) should not be drunk by anybody, or given to anybody, or accepted by anybody"

"A twice-born man who has (intentionally) drunk, through delusion of mind, (the spirituous liquor called) *Sura* shall drink that liquor boiling hot; when his body has been completely scalded by that, he is freed from his guilt Or he may drink cow's urine, water, milk, clarified butter or liquid cowdung boiling hot until he dies"

The Buddhistic Scriptures strongly condemn the use of intoxicating liquors and drugs by the followers of the creed.

Of the *pancha-sila* which is incumbent on all professing the religion of Buddha, the fifth one prohibits the use of drinks and drugs altogether It runs as follows —

"surá meraya majja pamádatthána veramani sikkhápadam samádiyámi"

"The use of all sorts of intoxicating or spirituous liquors or drugs is the road to death. I accept this instruction."

Buddhism says that the use of all sorts of intoxicating and spirituous liquors or drugs lead to death. As to Islam, once an agent of an international federation of temperance workers requested the late Sir Sayed of Aligarh to join their their orgaisation. Sir Sayed's retort was that he belonged to the greatest Temperance Federation of the world and that he was a Mussalman. The Koranic writers are quite clear on this point.

O you who believe! intoxicants and games of chances and (sacrificing to) stones set up and (dividing by) arrows are only an uncleanness, the devil's work, shun it therefore that you may be successful —Al-mandah (90)

They ask you about intoxicants and games of chance Say In both of them there is a great sin and means of profit for men, and their sin is greater than their profit —Al-Bagma (219).

This much as to the attitude of the Hindus and Moslems to the drink problem. I believe that our Christian and European friends in India are also not without sympathy for the cause of temperance The activities of the Rev Anderson of the Calcutta Temperance Federation and of the Rev. Andrews of the Anglo-Indian League of Temperance go to show how earnest some of our Christian brethren are in the cause of temperance. Sir, as I have said before, religious considerations alone cannot guide the course of legislation in the modern world We ought to look to the rationale of the question and we must judge the question on its merits The curse of the drink habit has been fully realised in the West. The West which had so long been given to inveterate drinking, that West has now realised the evil effects of it. The United States of America have gone dry—completely dry. The law of prohibition has been incorporated in the constitution of the American Republic and those who know the constitution of the American Republic know what that means. In Canada, a part of the glorious British Empire, in the Prince Edward island they have adopted complete prohibition. In 1908, Iceland by a popular vote resolved to prohibit the manufacture, importation and sale of intoxicating liquor. In Norway, nearly half the towns adopted prohibition under the law of 1906. In Belgium and Switzerland, the manufacture and importation of absinthe was forbidden in 1908. In Australia and New Zealand and other parts of the British Empire the prohibition movement is, I believe, gaining fast ground; and I would not be surprised if one fine morning I read in the papers that they have gone altogether dry. If that is the attitude of the West—the West that was so long given to drinking and where the climatic conditions might allow indulgence in moderate drinking, I do not know what attitude shall India take

Whatever sides of human life and activities you consider, you will find that evil effects of drink are manifest. All the eminent medical practitioners of Europe are unanimous in their verdict of the deleterious effect of drink on the health and physical constitution of the people. Sir Frederick Treves, Bart., K.C.V.O., C.B., F.R.C.S., Surgeon with His Majesty the King-Emperor and His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales says:—

> The train of physical wreckage that lies in the wake of drunkenness is, unfortunately, a matter of too common knowledge.

And he says further—

> Alcohol is distinctly a poison and it is a poison which like other poisons has certain uses but the limitation in the use of alcohol should be as strict as the limitation of the use of any other kind of poison.

There are other medical men, viz., Sir Thomas Barlow, Sir Victor Horsley, Professor G. Sims Woodhead, and many others, who speak of the deleterious effect of alcohol on the human constitution. Dr. J. Kellogg says—

> While acute disease is usually the result of accident or infection, chronic disease is for the most part due to the breakdown of the vital machine as the cumulative effects of unhologic habits Between the ages of 20 and 24 years, three hundred men die for every hundred women, and 20 years later nearly four times as many men as women die from diseases of the heart and blood vessels The large use of alcohol and the general use of tobacco by men would seem to be a large factor in causing the great difference in the mortality rate

Then, Sir, there are those who say that moderate drinking does not do any harm. Well, they say, "half a pint of beer will not do any harm." Yes, but "half a pint to-day means half a pint to-morrow, and the next day, and the next, and so on, day after day, week after week, month after month, and year after year. Nay, it often means more than that. The half-pint for dinner paves the way for the half-pint for supper; the half-pint this year often means a pint next year, or, in too many cases, half-pint after half-pint, or even pot after pot."

With the ruin of the physical health, the decay of the mental health sets in. Formerly, it was believed that drinking promoted the clearness of the mental vision, otherwise, argued the unbelievers, how was it that the geniuses of the world, the greatest of the artists and the men of letters were great boozers? Well, we are not geniuses and we may leave them aside and take the average man, average mortals like ourselves. What does the scientific analysis go to show—it shows that drinking has a bad effect on the mental powers of man. Clearness of vision is lost, mental grasp is lost, concentration of powers of clear thinking are lost and every thing that goes for mental health is lost. When the physical health is ruined and the mental balance lost, deterioration of morals gains ground fast apace. The investigations of the Criminal Investigation Department of America and Europe

establish what close connection there is between criminality and drunkenness. What is true of America and Europe is also true of India. Who can say what number of homes and family lives have been ruined by the intemperance of even a single member of a family. The money that is wasted on drinks, if saved, could do something towards relieving the bare necessities of life.

So, in the name of the future health of our nation, and of the moral, mental and social welfare of our country, we expect that total prohibition should be accepted for Bengal. Recently there was a similar resolution moved in the Central Provinces Council and the Hon'ble Minister, Mr. Chitnavis, declared on behalf of the Government that, in view of the strong Indian opinion in favour of total abstention, Government was ready to accept the principle that prohibition was the ultimate goal of its excise policy If that was the case in the Central Provinces, what is Bengal going to do? In the Central Provinces the Government will have to sacrifice 26 per cent of the total revenue, whereas, if we have to sacrifice anything at all we will have to sacrifice 5·2 per cent Therefore, I believe that prohibition should be our ultimate goal as well in this country.

Now, I would meet some of those arguments stock arguments generally—that are advanced against total prohibition. There is a first set of those who do not believe in the necessity—and even if necessity be conceded—of the practicability of a prohibition law. They hold that if one wants to have a drink he will always be able to have it. They believe that it is impossible to have a prohibition law as a practical measure in the country We must, however, see what has been done in America, and we must judge things by the results achieved there. In America, we find that the prohibition law is going to be enforced and that it can easily be enforced With your permission, I would like to read a few extracts relating to the results of prohibition in America. The Governor of the Washington State says—

Prohibition in Washington three years shows satisfactory economic, moral and industrial benefits. Criminals in jails materially reduced, bank deposits steadily increased, satisfactory business and industrial growth Enforcement good Voters adopted prohibition, three elections by heavily increased majorities.

Birmingham, Alabama, reports as follows:—

		1915 (wet)	1919 (dry)
Population (estimated)	...	... 175,000	231,577
Tax rate ...	...	... 1 per cent.	1 per cent.
Number of police	...	... 178	131
Arrests, all causes	...	.. 20,975	11,849

When the country went dry, the Mayor of Atlanta stated—

We have had prohibition beginning with the year 1909 Prohibition in the State and in this city during these years has been an unmixed blessing It was and is an

industrial and racial necessity, aside from every moral question involved. Its adoption has reduced crime, drunkenness, disorder, corruption and industrial unrest. It has made for efficient, good order, good business, good morals and increased prosperity. The law is sustained by the overwhelming sentiment of the people and is enforced as vigorously and sympathetically as any other law. The people of Georgia and the city of Atlanta, that is, the majority of them, do not for a moment consider the return to the previous condition.

These facts I think will convince if any convincing is necessary. I submit that with the help of the present highly efficient Excise Service, the Police Department and the Village Union Boards, it will not be very difficult to carry into effect any prohibitive law that this Council might pass. The difficulty of administering such law in Bengal is not so great as in the West. In Bengal the drink habit is not widespread and ingrained in the constitution of the people. So if the question of measures be taken and action concentrated on the mill areas in and around Calcutta, the district of Midnapore and some parts of Chittagong, it will be easy to stop at least nine-tenths of the illicit traffic in liquor.

There is another set of people who assert that the State has no right to interfere with the liberty of action of the individuals which was the greatest cry raised in the West. If such plea be carried to its logical end it would be a negation of all legislative enactments. If for the welfare of its inhabitants, a State has no right to enact a prohibition law, I ask what right has it to make bigamy criminal or for the matter of that to hamper individual liberty of speech and free action of individuals in the name of sedition and rebellion? Or for the matter of that why did the Government of India in the past put a stop to Suttee and infanticide? Well, if these laws could be passed which put a clog to individual liberty, prohibition can also be passed. All laws are meant to promote the welfare of the nation at large and for that matter we have to impose some hardship on some persons and for the welfare of the nation as a whole. I think we ought to pass that law.

But, Sir, the real opposition would come from the European community of Calcutta and of Bengal and specially of Calcutta and from the Government of Bengal on the score of the threatened loss of revenue. The opposition from the European community is sure to influence the attitude of the Government. Sir, will the influence of the European liquor vested interest and of the European consumers of liquor tell so much on the Government of Bengal? The Rev. Anderson has predicted—"India may find that through her connection with Britain; the ideal of prohibition will be realised by slow degrees," and I might add not till England becomes a convert to prohibition. I ask the Government are they going to pay so much attention to the cries of the European community as to withstand the pressure of all shades of Indian opinion and of a considerable body of European as well? When

the United States of America wanted to be dry it could be dry, no extraneous consideration influenced its course. And I shall not be surprised if on a fine morning I learn that Australia, New Zealand and Canada have gone dry. But these are free countries and self-governing dominions and India is a dependency! And, Sir, I again ask if India will be allowed to become dry if her people so determine?

The consideration of revenue is a real consideration. And we can well appreciate the consternation with which a Government with a deficit balance sheet looks to the threatened loss of about Rs 2 crores or about 5·2 of the total revenue. In view of the present deficit, no Government, I can well conceive, can think of adopting prohibition law. I would therefore ask that Professor Mukherji's resolution be given effect to at once and let my resolution be accepted as the ideal towards which we have to work. All credit is due to the Excise Department in its endeavour to secure a maximum of revenue from a minimum of consumption. And though there are over-zealous officers who would do anything to increase the excise revenue, yet it must be recognised that the Excise Department as a whole has not encouraged the drink habit in Bengal. The defect is, however, in the system itself. We do not want the maximum of revenue with the minimum of consumption. We know that it causes no hardship to the moderate consumer but we want total prohibition. The statistics of recent years show that the consumption of countryspirit is getting higher. The following are the figures:—

Year	Figures for Bengal
	Rs
1916-17	6,26,454
1917-18	7,00,586
1918-19	7,96,972
1919-20	7,55,285
1920-21	7,66,572

The clearance report of the Custom House also shows that the importation of foreign liquor has increased. And as the defect is in the excise policy of the Government we cannot expect any appreciable improvement of the position until the whole view-point is changed and prohibition adopted as the ideal—ideal not only on paper, but towards which the Government would really work.

Sir, the real issue in such a case is whether the Government is justified in setting a premium on vice, a vice that eats into the very vitals of the people. What we want is that the Government should dissociate itself from the stigma attached to it on its connection with the trade in excisable articles.

Sir, the nascent spirit of Indian nationality and self-respect has been awakened in the people. The people themselves are struggling

hard to free themselves from the grip of the drink habit and the effect of the struggle is evident in the diminished intakings of the various provincial Governments. By July last there was a fall of Rs. 46 lakhs in the Central Provinces and Rs. 30 lakhs in Behar on the estimated excise revenue of the provinces. And though I have no information about Bengal as a whole, I think that in the mill areas in and around Howrah the consumption has diminished by half. So if the people are earnest, as is evident from the statistics, should not the Government help the people to fight the drink question? Should any petty consideration of revenue stand in the way of Government helping the people to free themselves from the scourge of the drink habit? Therefore, I want that Government should adopt prohibition as its ultimate policy. Probably there will be difficulty in obtaining the sanction of the Government of India to this policy; but if the Government of India refuse their sanction about foreign liquor let us wash our hands clean and let the responsibility vest on the Government of India. I have done. With these remarks I commend my resolution to the acceptance of this House.

Adjournment.

The Council was then adjourned till Thursday, the 1st September, 1921, at 3 P.M. at the Town Hall, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Thursday, the 1st September, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Executive Members of Government, the Hon'ble the three Ministers and 113 nominated and elected members.

Restriction on intoxicating liquors and drugs.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I think the Government ought to be as much anxious for the moral well-being, moral elevation of the people committed to their charge, as for their material prosperity. In fact the two ought to run parallel to one another. Assuming that proposition to be correct, I think the two resolutions marked seem to be very opportune. I wish that the day is not far distant when the excise revenue of the province will be a negligible quantity and the Finance Member of the Government will not count upon that revenue for the administration of the province. I think some of my friends are aware of the fact that a band of so-called philanthropists, some members of Parliament—Messrs. Peas & Co.—were instrumental in compelling the Government of this country to sacrifice the revenue derived from the sale of opium to China. If that could be done, I really cannot understand why we should not prepare ourselves to make a sacrifice of revenue for the good of our countrymen. If there is any department of Government with which we should willingly and gladly non-co-operate it is this. We all, no doubt, advocate that there should be no restrictions put upon the personal liberty of the subject by Government. But in this matter all such restrictions would be only too welcome. I am not in a position to state whether the drink habit is on the increase throughout the province, but this I can say, from my experience of the mill area of this province, that it is very much on the increase, and that poor people spend a good portion of what they earn in drinking. The ancient law-givers of India have all interdicted the use of spirituous liquors among the twice-born castes. For them to take wine is tantamount to commit homicide. Whether it be dram drinking or drinking till the bottom of the bottle is parallel to the roof, the result is the same. Divine Shakespeare has said, in

speaking of wine, "if thou hast not any other name I shall call thee devil." I know that in some of the Native States of India if a Brahmin drinks wine he is excommunicated from society, he is considered as an outcaste.

These are my views on the drink question generally.

I therefore congratulate the Hon'ble Member in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries for the sympathetic attitude as shown in the *communiqué* of Government issued in yesterday's daily papers. The resolution of Professor Mukherji has been anticipated in some matters, such as fixing the number of shops and putting a limitation on the hours of sale. I am, however, sorry to learn that in Calcutta the Advisory Board has not worked satisfactorily. If that be so, I hope the Government will issue special instructions so that, in future, the opinion of the non-official members of the Advisory Board may be respected, nay, acted up to. I ought to state that my experience of these Advisory Boards is quite different. As chairman of an important municipality just on the borders of Calcutta, I have been a member of these Boards ever since their constitution, and my experience is that the opinion of the non-official gentlemen have invariably been given effect to. I know of no single instance when our recommendations have not been carried out or that a shop for the sale of intoxicants has been opened in opposition to our wishes or at a place not fixed by us. If that be in a place near Calcutta why should it be otherwise in Calcutta.

Now as regards the question of local option, I think it is time that there should be a beginning. If not all municipalities, let some of the municipalities be given this privilege. Let us see how it works. The Government cannot say nay to it. The Government would simply act according to its past traditions if it accepts this suggestion. Let the voice of the people be the determining factor in the matter of the sale of all intoxicants.

Raja MANMATHA NATH RAY CHOUDHURY: I must confess that it is hardly necessary for me to say anything more on the resolutions, which are under discussion, after the eloquent and exhaustive speeches to which we listened last night. But, Sir, as I have all along identified myself with the cause, which the propositions represent, I consider it to be my duty to say a few words in support of them, instead of recording a mere silent vote. Besides, it is a cause, which I think, is no less conducive to the well-being and prosperity of our countrymen than any question which may rightly claim the attention of this Council.

At the very outset, I desire to congratulate my friend, Mr. Rahman, on the gallant fight which he put up last night. His speech was really illuminating and his survey of the whole situation brought out useful

facts and figures. But as my friend himself admitted that his resolution is more idealistic than realistic, I will hurriedly pass on to Professor Mukherji's resolution.

Whereas Mr. Rahman has probably in view such American measures as might be said to have emanated, more or less, from the Maine Liquor Law of America which was passed in that great country with thirty-nine other protective and prohibitive statutes, Professor Mukherji, perhaps, draws his inspiration from such broad original measures of England as Sir Wilford Lasawon's Permissive Bill, which took Parliamentary form, but was subsequently replaced by what is known in History as the Local Option Resolution, which was thrice affirmed by by the House of Commons.

Sir, I may, perhaps say, without the least fear of contradiction, that enemies as well as friends of the British Government believe that there is considerable room for improvement in its present system of excise administration. That cheapness in the price of liquor and other intoxicants bring them within the easy reach of a large number of consumers and thereby increase the consumption admits of no doubt. Retail market prices should, therefore, be increased

It has been from time to time suggested by the supporters of the excise policy of the Government that the enormous increase in the excise revenue was due to and clearly reflected the prosperous condition of the people, but in reality it had nothing to do with their financial improvement.

What Professor Mukherji has asked for constitutes a most modest demand and, in my opinion, it is essential that the liquor hours should be further curtailed by such a measure as the London drink curfew, a fresh duty should be imposed and a veto should be placed in the hands of the ratepayers, so that they could successfully combat the evil of drunkenness by removing the temptation from their vicinity. I think it is my duty to say that I have no sympathy, and this Council also should have no sympathy, with those who take shelter under the great Temperance cause only with a view to bring about, what I may call, a financial crisis, which should by all means be avoided in the interest of good Government.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: I have great pleasure in supporting the resolution of Professor Mukherji. I would like to discuss this in a businesslike manner. Professor Mukherji wishes the Council to consider the application of the principle of local option. The practice hitherto observed is that the wishes of the people are consulted to a considerable extent by the local authority. There is annually an inquiry or investigation by the local bodies, such as, for example, mufassal municipalities, local boards, etc. A list of liquor shops are prepared and scrutinised by the local bodies and also by the official members who attend these bodies. The sites of the

liquor shops are also selected, the ratepayers are also consulted and objections are listened to by the local bodies and official members. The great principle, therefore, of local option is adopted. Professor Mukherji wishes to explain the principle. I have no objection to that and I do press upon the attention of the Council that, if the ratepayers or the residents of locality are directly consulted, much good will come out of it. It would be far better if the local body as well as ratepayers are all consulted as to the application of the principle of local option. This matter demands the consideration of the official members of the Committee. The sites to be selected are the principal question for discussion in the mufassal committees. If any particular site is selected at a great distance, it is objectionable sometimes. If the site is selected in the heart of villages and towns, then it is also objectionable but sometimes allowed. Therefore, on the principle of local option, the great question to be considered is the situation of the sites of the shops. And if this is settled partially that principle is allowed. I hope that may be allowed. If that principle is to be accepted *in toto*, I submit to the Council that the Minister in charge will consider whether it would be difficult to apply the same As a rule, the Chairmen of the local bodies, viz., municipalities, local boards, are assisted by Commissioners or the members of the local board. To abolish the drink at once will be a difficult thing. We live in modern times. The preaching of the moralists that drinking habit should be given up will be very difficult to follow by those who are addicted to drinking. Secondly, if you gradually proceed on, we hope to succeed hereafter, keeping an eye on the high and noble ideals set by other nations. Take the case of China. We hear that everything is all right there now; but was it done by a single stroke of the pen? It required a good deal of concentration; and a cautious and gradual step had brought about the improvement there in China. The learned mover of the second resolution said that it should be done at once. To take immediate steps to kill the drink will not be possible. Consequently my humble suggestion is to proceed gradually and the day is not far distant when we may find Bengal almost free from drink. If drastic measures are taken for the immediate and total prohibition of drink, our efforts will not be crowned with success. They will be doomed to failure. I therefore support the resolution of Professor Mukherji.

Maulvi EMADUDDIN AHMED: I support the resolutions which have been moved by Professor Mukherji and Mr. Razaur Rahman. The resolution that has been moved by the latter is a very wise one. If this resolution is accepted, we may expect that within a very short time the drinking habit will be done away with in Bengal. I know, Sir, that the wheels of Government move slowly. I also know, Sir, that this is the unanimous verdict of the country that the drinking habit should be done away with. The country to a certain extent has

prepared itself to get rid of the drinking habit. Mr. Rahman asks only that within a short period it might be done away with. Wise heads there are in the Government. Let them put their heads together and formulate a definite policy that within a definite period the drinking evil should be done away with. Every one knows the evil affects of drunkenness and how big zamindars have become beggars by giving way to drinking. I know that the revenue of the Government would suffer but there are wise heads in the Government and let them formulate financial policy and, if you add a little to the tax, I do not think the taxpayer would mind it if by that way the drinking evil may be put a stop to.

Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: After the elaborate and erudite treatment of the question by my friend Mr. Razaur Rahman Khan I do not think any long speech is necessary in support of the resolution I am surprised to find that my friend Raja Manmatha Nath Choudhury has thought fit to characterise the resolution as "idealistic" even after the amendment made by the mover. The resolution, no doubt, holds out an ideal to be realised in as short a time as practicable, but how it can be construed as a proposal to "kill the drink forthwith," as Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra Mitra seems to think, I do not understand Has the word "possible" or "practicable" then no meaning at all? Besides I should like to point out why we cannot stop with passing such a resolution as has been moved by Professor Mukherji. Apart from the principle of local option, of which Professor Mukherji desires recognition, there is nothing in his resolution which lays down the objective to be attained even by the adoption of the methods and measures suggested by him, and hence, I think, it principally follows the line of "reasonable temperance movement" with which Government professes to sympathise—lip sympathy no doubt, for what after all are the results of their co-operation with such a temperance work? Well, these are —(*i*) increase of drunkenness; (*ii*) increased consumption of all other commodities except country liquor; (*iii*) unwillingness to prohibit even the use of those drugs which are most injurious but least revenue yielding. As regards the first point I know, Sir, that Government refuses to admit that drunkenness is on the increase. In reply to one of my questions the Government has been pleased to admit in this session, without giving the figures asked for, that there has been an increase of convictions in Calcutta, but at the same time asserts that that does not mean increased drunkenness. Yes, Sir, we are not such fools as to think that every increase in the number of convictions means increase in drunkenness. But when the statistics show that in course of five years from 1915-16 to 1919-20 the number of convictions has risen from 9,320 to 11,147 in municipal areas and even in Calcutta it has gone up from 6,321 to 7,928 (*i.e.*, an increase of about 1,600 convictions in five years), we are not disposed or logically justified to dismiss only this one factor from our mind and

attribute this heavy increase only to all and sundry other causes and believe, on the contrary, that this is due to "co-operation with any reasonable temperance movement." Then let us look to consumption, Sir. From the departmental report for the year 1919-20, we find that save and except country spirit the consumption of all the other excisable commodities have increased and have been increasing. "The imports of wine," says the report, "have been of unprecedented magnitude"—"all qualities," except some, "showing an advance." Consumption of spirits was much in excess of arrival. Consumption of *ganja* increased in 20 out of 27 districts of this province and by a total of 76 maunds 8 seers, and not only consumption but cultivation too increased. So, also, the consumption of the other hemp drugs, opium, etc. And reasonable temperance work, there is no doubt, is proceeding apace. But here it does not end. Other instances of "co-operation with reasonable temperance work" are—(*i*) not to prohibit *charas*—the strongest and most injurious of the hemp intoxicants even when the revenue derived from it does not come up to Rs. 80,000; (*ii*) not to allow a non-official majority in licensing boards and to restrict their powers; and (*iii*) to permit, as Rev. Herbert Anderson says, the rules as to the location of the shops to be broken in about 75 per cent. of locations (this of course I say subject to correction).

If such are the results of co-operation with reasonable temperance movement, I think the time has come to be a little unreasonable in our demands in this respect and we ought to lay down once for all that total prohibition and nothing short of that is our objective and further that it is to be achieved as early as practicable. Awakened Bengal is in no mood to exploit the weakness and vice of degraded humanity for all time to come.

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: I think the evil of drink has been admitted on all hands, and I do not wish to dwell any longer on the subject. It is the bounden duty of this Council to devise means how to drive away this evil habit from the land and it is a move in the right direction that this Council has come to deliberate upon this vital question of great importance, and how to combat this evil is the subject of our deliberations; and I hope and trust this Council will devise the best means how to do the work.

Rai Sahib NILMANI CHATAK: It is needless to dilate on the manifold pernicious effects of the liquor habit. Daily experience and history of criminal law furnished sufficient examples for thoughtful men. It is an evil outcome of modern civilization and the Western countries have fully felt its results and have been trying their best to expel it. The Americans have nearly succeeded in purging it by legislation and the European countries have also been exerting themselves in this direction. In the short space of time within which it hae made its presence felt in this country, it has made a considerable progress and unless a stop is put to

it early, it will cause irreparable damage before long. Besides, we cannot fall behind the times in matters which are proved to be of much benefit to mankind. Things have come to such a pass that we must mend matters at any cost. So far as the people are concerned, they are fully conscious of their duties and responsibilities and, we believe, the Government will not lag behind seeing that as representatives of the people we are anxious to get rid of this scourge. So far as this Council is concerned, I am fully confident there cannot be two opinions, as the resolution has not come too early and it will be carried unanimously. It has been often said that carrying out of such a measure will entail loss of provincial revenue to a great extent and the present financial condition will discourage such measures being taken in hand. The objection is not without some force. But, Sir, no good thing can be achieved without some sacrifice and loss, and if some loss accrue, as it is sure to follow, means will be devised to make up for the loss and the people are sure to accept it in genial spirits. I cannot conceive any other objection of a serious nature in this matter. Of course, the false issue—who introduced drink into India—raised in some quarters must not be allowed to cloud the real issue—the evils of drink. The mover of the resolution has very ably discussed all aspects of the question. I need hardly remind the Council that movements of like nature have been in progress in other provinces also.

I regret, however, to say that restriction of consumption is not sufficient to cope with the situation. When the disease is manifest and treacherous, the remedy must be equally quick and violent. It may cause some inconvenience and probably pain for the time being, but the ultimate results to be gained by the operation should outweigh lesser considerations.

With these words, I beg most heartily to support the resolution moved by Mr. Razaur Rahman Khan.

SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ delivered a speech in vernacular in support of the resolution of Mr. Razaur Rahman Khan.

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of AGRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): I am glad to be able to state, for the information of the Council, that the Government of Bengal, during the last few years, have already been taking action on the lines recommended by the member with a view to restrict the consumption of intoxicating liquors and drugs in Calcutta and in Bengal.

I shall, at first, deal with paragraph 2 of the resolution. The Government of Bengal accept the policy enunciated therein, and they have been taking gradual steps in the direction of enhanced duty, increase of retail market prices, restriction in the number of shops, limitation of hours of sale and reduction of issue strengths during the last six years. I would also invite the attention of the member of the *communiqué*

issued by the Government on 25th August, 1921. During this time the duty on foreign liquor has been raised from Rs. 9-6-0 to Rs. 18-12-0 per London-proof gallon. Duty on country spirit in Calcutta and suburban areas has been raised from Rs. 6-4-0 to Rs. 14-2-0 per London-proof gallon. Duty on country spirit in other areas in the Presidency has also been appreciably raised except in Birbhum, Faridpore, Bakarganj, Chittagong, Noakhali, Tippera, Rajshahi, Bogra and Pabna. Duty on *ganja* has not been raised, but taxation in license-fees has been raised from Rs. 18-3-0 to Rs. 30 per seer.

Duty on opium has been raised from Rs. 40 to Rs. 60 per seer.

Retail prices have been correspondingly raised.

In Calcutta the number of country spirit shops have been reduced from 106 to 64, *ganja* shops from 60 to 48, opium shops from 51 to 41 and *tari* shops from 64 to 45.

In other areas in the Presidency, country spirit shops have come down from 1,127 to 1,056, *ganja* shops from 1,287 to 1,222, opium shops from 808 to 754 and *tari* shops from 698 to 575. It will be possible to effect an appreciable reduction in the number of shops in the near future.

Hours have been limited from sunrise to 11 A.M. for liquor shops, and 10 A.M. for drug shops and from 9 A.M. to 8 P.M. for liquor shops in the industrial areas and from 9 A.M. to sunset for all drugs and for liquor shops in other areas.

Dealing with the first part of the resolution and speaking about the principle of local option, I should begin by stating that it is a desirable reform, which would, I feel confident, be given effect to in this Council in the fullness of time But reforms calculated to work up to this ideal were already introduced by this Government in Calcutta and in Bengal, when they constituted the Excise Licensing Boards for the cities of Calcutta and Howrah and gave them the final authority, subject to the supervision of the Government, to decide the number and location of all liquor and drug shops in these cities, and formed Excise Advisory Committees to advise the Collectors on the question of number and location of drink and drug shops in the mufassal towns and in the rural areas of Bengal. I should state, for the information of this Council, that the Licensing Boards have done valuable work in dealing with the question of the location and number of shops in the cities of Calcutta and Howrah and the numbers of such shops have already been appreciably reduced and their location changed in various places. The Excise Advisory Committees in the mufassal have likewise done much in that direction.

The ultimate object in view in recommending the principle of local option has, therefore, been attained, to some extent at least, though not to the same extent as local option might do. Local option would mean that, if the majority of the voters in any particular area voted for "no license," there would be no license in that area. This presupposes

the existence of conditions which the Government do not consider exist in Bengal. This presupposes that large portions of the population in a particular area are habituated to drink or drugs. But, in Bengal, as every member of the Council is aware of, this is not a fact. In Bengal, it is only a small portion or a very small portion of the population in any locality, which indulges either in drink or in drugs. Consequently, if local option were at once introduced, even in municipal areas as has been recommended by the member, the result would possibly be that the large majority of the men, who do not drink or take any drugs, would be able to abolish all the licenses within a very short time, and thus force their will on the small minority, who take liquor or drugs in moderation in such localities. It is however doubtful whether the individual liberty of the people in their private life as to what they should eat or drink can be restricted in this way. Among the small minority, who take liquor or drugs in Bengal, we have people, who are habituated from time immemorial to the use of some sort of intoxicants; for example, country spirit, *pachwai*, *tari* or drugs. Among such people, I may mention the aboriginal races in Bankura, Midnapore, Birbhum, Burdwan, the hillmen of Darjeeling and certain classes among the labouring population in all towns and cities. To say to these people that they must stop their drink or drug, would be like saying to the people of many countries in Europe or in Asia to stop their national drinks like beer, brandy or whisky. In Bengal, on account of the growth of industrial concerns, we have such people scattered throughout the province. You will find such people in all the principal industrial centres in Bengal in factories, tea gardens and also in most of the urban areas in the Presidency. The Council is aware that they are a small minority among the population in all such areas, and, if, by introducing a principle of local option in all such areas, facilities for obtaining the intoxicants in moderate quantities were entirely removed, it would mean not only considerable hardship to the minority I am speaking about but might give rise to worse evils such as illicit practices and use of other and more deleterious articles and I cannot at present recommend any course which might have that effect. I know that the Bengalis as a nation do not indulge in intoxicating liquor or drugs. This is a circumstance in which we can really take a pride and congratulate ourselves. But the Government will have to consider the needs of men, who are not abstainers and who want their drink, whether it is *pachwai* or *tari*, or country spirit, or some drug. I need not refer, in this Council, to men of other nations, resident in the city of Calcutta or in Bengal, who also are not abstainers. The growing industrial life in Bengal has a tendency and a serious tendency to increase the demand for intoxicants. It may be decried and may be considered as one of the evil effects of industrialism, but all the same it is there. In the circumstances stated above, I cannot sincerely advise the Council to accept a principle of local option just at present in municipal areas.

We have a machinery in these Excise Licensing Boards and in Excise Advisory Committees which can very properly deal with these questions. I do not think we need any other machinery in Bengal at present. The Government may, if the Council wishes it, consider the question of reconstituting the Excise Licensing Boards and the Excise Advisory Committees on such lines as may secure a fuller representation of the various points of view on this subject and secure a more effective control over the questions of site, number and other cognate questions relating to consumption of intoxicants. If in these boards and committees we have gentlemen, who can appreciate all sides of the question, I am sure, we shall get much valuable work from them in the same direction which the member has in view in recommending the introduction of local option in municipal areas.

My friend Mr. Mukherji has alluded to a Government resolution of 1914. I, as a member of the reformed Government, am not in a position to say anything for or against that resolution and I hope I shall be pardoned by this House if I refrain from making any remarks with regard to it. I am responsible for the policy which we may adopt now. What the policy is, I believe, has already been well known to the public and all my friends here as it was enunciated in a recent Press *communiqué*. I have explained therein that as long as we cannot do away with the drink traffic, we should take steps to minimise the evil by the imposition of heavy tax on this luxury.

Turning now to the resolution moved by my friend Mr. Razaur Rahman Khan to the effect that immediate steps be taken by the issue of circulars to officers concerned directing them to limit the number of licensed liquor shops and otherwise to discourage the drink habit in Bengal with a view to total prohibition within as short a period as practicable, I would make the following observations:—

I am glad to be able to inform the Council that before this resolution came to my hand, I was already thinking of issuing orders for limiting the number of licensed liquor shops in the Presidency with effect from 1st October next. Orders have also been just passed by me for better control of the foreign liquor traffic in the Presidency as desired by the Temperance Federation of Bengal. Similarly the taxation on liquor and drugs will be shortly increased with a view to limit consumption as urged in the resolution of my friend, Mr. Razaur Rahman Khan. My friend has bestowed much thought and attention upon the question of prohibition. I sympathise with his views and sincerely wish that the time may soon come when the use of intoxicating liquors and drugs in Bengal will disappear even from the small number of people who indulge in these articles. My friend wants total prohibition in a very short time. I do not know whether in putting forward such a proposition he sufficiently realises the very grave responsibility involved in recommending such an important and momentous change in the policy of Government. Of course, this Council can, if they choose, pass a

resolution adopting total prohibition at any moment they like, but if they do so, they will have to take upon themselves the entire responsibility for the consequences which will accrue. I need hardly remind my friends in this Council that the immediate consequence of this step will be a loss of revenue to the amount of about two crores of rupees. I must at once point out here that my friend's statement that the excise revenue of Bengal forms only 5·2 per cent. of the total revenue is incorrect, the real figure being about 20 per cent. Now my friends are all aware that the expenditure in connection with the reserved subjects, such as police, general administration, etc., is the first charge upon the revenue of Bengal. After this charge is met, the residue is left for the development of education, agriculture and industries and the improvement of sanitation. If the total excise revenue is wiped out, my friends will at once see that education, sanitation, agriculture and industries will be the first to suffer very heavily. As the whole country is clamouring for progress in all these matters, I would leave it to this House to judge how far it would be wise or advisable to abolish the excise revenue of two crores of rupees. It is hardly necessary for me to point out that all our activities in matters of sanitation, education, etc., will have to be largely curtailed, if not altogether stopped. Out of two crores, less than fifteen lakhs only is spent for the administration of the Excise Department and the whole of the remaining balance goes to feed the other departments of Government. I may point out here that excise taxation touches the pockets of a very small section of the people, namely, of those who indulge in intoxicants. If this is replaced by a general taxation affecting the income of the public at large, there will be a hue and cry in the country and such new taxation will be vehemently opposed by the very members who are in favour of abolishing the excise revenue.

The next objection against total prohibition is that it will give rise to malpractices and lead people to take to the use of articles which are more injurious to health. In this connection I may cite the case of China which has on paper abolished the use of opium but as a matter of fact, thousands of maunds of opium are being annually smuggled into that country and are being used by the people secretly, though they have to pay such high price as three to four hundred rupees per seer. It has also been found out that many respectable people and even very high officials in China are secretly connected with this illicit trade. What is happening in China and in dry America will also happen in India, because those who are inveterate consumers of intoxicating drinks and drugs those who make money out of it as well as those who do not look upon the use of intoxicants as a vice or sin will never give up the habit so easily as my friend may think.

I may also mention here that among some sects of my Hindu compatriots, use of liquor is necessary in connection with some religious ceremonies and practices, for instance, among the Tantries. There are

also tribes like the Sonthals, etc., as I have already said in my reply to my friend Mr. Mukherji's resolution who cannot do without some stimulating drink such as *pachwai*. They use it more as food than as intoxicating drinks and even little children and women among them use it freely. It is also very largely used at the time of their annual religious festival called *Bandhana*. They are a sensitive tribe and will not hesitate to create trouble if we put any serious restrictions upon their liberty in this respect.

My friend is anxious to see total prohibition adopted in the country. From his statement one would be led to think that the whole Bengali nation, or a large majority of it, is addicted to the drink habit on such a large scale that this measure is indispensably necessary for their salvation. This is, however, not so. Statistics of consumption go to show that only an infinitesimally small fraction of them, viz., not more than 5 per cent. of these people are given to the use of intoxicants, so my friend will see that practically prohibition is already in existence in Bengal. Then again, there are my friends of the Temperance Federation and also other social leaders who are trying to wean their weak brethren from the drink habit. Such being the case and in view of the financial and other difficulties I have explained already, I hope my friend will see that in a manner like this, we should proceed very cautiously after carefully and fully considering all aspects of the question. It will be conceded that this is the proper way of dealing with all important and complicated problems. Conditions are different in different countries and I do not understand the reason that because prohibition has been adopted in America and a few other Western Countries, it should be immediately adopted in this country. My friend is of course aware that the bulk of the population in America was given to the habit of using alcoholic drinks and as this was fraught with serious consequences for the whole of the nation during the war, a drastic measure like total prohibition was found necessary. Because it has been adopted there, it is no reason why we should also adopt it here without considering the necessity for it and all the points for or against it. As I have remarked above, the religious and moral education both of Hindus and Moslems generally speaking during the last thousand years have made us already the most dry nation in the world. I would accordingly request my friend not to press for the adoption of a policy of "total prohibition within a short time." As regards the other question raised by him in his resolution regarding limitation of licenses, etc., I have already explained that we are taking necessary action.

In these circumstances, I would request both of my friends to withdraw their resolutions.

Babu NITYA DHON MUKHERJEE: I move that the question be now put.

The motion was then put and agreed to.

The PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): I think it desirable to put resolution No. 15 first as it covers a larger ground.

A division was then taken with the following result: —

AYES.

Afzal, Nawabzada K. M. Khan Bahadur.
Ahmad, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Emaduddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Rafi Uddin.
Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.
Aley, Shaikh Mahboob.
Ali, Maulvi A. H. M. Wazir.
Ali, Mr. Syed Erfan.
Ali, Munshi Amir.
Ali, Munshi Ayub.
Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar.
Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mohamed.
Charmakar, Babu Rasik Chandra.
Chaudhuri, Babu Tankanath.
Chuadhuri, Sir Ashutosh.
Doss, Rai Bahadur Pyari Lal.
Dutta, Babu Annada Charan.
Farequi, K. C. M.
*Chatak, Rai Sahib Nilmani.
Chose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder.
Haq, Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul.
Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlal.
Khan, Maulvi Hamid-ud-din.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin.
Khan, Mr. Razaur Rahman.
Khan Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Muhammad Ershad Ali.
Makramali, Munshi.
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra.
Moitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath.
Mukherji, Professor S. C.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Nakey, Mirza Muhammad Ali.
Pahlewan, Maulvi Md. Abdul Jubbar.
Ray, Rai Bahadur Upendra Lal.
Roy, Babu Bijoy Prosad Singh.
Roy, Babu Jogendra Krishna.
Roy, Babu Jogendra Nath.
Roy, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh.
Suhrawardy, Dr. A.
Suhrawardy, Mr. Huseyn Shaheed.

NOES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.
Ahmad, Maulvi Yakuinuddin.
Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath.
Banerjee, Rai Bahadur Abinash Chandra.
Barma, Rai Sahib Panchanan.
Barton, Mr. H.
Biss, Mr. E. E.
Bompas, Mr. C. H.
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad.
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Das, Babu Bhishmadev.
Das, Rai Bahadur Amar Nath.
Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra.
De, Babu Fanindralal.
Dey, Mr. C. C.
Donald, Mr. J.
French, Mr. F. C.
Chose, Mr. O. C.
Gupta, Mr. N. B.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
Hussain, Maulvi Mahammed Madassur.
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.
Lang, Mr. J.
Law, Raja Reshee Case.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble.
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhone.
Mukhopadhaya, Babu sarat Chandra.
O'Kinealy, Lt.-Col. Frederick.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.
Payne, Mr. C. F.
Rae, Mr. W. R.
Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur.
Rauf, Maulvi Shah Abdur.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar.
Ray Chaudhuri, Mr. Krishna Chandra.
Roy, Babu Nalini Nath.
Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra
Roy, Mr. J. E.
Roy, Mr. Tarit Bhusan.
Roy, Raja Manilell Singh.
Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Sailaja Nath.
Sarkar, Babu Jogesh Chandra.
Sarkar, Babu Rishindra Nath.
Stark, Mr. H. A.
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry.
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

The Ayes being 41 and the Noes 48, the resolution was lost.

Resolution No. 14 was then put and carried.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: May I not move the resolution which stands in my name?

The PRESIDENT: You have been informed, I am told, that your resolution has been vetoed by His Excellency the Governor.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: May I know the reasons for it?

The PRESIDENT: I cannot give you the reasons. It has been vetoed under rule 22.

Withdrawal of Resolutions.

Mr. SYED ERFAN ALI: Since the notice of my resolution was given, Government have appointed a committee for the amendment of the Bengal Tenancy Act, of which I am one of the members. The Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Revenue Department desires that I should withdraw this resolution now and take note of the subject matter of it for the consideration of the Committee. Under the circumstances I beg to withdraw the resolution.

The following resolution was then, by leave of the Council, withdrawn:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that the Bengal Tenancy Act be so amended as—

(*i*) to secure fixity of rent for ever to the settled raiyats and to abolish the *utbandi* and the 'tenant-at-will' system under the zamindars;

(*ii*) to secure to them the right of transference of *jotes*, whole or in part, the right of digging or re-excavating tanks, the right of planting and cutting trees, the right of building *pucca* or *kutcha* houses, and the digging of necessary earth free and at will, irrespective of the consent or permission of the superior landlord;

(*iii*) to make the collection of *abwabs* or illegal cesses; of any kind, and the levy of *begar*, or free, or concession labour, of any kind, a cognizable criminal offence;

(*iv*) to make the rent money-order in the zamindar's name in his sadar *katchari* a legal tender, and that raiyats be allowed to send in, in one money-order, the total amount of rent due on their different *jotes*, giving a descriptive account in a coupon or in a separate registered post-card or letter;

(*v*) to provide that in the case of money-orders for rent not taken delivery of in the *katchari*, within one week after the last day of the *kist*, the sender be free from the liability of paying interest;

(*vi*) to provide that zamindars be bound to send *gomastas* to collect rent in time, and that the inability of the *gomasta* to take rent, the issue of the cheque or rent-receipt should free the raiyat from the liability of paying interest; and

(*vii*) to provide that in the case of refusal to receive rents in the *katchari*, the giving of due receipts on the part of the zamindar, if proved, should be counted as an offence liable to an explanation to the Collector of the district, who should be empowered to appoint a receiver to collect the rent and allow compensation to be paid to any raiyat incurring unnecessary loss in tendering rent, if such refusal is found repeatedly occurring to harass any raiyat."

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: I find that the Government have already anticipated me, by putting in the lobby, a list of the resolutions, that have been carried and the action the Government propose to take on them. I was informed that that was the position and I was asked to remove my resolution from the agenda paper. At that stage, I could not do it, as I did not see how the matter stood. Now that I find that Government have introduced the practice I had in view, and my object in bringing forward the resolution has been served, I beg to leave to withdraw it, with the request that in future, the information may be printed and circulated among members with a view to the reduction of a large number of interpellations.

The following resolution was then, by leave of the Council, withdrawn:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that rules be framed to inform the Council, at the earliest possible opportunity, which of the resolutions passed at its previous session have been accepted by the Government, and the steps taken to give effect to them."

Woman Suffrage.

Mr. S. M. BOSE: "This Council recommends to the Government—

(*i*) that the sex disqualification for registration on the electoral rolls, provided in Rule 7 of the Bengal Electoral Rules, be removed entirely, and that regulations be made providing that women shall not be disqualified for registration in the electoral roll by reason only of their sex; and

(*ii*) that such regulations should make suitable provisions for giving women the opportunity of recording their votes, having regard to their habits and customs."

To my mind, this is one of the most important resolutions that has hitherto been discussed here. Its acceptance by the Council will mean untold benefit to future generations. I would that my voice were as mighty as the cause. I would that I could speak with the tongues of men and of angels. But my voice is feeble and it cannot rise to the height of this great argument. So I claim your patience and indulgence for a little while.

It will be seen that my motion divides itself into two parts—(1) the acceptance of the principle of women's franchise, and (2) the practical application of this principle. I shall first deal with the principle on which I lay more stress, for once it is accepted, we can easily evolve means of giving practical effect to it.

Women's education is beyond all controversy, one of the most vital of our necessities. Our progress as a nation very largely depends upon the progress of our women. As has been truly said, "the hand that rocks the cradle, rules the world." Women's education is becoming very important, in view of the fact that in modern times, in our society, the régime of status is fast disappearing and the joint-family system is rapidly breaking up into a number of small units, consisting of the husband, the wife and the children with a few relatives. So, under modern conditions, women must learn to stand up for themselves. They cannot now afford to remain immured within the *purdah*. It is most undesirable that they should continue to labour under the darkness of ignorance and superstition, and be always in continual conflict and disagreement with their educated husbands, brothers and sons. The education of a single girl means the uplifting of a whole family in a larger sense than the education of a single man. Thus the education of a woman has the most profound influence upon the whole texture of national life and the whole movement of national thought. But, unfortunately, the progress of women's education in Bengal has been very slow indeed. From the census figures, it appears that out of about 46½ millions of people in Bengal, about 22½ millions are women. Of these women, only 1 out of 100 is literate. It is true that literacy is not the only test of education, but under modern conditions, it is the most important test. Judged by this standard, it is clear what a very small amount of progress woman's education has made in Bengal.

The explanation of this backwardness, as the Calcutta University Commission truly remarks, is to be found in the social condition of the country and in the restrictions by which the life and activities of women are still surrounded. So long as women's education is in the hands of men, it will not make any satisfactory progress because even now men are led by selfishness and prejudice to give as little as possible.

So women must come to the rescue. One important step is to give her the vote. It is the vote that can create a demand for literacy and can give the enlightenment that is badly needed. The vote in itself will have a very great educative value. It will widen her horizon and her outlook on life. So long her vision has been cribbed and confined within the four corners of the home. Give her the franchise and you will find how rapidly she will develop and improve.

Next, I come to a very important consideration in favour of woman franchise. Our political progress depends very largely on the help and co-operation we receive from our women. *Swaraj* can never be attained

as long as half of the population is kept ignorant of all matters affecting the country's welfare. We talk glibly of Liberty, Equality and Fraternity. But by what logic can we limit these great ideas to one sex? We talk of the rights of small nationalities and of self-determination forgetting the fact within our fold there are over 22 millions of human souls who are denied the elementary civic rights.

It is idle to think of any political advance unless the nation, *as a whole*, takes part in the movement. We want active help and encouragement from everybody, without distinction of caste, creed or sex. Does it not therefore follow that our women should be interested in the welfare of the country? Then, is it not essential that she should be given the vote? How can we exclude women and talk of the nation?

Then, there are many subjects in which women are vitally interested —child welfare, maternity, housing, hygiene, prevention of diseases, etc. Should we not get their help and advice on these matters?

It is therefore obvious that for the welfare and uplift of the nation, it is essential that women must be interested in the country's cause; and real interest can only come when there is power in their hands. If they have the franchise, then we can expect intelligent help and co-operation from them

Further, the interest of the community demands the full and free development of every member, so that he or she may be of the greatest utility to the State. We have, I hope, outgrown by this time, the old idea that women exist simply to minister to the amusement, enjoyment, and vanity of men. It has to be admitted that woman, no less than man, has a claim to be considered as something more than a mere means to the good of others, that woman is an end as well as a means, that she has duties to herself as well as to others, and such duties involve the free exercise of all her faculties. Then how can we any longer deny her the franchise, the birthright of every citizen? Is it not, therefore, our duty to do our best to remove all clogs and impediments which shackle her mind and soul?

For these reasons, I maintain that women have a right to the franchise. Now comes the question—Should we not of our own accord grant her this right? Do we not owe her a deep debt of gratitude? Her motto is " Love and Service "—unostentatious devotion and self-sacrifice. Do we not all of us realize how deeply indebted we are to the woman—the mother, the sister, the wife and the daughter? She, the embodiment of charity, beareth all things, believeth all things, hopeth all things, endureth all things. She is our monitor, our companion, our comforter, our friend. So will it not be a graceful act on our part to give her the franchise of our own accord? Nay will it not be wise and politic on our part to do so? The woman is at our gate, knocking for admission, demanding equal treatment, crying for justice. How long will the male autocrat continue to turn a deaf ear to her demands? She

will not be denied. Is it not better, therefore, when her claim is just, to yield instead of provoking an unpleasant and unseemly agitation? We all know to what lengths the suffragette agitation was carried on in England. Is it too much to hope that our men will be more amenable to reason and logic than Englishmen?

Now I turn to examine very briefly some of the stock arguments which are advanced against woman franchise.

It is said that women do not themselves want the vote. My answer is two-fold. First, I say that a good many women do want the vote very much, though owing to social disabilities and lack of organisation, they have not been able to attract much public attention. In 1918, a deputation of women waited upon Mr. Montagu and Lord Chelmsford. During the sitting of the Franchise Committee in 1919, many memorials were sent to them from women. Many women's conferences have been held in several large towns, asking for the franchise. Recently ladies' meetings have been held in many towns in Bengal and resolutions have been adopted demanding the franchise. I mention a few of the places where such meetings have been held:—Bogra, Mymensingh, Chittagong, Darjeeling, Dinajpore, Pabna, Tangail, Kishoreganj, etc. It is encouraging to find orthodox Muhammadan ladies joining their Hindu sisters in this movement. The educated women who lead the movement, have every right to speak and act on behalf of the voiceless millions of their sex, at least just as much right as we have to speak on behalf of the voiceless millions of both sexes. A handful of educated men have naturally led the agitation for political rights. Can we object to educated women doing the same for their sisters?

Secondly, I say that we are not conferring any boon out of charity, It is necessary for our own welfare, it is necessary for the uplift of the nation, that women should have the vote. Even if not a single woman asked for the vote, I would insist that she should have it. Not only is this good for woman, but also for the man. She has, as a member of the community, a right to the franchise. Man has by abuse of his power, wrongfully deprived her of this. Denial of franchise is denial of justice, and it is now high time that the right be restored to her.

Another argument frequently put forward is that women are not educated and so will not be able to use the franchise properly. To this, I say that many women, though illiterate, possess a vast amount of common sense and sagacity, and so, are better qualified for the vote than most of our male electors. It is well known that many women have managed large estates with a skill that has extorted the admiration of men. I firmly believe that woman will be able to use the franchise just as well as the average man.

But even supposing that they will be unable to exercise the right properly, does this not reflect discredit on us? They are what we have made them. After keeping them immured within the four walls of the

house, after having denied them the blessings of education, does it lie in our mouth to say that they are ignorant and therefore incompetent? A very similar argument was employed by many who tried to oppose the grant of the franchise to the Indian males. Again, even if women cannot now exercise the franchise properly, they will, like the male voters, learn by experience through mistakes.

Sir, I have dwelt at length on the first part of my resolution and must not trespass on your patience further by dwelling on various other arguments that may be advanced against woman's franchise. I shall now turn to deal briefly with the second part of my resolution.

Once the principle is accepted, it will not be a very difficult matter to carry it out in practice. Many women at first will object to going to the polling booth. So it is advisable to give facilities to women to vote having due regard to their habits and customs. As in the case of graduate voters, the voting papers for women may be sent to their houses to be filled up before Honorary Magistrates; or lady polling officers may go round to their houses and get them to fill up the papers. So there can be no possible objection even by the most orthodox lady. If she had to execute a deed, a Registrar would attend at her house to attest her signature.

Some are apprehensive of practical difficulties in the way of arranging for proper identification. But I think these difficulties may be easily obviated. A Registrar when he goes to a lady to attest her signature, sees to her being properly identified. Similar rules may be enforced when a lady is recording her vote. I am not here much concerned with the practical solution of the question. Under the Electoral Rules, it is for the Government to frame the necessary regulations. It may, if it thinks necessary, appoint a small committee to advise as to the practical means to be adopted for giving effect to the principle.

Sir, I have now done. I sincerely hope that this resolution will be carried by a large majority, if not unanimously. We can then hope for a united nation—Hindu and Muhammadan, Brahmin and Sudra, men and women, everybody striving to work together for the good of the motherland. Over 30 years ago, a Bengali lady, a famous authoress who is leading the movement for women's franchise, wrote a song which was sung at a meeting of the National Congress.

The PRESIDENT: If you are referring to the gallery, you are out of order.

Mr. S. M. BOSE: No, I am not referring to the gallery. In this she spoke of a vision of united India marching together to fight for the motherland, the women cheering and encouraging the men, and joining them in the worship of the mother. May that vision be speedily realised!

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I beg to move, by way of amendment, that motion No. 19 do take the following form:—

"This Council recommends to the Government to take such measures as may be necessary to extend the franchise to educated women in this country by giving the vote to lady graduates for the election of the member to the Council from the University, and in other constituencies to such ladies as may have passed the Matriculation or Cambridge Junior Examination."

Before I go into the merits of the question, I ought to mention here that so far as the University election is concerned no property qualification is necessary. Every graduate is entitled to vote and so far as other constituencies are concerned, when I say that they must pass the Matriculation or Cambridge examination, it means provided that they satisfy the property and age qualifications.

The right of women to vote in society, depends on the stage of progress of that particular society. From the most ancient times woman on account of her weakness and dependence on man during maternity, has been at a great disadvantage. She has been considered as a chattel by man. She was burnt and buried alive with slaves, horses, sheep and other cattle, not only in India but also in Scandinavia and in other European countries. Women, further, had no rights to property. It was the Hindu law-giver who has given her rights to property, her peculium, her *stridhan*. In England, also, it is only in recent years that woman has had her separate property. It was Mahomet who was the most generous of teachers as regards women (hear, hear); even he, the most democratic of men, ordained that women should be immured in the zenana (A voice: I question that). Woman has been under a great disadvantage. She has been given the vote only during the last decade in England and in some of the European countries, not in all, after a bitter strife. Now the question is, are we in a position to grant the vote to women; is our society so advanced that we can grant it to them? If you grant it to women, the result will be that a few women who have got rid of the *purdah* would be in a position to vote. Even in England where woman has got the vote, her right is not taken seriously, but as a mere show. Well, those gentlemen who talk of woman's right to vote in this country, both Hindus and Muhammadans, are they prepared to break through the barriers of *purdah*? If they are not, I say, I question their sincerity. As I said before, only a few worthy ladies will get the vote, but the result would be, if we place it upon the property qualification only, a very large number of other women will also get the vote. I reverence women as the race of my mother, my sister, my wife and my daughter, and I am not prepared to cast a stone at any woman of any description whatsoever. I must point out that upon woman, society, morality and self-sacrifice depend. I would not, therefore,

desecrate the sacred vessel, the first receptacle of divine love, manifested through the mother; I would not take her into the stress and turmoil of political life. (Hear, hear) I know very well how disagreeable and degrading that strife and turmoil is, and I am really anxious to go out, as soon as I can, of this ignoble strife. I know very well that there are few among us who can resist the temptation of selling themselves to political leaders for gain and power. I would not place woman in that position. By saying all this I must not forget the fact that woman has perfectly equal rights with man in every matter; that right cannot be denied. Education was denied to woman in early times; now it is conceded on all hands. Now, Sir, I want to know what objection there can be for a lady graduate not being allowed to exercise her vote in my own constituency? Speaking as a representative of the University, I say I can see no reason whatsoever and I demand that my sister graduates should vote. Others have no right whatever to object to it. I go further and say that women who pass the Matriculation examination or the Cambridge examination should be allowed the vote, provided they satisfy the qualifications of age and property. Those women who have enfranchised themselves by education, and freed themselves from the slavery of man, who have discarded the *purdah* and have got themselves educated on an equal footing with man have every right to vote. Sir, when I find that millions of uneducated, ignorant and superstitious men, dumb driven cattle, are allowed to vote, what reason can there be that educated women, who fully understand their rights, who can hold their own against any man, should not be allowed to vote? I can find no reason whatsoever. It is said why make this educational qualification? Speaking for myself, I would put that qualification on men also. What right have ignorant, superstitious men to interfere with the management of a kingdom? (Hear, hear.) I view with apprehension the day when rough-handed labourers and the gross sons of the ugly god Kuvera, the god of wealth, should rule this world. My only hope is Solomon is right when he says that by wisdom kings do reign, and that without learning society will be impossible. Therefore, I say, Sir, the educational qualification is necessary for all persons, men and women alike. In England you are aware that there is compulsory education, and therefore they do not feel it, but in India, I do feel it, that at least as regards women there should be that qualification. Further, there is one other important reason to my mind why this qualification should be inserted and that is this. High education of women in this country is badly neglected. This will be a great impetus to higher education among women. I know from my own experience, as Secretary of certain girls' schools, that girls in India seldom go beyond the Fourth Standard. If you give the vote to women who pass the Matriculation, it will be a great impetus to high education for women. I do hope that the right of woman to vote should be recognised, recognised for a very good reason,

in order that her just rights may be safeguarded, and that she may be protected from oppression, and that the honor that is her due may be granted to her.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: I beg to move, by way of amendment, that clause (1) of motion No. 19 do take the following form:—

"(1) that the principle of extending the franchise to women for voting only, at the election of members to the Bengal Legislative Council be recognised, and that the same may at present be made applicable to lady graduates and undergraduates including those who have passed the Matriculation examination subject to the usual qualifications as to age, property, etc."

In urging my amendment upon this Council, I should at the outset, state that it provides for general recognition of the principle of conferring franchise upon women, the latter part being only a suggestion as to how far we should now proceed, and the extent to which practical operation should be given to the same in the present times and circumstances. Sir, I confess that one naturally feels somewhat diffident, if not actually nervous, while discussing such a subject. Especially for a man like me, under the glamour of metropolitan life, which often appears to be too dazzling, to come to a calm decision, the task is rather hard. On the one hand, you find the insistent demands of those Calcutta brilliants before whose gaze we turn pale; on the other hand, there are the ladies of the families in the interior of the country most of whom are endowed with such common sense that whatever comes across them they always manage in a practical way. Yet, people there are, who sincerely believe that the extension of franchise to women will be putting the thin end of the wedge into our serene and pure privacy of domestic life. If women are to sweeten our lives by which I mean home lives, the brunt of the dry-and-dust portion of the life should naturally fall to the lot of the sterner sex. One cannot, therefore, help recognising some cogency in the argument as above. In these circumstances, the question really strikes me as a very difficult one; yet it has got to be solved one way or the other. After carefully considering all the pros and cons, I am of opinion that such franchise should be allowed. Not only is that necessary in the light of the grant of franchise to the females of other countries, and because some of our sister provinces have followed suit, but to my mind the basic principle of Indian life and culture requires that woman should be given her rightful place in the polity of the country, and there is no reason why those women who, by education and other qualifications, deserve the right, should be precluded from exercising the same. Cruel historical facts and circumstances, dating from several centuries back, in their cumulative after effects, have no doubt rendered our society considerably emasculate, especially in political matters; this has had such a

pernicious effect, that most of us seem to have forgotten that our women have a place in, or connected with, anything outside the four walls of the zenana. We, therefore, often forget that the making of the people, and therefore the building of the nation is, at the outset, in the hands of woman as mother or potential mother. The Hindu idea is that woman is a symbol of the divine mother, the divine force, or *sakti*, without whose manifestation no tangible act can take place. Thousands of years of non-action may have ostensibly rendered our womanhood unworthy of exercising such functions, but can anybody deny that she is still the real regulator, controller and minister in the small family state? Hence, the original germ of divine force cannot be said to be altogether dead; it is only lying dormant owing to absence of opportunities. Give her proper facilities, and free opportunities, and she will bring a pure and sweet atmosphere into the public political life, which we now so sorely need at the present day.

I do not forget for a moment that we are subdivided into various castes and creeds, including many sub-castes and divisions, nor the fact that the practical position allotted to the women in these varies considerably. Still, a careful study will show that there is an underlying unity in this diversity, which is manifest always in the innate sense of respect towards the womenfolk, and we should certainly utilise this common element and idea in developing our national ideal. The nation is now in the making, we can therefore ill-afford to leave half the population in absolute darkness, if indeed, we are serious about our nation-building and country's future progress, *Jatra narjyantu pujyante tatra ramante devate* (where women are honoured, gods are pleased) is true in all its sense and aspects in all spheres. Who knows that our divine mother, with a view to ameliorate our present worse than slave condition, to deliver us from the hands of designing, selfish, demoniac elements and forces, has not chosen some of her earthly vehicles to show us the proper way how to proceed onward in the progress of national life, so that we may quickly reach the final goal of complete deliverance of our motherland. No sacrifice, indeed, is too dear for such a consummation.

Now, as regards the extent of practical operation that should be given to the general proposition I have enunciated above, some difficulties are universally recognised, if we consider the manners and customs of our women in general. No such objection or obstacle is in the way of the Brahmos, the Christians and the reformed Hindus and the reformed Mussalmans. There is no reason why they, who have taken to a different sort of life, should be refused the right of woman franchise as their practical co-partners, the men have got it. The difficulty lies only with the orthodox Hindu and Muhammadan community who form the majority of the Bengal population. Inaptitude and incapacity, resulting from centuries of inactive, unconcerned and

indifferent life, have almost grown into second nature among the Hindu and Mussalman women. This explains their usual subordinate position in social life among us. The fair sex is fair for everything, but not up to the mark for functioning in the external political play. They have always to depend upon some male relation or friend for every transaction of their life. They have come to such a pass that the law of the country has extended to them, as *purdahnashins*, the especial protection given to the minors. Truly it is said *nirasraya na jibanti pandita banita lata* (without support cannot live the pundit, the female and the creeper). In all matters, their outside work has to be carried out with the help of, and through the agency of, some male friend or relation. This is a state of affairs which certainly does not justify the opening of the franchise to all our women at once, and exactly in the same way as that of the men. It must also be remembered that the general illiteracy of the female voters will offer golden opportunities to certain persons for their fraudulent, dishonest malpractices at the time of election; add to that the zenana system still obtaining, under which there will be all opportunities of exercising unfair influence in the exercise of female franchise. It is, therefore, incumbent upon us that, while fully recognising the general principle of giving franchise to women, and thus affording them their just and rightful place in the civic administration of the country, we ought to be cautious in the first steps towards its practical realisation. Knowledge is power when a certain particular end is to be obtained. To the proper exercise of the franchise therefore, considerable literacy is very necessary. I remember that in case of males this standard has not been followed; we who have to fight out a real electioneering campaign, know fully well what an error this has been. The prospective, educative value, perhaps, hardly justifies this sort of promiscuous conferment of franchise upon illiterate persons. One error does not justify another. In the case of males, a standard of education has been practically given the go-by; in the case of females that should not be done, especially remembering the limitations stated above. Property should not, therefore, be the only determining factor in their case. Fair education, if taken as a standard, will be a good criterion to avoid the pitfalls that beset the path of illiterate, and this is what my amendment provides.

It is extremely regrettable that in such a serious and dignified matter, when considering the status of women, our mothers and sisters, some people have brought in the question of certain undesirables to be met with usually in towns and cities. I quite appreciate their exclusion in case of voting and municipal election, but Council franchise will be spread over the whole country. A clause excluding such ones might do for the present, or in view of the broader policy of including certain males of questionable character and the insignificance of the section, the matter might be altogether ignored. In any

case, the educational qualification, I suggest, will minimise the risk almost to a vanishing point.

With these words, I beg to respectfully offer my amendment to the acceptance of this Council.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: It is not in a spirit of opposition to my gallant and learned friend that I move my amendment. Allow me to declare at once that I have the fullest sympathy with the female suffrage movement. Nothing would give me greater pleasure or greater pride than to represent here our fair sisters as well. And all hail to the day when we would not only be their representatives here but also their colleagues. It is, therefore, with the greatest reluctance that I have risen to move the amendment which might appear to some as a sinister proposal to put off the question, to shelve it for the moment. I feel my position is delicate, nay embarrassing, and feeling it, I feel diffident of my own powers to convince the House of the grave risks of the original motion of my friend, and of the unpreparedness of the country to reap its possible benefits. And my position is all the more pitiable and unenviable when I find fair eyes bent upon us, eagerly watching our proceedings——[A voice: "Is the member in order in referring to ladies in the gallery?"]

The PRESIDENT: He is out of order if he is referring to the gallery. I have already ruled that members must not refer to the gallery.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I did not refer to ladies in the gallery. Even some of the members of the Council may have fair eyes. As I was saying, my position is all the more pitiable and unenviable when I find fair ears being pricked to hear the least syllable of our deliberations mentally dividing us the sheep from the goat. But as I have said before I am not here to oppose the motion. In the words of Scott I might say:—

> How can I to that dearest theme.
> That ever warmed a 'member's' dream,
> So foul, so false a recreant prove?

But, Sir, my sincerest conviction is that so far as Bengal is concerned, our fair sisters as a community are not prepared for the bustle of political life. They have been hardened as yet for the worthy, the mire and dirt of public life. Sir, I may appear a boor in contrast with my gallant friend—[Mr. S. M. Bose: "I am not gallant."]—I am sorry—my learned friend, the mover of the resolution. His innate chivalry, reckless of special conditions prevailing in our country, reckless of all our social and religious conventions, in at once emancipating all our women, even before our men have been fully enfranchised and able to gather the significance of it, is deserving of the highest praise. Its freshness and vigour, nay its very want of circumspection, is the commendable

in a Council noted for its cautious proceedings. But Sir, dash and good intentions are said to have paved a place not very desirable!

We have got to see whether there is a real demand for woman franchise, a need widely felt by a large section of persons most likely to be benefited. Up till now, save in a meeting or two got up here and there ——[Mr. S. N. MULLICK: "Question!"] our sisters have not been vocal in their demands. My chivalrous friend, the mover of the resolution, will perhaps attribute it to the special characteristic of the fair sex, viz., "the lips move not, though the heart covets." Or perhaps he is acting up to that Latin expression *Bis dat qui cito dat* (he giveth twice who giveth quickly).

In Bengal 52 per cent. of the population are Muhammadans. And, if I am correctly informed, no Mussalman woman can on any account come outside the *purdah*. Such is the religious percept. However highly educated they may be our Mussalman sisters are absolutely unapproachable, and so, perforce, are totally incapable of judging for themselves the respective merits of the candidates and to vote for them. So, in this female franchise, more than half the female population of Bengal must altogether be kept out of account. To them the world would remain the same as ever! Then, as regards my Hindu sisters, with a few exceptions, their case is also almost the same. Save a few in the Capital and important towns, the vast majority of them are interred behind the *purdah*. Sir, we are not here to expatiate on the merits or demerits of the *purdah* system. Whether it is right or wrong, civilised or barbarous, protecting or demoralising, does not concern us the least. We have got to know the facts and bow down to them. Not even one in a thousand of our Hindu sisters can take advantage of this enfranchisement. And even amongst those whom no *purdah* can bind, how many pay the necessary rates or taxes to qualify them as voters? It is their husbands that pay them. Does my friend the mover mean that the qualification of the husband tantamounts to the qualification of the wife; that if the worse-half be qualified, the more so the better-half; the *Shahadharmini* is a *Sahakarmini* and so a *Sahavotini*?

Here I do not take into account the great difficulty that must necessarily be felt in registering these votes and the corruptions and false personifications that must necessarily prevail. Sir, here in Bengal, the instances of Madras and Bombay should not be quoted. For the conditions there differ from ours. There they have practically no *purdah* and respectable women can go to the polling stations to record their votes.

And let my friends, Christians, Brahmos and Hindus, who have adopted Western custom and manners ponder over this:" How many of the ladies of their household have independent means?" How many of them can be benefited by this franchise?" Few, few, very few! But what would be the danger they would have to confront at the same time, if my friend's resolution be accepted in its entirety? There is a large

class of women in almost every bazar who possess or can possess and I dare say would possess the necessary qualifications by payment of rates and taxes. It is they who will be the most benefited by this extension of franchise. Our respectable sisters would be nowhere before them, they would be swamped by the formidable numerical strength of these creatures. These women have no scruples, they go everywhere and are purchasable at any price. I am afraid, my friend the mover, and the ladies who are eager for their votes, could hardly have taken this into account. If the substantive resolution, as moved by my friend be accepted, you can by no means shut out these public women. Their intrusion would be debasing and demoralising. And scenes, just as scandalous as were witnessed the other day at Goalundo and Faridpur, would be repeated everywhere to the utter disgrace of womanhood, shocking to all sense of morality. Sir, casting aside all fear of reiteration I repeat again—" Who would be benefited by this extension of franchise?" Would the candidates go a-courting these public women for their votes? Would it be dignified, would it be desirable? I hope my friend the mover himself would be horrified at this aspect of the case.

It might be said, and it is actually said in certain quarters that we might accept the principle of female franchise, leaving the details to adjust themselves later on. I think this Council cannot and will not do that. This Council cannot accept a principle off-hand, without considering the details, without giving a thought as to how its mandates are to be realised into action. The Council cannot knowingly express a mere pious resolve. This is a responsible body, not given to mere hysterics. And, Sir, who is there, let alone the Council, who can seriously swallow a principle, without knowing how it is to be worked out and its effects and consequences? Can you accept the principle of Socialism of Karl Marx with no knowledge as to how they are to be attained? Can you accept the principle of Rousseau or of Lenin unconditionally? Their looks read very well, nay prophetic, and seem to bring about Utopia. And fortunately for us, as permanent warnings to future generations, people had been mad enough to accept them on their words giving no thought to the details. " The red fool-fury of the Seine " was the result of one, and the still more scarlet and still more foolishly furious horror is the result of the other Bolshevism——

Mr. KRISHNA CHANDRA RAY CHAUDHURI: Is the member in order?

The PRESIDENT: I think he is in order.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: Bolshevism is the result of the application of the ideals of Communism with no thought to details! Sir, details modify the principle, they make it. Coming nearer home, are you willing to accept the principle of that bloodless

revolution, known as non-violent non-co-operation without knowing how it is to be given effect to? Some have done it, and are tasting the sweets of it. *Swaraj* was promised within a few months, but has it been attained? The answer is—it could not be worked out in details, and periods of grace are being prayed for, and I daresay the periods of grace will last till the Sun grows cold. Sir, vague comparisons confined to generalities can be of no avail. If Madras and Bombay can have female franchise, why not we? If life be possible on the Earth why not on the Moon? Never mind the condition of the Moon, whether there is any atmosphere or not. The acceptance of an abstract principle must depend on its possible applicability and that too on the conditions subsisting. Female franchise may be all right where suitable conditions prevail. But here in Bengal, before we accept the principle, we must recognise the conditions under which it must be applied—the atmosphere of the *purdah*. How would the ladies vote? Would there be one polling booth for both men and women? That is absurd and not even suggested. Would there be two separate booths? One for men and the other for women? Then let us see what would happen. Who would be the recording officer? If a man, he will have some subordinates too. We all know what feelings our women have if they have to depose in courts, how they try to shun an appearance there, and how even serious cases are not prosecuted simply for fear that the ladies of the house may have to depose. And, if the votes be recorded by women? Have you that large number of efficient, responsible women, willing to do this work, for you cannot force such duties on women, and is the number sufficient for the whole province of Bengal? It is no good being sentimental. It is no good crying out "our mothers and sisters have no votes, let us be chivalrous, let us be charitable, let us give them votes." It is not a question of charity, not a question between master and slave. Hysterics are not practical politics. Before granting the power of election we must make it practically possible, we must see that it can be utilised and not merely locked up in an iron safe like precious jewellery. And suppose in an electorate there are 10,000 female electors. But because of the prevailing social and religious customs 8,000 voters cannot exercise their franchise and keep aloof, only 2,000 do vote, 500 of whom are probably respectable ladies whom no *purdah* can hold. But who would be the remaining 1,500? The undesirables, the result being one of their men get returned. The Congress have extended franchise to all women contributing four annas to the Congress Fund. But how many respectable ladies there exercised their power of electing the Congress delegates? [Mr. S. N. MULLICK: "Question!"] It is common knowledge, and I speak on the most reliable information from the mufassal that prostitutes and they alone trooped to the polling booths attired in their best. I know not if such a state of things is desired by Mr. Bose and his supporters. Fearing all these, the framers of the

Bengal Electoral Rules had been wise enough to make it an express provision in Rule 7, that the Council can recommend that the sex disqualification of registration be removed either in respect of women generally or *any class of women*. Sir, mark the words "any class of women!" And we are now asked not to look before we leap, to forget all this considered wisdom and make our minds *tabula rasa* for any child to scrawl upon.

And when once like men and with similar qualifications the women have votes, candidates must also try to make themselves known to their electors. Their canvassers will vie with each other in singing the fulsome praises of their respective masters. Sir, let us not try to loom large with that lofty ideal, that no personal canvassing should be done. We must look to practical possibility, what has been done, and what is being done; and not what in "Plato's Republic" should be done. I challenge anybody here to assert that he had not done any personal canvassing, either himself, or through his well-wishers or canvassers to any of his voters. When once our ladies get votes, canvassers must try to approach them; and men having no entrance inside the zenana, who will be employed as canvassers by the rival candidates, not respectable women, who know not the art of canvassing and cannot go from door to door begging for a favour. It is the undesirables again that would be employed for they are adepts, the past-masters in the art of personal canvassing, the only training of their life. Would you like your sisters and daughters mixing freely with these creatures? Would you even like the acquaintance of your ladies with these people? With that ostensible object of canvassing what can they not pour into the young ears during mid-day while you are away? There are these rocks ahead. Beware of them. In your efforts to look charitable, forget not the sanctity of your homes and hearts. Throw not the innocent into the risks of corruption.

Perhaps the feasibility of the thing did never strike him. He never considered the practical aspect of it. Sir, as I have said already, admirable is his chivalry, but quixotic is his quest.

I however realise that in our province there are some ladies who are second to none in ability or intellect. Of them, any country can be proud, and I glory in them. That would be a joyous day, a day of jubilation when they would enter the Council to guide us in our deliberations. It is far from my thought to bar the doors against them. Sir, having the desire but knowing the danger, aspiring, but not blindly following, I move my amendment for the formation of a committee. I leave the selection wholly into the hands of the Government that a sufficient number of members, both ladies and gentlemen, may sit on it representing all shades of views in the country. There might be officials too, if necessary. The committee would first gauge the demand for this woman franchise and if it be found that a volume of opinion, opinion of women themselves, is in its favour then it should consider

under what conditions a woman would be eligible for a vote, what would be the necessary qualifications of a woman elector, and how and where their votes should be recorded, and by whom, with due safeguards against corruption and false personification.

Here I cannot refrain from referring to a peculiar document I received only last night. Probably it has been circulated to all of us. I will not mention the name of the author here and satisfy his greed for cheap notoriety. Perhaps he is one of the "big brothers" he mentions in his pamphlet. He has threatened us, the members of this Council, with putrid eggs and other more substantial things. He proposes to go to our electorates, show us up to them and see that we are never returned again. To my knowledge this is the first time that the members of the Council have been intimidated and threats have been printed and openly held out to them to pass a measure not according to their sober judgment but under compulsion.

In conclusion, I must repeat my assurance to the esteemed mover and his supporters that I am not an enemy to the movement. Far be it from my idea to nip it in the bud. My only desire is to find out the best means for representing our women, steering clear of all rocks that appear to beset our path; and a committee seems to me to be the best for the purpose. Let me repeat again that the committee is not to shelve the question but to solve it. The committee would hardly take six months to come to a decision and the next election is due not before thirty months hence and so the question of delay also does not arise.

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): Since the fact that this resolution appears as an ordinary entry in the general list might give rise to the supposition in some quarters that, constitutionally, this and the other resolutions have the same effect, it may not perhaps be out of place if I remind the Council of the constitutional position—the more so because memories in these matters are short and the point has not yet been touched upon by any of the speakers. As is well known to the Council, the ordinary effect of a resolution is of a recommendation to Government. But that is not the effect of a resolution such as has been moved by Mr. Bose. As will be remembered, the Southborough Committee made a recommendation adverse to the cause of female suffrage, but the matter was raised again before the Joint Committee, whose recommendation was that "the question whether women should or should not be admitted to the franchise on the same terms as men should be left to the newly elected Legislative Council of each province to settle by resolution." In accordance with that recommendation the second proviso of rule 7 of the Electoral Rules runs as follows:—

Provided, further, that, if a resolution is passed by the Council after not less than one month's notice has been given of an intention to move such a resolution,

recommending that the sex disqualification for registration should be removed, either in respect of women generally or any class of women, the local Government shall make regulations providing that women, or a class of women, as the case may be, shall not be disqualified for registration by reason only of their sex.

Therefore the difference between this resolution and an ordinary resolution is that, if Mr. Bose's resolution is passed, it will be incumbent on the local Government to frame regulations forthwith.

Another point to which I wish to allude is one of a doubt in this connection which we have not been able so far to solve satisfactorily. It applies to the two amendments of Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur and Babu Annada Charan Dutta. It will be noticed that the first amendment proposes a new departure in the case of women; whereas to vote for the University constituency a male graduate must be of seven years' standing, the Rai Bahadur's amendment does not provide for any such restrictions in the case of lady graduates. He would allow any lady graduate to vote; that is widening the franchise in their favour. Then whereas men with certain property qualifications can vote irrespective of educational qualifications, the second amendment would limit the vote in the case of women to those possessing certain educational qualifications as also property qualifications. That means narrowing the franchise for women. The point is whether the class of women, as referred to in the rules, means the class of women who are matriculates and so on, or whether it is only the major disqualification of sex which a resolution of this Council can remove, otherwise leaving the same qualifications to govern the case of both men and women. We have taken legal opinion on the point, and we are advised that the rule might include a class such as is contemplated in these amendments, but we are also told that the matter is not free from doubt. Therefore, if this amendment is carried, we will have to clear up the point further before giving effect to it. It is just as well that the Council should be aware of this legal point.

Apart from that I only have to say that so far as official voting is concerned, it is not the wish of the Government to exercise any pressure of any kind, and officials may record their votes on any side they like.

Dr. A. SUHRAWARDY: As a student of Moslem history, as one who has not quite forgotten the illustrious names of Razia Sultan and Gulbadan Begum, of Nurjahan, Mumtaz Mahal and Chand Bibi, as one who still recollects the glorious rôle played by Moslem women in the annals of the Caliphate, as one who remembers with reverence the beautiful saying of the Prophet—" Heaven lies at the feet of women, of mother "—I cannot but sympathise with the resolution moved by my friend Mr. S. M. Bose. Sir, I cannot understand how any man with any sense of chivalry in him, with any pretensions to education and culture can fail to sympathise with women's efforts at emancipation,

advancement, and participation in the benefits of the Reforms. It is true, Sir, that the hard fact remains to be faced that even in England —that home of freedom, enlightenment and culture—not long ago women laboured under great disabilities and in the matter of franchise they were classed with idiots, lunatics and infants. England, however, has at last made amends for the past and now we have in England, in the person of Lady Astor, a lady member of Parliament. Now, Sir, we, who imitate and would like to follow England in other respects, why should we not follow the example of England in this? It is said that the vast majority of Indian women live in seclusion behind the *purdah*. So do the vast majority of Indian men. The vast majority of our electors, our constituents with low level of intelligence live in *purdah* behind the veil of illiteracy and ignorance. Babu Annada Charan Dutta missed the real point when he urged that the right of voting only should be accorded to women. It is not so much the right of voting that matters. It does not matter much whether women can or cannot record their votes in favour of a particular male candidate; although this in itself constitutes a grievance. Members should realise that by depriving women of suffrage we shut the door of the House, against such ladies as Miss Cornelia Sorabjee, Miss Lilian Brock, Lady Chaudhuri, Lady Bose, Mrs. Roy, Rani Mrinalini, to quote only a few names. I refrain from mentioning ladies of my own community not that we have none equal in education and culture to the ladies just named. I have not to travel very far in search of the name of a Moslem lady whose education and learning, culture and enlightenment, self-sacrifice and devotion to the pursuit of knowledge under difficulties would do honour to any community. Sir, if I refrain from mentioning Moslem ladies I do so because I know that the *purdah* stands in the way of their participation in political activities. Yet, Sir, there is no strong reason why even Moslem ladies should not have the right of recording their votes. It is preposterous that ladies of wealth and position, education and culture should be denied the enjoyment of a right enjoyed by the *khansama* and *khitmatgars*, their butchers and bakers, their butlers and cooks, their coachmen and palanquin bearers. Sir, we who, clamour, shout and vociferate for liberty, justice and equality, let us not be a party to the inequitous policy of the enslavement and subjection of women. O, why not let the women come in? They will relieve the dulness of the debates. Their presence will diffuse a freshness and fragrance in the depressing atmosphere of the House. They will add a charm, a little life, light and colour where darkness and dulness prevail.

But, Sir, in spite of all that I feel on the subject and in spite of all that I have said, I deeply deplore that I cannot formally support the motion of my friend Mr. Bose. It is not that I am afraid that some member may unearth the report of Lord Southborough's Committee—the Franchise Committee—on which I had the honour to serve

as an added member for Bengal. It is not that I am afraid that woman suffrage will throw wide open the door for corrupt practices and false personation, specially in the case of *purdah* ladies. My reason, Sir, for formally opposing the motion is that I belong to a profession which allows a man to say what he does not mean, provided that he is paid for it. Sir, on the one hand the Bangiya Nari Samaj which invited to its Garden Party venerable members of the Council somehow completely forgot my existence. Sir, nowadays, I have become extremely sensitive and suspicious.

I wonder whether the crime of holding office in the University has something to do with my exclusion from the fashionable gathering of the ladies. My hon'ble and gallant friend—I use the word "gallant" in its ordinary sense.

The PRESIDENT: You should give a member his proper description.

Dr. A. SUHRAWARDY: All right, Sir, my hon'ble and chivalrous friend Mr. Erfan Ali promised me to bring my grievance to the notice of the ladies and get the wrong redressed. I have been expecting since the offer of a cup of tea or a glass of *sherbet* by some fair hand by way of compensation. I have waited and waited till I rose to my feet to address the House but I waited in vain. On the other hand, my hon'ble and noble friend, the Raja of Chakdighi, has given proof of his Rajput chivalry and hospitality and has thus briefed me to oppose the resolution.

Raja MANI LOLL SINGH ROY: I beg your pardon.

Dr. A. SUHRAWARDY: That is why, Sir, though personally inclined to play to the gallery, I resist the resistless appeal from the gallery. The ladies, Sir, should not be disappointed or surprised if a House which carried a resolution the other day against the advancement of light and learning——

The PRESIDENT: You need not refer to what the Council did the other day.

Dr. A. SUHRAWARDY: All right, Sir, the ladies should not be disappointed or surprised if the House is backward, retrograde and unprogressive enough to defeat to-day a resolution for the advancement and emancipation of women. They should not be disappointed, for after all, even if carried, the resolution would not confer upon them immediately the benefits of the suffrage. They will hope to wait for two years and a half. I, therefore, commend to the favourable consideration of the champions of the cause of female suffrage a solution and a solatium which will enable the ladies to realise their dreams much earlier. Let them shake the dust of this dark and dismal Chamber

off their feet and let them turn their thoughts not far away, to where dwells the Earl of Ronaldshay. Let them invade the sacred precincts of the Government House. Let them persuade our chivalrous Governor to remove the disqualification against the nomination of women as members of Council. Let them prevail upon some jaded, tired, fatigued and overworked nominated members to resign. I hope there are some wise and magnanimous enough to do so—and let Mrs. Sarojini Naidu, for example, be nominated. Let us see how the experiment works. Experimentation is the spirit of the Reforms. We are having the Reforms by instalments and doses. Let us have the first dose of female suffrage on the Government side. I earnestly trust that the mover will give his anxious consideration to my suggestion and withdraw his resolution and avoid defeat and disappointment to all champions of the cause of advancement of women.

Babu NITYA DHON MUKHERJEE: I find it most trying to address the Council on this question. I believe the other members will also find it trying, as who has the boldness to be unfair to the fair sex? A practical example may be given. Take Babu Annada Charan Dutta's amendment. In the beginning of his address he said that he was feeling rather nervous in delivering his speech, but in the course of his speech he gathered sufficient courage and said that he was in favour of female franchise. He further said that the reformed Hindus and the reformed Muhammadans of the reformed Council must allow the reformed ladies the power of voting. But, Sir, what is the definition of "reformed"? If Mr. D. L. Roy's definition is accepted, then we are nowhere. He also said that educated ladies can teach even educated men. Yes, Sir, I quite believe it. Babu Annada Charan Dutta profusely quoted in his speech from Mrs. Basu's pamphlet which, I understand, has been circulated to all members. Even the Sanskrit quotations in Babu Annada Charan Dutta's speech are to be found in that pamphlet. But, Sir, the selfish motive of man is there. Notwithstanding what he had said he would only give to his educated sisters the power of voting only, but he would not allow them to sit in the Council by his side.

We have also heard Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray. But he has not given his reason as to why there should be a committee. My friend has also said that to be a member of the Council, personal canvassing will be necessary and it would not be good for the ladies to go out canvassing. My reply is that canvassing will not be necessary in case of ladies, because where a lady would stand as a candidate, that seat will not be contested.

Sir, we have also heard Dr. Suhrawardy, but unfortunately, we could not follow him and so we do not know what he meant.

Sir, the educated and civilised ladies have been agitating for some time past. But, Sir, they form a very small fraction of the total number

of women of Bengal, and the question arises whether every one, educated or uneducated, should be given the franchise. Therefore that is the first reason for referring the question to a committee. The second reason is that opinion of public bodies should be taken and that can only be done by a committee.

The mover of the resolution has said that it is a political question. Sir, it is a political question with those that are educated, rich, and influential, but it is a social question with the rest of the womanhood of Bengal. With them it is a question of home and hearth. There are sections of communities whose religion prohibits woman franchise.

The amendment of Babu Annada Charan Dutta will not have any effect because as soon as this resolution is passed, these ladies will have a right to become candidates for the Council, and not only, they will have also the right to come forward as members of District Boards and Municipalities, and it will be difficult to deny them this privilege. Whom will they represent? How many females will be represented by these women of light and leading? Then my friend, the Kumar, has proposed certain restrictions for that class of women, who I may say, are hated by the society and are avoided as poison by all good people, and he wants to appoint a committee for this purpose.

Then the learned mover of this resolution has said that this will give education. What education, Sir, may I know? The probable answer is political. But before doing that, would it not be desirable to give them the primary education? No doubt this will be an acquisition and will give a new sphere of life to the rich, educated and cultured ladies. Would political education have any value with those who have got to attend to the domestic affairs from morning till they go to bed, with those who have got to go a mile with pitchers to fetch drinking water, and with those who almost every year are dying in hundreds for want of food and wearing clothes? Therefore, every one of us will be very thankful to the supporters of this resolution, if instead of taking this forward step, they move a little backward and put their eyes on the people of the mufassal and try to give them primary education and teach the ordinary principles of sanitation. I therefore submit that this matter should be settled by a representative committee before taking any practical steps, and in this view I support the resolution of Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray.

Mr. H. A. STARK: There can be no one in this Council who is not most anxious that the peoples of India should rise in the scale of nations, and who does not therefore welcome every measure that has for its object the uplifting of the races that dwell in this great land. It has been well said that no nation can be greater than its mothers. In deep sympathy as I am with the aspirations of my Indian colleagues in this Chamber for the fuller emancipation of their womanhood, and knowing, as I do, their great ability to champion the cause of their women, I will merely

say that I am here to speak in particular on behalf of the women of my community. We maintain that in all material respects they are as qualified as the men for the exercise of the vote. The Census shows that the Anglo-Indian population is equally divided between males and females, and that education is practically universal. The official publication entitled "Statistics of British India" records that in 1919-20 there were 22,568 Anglo-Indian boys and 21,354 Anglo-Indian girls receiving instruction. Again, the economic pressure of these days has resulted in the women of the community becoming wage-earners in annually increasing numbers. Many of them are supporting dependents. Numbers of them are paying an income-tax or a municipal rate or cess. We find them serving in Government and mercantile offices: in retail firms and railways; in the postal and telegraph departments; in schools and hospitals. Some of them fill well-paid positions of trust and responsibility. The Report of the Calcutta Domiciled Community Inquiry Committee (1918-19) provides the following statistics relating to Anglo-Indian women workers per 100 men:—

Industries	30
Transport	5
Trade	22
Public Administration	4
Arts and Professions	114
Other Occupations	59

I believe that a few telling facts, briefly stated, speak with more eloquence than the best turned sentences. I have therefore confined myself to facts, and I claim that I have shown that whether the test of literacy or the test of payment of a tax or rate be applied to them, a large percentage of Anglo-Indian women are qualified for the suffrage, and for participating in the rights and responsibilities of citizenship. I cordially support the original recommendation now before this Council.

Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI: It is very difficult to speak against such a resolution, not because there are no reasons against it but because there is so much sentiment in favour of it, and particularly because any opposition to it may be misconstrued as disrespect to the womankind and want of sympathy with their aspirations. However, one has got to take that risk—the risk of being misinterpreted and misjudged and incur odium when one sincerely believes that neither the best interests of the ladies nor those of the country will be served by passing such a resolution at this stage.

Sir, I am no believer in any inherent disability of woman and hence I base my opposition neither on the authority of the Old Testament, nor to the Bhagabat, neither on the authority of St. Augustine nor that of Sankaracharyya, neither on what Martin Luther used to repeat, nor

what Napoleon said to Madame Condorcet. No, not on any authority either old or new is my opposition grounded.

Neither am I oblivious of the cultural history of ancient India, of the solid achievements of the ladies of old, of their contribution to the hymnology of the Vedas, of their elaboration of the doctrines of Upanishad, of the propagation of Buddhism beyond the confines of India, to Ceylon by Sanghamita, of the developments that even Astrology and Mathematics received at their hands. Yes, even the darkest ages had their flashes of lightning. But old times have gone and old manners have changed long, long ago.

I know, Sir, I shall be asked, "if you do believe in a renaissance, if you have any idea of what is coming." My reply is, yes, I do believe in a renaissance, I do pray for it, not in the sense of an 'overturn and reversal' by any foreign culture, but in the sense of a re-birth of the national soul." But as we are not yet sure in what forms and activities it will reincarnate itself and as " in the outward life of the nation we are still in a stage of much uncertainty and confusion" we cannot but oppose a proposition which is coming only on the top of a wave of imitation. Moreover, I am fortified by Lord Salisbury's reply: "We have no right to assume what the future will be. It is your duty to act as you honestly believe. Even if it were the fact that your opponents must ultimately triumph it is only designed that they shall so triumph after they have conquered every obstacle which it is your duty to put in their way. It is thus that nature protects herself against what is premature."

Now to come to specific arguments against woman franchise at this stage, in the first place, Sir, I beg to say that the resolution is unauthorised. Except amongst a certain section, and a limited section too, of Calcutta ladies there is, so far as I know, no reliable evidence of a desire or demand for such a franchise; and if that be the case we have got no right, I think, to thrust such a right upon Hindu and Muhammadan women in general, specially when it is doubtful if the privilege exercised under the Reforms is enjoyed as a matter of right or by way of sufferance. I know, Sir, I shall be told in reply that then the representations of the educated men and so-called representatives of the masses cannot be taken as the views of the dumb millions. Sir, the educated men of the country have established their claim to be the spokesmen of the masses only after a " return movement " and after being " back to the country " in the widest sense of the term. So long as that movement of synthesis does not appear among the educated women in this country the representative character of the go-ahead ladies can seriously be questioned.

My second objection to women franchise at this stage, Sir, is that it is a proposal to put the cart before the horse—to invert historical sequence and the normal order of evolution. I do not know, Sir, of any instance in history—where political enfranchisement has preceded

social emancipation—where women have got votes before the other elementary human rights. When for having lived for centuries in a conquered country, lived for ages in an enslaved society, when stickling between suicidal non-education on the one hand and a baneful foreign education on the other, our women have lost the freedom to move in sunshine, to breathe ample air, to live freely and work out unfettered their high destiny, to realise themselves not, of course, in and through the forms borrowed slavishly from the West, but even in new forms instinct with national culture and consistent with their glorious past traditions—to propose that they should have the right to vote and take part in elections—what else it can be but a hollow mockery, I do not understand. To take suffrage in such a narrow sense betrays only an imitative mind which cannot help the growth but only give a wrong direction to the woman movement in this country.

And this brings me to my third objection to the resolution and that is that it will give a false ideal to "feminism" in this country and that is, Sir, what we "vernacular-minded" people fear most. We do not think, Sir, that by dragging our womenfolk into the political arena we can give "Home" to our "Rule." We think with Ellen Key that "they must learn to know that their power is greatest in those provinces in which 'imponderable' values are created, values that cannot be reduced to figures and yet are the sole values capable of transforming humanity." "Until women" and the pseudo-champions of their rights "come to recognise this it must be insisted that the gain to society is nothing if millions of women simply do the work that men could do and probably do better and evade or fulfil but poorly the greater tasks of life and happiness, the creation of men and the creation of souls." "It is a pity," says the same authoress, "that the modern American reform proposition has so blinded many women that they do not see that the American programme is like the American birds, whose colours are magnificent but who cannot sing. The American soul in general still lacks music. It has no ear for the tones and half-tones of life. For it is not utilities but complete human beings that elevate life. Accordingly, all the outward improvements through legislation and social work remain on the whole without effect, because neither men nor women understand that what really counts is the work done in the field of ethical values and in the furtherance of spiritual conditions." I admit, Sir, that to fulfil their great tasks and destiny, women require the same human rights as men, but certainly this accession of rights should not begin with the storming of polling booths and capture of seats in Council Chambers. In India, we believe, there has been a diluvion of women's rights and what we advocate is not the formation of an *insula nata* but "re-formation *in situ*." For what our country needs at this juncture is richer, fuller, freer women—truer makers of men and not simply politically-minded women.

In the next place, Sir, my objection is that it is not the stage in which our ladies can participate with honour in politics—nothing but participation in fully self-governing institutions befits them. And if women in free England could wait till 1919 (The Sex Disqualification Removal Act), cannot our sisters afford to wait a few years more? "Doll's house" in society may be distasteful to our educated ladies, but certainly a "Doll's house" in politics is not a good substitute for that and flight from the one is as unjustifiable as it is unseemly to fight for a candidate or place in the other.

One word with regard to Rai Jogendra Chandra Ghose Bahadur's amendment and I have done. I did not think, Sir, that, being the representative of the University, the Rai Bahadur was incapable of thinking of any other qualification but University certificates. A mind that cannot contemplate any intelligence, commonsense or culture, outside the walls of the University, does not, in spite of its eloquent professions, really honour our womanhood but honours University certificates only. Hence, Sir, I am grieved to find that a person like Rai Bahadur Ghose, insisting on such a qualification should in a manner and of course unwittingly insult the intelligence and commonsense of the Hindu and the Muhammadan ladies in general to whose *tapasya*, if to anything at all, the coming re-birth of the national soul of India will be largely due.

But, Sir, in spite of all these objections, I shall be the last person to stand in the way of woman franchise, if I can only ascertain that such is the desire of our women in general, and if I can only understand what qualifications will be insisted on, and what practice and procedure will be followed to make it a reality, and, in this view, I beg to support the amendment of Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray.

Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: I rise to support the resolution of Mr. S. M. Bose. I have been discussing the matter in and out of this Council and I shall now try to meet some of the arguments of the opponents of this resolution, viz., that our women are not yet fit for the suffrage, that very few of them would only be able to participate in utilising the franchise, that the *purdah* system of a large majority of our women would be encroached upon, that the homes where the ladies are expected to be the guiding angels would be neglected, that, on the whole, the removal of the sex disqualification would only unsex them. Now, to my mind, none of these arguments bears a moment's scrutiny.

The question of fitness applies equally to men as well as to women. If we remember the fact that the minimum qualification of a voter is the payment of a very small amount of road cess or chaukidari tax, the average male voters of any constituency can neither be more intelligent nor educated enough to appreciate the value of franchise conferred on them, and I make bold to declare that many of the voters who arrived at the polling booths during the last election arrived there more out of

persuasion by interested parties than out of a pure desire to utilise their franchise under a proper sense of responsibility.

Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur waxed eloquent on the fact that even in England the women had no franchise till recently, but this hon'ble gentleman, the representative of the Calcutta University, ought to know that his University was much more liberal in conferring degrees to her daughters long, long before the Universities of Oxford or Cambridge.

It is a known fact that, whenever a lady has been placed at the helm of affairs, be it the management of her estates or be it any social function, the management of the functions is done with greater attention to morals, discipline and decency. The names of Queen Victoria the Good, Ahalya Bai, Rani Bhabani, Rani Sarat Sundari, Maharani Swarnamoyee and many others are instances in point. I mean no personal reflection to any one when I say that it is my firm conviction that many of our zamindaris in Bengal will be managed more economically and with greater satisfaction to their tenants if, instead of the male zamindars, their ladies take their place, as in that case wanton frivolities will be a thing of the past. Do the opponents of this resolution seriously think that their ladies are not fit to exercise their votes when they themselves cannot refrain from consulting them in every detail of household affairs?

Regarding the next point, that very few of our ladies would care to participate in utilising their opportunities, I will say that I am not a prophet nor am I gifted with the foresight like that of the opponents of this resolution, but I am sure a large section of our qualified lady voters will join, and join it with a full sense of responsibility, unlike some of of the male voters, who, during the last election, did not even know the names and whereabouts of the persons they voted for. Again, without giving our women an opportunity how can one bodly assert that this franchise will be utilised by few?

I come to the next point that the *purdah* would be encroached upon. I ask them in all seriousness, how? Will our women be dragged into the polling booths by hooligans or otherwise insulted? If our women can manage to give evidence in a court of law, if our lady zamindars in strict *purdah* can hold conversation sometimes with highest officers of Government, through their agents, if our women can attend in their thousands the public exhibition, the Zoological Gardens and the Museum; if our women in strict *purdah* can go in their hundred thousands to attend the Sagar Mela, Khumbha Mêla, etc., and other ceremonial functions where there cannot be any total absence of males, I do not appreciate their reasoning when I hear that the *purdah* will be encroached upon. I do not deny, however, that in case the sex disqualification is removed some arrangements will have to be made by the authorities to ensure privacy of the zenana and, I believe, this will not be an insurmountable difficulty for those who wield the paramount power.

The next point that the homes of the ladies will be neglected if this suffrage is allowed is also not justified by facts. Every voter is not going to get a seat in the Council to discharge the affairs of the State and no stretch of imagination enables me to forsee a numerical strength of lady members in the Council which cannot be counted on one's finger ends.

The elected members of this Council ought to realize that every member here has got to sacrifice something dear to him in attending this Council for the sake of his country, the lawyer his clients, the doctor his patients, the zamindar his tenants, and the professor his students, the merchant his business, and the others their coveted sleep and happy dreams. And if one lady in a lakh chooses to devote a few hours in the Council, or if the general body of lady voters spend half an hour for the purpose of recording their votes once in three years, will the happiness of all homes be a thing of the past? Personally, I do not believe it. Did a Rani Bhabani, a Maharani Swarnamoyee, or Rani Sarat Sundari neglect their household duties in the discharge of their public functions? I would remind my opponents of the well known saying that the busiest persons have got the greatest leisure and it is only the idle that always clamour for want of time. The last point, viz., that the removal of sex disqualification will only unsex them. I would not care to reply. When coming from the mufassal I entered the Medical College here, the presence of a large number of lady students in the class and the presence of nurses in the male wards were something new to me and it took me some time to get accustomed to the new environment and I have every confidence that the same will result in this Council when our Councillors get accustomed to the presence of ladies in their midst. One word more and I finish. I am a member of the orthodox Hindu community, the identical community from which comes Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray, not in name alone but in practice, and I am one of those who did not practise in private life any thing for which I may stand convicted in the public gaze of my society. I am, on the other hand, not one of those who feel a charm for everything foreign, but still I am one of those who would not like for ever to remain in a narrow groove to the sacrifice and detriment of the best interests of our country. I am one of those who believe in the Reforms, but I am not one of those who believe them to produce any real effect so long as the benefits of the Reforms are not allowed to be shared by all—men and women alike—who have got the best interests of their country at heart.

I am aware, Sir, that a similar opposition was headed by the so-called orthodox school at the time of introducing filtered water supply in the town of Calcutta when people of position and influence deplored the introduction of filtered water on the ground of religion. I am aware, Sir, of the opposition on the ground of religion about the abolition of *Sutee* and the offerings of living children to the Ganges. I am also

aware, Sir, of another opposition in the name of religion about the Consent Bill, but it is common knowledge that people have now appreciated the boons. What is morally good is also good for society and furthermore orthodoxy is not bigotry. I fully believe that the removal of sex disqualification will be of material help in bringing up latent talents in the management of the administration of the country in a class of people hitherto neglected, and I am sure those, who are opposing this resolution to-day, will welcome it in future by the results achieved.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: I owe it to the womanhood of the country to support the resolution moved by Mr. S. N Bose. One may call us conservatives, moderates, extremists or nationalists, but I myself belong to a school of thought which has been always progressive. I would not go on repeating or paraphrasing what John Stuart Mill has said on the subjection of women in these days of growing democracy. Indian womanhood, cultured womanhood, can no longer be left behind in the race of life and debarred from enjoying political privileges. They have begun to assert their position and it is time that we should concede to them their right ungrudgingly. Irrational prejudice of men have done much to retard the mental growth and mental progress of our women and their birthright has long been denied to them. We would no longer be able to keep them back from their rightful places in the body politic. Our ancient scriptures, our history of old days, as left to us, contain brilliant pages of achievements by Indian womanhood and kings and emperors of those days thought it a high privilege to be instructed and guided by the advice of the cultured ladies who visited their courts. It would not do for us to ignore the signs of the times and not take due notice of the movement that has been set on foot in the country to secure votes for women. We can postpone the question and thereby help to create a new sort of discontent; but we will not be permitted to shelve the question much longer. Our ladies know better than we do how to accomplish an object and surely it will neither be wise nor sagacious to drive them to the necessity of fighting out their case to the bitter end. I plead for doing the act with good grace and nothing is well done which is not done with good grace. We are working on constitutional lines and we are in for *Swaraj*. It will therefore be in the fitness of things if we solidly vote for the acceptance of the resolution moved by Mr. S. M. Bose. My only regret is that other parts of the country—Madras and Bombay preferably—had to show us the way and remind us of our duty. But it is never too late to mend and let us mend the matter by the solidity of our votes. Let not the world say that cultured Bengal and representatives of the people in the Council have failed to give correct expression to public opinion in the matter Let us unanimously vote for this resolution.

I have had the opportunity to listen to the arguments of Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray who says that it would be very difficult to put the principle in operation, if acted upon by this Council. But there would be no difficulty if Government be prepared to modify the election rules. When these rules were initiated by Government, great difficulty was felt in many quarters to carry them out. I myself felt great difficulty in that way; but these election rules are now put in operation and no one can doubt the excellence of them. If the election rules are framed and drafted on a proper basis, there will be no difficulty in the way. Reference has been made to the bazar women who it is feared would come forward to vote in the election. Can there not be any rule to prohibit them? Members of the Council will find no difficulty if the rules are framed as I said on proper basis. True, it is, that the *purdah* system prevails in our country. True it is, that ladies cannot come out of the *purdah;* but will that be an argument against carrying out the principle enunciated in the Council Manual? At the time when the Widows Remarriage Act was before the Government, we know what objections were raised; solid objections were made at the time but some of my countrymen saw that it was a mistake to oppose the principle enunciated in it. When the Acts are novel, when rules are novel, when the subject is new, there must be objections but we ought not to be afraid of them. I am led to think, after deep and anxious consideration, that it is high time that this Council should consider the force of the resolution which has been brought forward before it. It is time that we should not be in the backward line, on the retrograde side. We must come forward and help the women as far as it lies in us. Great injustice has been done to the girls and women of our country. We educate our boys at great expense but what have we done to educate our girls? It is time that Bengal should come forward to allow the women to exercise their right of franchise. If I am not irrelevant, I may plead to this Council, as I have done on many platforms, that it is necessary for Bengal to see that the education of women is spread as far as possible. If female education would have spread in the country, we would have seen many female Councillors in the Council Chamber by this time.

With these words, I beg to support the resolution moved by my friend Mr. S. M. Bose.

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: I beg to support the resolution moved by Mr. S. M. Bose. As a Muhammadan I am bound to support it. From the very commencement of civilization, during the time of the Saracens, the Arab women accompanied their husbands to battle. They were behind their husbands and if any one wanted to flee away from the battle-field, it was the voice of his wife which goaded him on. Naturally the men were ashamed to flee away from the battle-field;

they would not show their backs to the enemy. What was their valour due to? It was due to the presence of their wives.

Then again, coming to recent times, we have got Nur Jehan, Sultana Rezia and Chand Bibi who were the ornaments to womanhood. They had shown to the world their administrative capacity which we are afraid to give to the women of Bengal. Those gentlemen who are afraid of the *purdah*, do they know that Muhammadan women go on pilgrimage to Mecca thousands of miles away from their homes? Do they not then lose their *purdah*? Is the *purdah* torn off their faces when they go to visit the holy place of Mecca? Certainly not! Therefore, we ought not to be afraid that if we give the franchise to our women we would tear away the *purdah* from their faces. I say that we ought not to be afraid of giving franchise to our women, be they Hindus, be they Muhammadans, or of any other denomination. Therefore, I beg to submit that this Council, especially the Muhammadan Councillors, would consider all these facts which I give from our own society, not from any other society. There are hundreds of zamindar ladies and hundreds of ladies of middle class who have gone to Mecca and have come back as *Hajis*. Are they in any way inferior? Do you not revere them? Do you not say that they have performed a duty which many of you have not performed? Therefore, I should like to impress upon the Councillors that such is the Muhammadan society and such is the society in Bengal. You would do very well to give them the franchise asked for.

The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler has told us that the Government has reserved this duty of giving the franchise to women to the Reformed Council. Government has done nothing about it. It is left to your good sense to grant the franchise. Are you going, when the opportunity occurs, to ignore it? Are you going to say "no, we are not going to give franchise to women."

Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur has told you that our males are dumb driven cattle. If they were given franchise, why not women? When the franchise is given we shall see how it works, whether the *purdah* is an impediment or not. The details are not at present before this House for consideration. To-day the principle whether franchise ought to be given to women is under consideration, and I trust that this Council will have no hesitation in giving the franchise to women.

Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray is afraid of public women. He says that *purdah* ladies would be swamped by these public women, but can there not be a rule prohibiting them from being voters? They should not be able to come to this Council as Councillors. They are not in any sense fitted to be Councillors. It is an insult to morality, if my friends think so; it is an insult to intelligence if my friends think that

the public women should come and sit here as Councillors. By legislation, they should be deprived of the right to vote. It is only to the respectable women, zenana women who are educated, cultured or who have property qualification, that we should give franchise. If they like, they can come to this Council and at the same time observe their *purdah*. They may deliberate with the other Councillors here.

Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray says that Madras and Bombay have given votes to women, because they do not have *purdah*. I think that he is wrong. There are women in Bombay and Madras who are called *ghosha* ladies and they are the same as *purdah* ladies of Bengal. Therefore, if such *ghosha* ladies can be given franchise, why should not the *purdah* ladies of Bengal be given the franchise?

With regard to the amendments, I beg to submit that if the principle is accepted, that the franchise should be given to women, I think that the limitation that has been proposed by Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur and Babu Annada Charan Dutta, cannot hold water, because there may be women who are as much cultured or educated as any of the ladies who have passed the university examinations. Because the hall-mark of a University has not been attached to their names, I think that they ought not to be deprived of their vote, if they are sufficiently educated or are intelligent and possess property qualifications.

There is another point. A lady zamindar is, I think, as much qualified as a lady or girl who has passed the Matriculation examination. Therefore, there ought not to be any limitation.

I beg to remind my Muhammadan friends that it is our religion which gives the right of inheritance to our women. When a Muhammadan gentleman dies, his children whether male or female inherit his property equally. The property qualification amongst Muhammadans will be more easily found than among Hindus; thus the number of female Muhammadan voters would be much greater than that of the Hindus. With these words, I support the resolution that has been moved by my friend Mr. S. M. Bose.

Adjournment.

The Council then adjourned to Friday, the 2nd September, 1921, at 3 P.M., at the Town Hall, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Friday, the 2nd September, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers and 105 nominated and elected members.

Starred Questions

(to which oral answers were given).

Passenger trains on Howrah-Burdwan chord line.

***XXXII. Rai UPENDRA LAL RAY Bahadur:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works aware of the overcrowding in the evening up local passenger trains on the Howrah-Burdwan chord line of the East Indian Railway?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that in the evening up local trains, third and intermediate class daily passengers avail themselves of the second class compartments to the inconveniences and discomfort of the *bonâ fide* second class passengers?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that very often 25 to 30 passengers are allowed to travel in a second class compartment by those trains?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of PUBLIC WORKS (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) The reply is in the negative.

Waterways on the Issurdih-Serajganj and Issurdih-Santahar lines.

***XXXIII. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state whether the Government are aware that on the Issurdih-Serajganj Railway and Issurdih-Santahar Railway lines the waterways are insufficient, and that on that account there has been a sudden flood this year near several bridges in those lines, and the Dilpasar bridge in the Serajganj line has been overflooded and damaged, causing great hardship and heavy losses to the people over the flood area?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of instituting an immediate inquiry with the object of ascertaining the true state of things during the present rainy season, and of taking remedial measures at once, if considered necessary?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Complaints regarding insufficiency have been received and, with a view to settle this question, levels of the floods on both sides of these railway lines are being observed during the present monsoon, to ascertain if there is really any destructive heading up on one side of the embankments. Government have no information in regard to the Dilpasar bridge on the Serajganj line nor of the heavy losses to the people alleged to have taken place in the flooded area.

(*b*) Yes, steps have already been taken to record flood levels during the present rainy season and to collect hydraulic data.

Coolie affairs at Chandpur.

***XXXIV. Babu FANINDRALAL DE:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state whether any action has been taken by the Government with regard to the officers in connection with the coolie affairs at Chandpur, in view of the resolution passed in the July session of the Council? If not, what is the cause of the delay?

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): The attention of the officers concerned has been drawn to the proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council, dated the 8th and 11th July, 1921, in connection with the incident at Chandpur on the 20th May last.

Lecturers and Demonstrators.

***XXXV. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state—

(*a*) (*i*) whether it is a fact that, in recent years, lecturers and demonstrators have, on first entering the service, been appointed on different rates of salaries—some on Rs. 200 a month, some on Rs. 150, some on Rs. 125 and some on Rs. 100, and

(*ii*) whether it is also a fact that some of the existing senior lecturers and demonstrators were, under the old system, first appointed on Rs. 50 a month?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) how they propose to treat all these officers in determining their positions on the nominal rolls of the new service; and

(*ii*) how they propose to treat the latter type of officers?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) Whether, in determining the positions of all lecturers and demonstrators, their period of service will be counted from the very dates on which they were first appointed as lecturers and demonstrators, as the case may be, irrespective of their starting salaries, as if all of them were appointed on Rs. 150 from those dates?

(*ii*) If not, why not?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter): (*a*) (*i*) In recent years lecturers and demonstrators have initially been appointed on Rs. 200, Rs. 150 and Rs. 125 according to the circumstances of individual cases. They have not been appointed on Rs. 100. During the existence of the Eastern Bengal and Assam Government lecturers and demonstrators in Eastern Bengal colleges were appointed initially on Rs. 100.

(*ii*) Before 1904 there were a few appointments on Rs. 50 initially

(*b*) (*i*) On reorganisation the existing relative position of the officers is not likely to be disturbed.

(*ii*) and (*c*) The matter is still under the consideration of Government, and before Government passes definite orders it cannot be foretold what shape the matter will take.

Unstarred Questions

(answers to which were laid on the table).

Primary schools in Midnapore and Ghatal subdivisions.

190. Babu DEVENDRA LAL KHAN: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state—

(*i*) how many primary schools for boys are there in the Midnapore, Sadar and Ghatal subdivisions;

(*ii*) how many students are there in such schools;

(*iii*) the total number of school-going boys in the above two subdivisions and their proportionate number in such schools; and

(*iv*) the amount of grants-in-aid that such schools receive from the District Board and the Municipality and direct from the Government, respectively?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: A statement is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 190, showing the number of primary schools, the pupils in them, the number of boys of school-going age in the Sadar and Ghatal Sub-divisions in the Midnapore district and the amount of grant-in-aid allotted to them.

NAME OF SUB-DIVISION	Number of primary schools for boys in the sub-division	Number of students in such schools	NUMBER OF BOYS OF SCHOOL-GOING AGE		AMOUNT OF GRANT-IN-AID ALLOTTED TO SUCH SCHOOLS FROM—		
			In the sub-division	Their proportionate number in such schools	District fund.	Municipal fund.	Government
				Per cent	Rs	Rs.	Rs
Sadar ...	1,065	26,069	140,179	18	17,666	1,480	15,910
Ghatal ...	268	8,346	29,284	29	5,243	1,377	4,208

Efficiency bar for judicial officers.

191. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: Will the Hon'ble the Member charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to say—

(*a*) what is the procedure laid down for considering the efficiency bar of judicial officers;

(*b*) when will the efficiency bar of the judicial officers (Munsifs), who would be otherwise entitled to get Rs. 550 according to time-scale, be considered;

(*c*) who will first move in the matter: whether Government, the High Court or the Accountant-General, Bengal?

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): (*a*) Every case is carefully considered by the High Court before an officer is allowed to draw pay at a rate above the stage at which the efficiency bar is fixed.

(*b*) The question whether the officers referred to should be regarded as having passed the efficiency bar will be considered by the High Court on the reopening of the Court after the vacation. It has been arranged that this question will be considered annually on receipt of a list from the Accountant-General, Bengal, of the officers concerned.

(*c*) The Accountant-General, Bengal, who has the necessary information regarding the pay of officers, will first move in the matter.

Amalgamation of the Krishnagar Road and City stations.

192. Maharaja KSHAUNISH CHANDRA ROY Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state whether it is under the contemplation of the Railway authorities to amalgamate the Krishnagar Road station with the Krishnagar City station?

(*b*) If so, when is this expected to be done?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of moving the Railway authorities to complete this amalgamation at an early date?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) Government have no information in this matter which will, however, be brought to the notice of the Railway authorities.

Cadre of higher police service.

193. Babu NITYA DHON MUKHERJEE: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state what is the present strength of the cadre of superintendents, additional superintendents and assistant superintendents of police in Bengal?

(*b*) When was the number of officers in each case sanctioned, and how many posts out of the sanctioned strength are actually filled up at present, and how many vacancies are there in each case?

(*c*) How many posts of additional superintendents are at present substantively held by Indians?

(*d*) How many of these officers have been appointed from amongst promoted and directly appointed deputy superintendents?

(*e*) Is the percentage of the total number of Indian additional superintendents of Police to the strength the same as recommended by the Public Services Commission?

(*f*) If not, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reason for this?

MEMBER in charge of APPOINTMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) Superintendents, 45; additional superintendents, 13; assistant superintendents, 52.

(*b*) The cadre was originally sanctioned on the constitution of the Presidency in 1912, and with subsequent additions stands as in (*a*) above. There are no vacancies in the cadre of superintendents, but there are 18 vacancies in the cadre of assistant superintendents.

(*c*) Two posts of additional superintendents are at present held substantively *pro tempore* by Indian officers.

(*d*) Of the six posts of superintendents and additional superintendents held by Indians, two are at present filled by promoted, three by directly recruited, deputy superintendents, and one by a promoted assistant commissioner of the Calcutta police.

(*e*) and (*f*) The Public Services Commission made no recommendation as to the percentage of appointments to be held by Indian additional superintendents.

Khulna distress.

194. Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state the latest reports regarding the prevailing distress in Khulna, with particular reference to—

(*i*) places where the distress is most acute;

(*ii*) deaths from starvation, if any;

(*iii*) health of the people in the affected area;

(*iv*) measures of relief adopted with special reference to the number of 2,000 persons who have been reduced to abject poverty, as mentioned in reply to my question at the last meeting of the Council?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that there have been some private organisations to afford relief in the distressed area?

(*c*) If so, will the Government be pleased to state

(*i*) the nature of relief given by such organisations,

(*ii*) the number of people receiving such relief?

(*d*) Are the Government aware that there have been repeated failures of crops since the cyclone of 1919, in thanas Paikgacha, Asasuni, Shyamnagar and Kaliganj, including Pratabnagar beat house, and that the ordinary average outturn per bigha of the crops there even before the cyclone diminished considerably?

(*e*) Are the Government considering the desirability of making an inquiry into the causes of such diminishing outturn?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE [LAND REVENUE] (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (*a*) A *communiqué* showing the result of the Hon'ble Member's visit to the affected area has already been published.

(*i*) Pratabnagar Union, Kasimari in Shyamnagar thana, and certain tracts in Paikgacha thana adjacent to the Sipsa and Koyra and Kobadak rivers, wherever the embankments have failed to keep out salt water.

(*ii*) None.

(*iii*) Health is not good; malaria and bowel complaints are prevalent.

(*iv*) Apart from non-official relief, which is referred to below, Government have granted Rs. 40,000 as agricultural loans, Rs. 5,000 to the District Board for relief, and Rs. 1,000 for cloths from the Ram Lal Mukherjee's Fund.

Suspension of rent in affected khas mahals has been granted and realisation of previous agricultural loans has been suspended in the affected areas. The District Board also provided relief work by road construction as long as the weather permitted, and is now providing medical assistance in all the affected tracts.

(*b*) The Seva Asram of Khulna, the Ram Krishna Mission and the Bama Missions are doing good work in the affected areas.

(*c*) The latest figures supplied are :—

		(1) Nature of relief.	(2) Member of recipients.
Seva Asram	...	Distribution of rice and cloth	12,317
Ram Krishna Mission	...	Distribution of rice and cloth	1,422

The Bama Mission have just commenced work and no figures are available.

(*d*) Yes, the condition of the embankments, which are in many places quite inadequate to cope with the increasing salinity of the rivers, has resulted in failure of crops since the cyclone of 1919. It is a fact that these causes had even before the cyclone led to a deterioration in the productive capacity of the areas so affected.

(*e*) Government propose to make inquiries with a view to ascertain what steps are possible for the restoration of the embankments and for the exclusion of saline water.

Depressed classes.

195. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state what classes are included in the term "depressed classes"?

(*b*) Have the Government accepted the classification recognised by the Calcutta University Commission?

(*c*) What is the population of the "depressed classes" in Bengal as recognised by the Government?

(*d*) Will it be possible for the Government to supply figures showing how many of these have passed the Matriculation, Intermediate in Arts and Science, Bachelor of Arts and Science, and Master of Arts and Science Examinations during the last ten years?

(*e*) What number and percentage of the appointments in the following services and departments are at present held by the members of the "depressed classes":—

(*i*) Bengal Civil Service (Executive and Judicial);
(*ii*) Subordinate Executive Police;
(*iii*) Registration;
(*iv*) Education;
(*v*) Excise;
(*vi*) Agriculture; and
(*vii*) Co-operative?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) and (*b*) No rigid classification has been adopted or recognized by Government. The castes and tribes named in Chapter VII of the Report of the Calcutta University Commission have been generally regarded as coming within the category.

(*c*) A little over seven millions.

(*d*) No.

(*e*) The information is not on record.

Bengal Civil Service.

196. Mr. SYED ERFAN ALI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department aware of the discontent prevailing among the deputy collectors of Bengal over the new time-scale of pay?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the salary of similar officers in other provinces is higher than in Bengal? If so, can the Government assign any reason for it?

(*c*) Did the Public Services Commission suggest different scales of pay for the different provinces?

(*d*) Is it a fact that the deputy collectors sent a memorial to the local Government protesting against the new scale of pay? If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what action was taken on the memorial?

(*e*) Is it a fact that the deputy collectors have now memorialised the Government of India? If so, have the local Government forwarded their memorial? If not, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reasons for withholding the memorial?

(*f*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state under what atuhority the local Government fixed the scale of pay of these officers?

(*g*) Is it a fact that the Imperial Government are the only authority to fix the pay of officers appointed before 1914?

(*h*) Are the Government aware that in other provinces as well as in the Indian Civil Services, only one efficiency bar has been laid down,

whereas in Bengal there are two efficiency bars besides a selection grade bar, and that the increment in those provinces is annual and not biennial as is the case in Bengal?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Government have received representations as to the inadequacy of the new time-scale for the Bengal Civil Service from members of that service.

(*b*) The time-scale of some provinces is more favourable than that of Bengal. The latter was fixed after a careful consideration of the circumstances and needs of this Presidency.

(*c*) No, except for Burma.

(*d*) Yes. As the time-scale had been fixed after due consideration, Government were unable to reopen the question and the memorialists were informed accordingly.

(*e*) Yes: the memorial has been forwarded.

(*f*) The scale was fixed by the local Government under powers delegated to it by the Secretary of State and the Government of India.

(*g*) Under section 18, Regulation IX, 1833, the pay of deputy collectors is to be fixed by the Governor-General in Council. This section was repealed in 1914 by the Repealing and Amending Act, 1914.

(*h*) In the Indian Civil Service, there is only one efficiency bar. The creation of two efficiency bars in the Bengal Civil Service is in accordance with the recommendations of the Secretary of State. Provisions for increment are not the same in all provinces. On these points reference is invited to the answer to (*b*) above.

Licensing Boards (Excise).

197. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state—

(*i*) the statutory functions of licensing boards;

(*ii*) the objects in view for which they were constituted?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the licensing board has not been given the following powers, namely,—

(*i*) to grant wholesale licenses;

(*ii*) to select vendors;

(*iii*) to settle hours of sale; and

(*iv*) to determine the strength at which liquor should be sold?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of constituting licensing boards with a non-official majority? If not, why not?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of AGRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (*a*) (*i*) Licensing boards for the cities of Calcutta and Howrah, exercise, subject to the control of the local Government and to the exclusion of the Collector, all the powers (except that of granting licenses) and perform all the duties which are conferred and imposed upon the Collector by section 34, read with section 33 of the Excise Act

(*ii*) They have been appointed to consider and finally decide, subject to the supervision of the Government, all proposals of the Excise Department in connection with the number and location of excise shops in the cities of Calcutta and Howrah.

(*b*) No. The licensing boards have not been given these powers, but they can bring to the notice of the Commissioner of Excise such opinions as they may form on any of the subjects.

(*c*) The Government will, before long, consider the question of the constitution of the present licensing boards for the cities of Calcutta and Howrah and will endeavour to make such changes in the constitution as would lead to a better representation in the boards of the public non-official view on these questions If considered necessary, the Government will see that there is a non-official majority in the boards.

Arrests and convictions due to drunkenness in Calcutta and its suburbs.

198. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing—

(*i*) the number of arrests due to drunkenness; and

(*ii*) the number of convictions arising therefrom;

in the town of Calcutta and its suburbs in each of the last five years?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*i*) The information asked for in part (*i*) of the question is not readily available.

(*ii*) Calcutta (Town proper)—1916-17, 4,224; 1917-18, 6,038; 1918-19, 5,006; 1919-20, 5,209; 1920-21, 5,293.

Calcutta (Suburbs).—1916-17, 2,528; 1917-18, 2,808; 1918-19, 2,679; 1919-20, 2,719; 1920-21, 2,201.

Assistant sub-inspectors of police.

199. Babu HEM CHANDRA NASKER: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state what class of men are appointed as assistant sub-inspectors of police?

(*b*) What is the standard of qualification on which these appointments are made?

(*c*) How is their promotion to higher ranks regulated?

(*d*) Is it a fact that the scale of pay which was recommended and sanctioned for the assistant sub-inspectors in pre-war days was announced a year ago?

(*e*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware of the discontent prevailing amongst these officers?

(*f*) Are the Government considering the desirability of enhancing the scale of pay sanctioned for the assistant sub-inspectors?

MEMBER in charge of POLICE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) and (*b*) Assistant sub-inspectors both in the Bengal and Calcutta police are recruited by promotion from the rank of literate constables and also by direct enlistment. Direct recruits are required to have passed the matriculation examination.

(*c*) In the Bengal police, 50 per cent., and in the Calcutta police, 25 per cent., of vacancies in the rank of sub-inspectors are filled by the promotion of assistant sub-inspectors

(*d*) No. The scale of pay sanctioned in 1920 was fixed with reference to modern economic conditions.

(*e*) Government are aware that the assistant sub-inspectors are not content with the revised scale of pay sanctioned for them.

(*f*) No.

Military guards at Chandpur and elsewhere on the Assam-Bengal Railway.

200. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department aware that the military police (Gurkha) guards in the Chandpur steamer ghat prevent, or used to prevent, passengers holding through tickets from boarding the steamers at night, and that such passengers had to spend the night at Chandpur?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that special guards from the armed or military police have been placed in many stations of the Assam-Bengal Railway?

(*c*) Will the Government be pleased to state whether the Assam-Bengal Railway or the steamer companies bear the cost of these extra guards? If not, why not?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of removing these extra guards?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Government have received no representation on this subject.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) No. The force has been deputed for the maintenance of law and order and not specially in the interest of the companies.

(*d*) The guards will be withdrawn as soon as the necessity for retaining them ceases to exist.

Waterways on the Burdwan-Howrah Chord Railway.

201. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works aware that the East Indian Railway Company in constructing their Burdwan-Howrah Chord line have not kept sufficient waterways between Porabazar Gate and Belmuri station and Chinsura-Dhanakhali District Board road in the district of Hooghly?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the people of the locality have suffered thereby both from the point of view of public health and production of crops?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister also aware that it has resulted in water-logging on the west of the Burdwan-Howrah Chord line between mile 28 and 30 and has caused a dearth of water and consequent failure of the crops on the east of the line?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of undertaking a local investigation by a Government Engineer and of laying the result of the investigation on the table?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) No.

(*d*) The question of waterways on the Saktigarh-Kamarkundu section of the Burdwan-Howrah Chord Railway was carefully considered by Government during the construction of the line. The Superintending Engineer, South-Western Circle, was asked to make a local inquiry as to the number and size of the waterways in company with the District and Railway Engineers and submit his report to Government through the Commissioner of the Division. The Railway authorities have provided all the additional waterways recommended by the Superintending Engineer and the local civil officers. In the circumstances, Government do not consider it desirable to take any further action in this matter at present and until such time as the insufficiency of the waterways provided for under normal conditions of rainfall and flood has been clearly established.

Removal of Book Depôt to Chetla.

202. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: (*a*) In connection with his statement in the Bengal Legislative Council on 23rd March, 1921 (page 387, Volume I, No. 5 of the Bengal Legislative Council Proceedings), that the public would not be put to the slightest inconvenience by the removal of the press to Chetla, as Government publications would continue to be stocked at Writers' Buildings, will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether the statement meant that the idea of the removal of the Book Depôt to Chetla had been abandoned, or merely that a small sale office would be located at Writers' Buildings?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what is the estimated cost of construction of the portion of the building which will be occupied by the Book Depôt at Chetla?

(*c*) What will be the cost of construction of the racks and furniture in the new buildings at Chetla for the Book Depôt?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of FINANCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): (*a*) It is proposed to remove the main Book Depôt to Chetla and to have a local sale office in Writers' Buildings.

(*b*) Rs. 1,15,000.

(*c*) No estimate has been framed yet.

Witness sheds in Rangpur courts.

203. Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state whether he is aware—

(*i*) that there is no witness sheds attached to the civil courts of the Rangpur, Sadar and Subdivisional Courts, and that this is the cause of great inconvenience to the public;

(*ii*) that there is a corrugated iron shed attached to the civil court of Rangpur, Sadar, which, when constructed, was meant for the witnesses, but has been used as a godown by the Government for the last 10 or 12 years?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of constructing witness sheds at this place?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) (*i*) There are witness sheds attached to the civil courts in the Sadar and in Nilphamari and Kurigaon subdivisions of the Rangpur district. Administrative approval has been accorded to the construction of a witness shed at Gaibandha subdivision. The work will be taken up as soon as funds are available.

(*ii*) The corrugated iron-shed attached to the civil court at Rangpur is being used as a godown. In its place a verandah has been set apart for use as witness shed.

(*b*) The question does not arise.

Silk industry in Murshidabad.

204. Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing:—

(*i*) the number of silk-weavers in the district of Murshidabad;

(*ii*) the number of silk-cloth dealers in the same district; and

(*iii*) the number of people who rear silk in the said district?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*i*) 27,338.

(*ii*) Information not available.

(*iii*) 6,803. These figures were recorded so far back as the year 1911. Recent figures are not available.

Veterinary service.

205. Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state—

(*a*) whether it is a fact that the pay of an officer in the Provincial Veterinary Service of Bengal as sanctioned by the Right Hon'ble the Secretary of State for India is Rs. 250–750;

(*b*) whether the Bengal Civil Veterinary Inspectors belong to the cadre of the said Provincial Service since the creation of the appointments in the Government of India letter to the Right Hon'ble the Secretary of State for India, No. 232 of 1907, and as sanctioned by the latter's No. 136 Rev., dated the 23rd August, 1907;

(*c*) if the answer to (*b*) is in the affirmative, why effect has not yet been given to the scale of pay as referred to in (*a*) as regards the Veterinary Inspectors;

(*d*) whether it is in the contemplation of Government to grant the benefit of the revised scale to the Veterinary Inspectors, or to give them an all-round increase of pay, as in the case of services of similar status and cadre,

(*e*) whether it is a fact that till now the said Inspectors have been granted no increase of pay, or compensation in lieu thereof pending such grant of increment;

x

(*f*) whether memorials from the Veterinary Inspectors, dated the 10th February, 1921, regarding the revision and increment of pay have been received by the Hon'ble the Minister; and

(*g*) whether the said memorials have been disposed of, and, if so, what orders have been passed thereon?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) No.

(*c*) The question does not arise.

(*d*) The answer to the first part of the question is in the negative. The question raised in the second part is under consideration.

(*e*) Yes.

(*f*) Yes.

(*g*) The memorials are still under consideration.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge be pleased to state whether, on the lines mentioned in question (*b*) it really provides that these officers belong to the cadre as referred to in question (*a*)? I trust that they have not been so classed.

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: I must have notice of this question.

Calcutta University budget.

206. Babu HEM CHANDRA NASKER: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state when the budget of the Calcutta University is presented before the Senate?

(*b*) Is it a fact that lecturers are appointed before the budget is sanctioned?

(*c*) Is it a fact that one-third of the income derived from examination fees is sanctioned for the Postgraduate Department of the Calcutta University?

(*d*) Is not the Science Department a part of the postgraduate teaching?

(*e*) Is it a fact that no sum from the said fee fund has been sanctioned for the Science Department in the year 1919-20?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: The University has replied as follows:—

(*a*) There is no fixed date.

(*b*) Yes, sometimes so.

(*c*) Reference is invited to section 44, Chapter XI of the Regulations of the Calcutta University.

(*d*) Yes.

(*e*) It is not a fact.

Assistant Secretaries.

207. Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state how many posts of Assistant Secretaries are there in the various departments of the Government of Bengal, and who hold those appointments?

(*b*) How many of the Assistant Secretaries have been recruited from outside and how many have been taken from the office assistants?

(*c*) What are the instructions of the Government of India in the matter of selecting Assistant Secretaries?

(*d*) Is it not a fact that the direction of the Government of India is to the effect that these posts should be given to the office assistants as far as possible?

(*e*) Who has been recently appointed as the Assistant Secretary to the Judicial Department?

(*f*) What are his qualifications?

(*g*) Is it a fact that the claims of qualified and experienced office assistants have been overlooked in the matter of this appointment? If so, why?

(*h*) Are the Government aware of the dissatisfaction among the office assistants on account of their supersession?

(*i*) Are the Government considering the desirability of throwing open these posts to the office assistants?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) The posts of Assistant Secretary are as follows:—

(1) Public Works Department.—Mr. C. B. Bayley (permanent) on leave. Maulvi S. M. Abdul Aziz (officiating).

(2) Legislative Department.—Mr. A. M. Hutchison (permanent), on deputation; Mr. K. M. Mazumdar (officiating).

The above posts existed prior to the Reforms.

The following have since been created:—

(3) Judicial Department.—Maulvi Wali-ul-Islam.

(4) Revenue Department.—Khan Bahadur Saiyid Abdul Latif.

(5) Department of Local Self-Government.—Babu G. C. Sen.

(6) Department of Agriculture and Industries.—Maulvi Muhammad Chainuddin.

(*b*) None of these officers were recruited from the office assistants.

(*c*) and (*d*) No precise instructions regarding selection have been received. The matter is one for the discretion of the local Government.

(*e*) Maulvi Wali-ul-Islam.

(*f*) He is a deputy magistrate and deputy collector of twelve years' standing; he has also had some previous acquaintance with Secretariat work in the office of the Director of Land Records.

(*g*) and (*h*) The answer is in the negative.

(*i*) These posts are already open to the office assistants.

Coolie affairs at Chandpur.

208. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to say what effect has been given to the resolution No. 45, passed at the last sessions of this Council, recommending the Government to take action against the conduct of local officials in connection with the ejectment of the coolies and their families from the station at Chandpur on the 20th May, 1921?

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): The member is referred to the answer given to a starred question asked at this meeting by Babu Fanindralal De.

Coolie affairs at Chandpur.

209. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state in what manner the Government intend to give effect to the resolution of this Council regarding the Chandpur affair?

(*b*) Will the Government be pleased to make a full statement as to how the officers concerned have been dealt with?

(*c*) What further action does the Government propose to take in order to make the recurrence of such an incident impossible?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) and (*b*) The member is referred to the answer given to a starred question at this meeting by Babu Fanindralal De.

(*c*) No further action is contemplated.

Weights in vogue in several districts.

210. Maulvi HAMID-UD-DIN KHAN: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement in a tabular form showing the weights in vogue in different districts of Bengal?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): The compilation of a statement of the kind asked for would involve an undue amount of labour.

The following extract from the report of a special committee which was appointed in 1913 by the Government of India to inquire into the question of the feasibility of securing the use of uniform weights and measures in India furnishes information for many of the districts of Bengal:—

"*Measures of weight.*—The ordinary table of weights in Bengal is 4 kachhas=1 chatak; 4 chataks=1 pao; 4 paos=1 seer; 5 seers=1 panseri; 8 panseris=1 maund and the most common seer in use in connection with ordinary commodities is the seer of 80 tolas. The kachha seer of 60 tolas is commonly used for ordinary commodities in retail trade in Bakarganj, Birbhum, Bogra, Faridpur, Jalpaiguri, Midnapore, Khulna, Murshidabad, Mymensingh, Pabna, Rajshahi, and 24-Parganas and in portions of Bankura, Jessore and Rangpur, in the principal marts in Burdwan, in outlying villages in Dacca. The same seer of 60 tolas is also used for agricultural produce in Burdwan, in retail trade in dry fish and milk in Chittagong, for medicines in Dacca, for various commodities in different parts of Dinajpur, and for molasses and tobacco in Nadia. Various other seers are also used in retail trade; 52, 55, 58, 58§, 62, 64, 70, 72, 75, 78, 81, 82§, 85§, 90, 96. In wholesale purchase, special weights are frequently used, for instance, a seer of 82§ tolas for cotton in Chittagong, for rice, sugar, etc. in Dacca, for paddy, rice and mustard in Dinajpur, for country produce in Midnapore, for paddy, rice, betel-nut, etc. in Mymensingh, and for rice in Bakarganj, Tippera and 24-Parganas; the seer of 120 tolas for sugar in Bakarganj; the seer of 84§ tolas for jute in Dacca, Pabna and 24-Parganas and for paddy, jute, rice, mustard, and other grains in Mymensingh. Other seers are used in wholesale trade, such as of 81, 82, 76§, 83, 84, 85, 86, 96, 100, 96, 84⅞, 88, 75, 58. various seers are used in the same district for different purposes, *e.g.*, in Chittagong, there are seers of 16, 52, 60, 64, 70, 75, 80, 82, 82§, 83, 84, 85, 86, 90, 96 and 100 tolas, while in Chittagong Hill Tracts, trade in cotton is carried on in different parts by seers of 84, 85, and 120 tolas. In some cases, the number of seers to the maund in wholesale trade varies. For instance, in Chittagong, it is reported that 30 seers make a maund for purchase of jute from Manikganj. In Jalpaiguri, there are maunds of 30, 42, and 43 seers of 80 tolas each. There are, therefore, several seers in use in Bengal, many being used at the same place for the same or different commodities. In Birbhum district a weight called a pai which is equal to 75, 80 or 110 tolas is used in certain parts of the district. Jute and tobacco in parts of Jalpaiguri is sold by the table 10 seers=1 pati; 4 patis=1 maund; 3 maunds=1 tangi;

the seer being 60 or 62 tolas, and in other parts of the same district, jute and tobacco are sold by 10 seers=1 pati; 6 patis=1 maund; and 2 maunds=1 tangi, the seer being 90 or 93 tolas. In the same district cotton is sold by a khan of 189 tolas, and also by seers of 168 and 189 tolas, 18 seers being equal to 1 bhar. In 24-Parganas the factory maund is $\frac{2}{3}$ cwt.

Avoirdupois weights.—The English avoirdupois weights are used in Bakarganj for articles manufactured in England, for coal in Burdwan, for iron, coal, etc., in Chittagong, for various articles of European and American manufacture in Darjeeling, for hides in Midnapore, for corrugated iron, etc. in Noakhali and for English and Continental metals and goods and the export of rice to American ports in 24-Parganas and also for tea in some districts; but there are several districts from which the use of the avoirdupois weights is not reported. Troy weights are said to be used in Darjeeling and 24-Parganas, and apothecaries' weights in retail trade in European drugs in several districts.

Jewellers' and kavirajes' weights.—The usual table for jewellery, etc., is 4 dhans=1 ratti; 6 rattis=1 anna; 8 rattis=1 masha; 12 mashas or 16 annas=1 tola, the tola being 180 grains. For medicines, the usual table is 4 dhans=1 ratti; 10 rattis=1 masha; 8 mashas=1 tola; but in Howrah, the equation 10 rattis=1 masha is said to be obsolete now and to have been replaced by the equation 12 rattis=1 masha, 8 mashas being one tola. In 24-Parganas, the seer for Indian medicines is generally 64 tolas and the table for Indian medicines is 4 dhans=1 ratti; 10 rattis=1 masha; 12 mashas=1 tola. In some districts, the anna and the bhari are also used for medicines. In Mymensingh, this table is used for medicines but the tola is 192 grains. In Jessore, the tola is in some places 80 grains and in others 160 grains, in others again 180 grains. In Mymensingh, the following tables are used for English medicines:—5 rattis=1 masha; 8 mashas=1 tola and also 10 rattis=1 masha; 8 mashas=1 tola, the tola being 160 grains. In Murshidabad, the masha for Indian medicines=2 annas or 12 rattis, and 8 mashas=1 tola. A long table used in native medicines is reported from Bakarganj district except as already noted. The weights used for jewellery and native medicines are all based on the tola of 180 grains but the values of the ratti and masha vary."

Ferry service in suburban areas of Calcutta.

211. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Marine Department aware that one result of the starting by the Port Commissioners of a service has been the discontinuance of the plying of country boats for passenger traffic on behalf of people from the suburban areas?

(*b*) When the ferry service was inaugurated, was it intended to be a profitable and productive concern?

(*c*) If so, why has it been working at a loss since its inauguration?

(*d*) Is it a fact that one of the principal objects in providing this service was to relieve the congestion in Calcutta?

(*e*) Does the Calcutta Municipality contribute anything towards the working expenses of the service? If not, why not?

(*f*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that in the new rates of increased fares which have been fixed between various intermediate stations it is found that sometimes a passenger has to pay more for travelling a shorter distance?

(*g*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that while the second class fare from Barabazar to Shibtola has been increased by 33 per cent. that from Barabazar to Baranagar (Kutighat), which is a little over half the distance from between Barabazar and Shibtola, has been increased by 60 per cent.?

(*h*) Is it a fact that the original proposal was to increase fares by effecting an all-round enhancement between 20 and 33 per cent.?

(*i*) Are the Government considering the desirability of drawing the attention of the Port Commissioners to these anomalies, and of requesting them to revise the fares accordingly?

MEMBER in charge of MARINE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): (*a*) There has been a decrease in the number of licensed small passenger craft from 884 in 1907-08, when the Commissioners' Ferry Service commenced running, to 759 in 1920-21. It is not the case that such boats have discontinued plying for hire.

(*b*) This question was not definitely discussed at the time, but it appears to have been the intention that the ferry service should be self-supporting.

(*c*) The fares have been kept at too low a level. Latterly, the deficit has been increased owing to a marked rise in the cost of coal and other materials and in the pay drawn by the staff.

(*d*) No information is available on this point.

(*e*) No; it has never been asked to do so, and no reason has been suggested why it should do so.

(*f*) Two such cases at present exist and these are under the consideration of the Port Commissioners.

(*g*) The second class fare between Barabazar and Shibtola has been raised from one and a half annas to two annas and that between Barabazar and Barangar (Kutighat) from one anna and three pies to two annas. If proportionate fares were charged throughout, the longer-distance passengers would be heavily taxed.

(*h*) These percentages were suggested by the Vice-Chairman, but a Committee of the Port Commissioners which examined the question recommended higher rates with a view to make the service self-supporting.

(*i*) The Chairman was asked for a report on the points raised in these questions. Government do not propose to take any further action.

Labour Unions.

212. Babu HEM CHANDRA BHATTACHARJI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Commerce aware that there is a number of labour unions which have been established in Calcutta?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table a list of these unions?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of appointing a committee, on which these labour unions will be fairly represented, to decide disputes between the labouring classes and the capitalists?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of COMMERCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) A list of the unions and associations in Calcutta and its neighbourhood which have come to the notice of the Department of Industries during the last year has been placed on the library table. Many of them have had only an ephemeral existence and are reported to be no longer active bodies.

(*c*) The member is referred to the report of the Committee on Industrial Unrest which was signed by him. The action taken by Government to give effect to the Committee's recommendations is explained in a resolution which was published in the *Calcutta Gazette* of the 31st August.

Government appointments of Rs. 1,000 and above.

213. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to lay on the table a tabular statement, showing the number of Government appointments, carrying a salary of Rs. 1,000 and above per month, held by members of different communities?

(*b*) How many of these appointments are held by members of the Imperial Services?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member also be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing, service by service, the amount of retrospective pay paid to the officers of various Imperial and Provincial Services in Bengal during the last two years.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*b*) Three hundred and seventy-two.

(*c*) A statement is laid on the table. The figures represent payments made owing to retrospective effect being given to the reorganization of a service. The period of retrospective effect differs in the different services in some cases covering only a short period, in others a longer period.

Statement referred to in the reply to clause (a) of unstarred question No. 213.

Total number of appointments carrying a salary of Rs. 1,000 and over on 1st June, 1921.	TOTAL NUMBER OF APPOINTMENTS HELD BY—				
	Europeans.	Anglo-Indians	Indians.		
			Hindus.	Muhammadans	Others.
474	357	4	73	12	18
	464				
	19 vacancies.				

Statement referred to in the reply to clause (c) of unstarred question No. 213, showing, service by service, amount of retrospective pay paid to the officers in Bengal during the last two years.

Name of Service.		Imperial Service			Provincial Service.		
		Rs.	A.		Rs.	A.	P.
Agricultural Service	...	10,000	0		2,000	0	0
Co-operative Service	...	663	6		7,182	15	3
Veterinary Service	...	3,240	0		12,000	0	0
Botanic Garden	...	4,000	0		.....		
Indian Civil Service	...	57,000	0		.....		
Bengal Civil Service (Executive)	...	.....			1,88,000	0	0
Bengal Civil Service (Judicial)	...	.....			4,00,000	0	0
Ecclesiastical Service	...	53,450	0		.....		
Police Service	...	8,000	0		.....		
Forest Service	...	7,500	0		600	0	0
Educational Service	...	23,000	0		1,10,000	0	0
Medical Service	...	1,05,000	0		80,000	0	0
Engineering Service	...	38,000	0		61,600	0	0
Factory and Boiler Inspection Department	...	.....			4,600	0	0
Pilot Service	...	38,000	0		.....		
Customs Service	...	14,000	0		.....		

Indians and the Imperial police service.

214. Maulvi A. H. M. WAZIR ALI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state what are the recommendations made by the Royal Services Commission, and by the Reforms Committee, regarding the appointments of Indians in the Imperial Police Service, and what orders have been issued by the Secretary of State on their recommendations, and how far they have been given effect to?

(*b*) If full effect has not been given, how do the Government propose to give effect to the same, and when?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the percentage of Indian officers in the Imperial Service, stating how many of these officers were taken from the post of deputy superintendents and those promoted to the rank of deputy superintendents, as also their nationality and religion?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether any orders have been passed, or are in contemplation, regarding the appointment of Indians to the administrative ranks such as that of Deputy Inspector-General of Police?

(*e*) Is it a fact that the Public Services Commission recommended that Indian officers should be promoted to the higher rank and at a comparatively younger age, with a view to give them facilities to rise to the administrative ranks suggesting approximately the same age as that of an assistant superintendent of police?

(*f*) How far are these recommendations being observed in making these promotions?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) and (*b*) The member is referred to annexure XVI to the report of the Public Services Commission and Chapter XI of the Report on Indian Constitutional Reforms. The orders passed by the Secretary of State cannot be published. Effect has already been given to these orders so far as promotion of Indian officers to the Imperial Service is concerned. Arrangements for the direct recruitment of Indians to the service are also under consideration.

(*c*) The percentage of Indian officers to the superintendents in the Imperial Service is 10. Of the 6 Indian officers in the service five were taken from the class of deputy superintendents—3 of whom were recruited direct and 2 promoted to that rank. The sixth officer was an assistant commissioner of the Calcutta Police. All the Indian officers are natives of Bengal except one who is a Punjabi. Four are Hindus, one is a Christian, and another a Muhammadan.

(*d*) There is no bar to the appointment of Indians to the post of Deputy Inspector-General.

(*e*) The member is referred to the report of the Commission.

(*f*) Individual selections are made on the merits in each instance, all relevant factors being borne in mind.

Officiating Deputy Superintendents of Police.

215. Maulvi A. K. FAZL-UL HAQ: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state how many officers are at present officiating as deputy superintendents of police and how long has each officer been acting in that rank?

(*b*) How many of them held charge of districts and how many of subdivisional police?

(*c*) How many are still in charge of districts or subdivisions?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the number of such officiating appointments, year by year, since the creation of the appointment of deputy superintendents?

(*e*) On what principle have appointments in the rank of officiating deputy superintendents been made since the constitution of the present Presidency in 1912?

(*f*) Has there been a special selection and preparation of a list of officers for promotion to the rank of officiating deputy superintendents?

(*g*) If so, when was the list prepared?

(*h*) Are officers selected from this list for permanent promotion, or is a different system followed?

(*i*) Is there any such waiting list of acting officers in any other department of Government?

(*j*) What steps are the Government taking to allay the discontent and give relief to this class of officers?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*b*) Nine officers have held charge of districts (in short temporary vacancies), and twenty-one of subdivisions.

(*c*) No such officer is now in charge of a district. Nine are in charge of subdivisions.

(*d*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*e*) and (*h*) The system in force in 1912 was one of nomination by the Inspector-General in consultation with Deputy Inspectors-General from a list of inspectors recommended by the Deputy Inspectors-General. Definite rules on the subject were issued in 1917, and will be found in Police Regulations, Bengal, Part I. Appendix VI (*a*).

(*f*) and (*g*) Other than the "approved list" mentioned in the appendix referred to above, no list is maintained.

(*i*) No.

(*j*) The substantive pay of inspectors has been recently increased. The initial pay, under the new time-scale, of deputy superintendents of police, promoted from inspectors on which the acting allowance of inspectors should be calculated, is under the consideration of Government. It may be emphasised that the majority of inspectors who have been acting as deputy superintendents of police have done so only in purely temporary vacancies, arising from the abnormal conditions of the war, and have no legitimate grievance if they fail to secure permanent promotion.

Statement referred to in the reply to clause (a) of unstarred question No. 215, showing the names of officiating deputy superintendents and the dates from which they are acting as such, etc.

	Name.	Date of appointment as officiating deputy superintendent.
1.	Edward Brown (B 29-2-1876) ...	... 25th August, 1917.
2.	Nagesh Chandra Mukharji (B. 16-1-1871)	... 30th April, 1919.
3.	Nagendra Chandra Basu (B. 1-7-1869)	... 16th July, 1915.
4.	Benode Bihari Gupta (B. 1-7-1867)*	... 2nd January, 1917.
5.	Narendra Kumar Mallik (B 1-7-1878) (Law with books II)	... 9th May, 1919.
	Rai Sahib Bhabesh Charan Das (B. 1-8-1872)†	... 9th January, 1915.
6.	Chandra Kanta De (B 1-7-1872)	... 26th July, 1915.
7.	Umesh Chandra Chanda (B. 1-7-1872)	... 26th October, 1916.
8.	Chandi Charan Mukharji (B. 1-7-1876)	... 18th August, 1916.
9.	Sital Chandra Sen (B. 16-6-1870)	... 15th June, 1915.
10.	Aswini Kumar Guha (B 30-1-1877)	... 23rd July, 1915.
11.	Ambika Charan Chakrabatti (B 18-10-1872)	... 4th May, 1915.
12.	Hari Kumar Gupta, B.L (B 13-12-1883)	... 26th July, 1915.
13	Harendra Kishore Ghosh (B 1-7-1872)	... 1st July, 1917.
14.	Albert Henry Ray (B 29-5-1874)	... .
15.	Pramode Nath Mukharji (B. 1-7-1881)	... 26th April, 1919.
16.	Nishi Kanta Banarji (B. 1-7-1871)	... 13th July, 1918.
17.	Manindra Nath Banarji, B.A (B. 1-7-1882)	... 6th April, 1918.
18.	Sarat Chandra Ghosh II (B. 1-7-1878)	... 4th August, 1917.
19.	Aswini Kumar Banarji (B 1-7-1873)	... 6th September, 1917.
20	Ashutosh Banarji (B. 1 7-1870)	... 26th July, 1915.
	Khan Sahib Muhammad Yusuf (B. 1-7-1873) ...	.....
21.	Priya Nath De, M.A., B.L. (B. 1-7-1880)	... 25th December, 1917.
22.	Jnanananda Chakrabatti (B. 1-7-1873)	... 1st July, 1916.
23.	Sarat Chandra Acharji (B. 1-7-1874)	... 1st September, 1917.
24.	Nagendra Nath Sen Gupta, B.A. (B 1-7-1882)	... 5th July, 1919.
25.	Yakub Ali Khan (B. 1-7-1889) (B. in H)	... 17th December, 1917.
26.	Rai Sahib Braja Bihari Barman (B. 1-7-1873)	... 19th September, 1917.

* On combined leave for 8 months from 22nd February, 1921.

† On deputation as Superintendent of Police, Cooch Behar State, for 3 years from 1st April, 1921.

	Name.	Date of appointment as officiating deputy superintendent.
27.	Manmatha Nath Mukharji, B.A. (B. 1-7-1880) ...	11th February, 1917.
28.	Ramesh Chandra Guha (B. 1-7-1877) ...	18th June, 1919.
29.	Bepin Bihari Mukharji (B. 1-7-1871) ...	29th May, 1919.
30.	Rangin Lal Ghosh (B. 1-7-1881) ...	22nd August, 1919.
	Surendra Nath Banarji (B. 1-7-1872)* ...	5th September, 1916.
31.	Jadab Chandra Chakrabatti (B. 1-7-1877) ...	11th January, 1917
32.	Anath Bandhu Chakrabatti (B. 1-7 1879) ...	10th September, 1917
33.	Rai Sahib Bhupendra Nath Chatarji (B 1-7 1878)	17th January, 1917.
34.	Sarat Chandra Ghosh I (B. 1-7 1871) ...	8th July, 1919
35.	Henry Gould (B. 1-7-1871) ...	19th April, 1920.
36.	Edward Samuel Jones (B. 1-7-1880) ...	17th May, 1920.
37.	Kazi Imamuddin (B. 1-7-1873) ...	25th May, 1921

* On deputation to the Munitions Board from 1st November, 1919.

Statement referred to in the reply to clause (d) of unstarred question No. 215.

Year.	Number
1906-1907	Nil
1908	9
1909	19
1910	21
1911	28
1912	24
1913	13
1914	13
1915	25
1916	33
1917	36
1918	45
1919	48
1920	44
1921	37

Resolutions

(under the rules for the discussion of matters of general public interest)

Woman Suffrage.

Mr. SYED NASIM ALI: I rise to oppose all the resolutions that have been moved for extending franchise to our women. I rise to oppose as

a Muhammadan first; secondly, as a representative of the Bengal Muhammadans, and thirdly, as a representative of Bengal. One of the members of this Council has told the Council that as a Muhammadan he is bound to support it. As against that, I assert that as a Muhammadan I am bound to oppose it. (Hear, hear.) I ask each and every Muhammadan member of this Council to place his hand upon his breast, and tell the members of this Council, whether he wants that his zenana should be dragged out of the *purdah*, and that this *purdah* system should be abolished gradually. That is the whole question; each Muhammadan will have to decide for himself, whether he is prepared to do it. My friend Maulvi Yakuinuddin Ahmed has tried to win the votes of some members of the Council in the name of religion. What are the tenets of Islam on this point? I think, as a Muhammadan member, I ought to tell the Council something about it. I quote certain passages from the Koran to inform you in what particular light women are considered by Islam and what is their status. It is not true that women are regarded as slaves by the Mussalman; that is not their position though some of the critics of Islam have said so in many books. Neither is it true that Islam wants that Muhammadan women should go hand in hand with the males and frequent bazars and market places, councils and courts, to take up functions which God has allotted to men. Now, the first passage which I shall place before you may be translated thus: "Your wives are tilt for you, so go in to your tilt when you like. Her object is to bring up children." The next passage is, "the men are a degree above them." I think the Muhammadan law of Inheritance also recognises that. The argument has been advanced that because under the Muhammadan law, half share of properties goes to the daughter, therefore the daughter must have franchise, so let them have half the vote. This passage is very significant; this passage says the men are a degree above them, and why? The reason is obvious; human minds generally consist of three faculties, reasoning, emotion and will; will is the predominant characteristic of males, while emotion is the dormant feature of females; it is reason that has elevated males to the position which they occupy in society; it is emotion, it is feeling, it is sentiment, it is constant devotion to their duty to make their homes happy that has given females their proper place in this world. I do not consider that I say all this in a hostile attitude towards our females. Their cry, or at least the cries of some of the educated women of Bengal is, "We must have equal rights with you." "Very good, in what way?" Perhaps the next day or in the next generation, they will want to be magistrates, barristers, vakils, sub-judges and hold all the important positions under the Government. Now the whole question that I ask each and every member, especially every Indian member of this Council, is to say whether, in their heart of hearts, they want to have lady magistrates, lady barristers, lady vakils, etc.

[A voice: "Why not?"]

It is also stated that men are the guardians of women; the reason is that God has made some to excel others; man excels woman in constitution and physique, while woman excels man in beauty and delicacy of structure, and I should also add that woman excels man in sentiment, emotion and feelings; their proper place is in the home. You will find another injunction in the Koran regarding this; if any member wants to refer to the original text——

The PRESIDENT: (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): I do not think you should take up the time of the Council by reading extracts from the Koran.

Mr. SYED NASIM ALI: This is what the Koran says. [Here the member quoted a passage from the Koran.] Mr. Rushbrook Williams in his *India* of 1919, at page 127, says this:

> Nor is it possible to deny that the old conservative objection has a grain of wisdom in it. There is a real fear lest girls, when they are educated, may become unfitted for home life when they become adverse from paths which constitute the glory and the pride of the orthodox Indian woman.

Real female education and social reform can be obtained by advancing schemes of female education which will fit its girls for the vocation of wife and mother, and not as magistrates, munsifs, etc., and not certainly as M.L.C.'s and M.L.A.'s; that is his idea of female education Dealing with the question of *purdah*, Mr. Rushbrook Williams has also said in his *India* of 1919.

> It cannot be denied that the *purdah* is still very firmly rooted, especially amongst the Muhammadan community.

This is the observation of a person of European ideal—that the *purdah* is still very firmly rooted specially among the Muhammadans—many still practise it. That is what it appears to an on-looker and an outsider—are we, the Muhammadans, in a position to say that that is really not our feeling? The custom of early marriage is very firmly rooted in the Hindu community. This is what Mr. Rushbrook Williams says:

> . . . despite the protest of social reformers, it will be long before a substantial advance is possible.

That is the statement of a gentleman who is not an Indian. I ask each and every Indian to tell this Council frankly whether this is not a correct appreciation of the feeling of the Bengalis. [A voice: "Certainly not."] One thing I wish to point out in connection with my statement, that I also oppose it on the ground that I am also an inhabitant of Bengal. In 1919, in British India, there was a population of 240 millions; there are under 8 million people in all our educational institutions put together. Three per cent. of the population is under instruction; five per cent. consists of males and one per cent. of females. Now,

the object of legislation is to deal with human needs as it is. The object of legislation is not to deal with ideal and utopian needs; you cannot change human nature in a day by legislation; do all that you can, legislation is bound to be futile; the whole question is whether the time is ripe for that, and whether the feelings, the needs, the interests of the country and the attainment of *swaraj* or self-government require it. What is the object of these ladies in their attempt to get franchise? To me it seems that they want to share in the administration of the country; for what purpose? Perhaps to ameliorate the condition of the people. Is there any Indian mother, any Indian sister, any Indian wife who is in a position to state that her father, her brother, her husband does not look after her interests; does not know what is her best interest, and is not in a position to represent in the Council what is conducive to her welfare? Certainly, we may not be able to listen to their sweet voices in the Council, but at the same time I think the husbands, fathers and brothers are quite competent to deal with their interests. Then as regards the welfare of her children. Certainly, my wife is as much interested in the welfare of her children as I am, they are as much my children as hers; there cannot be any adverse conflict of interests. Therefore, what special interest do we want to provide for? The women say: "We want to be given complete freedom and liberty for women to sit in the Council; we must share in the administration of the country and the privileges which you men enjoy." That is the attitude. If that is so, the whole question is whether we should accept that proposal. I could have understood that position, if any member of the Council could have pointed out that, but for their representation in the Council, our females have suffered in any way. Before the inauguration of the Reforms scheme, the whole thing was in the hands of the Government. Just now we have been given opportunities in some matters to improve conditions. One year has not elapsed; our mothers and sisters and wives have not had time to judge whether we are not able to do our best for them or not . . .

The member having reached the time-lmit, had to resume his seat, as there were many other speakers.

Maulvi A. K. FAZL-UL HAQ: In order to dispel any doubt as to my attitude on this particular question, I wish to declare at once that I rise to support the resolution of my friend, Mr. S. M. Bose. On a question of such vital importance and involving far-reaching issues, I do not think I would be fulfilling my duty if I were to record a mere silent vote, and I therefore wish to say a few words in order to explain clearly my position, and, as I understand it, the position of the members of my community towards a question like this. As far as I have been able to make out the opponents to this resolution may be classified under three distinct heads. There is first of all what I call the prejudiced class, men who are brought up in prejudices, and who refuse to look far into the

future, and who are so very selfish that they do not for a moment think that women, even their mothers and sisters, should participate in their joys and happiness So far as this particular class is concerned, I do not think any useful purpose will be served by arguing with them. I shall leave them alone with their prejudices and to such comforts and happiness that they can have, surrounded by the superstition and ignorance of the female members of their household. There is the second class, who accept this principle but who think it will be difficult to draw up regulations which will keep out undesirable members of the female sex, not only from going to the polling station, but later on from sitting as members of this Council. I think my esteemed friend, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray, belongs to this class. He accepts the principle, but he has got certain fears in his mind as to whether a franchise like this can be worked out favourably in practice. To him I would say that once the principle is accepted, the question of making regulations may be considered later on. We may have committees if we like for that, we may have meetings, we may have suggestions, we may have considerations from all quarters and all points of view, and it will then be the time to consider how we can make regulations which will allow not merely suitable voters to come to the polling booths, but also to make provision, when the time comes, for female members to sit in our Council. I know that there is a strong feeling that a certain class of females might have these privileges very much to the exclusion of desirable members. I am not one of those who would for a moment suggest that the door should be let so wide open as to allow anyone and everyone to enter. I think if strict regulations were framed, many male members should be, in strict justice, ruled out of the polling booths. In the laws of morality I would not have one standard for males and another for females; I do not wish to justify any principle of commandment of males over females. When questions like these are under consideration, it is not correct to warp our judgment.

There is a third class, and that consists of those who accept the principle and do not seem to have very many apprehensions as regards rules and regulations but think that very many of them might be affected if women get the vote. As my friend Maulvi Yakuinuddin Ahmed thinks he is bound to support this resolution. There is, however, my friend Mr. Syed Nasim Ali who thinks that as a Muhammadan he is bound to oppose it. I wish to say, with reference to this question, that whatever the decision of this Council may be, it is extremely unfortunate that the sacred name of Islam should have been dragged into this controversy. It has been said that the views of a particular member represent the views of the Moslem community. As far as I am concerned, I wish to declare that on a question like this, the laws of Islam seem to me to be so liberal to the members of the female sex, that I think I can fairly claim that under the laws of Islam Moslem women have got a status which women of other communities may reasonably envy. To say that Islam is not tolerant to

women is not only not true, but is one of the greatest possible insults to Islam. That has been the cry of the enemies of Islam ever since the beginning of the preachings of the Prophet and I submit to the Council, that a graver charge has not been levelled against Islam than has been by my friend Mr. Nasim Ali. I ask him to consider what happened after the death of our holy Prophet, when there was a dispute about the Khilafat. There was danger of a civil war, and it was Hazrat Ayesha, the wife of the Prophet who intervened and who declared in favour of Abu Bakar as the first Caliph, and that put an end to the dispute, and everyone came forward and voted in his favour. I would like to ask my friend if he considers that the wife of the Prophet went against the preachings of Islam? In the light of this, do you consider that this proposal is not correct? When Islamic ladies of the highest position have taken part in the affairs of the country, I say that, when we clamour for representative institutions, it is nothing new either to the Hindus or Muhammadans. In European countries we have the beginnings of representative Government, and in Islam not only have men voted freely, but I claim that it is a matter of history that even the most respectable ladies have voted publicly and taken part in the elections, without going out beyond the *purdah*; they have got out veiled. This is the only restriction observed in Muhammadan countries. You see women going out veiled, attending to their domestic duties, making their purchases and moving about freely. They go out into markets to make purchases; they go out to make formal and ceremonial calls on friends and relatives. That they do: but is it because that there is strict *purdah* in India, therefore, the tenets of Islam are against the granting of franchise to women? I claim that this is absolutely blasphemous.

It has been said that if the franchise be given to ladies, Moslem interests will, in a mysterious way, be affected—I cannot understand how? In the first place, we are not agitating for making females eligible for seats in Council. We are only trying to remove the sex-disqualifications. The number of seats is settled; the proportion of Muhammadan seats is fixed by statute. If, at any time, Hindu seats are increased, Moslems will have 40 per cent. of the non-Muhammadan Indian seats—then where is the danger? What will happen is this: at the present moment, let us suppose an electorate of about a million voters elect 60 or 65 members; and if women are given the franchise, perhaps an electorate of a million and half or two millions will elect 60 or 65 members. How can we object to it? So far as our women are concerned, in supporting this resolution, we do not say that a policeman should go and drag our women from out the *purdah*; we only ask that their names will be on the electoral rolls, and it will be at their option to exercise the franchise. If, at these elections, some voters do not like to exercise this privilege, no policeman will drag them and take them to the polling booth. If they think that they cannot exercise their right at the present moment and under present conditions, nobody will

force them to do so. But, by all means, let them have the right; let their names be on the voters' list and when time advances, customs change and they can conveniently go to the polling booths, they will do so; but so long as they cannot go to the polling booths, I think we can frame rules and regulations for the issue of commissions and for employing lady recorders of votes or lady returning officers; these are however all matters of detail.

Then, my friend, Maulvi Nasim Ali, has said—" Why do ladies want the vote?" I say—" Ladies want the vote to root out prejudices from our minds. Ladies want the vote to rule out prejudiced members like my friend. (Hear, hear.) Ladies want the vote, because the time has come when you must recognise that they have got their rights and privileges just as men have got. Ladies want the vote, because while you are clamouring for liberty and emancipation, it is the wish of the God Almighty that those whom you have kept in servility and bondage do like to break away from their fetters. Ladies want the vote, because if liberty is dear to you, it is also dear to them. Ladies want the vote, because if you are God's creatures and claim liberty, ladies are also God's creatures none the less and they have an equal right to claim liberty and emancipation."

It has been said that that the time has not come for this privilege being granted to ladies. Well, that was the cry we heard in 1915: that was what we heard in Lucknow in 1918, when the Congress and the Moslem League made their solemn compact. My friend will pardon me—he was not there. I am the only survivor of that band in this Council, the others not having elected to come here; and I am the only Muhammadan member here. Our Hon'ble Minister, the Nawab Sahib, will bear me out that when we entered into that compact, to sink all differences between Hindus and Moslems, there were many who then prophesied that this Moslem League and Congress compact spelt nothing but disaster to the Muhammadans. But where would we have been but for that compact? We made that compact at Lucknow, disregarding prejudices and placing our faith in God, placing our faith in the immutable laws of nature. (Hear, hear.) We made that compact and it is as a result of that compact that we have got these reforms and we have this extended privilege and all that we now see before us in this Chamber. I know that the time allowed to me is very short; so it is not possible for me to meet all the arguments advanced by my friend, Maulvi Nasim Ali; but to him I would make an earnest appeal—it will not do to look at things from a narrow point of view. We are here to affirm a great principle, and when we are discussing principles, we cannot do so in a cool and calculating spirit. We must be just and generous; and I take it that it is on our sense of justice that women rely in asking for this privilege. Justice—justice unalloyed by selfishness, justice which is undeterred by craven fear—it is on such justice that our womanhood now

rely—let me say—with unflinching faith; and let us hope that this confidence that is reposed in us has not been misplaced and that our sympathy will go forth to those who are most entitled to our help, support and sympathy.

The member having reached the time-limit, had to conclude his remarks.

Mr. D. C. GHOSE: Sir, I cannot help thinking that this great question, this important subject of women franchise, has been discussed in this House, at any rate by its opponents, in a somewhat petty-fogging spirit. Instead of basing their opposition upon the orthodox but perfectly intelligible ground that the true functions of womanhood would be jeopardised by the intrusion of women into the field of politics, they have introduced into the discussion petty squabbles about difficulties in giving effect to the resolution of my friend Mr. S. M. Bose. Difficulties there are, I admit, with regard to this matter. But will anybody tell me what great idea there is which is altogether free from difficulties? It is one thing, however, to face difficulties for the purpose of overcoming them, and it is quite another thing to set them up as an excuse for the purpose of refusing to solve a question. I am, therefore, not impressed by the narration of difficulties by members who are opposing Mr. Bose's resolution.

Let me briefly touch upon some of the arguments that have been employed by members who are opposing Mr. Bose. I will take first the speech of my friend Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur. Amid a good deal of irrelevancies the only solid argument I come across in his speech is that he is opposed to Mr. Bose's resolution, because he is unwilling to desecrate women by bringing them into the field of politics. But no sooner has he uttered this fine argument than he gives it the go-by by saying that he is quite prepared, however, to give the vote to such women as are graduates or have passed the Matriculation or Cambridge Junior examination. In other words, although he is unwilling to desecrate women, he is quite prepared to desecrate such women as have got some education. This is logic indeed with a vengeance.

My friend, Babu Annada Charan Dutta, has urged us to be cautious in this matter, and has supported his argument by saying that it is wise to insist upon some educational qualification for the purpose of minimising the grave risks of giving the vote to women. I confess, I remain unconvinced by his argument. Assuming for the purpose of debate that there are serious risks in giving the vote to women, I cannot understand how they will be minimised by our insistence upon some educational qualification. What do we see in the case of men? Do we find men who are graduates better citizens than those who are not? Do we find men who have passed the Matriculation examination wiser than those who have not? The truth is that the passing of an

examination prescribed by a University does not necessarily bring in its train knowledge of affairs which is after all the best qualification for participation in politics. (Hear, hear.) That being so, I cannot understand why my friend asks us that we should insist upon some educational qualification.

Let me now turn to the speech of my friend Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray. It is always comforting, if I may say so, to hear him. The assurance with which he invariably speaks and the emphasis with which he drives home his arguments are such that we cannot but admire. My friend will forgive me, I hope, if I venture to point out, that assurance and emphasis are not the only essentials of a speech. Something else, something more is required and that important something, namely, logic and force of argument, I confess, I altogether miss in the speech with which he has supported his amendment. Hearing his arguments I failed to appreciate his conclusion, namely, reference of the question of women franchise to a committee. Why does he want the farce of a committee? What is the committee going to do? Is it to tell us whether or not we should give the vote to women? Are we so helpless with regard to this matter that we must have a committee to tell us what we should do? The truth is, my friend does not want to give the vote to women and he has adopted one of the familiar methods of shirking an issue for a committee. Sir, these arguments, these trivialities, these attempts to avoid facing the issue are out of joint with the spirit of the times. And that spirit, the spirit of freedom, is blasphemed and violated by those who say to their fellow creatures, either men or women:" There thou shalt abide. Come not nearer me." Let me here read out to you the eloquent words of one of India's greatest sons spoken in London the other day on the occasion of his receiving the freedom of that great city. These words, *mutatis mutandis*, apply equally well to the demand of the women for the vote. What did he say?—" He noticed that some took up the attitude that as their ancestors had struggled and sacrificed to obtain freedom, it was theirs exclusively and they were not willing to share it with those who had not shared trials and misfortunes, but," declared Mr. Sastri, " all trials and misfortunes would be profitless if they compelled posterity to go through similar ordeals. What one man fought for and won he must without reserve or qualification share with his fellowmen. Philosophy had taught mankind that it was best to seek one's own happiness only by serving the happiness of others. Similarly, no man can enjoy the fullest measure of the blessings of freedom unless he shared it fully with his fellowmen." Sir, I would respectfully ask members to ponder over these thoughtful, pregnant words of one of India's greatest patriots, Mr. Srinivasa Sastri. Sir, there is another argument in favour of giving the vote to women which, to my mind, is almost conclusive. We are witnessing now the laying as it were of the foundation stone of responsible democratic Government in

India. The foundations are now being laid for a noble edifice of government of the people by the people, for the people. And, therefore, I submit that now is the suitable time, this is the psychological moment, this is the opportune occasion, when we should, in a truly democratic spirit, invite the co-operation of women in laying the foundations and building the grand edifice. Let us enable them by giving the vote to contribute their peculiar genius, their finer sentiments and emotions, their deep fervent spirituality to the task of building the future great India.

Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur: Sir, I stand to oppose all the resolutions which are now before the House. Having listened to the arguments, I believe, this question is not only premature but also an uncalled-for one. Women of Bengal do not mean a few Westernised women whose number can be counted on one's finger's ends, but millions whose number cannot be reckoned with. This agitation set on foot is a flimsy project only to help a certain community. The passing of the same resolution in Bombay Legislative Council perhaps suggested the mover to press for the resolution here also. But Calcutta or rather Bengal differs materially in many respects from the Bombay Presidency, where woman emancipation exists from time immemorial. In Bengal, we have no such thing. I have consulted our *purdanashin* ladies. They do not want female emancipation of the West. Without female emancipation, I think, woman franchise will be a farce only. For, the major portion of women of Bengal, excepting those of the Brahmo and Christian communities, would not go to record their votes. What difficulties would then arise, specially about the identification, even if special arrangements are made? Women of Hindu and of Muhammadan communities composing 90 per cent. in Bengal, would refrain from voting and the 10 per cent. women enjoying the franchise would be outnumbered by women of ill-fame. Specially, the Calcutta candidates will have to go to canvass in the houses of ill-fame, what a downfall it will be for the future legislators of the country? The passing of the resolution will enable the minority to take advantage over the majority. For justice's sake, I must say that should not be allowed to exist. The Southborough Committee, having received a deputation from distinguished women of Bengal, decided otherwise and one of the signatories of the report is our venerable Minister, Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea. Dr. Abdullah Suhrawardy joined the Committee when it came to Bengal and I find his name also amongst the signatories. I beg to read a little portion of it:—

We received numerous petitions from women of the educated classes urging the cause of female suffrage on the same property qualifications as for men, or at least the admission of women graduates to the franchise. More than one lady appeared before us to support this view. Several political associations, especially in Bombay and Madras, urged the same cause, but during the oral examination of their representatives we found reason to believe that female suffrage was advocated

rather on general grounds than on considerations of practicability . . . We are satisfied that the social conditions of India make it premature to extend the franchise to Indian women at this juncture, when so large a proportion of male electors require education in the use of a responsible vote. Further, until the custom of seclusion of women, followed by many classes and communities, is relaxed, female suffrage would hardly be a reality; it would be out of harmony with the conservative feeling of the country; and it would involve great difficulties in the actual recording of votes. Whilst fully appreciating the object of those who advocate this measure as an aid to the emancipation of women, we have decided not to recommend the extension of the suffrage to them, but are of opinion that at the next revision (as contemplated by the Joint Report) of the constitutions of the councils the matter should be reconsidered in the light of the experience gained of the working of the electoral system and of social conditions as they then exist

There is another thing to be noted. A pamphlet has been issued to enlist support of the members, but the curious fact is that the writer is a male. The other day, another male writer, in an article in the *Englishman*, said that "the case of India will be different, male suffragists will fight for the woman suffragettes." I think this chivalrous spirit, even admitting self-prompted, would do immense injuries to the female cause as the writers do not know how to use decent language. Again, I may also say this zeal might lead to suspicion and we might say that only to gain advantage, the minority is making the agitation. I have also heard the female members of several orthodox communities through their male members to assert that they do not want the privilege. The reason is not far to seek, as the women of our Hindu community when married are to remain, according to our religious injunctions, under the guardianship of their husbands and even when they become widows, their duties then become to nurse the sick and feed the poor and to perform their daily *pujas*. They always like to live far away from politics and power. This is my view and in asserting this, I am voicing the opinion of my Rajput community and I am sure also that of the other Hindu communities and, I further believe that many of my Muhammadan friends here cannot far differ from my views on behalf of their communities. The measure would cause much trouble and inconvenience and that is why I ask the Council to deliver its judgment with caution and prudence. It would be better and safe to allow the women of Bengal to remain in their proper place in the society, which is much higher and unique than what the mover is trying to give and to let them do their duties as mothers, daughters, sisters and wives instead of degrading them by dragging them to such an intricate and unwholesome subject, I mean, politics.

In conclusion, the irresistible argument against the franchise seems to be insurmountable. Female franchise presupposes female emancipation; it is an afterthought and a by-product of female emancipation. We, the orthodox Hindus and Muhammadans, do not like to slavishly follow the western customs and in our judgment, we think, female

emancipation, as understood by the people of the west, could not be copied here. This affects the whole fabric, touches the core of our society and religion. Naturally, we do not like to discuss over it here. The main argument, therefore, remains unaltered. When female emancipation could not be introduced here so easily, female franchise must drop out as a matter of course, just as a parasite, without the parent tree, cannot come into existence. Thus, I hope, it is obvious for my Hindu and Muhammadan friends, that the female franchise, if introduced, would do them no good, rather it might stand against them at the time of election, the objectionable features of which have been clearly explained by Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray. The ethics of politics is that the minority should be taken care of, but therefore, it never means that the minority should be allowed to take advantage over the majority. Thus, for justice's sake, I oppose it and in the name of prudence I condemn it.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I beg most heartily to support the resolution and the movement for securing franchise for women. It is a movement for which I have not only a deep approbation but a positive enthusiasm though I am a Hindu Bengali to the core of my heart. For to ask for woman franchise is to ask for an act of barest justice and fair play. For a woman's franchise—what does it mean? It means nothing but this that a woman is also entitled to give adequate and formal expression to her opinion by virtue of the right that Providence has vested in her as a human being. I therefore firmly believe that no man with a strong heart and a sound sense can possibly refuse the demand unless he has allowed consciously or unconsciously, his judgment to be befogged by that deep-rooted antipathy of the sexes which is unquestionably primitive in its character.

Sir, about two and a half years ago, this question was first officially raised by me and some of my brother commissioners of the Calcutta Corporation when we were discussing how the Calcutta Municipal Act was to be so amended as to open out the door for a larger amount of popular representation. As the result of that debate we recommended the extension of the franchise, not only by lowering the basis of qualification but also by throwing it open to our women rate-payers. In that debate, there was no doubt, a considerable amount of opposition to the innovation, but, I am glad to say, that ultimately the demand for women suffrage was carried by an overwhelming majority. The Corporation of Calcutta have, therefore, accepted the principle and have recommended to the Government to allow women to be voters on the same qualification as men under the new Act that is to come.

Sir, it is too late in the day to demand for a reason for allowing women to vote. A question of this kind can only be based on a supposed inferiority of women in matters of intellect. If such a question is put, then I have no hesitation to say in reply that the progress of the General

Science of Mankind, which is constituted by a union of all other sciences, as Biology, Anthropology, Ethnology, Psychology, etc., has sufficiently and effectively pointed out, that this idea of supposed inferiority of the sex to which our mothers, our sisters and our wives belong is based not on reason but on prejudice. In her brilliant book called "A Critique on Femininity," Rosa Mayreder has pointed out, beyond all possible controversy, that "Sexual Polarity" does not extend to the "higher culture" of mankind—to the intellectual and spiritual spheres. The great philosopher, John Stuart Mill, points out the instinctive gift of woman, who led by her individual observations, rapidly and clearly discovers a truth and applies it in particular cases without troubling with abstract theories. This may be called the intuitive or subconscious judgment, in which women are particularly strong; so there is no justification for the argument based on the so-called inferiority of women which is so often levelled by our opponents against this demand for fair play.

In this connection, it may also be said with advantage, as has been most aptly pointed out by that great Professor of Psychiatry, Dr. August Froebel that "when man compares himself with woman he usually identifies himself, more or less unconsciously, with the highest male intellects, with men of genius in art and science and complaisantly ignores the crowd of idiots of his own sex."

Sir, in the region of intellect and judgment there is nothing like superiority and inferiority between man and woman. The truth is and that has been adequately demonstrated by the highest authorities on the subject, that in that region of intellect, the two sexes by the decree of Providence do complement each other and that most admirably. The mind has no sex, but only the body—as has been said by the admirable Mirabean.

While man raises this height of the ideal and of objects to be attained, woman has the necessary tact to soften and refine the tones and to adapt the shades to each special situation by the aid of her natural intuition, where man risks everything by the violence of his passions and his efforts.

This reciprocal influence alone conduces to the best and highest harmony of sentiments, judgments and necessarily of actions in life in all its departments. I join in the hope of such an eminent authority as Havelock Ellis, who hopes so much from the development in the civilization of the future, of an equal freedom for man and woman. Let not petty feelings of jealousy or false ideas of superiority or even primitive ideas of perpetual tutelage of women close the door to the realization of a hope so noble, so glorious, and so soul inspiring.

Sir, if the exercise of the franchise requires a will power, then it is women who are certainly equally, if not more, entitled to it. For as regards will power, in the opinion of high authorities on the subject and

in our own domestic experience, woman is on the average superior to man. It is in this psychological domain, more than in any other, that she does and will always triumph. Let us look to our homes and we shall get abundant evidence of it.

The average woman is in no way inferior to the average man in intelligence. It is only this, that the intelligence of one is, to say roughly, different in kind from the intelligence of the other.

Dr. Ivan Bloch, the great authority on Sexual Psychology, has very ably pointed out that, in respect of quickness of comprehension and intellectual mobility, woman is distinctly superior to man; what more is required for a correct exercise of a franchise? Women appear to possess, in the sphere of politics, more indepent significance, as is shown by the fact that there have been so many celebrated women rulers. Diplomatic adroitness, finesse, and self-command, to the extent to which these qualities favour political activity, are indeed specific female peculiarities. Look to our own celebrated women of India both Hindu and Moslem.

Sir, there is another class of our opponents who would ask us to explain why we should allow women to vote. To my mind, this is looking at the question from the hopelessly wrong point of view.

The question is not why we should allow women to vote, but the real question is, " what right have we men, to keep them away from it— their birthright to give expression to their opinion. The onus is not on us who want to do justice but on them who want to shut it out on their supposed grounds of expediency. Our votes mainly depend on property qualifications and except for the Calcutta University constituency, and a few others, so far as I know, there is no vote on personal qualification for the Council.

If, therefore, we more than recognise the property qualification of a woman by realising rates and taxes from her, what fairness or justice is it then to deprive her of the ordinary legal incidence of such rates and taxes—viz., a vote?

If again the personal qualification of being a graduate of seven years' standing entitles a young man to vote, how on earth could a lady graduate of the same standing be deprived of it? Who shows the greater grit, man or the woman graduate? Why disqualify the better of the two? Is it because you have the power to do it?

Sir, there is another class of persons who object to this movement on the ground that it will be productive of very great social harm. To them it need only be pointed out that similar vague, baseless, and extravagant apprehensions were entertained by those who objected to the introduction of female education in this country, and even to the suppression of the horrible custom of the *Suttee*. Such extravagant fears arise from personal prejudice alone and are not worth any serious consideration. To this it may be said that the only persons whom ghosts can frighten are either children or imbeciles.

Then again, Sir, there is another class of objectors who argue that our women are not educated enough to exercise the franchise and so they say that it should be given only to women who are graduates or undergraduates. These are men who live in the half-way house. They have the intelligence to realise the necessity of the demand, but have not the courage to admit the justice thereof, and so it is that they want to whittle it down by introducing unjustifiable limitations. How many of our male voters are educated, please? Why raise false issues then? The truth very largely is that the kind of education that is calculated to help a man or woman in exercising the franchise correctly is more atmospheric than academic in its character.

There are yet one or two other kinds of objections to this demand which time would not permit me to mention in detail. They are more frivolous than substantial and can be very easily met by the fact that this right to vote, which is demanded, is only and entirely a permissive one. You have not been called upon to grant a woman's Charter of Rights now? It will be entirely left to the individual woman concerned if she will exercise her franchise or not. In the most hotly contested elections in Calcutta now, in spite of facilities of transit and all the pressure and coaxing that candidates can apply, as a rule, more than one-third of the voters—males—do not exercise the franchise at all.

In this connection, I may quote, with advantage, what was said by the great Thomas Huxley in 1865. Two-thirds of a century ago that great man said:—

> Let those women, who feel inclined to do so, descend into the gladiatorial arena of life, not merely in the guise of *retiaria* as hithertofore, but as bold *secutrix*, breasting the open fray. Let them be merchants, lawyers, politicians, if they so please. Let them have a fair field, but (the great man cautioned them) let them understand, as the necessary correlative, that they are to have no favour. Let Nature alone sit high above the lists, rain influence, and judge the prize.

So much for the substance of the demand. Then come the objections based on the difficulties in the procedure of getting women's votes recorded. If there is the will to grant the demand, then the difficulties in getting the grant reduced to action need not be any serious source of anxiety. Matters can easily be arranged by keeping the custom of the *purdah* in tact for such women who cherish the same. Other smaller difficulties like those concerning identification, etc., can be very easily dealt with with the help of the thumb impressions etc. It is frivolous waste of time to magnify trifling difficulties of procedure and to put them across our way as objections based on matters of substance. Women in South India, even Muhammadan ladies, have been exercising this right of franchise for some years past.

There is one other point that I beg to place before the House. If we men of Bengal, because we have the power in our hands, refuse to do justice to our own mothers, sisters and wives in the matter of their

natural right to representation, then how could we legitimately expect a Government conducted by foreigners, with no racial bond of attachment with us, to surrender to us, a subject race, any of the rights, which we are so earnestly claiming at their hands?

If we are anxious to have justice for ourselves then we must be prepared to do justice to others to whom it is due at our hands. If not, then our claims will be a mere cry in the wilderness and no shrewd and sensible Government will ever take it seriously.

Raja MANMATHA NATH RAY CHOUDHURY: Sir, at the very outset, I desire to join my voice with that of Mr. D. C. Ghose and deplore the fact that last night, as well as to-day, certain speakers thought fit to drag the debate on so important a matter to a very low level by their unparliamentary conduct and expressions. The proposition which Mr. Basu has thrown open for discussion touches a difficult, intricate and important problem. I am aware that many of our community think that the social aspect of the problem is fraught with serious consequences and they are, therefore, anxious to leave the important political issues which are involved in it to the slow operation of time. They seriously believe that if our women get the franchise they are agitating for they will lay the axe to the very root of orthodoxy in this country and bring about a revolution which will upset all accepted beliefs and existing institutions which are based, broad and deep on cautious social conservatism. Is there really any cause for such an alarm? I say, "no." I feel disposed to treat it as a mere stage in the evolution of our national life. It is bound to come sooner or later and, in my opinion, it is much better for men to keep pace with the tide of evolution than to oppose the women's cause which its swift current is carrying forward in the natural course with an irresistible force. Besides, a new era has dawned upon us and the Indian world has begun to move. Although I am dead against any kind of revolution, I will certainly take it upon myself to say that those who say "change nothing" are champions of slavery But Sir, we find that in ancient India women were coadjutors of men in all departments of life—whether within the magic circle of home or in other sterner spheres of life, including the battlefield. To be more businesslike let me say that if we compare the legal position of our women, as described in the institutes of Mannu, with that of the women of even England, we at once find that the birthright of women was nowhere more respected than in ancient India. A perusal of Mill's "Subjection of Women" will convince one of the truth of my statement.

Sir, it is feared that the natural superiority of man will be questioned and disputed by woman, if she is allowed to enter into the arena of politics on equal terms. I refuse to believe this; for, natural superiority can never be crushed out of existence by open competition. It is not a hot house plant and I am sure it will thrive better in the open

air. It has been also urged that politics is a dirty game and women should not get near it. Is not life itself, as we find it in this shabby world of ours, a dirty game too. To whom do we look to purify our every-day existence. To women, undoubtedly. So let politics also be purified by the association of all that is best and noblest in the womanhood of our country. It is moreover apprehended that the innovation contemplated by the resolution under discussion will produce the New Woman, with a masculine intellect, quite indifferent to the natural duties and functions of her life. I decline to believe that any woman, with a grain of common sense in her, would ever think of sacrificing her God-given feminine grace or her throne in the home, where she is supposed to be the guardian angel, or for the matter of that lose the divine rewards of the glorious motherhood for the tinsel of politics. The franchise which is sought for them will only enable them to participate in some measure, with us in our toils in the field of politics as they are already doing in other spheres of life. India needs such an alliance between man and woman in the domain of her politics for the further expansion of her civic life. It is the intention of God and man alike that women should be our helpmates in the strict sense of the term, and I think it is quite safe for men, of all shades of opinion, to say in the glorious immortal language of Tennyson, who was verily the soul of the age in which he lived:—

> The woman's cause is man's;
> they rise or sink
> Together, dwarfed or God-like,
> bond or free.

Sir, I think a very strong case has been made out in favour of Mr. Bose's resolution. The amendments, in my opinion, are altogether unacceptable and as such, should be altogether rejected.

The movers of the first two amendments have set excessively high premium on University education. A woman, according to one of them, should not only go through the paddock, or have a preliminary canter, but must actually run, right up to the winning post, the harrowing race of a University to get the franchise! Mr. Dutta, however, was a bit more merciful, but I wish, Sir, that both of them could look beyond the rails of the University Race course

The last, though not the least, Kumar Shib. Shekhareswar Ray, made a heroic effort to stand on two stools and, so far as I could see, the valiant Kumar had the inevitable fall between them. Hypocritical professions carry no conviction or rouse no sympathy which is the universal solvent. My friend very cleverly tried, or shall I say, made a desperate attempt to steal a march on the unsophisticated minds of those who want the franchise by saying that his committee was going to give them the moon; but, their eyes which, perhaps see more than the eyes of men must have seen, under the froth and foam of the

Kumar's equivocal speech, the real intention of the inner man that dwells within him. Besides, his speech, if I may say so without offence and I really do not mean any offence grew hypercritical and redundant in its latter stage and revealed him in the vividness of reality. Their came hard words and hard words break bones.

However that may be, last night the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler made an important pronouncement when he said that the decision of this House will be final in this matter. Here is a splendid opportunity I say, for this House to do some real good to the country unaided by Government support, and I hope and trust that we shall not let the opportunity slip out of our hands. If a committee has to be formed it must come into existence after Mr. Bose's resolution has been accepted and carried. A committee can work out details—determine the *modus operandi*, safeguard varied interests that are involved in the question, see that the *purdah* is not in any way violated and suggest measures by which the undesirables and ill-fames may be excluded; for, excluded they must be for the sanctity of our political atmosphere.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: Sir, I feel that in rising to speak on this occasion I must clear my ground. In the first place I desire it to be clearly known that I speak not as a Member of the Government but as a representative of my constituency, as a Member of this Council and as a public man. The views which it would be my duty to place before the Council are personal and individual views for which the responsibility belongs to me and to me alone. In the first place, Sir, I desire to remind this House—and I find that the fact has been mentioned by one of the speakers that I was a member of the Southborough Committee and that the Committee did not recommend the enfranchisement of women. Not only that but I supported that recommendation. I feel that some of you would say—"you are inconsistent." "Here evidently you are going back upon principles which you had endorsed." Well, Sir, I do not attach any great importance to the cult of consistency. Consistency may not always be a virtue any more than inconsistency is a crime. Consistency sometimes means perseverance in error. Inconsistency is often the mark and symbol of the forward movement of a progressive mind. Sir, read the history of the lives of distinguished public men. Gladstone began his political career as the rising hope of the unbending Tories. He ended his great record as the trusted leader of the advanced Liberal party in the United Kingdom. Joseph Chamberlain began his public life as a Radical—almost a republican, and died as the leader of the Unionist party. Michael Davitt began life as a rebel and ended it as a Member of Parliament swearing allegiance to the Crown. Sir, it is circumstances that determine political principles. It is circumstances that impart to political principles, their distinguishing character and their discriminating effect. That is the dictum of Edmund Burke. The circumstances under which the

Southborough Committee made the recommendation to which I have just referred do not now exist. We felt that here were the Reforms whose fate was trembling in the balance, the extremists violently attacking them, the other sections of the community look warm in their support. They had to be saved. We felt that if we granted women's franchise we might alienate the sympathies of the orthodox and conservative sections of the community and thus jeopardise the Reforms. We preferred to throw this cargo over board in order to save the ship. That is my jurisdiction for not supporting women's franchise in our recommendations. Sir, the circumstances have changed since. The Reforms now formed part of the law of the land. They are in working order. The circumstances having changed, I have changed my angle of vision and have modified my views on the subject.

Therefore, I am prepared to extend my humble support to the resolution of my friend Mr. S. M. Bose. Is it not desirable, is it not wise, and expedient that we should do so? The agitation has begun—started by whom? By the most emotional—the most energetic section of our community—by our mothers, wives and sisters. The agitation will grow in volume and intensity. It is bound to succeed sooner or later. Is it not wise to take time by the forelock and grant them the concession they ask for? *Bis dat cito dat*: "he gives twice who gives promptly"—that is the latin proverb. Promptitude adds to the graciousness of a gift, delay mars it. Let not the words "too late" be written on our concession in this matter as they have been inscribed so often in the past. We shall be bound to give it sooner or later. The Bombay Legislative Council has voted for it, the Madras Legislative Council has voted for it. Are you going to oppose it—are you going to resist it? Will you be able to stifle the agitation? Will you be able to roll back the onrush of the rising tide? You will not succeed. The forces of nature, the forces of time, are with the ladies, and it is wise for you to accept the situation and grant them the concession with promptitude which will impart an added grace to the gift. And, Sir, is it not desirable in our own interest that we should admit our women into the electorate and associate them with us in the legislature and the Government of the country in the times to come? Do you not want—and here I speak as a Member of the Government—do you not want women's help in respect of the many activities of Government? Sir, speaking of the Departments over which I have the honour to preside, we want their help in the matter of sanitation, we want their aid in the matter of child-welfare. I may mention here that at the present time I am organising a series of lantern lectures for the benefit of *purdah* ladies in the Barrackpore subdivision and I have felt the utmost need for the assistance of women in this matter. My friend Mr. P. C. Mitter wants their aid in the matter of female education. My friend over there, the Nawab Sahib, wants their aid for the development of cottage industries, and we too want them in this Council

Chamber to soften the acerbities of our debates, to impart to our deliberations that grace, that charm, that sweetness which feminine presence alone can inspire. Therefore, Sir, taking my stand upon the high ground of expediency, it does seem to me that this Council would do well to accept with unanimity and enthusiasm the resolution which has been moved by my friend Mr. S. M. Bose, and Sir, remember that the vote is an educating factor. You talk of female education and you place within their reach the benefits of school instruction: but far more valuable to my mind would be this form of instruction given by the exercise of the vote. It will enthrone the principle of co-operation in the recesses of our hearths and homes. It will supply an antidote to the mischievous poison of non-co-operation. At the present moment these ladies are supplicants at your doors; they will increase in power and in influence, as time passes; aided by the time forces, by the sympathies of civilised humanity and the voices of their sisters wafted across distant lands, they will speak in tones of thunder which will be irresistible. Therefore, grant them now what you will be forced to concede in the end. Save us from the agitation which is inevitable. Let us have peace. We have had enough of agitation. God grant that the counsels of sobriety and prudence may prevail.

Mr. H. BARTON: I have much pleasure in supporting the resolutions by our worthy friend, Mr. S M. Bose. My colleague, Mr. Stark, has already spoken for my community, but I should like to supplement what he has said. Sir, with the advancement and expansion of thought, the olden-day attitude towards woman, that her place in life should be confined to the four walls of the house and tied down as a domestic drudge, has changed. The days when woman's weakness, inferiority and incapacity were held to be obstacles to her taking part in public affairs have passed, while woman, herself, has triumphed over the attempt by man to relegate her to a position of subordination and servitude. No fair-minded person, to-day, could deny to woman the credit of having overtaken man despite the terrible odds against her to say nothing of man's attempt to handicap her altogether for purposes of pure selfishness. She has wiped out all stigmas cast upon her and is, to-day, man's equal in more respects than one. Whatever might be the attitude of other classes towards their women on this question, speaking for the Anglo-Indian and Domiciled European Community, I feel that our women are fit for the franchise. A very large percentage of them are educated up to the highest standard this country affords; a large percentage are engaged in public offices and commercial firms; many have taken up medicine as a profession; a large number comprise the nursing staffs of civil and military hospitals, a large number have gone into business while a large percentage pay the same taxes and rates that men do. As to those classes who feel that their women are either not ready for the franchise or are labouring under peculiar national disabilities, which stand in the

way of their participation, the time must sooner or later come, when, realising the advantages it offers, they will see the stern necessity for making their women fit and will find ways and means by which such disabilities might be overcome. The destiny of their women lies in their hands and it is for them to say whether they will watch over it to their advantage or disadvantage. Sir, the extension of the franchise to women means more to them than words can express. It must, ultimately, bring with it enlightenment, liberty, influence and power which would only be the restoration to them of rights lost through no fault of theirs. I do sincerely hope that their rights will not be restricted to the vote, but that it will not be long before we find them sitting side by side with us in the Council deliberating those many questions so largely associated with the welfare of women. Woman best understands the needs of woman and it is woman that can best advocate woman's cause. What reasonable objection could there be to treating woman, in this respect, on an equality with man? She really plays the larger part in the affairs of man and every day sees her assuming larger responsibilities and filling a more prominent part in those matters which make for the world's advancement. If women could go hand in hand and side by side with man in the domestic and social life, what should stand in the way of her doing so in public life? Woman, like man, is of God's creation; woman, like man, is therefore entitled to the same privileges. If man chooses to deprive her of this right, he must submit to the consequences. The recent war has brought out in a conspicuous manner the high qualities in women. We know when at a time England needed to keep her fighting forces at full strength and every available man had to be set free, the women came forward and took their places in the various services, and it is due largely to this fact that the British were able to hold their own during one of the most critical stages of the war. On the other hand Anglo-Indian and Domiciled European women went out in large numbers to the various theatres of the war and played a most heroic part in the war hospitals. History records the fact of Indian women having risen to similar emergencies, and who will respond again should occasion arise. The names of Indian women as great leaders and administrators are not lacking. Shall we then turn to women in the hour of our need and cast her aside after this need has been met? Men owe more to women than most people care to acknowledge. Man's dependence on woman has been from the beginning and will continue till the end of time, why is man ashamed to admit this? The extension of the franchise to women can only be a step in the right direction. In asking for its extension we are but asking for bare justice. Whatever objections or scruples there may be on the part of some, they have not convinced this Council that the extension of the franchise to women will result in compulsion. Let us accept the principle and the rest will follow.

With these remarks, I support the resolution of Mr. S. M. Bose.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: It was not my intention to intervene in the debate and incur the odium of womankind; it was not my purpose to give expression to sentiments, that not being fashionable, may be termed reactionary but in fairness to polemics, to dialectics and academic politics, I think I should sound a note of discord in the midst of a pæan of praise. I shall endeavour to treat the subject with the consideration that it deserves, because the Muhammadan members have, in appealing to the beauties of the Islamic religion, which I hope will ensure us some converts, given a serious tone to a matter of little moment, because some have with gross irreverence introduced the name of the Prophet and Hazrat Ayesha in a dirty political atmosphere and in an age that has well been styled the Kali Yuga, and because the uncounted women of Bengal have in flooding us with pamphlets, invitations exhortations and insults, taken themselves and this interesting subject with a seriousness which does credit to their enthusiastic self-centredness. They have shown themselves so adept in the art of canvassing, an art natural to them, that already I feel that the reason of some of our members has given way under the strain of their onslaught and button holes that were never sported before are in evidence in this austere company, and it is no secret that the members of the Southborough Committee realised the changing times only day before yesterday—with slow and unyielding comprehension—and taking their stand on the highest ground of expediency. Already, Sir, we quake in our shoes when we realise our fate when we shall have to bring, to bear on the battlefield of a polling day our feeble forces against the magnetic influence of some fair damsel, who with the tune of the Pied Piper, will charm away our trusting voters from the security of their homes to their destruction and our detriment; already I can realise our futility in the face of the army of women canvassers that will lead away with gentle guile at the very steps of the polling booth the mere males whom with anxious entreaties we managed to secure, whom with forcible persuasion we managed to give a free ride in our motor cars, only to be betrayed in the end at the hour of trial; already, Sir, I can picture the army of men candidates, melting like snow before the sun when they find the redoubtable woman amongst them: why, Sir, I earnestly recommend this series of resolutions for the acceptance of the Government, for it will save them all the harassment and trouble of a contested election, for I daresay there will be no paucity of women candidates throughout the length and breadth of Bengal, in its furthermost nooks and crannies, in view of the, did we not say, universal cry for women suffrage? But it is not on these grounds, Sir, that I oppose the resolutions, although the distinct of self-preservation is strong within me. Nobody doubts their good qualities, but the right to vote is no guerdon for good qualities; nobody doubts their shrewdness and acuteness, but shrewdness and acuteness are poor substitutes for political insight, balance and far-sightedness. I do not wish to recount the numerous womanly qualities that make them for the time being, let us have it.

unfit for a political existence. There are innumerable reasons, too, all more or less cogent, some felt, some expressible. For though, Sir, with our characteristic chivalry and our characteristic cowardice when in the presence of women, let alone with a quailing conscience under the glare of a hundred baleful eyes we may pass the measure, we shall still feel that it were far better if we had resisted the temptation of mooting such a doubtful proposition. I will not recount the insuperable difficulties that will arise as regards impersonation, recording of votes, giving evidence on election petitions, canvassing of women voters, should the ladies behind the veil stoop to exercise the franchise, for the difficulties are there and patent. I need not refer to the facilities to young Adonises and to polygamous Muhammadans and Hindus and the difficulties in identifying Mrs. No. 1 and Mrs. No. 2. I need not refer to the real danger that exists in the ingenuity of that obstructive part of the community that sent a carter in Delhi to drive the members, that sent a baker to minister to their wants and that may send a distinguished public woman to keep company with distinguished and enlightened public men, side by side, as Mr. Barton would have it. But I feel, Sir, I cannot let this opportunity pass without sounding a note of warning. India is passing through difficult times, not only politically, but socially and culturally. The minds of the best thinkers are exercised in presaging and calculating the effect on the culture of India of the advent of Western institutions and above all of Western customs and manners, of Western modes of thought and ideals. We are looking with longing eyes not to a dim and glorious past, not to a sublime and distant civilisation, but at our own ideals, our own simplicity, our own love for the home and family life, at our own customs and manners that we feel are being ruthlessly sundered by too close an imitation of Western life. And I indeed regret to say that it is the women of Bengal, far more than the other provinces who are teaching us to be more Western than the Westerns themselves. And I cry: Halt! let us examine the position. And I say so because I have been to the West and I have seen what the West has done for its women. I may be wrong in arguing from the few against the interests of the many, who presumably wait at home with uplifted hands for the conferring of the boon, but I daresay they will not be grievously disappointed if the opportunity to vote is denied them. Then again, do the women actually wish to help us, do they wish to take active part in building the great political house that we are endeavouring to construct? One swallow, Sir, cannot make a summer, though for the time being its sweet twittering beneath verdant leaves may send through us a warm glow of pleasant anticipation. What have the women done to show that they can help us? The women of England before they obtained the vote had long been engaged in helping their folk in their political campaigns, had long shown their earnestness in participating in the problems of the country, had long worked to uplift and help the poor and the suffering, had long stooped to bear the burden of their unfortunate sisters. What have the

women in Bengal done which can give them the right to come forward and claim participation in the reconstruction of their country with knowledge and experience, what have they done to show that they have realised the needs of the country and have intelligently grappled with the problems of the people or of their own female community? What knowledge of affairs have they, which, according to Mr. D. C. Ghose, is the best passport to a political existence? And, Sir, to use the favourite phrase of this House, used in much lesser measure yesterday and the day before, I challenge contradiction. We want no seers, no inspirers, no divorcees from hard facts, we want knowledge and experience and a will to face hard facts. Perhaps some of us wait for the phenomenon of militancy to manifest itself among the women as a sign that they found their true freedom, perhaps we wait for the day when the supplicants at our doors will speak with a voice of thunder. Who is it, Sir, that refuses to emancipate them, who is that wishes to keep them uneducated, who is it that refuses to make them helpmates, who is it that denies them God's pure light and air, who is it that wishes to oppress them?—let the women come forward and show that they are willing to help, that can help, and cease speaking, each one for the whole woman race. Surely there is some lack of proportion, surely it speaks ill of their sense of perspective if they think that the vote will give them all, if they think that the adjudgment between the claims of rival candidates, so often regulated by accident, influence and personal prejudices, will teach them to take interest in the problems of the day. By the vote we cannot abolish the *purdah*, by the vote we cannot remove prejudices, by the vote you cannot turn Fourth standard girls into graduates, by the vote you cannot remedy the brutality of the social customs that have stunted the growth of freedom both in man and woman. Let us drop the grandiose cant, the unadulterated piffle, in talking of education, enlightenment, emancipation, freedom, etc., in connection with the conferring of the vote. Bombay and Madras are no parallel. We have dared to go against the dictates of these provinces before, and I daresay we can do it again. There is an enormous difference between the womankind here and there; those who have been to the various provinces can see it at a glance. I would, therefore, Sir, request the women of Bengal, or such of them who take an interest in the conferring of the vote, to have patience for the next ten years, when the fate of India trembles in the balance, and in the meantime show by honesty of work and honesty of intellect that they and their helpers are ready to do something constructive in the cause of womenkind, and are not too glib with threats and intimidation and vapid outpourings that make them ridiculous in the eyes of the people and damage the cause they espouse. Let them exercise their generous and violent enthusiasm in support of a cause that is worthy of their impulse, and not bertray their childishness in a paroxysm of

fury. Within these ten years, Sir, let them try to alleviate the sufferings of their sisters doomed to untold misery by ridiculous customs, let them have a platform of social reform and progress to stand upon, and then we ourselves, Sir, on humble and bended knees shall offer to them the poor gift of a vote. There is, however, one cogent argument in favour of conferring the grant. Property qualification is impersonal, so why should women be left out of it, considering that they are neither insane, nor infants, though they are naturally piqued by the happy cynicism of the law that has grouped all disabled people together. But when one realises that this will embrace only a few—if we exclude those women who hold property qualifications in their own right and by their own earnings—and we see no reason why we should exclude them, for admittedly property qualification is impersonal, and we see no reason why we should shirk the idea of the premier danseuse of Bengal occupying one of the responsible chairs in this House, for admittedly property qualification is impersonal—and let it be known that once the principle is accepted, there is no room for committees, or restrictions, or opinions or details, and when one further realises that there are many who carry on the good work of civilisation, carry on the good work of political and social enlightenment without caring to exercise the vote, when one realises that it will affect and exercise only a few, that few will care to take advantage of it, that it may, who knows, superadd to the political conflict a bitter domestic conflict, it is perhaps just as well that we should wait for the women of Bengal to show signs of resuscitation, rather than by means of artificial methods galvanise them into a puppet show.

Professor S. C. MUKHERJI: The community which I have the honour to represent is completely in favour of granting franchise to our women. The Indian Christian Association, Bengal, which is the representative Association of that community, grants full membership to ladies. In all matters we have deliberated together and have not suffered thereby in the least. In certain directions our gain has been considerable. Our ladies do not allow us to talk too much: when we grow prolix they grow impatient. When we begin to talk nonsense they begin to smile and we resume our seats. Our ladies are making a substantial contribution towards the upbuilding of our communal life. That has been our experience as a community.

Now to look at the question from general standpoints. Will the grant of this privilege really prove a disruptive and a disintegrating factor in our home life? If it does, it is surely a very serious matter. In that case we ought not to grant any franchise to our women, whether they are educated or not from the University standpoint, because a home is a home it does not matter—who the mistress of the home is—whether she is a University lady or one who did not have any University education at all. Certainly, we do not mean to say

that our educated ladies have got no homes to look after. If that be the considered judgment of this Council let us say so frankly and act according to our honest conviction. A partial application of this principle is utterly inconsistent. So far as I am personally concerned my honest conviction is that the grant of franchise will not result in the breaking up of our homes.

Is there any other ground on which we can deny them this privilege? Are they in any way inferior to us? No one has suggested that. They have brains as much as we have, sometimes more than we have. They possess sound instinct, good judgment and a greater persuasive force. The recent conversion of Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea is an illustration in point. Sir Surendra Nath was opposed to women franchise at first.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: I rise to a point of order. I explained the circumstances under which my conversion had been effected.

Professor S. C. MUKHERJI: I am not casting any reflection. It is a great thing he has done. My hon'ble friend has misunderstood me. Sir Surendra Nath was opposed to women's franchise but he was converted the other day by a deputation of ladies. I sincerely congratulate him on his recent conversion.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: May I offer a personal explanation. The deputation did not convert me. I gave a cautious answer. I said I would sympathetically consider the whole situation without committing myself ons way or the other.

Professor S. C. MUKHERJI: It has been suggested that the majority of our women have no vital interest in the question. In fact they are totally ignorant of it. Well, that applies to the majority of our male voters. There are thousands and thousands of them who do not really know what the Reforms are. We have given them franchise and are getting them gradually trained in responsible self-government, the minority for the time being guiding the majority. This will exactly be the case with our women.

Some of us think that the granting of franchise will interfere with the social customs that prevail in the orthodox sections of the Hindu and Muhammadan communities. It will be a very serious thing if it does. We must respect these customs, but I do not see how the granting of franchise will in any way interfere with such social customs. There is absolutely no element of compulsion here. This is purely optional whether they exercise their right or not. What is then the secret of this opposition? There is, it seems to me, a lurking suspicion somewhere in the sub-conscious region that man is the lord of creation, that woman is born to serve and to obey. Yes, the woman is to serve her whole life, her life is a life of service, a life of ministering; but

what right have we to put barriers and obstacles in her sphere of service. What right have we, may I ask in the name of humanity, to keep her down and to deny what is nothing but her birthright? Sir Surendra Nath wanted to stand on expediency. Sir, it is not a case of expediency, it is a case of sheer justice and fairness, it is a case of equity. We have no right absolutely to stand in the way of women and to deny them that privilege which God has endowed them with.

Mr. KRISHNA CHANDRA RAY CHAUDHURI: I perfectly agree with Sir Surendra Nath that it is wise, it is prudent, it is expedient to grant votes to women. Socialism which is only an advanced form of democracy demands that franchise should be given to women. The advocates of socialism, men and women, were the foremost to associate with the woman suffrage movement. The economic aspect of the votes for women appealed to them strongly. The condition under which the women wage-earners work were found in many cases appalling. Long hours, paltry wages and other sex disqualifications have been tackled seriously by the enfranchised women of the West. Indian working women suffer from their present low economic position. Our women are expected to tackle these problems of their own sex. Enfranchised Bengali women will undoubtedly help in the elimination of the zenana system, will compel selfish men to send girls to schools, to make no demand for dowry, raise marriageable age, and abolish man-made and one-sided law of inheritance and Kulinism. In fact woman suffrage will usher a new era of freedom, self-respect and self-help for both men and women.

The success of the Dominion Government, which we are rightly claiming and which is bound to come, will depend a good deal on the social, economic and moral status of our women in future. I have great pleasure in supporting Mr. Bose's resolution.

Maulvi A. H. M. WAZIR ALI: As the question has been fully discussed, I propose that the question be now put.

The motion was put to vote and lost.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: I congratulate my friend, Mr. S. M. Bose, for his resolution, because I know that he has brought it forward, not from a desire to earn cheap chivalry, nor as a result of the glamour of metropolitan life, nor from a fear of the putrid eggs, which seem to have so much enraged the Kumar, but to vindicate a principle—a principle whose recognition is long overdue.

There has been a great deal of talk about sympathy for the cause since yesterday; but, there is no question of sympathy in this matter. It is a question of justice. Is the cause just? If so, you have no right to go against it. If it is not just, nobody wants your sympathy. When I heard some of the opposition speakers preface their speeches yesterday with loud protestations of sympathy and friendliness, I

thought it was time to grow suspicious. And in the end, I found I was in the right. The question really resolves itself into two parts:—first, are women fit to have the vote? and, secondly, is it expedient and practical to give them this right?

To take the first question first, are they fit to have the vote? With this question, arises another question. Who is the fittest to judge the matter? They or the menfolk. The British Government thinks that the Indian men are not yet fit for self-government. Now, are we, Indian men, to take a leaf out of the British Government and declare in a high and mighty tone tone—with the same arrogant pretension to superior wisdom—that the Indian women are not fit to have the vote? For good or for evil, the menfolk have got the power in their hands and they have made the law to decide what is good for women. The women have obeyed. Perhaps, they have sometimes felt the injustice of some of the rules framed by men, yet they have obeyed. But now, the times are changing—a new spirit is abroad—new problems are springing up, which we can no longer ignore. Women are taking a greater and more useful share in the social and political life of the country than before. Can we in all fairness shut our eyes to these conditions?

Why is it that women are regarded as unfit for politics? I have heard it argued that woman has no political instinct. Sir, I do not know what political instinct is. I do not know how much of this commodity is possessed by all the members of this Council; but this much I know, that in the eventful days of Plassey, when the future history of India was being written in letters of blood, it was a woman —Rani Bhavani of sacred memory—who showed the greatest political instinct. Her statesmanship, her strength of mind, her boldness and above all, her "valiant stand against tyranny"—which is the essence of all politics—remain for ever a sacred thing. There were many men—politicians in those dark days—but the courage shown by this woman in sending a bold letter of protest to the Nawab will for ever remain the most memorable document of dignified protest and inordinate strength of will. Maharani Sarnomay's name has already been mentioned. It is no use multiplying names. In the villages of Bengal, even to-day, you will always find lady zamindars managing their estates with a vigour of power that may arouse the envy of many a man. The late Jahnavi Chaudharani of Santosh, Begum Sahiba Faizennessa Chaudharani of Comilla are some of the bright examples. In almost every family, you will find women able to give sound advice regarding the management of estates. If they can do this so admirably, how can it be seriously argued that they cannot understand the affairs of the State which is but a glorified edition of smaller estates? When I know that my dhobi, my barber, even my sweeper has a vote, and yet my neighbour, the lady zamindar, cannot exercise the right. I have to hang down my head in shame.

It is unfortunate that the present position of women in Bengal has made many people think that their condition was ever such. Bengal has passed through many dark ages, but history is very clear in showing that in the Buddhistic and early Hindu days and even in Muhammadan days, women took a much more prominent and active position in the affairs of the society and of the State. Even in these days, the part played by women is not inconsiderable. The service done to the political life of Bengal by her daughters, like Swarna Kumari Debi, Sarala Debi and Sarojini Naidu, may be recorded in letters of gold. They have helped to mould political thought. All India sanctioned the right of women to take part in politics by electing Mrs. Besant to the presidential seat of the Indian National Congress—the greatest position of honour in the country. Mahatma Gandhi can speak from experience, what response the women of Bengal have made to his call. In the memorable days of the partition agitation, we know what splendid service the women of Bengal did towards the common cause. He know how their splendid response in tying the sacred bond of *Rakhi*, inspired the youth of the country. Those, who have the memory of those days, cannot lightly ridicule the movement by the cheap satire of coining words like *Sahabhotini*. In Japan, politics is a religion and unless we make our politics a *dharma*, we shall for ever remain in the dark. If we know how to interpret the word *Sahadharmini*, there will not be any need of coining cheap phrases, there will not be any need of casting stones at Mahatma Gandhi. The days of declaring women unfit are gone. We must face the situation, let us face it honestly and boldly.

In this country, in spite of the *purdah*, women have had greater rights and privileges as regards property, than her sisters in other countries, than even in England. The Married Woman's Property Act is a very recent matter in progressive England, whereas the women of Bengal have had this right for a long time. Are we going to refuse them this right of voting which is possessed by the women of England? Then again, I have heard it seriously argued that woman is not fit for politics, because she is appealed through her heart, rather than through her brains—that she is guided by instinct rather than by reason. I do not believe in this, but taking for granted that this view is correct, what harm can there be in giving them the vote? If she can decide things more easily by instinct, so much the better. If she is guided by her heart, I welcome the idea. The element of dry reasoning is much too evident in the present day administration. It is time that more heart was infused into the dry bones of the bureaucracy.

I cannot understand the cry that has been raised to limit the franchise to those that have come into contact with the University. This may be natural for the University member to suggest. But, I say without fear of contradiction, that there are hundreds of other and possibly better methods of education than coming in contact with this

University. The University certificate is but the guinea stamp, the true political education that comes from the hard experience of life is the real gold.

In whatever way we may look at it, we cannot call her unfit, unless, of course, in order to give our own selves a complacent satisfaction that we, men, are superior beings.

Let me now come to the question of expediency and practicability.

It has been argued that the true sphere of the woman is her home. I suppose, by analogy, this ought to imply that the true sphere of the man is his office of profession or business. Then, who is to take part in politics? I cannot understand why woman cannot be expected to take as much interest in politics after her day's work at home, as a man can, after his day's work in office. If this argument is to be followed, we cannot have anything but professional politicians, people whose only business would be politics. Then the franchise to men must be narrowed down to very few persons indeed.

I am extremely pained to find that some members have raised the bugbear of a certain class of women. Sir, the matter is so delicate, that a full discussion of the subject is sure to be unpalatable and undignified. Have not Bombay and Madras faced this problem? Have they shirked this? Have you been able to keep out the undesirable men—the men of easy virtue? I am not keen on giving these women votes, but as the law stands, what can be done? In the eyes of the law, in the British dominions, there is no prostitute. How can you draw a line of legal demarcation? I will not go into this unseemly discussion, but I will say this: if the women of easy virtue have any desire to interfere in politics, can you prevent them from doing so even now that they have no vote? As long as there are men of easy virtue in this world, they will certainly be influenced by this class of women, even in the matter of the use of their votes. Cleopatra was not a Roman citizen, she had no privileges of Roman citizenship, but she was able to change the history of Rome more effectively than any citizen of Rome. It is not safe to raise a standard of virtue in this question. If you are really serious, try for their uplift rather than refuse the women the vote.

We have heard it loudly expressed from several sections of this House, that he who pays the piper must call the tune. We have also heard it shouted from the house tops that, where there is no representation, there must be no taxation. If taxation is the criterion of representation, is this rule to be applied in the case of men only? We are generous enough to accept taxes from women, but when they ask for a share in the voice to say how the money is to be spent, we take the bureaucrat's mighty tone, and say: "Oh, you do not understand these matters, look cheerful and pay: we will take care of your money."

Are we Indians going to be greater autocrats than this great bureaucracy? The number of women who pay taxes in their name, is not very large: why should they be denied this preliminary right?

Women are permitted to hold shares and vote in Joint Stock Companies and Co-operative Banks. We have not heard of any practical difficulty there. Why should there be a difficulty here?

What after all is the meaning of this resolution? It is only a permissive resolution. We only take away their disabilities from voting. We do not compel them to vote. If they have the wish, if they like to join the turmoil of political life, let them come. We have no right to prevent them.

If you really believe that the right to vote is a good thing, do not hesitate to give it to them. They will cherish it; and their presence will take away much from the narrowness and dry atmosphere of politics. Let not the bugbear of practical difficulty make cowards of us.

Mr. SYED ERFAN ALI: In supporting the resolution moved by Mr. S. M. Bose, I desire to point out that the tenets of Islam which is one of the prominent religions in the three continents of the old world, held very high the liberties and status of woman. The Prophet of Islam says: "Paradise is at the foot of the mother." I do not know that any other religion has offered the same liberty and privileges to woman. We all know the position of woman under the early Romans, Greeks, Persians, Babylonians and Assyrians. We know as well of woman under ancient Hebrews and Christians. It is Islam which can claim and can claim rightly and very strongly to have established the equality of rights and privileges between the sexes as a cognizable factor from the very day of its foundation. A passage from the Koran will give a very emphatic expression of the idea how just the equal attention was paid to both the sexes under Islam. Says the Holy Authority:—

> Verily, the Muslims, men and women, and the faithful, men and women, and the devout, men and women, and the truthful, men and women, and the patient, men and women, and the humble, men and women, and the charitable, men and women, and the fasting, men and women, and those who preserve their modesty, of men and women, and those who remember God much, of men and women, God has prepared for them pardon and a great reward.

Under Islam, Sir, woman has not only equal rights and liberties, but she always keeps her individuality as a distinct factor in all her relations as a mother, a sister, a wife, a cousin, or a daughter, and she inherits and exerts her rights equally with those of a man of her status. The history of the Saracens will reveal a great deal more. The Saracenic women took part in war and in public affairs as judges, professors, lecturers, doctors, and rulers. We need not go so far back to hunt examples out in different countries to know all what they did in different

times. Even in India we find a large number of Moslem ladies undertaking serious responsibility in the administration of the country, names of Nur Jahan, Rezia and Mumtaj Mohul are only too well known. Even in the present days you will find a large number of Moslem ladies managing their zamindari affairs in a very creditable way. In conclusion, I should like to remind you that the Holy Prophet of Islam enforced, as one of the essential teachings of his creed, "respect for women," and his followers in their love and reverence for his celebrated daughter proclaimed her "the Lady of the Paradise," as the representative of her sex. "Our Lady of Light" is the embodiment of all that is divine in womanhood, of all that is pure and true and holy in her sex, the noblest ideal of human conception. And she has been followed by a long succession of women, who have consecrated their sex by their virtues. Who has not heard of the saintly Rabia and a thousand others, her equals? Since there is communal representation, if franchise is granted to women it will not affect in any way the Moslem interest. A different set of rules from those which regulate the voting now will of course have to be especially framed for the women voters so that there may not be any interference with the *purdah* system.

Babu BIJOY PROSAD SINGH ROY: In placing this resolution before the Council, Mr. S. M. Bose certainly deserves the gratitude not only of the educated and enlightened ladies of Bengal but of the whole educated community of the country. His is a noble cause and nobody can doubt or dispute the great principle which underlies the resolution. But politics must always be guided by prudence, and I think it is prudence or diplomacy, whatever you may call it, which compelled even our own Minister the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath to stand against giving franchise to women, in the Southborough Committee. Politics must take prudence as its guide, and prudence must not be swayed either by chivalry or look at things through a glass of romance. This resolution, I venture to submit, in spite of its merits, is premature and uncalled for. It is premature because it rather anticipates things as they may be in future when our ladies are free from the *purdah*. It advocates no reform to suit the existing state of affairs. I call it uncalled for, because the whole country, except a certain section of the commnuity, I mean the Brahmo and the Indian Christian community, have taken no interest in this agitation. The Calcutta public is perfectly indifferent to the fate of this resolution in this Council. This apathy is not the characteristic attitude of the citizens of Calcutta. There are instances when the citizens of Calcutta took considerable interest in the debate of political measures in the Legislative Councils; for instance I beg to refer to the discussion of Mr. Bose's Marriage Bill in the Indian Legislative Council a few years ago. This question came before the Southborough Committee and that august body was compelled to shelve it on account of the practical difficulties in the way of our

ladies in recording their votes. However anxious we may be to admit ladies to the same political privileges we enjoy, we must not forget these practical difficulties. A handful of Brahmo or Indian Christian ladies may attend the polling station to record their votes, but what of the vast majority of their Hindu and Muhammadan sisters in the mufassal? No amount of political zeal would compel them to do so. This is the state of affairs, and we must deplore them. These are the defects, and we cannot surmount them in a short time. In the landholders' constituency the lady zamindars, many of whom are well-educated and intelligent, are not given this privilege. The resolution of Mr. Bose asks for provision to be made to allow every facility to our ladies to record their votes in a manner which would be consistent with their habits and customs. I doubt whether that would be practically possible. There are women of ill-fame in cities like Calcutta, and who will believe in their honesty? I should not be astonished, if after the next election, instead of the worthy representatives of the citizens of Calcutta, some of the notorious cocaine smugglers of the city would come and adorn the seats in this Chamber, if this resolution is accepted by this Council. Moreover, the orthodox community of Calcutta and the people of the mufassal, whom we have the honour to represent in this Council, have not been consulted on the question. It is a question of supreme importance to the public in which the customs of the people are at stake and my submission to the House is that the House would oppose this resolution, but accept the amendment of Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray.

With these few words, I beg to oppose the original motion of Mr. Bose, and to support the amendment suggested by my hon'ble friend the Kumar.

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: I am thankful to you, Sir, for having called upon me to speak on this momentous question. I thought that by the time we would be asked to speak, the motion for closure would be carried. Fortunately, that has not been the case. Whatever the fate of the resolution or the amendment might be, it is necessary that the question should be thoroughly discussed.

For centuries and ages, the greatest injustice has been done to women by men who claim a kind of superiority, which is not warranted by science or by experience—a claim of mental and moral superiority; and I was surprised to find that some members of this Council went to the extent of saying that woman's mental calibre is not of the same kind as that of man's. But it has been said by my friend, Babu Surendra Nath Mullick, that up till now we have not heard that the soul has any sex.

The subjection of women and slavery are the two greatest blots upon human civilization, proclaiming the dominance of brute or physical force over the spiritual. The time has come when this blot should be

removed outright, and proper places assigned to our sisters and mothers in the social economy. The old ideas about natural inferiority have to be abandoned, and the time-worn and hackneyed arguments for denying women their rights and privileges, to which they are justly entitled, should also be abandoned. Humanity does not mean "men" alone to the exclusion of "women." If we have to improve humanity, we have to raise women in status and to give them their natural places in the social economy. It was remarked by some members of this Council in the lobby, that the privilege which our sisters in the West secured after years of struggle by the suffragist movement, should not be conceded so easily. But my friends forget that the battles of humanity and of civilisation are fought in one land, and the fruits of them are enjoyed by the people all over the world. Then again, it has been said that this extension of the franchise to women in India will affect very few of them, as they have little social status, no separate property, and as most of them live in seclusion. This is no argument. It is tantamount to the perpetuation of one wrong by reference to another. Raise the social status of women by all means, and, if you are so disposed, tear off the *purdah* and give the women their rightful places. This extension of the franchise is indeed a very small matter; but let us be generous and just in small things—greater things will follow.

It has been said that the women themselves do not ask for the privilege, besides a handful of educated women of Calcutta, and an argument has been put forward whether they are really anxious for the franchise. There is no doubt that the educated, the politically-minded few, ask for the privileges and it is only fair and proper that our educated sisters should have their rights and privileges.

The next argument that has been brought against the resolution is that if this franchise is given, it will introduce social disorder. But I do not think that there is any chance of such disorder. This is the first step towards female emancipation. You want female emancipation; do you expect to make any progress in this direction unless you ask your mothers, your sisters, your wives to assist you?

Another argument that has been brought forward against this resolution is that we do not know where we stand in regard to privileges to women, and so it is necessary to ascertain by the formation of a Committee the facts and figures as to how many women will be enfranchised by this measure. But this is a matter of detail and does not affect the main question. It seems to me we will be wanting in our duty if we fail to pass this resolution.

Practical difficulties have been brought forward in the shape of social customs and habits which cannot be changed in a single day; anomalies owing to property qualifications for exercising the franchise; women's position under the existing Hindu and Muhammadan laws; the limited number of our sisters that may be called upon to take advantage of the privilege; and the danger of enfranchising a larger number

of women of easy virtue are, no doubt, many. But we should not be scared away by them. It is only by grappling with difficulties that we gain in strength. No change is possible without some kind of struggle. But that should be no reason for crying "halt" in our onward march. The spirit of freedom is abroad. We, who have so long been deaf, are now hearing the great bugle-call to fall in, and if we mean to win freedom's battle, we are bound to take our sisters as comrades in arms. Educate your sisters and mothers, bring them up into your line and present a united front to all the forces of reaction and darkness and your success is assured. The extension of the franchise is not only a step in education or in politics but it is a stride towards the advancement of humanity. I think the principle of enfranchising women should be accepted. The details should be worked out by the Government. If this House recommends that the franchise should be extended to women, Government should frame such rules and regulations, consistent with our existing habits and customs, as would enable all our women to take advantage of the franchise.

With these words, I beg to support the resolution moved by my friend Mr. S. M. Bose.

Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur: I move that the question be now put.

The PRESIDENT: I do not think any useful purpose would be served by putting the clousure motion before the House now. There are many speakers yet.

Mr. S. M. ALEY: I have heard a good deal in support as well as against the resolution moved by my hon'ble friend Mr. S. M. Bose. I do not want to dilate on any points which have been put forward either in favour of or against it, but I want to ask this Council one simple question as to what is the duty of the legislators in making laws and whether the laws they make should not be for the benefit of the masses. In case this resolution as it stands or the amendment suggested by others be passed, what will be the result and who will be benefited by it? I say a very microscopic minority alone will get the benefit of it. The masses will never be able to take advantage of this law. Besides the masses of our womenfolk are not clamouring for this privilege; it is only a certain section of the Hindu, Brahmo and Indian Christian communities (whose number is very small) who have received English education and have taken to Western ways that are eager to get this right and who alone will enjoy it. Let our womenfolk first take to education and to humanitarian work for the good of their own kind and when they are sufficiently advanced, then, and then only, they should ask for this privilege. With these few words, I strongly oppose the resolution.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I move that the question be now put.

The motion that the question be put was put and lost.

Rai UPENDRA LAL RAY Bahadur: I would like to say a few words on this subject. Before doing so, I would like to mention that it is a matter for surprise to us that some members of this Council were attempting to close this debate although they knew fully well that there were other speakers who wanted to speak on the subject. The resolution of Mr. S. M. Bose suggests that the sex disqualification for registration on the electoral rolls be removed entirely, whereas the two amendments of Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur and Babu Annada Charan Dutta, respectively, aim at limiting the franchise to women possessing certain educational qualifications; and the last of the amendments moved by Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray suggests that the question be referred to a representative committee of non-official men and women.

There is a feeling both in this House and outside that a reference of a matter to a committee amounts to shelving it indefinitely. If the principle be accepted, I fail to understand why we should adopt this course which is contrary to the Act of 1919. It is true that if Mr. Bose's suggestions are accepted, the matter will be taken up by Government who, under the Act, will frame the regulations. If, on the other hand, the Kumar Bahadur does not at heart agree to the extension of the franchise he should have said so in plain terms; and instead of moving an amendment he should have opposed the resolution. The very fact that he suggests that the committee should be composed of men and women indicates that he accepts the principle of extending the franchise to women. Much has been said by previous speakers on this very important subject. In some other parts of India the principle has been recognised and there is no reason why Bengal which claims to be the premier presidency in India should lag behind. She has produced many illustrious women who, in point of education, intelligence and foresight, can claim to be in no way inferior to men who enjoy the privilege only because they happen to belong to the stronger sex.

We are living in a land of progress and if in our selfishness we fail to see the equality of our sisters and daughters, posterity will certainly cry shame on us.

Extension of the franchise will give a healthy stimulus to female education, the necessity for which, I am sure, is recognised by all. If we, in this House, stand in the way of imparting education to the womanhood of Bengal, shall we not be marked for ever as a lot of biassed and selfish legislators like the Brahmins of the old ages who thought it fit to monopolise certain privileges even in matters educational to their own community? Even in those days there existed in

India women whose intelligence and erudition were far above those of the average man then living.

Difficulties there will undoubtedly be, in the matter of fixing the standards of qualification; but these are details which should be left to the framers of the rules, if the resolution is carried.

With these observations, I have much pleasure in supporting the resolution moved by Mr. S. M. Bose.

Babu NALINI NATH ROY: No country in the world developed a higher conception of womanhood than India—the India which gave birth to the rudiments of civilisation; and in few countries of the world the lot of woman has been rendered more pitiable than in this very land of *Bharat*. No country in the world has produced a higher type of womanhood than India, and in few countries of the world women have been treated with less justice than here.

It is now time—high time, I should say—to make up for past misdeeds; it is high time to make amends, to right the wrongs that have been inflicted; the selfishness of the stronger section of the population that has been allowed to run riot in this sacred land of ours, must now be cast away and full justice and reparation must be done to those who are inferior to us in brute force only, but are ten times superior to us in the true qualities of humanity. It is a very hopeful sign of the times, that meetings are being held in almost every district of Bengal and the women of the country, who have lived and suffered for centuries without complaining, are now coming forward to claim their due before the bar of humanity.

Without being too serious, I would ask, why should we hesitate to give the right to vote to women? Have not they got the right to rule and do they not actually exercise this right of ruling to its utmost extent in every household?

As we, mere men, have given up the right to rule and manage our own homes, why should we object to giving the ladies a mere right to vote?

I look forward to the day when, not only the ladies will vote, but when we shall be enabled to make over the wretched business of politics and rulership entirely to them, and betaken ourselves to pursuits more beneficial, more suited to our brutish natures. I hold that the proper function of man is not to rule, not to quarrel with fellowmen but to try to rule nature to fight with the forces of nature and make them yield-up their treasures for the service of humanity.

The management of homes, management of the domestic arrangements of nations should be left more and more to the care of women. What relief! What a gain! When will we be able to shake off the dust of politics with its attendant petty selfishness, its jealousies and heartburnings, its deception and subterfuges entirely from us? Of

course, the happy consummation of these happy events is yet a matter of pious hope, but I would not hesitate to make a beginning, even in this land of malaria and marshes. I fully believe politics and political morality will be much safer in the hands of our ladies than in our own.

The other day, I had the pleasure of talking to a learned Pandit about this matter. He gave me definitely to understand that this measure is the beginning of the end: Society will go to rack and ruin and the priceless old civilisation of our country, that has been built up after centuries of toil will receive its death blow. Now the curses of this learned Pandit are, I think, the best proof of justice and fairness of women franchise. For the last 150 years most of these Pandits have cursed almost everything that goes towards rebuilding Indian society on right lines. So when I heard him condemning women franchise with all his sincerity and earnestness, I thought that nothing could be stronger of the justice of this measure than this condemnation. When I told him that he should prepare himself for seeing this measure passed he asked me, whether it is really true that Hindu members will vote for it. I assured him that they will. He then consoled himself with the idea, that whatever Hindus may do, our Muhammadan members will not allow such a revolutionary thing to pass. But what I expect is that this gentleman has reckoned without his hest and will find to his discomfiture that, in this measure of giving the vote to the women, Hindus and Muhammadans will join hands together. For is it not the Islamic civilisation which conferred the right to property to women fourteen centuries ago, when the rest of the world considered their womenfolk almost in the light of goods and chatels? And will Islam now stand in the way of doing full justice to the status of the womankind?

In conclusion, I would say that the call for women franchise does not come merely from meetings and associations but from the depth of futurity itself, which, we would be wise not to ignore.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: I agree with the mover of the original resolution that the women should be allowed to vote. The local authorities enforce women just as men to pay rates and taxes and if they fail to pay, their properties are attached and, therefore, it is right and just that the women having property should be allowed to vote. But I find some difficulties. I am of opinion that though they should be allowed to vote they should not vote directly, but they should be allowed to vote through proxies. The *purdahnashin* system stands in the way. Most of our women follow the *purdahnashin* system and most of them are illiterate and some are of ill-fame and it would be very difficult to identify them at the polling station. These are the reasons for which, though I admit that they should be allowed to vote, they

should not be allowed to vote directly. It has been said that the Bombay and Madras Legislative Councils have allowed franchise to women, but I beg to submit that in those presidencies the women do not follow the *purdahnashin* system as in Bengal [BABU SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: "Question."] I think that they may be allowed to vote through their legal guardians, through their husbands, through their fathers and their managers just as, under the Calcutta Municipal Act, the Joint Stock Companies are allowed to vote through their agents or managers. Similarly, if women are allowed to vote, they should be allowed to vote through proxies. I must, however, say that in the case of lady-graduates or even those who have passed the Matriculation Examination or similar examinations they may be allowed to vote directly, but in the case of other women though they may have property qualification they should not be allowed to vote directly on the grounds which I have just stated. It appears from the Franchise Committee's Report which is dated February, 1919—the Committee which went carefully through the representations of the representatives of the women and through the representations of the local Governments—that they strongly opposed to grant franchise to women at present. They have stated that several political associations specially in Bombay and Madras urged the same cause, but during the early examination of the representatives they found reason to believe that female suffrage——

The PRESIDENT: I do not think that you need take up the time of the Council in reading from the Franchise Committee's Report.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: It will appear from their report that in their opinion the time has not come when franchise should be given to women and specially in Bengal. I fail to understand what circumstances have changed since then during the last two years that these women should be allowed to vote. I will therefore support the last amendment to refer the matter to a committee and if it is lost then I shall be very glad to support the amendment of Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur, namely, that only lady-graduates or matriculates should be allowed to vote and not others.

The Council was then adjourned for fifteen minutes.

After the adjournment.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: At this fag-end of the day, it is painful for me to rise to inflict a speech on the Council when every one is anxious to go away. As however, the matter is an important one I cannot refuse to take part in the debate. I am extremely sorry that the House is divided hopelessly with conflicting views; but I hope, Sir, that a compromise will be effected. I think the views of all parties should be consulted and we should be allowed time to consider the details. In my opinion we should accept the principle of woman franchise. There are difficulties in the way and the Hon'ble Sir Henry

Wheeler pointed out yesterday the legal difficulties. The strong feeling of the Muhammadan friends against the granting of franchise should be considered, the undesirables should be excluded and I am sure even the ladies who are advocating for getting the franchise are also anxious that the undesirables should not be allowed the privilege. The resolution as it stands has my sympathy, but I do not think it can be taken in its entirety, some modification is necessary, and I know the mover of the resolution is quite willing to do so. The two amendments advocate only a limited franchise The question of woman franchise is not a new one. It was discussed before the Joint Committee of the Parliament. It could not be decided then and time was allowed and it was said that if there was any strong desire on the part of the electors, the matter should be discussed in the Council and whatever should be the effect, action might be taken accordingly. Bombay and Madras have accepted the principle and there is no reason why Bengal should not do the same. But at the same time I must say that Bengal is not Bombay or Madras. I do not admit, Sir, that our women are incapable of taking an intelligent part in our public affairs or questions of public interests. In the household affairs our women, literate or illiterate, reign supreme. In Bengal both Hindu and Muhammadan women have been given the right to exercise ownership of properties. Politics is not a thing in which any special expert knowledge is necessary. One who has got a strong common sense can very well take part in politics. If it is not so, how can we extend the privilege to the illiterate men. If it is the birthright of men it is equally the birthright of women and they should be allowed to take part in the political questions of the day. If we allowed the privilege to the illiterate male members, how can we say, that the females are not capable of exercising it. The Government for a long time resisted our demands on the ground that we were not competent to exercise the new power, but at last it had to yield. Similarly, I do not see any reason why the females should be told "you are incompetent to exercise the power and therefore you are debarred from exercising it." The zenana question is a difficult question, no doubt, but I do not think that it can really stand in the way. I cannot concede that if this privilege is extended to the females, the zenana would be invaded by anybody and everybody. If anything is necessary, it may be done through the husband or son or some other person who has access to the zenana. But I fail to see how the privilege can be extended to the interior parts of the country. The privilege can now be given to the municipal towns where proper arrangements can be made through the females, there being many educated women to take part in the necessary arrangements of a polling station and recording of votes. It would, however, be a very difficult task if the recording is done by house to house visitation and then again, in the interior, it would be impossible to expect the women to go to the polling stations far away from their homes and sometimes it is no less a distance than 10 or 12 miles.

If the voting is to be recorded by sending other persons to the villages the difficulty would be that it would take an enormous amount of time. All these matters will have to be considered as also the objections of the Muhammadan Community. If the privilege be given to the women it will surely give an impetus to the spread of female education. For these reasons, I hope that an amicable arrangement should be arrived at, and I think that the principles underlying the resolution should be accepted with some reservations. If that can be done and I think even now that it can be done, a committee may be appointed to consider and suggest the details. If however that cannot be done even then I hope we should have a committee which would consider what class should be excluded and to whom the privilege should be given and whether it would work through general electorate or special electorate, whether it should be restricted to municipal towns, etc. For these reasons, and with these observations, I express my sympathy with the movement for enfranchising women, but at the same time I suggest some arrangement should be made and all communities should be consulted. I have, therefore, much pleasure in supporting the principle underlying the resolution.

Maulvi MUHAMMAD ABDUL JUBBAR PAHLOWAN: I am sorry that I am not able to support the resolution, which, I understand, many of my colleagues are going to support. Certainly I would have supported it if my religion would have allowed me to do so. And I would not have spoken a word if the resolution had not been of a general nature, *i.e.*, I would have had nothing to say if the question had been a communal one. I know that according to the present rules and regulations of the Parliamentary Joint Committee, the present Bengal electoral rules cannot be changed. Rule 7 may be changed, but that cannot be made communal; so, I request my friends and sisters, who are willing to see the resolution carried, to wait for ten years and try after this period when it may be possible to make it communal. I do not know what the Hindu religion says about it. But I can assure my friends that Islam can never tolerate it. I understand that my sisters inside and outside the Council will put censure upon me for opposing this resolution, but I request them to consider my position as a Muhammadan representative in the Council. I also request them to consider whether I shall obey the dictates of the religion or concede to the request of theirs. However, I regret to say that the cruel *purdah* system has made me accede to the tender request of my sisters and oppose the resolution. One may cite the examples of individuals who allow their females to be present everywhere and to speak with everyone, but that cannot be cited as a religious dictate, *e.g.*, if a Mussalman takes ham which is a forbidden food, may it therefore be said that ham is allowed to be taken by Mussalmans? Moreover, I know many examples of bitter experiences of women emancipation. I challenge every Muhammadan member of this Council to prove otherwise about Muhammadan *purdah*. If any one

hesitates to reply on my words as authoritative, I have nothing to say, but I request them to postpone the resolution for a short period of time and to take the opinion of Muhammadan religious authorities. Sir, what else can I say than this to support my opposition. What is the harm to postpone it for a short period of time? What is the need of such a hurried legislation? With these few words, I strongly oppose the resolution and all amendments to it.

The motion for closure was moved by Maulvi Ekramul Huq which was lost, the voting being 31 on each side.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: I have been called upon to speak on this resolution at the fag-end of the day. I would not try to detain the House very long. I would only say one thing and it is this that quotations from the scriptures have been cited in favour of this resolution by some Muhammadan as also by Hindu speakers; but the question is that this movement is a new one. In no country has it been tried before. It is a new experiment and most probably it is yet too premature to try to start this movement in Bengal. It is no argument that because Bombay and Madras have passed the enfranchisement of women, therefore, Bengal will follow suit. The circumstances in Madras and Bombay are very much different. I do not mean by this that I am opposed to the principle underlying the movement, but the thing is that we did not get time to consult the constituencies which we have the honour to represent in this Council. We should try to gauge the feelings of the country before we can give our consent to this movement. My friends who have been imbibed with the Western ideals might perhaps resent my words, that "East is east and West is west." In England it took a long time—I cannot say the exact number of years—it may be 50 or 60 years before this movement could gain ground there. There is no *purdah* system there and there the women can exercise their right of voting more intelligently than women in India. Whatever may be the reason, we find that our womenfolk are not so much educated as the women of Western countries. Let us first educate our daughters and sisters and in the fulness of time this female franchise would be realised and till then it will be too premature to press for it. Sir, we have heard that a certain class of females have been branded as unfortunates and undesirables. I think they should be treated more compassionately. Their degradation is due to the men——

The PRESIDENT: I do not think that is a point you need dilate upon.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: I mean to say there are men who ought to be disenfranchised. Babu Amulya Dhone Addy has said that direct power of voting should not be given to women. That shows that he is against giving this franchise to women, but he wants that more power should be added to the voting capacity of men. Sir, I

would say another thing. A fresh election for this Council would not take place within another two years and a half. It would be best to ascertain the feelings of the public at large on this important point. I am sure the people of Bengal would be too glad to accord their full support to this movement. But so long as we have not ascertained the feelings of the public, it will not be very wise on the part of the few members who have assembled here to decide the question of such a vital importance to the well-being of the community. Sir, if we decide this question in haste we may have to repent at leisure. The representatives of the Indian Christian community and Anglo-Indian community can very well claim this franchise for women because they have no *purdah* system. With these remarks, I would request the mover of the motion to postpone this resolution for some time to come.

Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: I rise to make the following observations on the resolution. I am against the principle of restricting the women from voting. My opinion is that, with regard to politics, all classes and communities should have the right of voting. We must take the opinion of every section for the matter of managing the affairs of our country, and Government. We have seen many queens reigning ably over their kingdoms during Moslem time. We have also seen Rezia, Nur Jahan and other ladies governing the kingdoms. We have heard of Rani Lakshmi Bai who went to the battlefield to lead her army; and, in later days, of Maharani Sarnomay and others.

Sir, I have every sympathy with the resolution, but at the same time I have doubts about its practicability. The report of the Southborough Committee says that female franchise need not be taken now and we have also heard from the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler that if the resolution is carried Government will have to frame rules. We have heard references to Madras and Bombay who have extended the franchise to women, but I believe women of those provinces are more advanced than our women.

The PRESIDENT: All these matters have been discussed before and it is no use repeating them and as the time is short you should curtail your speech.

Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: With these observations, I accept the principle but to solve the practical difficulties let the matter be decided by a committee.

The PRESIDENT: I want to bring to your notice that there is a very important resolution, No. 64, on the agenda, which stands in the name of Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri. It runs thus:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that a deputation consisting of the Finance Member, one Minister and two non-official

Members of this Council be sent to Simla, as early as possible, to represent to His Excellency the Viceroy the special pecuniary difficulties of Bengal and its claim for special consideration and financial help."

That is a very important motion: if it is taken in its usual turn it will never come up for discussion. The Government of Bengal is sending a deputation to Simla, and, I believe, everyone would wish before that deputation goes to decide this matter, and if they are in favour of sending a deputation, that deputation should go with the Members of Government. I would therefore like, unless there is any objection, to take this motion on Monday immediately after the motion which is now under discussion. Is there any objection to this?

The Council agreed to the proposal.

Adjournment.

The Council then adjourned till Monday, the 5th September, 1921, at 3 P.M. at the Town Hall, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Monday the 5th September, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers and 111 nominated and elected members.

Starred Questions

(to which oral answers were given).

Vice-Chancellor, Dacca University.

***XXXVI. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the present Vice-Chancellor of the Dacca University is receiving a salary of Rs. 4,000 a month?

(*b*) What were the reasons which led the Government to appoint a Vice-Chancellor for the Dacca University on a high salary?

(*c*) What was the salary he received immediately before his present appointment?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be further pleased to state what total amount of money, if any, was paid to him from the Government treasury for work done in England for the Dacca University, prior to his actual appointment as its Vice-Chancellor?

(*e*) If any amount was paid for any such work, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the nature and amount of the work so performed?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter): (*a*) It is a fact.

(*b*) The appointment was made by the Government of India, which fixed the salary commensurately with the duties, responsibilities and dignity of the appointment. This salary was proposed by the Calcutta University Commission.

(*c*) Government are not in possession of this information.

(*d*) and (*e*) A sum of Rs. 4,297-12 has been paid, viz., Rs. 4,000 as honorarium and Rs. 297-12 expenses for clerical assistance. The Vice-Chancellor was occupied for some three months in England in attending selection committees, interviewing candidates and in other work preliminary to the establishment of the University.

Travelling allowance of sub-inspectors of police.

*XXXVII. **Babu BIJOY PROSAD SINGH ROY:** (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state whether all Government officers, drawing a salary of over Rs. 100, are considered as second class officers; and whether they are entitled under the Civil Service Regulations to draw second class travelling allowance?

(b) Do the sub-inspectors of police, Bengal, drawing salaries of over Rs. 100, receive travelling allowance according to the above rule?

(c) If the answer to (b) is in the negative, will the Hon'ble the Member in charge be pleased to state, the reasons for this differential treatment?

MEMBER in charge of POLICE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (a) Yes.

(b) and (c) No; the general question of raising the limit of pay for the purposes of the classification of officers under the Civil Service Regulations is under consideration. Meanwhile orders were issued that sub-inspectors of police should continue to rank as third class officers, and should not be classified as second class officers and draw higher travelling allowance rates merely because their revised scale of pay exceeded Rs. 100.

Witness shed at Gaibandha Courts.

*XXXVIII. **Maulvi HAMID-UD-DIN KHAN:** (a) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department aware that there is no witness shed attached to Gaibandha (Rangpur) Courts (Civil and Criminal) and that the public are greatly inconvenienced thereby?

(b) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps to remove this grievance at an early date?

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): (a) and (b) Government are aware that there are no witness sheds attached to the Court (Civil and Criminal) at Gaibandha. Administrative approval has been accorded to the construction of a witness shed for the Civil Court. As regards the Criminal Court, such a shed is not considered necessary as there is fair sitting accommodation in the verandah of the Court which is utilised by the witnesses, and if another verandah be added on the western side, as has been proposed, there will be more than sufficient accommodation.

Unstarred Questions

(answers to which were laid on the table).

Officers of the Dacca University.

216. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to lay on the table a complete list of all the appointments made by the Dacca University authorities, specifying—

(*i*) the names of the officers and teachers appointed,

(*ii*) their academic qualifications,

(*iii*) their respective posts and salaries, and

(*iv*) their previous occupations with their salaries and grades, if any?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state what is the total number of students who have taken admission in the Dacca University and the number of students in each class, as also the number of stipends offered to students?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether it is a fact that it has been estimated that the Dacca University is going to cost in the current year more than what was provided for it in the budget?

(*d*) If so, what will be the approximate deficit?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*), (*i*), (*ii*), (*iii*) and (*iv*) Reference may be made to the reply on the 31st August last to unstarred question No. 189 asked by Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur.

(*b*) Up to 24th August, 1921, the number was 734. A sum of Rs. 10,000 has been provided for scholarships and stipends during the current year.

(*c*) It is not a fact.

(*d*) The question does not arise.

Post-graduate staff of the Calcutta University.

217. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state how many members of the post-graduate staff of the Calcutta University are attached to the Government colleges?

(*b*) How much does the University pay for the remuneration of these teachers?

(*c*) How many of these teachers belong to the Presidency College, and what amount is paid by the University for these teachers?

(*d*) Is it a fact that the teachers of the Presidency College are not allowed to draw their honoraria for post-graduate work?

(*e*) Is it a fact that the teachers of the other Government colleges are allowed to draw the same?

(*f*) If so, what is the reason for this differential treatment?

(*g*) Did the Governing Body of the Presidency College recommend that the teachers should receive their honoraria?

(*h*) Are the Government reconsidering the case of the Presidency College teachers?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) During the academic session of 1919-20, 41 officers attached to Government colleges worked as post-graduate lecturers.

(*b*) For the services of those 41 officers Calcutta University paid Rs. 43,660-6-11.

(*c*) During the academic session of 1919-20, 31 officers of Presidency College worked as University lecturers in the Post-graduate Department. The University paid Rs. 33,460-6-11 to Government for their services as post-graduate lecturers.

(*d*) Yes.

(*e*) Yes.

(*f*) The Presidency College was affiliated in M.A. and M.Sc. in most subjects before the present post-graduate arrangements were introduced, and its staff had been appointed to meet the requirements of the college in this respect. The new arrangements threw no extra work upon them, as post-graduate teaching was already part of their duties, for which they are paid by Government. The situation is different with regard to other Government colleges, which had no M.A. or M.Sc. affiliation: the members of their staffs who take part in post-graduate teaching do so in addition to their ordinary duties, *i.e.*, in addition to the duties for which they are paid by Government.

(*g*) Yes.

(*h*) No.

Proposed Bonarpara-Parbatipur railway line.

218. Maulvi HAMID-UD-DIN KHAN: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to say, after inquiry, when the construction of the railway line from Bonarpara to Parbatipur, or from Mohimganj to Parbatipur, is likely to be taken up?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of PUBLIC WORKS (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): As there is little or no prospect of these lines being constructed in the near future, Government do not consider that an inquiry addressed to the Government of India (Railway Board) will have any fruitful result at the present time.

Percentage of failures in classical languages in 1921 B.A. examination.

219. Maulvi A. H. M. WAZIR ALI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing the percentage of failures in the various classical languages at the last University B.A. examination?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the B.A. course in Arabic is considered harder than the courses in other classical languages?

(*c*) If so, what steps are the Government taking to bring it into line with the courses for other classical languages?

(*d*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that there has been a very heavy percentage of failures among the Arabic students at the last University B.A. examination?

(*e*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that almost all the students in Arabic, except a few Presidency College students, were coached by the University itself (no other colleges in Calcutta having affiliation in Arabic)?

(*f*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing separately the percentage of failures in Arabic at the last B.A. examination among the Presidency College students and the students who were coached up by the University itself?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) The information will not be available till all the results have been examined.

(*b*) The University authorities report that it is not so considered.

(*c*) Does not arise.

(*d*) The University authorities report that this is not the case.

(*e*) Some students receive some assistance from teachers provided by the University.

(*f*) The information is not available.

Educational institutions and non-co-operation movement.

220. Babu JOGENDRA KRISHNA ROY: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether any school or college in the province has given up Government aid since the non-co-operation movement began? If so, what are the names of such schools and colleges?

(*ii*) whether any school or college has written to the Calcutta University seeking disaffiliation, or if the University has been compelled to disaffiliate any since the non-co-operation movement began;

(*iii*) the number of scholars on the roll of every college and school affiliated to the University of Calcutta on the 31st August, 1920, and the same on the 31st July, 1921?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*i*) No report has reached the Director of Public Instruction of any such repudiation.

(*ii*) The following schools have formally applied to Calcutta University for disaffiliation since the non-co-operation movement began:—

(*1*) Karatiya Hafiz Md. Ali Institution, Mymensingh.
(*2*) Kalihati R. G. Union High English School, Mymensingh.
(*3*) Bajrajogini High English School, Dacca.
(*4*) Solaghar Sir C. M. High English School, Dacca.
(*5*) Aryan Academy, Pabna.
(*6*) Sri Maheswari Vidyalaya, Calcutta.

The University has not been compelled to disaffiliate any schools since the movement began.

(*iii*) The University are unable to supply the information required at present. If received, it will be communicated later.

Procedure for collecting statistics of diseases.

221. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state how the figures of the occurrences of various diseases published in the Sanitary Report are collected?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): On his weekly or bi-weekly visits to the local thana, the village chaukidar reports the births and deaths which have occurred in his area since his previous report. Reports of the occurrence of epidemic diseases, such as cholera and small-pox, are made at the same time. The thana officer reports the information received by him to the Civil Surgeon, who compiles the statistics for the whole district and transmits them monthly to the Director of Public Health. The figures for urban areas are collected by the municipal authorities and reported by them to the Civil Surgeon for inclusion in his monthly district return.

Preventive measures taken for cholera during tea garden coolie migration in various centres in Bengal.

222. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state what actual steps, if any, were taken to prevent cholera from taking an epidemic form at the time of the recent Assam coolie migration in the different centres, especially at Asansol, Naihati, Santahar and Goalundo?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: Three Assistant Directors of Public Health were sent to the places chiefly affected with orders to organise preventive and relief measures, to defray the cost of

which a sum of Rs. 6,000 was sanctioned. A fourth Assistant Director of Public Health was ordered to watch the situation at Naihati, whilst another Assistant Director was instructed to keep himself informed of any possible sudden emergency at Santahar. A sufficient staff of Assistant and Sub-Assistant Surgeons provided with medical outfits and disinfectants was also sent to Chandpur, Goalundo, Naihati and Asansol to supplement local resources. Accounts of the measures taken at Chandpur have been published in the newspapers. At Asansol, medical examination of all coolies arriving was made by the railway medical staff. Sick coolies and suspects were detrained and treated at the local railway hospital. The localities affected were kept in a state of efficient cleanliness and disinfection. At Naihati, all coolie passengers were examined by the railway medical staff, assisted by the medical officers deputed by the Department of Public Health. Actual cases of cholera were transferred to the local hospital for treatment, while suspects and contacts were segregated. The station premises and precincts were satisfactorily disinfected and constantly kept clean. At Goalundo, satisfactory sanitary and medical arrangements were similarly made in collaboration with the Medical Superintendent of Emigration stationed there. Steamers and all sources of local water supply likely to be infected were disinfected and cholera cases were accommodated in cholera huts. No action was required at Santahar.

Municipal rates in Calcutta.

223. Mr. AJOY CHUNDER DUTT: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state the amount of rates derived by the Calcutta Corporation from house-owners and occupiers and the number of persons who paid the said rates last year?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: The Chairman of the Corporation reports that the total amount of consolidated rates realised from owners and occupiers during 1920-21 was Rs. 99,43,084 and the total number of rate-payers (owners and occupiers) as recorded in the assessment book was 59,057. Figures for owners and occupiers separately are not readily available.

Charitable dispensary at Kotalpur (Bankura).

224. Mr. AJOY CHUNDER DUTT: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government aware of the great need for medical assistance existing in Kotalpur (Vishnupur subdivision, Bankura district)?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of establishing a charitable dispensary in that town?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) and (*b*) There was formerly a District Board dispensary at the village of Kotalpur, but in 1916 it was transferred to Patrasayer in the Vishnupur subdivision, as that place was in need of a dispensary, and a well-equipped private charitable dispensary had been opened at Deopara, only 3 miles from Kotalpur, owing to the generosity of a private gentleman. The District Board's Chairman reports that owing to the good work of the Kotalpur Union Committee for the last three or four years the health of the place has been gradually improving and there is no necessity of opening another dispensary at Kotalpur.

Deputy superintendents of police.

225. Mr. AJOY CHUNDER DUTT: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department aware of the feeling of discontent existing amongst officiating deputy superintendents for lack of any prospect of being made permanent under existing conditions?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the advisability of increasing the cadre of the deputy superintendents, by suspending the recruitment of Assistant Superintendents in England, and allowing the existing vacancies in that service to be filled up by experienced Indian officers?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware of the fact, that by fixing the initial pay of promoted deputy superintendents at Rs. 320, the officiating deputy superintendents, who as inspectors would draw a maximum pay of Rs. 300 *plus* house allowance, actually suffer a reduction in their salary?

(*d*) If so, what steps do Government propose to take to remove this anomaly?

MEMBER in charge of APPOINTMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) Representations from officiating deputy superintendents on this ground have been received by Government. *Prima facie* they have no legitimate grievance, as most of them have been acting in purely temporary vacancies caused by the war, and would not have done so in normal circumstances.

(*b*) No.

(*c*) and (*d*) The question of the initial pay of promoted deputy superintendents is still under the consideration of Government.

Expenditure of the 24-Parganas District Board on tanks and roads.

226. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

(*a*) how many new tanks have been excavated and old tanks re-excavated by the District Board of the 24-Parganas since 1910, stating

the names of villages and thanas where, and the dates when, and the cost at which, they have been so excavated or re-excavated?

(*b*) how many miles of new roads, metalled and unmetalled, have been constructed out of the District Board Fund since 1880?

(*c*) (*i*) How many miles of pre-existing roads were taken charge of by the 24-Parganas District Board under the Cess Act in 1880?

(*ii*) How many miles of such roads are under the charge of the said District Board at present and what is the annual charge for the repairs and maintenance of such roads at present?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) Two statements (I and II) furnished by the Chairman of the District Board are laid on the table.

(*b*) and (*c*) The figures are as follows:—

	Metalled roads.	District unmetalled roads.	Village roads.
	84 miles.	255 miles	568 miles
(*c*) (*i*)	141 ,,	183 ,,	990 ,,
(*c*) (*ii*)	225 ,,	438 ,,	1 558 ,,
	Rs.	Rs	Rs
Annual charge ...	1,35,870	29,325	45,869

Statement I referred to in the reply to clause (a) of unstarred question No. 226, showing new tanks excavated from 1910-11 to 1920-21.

24-PARGANAS DISTRICT BOARD.

No.	Name of tank.	Village.	Thana.	Date of excavation.	Cost.
					Rs.
1	Excavating Sanderbil Abad tank.	Sanderbil ...	Hasnabad ...	1910-11	2,609
2	Excavating Nazait tank	Nazait ...	,, ...	,,	577
3	Excavating Saurapole tank.	Saurapole ...	Sarupnagore...	1911-12	1,685
4	Excavating Sadhandanga tank.	Sadhandanga	Diamond Harbour.	,,	2,166
5	Excavating a tank at Dobelia.	Dobelia ...	Hasnabad ...	1912-13	1,746
6	Excavating Nabinganj tank.	Nabinganj ...	,, ...	,,	2,745

No.	Name of tank.	Village.	Thana.	Date of excavation.	Cost.
					Rs.
7	Excavating Sandeshkhali tank.	Sandeshkhali...	Sandeshkhali...	1913-14	2,299
8	Excavating Madhabkhali tank.	Madhabkhali...	Hasnabad ...	,,	2,513
9	Excavating Ektara tank	Ektara ...	Diamond Harbour.	1914-15	2,149
10	Excavating Chowgacha tank.	Chowgacha ...	Naihati ...	1915-16	3,480
11	Excavating Sthispara tank.	Sthispara ...	,, ...	,,	5,043
12	Excavating Babanpur tank.	Babanpur ...	Nowpara ...	,,	3,827
13	Excavating Balagor tank	Balagor ...	Khardah ...	,,	4,101
14	Excavating Daporia tank	Daporia ...	,, ..	..	3,508
15	Excavating Sultanpur tank.	Sultanpur ...	Dum Dum ...	,,	3,707
16	Excavating Ganga Sagar Mela ground tank	Mela ground ...	Kulpi	,,	2,986
17	Excavating Kaknagor tank.	Kaknagor ... (Sanderbil)	Hasnabad ...	,,	2,718
18	Excavating Nakmalipur tank.	Nakmalipur ...	Deganga ...	1916-17	4,691
19	Excavating Chakla Ramnagar tank.	Chakla Ramnagar.	,, ...	,,	4,885
20	Excavating Rawtara tank	Rawtara ...	Habra ...	,,	4,430
21	Excavating Bashudebpur tank	Bashudebpur	Naihati ...	,,	4,366
22	Excavating Jatragachi tank.	Jatragachi ...	Baraset ...	,,	3,977
23	Excavating Dehti tank	Dehti ...	Khardah ...	,,	4,183
24	Excavating Podderhat tank.	Podderhat ...	Joynagore ...	,,	2,981
25	Excavating Kharo tank	Kharo ...	Habra ...	,,	3,504
26	Excavating Samudrapur tank.	Samudrapur	,, ...	,,	3,245

No.	Name of tank.	Village.	Thana.	Date of excavation.	Cost.
					Rs.
27	Excavating Rampur tank	Rampur ...	Hasnabad ...	1917-18	3,453
28	Excavating Garagacha tank.	Garagacha ...	Diamond Harbour.	,,	4,845
29	Excavating Ranigachi tank.	Ranigachi ...	Haroa ...	,,	4,201
30	Excavating Sajnaberia tank.	Sajnaberia ...	Behala ...	,,	4,607
31	Excavating Daulatpur tank.	Daulatpur ...	,, ...	,,	4,619
32	Excavating Lakhankati tank.	Lakhankati ...	Basirhat ...	,,	4,602
33	Excavating Janmahomedpur tank.	Janmahomedpur	,, ...	,,	4,928
34	Excavating Kotalberia tank.	Kotalberia ...	Baduria ...	,,	3,181
35	Excavating a tank in the Baduria inspection bungalow compound.	Baduria ...	,, ...	,,	3,254
36	Excavating Chhota Baduria tank.	Chhota Baduria	Naihati ...	,,	4,764
37	Excavating Magrahat Madrasa tank.	Magrahat ...	Magrahat ...	,,	4,571
38	Excavating Chak Subudhi tank.	Chak Subudhi	Kulpi ...	1918-19	4,631
39	Excavating Akraberia tank.	Akraberia ...	,, ...	,,	5,665
40	Excavating Madurdah tank.	Madurdah ...	Tollygunge ...	,,	4,642
41	Excavating Gourdah tank.	Gourdah ...	Protapnagar ...	,,	4,[illegible]21
42	Excavating Boinchtola tank.	Boinchtola ...	Tollygunge ...	,,	4,577
43	Excavating Naliakhali tank.	Naliakhali ...	Canning ...	,,	3,400
44	Excavating Hingulganj tank.	Hingulganj ...	Hasnabad ...	1919-20	2,684

No.	Name of tank.	Village.	Thana.	Date of excavation.	Cost.
					Rs.
45	Excavating Raipur tank	Raipur ...	Magrahat ...	1919-20	3,242
46	Excavating Sapmora tank.	Sapmora ...	,, ...	,,	4,272
47	Excavating Sahara tank	Sahara ...	Habra ...	,,	4,807
48	Excavating Laskarati tank.	Laskarati ...	Tollygunge ...	,,	4,545
49	Excavating Chandanda tank	Chandanda ...	Bistupur ...	,,	4,447
50	Excavating Dewanganj tank.	Dewanganj ...	Joynagore ...	,,	3,946
51	Excavating Ramker chak tank.	Ramker chak	Kulpi ...	,,	1,798
52	Excavating Begnakhali tank	Begnakhali ...	,, ...	,,	1,798
53	Excavating Monsherdwip tank	Monsherdwip	,, ...	,,	1,799
54	Excavating Sikarpore tank.	Sikarpore ...	,, ...	,,	1,788
55	Excavating Hemnagar tank.	Hemnagar ...	Hasnabad ...	,,	3,026
56	Excavating Gillarchak tank.	Gillarchak ...	Mathurapore ...	,,	3,429
57	Excavating Nalna tank	Nalna ...	,, ...	,,	3,539
58	Excavating Akharpur tank.	Akharpur ...	Basirhat ...	,,	3,848
59	Excavating Nehalpur tank.	Nehalpur ...	,, ...	,,	4,229
60	Excavating Finga tank	Finga ...	Dum Dum ...	,,	4,182
61	Excavating Mohespota tank.	Mohespota ...	Khardah ...	,,	4,296
62	Excavating Kakdwip tank.	Kakdwip ...	Kakdwip ...	,,	4,045
63	Excavating Kuchemora tank.	Kuchemora ...	Deyganga ...	,,	3,677
64	Excavating Nakdah tank	Nakdah ...	Naihati ...	,,	4,150

No.	Name of tank.	Village.	Thana.	Date of excavation.	Cost.
					Rs.
65	Excavating South Hansia tank.	South Hansia	Nawpara ...	1920-21	4,349
66	Excavating Sukdebpur tank.	Sukdebpur ...	Behala ...	,,	4,915
67	Excavating Taldi Lakshipur tank	Taldi Lakshipur	Tollygunge ...	,,	3,510
68	Excavating Bangooda tank	Bangooda ...	Bhangor ...	,,	4,159
69	Excavating Raipur tank	Raipur ...	Protapnagor	,,	3,546
70	Excavating Gorainagor tank.	Gorainagor ...	Deganga ...	,,	4,354
71	Excavating Ranipur tank	Ranipur ...	Hasnabad ...	,,	3,277

Statement II referred to in the reply to clause (a) of question No. 226, showing old tanks re-excavated.

24-PARGANAS DISTRICT BOARD

No.	Name of tank.	Village.	Thana.	Date of re-excavation.	Cost.
					Rs
1	Re-excavating Maslandapur tank.	Maslandapur	Habra ...	1917-18	971
2	Re-excavating Sreerampur tank.	Sreerampur ...	Baraset ...	1918-19	2,551
3	Re-excavating Chowgacha tank.	Chowgacha ...	Naihati ...	1919-20	965
4	Re-excavating Setpur tank.	Setpur ...	Basirhat ...	1920-21	3,607
5	Re-excavating Naranpur tank.	Naranpur ...	Baduria ...	,,	3,534

Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee and ministerial officers of the High Court.

227. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to say—

(*i*) whether any of the ministerial officers, either of the Appellate Side or of the Original Side of the Calcutta High Court, were consulted or examined by the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee? If not, why not?

(*ii*) whether the Hon'ble the Chief Justice and the other Judges were consulted by the said Committee in arriving at their decision? If not, why not?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of FINANCE (the Hon'ble Mr. KERR): (*i*) So far as Government are aware, no ministerial officers of the High Court were examined by the Salaries Committee, but the Registrars on both the Appellate and Original Sides were consulted by the Committee.

(*ii*) The Hon'ble the Chief Justice and the Judges were not consulted, as the proper procedure is to consult the Registrars, and this was done.

Financial transactions of the Calcutta University.

228. Babu HEM CHANDRA NASKER: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Calcutta University Syndicate has passed a resolution to the effect that the University refuses to supply any information to the Council about their financial transactions except what is published in their minutes of proceedings?

(*b*) If so, has the Hon'ble the Minister considered how the Council can get those informations?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) In reference to a reference about Babu Hem Chandra Nasker's unstarred question No. 188 for the 4th July last, the Registrar replied to the Deputy Secretary to the Government of Bengal that ". . . No information as to finances of the University which is not contained in its published proceedings will be supplied by the University for publication."

(*b*) This has not yet been considered. The matter has been brought to the notice of the Hon'ble the Minister very recently.

Grants to dispensaries.

229. Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be

pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Government gives an annual grant to sadar and subdivisional charitable dispensaries and that no grant is given to mufassal charitable dispensaries?

(*b*) If so, what is the reason for this differential treatment?

(*c*) Is it a fact that Government officers residing in mufassal stations, such as police officers, postal officers and sub-registrars, make use of the local charitable dispensaries maintained by local funds free of charges, in the same manner as officers residing in sadar and subdivisional headquarters do with regard to the sadar and subdivisional dispensaries?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of making an annual grant to mufassal dispensaries attached to mufassal stations?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: It is presumed that the member refers to grants given by Government to hospitals and dispensaries for the free supply of medicines to Government servants. Such grants are given on the recommendation of District Officers and Divisional Commissioners to such dispensaries as are required to supply medicines free of cost to Government servants. As Government servants are generally stationed at the district and subdivisional headquarters, the sadar and subdivisional dispensaries are generally the recipients of the grants. If there is any place outside the district and subdivisional headquarters where there are Government servants, grants for the free supply of medicines to the dispensaries at these places are sanctioned by Government on the recommendation of District Magistrates and Commissioners.

Study of English history in secondary schools.

230. Mr. SYED ERFAN ALI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the study of the history of England is prohibited or discouraged by the Department of Education in the secondary (aided and Government) schools of Bengal?

(*b*) Will the Government name any Government or aided secondary schools in Bengal where the history of England is taught in any of the classes?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) It is not a fact.

(*b*) In the Presidency Division alone it is taught in 35 Government or Government aided schools, among them the Hindu and Hare Schools. Figures for other divisions are being collected.

Department of Industry.

231. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and

Industries be pleased to state the number, names, special technical qualifications, if any, and salary of the persons recently appointed as circle inspectors, Department of Industry?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing the duties of all such circle inspectors?

(*c*) Have the Government any information as to the results achieved in the field of industry by any of these circle inspectors within their official jurisdiction?

(*d*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to lay a statement on the table?

(*e*) What is the number, names and special qualifications of the Economic Botanists to the Government of Bengal and the nature of their work of investigation?

(*f*) Have the Government any information as to the results so far achieved by these officers?

(*g*) How much does it cost the Government to employ these officers?

(*h*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the amount of yearly expenditure under the head establishment charges and travelling for the Department of Industry, Bengal?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of AGRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (*a*) The information is given in the table below:—

Name.	Special technical qualifications.	Salary.
		Rs.
1. Mr. J. N. Sett ...	Was Professor of Physics for 3 years in one of the Technical Institutes in Bengal, Assistant Professor of Physics, University College of Science, Organiser of a few industrial concerns. Visited Technological Institutes in America, England and India.	360
2. Mr. A. C. Bera ...	Visited some factories in Edinburgh. Has experience in soap manufacture. Studied Geology and Mineralogy.	340
3. Babu P. C. Dutta ...	Was Chemist of the Assam Oil Company Limited. Has experience in Mechanical Engineering.	240
4. Mr. S. N. Bose ...	Has experience in tanning industry, Agriculture, Chemistry and Bacteriology.	200
5. Babu J. K. Majumdar	Was Demonstrator of Chemistry, Muir Central College and Dacca College.	200

(*b*) The main duties of the circle officers are to supervise the local activities of the department. They are its representatives on the spot and the channel of communication between the people and the department. They receive requests for assistance, make local inquiries,

prepare schemes and supervise minor works within their areas. They are also required to make a survey of the industries in their respective jurisdictions and to make practical suggestions for their development.

(*c*) and (*d*) No new industries have been started, but certain improvements over existing ones have been effected as a result of the circle officers' activities. This department is limited to being more or less an advisory organisation owing to paucity of funds. It therefore suggests to private industrialists the means of developing industries by advice, information or such other help as can possibly be rendered and the achievement of results will necessarily rest with the private industrialists. The circle officers have rendered considerable help by—

(*1*) inquiring into the *bonâ fides* of claims for supply of wagons for coal;

(*2*) arranging demonstrations of improved methods of tanning and weaving among the village tanners and weavers;

(*3*) recommending the introduction of improved methods and appliances in tanning and weaving industries; also button-making, conch shell bangles, and rope-spinning;

(*4*) receiving and investigating applications for help and recommending them to the head office;

(*5*) supplying industrial information to inquirers;

(*6*) surveying cottage industries;

(*7*) framing schemes for demonstration factories such as—

(*a*) dairy factory,

(*b*) tobacco factory,

(*c*) silk factory,

(*d*) bell-metal factory,

(*e*) fruit-canning factory.

(*8*) helping to organize embroidery and chikon industries with a view to finding out overseas markets; and

(*9*) inspecting industrial schools and submitting schemes on industrial education.

(*e*) Two viz.: (1) Mr. G. P. Hector, M.A., B.Sc., and (2) Mr. Dwijadas Dutt, B.Sc. (Cal.), M.S.A. (Cornell), officiating, Mr. Hector is a B.Sc. in Botany, Zoology and Geology of Aberdeen University. Has "distinction" certificates in classes of Botany and "high distinction" in classes of Zoology and Geology. From October, 1904, to October, 1906, he worked on Economic Botany at the Herbarium, Royal Botanic Gardens, Kew, as Assistant to Sir George Watt, formerly Reporter on Economic Products to the Government of India. In January, 1907, he was appointed as a Botanist to the Indian Agricultural Service and posted to Pusa as supernumerary Economic Botanist.

Mr. Dwijadas Dutt is a B.Sc. in Botany and Chemistry of the Calcutta University. He passed the final examination of the Higher Agricultural classes attached to the Civil Engineering College, Sibpur, and was the graduate scholar of the year. Obtained M.Sc. in Agriculture of Cornell University (U.S.A.) specialising in Plant-breeding, Cytology and Horticulture. Has an experience of work in the various experimental and breeding stations under the Federal and State Department of Agriculture (U.S.A.)

Their work consists mainly in plant-breeding with a view to the production of improved strains of staple agricultural crops and in economic work in general, from a botanical standpoint, on agricultural crops.

(*f*) Paddy being the main crop of Bengal, is naturally receiving the chief attention of the Botanical Section. By a process of selection Mr. Hector has produced two varieties of rice, both of which have a yield largely in excess of the average yield of the varieties ordinarily grown in Bengal.

(*g*) Rupees 22,200 per annum on an average.

(*h*) A statement is given below:—

Year.			Salaries.	Establishment.	Travelling allowance.
			Rs.	Rs.	Rs
1918-19	...	...	45,812	13,398	3,988
1919-20	...	...	44,633	16,516	6,854
1920-21	...	...	55,491	64,819	11,519

Revaluation cess in Midnapore.

232. Babu SARAT CHANDRA JANAH: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing the maximum amount of cess in comparison with the rent payable for at least ten tenancies in the district of Midnapore (as levied by the recent cess revaluation)?

(*b*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Member been drawn to the fact that the assessment of the road-cess under Bengal Act IX of 1880 in the district of Midnapore, is being made upon a basis which has in some cases caused extreme hardship to the tenants?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that in some tenancies the amount of the revaluation cess has almost come up to the actual rent payable for the tenancy?

(*d*) (*i*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking expert judicial opinion on the meaning of the phrase "annual value of any land, estate, or tenure" in section 4 of the Cess Act in the case of a raiyat's holding, and

(*ii*) whether the annual value of a raiyat's holding can be assessed upon the profits receivable by the raiyat from his *bhagchasis*, and also whether cesses can be assessed upon it?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE [LAND REVENUE] (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (*a*) A statement is placed below—

Serial No.		Rent paid by tenure-holder.			Annual value of the tenure.			Cess demand		
		Rs.	A.	P.	Rs.	A.	P.	Rs.	A.	P.
1	...	7	0	0	610	5	0	37	15	0
2	...	6	5	0	60	4	0	3	9	0
3	...	3	8	3	72	8	0	4	7	0
4	...	116	7	7	1,296	10	0	77	6	0
5	...	18	5	4	202	15	0	12	2	0
6	...	958	15	10½	3,351	9	0	179	8	0
7	...	1,746	15	9	5,508	4	0	289	11	0
8	...	18	1	2	123	5	0	7	2	0
9	...	1	0	0	32	0	0	1	15	0
10	...	1	4	0	39	12	0	2	7	0

(*b*) No such case has been brought to the knowledge of Government.

(*c*) Yes. In some cases the cesses have not only come up to the actual rent payable for the tenancies, but have exceeded them, as the cesses payable by the tenure-holders do not depend on the rent paid by the tenure-holders but on the annual value of the tenures—*vide* section 4 of the Bengal Cess Act, 1880.

(*d*) (*i*) As the meaning of the section is clear, no expert judicial opinion appears necessary.

(*ii*) Yes. [*Vide* note to section 24 of the Cess Act, 1880 (Bengal Act IX of 1880), on page 12 of the Bengal Cess Manual, 1919, which is based on legal opinion.]

Calcutta Technical Evening School.

233. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state what amount of money grant, if any, was made by Government to the Calcutta Technical Evening School in 1920-21?

(*b*) What was the total number of students on the rolls of the school on the 31st March, 1921, showing their nationality (Indian, Anglo-Indian and European) and also the names of the firms to which they belong?

(*c*) Is it the intention that the proposed Calcutta Technical School should replace the existing Calcutta Technical Evening School, and, at

present, provide theoretical training for the apprentices employed in the large industrial workshops in and around Calcutta?

(*d*) If the answer to (*c*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether any inquiry has been made and, if so, with what results as to whether the industrial workshops, which are likely to send their apprentices to the Calcutta Technical School for training, freely admit Indians as apprentices in their firms?

(*e*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state what amount of money, if any, these industrial workshops paid towards the upkeep of the Calcutta Technical Evening School during the year 1920-21?

(*f*) Is it the intention of Government to make it a condition precedent that these workshops should freely admit Indian Engineering apprentices before they can be permitted to send their apprentices for training to the proposed Calcutta Technical School? If not, why not?

(*g*) Is it in contemplation to levy any contribution from any of these industrial firms, towards the upkeep of the proposed Calcutta Technical School?

(*h*) What is the latest estimate of the cost of the proposed Calcutta Technical School in—(*i*) capital expenditure, (*ii*) recurring expenditure?

(*i*) How much has already been spent in capital expenditure?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Rs. 2,000.

(*b*) The total number of students on the roll during the year ending 31st December, 1920, was 166, of whom 98 were Indians and 68 Anglo-Indians and Europeans. Of these, 12 were private students and the rest belonged to the following:—

Messrs. Burn & Co.	61
Messrs. John King & Co	10
Messrs. Jessop & Co	15
East Indian Railway Company	17
Calcutta Port Commissioners	10
Messrs. Balmer, Lawrie & Co	6
Vulcan Iron Works	2
Garden Reach Engineering Works (Messrs. McNeil & Co.)	4
Messrs. Turner Morrison & Co	10
Calcutta Tramways Company	2
Russa Engineering Works	3
Cossipore Shell Factory	14
Total ...	154

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) An inquiry was made of the workshops who take apprentices and replies received from them were, without exception, in the affirmative.

		Rs.
(*e*) Messrs. Burn & Co	...	750
East Indian Railway	..	600
Messrs Jessop & Co	...	250
Messrs. John King & Co	...	250

(*f*) No. Government do not consider it necessary or desirable to impose any such condition, but prefer to rely on the goodwill of the firms concerned.

(*g*) The question has not yet been finally decided.

(*h*) (*i*) Capital cost—

		Rs.
For land	...	10,26,400
For ground floor of the school building		2,39,704
Furniture and equipment	...	* 1,00,000
Total	...	13,66,104

* *N.B*—The two upper floors are estimated to cost an additional Rs. 4 lakhs.

(*ii*) Recurring cost—Rs. 1,29,800.

(*i*) Rs. 8,44,030.

Supply of quinine to dispensaries.

234. Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether he is aware that the supply of quinine in the mufassal dispensaries is always inadequate?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps to provide a sufficient supply?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The member is referred to the reply given at the meeting of 14th March, 1921, to clause (*xii*) of unstarred question No. 64 asked by Babu Tankanath Chaudhuri.

(*b*) Government have already sanctioned a grant of Rs. 67,880 to local bodies for the supply of quinine free during the current year.

Anti-malarial scheme for the 24-Parganas.

235. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether any comprehensive anti-malarial scheme has been prepared for the district of the 24-Parganas?

(*b*) If not, whether the preparation of such a scheme is under contemplation?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) and (*b*) The following anti-malarial schemes affecting the district are in progress:—

(*1*) Jaboona;

(*2*) Nowi-Sunthi;

(*3*) Arapanch,

(*4*) Madanpur-Baragachi; and

(*5*) Manikhali.

The last has been nearly completed. In addition to these schemes the Baitgachi Gong scheme is under investigation and surveys are being made. No comprehensive scheme affecting the whole of the district has yet been prepared, but the District Board has been asked to hold a conference of the leading men in the district to formulate, in the light of local knowledge and information, anti-malarial schemes for the benefit of the district.

Grievances of the people of Chauberia (Jessore).

236. Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether he is aware of the following grievances of the people of Chauberia and the surrounding locality within the jurisdiction of the District Board of Jessore, viz:—

(*i*) the want of a road leading to the nearest railway station;

(*ii*) the want of pure drinking water, especially in the summer; and

(*iii*) the absence of a local charitable dispensary to afford medical relief.

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state what steps, if any, the District Board of Jessore have taken or propose to take with a view to the removal of these grievances?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) and (*b*) The Chairman of the District Board, Jessore, reports as follows:—

(*i*) "There is a road leading from Gopalnagore, the nearest railway station to Chauberia. As Chauberia is an island, the road had to

cross a river which could not be bridged for want of funds. In the dry season the people can ford the river and in the rainy season can cross it by boat.

(*ii*) "A tank has already been sanctioned and the work will be taken up in due course.

(*iii*) "A charitable dispensary has been sanctioned and preliminary arrangements are being made."

Travelling allowances to sub-inspectors of police.

237. Babu SATISH CHANDRA MUKHARJI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department aware that in the Presidency of Bombay all sub-inspectors of police, including probationers, irrespective of their pay, are treated as second class officers for the purpose of their travelling allowances?

(*b*) Is it a fact that in the Presidency of Bengal sub-inspectors, some drawing more than Rs. 100 per month, are treated as third class officers?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of treating all sub-inspectors in Bengal as second class officers for the purpose of their travelling allowance as has been sanctioned in Bombay?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to place on the table, for the information of the members, a copy of the Bombay Government resolution No. 5345 (Government of Bombay, Home Department), dated Poona, the 31st May, 1921, on the subject?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Government have no information.

(*b*) and (*c*) Attention is invited to the answer given to-day to a starred question asked at this meeting by Babu Bijoy Prosad Singh Roy.

(*d*) Government have no copy of the resolution in question.

Partition of tauzi No. 127, Khulna.

238. Babu JOGENDRA NATH ROY: (*a*) In continuation of unstarred question No. 191 (meeting of 4th July, 1921), will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state the monthly expenses being incurred by the partition office at Khulna, and the rate at which they are being charged on the different estates concerned?

(*b*) What were the expenses incurred during the last three years and the amount charged on the different estates interested?

(*c*) Is it a fact that more than 20 adjournments were given in the hearing of one petition of objection (Mis. case No. 3 of 1919-20)?

(*d*) Is it a fact that after the disposal of all objections on the 12th October, 1920, the original case has not yet been submitted by the Deputy Collector to the Collector?

(*e*) Are the Government considering the desirability of issuing orders to expedite the work of the partition of tauzi No. 127, Khulna?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) A monthly expenditure of about Rs. 500 is likely to be incurred during the current year. The amount is charged rateably in proportion to the area, against the estates.

(*b*) The expenses incurred during the last three years and the amount charged on the different estates were:—

Estate.	Expenditure incurred during three years, 1918-19, 1919-20 and 1920-21.
	Rs.
Tauzi No. 127	10,634
Tauzi No. 132	4,715
Tauzi No. 176	517
Tauzi No. 561	134
Tauzi No. 67	2,719
Tauzi No. 723	451
Tauzi No. 70	351
Tauzi No 68	348
Tauzi No. 66	713
Tauzi No. 119	220
Total	20,802

(*c*) No. Fourteen adjournments were given, twelve of which were granted at the instance of the parties.

(*d*) Yes. Papers for drawing up allotment proceedings are now being prepared.

(*e*) The matter has already been brought to the notice of the Board of Revenue.

Grants to local boards for original works.

239. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether the district boards of Bengal allot any money to the local boards for original works?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the local boards are much pressed by the public for village roads?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister considering the desirability of making an inquiry into the matter and of asking the district boards to grant sufficient money to the local boards for original works?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Government have no definite information on the subject.

(*c*) An inquiry has been made the results of which are shown in the statement which is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 239, showing the amounts allotted by District Boards to Local Boards for original works in 1919-20.

District Board.	Amounts allotted.	Remarks.
	Rs	
Burdwan ...	1,91,142	This amount represents road cess receipts realised in the Asansol subdivision which are made over to the Asansol Local Board for original works and repairs to District Board and village roads. Local Boards in the other subdivisions have been relieved of the construction and repairs of roads on the creation of Union Boards.
Birbhum ...	.....	The Local Boards have hardly any original works to do, the work done by them on village roads, including construction of culverts, being of the nature of repair works. The District Board has no objection to making grants to Local Boards for original works within the lump allotment made to these bodies each year.
Bankura ...	.....	Grants for the maintenance of roads are made to Local Boards from which they undertake original works. The District Board has no objection to allotting funds for original works if funds are available.
Midnapore ...	.....	Ditto ditto.
Hooghly ...	28,500	
Howrah ...	.....	It is reported that the Local Boards have no competent engineering staff and have no occasion for executing original works other than the construction of culverts on village roads, which they maintain out of the funds at their disposal.
24-Parganas ...	10,000	
Nadia ...	2,500	
Jessore ...	19,000*	
Khulna ...	9,500*†	

N.B.—There being no Local Boards in Malda and Bogra they have been omitted from this statement.

* Both for original and repair works.

† In addition to this, a sum of Rs. 8,000 was given to each of the Local Boards for original water works.

District Board.	Amounts allotted.	Remarks.
	Rs.	
Murshidabad ...	.....	The Local Boards have no adequate staff for carrying out original works.
Dacca ...	42,000	
Bakarganj ...	3,979	
Faridpur ...	42,066	
Mymensingh ...	18,000	
Rajshahi ...	27,891	
Jalpaiguri ...	15,481	
Rangpur ...	.....	Out of Rs 24,000 allotted for repairs to roads Rs. 5,155 were spent on original works.
Pabna ...	2,931	
Dinajpur ...	.....	The engineering staff of the Local Boards are not efficient to look after works of importance.
Tippera ...	31,000	
Noakhali ...	28,200	
Chittagong ...	.....	Local Boards have only recently been established.

Expenditure: "41.—Civil Works—Public Works Department."

240. Mr. S. M. BOSE: With reference to the supplementary grant of Rs. 2,74,500 made without discussion on the 15th July last, under the head "41—Civil Works—Public Works Department," will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to make a statement showing the necessity for the expenditure?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: A statement furnishing the information is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 240, showing the necessity for the expenditure covered by the grant of Rs. 2,74,500 voted by the Legislative Council in July session.

Description of scheme.	Amount voted.	Explanation of the necessity for the expenditure.
	Rs.	
1. Construction of buildings for the Calcutta Technical School.	1,25,000	The cost of acquiring the site of the Calcutta Technical School turned out to be more than was expected and this has absorbed all the money provided to begin the erection of the buildings. A further grant of Rs. 1,25,000 has been necessary to enable the Public Works Department to start building operations
2 Construction of buildings for the Agricultural Institute at Dacca.	1,00,000	The land for the Agricultural Institute has already been acquired Last year the Government of India provided a sum of Rs 1,02,000 for the construction of buildings The grant was, however, received too late to be spent during the last financial year and through an oversight no provision was made for the work in the budget for 1921-22
3 Alterations in and additions to the premises hired in Beniapuker Street for the Motor Vehicles and Hackney Carriage Department.	25,000	The premises at Fenwick Bazar thana have been found utterly insufficient for the Motor Vehicles and Hackney Carriage Department of the Calcutta Police A house has therefore been rented by Government in Beniapuker Street for this purpose and alterations and additions costing about Rs 25,000 have been necessary to make the house suitable for this purpose
4. Special repairs to the second block, Writers' Buildings.	14,000	The repairs were necessitated by the occurrence of a fire in the office of the Financial Department in January last
5. Improvement to the Malda Registration Record Room	8,000	The existing accommodation in the Malda Registration Record Room being utterly inadequate, it has been found urgently necessary to carry out certain improvements in that direction.
6. Completion of the Rampal Registration Buildings.	2,500	This sum was urgently required to complete a combined office and quarters for the sub-registrar at Rampal in the Khulna district, there being no suitable rented building available for the purpose.
Total ...	2,74,500	

Roads in Dinajpur.

241. Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether it is a fact that there is no river in the northern part of the district of Dinajpur which is navigable throughout the year?

(*b*) Is it a fact that there is no railway communication in the Thakurgaon subdivision of the district of Dinajpur and that the entire traffic has to depend upon carts on *kutcha* roads?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the funds of the District Board of Dinajpur are inadequate to keep all the roads in proper condition?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of maintaining some of the roads?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) and (*b*) The answer is in the affirmative.

(*c*) The District Magistrate of Dinajpur, who was also Chairman of the District Board, reported last year: "The money allotted for civil works in an ordinary year proves quite inadequate for maintaining the roads and bridges in good order and providing additional means of communication."

(*d*) The answer is in the negative. The member is referred to paragraph 9 of His Excellency's reply to the addresses presented at Dinajpur on 24th November, 1919, an extract from which is laid on the table.

Extract para. 9 from His Excellency's reply to the addresses presented at Dinajpur, on 24th November, 1919, referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 241.

* * * * * *

9. Coming now to the question of roads, I have explained in reply to addresses presented to me at Malda why I cannot depart from the general principle that local roads are matters for which the local authority must accept responsibility.

* * * * * *

Leave to District Judge, Noakhali.

242. Munshi JAFAR AHMED: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether the present District Judge of Noakhali has thrice applied for long leave in the course of the last 12 months on the ground of ill-health and inability to work properly, and is it a fact that all these applications have been rejected?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The officer applied for leave on three occasions during the last 12 months, on two of these occasions pleading ill-health—which was not supported by a medical certificate. Owing to the scarcity of officers his request in his earlier applications could not be granted. In accordance with his third request he will be allowed leave in continuation of the civil court vacation.

Endowments and trust funds for the Calcutta Medical College Hospital.

243. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to lay on the table a list of donations and endowments (in landed property and money) given to the Medical College Hospital since its creation, with a succinct account as to how they have been utilized according to the wishes of the particular donors where expressly indicated?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: A statement of endowments and trust funds is laid on the table. Details of the donations received since 1852, when the hospital was opened, are not available

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 243.

Names and objects of Endowments and Trust Funds.	Invested Capital.	Annual Interest.		
	Rs.	Rs	A.	P.
Prince Golam Mahomed Fund.—Providing pecuniary assistance and relief to distressed Christian patients on their discharge from hospitals. The unexpended balance of the interest after meeting the primary object of the Trust is utilised in buying special drugs and appliances for the benefit of the indigent Christian patients while in hospital.	76,300	1,331	4	8*
Hodgson Endowment.—Providing assistance to destitute Indian patients on their discharge from Hospital.	4,700	164	1	6
Gopal Lal Tagore Fund.—Furnishing relief to destitute patients on their discharge from hospital. In the event of there being no necessity for affording relief to destitute patients, the accumulated interest may be spent for improvement either of the hospital building or its management or in supplying some immediate benefit to the patients.	14,000	488	12	4

* Moiety of interest to Presidency General Hospital and Medical College Hospital.

Names and objects of Endowment and Trust Funds.	Invested Capital.	Annual Interest.
	Rs	Rs. A. P
Medical College Hospital Fund.—Affording relief to destitute Indian patients on their discharge from hospital and hospital improvement.	12,300	429 6 10
Owen John Elias Legacy.—General purposes of the hospital	13,100	439 14 4
G. S Fagans Fund.—General purposes of the hospital	1,100	38 6 6
J. B. Robert Fund —General purposes of the hospital.	1,000	34 14 8
Maharaja of Alwar Fund.—General purposes of the hospital.	1,000	34 14 8
Maharaja of Burdwan Fund.—General purposes of the hospital.	500	17 7 4
Khettromoni Dutt Fund.—Relief of destitute Indian patients on their discharge from hospital or for the general purposes of the hospital at the discretion of the Principal	7,000	244 6 2
Moir Memorial Fund —Providing surgical aid including artificial limbs, eyes, etc., for patients of the Medical College Hospital.	8,300	289 12 4
Medical College Samaritan Fund.—Clothing and small sums for temporary assistance to poor Indian convalescents, Hindus, Muhammadans and Parsees.	5,000	174 9 0
Ezra Hospital Fund —For maintaining the Ezra Hospital menial establishments.	23,000	802 15 10
Nistarini Dassi Fund —For maintaining the establishment of the Nistarini Dassi Ward (Eden Hospital) and as far as possible for the general current expenses of the said Ward.	27,000	945 0 0

Admission of patients into the Calcutta Medical College Hospital.

244. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether it is a fact that some patients desiring admission into the Calcutta Medical College Hospital meet the authorities of the particular ward in private consultation and secure orders of admission direct from them?

(*b*) If so, are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps with a view to putting a stop to the practice?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) No. The admission of patients to the Medical College group of hospitals is made by the Resident Physician for the medical wards and the Resident Surgeon for the surgical wards. They keep an accurate roster of names and, on receiving any order for admission from any of the Visiting Staff, place the name of the patient concerned on that roster in order of priority. No recommendation from any ward authorities, except in case of extreme urgency demanding immediate attention, is considered as giving a prior claim for admission.

(*b*) The question does not arise.

Excessive death-rate in Bengal.

245. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state what measures, if any, the Government contemplate to combat—

(*i*) the excessive death-rate in Bengal;

(*ii*) the cholera epidemic in Birbhum, Burdwan, Murshidabad and the 24-Parganas; and

(*iii*) malaria in the districts of Bankura, Birbhum, Burdwan, Murshidabad and Nadia?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: The measures by which a reduction of the death-rate can be effected are threefold, viz., preventive, curative, *i.e.*, treatment at hospitals and dispensaries, and educative, *i.e.*, the dissemination, by means of propaganda work, of sound ideas of hygiene and of the methods of preventing disease. Government is endeavouring to promote and carry out measures in all these directions and will continue to do so, as far as its resources allow; but it must have the active co-operation of local bodies and of the public generally. In this connection, I would invite the attention of the member to the speech which I delivered at the Press Conference on 16th July, 1921, in which I said: "You and I, the Government and the people, must co-operate to rid the country of malarial fever, or at any rate reduce its scope and the range of its malignant influence. Popular information and expert knowledge must be combined and co-ordinated for one great and common purpose. With this object in view I have invited the District Boards to hold conferences of all leading men in

their districts, with a view to formulate, in the light of local knowledge and information, schemes of water-supply and anti-malarial operations, together with the cost thereof and the means of meeting them. I am prepared to be present at some of these conferences, if so desired. These conferences will stimulate local interest, focus local wants and views, and expert knowledge and local opinion will act and re-act upon one another and strengthen one another by their mutual inter-action." As regards the four districts mentioned in clause (*ii*) of the question, cholera has not been prevalent in an epidemic form in any of them during the current year, though there have been some local outbreaks of short duration. I presume that the member refers not to any particular epidemic, but to the necessity of preventing outbreaks of cholera. I trust that the water-supply schemes formulated by the district conferences will be effectual in this direction and that anti-malarial operations initiated by them will serve to prevent and mitigate malaria in the five districts mentioned in the last clause of the question. I may add that an anti-cholera campaign is now being carried out in the district of Howrah at the cost of Government as an object lesson to other districts.

Filtered water-supply in Calcutta.

246. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state what is the average quantity of filtered water-supply by the Corporation of Calcutta to each ward since 1905?

(*b*) What is the number of meters fixed in each ward to indicate the quantity of filtered water supplied to premises?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to say whether he is now in a position to state the total amount of expense incurred by the Corporation of Calcutta in procuring the meters for measuring the supply of water and the total number of such meters?

(*d*) When was the system of measurement of water-supply by meters first introduced by the Corporation of Calcutta?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The quantity of water supplied to each ward is not recorded. Calcutta is divided into meter blocks which do not coincide with wards.

(*b*) Most of the house meters have been concentrated in certain blocks in ward 2, in which the average consumption of filtered water was high. This was done in 1916 under orders of the Corporation. No separate figures are kept of the number of house meters fixed in each

ward as the Water Works Department does not work upon the ward as a unit. In June, 1921, the number of house meters fixed in each district was as follows:—

District I	... ...	2,080
District II	... ...	476
District III	... ...	44
District IV	... ...	86
	Total ...	2,686

(*c*) The total number of house meters belonging to the Corporation is 3,369. It is not possible to state the expenditure incurred by the Corporation in procuring these meters, but it may be taken that on an average the cost is between Rs. 50 and Rs. 60 each.

(*d*) A regular system of waste prevention by means of meters was first introduced in 1901.

Muhammadans on the staffs of the Private Secretary and Military Secretary.

247. • Maulvi A. H. M. WAZIR ALI: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased—

(*a*) to lay a statement on the table showing separately the total strength, with pay, of the offices of the Private Secretary and the Military Secretary to His Excellency the Governor of Bengal?

(*b*) to state how many of these appointments are held by Muhammadans and non-Muhammadans, together with their names and qualifications?

(*c*) to state the number of vacancies that have occurred in the above offices during the last five years, and the number of Muhammadans appointed therein?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) and (*b*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*c*) No vacancy has occurred during the last five years. One assistant from the Private Secretary to Governor's office has gone on deputation to the Rent Controller's office, and a non-Muhammadan has been acting in his place.

Statement referred to in the reply to clauses (a) and (b) of the unstarred question No. 247.

Office of—	Total strength	Post. Number.	Post. Designation	Pay.	Names of holders.	Qualifications.
				Rs.		
Private Secretary to Governor.	6	1	Superintendent	200—15—350	Babu Jnanendra Nath Sur.	Passed F. A. and Government of India clerkship examination.
		1	Assistant Superintendent and Confidential Assistant.	150—15—300	Mr. N. C. Bose	Educated in St. Xavier's and Bishop's College.
		1	1st Assistant ...	75—7½—150	Babu Amrita Lal Mukerji.	Passed F. A. Examination.
		1	2nd Assistant ..	60—5—110	Babu Provash Chandra Chatterji (on deputation to Rent Controller's office).	Passed Entrance Examination.
		1	3rd Assistant ...	40—4—60	Babu Ashutosh Ghosh.	Ditto.
		1	4th Assistant ...	40 (fixed)	Babu Anil Chandra Sen.	Ditto.
		6				
Military Secretary to Governor.	6	1	Superintendent	150—20—350	Rai Sahib Hira Lal Dutta.	Passed F. A examination; knows typewriting.
		1	Assistant Superintendent and Accountant.	100—10—150	Babu Satkori Basu.	Ditto.
		1	1st Assistant ...	85—5—125	Babu Mohit Chandra Ray	Passed Entrance examination; knows typewriting.
		1	2nd Assistant ...	40—4—60	Babu Manindra Nath Mitter.	Ditto.
		1	3rd Assistant ...	40—4—60	Babu Manindra Nath Ghosh.	Ditto.
		1	Shorthand Writer.	45—4½—110	Babu Manmatha Nath Mullick.	Knows shorthand and typewriting.
		6				

Census office at Barisal.

248. Maulvi A. H. M. WAZIR ALI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state the designation and name of the officer who opened the Census office at Barisal?

(*b*) Did he advertise the vacancies in his office, and did he keep a register of the applications received?

(*c*) If so, how many applications were received, and how many of them were from Muhammadan candidates?

(*d*) How many inspectors, head-clerks, record-keepers, sorting supervisors, sorters, copying supervisors, assistant supervisors, copyists and peons are employed in that office, and how many of them are Muhammadans?

(*e*) Is it a fact that there is a low percentage of Muhammadan employés. If so, what is the reason for this?

(*f*) What action, if any, are the Government taking to protect the interests of Muhammadans in filling up vacancies in the public service?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE [JAILS] (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): (*a*) Babu Binod Bihari Das Gupta, Deputy Magistrate, made preliminary arrangements before the Deputy Superintendent of Census, Babu Hiranya Kumar Das Gupta, joined.

(*b*) Advertisements were published in Barisal of the posts of inspectors, supervisors and slip copyists. No register of applications was kept. The staff of sorters was selected from among the slip copyists.

(*c*) The information can only be given in respect of applications for the post of inspector. There were 26 applicants, all of whom were Hindus.

(*d*) The following is the present staff:—

	Hindu	Muhammadan
(1) Inspector	4	...
(2) Head clerk, record keeper, and assistants ...	4	...
(3) Supervisors	18	2
(4) Sorters	146	42

The work of slip copying was finished some time ago.

(*e*) The percentage of Muhammadans employed is only just over 20 per cent.

The employment being only for a few months, and offering no prospect for the future, it was not thought necessary to consider the proportion in which persons from different classes of the community were taken in.

(*f*) The member is referred to the answers given to questions No. 67 (*a*) and (*b*) and No. 227 (*a*) at the meeting of the Bengal Legislative Council held on the 4th July, 1921.

Resignation of Government servants owing to the non-co-operation movement.

249. Babu JOGENDRA KRISHNA ROY: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state the number, names and positions of officers under the employ of the Government who have resigned their services owing to the non-co-operation movement?

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): A statement is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 249, showing the number, names and position of officers under the Government of Bengal who have resigned their posts as a result of the non-co-operation movement.

	Name.	Position.
1	Nripendra Chandra Banarji	... Professor of English, Chittagong College (B. E. S.)
2	Bankim Chandra Das	... Assistant Master (on probation) Hare School, Calcutta Class VIII (S. E. S.)
3	Premananda Datta	... Preventive officer, Collector of Customs, Chittagong
4.	Sumati Mohan Chattarji	... Kanungo employed in Jessore.
5	Paresh Prasanna Sen	... Clerk office of the Executive Engineer, Chittagong
6	Jangbir Chhetri	... Junior clerk, Deputy Commissioner's office Darjeeling
7	Kamini Kanta Ganguly	.. Temporary clerk in the second Sub-Judge's Court, Bakarganj
8.	Muhammad Monir	... Constable, 24-Parganas Police.
9.	Bazlar Rahaman	... Constable, Chittagong Police.

Resolutions

(under the rules for the discussion of matters of general public interest).

(The discussion on the resolutions on woman suffrage was resumed.)

Woman Suffrage.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: The trend of the arguments of the supporters of the resolution is that woman was born equal with man with full liberty of action. Franchise is her birthright and man has deprived her of her rights and privileges and subjected her to perpetual tutelage and that she has been the victim of convention. Though they are loud in denouncing man, they have given very little reason to show how woman has equal rights with man in all matters

including politics nor have they taken care to show how franchise is her birthright. They have not explained what is meant by birthright. I take it to mean that when a person is born with a special attitude and fitness for a particular thing, a right to do that thing may be called that person's birthright. Now let us examine, with what natural gifts she was born, are those qualities essentially necessary or suitable for governance or protection of a country? If so, she may be said to have a birthright to vote, otherwise not. Eve was never created as an entity and juxtaposed by the side of Adam, but she was created out of the rib of Adam for the solace and companionship of Adam. She was endowed with some milder qualities, graces of person, aptitude to make her a useful wife and a loving mother. The constitution of her body and inherent periodical disabilities make her essentially unfit for outdoor work for the matter of that, for administration and defence of a country. As she is quite unfit for defence and administration of a country, franchise cannot be her birthright.

It is argued for advancement and protection of her interests it is necessary that she should have a voice in the administration of the country, for she has some peculiar wants which man is not likely to understand. Against this argument suffice it to say that man has invented a perfect system of medicine taking into account the minutest details of her diseases and ailments without the help of woman. He has developed the science of child welfare and woman played no part in it. Where is then ground for apprehension that man cannot carry on administration of the country without the help and co-operation of woman, and cannot provide for her peculiar wants. It is true that some women have shown a little knowledge of the theory of Government and have got eloquence and persuasive tone and men have appreciated their virtues; that is no reason why she should be allowed a share in the administration as this is not the sphere of activity where she can take part without impairing some of the nobler qualities for which she was created. True Government consists in presenting before its subjects opportunities for the highest development and perfect realisation of qualities and faculties inherent in the individuals without interfering with the rights and privileges of others. I have no objection to afford facilities for the development of womanly qualities and help her in the cultivation of those faculties in her which make her a loyal and dutiful wife, an affectionate mother and a loving sister, but I cannot lend my support to any measure intended to make her statesmen (should I call stateswoman) and warrior or to allow her any share in the government of the country which requires sterner qualities of the head and heart.

The next question is whether it is expedient to allow her vote in the Council election. There is absolutely no necessity for her meddling in this affair, it being beyond her sphere of action and undue mixing in politics will make her less fit for and less attentive to domestic affairs which are her primary duties to perform. Division and distribution of

labour has resulted in the great development of industry; there is no reason why we should disturb the division of labour between man and woman which division has the sanction of ages. Can the advocates of female franchise tell us what want of her co-operation has been felt in the field of politics? Man is anxious to give her proper education to make her more fit for her task and has relieved her of many drudgeries such as spinning, etc. In imparting education to females, we committed a mistake in allowing her to be educated on the same lines as sketched out for males and by school and college education our modern ladies are losing the grace, tenderness and other feminine qualities and advancing more and more towards manly qualities to the negligence of womanly qualities. Baneful effect of promiscuous mixing with men and exercise of manly qualities is branded on her person and she is showing marked discontent towards domestic life taking little care of children and husband even during their illness. I know of some educated ladies who would oblige their friends with their prattle though the husband is rotting on his bed with serious illness. I heard a husband lamenting for his selection in his younger days when his brain was filled up with high ideals and extravagant notions about the educated females. By claiming franchise for females, she is entering on a new chapter of life and activity. I warn the gentlemen of the Council to think thrice as to the future effect of such a step when it is not yet too late. She has been encouraged by the grant of franchise in some European countries and some of our councillors are anxious blindly to imitate the English statesman. The Englishmen are exercising the right of voting almost from the time when they met King John at Runnymede and they did not allow women franchise till yesterday and that, too, under peculiar circumstances, when the male population of England was decimated by the ruinous war and the help of women was badly needed. That the English statesmen did not allow the females to vote for so many centuries is a proof positive of the fact that a woman had no intrinsic merit to claim franchise. That the English statesmen managed the affairs admirably well without woman points to the same conclusion. It is argued that the English statesmen were foolish not to allow the franchise to females so long. If foolish statesmen of England could raise their country to her present position of reigning supreme over the whole world, let us remain fools for some centuries and see what we can do by such tomfoolery of excluding women from the fields of politics.

If we allow female franchise the immediate effect will not be much. Mahatma Gandhi extended franchise to females on condition of paying annas four only and none but the prostitutes cared to vote though sympathisers are not wanting even amongst females. But gradually it will cause disintegration of family life and put an end to the domestic happiness. If both male and female join with feverish excitement of political life, there will be none to look after our home affairs. Ladies are more prone to blindly imitate their sisters of the West as they have shewn in

the choice of dress and fineries. Europe's cup of misery on the score of women is almost full. It has nearly completed the circle. Women have made considerable progress towards the original state of nature. European States have to legislate to keep the females within due bounds of decency, and police has to measure the extent of exposure in the person of girls in the streets. Ladies are anxious to forego their womanhood, the *summum bonum* of their life. Girls are taking to manly games and habits and thereby they are having broad shoulders like Greek heroes of the old and some other parts of their body highly developed which quite unsuited them for motherhood. Considerable anxiety is being felt in Europe on that ground. Some States have declared prizes and special concessions for having children. I would ask in all seriousness, are members of the Council anxious to bring about such a state of things in Bengal? Some of our friends are anxious to give the ladies votes only and not seats in the Council, that is, the view not the touch of the dear delights, the sight to inflame their hearts, to long for the pine-apple in frames not certainly to look and linger but to break the glass and cut their fingers. I would advise them to accept the lead of wisdom and truth and gather honey from the woods. It would be a great relief to men if educated ladies engaged themselves to fight against social evils, tried to improve the comforts of family life, and combated the growing evils among modern girls of neglecting their legitimate duties. There are numerous fields for their activities. There is absolutely no reason why they should be anxious to tread on such rougher grounds which men often find uncongenial and show hankering for private life. After toils of the day, when a man retires, he naturally expects some milder topics to chase away his cares. Would you like, gentlemen, that females too should talk politics and make our home and hearth as disgusting as London was at the time of Dr. Johnson when he says, "there is some female theist who talks you dead." For the last few days some bioscope companies have put an object lesson before the public showing in lurid lights the undesirable effect of female activities in political matters. A soldier had a very loyal and educated wife——

The PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): I do not think it is relevant what the bioscope company showed.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: It shows the social life.

The PRESIDENT: You can speak of the social life without referring to the bioscope company.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: Should I omit? A soldier had a very loyal and educated wife. It was reported from the front that the soldier died in action. The loyal wife was very sorry——

The PRESIDENT: I do not think all this is relevant. I rule you out of order.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: It showed the change in social life. So, I would advise the ladies to seek happiness in domestic affairs minding the welfare of children and trying to improve the lot of suffering humanity. "Far other things their hearts should learn to prize: more bent to raise the wretched than to rise."

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: Considering the importance of the subject of this resolution I think it would be wrong on my part to remain silent. I have heard with great interest the various speakers and the divergent views expressed on this subject. I am not opposed to giving the woman of our country her proper place. I think with the poet that the woman's cause is man's. I have got the highest regard for some of them. The great law-giver Manu says:—

Women are to be honoured and adored by fathers and brothers, by husbands, as also by brothers-in-law, who desire much prosperity. Where women are honoured, there the Gods rejoice; but where they are not honoured, there all rites are fruitless.

In ancient India, no doubt, women enjoyed an amount of liberty not enjoyed by them at the present time. The women of ancient India got wide education and consequently enjoyed dignified liberty. But the country was immersed in cimmerian darkness without the hope, without the light for centuries, till the light from the West began to dispel the gloom. My friends who advocate franchise for women forget that there are functions that are specially to be discharged by woman. The great division of sexes that we find in humanity points this out. As has been said by a great woman, "any attempt to bridge over that difference, any attempt to turn a man into a woman or a woman into a man, means the throwing back of humanity, a check on its orderly, on its progressive evolution." Certain distinct qualities are evolved in each sex, certain distinct powers are found to be assigned to the one sex or to the other. To try to unsex either is to make a fundamental blunder. At a time when she has just attained intellectual and physical development, she is to become the mother of children, to nurse them, whereas man is, to work for the upbringing of the little ones to play his part in the world's broad field of battle. Why should we forget this fundamental difference between man and woman? It is necessary that those who are trying to uplift the political status of our women, should first try to uplift their intellectual, their educational status? How is it that my friends have done nothing up to this time to spread education among the girls of our country? How is it that while some of the ladies of the laud and their number is less than a miscroscopic minority are trying to vote along with men in the Council that they have not approached Government either themselves or through their accredited representatives in the Council to take immediate steps to establish girls' schools in every village of this province for the free

and compulsory education of girls? I would tell them "Ministering Angels," "how is it that you are not by the bedside of the sick and poverty-stricken men of the land who are dying not by hundreds but by thousands without succour and without nursing? How is it that in the hospitals of this city we find European ladies, "Little Sisters of the Poor," "Sisters of Charity," tending the sick and there is not one single of our country-woman working for love? In speaking of the woman of the West, Mrs. Besant has said—

> . . . the gaining of their livelihood leads them unnecessarily into competition with men. Out of that competition, out of that struggle for existence, out of the passing of women into the arena of life-struggle, where they have to gain their own livelihood and fight with their own hands against the competition of women, out of that has arisen the demand for what is called the higher education of women. That is the economic reason underlying the demand for higher education. I presume that no Hindu, unless he has lost the Hindu heart, desires to bring about the same economic condition of things here. I presume that he does not desire to educate his daughters, and then to send them out into the world to struggle with men for gaining a livelihood, to compete with men in the various learned professions, in the various commercial undertakings.

Let, therefore, the women of India take their proper place in this country, let them exercise in elevating influence over the children, let them prove worthy mothers to worthy sons. Has it not been said that there is nowhere to be found spirituality so pure and lofty, devotion so strong and tender, purity so unsullied and spotless, as are to be found in the women of India. Why should she, the woman of India, belie all that and hanker after something from which neither our society nor our country can benefit. It was after years of struggle that the women of England got the franchise only the other day. The Reforms here are only a few months old. Let us wait and see how they work. Let us not try to turn everything topsy-turvy now.

I should like to know how many of my friends here who have spoken in favour of this franchise have been asked by their female relations, their wives, their mothers, their sisters or their daughters to support this movement? How many of them even know about this?

It is said that they have voted for giving the suffrage to women in Madras and in Bombay. Those who had been to these places know full well that the *purdah* does not exist there and unfortunately this *purdah* has made a great deal of difference between the women of Bengal and those of Bombay and Madras. I, therefore, cannot support the resolution of my esteemed friend M. S. M. Bose. There is no demand in the country for the suffrage of woman. Let our mothers, wives, daughters and sisters lord over us in the household which is her true realm Let them not be competitors in all that makes life a fierce and selfish struggle for place, power and money. Let us wait. Let us not try to rush in things. But this I must say that if this Council decides in favour of woman suffrage, I would suggest, for the consideration of the Council as well as for any committee that may be appointed, that

qualified females be allowed to vote in the election of female candidates to whom a few seats may be allotted. Let them not exercise their power of voting in any general constituency of the province, except the University constituency.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY and **Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur** moved that the question be put.

The motion being put, a division was taken, the Ayes being 37, and Noes 45, the motion was lost, and the debate continued.

Maulvi EMADUDDIN AHMED: I am opposed to the resolution that has been moved by my friend Mr. S. M. Bose saying that the franchise should be given to women irrespective of any consideration.

We are not Calcutta men; we come from the mufassal; our Calcutta friends will laugh at us when we say that we have got our own mufassal ideas. There is a saying in my part of the country that if women are allowed to attend three marriage ceremonies, they will refuse to revert to their husbands' homes. How will it be possible for the members of Council to permit their womenfolk to attend the Council and mix freely with men, when it is the custom, both among Hindus and Muhammadans, to keep their womenfolk in their homes, and not allow them to mix with other men at all. It has also been suggested that in the case of estates owned by men zamindars, it would be better if the management were in the hands of the women. There have been instances in which women were left to manage their own estates and had officers under them and had shown undue favour to particular officers, which has brought an indelible blot upon the name of the whole family. With the little education that these women have got, is it desirable that they should come out and take in deliberations with men?

Maulvi Yakuinuddin Ahmed has said that Arab women used to urge their husbands and friends to war and used to accompany them; but I say this was before the Islamic days, when the marriage tie was a lax one between man and woman. It is not for me to criticize; the present question before us is whether women are to have the franchise or not—it will have to be decided by vote. Muhammadan ladies are very loth to come out of their *purdah*; the fact remains that if we extend the franchise to mufassal women, they will not care to come out to take part in elections either for municipal commissioners or councillors. Another aspect of the question, which has been suggested by Maulvi Wasimuddin Ahmed, is this: when a woman has been elected and has taken her seat in this Council and taken part in its deliberations, would she like to go back to her domestic duties and take charge of the kitchen? I ask every Muhammadan member to place his hand on his breast and answer that question. The time will, I daresay, come when the whole question will have to be reviewed, and the franchise given to women; but I say that this resolution is rather premature just now.

Maulvi Yakumuddin has said that women used to be allowed to go to Mecca to perform pilgrimage; this is correct, but the universal Muhammadan law and custom is that she must be elderly and must go under the care of some person who is related to her within the prohibited degrees, and is not in a position to marry her. This is the law. There is great danger of your not being able to stick to your *purdah* in earnestness. Even in European countries Queen Elizabeth and Queen Victoria, though they were queens, did not give franchise to women. In England this franchise has only been given within recent years. Some one has said, "East is east, and West is west." This is nothing new. In our domestic life we picture the mother in her home with her children round her taking care of them and looking to their welfare; this is a beautiful picture. I beg of my friends to consider the point before they think of making our domestic life unhappy.

With these words, I beg to oppose this motion.

Dr. HASSAN SUHRAWARDY: Speaking on the question of woman suffrage, one finds oneself in a rather difficult position. It is almost impossible to maintain an attitude of strict neutrality or to remain uninfluenced one way or the other where women are concerned. The finer sentiments of man and his spirit of gallantry prompt him at once to take the side of the weaker sex. I notice that even some of the members of Lord Southborough's Committee have succumbed to the subtle influences of the fair and I am not surprised. Champions of woman suffrage point out to us the example of England. The example of England need not be blindly followed. England granted female suffrage the other day after years of agitation. Not long ago in England women were classed with infants, lunatics, and others mentally or morally deficient. The determining factor in favour of female suffrage in England was probably the devastating world war which wiped out the manhood of England. Champions of woman suffrage lightly talk of equality of men and women. Assume for argument's sake that men and women are equal—for I am not going to discuss here the physiological difference between them and the physical disabilities of women. If you want equality, then let there be equal justice between man and woman and between woman and woman and let the same qualifications of electors apply to women as to men (*vide* Bengal Electoral Rules—Rule 8, Manual page 112). There should be no alteration or relaxation of the rules in favour of women. For example, women matriculates should not be allowed the same privilege as men graduates of seven years' standing.

As men are not debarred from the franchise on the ground of living on the earnings of women or of being immoral, the theory of equality demands that women of the town (who, unlike the bulk of Hindu women, possess self-acquired property, not merely *Stridhan*) should not be excluded from participation in the benefits of the franchise. If we concede this, what will happen can very easily be imagined. Women graduates of seven years' standing and women with property will be swamped

by women of the town. Gawharjans and Aspasias of Calcutta and their male supporters will be sent up by their friends along with some sedate and highly respected blue stocking and, as was rightly observed by a previous speaker, our good friends the non-co-operators will not miss the opportunity of insulting and ridiculing the Council by sending "public women to keep company with public men." The resolution of Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur should be opposed, because if we apply the University qualification alone we have to leave out of consideration a large number of highly cultured and educated ladies who are as broad-minded, as useful and as intellectual as those who possess the B.A. and M.A. degrees of a University. The names of the ladies quoted by the Secretary of the Nari Samaj, viz., Maharani Sarnomay, Rani Sarat Sundari, Srimati Janaki Choudhurani were women of parts and culture without any University qualifications and there are many who have not attended any school or taken any diploma or learnt English or any foreign language and yet are highly educated in every sense of the word and they would be left out.

The greatest objection to woman suffrage is the practical difficulty which has to be faced, the innumerable crop of election petitions which will follow in the wake of each election alleging false personations in recording votes of *purdah* women. We must also consider the enormous burden of expenditure this poor country will have to bear in order to provide suitable strict *purdah* polling booths and reliable highly-paid female polling officers at every polling station. From our experience of so-called *purdah* parties in which we find an overwhelming proportion of non-*purdah* women over the actual *purdah-nashin*, we can safely infer that most of the women who are now anxious to participate in the dust and heat of political life will find a suitable haven of refuge inside these *purdah* booths and I cannot see what return the country will get for this enormous bother and trouble and expenditure and waste of public money. It is said we will derive inspiration and receive co-operation from them. Inspiration and co-operation, indeed! Can we not get and do we not now enjoy these benefits from our lady friends? Do inspiration and co-operation depend upon their enfranchisement? Is it just and fair to burden the country with an enormous expense simply to satisfy the petulant demand of a small microscopic minority for which we are not likely to get any return or any substantial benefits? The examples of Bombay and Madras are held out before us. Let us not forget the social conditions of Bombay and Madras. The social conditions of Bombay and Madras are different from those of Bengal. The free Maharashtra people have never suffered from that terrible affliction called the *purdah* system. The Parsi women are free to enjoy God's light and air. The women of Madras are not shut within the four walls of the zenana. Of course there are exceptions here and there. Remember that it is not Bengal but Madras that boasts of the biggest maternity hospital in India. The women of Bengal would do

well not to break their heart over the bauble of woman suffrage. They will do more good to their country and to their community if they directed their zeal and energy to the substantial work of carrying the light of education into the darkest corners of the benighted homes of the caste-ridden and *purdah*-stricken women of Bengal. Ignorance and superstition are at the root of infant mortality, of premature senility, of lowered vitality, of incompatibility of temperament between husband and wife and of a thousand and one evils. Let them first of all go forward to abolish the degrading custom of the slave-market, of exhibiting girls to the agent of the bridegroom and exposing them to the risk of the insult of rejection if unable to provide a handsome dowry. Where is the premium on intellectual superiority over filthy lucre or even physical charms, in this pernicious practice? The abolition of these degrading customs is more vital, more urgent, more pressing than the empty satisfaction of giving them votes. Let us try and reconstitute the Hindu Law of Inheritance which unjustly debars a woman from getting a just share of her paternal property. Before these bigger issues that of woman franchise pales into insignificance. Only a few months ago, in this very Hall, our revered leader, the Minister of Health, pointed out that the Bengali race is dying out, that the death-rate is higher than the birth-rate in Bengal. Let the women of Bengal fight ignorance, superstition, prejudice, disease and decay, be good housewives, good mothers, good sisters. These are more important matters than wasting one's energy in clamouring for votes. I believe that women should get votes and they will get votes when the time is ripe for it, whether they demand it or not. But the point to consider is: Is it good for them to get it at this stage? The whole world is in a state of ferment. Shall we now add to the turmoil? At the threshold of the Reforms are we not running the risk of riding our horse to death? How many of us enfranchised men really relish the dust and heat, the din and clamour of political life? Should we, without a moment's pause, try to drag our women from the seclusion of the zenana into the arena of party polemics and party politics, the atmosphere of insincerity and hypocrisy, of broken faiths and unredeemed pledges? Beware of the proverbial "Laddoo of Delhi" which, like the apple of the Dead Sea, is fine to look at from a distance, but when touched crumbles to dust and ashes. The baneful method of utilising the honest and unbalanced students are sure to be largely applied by the extremists to inexperienced and emotional women who are oftener led away by sentiment than guided by reason. The practice of playing to the gallery must cease. It is easy to gain cheap popularity but it is difficult to maintain reputation for steadiness, firmness, and far-sighted statesmanship. Swim with the tide, join the war-cry of the masses, advocate non-co-operation and *hartals* and you will at once be dubbed a Mahatma, a Maulana, a Desabandhu or a Desapriya; you will get all the good on earth and all the good in heaven, the Crown of Martyrdom here and the

Kingdom of Heaven hereafter. But the bubble will burst sooner or later and there will be a terrible awakening. Carried away by the passion of the moment let us not forget the relative fitness of things.

Sir, in the pamphlet published by the Nari Samaj, members of the Bombay Legislative Council, who opposed the resolution for woman suffrage, have been called Liliputians. I am sure the supporters of the resolution here aspire to be dubbed Brobdignags. I have no ambition to be the one or the other. I have not lost my sense of proportion. I am quite content to be styled what I am—not an Adonis, but a plain, ordinary mortal, a mere man. Sir, I oppose the motion as premature.

Before I sit down I cannot forget to take notice of the utterances of an hon'ble member who has thought it fit to drag into the whirlpool of polemics the sacred names of the womanhood of Islam. I would have strongly protested against his conduct could I make up my mind to take him seriously. I cannot quite believe that the erstwhile champion of orthodoxy and conservatism has really become a genuine convert to the cause of female suffrage. I am at a loss to determine whether the championship of women's cause by the hon'ble member is in the interest of co-operation or non-co-operation. I wonder if his lapse is simply a manifestation of the symptoms of his old disease—playing to the gallery; and the gallery to-day with the serried ranks of the army of the fair is playing havoc with the orthodoxy of many a venerable and bearded hon'ble member. I brush aside the wicked and malicious suggestion that the conversion of the hon'ble member dates from June, 1920, since which the number of female votes at his command has doubled, if not quadrupled. I, however, who missed the hon'ble member in the General Election in December but found him in the bye-election in January, having listened with amusement to his speeches for the "Ayes," do not despair of his vote for the "Noes."

The PRESIDENT: I have made many appeals to members to curtail their speeches, but I am sorry to say it has been in vain. There is one point I should like to mention, which may perhaps weigh with you, and that is, that there is a rather important meeting at Government House at 5-30, and many members would, no doubt, like to attend. Perhaps this consideration would weigh with you in making your speeches fewer and shorter.

Babu JOGENDRA NATH ROY: We can have no objection to the principle that underlies the resolution. We desire that franchise should be given to women. We, in the East, have always held the women in respect. From time immemorial the rights of women to property have been recognised by Hindu Law. If my friend, the mover of the resolution, had taken the trouble of reading the Smritis, he would have found that the Hindus have never harboured the opinion that women exist simply to minister to the amusement, enjoyment and vanity of men. Hindus have never subscribed to the opinion, which, till lately, was pre-

valent in the West that "Woman is the lesser man." I admit there are practical difficulties in the way of recording votes, especially in the case of Hindus and Muhammadans. In the case of Hindu women, the vast majority do not possess the necessary property qualification and are *purdahnashin*, facts which should weigh with the Council. Then again, in most cases, the wife will not like to go against her husband, and vote with him, which will mean that the successful canvasser will trap two votes in place of one. The whole matter requires careful consideration. But I am sure we shall be in a position to obviate these difficulties and recommend that sex disqualification should be removed.

Rai PYARI LAL DOSS Bahadur: The question has been discussed threadbare from all points of view, and requires no elucidation; but I would like to say a few words in this connection, in view of the public interest it has attracted. At the outset I beg to submit that I feel bound to oppose the resolution moved by Mr. S. M. Bose. My chief ground is that there are many difficulties in the way which are not easy to overcome.

Of the women-population in Bengal, a vast majority consists of *purdahnashin* ladies; they are not keen at all about the franchise. They will stubbornly refuse to go to any polling station, outside their respective homes to record their votes, even if the polling-officer be one belonging to their sex.

In certain quarters, it has been suggested that the difficulty may be overcome by providing for *purdahnashin* ladies to record their votes in their respective houses. It virtually means that the polling-officer, necessarily a female, will have to go round from house to house, from village to village, with the ballot boxes. If the number of *purdahnashin* voters be pretty large, it would be almost an impossible feat to finish the recording of votes, within the prescribed limit of time, in view of the length of time likely to be occupied in recording the vote of one single *purdahnashin* voter; and if the number of such voters be very small, I would suggest that such small number should be left out of account, and no provision be made for their franchise.

There is another difficulty with regard to *purdahnashin* voters. Candidates for the council election will not have the opportunity to approach them personally, to appeal to them and to urge before them, their respective claims for election, and the result will be that the votes of such women will not be independent votes, recorded upon a due consideration of the respective claims of the several candidates for election, but their votes will be the votes of their father, brother or other near male relation.

My friend, Mr. Bose, has begun at the wrong end of the ladder. In the Local Bodies—I mean the union board, the local board, the district board and the municipal board—which are considered the various units of self-government, no franchise has been granted to women, and no demand for such franchise has been urged up to now. Lady-graduates,

under-graduates or lady-matriculates total a very small number,—a mere microscopic minority—in proportion to the women-population in Bengal; they have not been forward to demand franchise in the local bodies. It would be wise for Mr. Bose to begin at the lower end of the ladder of self-government by demanding franchise for women in the local bodies. On this ground, I beg to submit, Sir, that the resolution moved by Mr. Bose, and the other cognate resolutions, standing on the agenda, are premature. An early experiment may be made of women-franchise in the local bodies, and until such experiment is found successful, the present question be kept in abeyance. I doubt not, Sir, that in the long run, the experiment will prove successful, and that in the fullness of time, full franchise will be extended to women, and it would be a proud day in the history of Bengal, when a lady-councillor will sit together with her brother-councillor, and consult and co-operate with him, for the common good of the country.

Maulvi HAMID-UD-DIN KHAN: I beg to rise to express my opinion on the resolution and amendments that have been moved regarding women franchise in Bengal. This is a very important and serious question and should be considered with all the care and attention which the subject demands. I think I should be wrong if I suddenly jump to the conclusion that franchise should be at once given to our women as it has been done in the West, and equal would be my guilt if I hold the most bigoted and orthodox view that the women as such are never fit for the rights and privileges which have been granted to men. Before coming to a definite conclusion, I think we should examine the questions in all its aspects, but as my time is short I should refer only to a few broad points.

First, let me consider the historical aspect of the matter. It has been said that in ancient times noble characters like Khana, Lilabati, Gergi, Matria and in comparatively recent times great women like Lakshi Bai, Rani Bhobani and Maharani Sarnomay, Nur Jahan, Chandbibi adorned this great land of ours and, as such, the women of this country are sure to prove equally competent with men in the field of politics as well. This argument is quite fallacious. These great ladies are indeed the pride and glory of India,but they are only exceptions. How many more such ladies have flourished since their demise? —perhaps none. Besides, the condition of the ancient India is quite different from modern India. So any reference to these great women does not, at all, help the advocates of female suffrage; rather the past history points otherwise.

In ancient India, Arabia and even in Europe what was the position of women? In India the sphere of women was confined to the home only. They were always guided by their father, husband and son and had no independence of their own. They were never unhappy in that condition. Their interest and welfare were never neglected by

men. On the contrary men did all they could to further, in all possible way, the comforts or conveniences of their mothers, sisters, wives and daughters. The Hindu Rishis of old did not give the women the right of worshipping their gods and goddesses. The Legislature did not give them absolute right in the property. Why were all these disabilities imposed upon them? Because they thought the women were incompetent to equally discharge the function which could be successfully done by men alone, because they thought that there was eternal and fundamental distinction between men and women. So there could be no equality between men and women in the spheres of life. In Arabia even the great Prophet who was the most generous and liberal to women did not give the women the rights and privileges which he granted to men. On the demise of the great Prophet when the question arose as to who should succeed him to the Khalifat, only the opinions of men were taken, not even the opinion of Hazarat Aysa was consulted. She was only asked to inform whether her illustrious husband had left with her any particular desire regarding the succession to the Khalifat. In Europe every one knows the women were regarded as mere chattels and could own no property of their own: such was the state of things in the past. I therefore say that the past history points out, in no uncertain terms that the women are not fit to do equal work with men in all sphere of life.

Secondly, there is eternal and fundamental distinction between men and women. By their very nature and constitution they are different from men. So if they aspire to do the works which should be done by men alone or *vice versa* the world would be unhappy. I do not say that, they should remain ignorant, illiterate and inarticulate; let them receive education. Let them develop their capacities, which may render them good and useful in the social spheres of life, but I think it would be a mistake—a great mistake for them to come and wrangle with men in the field of politics. The great poet Tennyson in his "Princess" has beautifully shown that women should not encroach on the fields reserved for men and I say the *vice versa* case is also true. True, in Europe the suffrage is given to women but how long ago. Only recently after a great struggle of decades of years, but the condition of the West is quite different from that of the East. The analogy of the West does not hold in the East. If you only imitate the West without any regard to the tradition of your own country the result may be disastrous. "West is west and East is east." What is good for the West may be bad for the East and *vice versa*. I therefore say when you like to introduce any change in India you ought to consider with all care and attention whether civilization and the peculiar circumstances of the country permit it. You say Bombay has got it. Madras has got it. Why should Bengal lag behind?

The mere having it will not suffice. Let us see how it works and what result it produces there. I think it would be better to wait at

least a few years and see how it works in the two sister provinces which have extended these rights to the women there. Besides I am of opinion that the condition of women of Bengal is also different from that of Madras or Bombay. In Europe where the women are far more advanced in education and far more different in social matters even there they got it after the last great war. I am therefore of opinion that this resolution is quite premature.

Thirdly, it is said that the interest and welfare of women may not be duly safeguarded by men. It is argued that the females would be better able to represent some questions affecting their interest and welfare such as sanitation or child welfare, etc., but I think these subjects have already drawn the attention of men and they are doing their best in the matter. It is hardly a year that the Reformed Council has come into existence and within this short time it is not proper for the women to say that men will not be equally able to represent their interest and welfare in the Council. It is also wrong to say that they have got any separate interest from those of men, for their interest and welfare are also the interest and welfare of men as well. No man would like that his own mother, sister, wife or daughter would suffer in any way; on the other hand every man could try his best to do all that he can to further the interest of the fair sex. So this argument of the other side also falls to the ground.

Fourthly, if franchise be extended to women at this stage it may be exercised only by a handful of Calcutta ladies, but in the mufassal of which I have considerable experience, very few—almost none—will respond to it. I also think that if the females are given the franchise they will necessarily belong to some political party or other and it may not be uncommon that the husband and the wife will hold diametrically different views and that will surely make the house unhappy. Perhaps many may laugh at this idea, but such cases are sure to arise. Besides, if the females come out in the spheres of politics they shall have to fight with men on many occasions and shall have to associate themselves in many hard and even unpleasant matters and, I am sure, the sweet temper which is a virtue peculiar to them and which makes the home calm or sweet will gradually vanish as they will become so many wrangling debaters; political speakers and partisans and, in the long run, I fear, they will become unsexed. I therefore think that the time is yet far off when the resolution like this can be taken up. Let us first try to make the reforms successful among men; let us first try to abolish the social and religious disabilities of women before we think of their political freedom.

I fear some of the educated ladies of our province may be offended at my attitude which they may call most bigoted and orthodox; but I think I should be frank and sincere in giving my own opinion in the matter. Besides, there will be endless trouble and enormous costs in

giving effect to the resolution, if it be carried in the Council. I am therefore of opinion that these resolutions and amendments are all premature and should be withdrawn at present.

Maulvi SHAH MUHAMMAD CHAUDHURI: The resolution involves the question whether we are ready to grant equal status to women with males. The position of women in the world over, indicates that the men have assumed superiority over women and their rights and liberties have been circumscribed accordingly.

Women have been relegated to their present position in society all over the world on account of their natural disabilities. They are always best and superior in the question of heart; but are very seldom proficient in the qualities of head. Even in European countries, which are undoubtedly far advanced in this respect of the women suffrage, the principle has not yet been adopted universally. In the Eastern World, specially in India, where males and females cannot mix with each other freely and publicly, the granting of suffrage is out of the question.

My friend, the learned mover undoubtedly has the few educated sisters living in Calcutta and some of the towns in view in moving this resolution and I draw his attention to what a small proportion they bear to the millions of illiterate women of our country. The multifarious social customs and religious obstructions stand in their way to exercise their right to vote even if it is granted.

If it is granted for the sake of some of the few educated women of the town, it would be a great disaster to our female societies as a large number of bazar women of easy virtue who pay rates and taxes would come out as electors, with whom no one would like to associate.

I do not understand what good the women will achieve by becoming voters, or what further interest they would try to get which are not looked after by their husbands, fathers or brothers. If they want to become members of the Council or of the District Board or of the Municipalities, I for myself would not like them to be so.

They would really make harm to the country than making any good. It is known to all that women are very sentimental and they are always guided by sentiments. Had not Eve been misguided by Satan and persuaded Adam to take the prohibited fruit and thereby brought misery upon them? Did not Lady Macbeth instigate her husband in the murder of Duncan? Besides petty jealousies are ingrained in their nature and for that they are quite unfit to be members of deliberative bodies.

The women are physically different from men and they are intended by God to perform different kinds of works in life. In the great division of labour of mankind and of the specialisation of their duties women have to look after and manage household affairs and nursing of children and invalids and men have taken charge of the sterner duties of

the protection of the country and other industries. Then why are we going to subvert it and bring women to meddle in politics? This would be an innovation which will require reconstruction of society and there would be a social revolution.

My friend Maulvi Yakuinuddin Ahmed said the other day that while hundreds of Muhammadan women are going to Mecca why would they not come out of *purdah* for recording their votes? But, Sir, that is a different matter and cannot be compared with female electors. The number of such women is very few, even a fractional part of the whole number of females. These women generally go to pilgrimage when they become hoary in head and totter for the grave and even under our religion they are not allowed to go with any other male's company but to that of their husbands, fathers, brothers, sons and such other male relatives with whom marriage is prohibited.

I am sorry that few of our Muhammadan members who are lawyers in profession have supported this resolution. But are they not aware that our religion does not allow women to be guardians of the properties of their children although they are guardians of their bodies? Is it not known to them that they are not allowed to give their consent in marriage of their children? Why this difference. Why have they not been allowed these privileges? Because they are wanting in the power of deliberation. Sir, my friend Dr. J. N. Moitra named some women who managed their properties well, but were they not supported by good male officers and councillors? There are no instances in history where a female is a Councillor or Minister and wherever there is an instance of female influence at the back of males, there had been intrigues and dissensions in the management of affairs as in Nur Jahan's case.

With these few words, I strongly oppose the resolution as well as all the amendments.

Rai Sahib PANCHANAN BARMA: I am afraid I must oppose the resolution. Considered as simply as political beings, I think women can claim to have votes equally with men because they own property and pay taxes, and to pay taxes is the criterion on which the vote is based; in that case it would happen that women would have votes equally with men, but if that is the case taxes have got no morality at all; so we cannot refuse votes to the public women also; and if we allow votes to the public women they will come forward and swamp the women of home life; and we shall see fine women —public women—adorning the Council, and what will be the effect?

The PRESIDENT: We have heard a great deal of public women in this connection, and that argument may now be left out.

Rai Sahib PANCHANAN BARMA: It is not simply a case of politics; there is something which is more ancient and more vital and I

think more essential than politics; it is society; and it is in the midst of society that we can live in peace and happiness without having to do anything with politics; if that is the case the interests of society must be looked after before we come to give votes to women. In the society there are different parts for men and women to play; some parts are assigned to men and some to women, and if men and women do but discharge the duties assigned to them respectively, the home becomes heavenly. I beg to submit that our home is heavenly, but if there are constant differences and wranglings then the home becomes a perpetual scene of discord and unhappiness. We, the Hindus—to use the homely phrase—do not say, the house is a house; our conception is not that the house is a house but that it is the women in the house who is really the house; —who by their counsel and guidance render it so; so that if we draw our wives and women from the house, the organisation of home life will dwindle down to utter ruin with unhappiness as its inevitable concomitant.

We have heard of many eminent women in the course of this debate such as Rani Durgabati, the fighting woman, Rani Bhobani, the politician who counselled at the time of Serajaudullah, and there are many more. In this connection, I may mention of one of rural memory Rani Ranachandi of Jalpaiguri who fought her battles with Kathmas. But who were they? Did they mix in politics? Did they do anything political? Did they come out to have elections to secure votes and debate and insist on their political franchise? Certainly not. They did their work quietly at home—a work in which their heart and head had the greatest play; they were ideal Grihinis and from that position we are trying to dislodge them by the grant of the right to vote. The ideal character of a wife is given by the most celebrated and greatest of our poets—Kalidas; it is in the story of "Sakuntala" the most beautiful of dramas. When Sakuntala was about to go to her husband's house, this was the advice given her by Kanwa, her foster-father. [Here the speaker quoted a few stanzas from "Sakuntala" which instructed her to serve her superiors with respect; to have recourse to the conduct of a good friend to the rival wives of her husband: Never in anger to go against her husband, even when treated with slight and harshness; to be kind and courteous towards the attendants; not to be puffed up in times of good fortune, so young women get to the place of a good Grihini that is the mistress of the house, those who act in the contrary way are the pests of the house.] My submission is that the evolution of such celebrated women is the outcome of this ideal,—that too is suggested by the great poet. When Sakuntala asked Kanwa when she might again come to the Asrama, she was thus advised. [The speaker again quoted a few lines from the same book: "So doing, you will soon rise to the position of a rival of the Four-quartered Earth and then placing the son of Duswartha on the throne with your husband will again come to this

peaceful Asrama."] These women of celebrated memory were the outcome not of the grant of political emancipation, but of this noble ideal of ministering to the comforts and peace of home.

My submission is that if we allow women to come out and vote publicly like males, the result will be that they will be quarrelsome; their household duties will be neglected and they will not attend to their home duties wherein alone their greatness lies.

With these few words, I oppose the resolution.

Raja MANILOLL SINGH ROY: Sir, at heart I am not against the resolution of my friend Mr. S. M. Bose on the subject of female franchise. If the Reforms and the Reformed Council are good things, how can we deny them to our women of whom the poet has truly sung "Oh, woman, lovely woman! Nature made thee to temper men. We had been brutes without you." But, Sir, there are some great and insurmountable difficulties in the way which we should not overlook. Now, even if polling arrangements are made to suit the *zenana* ladies behind the *purdah* in all the general electorates, will their fathers and sons, brothers and husbands ever consent to allow the male candidates or their agents who in majority of cases are bound to be males to be present at the polling behind the *purdah*. The great majority of them would not like it themselves. The electoral rules allow them to the polling booth, which, as experience has shown, is absolutely necessary. I think, Sir, this is a difficulty almost insurmountable and cannot be successfully grappled with in the present state of our society. This is my humble opinion in the matter and I should like to know if my friend Mr. Bose could find a way out of it.

I have no objection to give it to particular sections, such as Europeans and Anglo-Indians who do not observe *purdah*, but not to the general non-Muhammadan or Muhammadan electorates almost all of whom observe *purdah*, as in giving the franchise to them we shall be giving advantage only to a certain section of the communities where a candidate of that particular community, whether male or female, will be on the field as a rival to one who observes the *purdah* system.

Moreover, Sir, we do not know, what rules, if any, have been framed as yet in the provinces where it is said there is *purdah* system and yet franchise to the females has been given. We should look into it first and shall then decide. I am sorry that Mr. Bose is silent on the point. These are matters of facts and should be decided on such proofs and not on sentiment alone.

Rai ABINASH CHANDRA BANERJEE Bahadur: It is sheer madness to attempt to arrive at a definite conclusion by the way in which we have been debating over this matter. In the first place, may I inquire of my friends who strictly observe this *purdah* system that if their ladies can, observing strict *purdah*, go to the places of pilgrimage

and visit the temples and do everything regarding worship in the temples before men, will it stand in the way of these very ladies if they go to the polling booths and record their votes? I do not think so. The difficulties which have been put forward are all sentimental and theoretical. There are 60 lakhs of men in Bengal who have got the franchise; of them 40 lakhs are illiterate; if it can be managed to record their votes, it will not at all be difficult to have the votes recorded of these ladies who want to have their votes so recorded. Another thing that has struck me very much is this. We are presuming that if a woman be a voter she will be a candidate for a seat in the Council. But that is not a fact. The rules of the Council would not allow that. What Mr. Bose has proposed is a change in section 7, only for the purpose of allowing women to have the right of votes. But the rule which prohibits woman from taking her seat in the Council will not be affected by the amendment proposed by Mr. Bose. For the next 10 years a woman cannot sit in the Council. Secondly, I find it has also been said that the number of votes will be very great, but I think that the number cannot but be very small because women have to qualify for votes and must pay road-cess or municipal or chaukidari tax and the number of women who pay such taxes and rates in Bengal is very small indeed. So there is no fear that the number of women voters will be very great. So I appeal to the House to take into consideration all these facts and not discuss theoretical difficulties. Let us be practical. Only the other day when I was having a talk with a European friend of mine, he said, "when will the Indians learn the principle of give-and-take as regards their women?" He further said, "at present we have only been taking from them and not giving them anything. Let us now give them something."

Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: I rise to oppose the resolutions on woman franchise. I have given my fullest consideration to the question, but I am afraid I am unable to see its utility. It is no question if the women want it or not, but the first and foremost of all it will be considered if the franchise will be of any good to the country and the human race, and if it is required at all. I say "no." The country will derive no benefit from it and the Council will not increase in efficiency with the votes of women. Then for what purpose this franchise is demanded. Is it not to satisfy the vanities of some ladies that this question is before the House? We have learnt to imitate the vices of European countries and not the virtues. European countries and other provinces of India have granted the franchise to women, and that is no reason why it should be granted in Bengal. We must look to the result and utility of the franchise and not follow suit with other peoples. The freedom of women has made many European homes miserable and unhappy to the extreme, and they would have turned the wheel back if they could. They have much advanced in their folly and nothing less than a revolution will set them right. Time is not

far off that the women will be pushed back to their proper sphere when the unemployed question will be too acute. In Europe the freedom of women came first and the political franchise later on, while in India franchise is going to precede the freedom, bringing the same pernicious effect in its train. It is said the English were fools in not granting franchise to women so long. Sir, they are not fools, but wiser and sadder from the experiences of freedom to women and for that reason only they were opposing the political franchise to women. Otherwise what reason might there have been to deny the franchise to their own women by the English who are advocating liberty and equality of men for centuries? The English have been now compelled to grant the franchise out of dire necessity ensuing from want of capable men. No such necessity has arisen in India to allow our women to take parts in all spheres of life with men, to the neglect of more important duties at home.

It is said the Arab women fought with their husbands in battle-fields. Yes, it was in times of great exigencies when there was a paucity of men and on occasions when the country and religion were at great stake. But what stakes are we facing now to give our women an opportunity and temptation to come out of the sacred *zenana* and expose themselves to the cruel gaze of men.

It is a misstatement of facts to say that the women of Arabia voted during the election of Khalifas. It is none the less a mistake to say that Hazrat Aisha Siddiqua voted for Hazrat Abu Baker in truer sense of the word. Voice of Hazrat Aisha, the beloved wife of the Prophet, was a command to the followers of the Prophet and she was expected to know more than anybody else the wishes of the Prophet as to who would be the first Khalifa in preference to others. She acted rather as an arbitrator than as a voter in deciding the then most vital question of Khilafat.

Much has been said about the birthright of women to franchise, but, Sir, who are men and women to decide on the point? In my opinion they are not in any way qualified to pronounce any judgment as to what is the birthright of women. It is time and time alone that can give the verdict in one way or the other and the time has long ago, in no uncertain terms, chalked out the different spheres of activities of men and women and call it birthright or whatever you like. In primitive ages men and women were working together in all spheres of life; but for social and moral welfare of the human race, spheres of activities had been marked out for man and woman, and it was not out of courtesy and kindness that the outdoor works were set apart for men and it was not a matter of injustice and oppression that women were given to rule over the home affairs. Do you like to change the arrangement and march backwards to the primitive ages for a trip to see how men and women worked together. Is it progress or a confusion of every

thing settled? Force of theory of birthright melts away when tested before practical life.

It is said that women have hands, legs and brains similar to men, then is it not the birthright of women, if the word birthright has any meaning at all, to take to ploughs and other harder works of life? But why they do not claim activities in those spheres is because they are not suited to that. Their brains also are not meant for politics or other higher subjects. They have got other works suited to their constitution to devote their brains in. It is said they can make time to deal in politics after performing their home duties. I say it emphatically that a dutiful and responsible woman cannot make time to devote her leisure seriously in politics. If she does, it is at the expense of her more important duties of home and as a sort of luxury and recreation.

Is politics such a trifling thing of luxury or recreation that it should be made the sphere of women as their tempting persuasions? I think not.

It is true that many women work hard with men in outdoor affairs. But why do they so? It is simply to supplement the earnings of their male members who cannot earn sufficiently to maintain the family. Have men proved themselves unfit or deficient in administering the country? Then why do the women offer their uncalled-for help in the matter? Then, Sir, where is the justification to deny the franchise to women when it is granted to the dumb driven mass of the male population much inferior in rank, intelligence and education to some of the ladies of the country? May I ask if the franchise has been granted to them only because they are men? I say, "no, nothing of the kind." They represent different conflicting interests, there are producers and consumers, tenants and landlords, labourers and capitalists, and so on. It is only to safeguard those interests that the franchise has been extended to those unworthy and unfortunate ones. Now what interest has woman different from that of man that he cannot and is not protecting from time immemorial, that the woman requires a special privilege of franchise.

Bengal is the premier province in India and some crocodile tears were shed that Bengal is lagging behind. It is no discredit but is worth the wisdom and foresight of the Bengalis that they are not taking the opportunity of destruction of social and moral welfare of the country by the forelock by granting franchise to women.

Bengal must lag behind in this matter if she wants to keep her position as the premier province of India. The very fact that Bengal has not taken the lead is a matter of serious consideration for those who advocate the cause of the ladies from utopia of imagination.

The ladies have come to remove our prejudices. Look at your own person. You hold your pen and the sword with the right hand, is it from prejudice that the left hand is not given the privileges of the

right hand? No, it is not so. It is convenience and wise policy of distribution of work that make this differential treatment. Similarly, the men and women are right and left hands of that intellectual Being who manifests Himself through mankind. The left hand is not used for the works of the right hand unless the right hand is disabled. Are our men disabled or degenerated to require the help of women in all public affairs? Sir, medical science will bear me out that brain work exhausts the body more than anything else. So the child is not expected to get full nourishment either before or after its birth from the mother who indulges in politics or other brain works. The woman was created primarily for continuance of human race and anything that stands in the way of its full realisation must be shunned by a dutiful and responsible woman. Who has not noticed the pale and emaciated figures of average adult lady students of colleges, as if just come from sick bed? Do the advocates of child welfare expect healthy children from those mothers? I say it cannot be. Then, Sir, a great economical question is involved in this matter. If you grant this franchise to women to-day, you will not have the justification to deny them entering in other departments of administration of the country. With what result? Women will shake off subordination to man and the unfortunate men will be ousted from those departments, as women's entry will be easier from their persuasive character, and starvation will glare at the face of many men's families.

So we should take lesson from the baneful result of women franchise in other countries and it should be an eye-opener to us all for serious consideration before we adopt it.

I appeal to you all to consider the matter over again and not allow yourselves to be swayed by any sentiment, and pave the way to social and moral destruction of the country by granting franchise to women.

With these few words, I strongly oppose the resolutions.

Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: Sir, at the outset I had no intention to address you on the question before the House. Things have since taken such a course that I think I shall fail in my duty if I were to record merely a silent vote.

In these days of democracy, it is no wonder that some of our women who have discarded the time-honoured traditions of the East and have taken to the Western mode of living will aspire to share with us all the privileges of the Reforms. However patriotic their desires may be, I regret, I cannot lend my support to the resolution of Mr. S. M. Bose. I oppose it because it is premature, because its utility has yet to be proved and because it is not expedient. Much has been made of the meetings held in Calcutta and elsewhere where resolutions demanding the right of women to vote and requesting the Council to accord its support were passed. Sir, I would like to be enlightened if they represent the views of the orthodox communities or at least the majority

of women in Bengal It appears that this demand has been engineered by a few women who have no touch with the mass of their countrymen, who have no authority to speak on their behalf and who do not or care not to inquire into the affairs of the poorer community? If they had the courage to approach the women of Bengal, they would have been surprised to find how they still cherish those very ideals which their respectable sisters had thought fit to cast away,—they would have been told before their very faces not to disturb their existing social fabric which they prize so much.

Sir, reference has been made about the women's franchise in Bombay and Madras. But I fail to find how it can be logical to draw an analogy in these dissimilar cases. I may here point out that only the other day England, the mother of all parliamentary institutions, the cradle of freedom, granted this privilege to her women after a strenuous fight under exceptional circumstances. It remains yet to be seen how the English women exercise their newly acquired right and what would be its benefits. Certainly it will be sheer madness to draw comparison with England considering the state of literacy prevailing there. France, Germany, Belgium, Italy have not extended the right to their women. Are the women of these countries less worthy than the women of Britain because they have no right to vote? Take the instance of Japan. Do the women there enjoy this right? Did that stand in the way of her national development? Surely it did not prevent her to achieve the proud position as queen of the Pacific. Sir, should I remind the House that we ourselves have got to prove before the great British nation our own competency to exercise this very right. How on the face of this can we consistently think of extending it to our women when they have not shown any inclination to exercise even the municipal franchise? I wonder how we can go against the findings of the Southborough Committee when we are barely a year old? I fail to find out the real state of affairs and circumstances that would justify us to amend the finding of that august body. Are we to be guided by fair faces and sentiments?

Sir, I submit it is an axiom that legislators in legislating should guide themselves directly by considerations of utility and expediency. We have to consider in our decision over the question whether the State would or would not suffer if the right is denied. I humbly submit that acting on the above principle one will at once find that it is not necessary under the present circumstances. I would like to inquire if this will drive malaria, if this will prevent epidemics, if this will stop famines. I find no benefit to come out of it except helping a particular class to obtain power and position through the influence of their women.

Sir, it is a question affecting the very foundation of our old dear Hindu society and must accordingly be dealt with. I am confident the

House will rise to the height of the occasion and reject the resolution by a vast majority.

The PRESIDENT: I think I have now come to the end of the speeches and I take it that there is no other member who wants to speak, and I, accordingly, call on Mr. Bose to reply.

Mr. S. M. BOSE: Sir, I shall try to be very brief. There seems to be a common impression that if women be given the vote, they can be elected to the Council. That is not so. Rule 7 of the Electoral Rules only deals with those who can vote. Rule 5 provides distinct qualifications for those who can stand. And one of these is that candidate must not be a woman. Neither rule 5 nor any of the rules can be in any way altered for the next ten years, with the sole exception of sex-disqualification for a voter. The Report of the Joint Select Committee on the Government of India Bill, which was accepted by parliament, lays down that the franchise, as settled by the rules, is not to be altered for the first ten years, and that the recommendation about woman suffrage in rule 7 is to be regarded as altogether an exception. So my friends can rest assured that acceptance of this resolution will not mean that women will be able to capture seats in the Council. From what I have said it will appear that there are grave doubts as to whether the amendments proposing a university test can be legally given effect to. For, as the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler has pointed out, this will have the effect of narrowing the qualification for women. This Council has no power to add or alter any qualification of a voter as provided in the rules, except as above. The Joint Select Committee Report says clearly that it should be at present outside the power of the Council to make any alteration in the franchise. Further, apart from the legal objection, these amendments, as many members have already pointed out, lay an undue stress on university examination. There are many Hindu and Muhammadan women who, though in the *purdah* yet, are highly educated. Again, it is not fair that the education test which is not imposed on men should be imposed on women.

Then, it has been urged that there is no general desire on the part of women to get the vote. That is not so. I have already spoken of the large number of meetings attended by orthodox ladies. There was a remarkable meeting in Calcutta of zenana Muhammadan ladies presided over by a begum shahiba. Then the other day there was an important meeting convened by the Women Graduates' Association, attended by Hindu, Muhammadan and European ladies, where a resolution asking for the franchise was passed. I submit that the point is not whether the majority of women want the vote. This objection suits the bureaucrat and not the popular representative.

I have not the time to deal in detail with the speeches of those who opposed. My task is rather easy, as the majority of speakers support

me and as the opposition has made a very poor show. This is only to be expected as reason, logic, and sentiment are all on my side. Mr. Nasim Ali, who may be taken as typifying the opposition, has made a violent and, in my opinion, a totally irrelevant speech, and I was glad to see how effectively he was crushed by Maulvi Fazl-ul Haq. Bluster and appeal to passion and prejudice cannot prevail against truth and justice. Whoever wanted that the women be dragged out of the *purdah*? Mr. Nasim Ali opposes women franchise because then there will be lady-magistrates and lady-subjudges. Sir, I may be pardoned if I fail to understand the cogency or the relevancy of this argument. Some speakers have expressed full sympathy with the principle of woman suffrage but point to practical difficulties. I wish to remind them again that all we have got to do now is to accept the principle. So I want more than their lip-sympathy—I want their votes. My friend Dr. Suhrawardy, after expressing deep sympathy flippantly remarked that he would not vote for me as some body else has entertained him. Sir, this is a sample of the illogical arguments advanced against me. I implore the members here to set aside levity for the moment and seriously consider the matter

Then it is said that women do not deserve the vote. But franchise is a thing which if you grant to the undeserved will make them deserve it soon. Further what right have we to deny it even if there be only a handful of women who want it? I wish to impress, with all the earnestness I can command, the fact that this is only a permissive measure, and if some women do not want the vote they need not be put on the electoral rolls at all, and they are not compelled to vote. Then it is said most women will not exercise the franchise if granted. Even if that be so, this does not hurt any body. It is well known that even in advanced countries only a small proportion of the electors vote.

I am not competent to discuss the question that this proposal is opposed to the precepts of Islam. To my mind the matter had been settled beyond all dispute by the eloquent speech of Maulvi Fazl-ul Haq. I am loth to believe that this great religion, which for the first time proclaimed with a trumpet-voice the principle of absolute equality and gave an independent status to women, has laid down anything not in accord with the spirit of my resolution. The voice of Maulvi Fazl-ul Haq, which so passionately defended the great Faith to which he belongs from calumny, is still ringing in our ears. May I not join my voice with his and plead that our mothers, sisters, wives and daughters may be accorded the same privilege which was claimed and exercised by the revered wife of the great Founder of Islam?

I now turn to the amendment proposed by the Kumar. It shirks the question brought forward by me, viz.—Do you or do you not approve of the principle that so far as the vote is concerned, man and woman should stand on exactly the same footing? The Kumar dares not face

this question fairly and squarely and seeks to hide behind a committee. A committee cannot decide the question of a principle for us. Every one of us has judgment and can say whether he accepts it or not. He cannot possibly bind himself to what a committee will decide for him on this matter. Then the Kumar seeks to justify his amendment on the ground that very few respectable orthodox ladies will get the vote, that this will be only for the benefit of a few ladies who have adopted Western customs and that they will be swamped by a crowd of women of loose virtues. He has dwelt of practical difficulties overlooking the facts that we can only express our opinion on the principle. Further he has overlooked the second part of the resolution. I want the Government to frame regulations with due regard to the habits and customs of our women. I have no doubt that, if my resolution be accepted, the Government will appoint a small advisory committee. I maintain that if the rules are properly framed all our ladies will be enabled to vote without any shock to their feeling or to those of their relatives.

As a matter of fact the Kumar and the party he represents are really anxious to deny women their elementary rights. This cry of public women getting the vote has been put forward to cloud the real issue by raising a false issue. I trust that this ingenious attempt to side-track the main question will be defeated. So I do not propose to waste the time of the Council by dealing at length with this false issue. The danger that he apprehends about respectable women voters being swamped by the women of the town is unfounded, and has been brought in to create prejudice. There are about 23 millions of women in Bengal and a very large number of them own properties in the shape of land, business, houses and Government papers; and so on the existing basis of qualification they will be entitled to vote. It is to be remembered that anybody who pays municipal tax of Re. 1-8 per year or road cess or union rates over one rupee or any income-tax is entitled to a vote. We know what a large amount of Government securities is held by women who thus pay the income-tax. So it is apparent that a very large proportion of the 23 millions of women is qualified on this basis. Can it be denied that only an infinitesimal proportion of these 23 millions belong to the unfortunate class? Further, it will be for the Government to see whether the danger apprehended is a real one and if so whether regulations cannot be framed to obviate this.

Sir, let me here appeal to the European members not to remain indifferent in this matter which affects the rights of all women—Hindus, Muhammadans and Christians. In the past Europeans have materially helped Indian progress and I have no doubt that the European members here, though they have remained silent, will by their action show how they value freedom and justice.

I hope that the attempt of the party of reaction to deny the just claim of women will be defeated. Let us frankly say whether it is our desire that they should have the vote. May I remind the members of this

Council that they are the sole and supreme judge in this matter and that from their verdict there is no appeal? So I earnestly request them to consider the matter calmly and dispassionately. I ask them if it is in accord with their sense of justice that some women should not be allowed to vote, because there may be others who may not wish to vote? There is a general feeling all over the country that women franchise should be recognised. Both wings of the popular party have recognised the justice of the claim. Shall it be said that we who claim to represent the people are out of touch with their feeling? One word more and I have done. The days of autocracy are numbered—whether it be the autocracy of the white, the Brahmin or the male. The party of reaction would stand in the way of national progress and her seeking to stem the tide which will inevitably sweep them away. I have every hope that this resolution will be passed. But if we lose, defeat will not dismay us. The force of nature, the force of time—as the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea has said—are with us. The battle of freedom will go on until success crowns our effort. There can be no halt, no retreat; for, "He has sounded forth the trumpet, that shall never call retreat"

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: Before the motions on the female suffrage are put to vote, I would pray the Hon'ble Member for the Government to inform the House, whether if the motion of Mr. S. M. Bose is accepted by the House in its entirety, the Government would be in a position to exclude any class of women, *e.g.*, public women, from being electors, by its power of framing regulations under the Electoral Rules.

The PRESIDENT: I do not know if the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler would like to give an answer to this point.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: I am not prepared to give a legal opinion off-hand. I have already explained to the Council that the proviso to Electoral Rule 7 enacts that subject to a resolution of the Council to that effect, Government *shall* frame regulations providing for the enfranchisement of women or a class of women. I have also explained to the Council that there is some legal doubt as to what precisely is meant by the phrase "class of women": but assuming that regulations are framed, I know of nothing in the rules which will permit of the exclusion of women who fulfil the qualifications laid down therein.

The PRESIDENT: In view of the fact that the House is practically divided on the one question, namely, franchise or no franchise, I think it desirable to put the original motion first, namely, that of Mr. S. M. Bose.

The original motion was then put and a division taken with the following result:—

AYES.

Ahmed, Maulvi Yakuinuddin.
Ali, Maulvi A. H. M. Wazir.
Ali, Mr. Syed Erfan.
Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath.
Banerjee, Rai Bahadur Aoinash Chandra.
Barton, Mr. H.
Basu, Babu Jatindra Nath.
Bose, Mr. S. M.
Charmakar, Babu Rasik Chandra.
Das, Mr. S. R.
Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra.
De, Babu Fanindralal.
Dutt, Mr. Ajoy Chunder.
Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan.
Faroqui, K. C. M.
Chose, Mr. D. C.
Gordon, Mr. A. D.
Haq, Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin.
Khan, Mr. Razaur Rahman.
Lang, Mr. J.
Larmour, Mr. F. A.
Makramali, Munshi.
McKenzie, Mr. D. P.
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
Moitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath.
Mukherji, Professor S. C.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Raikat, Mr. Prasanna Deb.
Ray, Babu Bhabendra Chandra.
Ray, Rai Bahadur Upendra Lal.
Ray Chaudhuri, Mr. Krishna Chandra.
Ray Choudhury, Raja Manmatha Nath.
Roy, Babu Jogendra Nath.
Roy, Babu Nalini Nath.
Roy, Mr. J. E.
Stark, Mr. H. A.

NOES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.
Afzal, Nawabzada K. M. Khan Bahadur.
Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Azaharuddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Emaduddin.
Ahmed, Mr. M.
Ahmed, Maulvi Rafi Uddin.
Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.
Aley, Shaikh Mahboob.
Ali, Maulvi Syed Muksood.
Ali, Mr. Syed Nasim.
Ali, Munshi Amir.
Ali, Munshi Ayub.
Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar.
Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mohamed.
Barma, Rai Sahib Panchanan.
Birla, Babu Chaneshyamdas.
Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Hafizar Rahman.
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad
Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath.
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Das, Babu Bhishmadev.
Donald, Mr. J.
Doss, Rai Bahadur Pyari Lal.
French, Mr. F. C.
Chatak, Rai Sahib Nilmani.
Chose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
Karim, Maulvi Abdul.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlal.
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.
Khan, Babu Devendra Lal.
Khan, Maulvi Hamid-ud-din.
Khan Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Muhammad Ershad Ali.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble.
Mukharji, Babu Satish Chandra.
Mukhopadhaya, Babu sarat Chandra.
Mullick, Babu Nirode Behary.
Nakey, Mirza Muhammad Ali.
O'Kinealy, Lt.-Col. Frederick.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S,
Pahlowan, Maulvi Md. Abdul Jubbar.
Poddar, Babu Keshoram.
Rauf, Maulvi Shah Abdur.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar.
Roy, Mr. Bijoy Prosad Singh.
Roy, Babu Jogendra Krishna.
Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra.
Roy, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh.
Roy, Raja Manilall Singh.
Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Sailaja Nath.
Sarkar, Babu Rishindra Nath.
Suhrawardy, Dr. A.
Suhrawardy, Dr. Hassan.
Suhrawardy, Mr. Huseyn Shaheed.

The Ayes being 37 and Noes 56, the resolution was lost.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER CHOSE Bahadur: Having regard to the temper of the House and having regard to the fate of the original motion, I beg to withdraw my amendment.

The PRESIDENT: Your amendment fails.

The amendments standing in the names of Babu Annada Charan Dutta and Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray were then withdrawn.

Financial position of Bengal.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: "This Council recommends to the Government that a deputation consisting of the Finance Member, one Minister and two non-official members of this Council be sent to Simla, as early as possible, to represent to His Excellency the Viceroy the special pecuniary difficulties of Bengal and its claim for special consideration and financial help."

I do not think the resolution requires any speech from me for its support. This is a matter in which there is no difference of opinion. It is known to this Council that the Government of Bengal have already arranged for a deputation and we are thankful to the Government for the favourable consideration shown in this matter. I hope, without taking much time from you, the Council will accord its support to this resolution, and we hope that the deputation may be successful in its noble mission and it will be able to induce the Government of India to grant favourable concession for the much-needed relief of Bengal.

With these words, I beg to move this resolution for the acceptance of the Council.

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: It is, I think, an open secret that Government are prepared to accept this resolution and indeed they welcome it. The financial position, I need not say, has been a matter of anxious concern to us ever since we took up our duties in January last, and some time ago, the Ministers and I agreed that we should go up to Simla after this present session of the Council and represent our case to the authorities there. When we got notice of this resolution we inquired whether His Excellency the Viceroy would be willing to receive a deputation with representatives of the non-official members of this Council. The reply we received is favourable and we have accordingly made all arrangements to start for Simla the day after to-morrow. In these circumstances, I do not think I need elaborate the arguments which we are going to put forward before the Government of India. This Council does not need any convincing that our claim is just. It is the Government of India that we want to convince and we may as well reserve our ammunition for them. But I may say that a careful study of the situation has shown us very clearly that what is wrong with us is a simple matter. Under the allocation of revenues made in connection with the Reform Scheme, land revenue is the chief source of income in all the provinces. But the land revenue in Bengal is only Rs. 3 crores, whereas in the other major provinces it is double or more than double that sum. Not only that, but in the other provinces, land revenue is capable of expansion and is as a matter of fact expanded as temporary settlements are made every 20 or 30 years. In Bengal, on the other hand, the land revenue is inelastic and cannot be expanded on account of the permanent settlement. That, as I have said, is the

fundamental defect of the existing provincial financial settlement so far as Bengal is concerned, and it is our business to urge that point before the Government of India. I have only one modification to suggest in the resolution and I am sure it will commend itself to the Council. The resolution asks us to take one Minister. We propose to take two, namely, Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea, who, to use his own familiar expression, will press our needs on the Government of India with all the emphasis at his command and Mr. P. C. Mitter, who, as everybody knows, has made a careful study of this question and whose advice and assistance will be of the utmost value to us. We would have been glad to take with us the Hon'ble Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, but as he has important public engagements in the mufassal, he will be unable to come, but there will be two Ministers and two non-official members of this Council. We deeply feel our responsibility in this matter, but we understand our case, and it is a clear case, and we shall do our best to make it clear to the Government of India. If, as I am certain, this Council passes this resolution, unanimously, we shall feel that we have the support of the Council behind us and that will greatly encourage us in our task.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I accept the amendment that there should be two Ministers.

The motion was then put and agreed to.

Salaries of Ministerial Officers.

Maulvi EMADUDDIN AHMED: The resolution which stands in my name, and which I commend to the acceptance of the House, runs thus: "This Council recommends to the Government—

(1) that the initial pay of the ministerial officers in the lower grade of the mufassal courts and offices be fixed at Rs. 50 rising to Rs. 100 in 18 years with an annual increment of Rs. 2 up to Rs. 58 and then of Rs. 3 up to Rs. 100;

(2) that the minimum pay of the upper division of the ministerial establishment of the mufassal courts and offices be fixed at Rs. 120 rising to Rs. 150 with an annual increment of Rs. 5;

(3) that the scale of Rs. 80—2—100 for Sheristadars of the Munsifs' Courts in Bengal as proposed in the majority report be not agreed to and that these posts be included in the upper division scale, viz., Rs. 120—5—150;

(4) that the proposal of the majority of the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee in paragraph 95, page 92, of their Report that in the case of the upper division the immediate increase should be limited to 50 per cent. of the previous pay, be not accepted;

(5) that the combined post of the Head Clerk-Translator, Judge's Offices (page 92 of the majority report of the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee) be equal to the post of the Foujdari Head Assistant and the salary be fixed at Rs. 175—10—225;

(6) that the Head Clerks in the Civil Surgeons' offices should be placed on an equal footing with regard to their pay and prospects with the ministerial officers of the upper division (both Judicial and Executive) and the other clerks of the same office with those of the lower division."

The miserable lot of the ministerial officers in our courts is too well known to require any lengthy speech from me. Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur in his minority report has shown that taking the estimate of Rai Kali Prasanna Ghosh Bahadur as the basis, the prices of the necessaries of life may be fixed at Rs. 57-9-0. The majority report also says this: "that it will be a serious handicap to efficient administration if heads of offices were to wink at illegal earnings out of sympathy for needy clerks or to feel that the smallness of pay was some partial justification for malpractices. They have therefore recommended in their report that Rs. 40 should be the minimum pay." I should think that when they have touched the point of preventing the taking of illegal gratifications, the smallest amount that can be granted must be Rs. 50 as in the minority report. Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur has clearly shown that the bare necessaries of life of a family consisting of four members cannot be met by anything less than this amount. In these circumstances, I hope the House will agree to the minimum wage being fixed at Rs 50.

The next proposal of mine is about the upper division of the ministerial establishment. The majority report has fixed the pay at Rs. 100, and I have asked for Rs. 120 It is only after 18 years' hard and arduous work that a lower division clerk can aspire to get into the upper division. At this stage of life he will have a large family with several children to educate. I have, therefore, proposed that the pay of the upper division clerks should be fixed at Rs. 120 rising to Rs. 150.

As regards the Sheristadars of the Munsifs' Courts, the majority report has proposed a pay for them of Rs. 80—2—100 and has recommended that the immediate increase in the case of the upper division should be limited to 50 per cent. of the previous pay. The Sheristadars have to do many important duties, and it is only natural that they should be given a decent pay and I have therefore proposed that these posts be included in the upper division scale, viz., Rs. 120—5—150. Their number will be very few and I do not think the Council will grudge them this small thing.

Then as regards the pay of the Head Clerk-Translator, I would say that the proposals of the majority report are simply inequitable because

the holders of these posts have to do the dual work of both head clerk as well as of translator, and so it is only natural that they should get more pay. I have therefore proposed that their pay should be fixed at Rs. 175—10—225.

As regards clerks in the Civil Surgeons' offices, I beg to submit that they have to work very hard and it is therefore only natural and fair that the Civil Surgeons' head clerks should be placed on the same footing as the upper division clerks and the other clerks of the same office as those of the lower division clerks with a minimum pay of Rs. 50.

I shall not detain the House any longer. It is a well known fact that the clerks supplement their income by doubtful means, and it is our primary duty to stop this practice. With these facts and figures before me, I have proposed that Rs. 50 should be the minimum pay.

Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: In view of the fact that there are other resolutions on the same subject, I do not propose to move the resolution standing in my name. So, I beg leave to withdraw it.

The following resolution was then, by leave of the Council, withdrawn: "This Council recommends to the Government—

(*1*) that the Sheristadars of Munsifs' Courts be included in the upper division in the grade of Rs. 80—4—140;

(*2*) that the starting pay of the lower division clerks (judicial side) be fixed at Rs. 50."

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: Sir, with your permission, I beg to move this resolution on behalf of Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri. The resolution which stands in the name of Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri runs as follows: "This Council recommends to the Government that the representation, No. 1408 C.C., dated the 3rd August, 1921, forwarded to the Secretary, Financial Department, by the All-Bengal Ministerial Officers' Conference, held at Bhawanipur on the 31st July, 1921, be taken into consideration by the Government in determining the pay of the clerks attached to the district courts and offices, including the offices of Divisional Commissioners."

You will be pleased to see that this is a very simple resolution. At the outset I must say that there is an impression in the minds of a large number of ministerial officers that I am opposed to any increment to their pay. They forget that it was myself who proposed during the budget debate of 1920-21 that a sum of Rs. 10 lakhs be set apart for giving allowance to the ministerial officers. My resolution, though opposed by Sir Henry Wheeler at the time, was subsequently given effect to by Government and since then the ministerial officers have been getting some allowance every month. I think, therefore, that the ministerial officers should

not consider me as one of their opponents but as one of their firm friends who is conscious of their hard lot and who wishes that Government should do to them nothing but justice. The resolution I am going to move is, I have already said, a very simple one. I am not opposed to the conclusions arrived at in the report of Mr. McAlpin and Mr. S. N. Ray or to the minority report of my friend Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur. Both the reports show that those who had been entrusted with the task of revising the scale of pay of the ministerial officers entered upon their task not in a half-hearted manner, but with an eye to do them real benefit. You cannot, however, satisfy all parties. Some of the officers want something more and they consider that their individual cases have not been properly considered.

A very large number of ministerial officers—their number would be about 6,000 out of 10,000 such officers all told—not being quite satisfied with the report held a conference at Bhowanipur under the presidency of my friend Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri and submitted their grievances in a report to Government. They say that they are unable to reconcile themselves to the amount of relief suggested in the committee's proposals in general and to certain inequalities and anomalies coupled with invidious distinctions in particular. They state in their petition to Government that the Salaries Committee ought not to have considered the question of demand and supply—a fact which was deprecated by the Public Services Commission, who had remarked that the only safe criterion for calculating the principle of salary was that the Government should pay so much and so much only to their employees as is necessary to obtain recruits of the right stamp and to maintain them in such a degree of comfort and dignity as will shield them from temptation and keep them efficient for the terms of their service. These ministerial officers submit that their rates of pay in the mufassal are not consistent with the nature of the duties and that the principles of increment are inequitable. They submit that the Calcutta offices have received better treatment than the mufassal offices both in the hands of Messrs. McAlpin and S. N. Ray and Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur. They regret that the Salaries Committee should have considered that the upper grade clerk has a margin of profit for luxuries. I may say from my own knowledge and experience that this is not a correct estimate of the financial condition of the upper grade clerks. These ministerial officers further state in their representation as one of their grievances that the Salaries Committee have exceeded the standard of percentage fixed by them and have recommended special increase for some offices, such as, the office of the Commissioner of Police, Calcutta; Inspector-General of Police, Bengal; Director of Public Health; Municipal Magistrate, Calcutta; and have raised the posts of Rs. 100 and 125 to the level of higher posts on Rs. 150 and Rs. 175 and then given the percentage of increase or have given special percentage. [See paragraph 17 of the report of the Conference.]

I would now quote only a short passage from their petition to illustrate my remarks. Let me quote paragraph 15 of the report of their conference:—

The result will be that a district office clerk on Rs. 80 with 4 years' service in the upper division will now have Rs. 96 as his initial pay—a pay which he has already been drawing since April, 1920 when Government was pleased to sanction the *ad interim* allowance to afford partial relief, while a clerk of the same grade in the offices named above will at once get Rs. 145 or Rs. 130 or Rs. 120 or Rs. 116, as the case may be, although both are on the same footing, in respect of pay, service and responsibility. Again a clerk of a district office now on Rs. 100 having 10 years' service in the upper division will have Rs 120 only, whereas his fortunate brethren of the Police Commissioner's Office or Calcutta Collectorate or some other similar office, who are on the same footing in all respects, will immediately get Rs 150 or Rs 160 or Rs. 175 or Rs 200 or Rs. 225 The Salaries Committee have suggested that their recommendations are based chiefly on economic conditions. If so, this Conference fails to understand on what ground the district office clerks on Rs 80, Rs. 100 and Rs 125 have met with a differential treatment.

These ministerial officers, as you will be pleased to see, further submit that even in the minority report same consideration has not been shown to the Superintendents and Sheristadars of the district courts as has been shown to the Head Assistants and other assistants in the office of the Inspector General of Police or attached offices.

I shall quote from paragraph 22, page 14 of the Conference report, to show what the recommendations of the Salaries Committee are:—

It is also regrettable that Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur did not, in his Note of Dissent, show the same consideration to the Superintendents and Sheristadars as he appears to have shewn to the Head Assistants or other assistants of the attached offices *e.g.*, he has proposed Rs. 250—15—325 for the Superintendent or Sheristadars while for similar posts or for posts of much lower rank in the other offices he has not only proposed higher pay but also suggested the reduction of period of increments For instance the pay of an ordinary assistant on Rs. 200 in the office of the Inspector-General of Police has been raised by the majority report of the Salaries Committee to Rs 250—25—300 while the Rai Bahadur has proposed Rs 275—25—350, the period of increments being 2 and 3 years respectively, as against 5 years in the case of a Superintendent or Sheristadar

Then the next passage I want to quote from this report is as regards the pay of Superintendent of Political Pensions—

There is a special office at Alipore known as the office of the Superintendent of Political Pensions, the cost of maintaining which is met from Imperial revenues. The Collector of the 24-Parganas controls it *ex-officio*. It consists of 3 clerks, one of whom is an Urdu-knowing Munshi. It will be found from page 75 of the Committee's report that the Head Assistant of that office has been disallowed the ordinary town allowance, a concession allowed to all clerks at Alipore, Sealdah and Howrah

Then this report points out certain incongruities in the proposals of the Salaries Committee which you will be pleased to find in paragraph 29, page 17 of their report. They say:—

Apart from the fact that the scales of pay recommended by the Salaries Committee for all grades are quite disappointing and inadequate, there are certain

incongruities in their proposals which should not in fairness be allowed to stand. The Committee appear to have proposed a post on Rs. 250—10—300 and another on Rs. 200—10—250 for Commissioners' offices in Western Bengal. In Eastern Bengal the post corresponding to that of Rs. 200—10—250 is Rs 175—5—200. There is no reason for this inequality . . These inequalities and anomalies should in the opinion of the Conference be removed.

Again we find that the Salaries Committee have treated the staff of the office of the Deputy Inspector-General of Police as a separate cadre, though it has so long been in a combined cadre with the staff of the office of the Inspector-General of Police, Bengal. This will be found in paragraph 31, page 20 of their report.

My resolution, as will be seen, is a very simple one. It simply asks Government to take into their consideration the report of the All-Bengal Ministerial Officers' Conference in determining the pay of the clerks attached to the District Courts including the offices attached to the Divisional Commissioners. The report is couched not in a carping, fault-finding spirit. The report simply presents the grievances of poor ministerial officers to Government. Theirs is the short and simple annals of the poor. Government have given satisfaction to all their officers by granting them increments in some instances beyond their expectation. This is the first real attempt, I may say, to grapple with the question of the pay of ministerial officers after more than half a century and I hope that Government will be equal to the occasion

Babu SATISH CHANDRA MUKHARJI: I have got a resolution on the same subject. May I speak on both?

The PRESIDENT: Yes; but you must move yours formally.

Babu SATISH CHANDRA MUKHARJI: I beg to move the two resolutions that stand against my name. They are Nos 26 and 32 Resolution No. 26 runs thus:—"This Council recommends to the Government that the majority report of (Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur, M.A., B.L., M.L.C.), of the Committee appointed to advise Government on the revision of pay of permanent ministerial officers and menials be adopted by Government"

Resolution No. 32 runs thus:—"This Council recommends to the Government that the posts of the Nazirs and Sheristadars of mufassal civil courts be kept on the same pay as before."

The last resolution is rather a sort of compromise because I accept the minority report of Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur with that modification. It goes without saying that the reports in the press and several public meetings show in unmistakable terms, that the majority report of the Committee did not give satisfaction. The reason for this is traceable in my opinion to the personnel of the Committee. The Committee consisted of three members: Mr. McAlpin, Mr. S. N. Ray and Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur. The first two gentlemen

belong to the Executive side of the service. It would be seen that not a single member of the Judicial service was taken in on the Committee. The result was—and I am constrained to remark so—that the cases of those who belong to the Judicial side had not been properly considered. It would have given satisfaction, if a member representing the Ministerial Services were taken on the Committee. The result would have been that the view-point of those clerks would have been more ably placed before the Committee at the time of deliberations. It seems to me that this drawback, namely, the omission of a member belonging to the judicial branch of the service and a representative of the clerks, was itself sufficient to cause dissatisfaction Another reason why the majority report has not given satisfaction is that the necessity of the class from which the clerks are drawn was not considered and recognised by the Committee. Except the Rai Bahadur, neither Mr. McAlpin nor Mr. Ray could be expected to represent the interests of the middle class people from whom the clerks are recruited and it is, therefore, I make bold to say, that the majority report has not given satisfaction. The Rai Bahadur, himself belonging to the middle-class, is quite competent to represent their wants and grievances. Therefore, I urge that his report ought to be accepted.

But what is the difference between majority and minority reports. Fancy the number of people involved in this—a huge number. The majority say that the increase in cost will be Rs. 41¼ lakhs, while the Rai Bahadur says that the increase according to his report would be Rs. 60¾ lakhs. The difference is only Rs. 20 lakhs. Now the Rai Bahadur tells us that as a matter of fact in actual practice this sum will not be required. The amount provided in this year's budget will suffice for the increase even if we accepted the Rai Bahadur's report. Next year there will be increase in the recurring expenditure. I wish that the Finance Member will be successful in his mission to Simla and that funds will be provided for this extra expenditure.

The reason for the difference between the majority and minority reports is this. The majority say that the economic rule of demand and supply ought to govern this case, but, with the greatest respect to the gentleman, I must say that this is a fallacious argument. Why should you bring in the doctrine of the demand and supply when the Government hold the monopoly in respect of this matter? Government ought to say that this principle cannot apply to this body of men who are whole-time servants and who have no secondary means of supplementing their income. It behoves Government to see that this body of men should live in decent comfort and should be above want. Another dictum has been laid down in the majority report that Government ought not to bear the whole of the increase in the cost of living. My submission is that it is a dangerous doctrine to lay down by Government. These clerks are not responsible for the war. I do not appreciate the reason which commended itself to the majority that the whole cost of

living would not be borne by Government. Who else will bear it? Can these poor clerks bear this high cost of living? I fail to understand how the majority report could say that a certain share of the cost of living should be borne by the clerks who have admittedly no margin for luxuries and are on the verge of starvation. The majority report ignores the actual conditions prevalent in the country. Everybody knows to what extent the prices have gone up. The Rai Bahadur tells us that according to his computation the cost of living has increased by about 100 per cent. I believe that he is nearer the mark. Therefore, my submission is that the increase granted by the majority report is insufficient because as a matter of fact they have failed to take into consideration the actual increase in the cost of living. They have cited some false analogies. They refer to the jail figures which as a rule do not afford a true and correct guide. Government buy wholesale and these poor clerks purchase at retail rates. That makes a good deal as regards the price. The 60 per cent. increase mentioned in the majority report is vitiated by the fact that they have not taken into consideration the retail prices. It is the retail prices that ought to be taken into consideration in finding the actual increase in the cost of living. The men whom you are going to benefit buy their things at retail rates and not at wholesale rates. This fact vitiates the conclusions of the majority report.

Then, a great difference centres round the minimum wage. According to the majority report it ought to be Rs 40, whereas according to the Rai Bahadur's it ought to be Rs. 50. Now, the bill of cost as laid down by the majority report is purely amusing. I am quite sure that this frame of mind discloses colossal ignorance on the part of those gentlemen who wrote the majority report about the actual conditions of the life of the middle class people I daresay that the Council knows well that every man has at least got five members to support in his house. I ask—Is Rs. 40 sufficient for five persons? I think that the answer is emphatically in the negative. The majority report asserts that Rs. 40 is quite sufficient in these days. The Commissioners of Divisions, who are all men of experience, men who have spent all their lives in India, who have come in contact with all sorts of persons, I submit, are in a better position than those two gentlemen to say what ought to be the minimum wage. In the year 1908 the Commissioner said that Rs. 50 should be the minimum, and they accepted, with the greatest reluctance in 1908, the minimum wage of Rs 30. Now consider the position of India of 1908 with India of 1921. Is an increment of Rs. 10 sufficient? Surely if an increment of Rs. 10 was considered sufficient then, the House will agree that it is a most inadequate increase that could be thought of now. In these circumstances, it is my firm conviction that the minimum pay of Rs. 50 suggested by the Rai Bahadur will not relieve the poor clerks in the matter of their initial pay because of the high cost of living. Even the Rai Bahadur accepts this with the greatest reluctance on account of the financial condition of the country.

Government consider that Rs. 40 is sufficient to keep these clerks; but it is not so in these hard days; if they do persist in this minimum the result will be that efficiency, which everyone desires in every service, will suffer. My submission is that the Rai Bahadur's suggestion ought to be accepted.

I would say one word with regard to the efficiency bar. This efficiency bar places the clerk at the mercy of both the sheristadar and the district officer; therefore, the less the efficiency bar is observed, the better for the parties concerned. I should observe that this bar ought to be removed altogether in the case of the lower division, and only one efficiency bar retained in the case of the upper division.

Then as regards the second resolution. In this matter I would say that the Committee is guilty of inconsistency; both the minority and the majority reports have told us that the conditions of services are beyond the scope of their reference.

We were told on the highest authority when we considered the resolution on the pay of the ministers that it is a question of status and rank. As regards the sheristadar and nazir, before the constitution of this Committee, these two officers used to get the same pay; now a change is suggested, and the sheristadar is to get a higher pay. The nazir's work is more onerous than the sheristadar's; and yet they have suggested less pay in his case than the sheristadar's, and the nazir's office is made less attractive than that of the sheristadar. In the previous Salaries' Committee in 1905-06 in which the High Court was consulted, and the members of which toured throughout Bengal, they came to the conclusion that the pay of these two officers should be on the same footing. I submit that no case has been made out by the Committee for a departure from the position adopted at that time. I request Government to take into consideration that fact: for reasons best known to the Committee, only a few judicial officers were consulted in the present case; therefore, as a matter of fact, no case has been made out.

I would like to say as regards the first resolution, that the pay of the Head Clerk in the District Judge's office should be on the same footing as that of the Head Assistant of the District Magistrate's office. I may tell you that this difference in treatment between the executive and judicial side is solely due to the fact that there was no one on the Committee to watch the interests of the clerks on the judicial side; the position of the head clerk on the judicial side is not worse than that of the head clerk on the executive side: the former is in charge of the correspondence, in charge of the returns, the custodian of original wills, in charge of the library, and he is the confidential clerk of the District Judge; whereas on the executive side there are two or three persons to carry out all this work. There is a separate librarian and a confidential clerk attached to the Collector. In this

man, the work of two or three persons is combined, and still no consideration is paid to him. In certain districts in Bengal, for instance, Hooghly and Howrah, no consideration is paid to the head clerk, who looks after the work of two districts. My submsision is that there is a very strong case made out that the minority report of Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadar should be accepted.

Mr. RAZAUR RAHMAN KHAN being absent, the following motion standing in his name was deemed to be withdrawn: "This Council recommends to the Government to give full effect to the minority report of Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur in regard to the revision of pay of the permanent ministerial officers and menials in Bengal."

Dr. HASSAN SUHRAWARDY being absent, the following motion standing in his name was deemed to be withdrawn: "This Council recommends to the Government that the general principle of increased rate of pay and allowances recommended by the minority report of the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee be accepted."

The PRESIDENT: Items 29 and 30 are identical to the ones already moved; I call on Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta to move item No. 31.

Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta moved, by the way of amendment, "that the following be added at the end of motion No. 26, namely:—

Subject to the following modifications, namely:—

(1) That the lower division clerks in the offices of Magistrate-Collectors, District Judges, Superintendents of Police and Public Works Department be recommended to be allowed the following scale of pay, viz., Rs. 35—40—50—3—110—5—120 with efficiency bar at Rs. 95;

(2) that the following general scale of pay, viz., Rs. 120—5—150 be recommended to be allowed to the clerks in the upper division, in place of the following, suggested by Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur viz., Rs. 100—5—150 for executive offices, Rs. 100—4—120 and Rs. 100—5—150 for judicial offices, Rs. 110—4—130 for the Public Works Department and Rs 100—4—120 for the Police Department;

(3) that in the scale of pay, viz., Rs. 150—5—200 proposed by Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur, for translators of Judges' Courts, the following appointments be included, (a) all collectorate accountants and collectorate head clerks of East Bengal districts, (b) all collectorate treasurers, (c) all first correspondence clerks of the Public Works Department and head clerks of Police offices, (d) three assistants on Rs. 125 of West Bengal and four assistants on Rs. 100 in the Commissioners' offices;

(4) that the nazir of the judicial offices, head assistants or Magistrate's head clerks be recommended to be allowed a scale of pay at the rate of Rs. 200—10—250;

(5) that sheristadars or superintendents of the Executive and Judicial offices, sheristadars and revenue assistants of Commissioners' offices and head assistants of the Public Works Department be recommended to be allowed a scale of pay at Rs. 275—25—350;

(6) that the pay of stenographers in the offices of the Board of Revenue, Inspector-General of Police and Director of Public Instruction be recommended to be not less than that proposed for the stenographers to Under-Secretaries and Secretaries to Government; and

(7) that the maximum of the grade pay of the head assistants of offices of heads of departments, when direct recruitment of assistants (with qualifications similar to those required for candidates for the subordinate executive service) is made in the upper division, be recommended to be not less than Rs. 400 per mensem.' "

First of all, I must congratulate Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur for the very able and sympathetic manner in which he has reviewed the whole question in his minority report; but unfortunately, financial stringency and financial difficulties have made the Rai Bahadur cut down the scale of the mufassal clerks to the lowest minimum.

The Salaries Committee was authorised to visit mufassal areas, but it is curious that they did not do so. I believe, that is the reason why the mufassal officers have been dealt with so unsympathetically in the majority report. In this report the expenses of Calcutta have been talked about a great deal, and everybody is under the impression that Calcutta is more expensive, and that the mufassal is cheaper in comparison. I may point out that barring house rent, all other things are dearer in the mufasal than in Calcutta, especially articles like cloth and various other articles that have to be brought from Calcutta. Therefore, in my amendment, I have suggested some changes which will be necessary for the mufassal staff.

I suppose it is in the fitness of things that the demand for a living wage made by the ministerial establishment can be so cavaliarly treated and called "extravagant demands" by the two signatories of the majority report—themselves members of one of the Imperial Services—who have been fortunate enough in getting another increase over the already extravagant increase sanctioned to them less than a couple of years ago. It seems a strange irony of fate that when the Imperial and Provincial Service men are able to get large increase of pay, with retrospective effect into the bargain, the case of the poor clerks, who have the same

social status as the Provincial Service men in Bengal and as the Imperial Service men in their own country, has been dealt with such a light-hearted manner. No question of financial stress was raised when it was a matter of increasing the pay of the superior services, but when it is a case of the poor clerks who are clamouring for a living wage we hear a great deal of financial difficulties. They do not want comfort or luxury—they just want to be able to live. It seems that this bugbear of financial difficulty has frightened the Rai Bahadur also. It is a case of justice which can no longer be denied.

The case of efficiency has also been discussed. I do not see why this question can be raised when it is a question of living wage. It has been said that these poor clerks take bribes; if they do take bribes, that is an additional reason for giving them a suitable living wage to place them beyond temptation.

The Council here adjourned for evening prayer.

The Council reassembled at 6-30 P.M.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: As I was just going to say, in order to check bribery, a good scale ought to be adopted. In this connection, I would like to mention that unless the pay of these clerks is improved, it will be impossible to put a stop to these malpractices. In this connection, I should like to protest against the system of taking *dáhlis*, which is so often indulged in by the superior officers. What are *dáhlis* but another way of taking bribes? As long as they accept *dáhlis*, their pernicious example remains a setback against any steps that they may take in stopping bribery.

Then, coming to the various amendments, the first one runs thus: "That the lower division clerks in the offices of Magistrates, Collectors, District Judges, Superintendents of Police and Public Works Department be recommended to be allowed the following scale of pay, viz. Rs. 35—40—50—3—110—5—120 with efficiency bar at Rs. 95."

My reason for differing from the Rai Bahadur is this:—

As regards this amendment, my difference with the Rai Bahadur is only as to the rate of increment and the maximum proposed by him. It is needless to say that the proportion of appointments in the upper division being small, the great majority of clerks—as many as 85 per cent. end their career in the lower division, qualification or no qualification. Supposing that every clerk will cross the efficiency bar, the Rai Bahadur's scale will enable him to retire with a pension of Rs. 50. This is certainly short of a living wage! How little it must be for an old man, who has to educate his grown up sons and pay the marriage expenses of his daughters. I believe that in Upper Assam also, the maximum is Rs. 120.

My second amendment is this: "That the following general scale of pay, viz., Rs. 120—5—150 be recommended to be allowed to the

clerks in the upper division, in place of the following, suggested by Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur, viz., Rs. 100—5—150 for Executive offices, Rs. 100—4—120 and Rs. 100—5—150 for Judicial offices. Rs. 110—4—130 for the Public Works Department and Rs. 100—4—120 for the Police Department."

My reason is that all these offices should be put on the same scale. The difference created by the Rai Bahadur is artificial and there is no ground for it. In this compartment, I have put all officers whose work is of a similar nature, both in importance and quantity.

Going to my amendment No. (3) it runs thus: "That in the scale of pay, viz., Rs. 150—5—200, proposed by Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur for translators of Judges' Courts, the following appointments be included, (*a*) all collectorate accountants and collectorate head clerks of East Bengal districts, (*b*) all collectorate treasurers, (*c*) all first correspondence clerks of the Public Works Department and head clerks of Police offices, (*d*) three assistants on Rs. 125 of West Bengal, and four assistants on Rs. 100 in the Commissioners' offices."

These are posts of importance, and cannot be classed in scale No. 2 mentioned above. The work is also very important, and some time ago accountants and treasurers were also given the same pay. So I think it is only fair and just that all these should be put on the same scale of Rs. 150 to Rs. 200.

Then comes No. (4): "That the nazir of the Judicial offices, head assistants or Magistrate's head clerks be recommended to be allowed a scale of pay at the rate of Rs. 200—10—250."

These gentlemen are selected officers; they have very responsible duties to perform; the nazirs have to look after the work of the peons, check and supervise much important work; therefore I think they should get the scale suggested.

Amendment (5) runs: "That sheristadars or superintendents of the Executive and Judicial offices, sheristadars and revenue assistants of Commissioners' offices and head assistants of the Public Works Department be recommended to be allowed a scale of pay at Rs. 275—25—350."

The Rai Bahadur has recommended that the maximum scale should be Rs. 325 forgetting that the sheristadars and superintendents have a great deal of responsibility in their work; they are practically Personal Assistants to Judges and Magistrates. Their posts compare with the posts of Registrars in the Bengal Secretariat; considering the scale of pay given to them as head clerks, before they became sheristadars or superintendents, it is only natural that they should be given this higher rate. As regards the scale of increment, I think they should get an annual increment of Rs. 25. This seems too much at first sight, but considering that these officers become sheristadars just a few years

before their retirement, it is desirable that their promotion should be rapid and so increase their pensions.

Amendment No. (6) runs thus: "That the pay of stenographers in the offices of the Board of Revenue, Inspector-General of Police and Director of Public Instruction be recommended to be not less than that proposed for the stenographers to Under-Secretaries and Secretaries to Government."

There are 3 classes of stenographers in the Secretariat, viz. A class on Rs. 200—300 *plus* Rs. 175 local allowance for reporting Legisative Council proceedings; B class on Rs. 100—150 till 1916, and now on Rs. 100—200. Five of the B class men also get an allowance of Rs. 75 each for reporting Council proceedings; and C class on Rs. 50—100 attached to Under-Secretaries. Both the majority and minority reports propose to fix the pay, amalgamate the B and C classes and fix their pay as Rs. 100—240.

The stenographers of the Member, Board of Revenue, Inspector-General of Police and Director of Public Instruction who, I find, are now on the grade of Rs. 100—150, *i.e.*, the same pay as the B class men of the Secretariat and before the revision of their pay more than the C class men have been proposed to be given a grade of Rs. 100—200, *i.e.*, even less than the C class men. Since a separate allowance is given for reporting the proceedings of the Council and they all have the same qualifications, do the same kind of work, and are drawing higher rate of salary than the C class men in the Secretariat, I fail to see why the pay of these three posts should be lower than that given to the stenographers attached to the Under-Secretaries. They have also to tour constantly with their office masters.

Again I notice that in both these reports the stenographers of the Commissioners and Collectors are proposed to be given higher pay than these three posts though at present half of these posts carry a lower pay. It cannot be said that they are less qualified, or Calcutta is less expensive, or the stenographers of the Inspector-General of Police do less confidential work or the status of Board of Revenue is less than that of the offices to which these stenographers belong. For all these reasons I propose that the grade of these three posts be the same as those that are recommended in the minority report for the B and C class Secretariat stenographers and those attached to Collectors and Commissioners, *i. e.*, Rs. 100—240.

My last amendment is this: "That the maximum of the grade pay of the head assistants of offices of heads of departments, when direct recruitment of assistants (with qualifications similar to those required for candidates for the subordinate executive service) is made in the upper division, be recommended to be not less than Rs. 400 per mensem."

These officers are recruited from candidates who get themselves nominated for the subordinate executive service. Their qualifications and work are particularly the same. Putting the maximum of the officers of the subordinate executive service at Rs. 450; it is only fair that these officers should get Rs. 400 a month.

Coming to the financial question, I find that the scheme of the majority report will cost Rs. 41 lakhs and that of the minority report will cost Rs. 13 lakhs more; my scheme will cost Rs. 5 lakhs more than that of the minority report; this is not a very large sum, considering that we are going to give these persons a living wage, a scale which is smaller than the rate of pay given to other services; so I think it is only fair that the scales recommended by me should be adopted.

With these words, I commend my amendment to the acceptance of the House.

Munshi MAKRAMALI being absent, the following resolution standing in his name was deemed to be withdrawn:—"This Council recommends to the Government that early effect be given to the recommendations contained in the minority report of the Committee appointed to advise the Government on the revision of pay of permanent ministerial officers, viz., the note of dissent by Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur, with the following modifications:—

MODIFICATIONS SHOWING SCALE OF REVISED PAY OF MINISTERIAL OFFICERS IN EXECUTIVE AND JUDICIAL OFFICES IN DISTRICTS PROPOSED BY THIS COUNCIL.

(1) Lower Division.

Executive and Judicial.

Rs. 50, rising to Rs. 120 in 18 years, with one efficiency bar at Rs. 100.

(2) Upper Division.

(*a*) *Executive.*

(*i*) Sheristadar, Collectorate—Rs. 250, rising to Rs. 350.

(*ii*) Head assistant or Magistrate's head clerk—Rs. 200, rising to Rs. 250.

(*iii*) Treasurer—Rs. 150, rising to Rs. 225.

(*iv*) Others—Rs. 130, rising to Rs. 200, with a charge allowance of Rs. 50 per month—(1) to all head clerks, Collectorate; (2) to all subdivisional head clerks; and (3) to accountants of district treasuries, or a special grade may be made for them.

(*b*) *Judicial.*

(*i*) Sheristadar, District Judge's Court—Rs. 250, rising to Rs. 350.

(*ii*) Nazir, District Judge's Court—Rs. 200, rising to Rs. 250.

(*iii*) Others—Rs. 130, rising to Rs. 200."

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: "This Council recommends to the Government—

(*1*) that the minimum pay of a ministerial officer of the lower division in any office be Rs. 40—40—45—5/2—70—5/2—100 with only one efficiency bar at Rs. 70;

(*2*) that the posts of the Sheristadars (or Superintendents) of the offices of the Divisional Commissioners, District Judges and District Collectors be the same as regards status, pay and scale and periods of increment; and

(*3*) that the post of the Nazir of a District Judge's Court be given the same status and pay as that of a Sheristadar."

At the outset I should mention that my No. (*1*) is like one of the amendments of my friend Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta, except that it raises the minimum. We have come to beg; it is only a little lump of bread for our poor people. The people whose case we are discussing are men deserving every consideration; they practically form the backbone of the service as well as of Bengal society. It would not be too much to pay them even double of what I have proposed. Even then, I doubt whether this would be sufficient to keep the pot boiling; but unfortunately, our administration is so very top-heavy that all the money that could be exacted from the poor people of Bengal has been taken, and little remains for the bottom of the service. Well, from whatever can be spared, let us see whether we can make provision for these poor people who, as I have said, are the backbone of the service as well as society. I may also mention that I have noted that the ministerial officers in the Commissioners' office have been recommended by the majority report to be paid at the scale I mention here, but when it comes to other departments, a less amount has been recommended. I say there is no reason why this difference should be made.

Coming to amendments Nos. (*2*) and (*3*); I shall take these two together. I do not suggest what amount should be paid, but I generally accept what Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta has said on the point. I may mention that I think there is no difference in the responsibilities and duties of the sheristadars or superintendents of the Commissioner's, Collector's and District Judge's offices. In fact, these posts are interchangeable; when a vacancy occurs in one office, a sheristadar of another office goes across and fills it. But in the majority report the sheristadars of the Divisional Commissioner's offices have been recommended a higher rate of pay. Well, there has recently been a discussion in this Council whether the Commissioner's office and the Commissioner's post are at all necessary. The matter was not carried, but at the same time it has been made clear to this House that after all it is only some sort of a magnified post-office, and I see no reason why the sheristadar of that office should get higher pay; unless there is

some philosophical reason why should they receive a higher pay than the other sheristadars? Similarly, the posts of the nazir and sheristadar of the District Judge's office have the same status and responsibilities, both represent two different branches of the ministerial offices; and I therefore suggest that their status should be the same.

Babu JOGENDRA KRISHNA ROY being absent, the following motion standing in his name was deemed to be withdrawn: "This Council recommends to the Government—

(*a*) that the minimum wage for a clerk under the employ of the Government be fixed at Rs. 50 a month; and

(*b*) that the minimum wage for a menial servant under the employ of the Government be fixed at Rs. 20 per month."

Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: I shall only move the first part of my resolution——

The PRESIDENT: You must take permission before you can do that.

Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: May I have your permission to move the first part of my resolution? I beg leave to withdraw the second part as it has been dealt with by previous speakers.

The PRESIDENT: You have my permission to move the first part only.

The second part of the resolution was, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: "This Council recommends to the Government, that the initial scale of pay of the full-time subsidiary jail clerks be fixed at Rs. 35 instead of Rs. 30 as proposed in the report."

As regards the second part of my resolution, I beg leave to withdraw it as it has been dealt with by previous speakers. I only wish to speak about the subsidiary jail class. Everywhere they are the whole-time Government servants and they have to perform the same duties as Jailers in other jails. They have of course been given an *ad-interim* allowance, but that is not permanent. Their case has of course been considered by the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee but it is not satisfactory to them. Generally they begin with an initial salary of Rs. 20 a month and the Committee has recommended Rs. 30 as the minimum scale. Sir, it is unfair to them. The Khas Mahal clerks who also used to begin on an initial salary of Rs. 20 have been given the minimum of Rs. 35, but as regards these jail classes the difference between their pay and that of the Khas Mahal clerks is Rs. 5. Therefore I submit for the consideration of the Council that they should at least be given

a minimum of Rs. 35. In view of the majority report their initial pay ought to be Rs. 32 and it would not entail much expenditure to add Rs 5 to their initial salary and fixed at Rs. 30.

With these words I place this resolution before the House for their acceptance.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI, by leave of the President withdrew the following resolution: "This Council recommends to the Government—

(*1*) that the minimum pay of the upper division of the ministerial establishment of the mufassal courts and offices be fixed at Rs. 100 rising to Rs. 150 with an annual increment of Rs. 5;

(*2*) that the scale of Rs. 80—2—100 for the sheristadars of the Munsifs' Courts in Bengal, as proposed in the majority report of the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee, be abolished and that these posts be included in the upper division scale, viz., Rs. 100—5—150;

(*3*) that the proposal of the majority on the report of the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee, in paragraph 95, page 92 of their report that in the case of the upper division the immediate increase should be limited to 50 per cent. of the previous pay, be not accepted;

(*4*) that the scale of pay for the sheristadars or superintendents of both the Executive and Judicial sides be equal and fixed at Rs. 225—300;

(*5*) that the sheristadars and superintendents of both the Executive and Judicial sides be given gazetted rank and that 4 per cent. of these officers be promoted annually to the Bengal Civil Service;

(*6*) that the pay of the head clerks of the offices of the Civil Surgeons be fixed at Rs. 70—3—100 and that of other clerks at Rs. 40—2—70;

(*7*) that the copyists and the typists attached to the district offices, Civil and Executive sides, be included in the respective establishments, and that their pay be fixed at Rs. 35 to 50 and Rs. 50 to 80, respectively;

(*8*) that the pay of the clerks in the rural Registration offices be fixed at Rs. 30—40 and Rs. 40—60;

(*9*) that the pay of joint office clerks and muharrirs in the Registration offices (headquarters) be fixed at Rs. 35—45 instead of Rs. 30—40."

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: Sir, I do not think I should take up the time of the Council at all. We all know that we are all in sympathy with the ministerial officers. We do not want any

speech but we want to have this thing put to the vote as soon as possible.

Mr. SYED NASIM ALI: In view of the importance of these resolutions and also in view of the remarks already made by different members of the Council, I do not think I should take up the time of the Council by dwelling at length upon this matter. I whole-heartedly support the amendment of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta and for this reason that he has proposed something in addition to the resolution of Babu Satish Chandra Mukharji to the effect that the minority report should be accepted.

Now, so far as these questions are concerned, there are practically two points to be considered. The first is whether we should give them the minimum pay and the maximum pay as stated in this particular resolution, and the second point is what would be the effect of this resolution upon the financial position of the province. It will perhaps be contended that if effect is given to Indu Babu's amendment, Government would require a very large amount of money and the present financial condition being very bad, it would be impossible to meet the requirements of the resolution. My short and simple answer is this: If once we decide that these are just dues it must be given effect to and we shall have to find the money anyhow. The whole question is whether the scales proposed in the resolution are really just. If that is so, then the Finance Member can very well ask for the supply of money and the members of the Council will have to find the money for him. Some members of the Council may perhaps say that in case we can save Rs 4 or 5 lakhs we can devote the money for other purposes, say, for instance, education or sanitation. But it must be remembered that these gentlemen whose pay we want to increase for, as one of the members has already stated, the backbone of our society, and I think all the members of the Council will agree with me that these ministerial officers are some way or other connected with us. In fact, if we go one, two or three generations back, we will find that practically all the holders of high posts and big offices and all who claim to be high in society are in some way or other connected with these ministerial officers excepting perhaps a few aristocratic landlords. One thing is certain and it is this: that these people are demanding an increase in their pay. They are a most competent class of public servants and we must not tire out their patience. The last conference of the ministerial officers was held practically near my house. The way in which this particular conference was carried on, the enthusiasm which prevailed in that conference and which I could gather from outside, convinced me that there was a real and genuine feeling and that all that agitation was not simply to have the luxuries of life but its bare necessities. Indu Babu's resolution wants to give them a minimum pay of Rs. 50. Sir, if I am not mistaken, even the majority report admits that Rs. 75 is the minimum expenditure of a family in these days. In that case, I think, it is not too much to ask

for Rs. 50 as minimum pay. It is very reasonable and I think the Council ought to support it.

Then, Sir, if Indu Babu's resolution is carried, it would entail an additional expenditure of Rs. 4 lakhs taking Rs. 40 as the average pay for 10,000 men. But if we are convinced that it will be of benefit to these people, we ought to spend Rs. 4 lakhs more. If we could afford to spend Rs. 12 lakhs more, we would have been justified in spending it. Therefore, we ought to spend Rs. 4 lakhs taking into consideration the fact that in the near future there would be no chance of a revision of the scale.

With these words, I beg to support Indu Babu's resolution.

Mr. H. BARTON: As this is possibly the last day of the sessions and as we do not want an important matter like this to lapse, I think it would be unfair to those for whose benefit these resolutions have been brought up, to take up the time of the Council by another speech. I however, heartily support the resolution as well as Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta's amendment.

Maulvi MUHAMMAD ABDUL JUBBAR PAHLOWAN: I am sorry that I have to oppose all the resolutions regarding the revision of salaries of ministerial officers. I understand that the present position is that there is a deficu of about Rs. 2 crores and by revising these salaries, this deficit will be greater. Where are we to get the money from? Will not the Government try to meet even a pie of the expenses of the poor famine-stricken people of Bengal? It is really a source of wonder to me to see under what principles my colleagues are trying to better the circumstances of one class of people from the labour of another class of people whose condition is many times worse than that of the former. Have my learned colleagues thought over this? Will my colleagues, who are very eager to revise the salaries of ministerial officers, allow the the Government to levy fresh taxation on the poor people who are already overburdened with taxes? Is the condition of the poor raiyats better than the ministerial officers? Perhaps the condition of the raiyats is better than the ministerial officers because they cannot speak and most of them are illiterate? However reasonable it may be, I much regret that I am compelled to ask the Government to postpone the matter, so long as the funds needed for it are not available. I know that my insignificant voice will not be able to rouse the Government, but I am afraid that there will be trouble if my advice is not followed.

SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ spoke in Bengali in support of the resolution and the amendment of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta.

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: I think I had begin by explaining to the Council the position of Government in regard to this matter. Whatever principles we adopt for regulating the pay of the ministerial officers, the process is bound to be expensive. It will certainly cost over Rs. 15

lakhs; and, therefore, under the Devolution Rules, the scheme will require the sanction of the Secretary of State. Now, the Secretary of State has issued orders that in the case of all schemes which require his sanction under the Devolution Rules, we are not to lay our proposals before the Legislative Council or to ask for a vote until he has had an opportunity of considering the matter. That is to say our hands are tied because the responsibility rests with the Secretary of State and not with the Council, but of course there is no bar to our consulting the Council and allowing it to express its views. That is the object of the proceedings to-day. We have given the Council an opportunity of expressing its views on the scales of pay to be adopted and we shall of course take the views of the Council into consideration before we formulate our proposals for submission to the Secretary of State. There are just a few general points of principle which I may properly ask the Council to consider before it gives its vote on this important matter. The most important point, at any rate, theoretically, is the standard of enhancement which we should give. The Committee, as the Council is aware, have taken a general standard at 60 per cent., though, as I shall show later, the enhancement of pay which they propose in individual cases very much exceeds this. The Rai Bahadur, who I am sorry to see is not here this evening, in his minority report has taken the general standard at 100 per cent. Now, our first objection to this proposal is that it is unnecessarily extravagant. It would no doubt be pleasant for the ministerial officers and everybody else concerned if we could hand them on the first of next month pay amounting to double the pre-war rate. But, in our present financial position, this is not possible. We disposed of the case of menials in July last and we are now concerned entirely with ministerial officers. The cost of the majority report regarding ministerial officers amounts to Rs. 31 lakhs. The cost of the proposal in the minority report is about Rs. 48½ lakhs, a difference of Rs. 17½ lakhs. The cost of the proposals in some of the resolutions which have been put forward would roughly amount to Rs. 10 or 15 lakhs more, that is to say, a total of Rs. 60 or Rs. 65 lakhs or perhaps more. We shall find it hard enough, as it is, to provide a sum of Rs. 30 or Rs. 35 lakhs to meet the cost of these proposals. The Rai Bahadur's proposals are based on the assumption that the cost of living has gone up 100 per cent. above the pre-war rates and he has submitted various calculations in support of his views and the Committee have given others. It is extremely difficult to check all these calculations and to criticise the detailed figures, but the best figures, we have in India are those compiled by the Director-General of Statistics. They are weighted very carefully and compared with prices all over the world and checked against figures in other countries where statistical arrangements are more complete than they are here. The Director-General's weighted figures show that the cost of living in India has gone up about 60 per cent. since the war, but these figures were published last December and the cost of living has fallen

since then. It has fallen in other countries much more than in India and we may reasonably hope that the effects of the fall in Europe will be felt here in the near future. I think, therefore, if we take the Committee's figures of 60 per cent. we shall not be going very far wrong. Babu Satish Chandra Mukharji thinks that we should make up the whole loss due to the war. I would point out however that no employer of labour has attempted to relieve his employees of the whole of the increased cost of living and it would be unreasonable to expect Government to do so. We, who have lived through the war, must pay the penalty and that penalty for us, who are in India, is far lighter in many ways than has been paid by the inhabitants of other countries. Now, I should like to touch as briefly, as posible upon some of the detailed proposals, but before I do so I should clear the ground by saying that we are prepared to accept two of the resolutions. The first is that standing in the name of Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri and moved by Babu S. N. Ray which asks us to take into consideration the opinion of the Bengal Ministerial Conference. As soon as the report was published we supplied a copy of the report to the conference and we have studied the views of the conference with a great deal of care and a great deal of interest. There is a good deal that I could say about those views, but I cannot detain the Council at this late hour. We propose also to accept the proposals which have been made in several of the resolutions that we should not limit the immediate increases to 50 per cent. of the previous pay. This limitation is a comparatively recent innovation introduced by the Government of India in the case of certain reorganizations, but it works unevenly and causes a good deal of heartburning and dissatisfaction. As it does not work well, we do not propose to adopt it in the case of ministerial officers in Bengal, but as I have said our proposals on this subject are subject to the sanction of the Secretary of State and the Government of India, and I cannot say what view they will take of the matter. So far, however, as the Government of Bengal is concerned we do not propose to bind ourselves by that limitation in drawing up our proposals. I do not think that we can well go into all the details suggested in many of these resolutions. It is hardly the function of this Council to fix the pay of individual posts like those of registration muharrirs, Civil Surgeon's clerks and people of that kind. Work of that description would not be attempted by the House of Commons or any deliberative body in any part of the civilized world, and I do not think that this Council will find that the undertaking of such work will redound to its credit. However, as an illustration of the practical bearing of these resolutions on the financial position of individual clerks, I will briefly run through the proposals in resolution No. 23.

The first proposal in the resolution is that the initial pay of the lower division clerks in the mufassal courts and offices should be fixed at Rs. 50 rising to Rs. 100. I think that the members who have proposed this resolution have omitted to consider the important principles

laid down in paragraph 9 of the report of the Committee regarding the standard value of the time-scale.

The advantage of the application of time-scale of pay to mufassal offices is quite obvious. In a graded service a man may be stuck in a grade for several years while under the time-scale system he will steadily go up by annual or biennial increments.

[At this stage the time for adjournment was reached as it was 7-15 o'clock. The President asked whether it would be better to adjourn the House.]

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: I will take about ten minutes more to finish my speech.

The PRESIDENT: I think the Council had better adjourn now and we can resume the discussion on this item on Tuesday, after the voting of grants.

Adjournment.

The Council was adjourned till 3 P.M. on Tuesday, the 6th September, 1921, at the Town Hall, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Tuesday, the 6th September, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers, and 102 nominated and elected members.

Starred Questions

(to which oral answers were given).

Provincial Police Service.

*XXXIX. **Mr. BIJOY PROSAD SINGH ROY:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether effect has been given to the recommendations of the Public Services Commission with regard to the pay and status of the officers of the Provincial Police Service in Bengal?

MEMBER in charge of APPOINTMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): A time-scale of pay for deputy superintendents of police was sanctioned by the Secretary of State with effect from the 30th October, 1919, after consideration of the recommendations of the Public Services Commission. The orders of the local Government fixing the pay of individual officers under the time-scale have been communicated to the Accountant-General, Bengal, who is expediting the issue of pay orders. Some other matters connected with the service are still under the consideration of Government.

Enforcement of Bengal Village Self-Government Act, 1919.

*XL. **Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether the Bengal Village Self-Government Act, 1919, is going to be put in force all over the province?

(*b*) If so, by what time and by what process?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): (*a*) and

(*b*) It is hoped that the Village Self-Government Act will eventually come into force throughout the province and every effort is being made by Government to accelerate the establishment of union boards. The rate of progress, however, varies in different districts, and the date by which they will have been formed in every district cannot therefore be foretold. The process of formation of these boards is governed by the provisions of the Village Self-Government Act.

Election and nomination of officials on local and district boards

***XLI. Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether it is a fact that under the new rules, guiding Government officers in the matter of local boards, subdivisional officers are not allowed to stand for election to, or sit on, local boards or at any rate they are not to be the chairmen of such boards?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that one result of this will be that these officers cannot be elected by the local boards to the district boards?

(*c*) Is it a fact that as a result of the instructions issued to the District Magistrates as to the number of officials whom they are to nominate to the district boards, they will only be able to nominate the Civil Surgeon and the District Deputy Inspector of Schools, and that subdivisional officers will not stand a chance of nomination to the district boards?

(*d*) Are the Government aware of a feeling that exists that the subdivisional officers, being conversant with all parts of their subdivisions, will be of great assistance to the district boards, especially now that the District Magistrate is no longer a chairman or even a member?

(*e*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge be pleased to state whether the matter is going to be reconsidered with a view to the retention of the subdivisional officers on the boards?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) A copy of letters No. 2108—12 L.S.-G., dated 16th April, 1921, and No. 46—T.—L.S.-G., dated 18th May, 1921, is laid on the table.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) No.

(*d*) No representations on the subject have been made to Government.

(*e*) The member is referred to the reply to clause (*c*).

Letters referred to in the reply to clause (a) of starred question No. XLI.

No. 2108-12 L.S.-G., dated Calcutta, the 16th April, 1921.

From—L. S. S. O'MALLEY, ESQ., C.I.E., I.C.S., Secretary to the Government of Bengal, Local Self-Government Department,

To—All Commissioners of Divisions.

I am directed to forward a copy of a resolution* which was moved by Babu Fanindralal De at the meeting of the Bengal Legislative Council held on the 5th April, 1921, and to say that it was accepted by Government and carried *nem con.* The Government of Bengal (Ministry of Local Self-Government) accordingly direct that no official member of a local board should nd for election as its chairman. I am to request that local boards in your ision and their official members may be informed of this order.

IE HON'BLE SIR ENDRA NATH ERJEA, KT., Minister harge

*This Council recommends to the Government that they be pleased to direct t no official member of a local board in Bengal should stand for election as irman thereof.

No. 46 T.—L.S.-G., dated Darjeeling, the 18th May, 1921.

From—L. S. S. O'MALLEY, ESQ., C.I.E., I.C.S., Secretary to the Government of Bengal, Local Self-Government Department,

To—The Commissioner of the Rajshahi Division.

With reference to your letter No. 642 M., dated the 25th March, 1921, I am directed to say that the orders contained in this Department memorandum No. 1906 L.S.-G., dated the 31st May, 1893, that if subdivisional officers who have been appointed members of local boards are not elected chairmen they uld resign, should be regarded as still in force.

IE HON'BLE SIR ENDRA NATH ERJEA, KT., Minister harge

2 Under the orders conveyed in this Department letter No. 2108—12 L.S.-G., ed the 16th April, 1921, officials are not to be elected as chairmen of local rds. A position of some difficulty and embarrassment may be created if a divisional officer serves as a member without being chairman, and the Government of Bengal (Ministry of Local Self-Government) have, therefore, decided that future subdivisional officers should not be appointed members of local boards.

Embankments within prohibited areas.

***XLII. Babu SARAT CHANDRA JANAH:** (*a*) Has the atten- n of the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of igation been drawn to the case reported in XXIX, Calcutta Law urnal, page 328?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of modifying e notification referred to in the said case?

(*c*) Are the Government aware that the notification is in force in me areas which are not necessary to be kept free from embankments spill areas, on account of the rivers being wholly silted up, such as e Bagda or Chowmuk?

(*d*) Is it a fact that the Government leased out lands within the prohibited areas to many tenants on the express stipulation that they would be allowed to erect embankments and repair them; but that subsequently these tenants were prosecuted under the Bengal Embankment Act (Bengal Act 2 of 1882) for exercising the said rights?

(*e*) What compensation, if any, have the Government paid to these tenants?

(*f*) If they have not done so yet, are the Government at present considering the matter with a view to reducing the rent of these tenancies?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of IRRIGATION (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) No.

(*c*) No; on the contrary Government is of opinion that the prohibitory notification is having a most salutary effect on the rivers concerned.

(*d*) As held by the Hon'ble the High Court, the clause regarding erection and repairs to embankments in the leased area casts upon the tenant a burden or duty and not a privilege and that it does not affect the prohibition under notification under section 6 of the Embankment Act.

(*e*) and (*f*) The answers are in the negative.

Increments to officers officiating in higher ranks.

***XLIII. Babu FANINDRALAL DE:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether it is a fact that an order No. 2097-C.S.R., Government of India, Finance Department, Delhi, dated 27th November, 1920—Pay and Allowance, issued by the Government of India in November, 1920, laying down certain rules for allowing increments to officers officiating in higher ranks has not been yet promulgated in this Province?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Finance Member be pleased to state when they propose to give effect to the order?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Finance Member be pleased to lay on the table a copy of the above order?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of FINANCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): (*a*) and (*b*) The orders referred to by the member were received in the Finance Department shortly before the fire of last January. They were, therefore, not circulated to all Departments, but copies of the orders were sent direct to the Accountant-General, Bengal, by the Government of India. The Accountant-General reports that acting promotions are being allowed under the new rules in cases where they apply.

(*c*) A copy of the orders has been placed in the Library.

Unstarred Questions

(answers to which were laid on the table).

Appointment of ministerial officers by District Officers.

250. Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether it is a fact that all District Officers are authorised to fill up all ministerial appointments over Rs. 100 in their own offices as well as offices subordinate to them but the District Officers of the Presidency Division have not been given such power?

(*ii*) What are the reasons for this different treatment?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of making the system of appointment the same all over the Presidency?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE [LAND REVENUE] (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (*a*) (*i*) Under rule 59 of the Board's Miscellaneous Rules, 1918, appointments to vacancies in the upper division of clerks in the district offices, including appointments over Rs. 100, are to be made by the District Officer. In the Presidency Division there is a rule that in the case of appointments to vacancies in posts with a salary of over Rs. 100 a reference is to be made to the Commissioner.

(*ii*) The object of the rule in the Presidency Division was to secure the consideration of the claims of deserving officers in districts to which first grade appointments were not assigned in the filling up of such appointments in other districts.

(*b*) The matter is under consideration

Admission into Presidency College.

251. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to say whether any principle is followed in admitting students into the Presidency College, if so, what?

(*b*) Has any exception been made to the principle, if any, in admitting students into the Presidency College this year, if so, why?

(*c*) Is there any committee for selecting students for admission into the Presidency College?

(*d*) What are the duties to be performed by the Bursar of the Presidency College?

(*e*) Is it a fact that a professor of Mathematics filled the office of the Bursar when it was first created, but a professor of English has been appointed as his successor?

(*f*) Is it a fact that the European professor of Mathematics, who filled the office of the Bursar, has been succeeded by an Indian professor?

(*g*) Has the present Bursar of the Presidency College any special knowledge of keeping accounts?

(*h*) Is the office of Bursar reserved for European professors only?

(*i*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that unusual delay is made in distributing the salary of the staff since the appointment of the present Bursar of the Presidency College?

(*j*) Is it a fact that a professor of Physics of the Chittagong College has been appointed to the position of demonstrator of Physics in the Presidency College? If so, why?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter): (*a*) The only rule on the subject is that Muhammadan candidates should be admitted up to a certain minimum. When this has been attended to remaining vacancies are filled by selection, regard being had not only to intellectual fitness and character, but also to school, place of domicile, occupation of father, social status, with a view to securing a wide representation of schools, of the various divisions of the people and of the various parts of the province. Three Calcutta Schools are as a matter of practice, not of right, granted special privileges in that their pupils are admitted in more generous numbers than those of other schools.

(*b*) No exception has been made.

(*c*) There is no committee. The decisions and responsibility are the Principal's, though he is invariably assisted by many members of the teaching staff of the college.

(*d*) He looks after the financial affairs of the college, supervising the accounts of the college accountant, relieving the Principal of this part of his duties but of no responsibility.

(*e*) The fact is as stated, but the first Bursar was not so appointed because he was a mathematician.

(*f*) An Indian gentleman has been appointed to act as professor of Mathematics in place of the European professor of Mathematics who is on deputation elsewhere. He has not been appointed to act as Bursar.

(*g*) The duties of Bursar require intelligence and reliability, but not any special knowledge of the keeping of accounts, though the present Bursar, having satisfactorily held the office for about 2 years, may be presumed to have such special knowledge and all other necessary qualifications for the discharge of his duties.

(*h*) No such ruling has been made.

(*i*) Government are not aware of any delay except that as certain members of the teaching staff learnt towards the end of July that they could draw arrears of pay on presenting their bills, and were insistent that the college accountant should deal with their cases immediately, the preparation of the menials' bills for that month was delayed, and

their pay was received late. As the Bursar was appointed two years ago the suggestion in the question is not understood.

(*j*) It is a fact. Owing to the promotion of a member of the Physics staff of the Presidency College to the Indian Educational Service as Principal of the Chittagong College, the transfer of a teacher of Physics from the Chittagong College to the Presidency College automatically ensued.

Admission into Calcutta Medical College.

252. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to lay on the table, a tabular statement, showing for the year 1921—

(*i*) the number of candidates, Bengali, Hindu and Muhammadan, respectively, for admission into the Calcutta Medical College;

(*ii*) the academical qualifications of such candidates, respectively, under heads M.Sc., B.Sc. (Honours), B.Sc. (Pass), I.Sc. (first, second and third divisions), and how many of such candidates were admitted; and

(*iii*) the total number of admissions into the college, showing their qualifications as detailed in (*ii*)?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether it is a fact that a committee was appointed by the Government to select suitable candidates for admission into the Calcutta Medical College this year?

(*ii*) if so, whether the said committee were present when the Principal interviewed the candidates for admission; and

(*iii*) if the answer to (*ii*) is in the negative, the reasons why the committee were not present then?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Principal admitted some students without the knowledge and consent of the said committee? If so, why?

(*d*) If the answer to (*c*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the number of students admitted by the Principal alone, showing their academical qualifications as detailed in (*a*) (*ii*) and the number admitted by the committee?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) (*i*) The figures are—

Bengali Hindus	915
Muhammadans	33
Native Christians	8
Total ...	956

(*ii*) and (*iii*) Statements A and B giving the information asked for are laid on the table.

(*b*) (*i*) Yes.

(*ii*) No, but on a few occasions two members of the committee were present.

(*iii*) The selection committee were of opinion that the character and personal attainments of each applicant could not be gauged properly by a meeting of the whole committee and they agreed that the wisest plan would be for the Principal himself to interview the candidates and for him to submit to the committee his opinion of the merits of each candidate which were expressed by a careful system of marks. The time occupied by the Principal himself in interviewing candidates was about 65 hours or 2 hours a day for a month, and it would have been impracticable for all the members of the committee to spare time for interviewing each individual candidate. Two members of the committee were however co-opted and sat with the Principal for a certain number of interviews.

(*c*) The Principal was authorised by the committee to admit students of whom he might approve to such vacancies as might occur owing to selected candidates not joining.

(*d*) The member is referred to statement B.

Statement A referred to in clauses (a) (ii) and (iii) of unstarred question No. 252, showing the number of candidates who applied for admission to the Medical College, Calcutta, during the session 1921-22.

M. Sc.	1
B. Sc. (Honours)	31
,, (Distinction)	59
,, (Pass)	72
I. Sc. First Division	433
,, Second ,,	245
,, Third ,,	39
B.A.	1
I.A. First Division	1
,, Second ,,	1
,, Third ,,	1
F.Sc.	1
High School	1
Senior Cambridge	1
Matriculation	67
Total	956

Statement B referred to in clauses (a) (ii) and (iii) of unstarred question No. 252, showing the total number of students admitted to the Medical College during the session 1921-22.

	B.Sc.			I Sc.			Senior Cambridge.	I.A.			MATRICULATION.			F. Sc.	Total.
	Honours	Distinction.	Pass.	1st division.	2nd division.	3rd division.		1st division.	2nd division.	3rd division.	1st division.	2nd division.	3rd division.		
1. Selected by Bihar Government.	...	1	2	2	9	1	...	..	...	..	..	...	...	...	18
2. Selected by Assam Government.	...	...	...	6	...	..	...	...	..	..	..	...	...	...	6
3. Selected by Burma Government.	...	...	1	...	..	.	...	..	...	...	..	...	...	...	1
4. Female candidates ...	...	...	...	...	...	..	1	..	...	1	...	1	...	1	4
5. Selected by Committee individually.	15	8	10	77	29	1	...	...	...	..	...	...	...	...	140
6. Admitted by Principal under orders of Committee.	...	5	...	7	...	..	...	..	...	..	...	...	...	..	12
7. Selected by Principal by sanction of the Committee to replace any of those selected but not joined.	...	...	...	...	10	..	...	...	...	..	..	...	...	...	10
Total ...	15	14	13	92	48	5	1	...	...	1	...	1	...	1	191

Appointment of special constables at Hajiganj (Chandpur).

253. Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state whether the recent orders of the subdivisional officer of Chandpur, appointing thirty-one persons of the Hajiganj locality to act as special constables, were issued on the responsibility of the subdivisional officer himself or at the instance of any higher authority?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the circumstances that led to the issue of such orders?

MEMBER in charge of POLICE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) The subdivisional officer of Chandpur appointed special constables on his own authority on receipt of an application in accordance with the provisions of section 17 of Act V of 1861.

(*b*) Owing to the intimidation of railway employees by unlawful assemblies and the damaging of the railway line endangering the safety of the public, further protective measures were necessary. The police ordinarily employed for preserving the peace were insufficient for the purpose and on the application of the Superintendent, Railway Police, and the Deputy Superintendent of Police, Chandpur, the subdivisional officer appointed 31 special police officers.

Appointment of special constables at Hajiganj (Chandpur).

254. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state the reasons why, and on whose application, a large number of gentlemen have been ordered to act as special constables in Hajiganj in the Chandpur subdivision of the district of Tippera?

(*b*) Is it a fact that these gentlemen have been ordered to guard railway lines near Hajiganj?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that there is a strong feeling in the locality against the procedure and that the duties imposed upon these gentlemen are regarded as insulting and beneath their dignity?

(*d*) Did the subdivisional officer of Chandpur or the District Magistrate of Tippera or any other responsible officer hold any inquiry as to the necessity of appointing special constables before this step was taken?

(*e*) Was any attempt made to try whether the ordinary or armed or any other police were not sufficient to meet the situation at Hajiganj before this procedure of appointing special constables was adopted? If not, why not?

(*f*) What steps, if any, are usually taken to see that the section dealing with the appointment of special constables is not abused?

(*g*) Are the Government considering the desirability of releasing these gentlemen of their duties as special constables?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Attention is invited to the answer given to an unstarred question asked at this meeting by Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur.

(*b*) The duties allotted to them were light, viz., to patrol the railway lines for a few hours to see that the gangmen were not obstructed in their work or the lines tampered with.

(*c*) Government have no information.

(*d*) The question of appointing special police officers was considered by the subdivisional officer on receipt of the application under Act V of 1861, and from his acquaintance with the circumstances, he considered their appointment necessary.

(*e*) Both unarmed and armed police as well as chaukidars were employed in patrolling the railway lines. When these were found to be insufficient, special police officers were appointed.

(*f*) Instructions are issued by Government regulating the appointment of special police officers. A copy is placed on the library table.

(*g*) No.

Officers of the Public Health Department.

255. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state the names, qualifications and respective ranks of officers of the Public Health Department, Bengal, and also the total expenditure of this Department?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: A statement showing the names, qualifications and ranks of officers of the Public Health Department, Bengal, is laid on the table. For the total expenditure of the department the member is referred to the figures given in page 43 of the budget statement for 1921-22.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 255.

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH, BENGAL.

Name.	Qualifications.	Rank.
Dr. Charles Albert Bentley.	M.B., D.P.H., D.T.M. & H.	Sub. *pro tem* Director of Public Health, Bengal, with effect from 9th November, 1915, and substantively from 29th May, 1917. Ex-officio Joint Secretary to the Sanitary Board and Professor of Hygiene, Calcutta Medical College (on privilege leave for six months from 21st April, 1921).

	Qualifications.	
Lt.-Col. Arthur Brownfield Fry, C.I.E., D.S.O.	M.D., D.P.H., D.T.M. & H., I.M.S.	Special Assistant Director of Public Health for Malaria Research, Bengal. (Officiating Public Health Commissioner with the Government of India, from 1st February, 1921).
Dr. Ratanshaw Bomanji Khambata.	M.R.C.S., L.R.C.P., D.P.H.	Sub. *pro tem.* Special Assistant Director of Public Health, Malaria Research, Bengal from 28th June, 1919.
Dr. Muhammad Ibrahim Sufi.	B.A., L.R.C.P. & S., L.R.F.P.S., D.P.H.	Assistant Director of Public Health, Dacca Circle.
Dr. Bipin Bihari Brahmachari.	L.M.S., D.P.H. ...	Sub. *pro tem.* Assistant Director of Public Health, Presidency Circle, Bengal, Calcutta.
Dr. Syma Prasanna Gupta.	L.M.S., D.P.H. ...	Sub. *pro tem.* Assistant Director of Public Health, on special duty Anti-Hookworm Campaign, Rural Areas, 4th March, 1919.
Dr. Sachindra Nath Sur	M.B., D.P.H., D.T.M.	Sub. *pro tem.* Assistant Director of Public Health, on special duty. Kala-azar Inquiry, 3rd June, 1919.
Dr. Rajendra Chandra Ray.	L.M.S., D.P.H. ...	Officiating Assistant Director of Public Health, Burdwan Circle, 16th July, 1919.
Dr. Sourendra Mohan Ghosh.	M.R.C.S., L.R.C.P., D.P.H.	Officiating Assistant Director of Public Health, Rajshahi Circle.
Dr. Giridhari Lal Batra.	M.B., CH.B., D.P.H.	Special Officer, Calcutta and Chittagong Port Stegomiya Investigation.
Dr. Satyendra Nath Mitra.	M.B., CH.B., D.P.H.	Assistant Director of Public Health for School Hygiene.
Dr. Rachel Nathan Cohen.	M.B., F.R.C.S. ...	Medical Inspectress of Girls' Schools.
Dr. Cecil Henry Elmes.	C.B.E., M.B., CH.B.	Health Officer, Port of Calcutta. (On combined leave for 5 months and 15 days from 21st July, 1921.)
Dr. J. B. McVail ...	M.R.C.S., L.R.C.P. ...	Officiating Health Officer, Port of Calcutta.
Alfred Holehouse ...	Military Assistant Surgeon.	Assistant Health Officer, Port of Calcutta.
Manindra Nath Bhattacharji.	Civil Assistant Surgeon, L.M.S.	Second Assistant Health Officer, Port of Calcutta.
Dr. Upendra Nath Ray.	M.B., D.P.H. ...	Third Assistant Health Officer, Port of Calcutta.
Rash Bihari Dutta ...	Temporary Assistant Surgeon, M.B.	Health Officer, Port of Chittagong.
Panchanan Sur ...	Temporary Assistant Surgeon, M.B., D.P.H.	Assistant to the Assistant Director of Public Health, Malaria Research.
Murari Mohan Basu	Temporary Assistant Surgeon, M.B.	Ditto ditto.
Haripada Sirkar ...	Temporary Assistant Surgeon.	Ditto ditto.
Banamali Ghosh ...	Temporary Assistant Surgeon, M.B.	Ditto ditto.

Name.	Qualifications.	Rank.
Jyotirmoy Banarji ...	Temporary Assistant Surgeon, M.B.	Assistant to the Assistant Director of Public Health School Hygiene.
Mahendra Kumar Chakravarti.	Civil Assistant Surgeon, M.B.	Superintendent, Bengal Vaccine Depôt. Calcutta.
Rao Sahib Vellore Govinda Raju Mudaliar.	B.A. ...	First Bacteriologist, Bengal Public Health Laboratory.
Rai Sahib Surendra Nath De.	B.A., F.C.S. ...	First Chemist, Bengal Public Health Laboratory, and Public Analyst for Bengal.
Narendra Krishna Chatterji.	B.Sc. ...	Second Chemist (officiating) Bengal Public Health Laboratory (officiating).
Nani Lal Banerji ...	M.Sc. ...	Fourth Chemist, Bengal Public Health Laboratory (officiating).
Sachindra Kishore Das Ray.	.....	Second Bacteriologist, Bengal Public Health Laboratory.
Abinash Chandra Das Gupta.	B.Sc. ...	Third Chemist, Bengal Public Health Laboratory
Hirendra Nath Datta	B.Sc. ...	Third Bacteriologist, Bengal Public Health Laboratory (officiating)
John Dallas ...	Marine Engineer ...	Inspector of Septic Tank Installations, Bengal
Mandayam Oswie Tirunarayan Iyengar.	B.A. ...	Entomologist, Malaria Research Department.
Miss J. F Mackintosh.	Diploma of the Central Midwives Board of England and other certificates of special training. Has experience of exhibition and publicity work in England.	Special Lady Assistant for Publicity Work.
Kali Prasanna Ray ...	M.A , B.L ...	Demonstrator, Travelling Public Health Laboratory.
Dr. Abinash Chandra Ray Choudhuri.	L.M.S ...	Teacher of Hygiene, Sanitary Inspectors' Training Class.
Dr. Sarat Chandra Das Gupta.	M.B. ...	Entomologist, Stegomiya Survey
Dr. Monoranjan Chakrabartti.	M.B. ...	Assistant Surgeon, Sonarpur Malaria Observatory.

PUBLIC HEALTH DEPARTMENT, ENGINEERING BRANCH.

Name.	Qualifications.	Rank.
Mr. G. B. Williams	M. Inst. C. E. ; M. I. Mech. E. ; Fellow, Royal Sanitary Institute ; Fellow, Royal Geographical Society ; Fellow, Institute of Sanitary Engineers ; 30 years' experience of Sanitary Engineering ; late Consulting Sanitary Engineer to the Crown Agents for the Colonies.	Chief Engineer, Public Health Department.

Name.	Qualifications.	Rank.
Mr. F. C. Griffin ...	A.M.I.C.E.; 18 years' experience of Sanitary Engineering.	Executive Engineer, Western Division (on leave).
Capt. A. Webster ...	Gold Medalist, Sanitary Engineering, Dundee Technical School. Sanitary Engineering experience in England and three years in charge, Sanitary Engineering Works, Singapore. Lieutenant, Military Works Department, in charge Nowshera water supply scheme.	Officiating Executive Engineer, Western Division (on leave).
Mr. S. N. Ghosh ...	B.A. (Hons) (Cal.). Passed I.E (Cal.). B.Sc. Eng. (Glasgow). Gold Medalist in Mathematics from Hooghly College in B.A Examination First prize in Electrical Engineering from Glasgow University A.M.I.C.E (Lond.). Member, Royal Sanitary Institute. First class certificate in Sanitary Engineering from Royal Technical Institute, Glasgow. Member, Asiatic Society, Bengal. Eight years' experience in roads, buildings and Sanitary Engineering.	Executive Engineer, Presidency Division.
Capt W. J. Berry ...	M.B.E. Professional Associate of Surveyors' Institution Member, Royal Sanitary Institute. Four years' experience of water supply, sanitation and construction work in England as Agent for the Hilmanton Estate of the Rt Hon Lord Islington. Mobilised August, 1914 Served as Garrison Engineer in Military Works Department from May, 1916, to September, 1919. Had charge of large construction works in Imperial Delhi, Bombay and Deolali. Held rank of Captain on release from service	Executive Engineer, Eastern Division
Mr. K. C Banerjea ...	Passed upper subordinate, Sibpur College, 1903, Engineer, in charge, Government Printing Works; engaged on Eastern Bengal Railway; 16 years in Engineering Department of Sanitary Engineer, Bengal (now Chief Engineer, Public Health Department) Promoted from Temporary Surveyor to Sub-Engineer and afterwards appointed Assistant Engineer in charge, Dacca Division.	Assistant Engineer in charge of Dacca Division

Sealdah Police Court.

256. Mr SHAIKH MAHBOOB ALEY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) when the Sealdah Police Court was first established;

(*ii*) in what proportion the number of cases has increased since the establishment?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware—

(*i*) that there is not enough accommodation for parties and witnesses in the Court building;

(*ii*) that a large number of people have to keep standing on the stairs and outside in the sun;

(*iii*) that the building becomes very dirty and insanitary owing to the above circumstances;

(*iv*) that there are not a sufficient number of suitable rooms for honorary magistrates to hold their courts; and

(*v*) that some of the rooms where honorary magistrates have to hold courts, are in a bad condition and the furniture is dilapidated?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) (*i*) About 1862. The exact date cannot be given, but the first report from the Court is dated the 3rd June, 1862.

(*ii*) The figures for 1862 not being available, this question cannot be answered. But there has been an increase in the number of cases since 1862.

(*b*) (*i*), (*ii*) and (*iii*) At times there is overcrowding, especially after holidays, when the number of drunk and disorderly cases is large: at such times the stairs are crowded and people may for a short time be unable to gain admission. The natural result is a certain amount of dirt and uncleanliness.

(*iv*) This only occurs when honorary magistrates sit on special days and not according to the roster. Ordinarily there is a sufficient number of rooms.

(*v*) The rooms are small but not in a specially bad condition. The furniture is ordinary office furniture and was thoroughly repaired and overhauled in March, 1920.

"Phuka" on milch-cows.

* **257. Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY:** (*a*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department been drawn to the dearth of pure cow's milk in Calcutta due chiefly to the practice of *phuka* on milch-cows?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the cows on which *phuka* is practised are sold to butchers to be slaughtered?

(*c*) What are the laws now in force for the prohibition of the practice of *phuka*?

(*d*) Which is the agency which enforces the said laws?

(*e*) What was the number of *phuka* prosecutions last year, and with what results?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Government are aware that scarcity of good cow's milk is attributed partly to the practice in question.

(*b*) Government have no information.

(*c*) The member is referred to the answer given to unstarred question No. 4 (*c*) (*v*) on the 7th February last.

(*d*) The police and the Calcutta Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals.

(*e*) There were no prosecutions last year.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: I should like to know whether the Government will be pleased to ask further information from the authorities concerned.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: I am willing to do so in order to ascertain new facts.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: Sir, I am surprised to find that the Government statement says that there were no prosecutions last year.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: That is an argument not a supplementary question.

Drinking water on passenger steamers.

258. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Marine Department aware that on inland passenger steamers in Eastern Bengal drinking water is kept in small quantities only on the first class deck, where other classes of passengers have no access, and that the latter have to depend for drinking water on an unfiltered supply drawn by them from the river?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the pumps on many steamers are located just behind the third class latrines?

(*c*) Is it a fact that the reservoirs are seldom, if ever, filled with water?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of asking the steamer companies to arrange that a regular supply of water for drinking purpose be kept on board all passenger steamers?

(*e*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that on most steamers one of the two pumps is kept unavailable for use by passengers, by detachment of some necessary part, and that the other is mainly used by the crew, and that passengers find much difficulty in procuring water when needed?

(*f*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that at intermediate stations a narrow plank without railings is lowered down for the embarkation

and disembarkation of passengers and that women, children and old people experience difficulty in passing over it?

(*g*) Are the Government considering the desirability of laying down a minimum breadth for these planks and of directing that the same be provided with railings on both sides?

(*h*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that on passenger steamers the arrangement for latrines is such that four to six seats are provided in a single compartment?

(*i*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that a single compartment with six seats is never used except by one person at a time owing to feelings of delicacy?

(*j*) Are the Government considering the desirability of asking the steamer companies to construct several latrines with only one seat in each compartment?

MEMBER in charge of MARINE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): (*a*) All vessels belonging to the Joint Steamer Companies are provided with drinking water for all classes of passengers. In most of the larger vessels a separate pump connects with fresh-water tanks in the holds and a second pump connects direct with the river for washing purposes. In small feeder steamers fresh-water tanks are on deck and only one pump for washing purposes is provided.

Where a supply of filtered water is not procurable, drinking water tanks are generally filled by the engine room donkey-engine from the best river water obtainable, to which a supply of alum is added.

(*b*) If this question refers to drinking-water pumps, the reply is in the negative.

(*c*) It is not a fact that the fresh-water tanks are seldom, if ever, filled with water.

(*d*) The Joint Steamer Companies state that a regular supply of drinking water is kept on board all passenger steamers.

(*e*) No. The Joint Steamer Companies state that occasionally pumps get out of order, but they are attended to as soon as possible. They have very hard wear, and if they get out of order it is often the custom to dismantle the plunger rod, but immediate attention is given.

(*f*) At small stations a single plank is often used, but hand rails are held by lascars for the safety and convenience of passengers. This practice has been in force for many years and the Joint Steamer Companies state that it has proved to be safe and suited to the conditions obtaining. To rig full stages at small stations would greatly delay steamers and consequently single planks 12 inches broad are provided.

(*g*) Government do not consider that it is necessary to impose these restrictions.

(*h*) Latrines vary in numbers according to capacity of steamers. Two to six seats are provided according to requirements. There is a partition between each seat.

(*i*) No objection to the type of latrine in use has been raised. Among certain classes only one person uses the latrine at a time.

(*j*) No.

Expenditure incurred by Government in defence of cases.

259. Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that after the Meredith case (in which a bailiff of the Calcutta Small Cause Court was defended by Government at a heavy cost) instructions were issued by the then Member in charge of the Judicial Department to the Legal Remembrancer that in all cases involving extraordinary expenditure the matter should be placed before the Member in charge before incurring any expenditure or instructions of a like nature?

(*b*) If the instructions were not as stated, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what instructions, if any, were issued by the Member in charge of the Judicial Department to the Legal Remembrancer in the above case?

(*c*) Were the instructions, if any, observed in the case of Sub-Inspector Dwijendra Chandra Ghose *versus* the Editor of the *Bangabasi*?

(*d*) If not, why not?

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): (*a*) The answer is in the negative.

(*b*) No instructions were issued to the Legal Remembrancer.

(*c*) and (*d*) The questions do not arise.

Pay of the European Officers of the Imperial Police.

260. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state the number of appointments in the rank of Deputy Inspector-General of Police before the partition in 1905, when Bengal, Bihar and Orissa were united, and the districts administered by each of them; and the number since added to the cadre, and the districts now administered by each, and the dates on which each appointment was sanctioned?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reasons for the creation of these appointments?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the amount annually spent for their pay and allowance and establishment charges separately?

(*d*) Is it a fact that the Inspector-General of Police has a Second Assistant? When was this post created? Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to give reasons for the creation of this post after the separation of Bihar and Orissa from Bengal?

(*e*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the present strength of the cadre of Superintendents of Police in Bengal? When was the cadre first fixed, and for what number, and when was the post of Additional Superintendent of Police created, and how many are now holding that situation in Bengal?

(*f*) How many of the posts of Superintendents and Additional Superintendents of Police are at present substantively held by Indians, and under what principle are promotions to these appointments made from among promoted and directly appointed Deputy Superintendent?

(*g*) What is the present percentage of Indians holding these appointments to the total strength of the cadre? What percentage was recommended by the Public Services Commission to be reserved for Indians; and what steps have been taken by Government to give effect to these recommendations? Has the formula of recruitment and promotion which was found to be defective by that Commission, been changed? If not, why not?

(*h*) Is it a fact that the European Officers of the Imperial Police submitted representations to the Secretary of State regarding further increase in their pay, and is it a fact that their pay has since been further increased? If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table a copy of their representation to the Secretary of State and the orders of the latter thereon and to state how the order, if given effect to, will affect the Indian Officers?

(*i*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether a supplementary budget will be placed before the Council for meeting the increase of pay of the Imperial Service? If not, from what source will the additional expenditure be provided?

(*j*) Have the Government considered the desirability of postponing giving immediate effect to the increment sanctioned for the Imperial Service on account of the financial stringency?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) A statement showing the districts administered by each Deputy Inspector-General in Bengal (including Bihar and Orissa) in 1905, and the districts now administered by each Deputy Inspector-General in Bengal is laid on the library table.

Four posts of Deputy Inspector-General were sanctioned on the reconstitution of the Presidency in 1912, three additional posts have been sanctioned since—one in 1913, one in 1915 and one in 1917. One is a temporary post.

(*b*) The appointments were created in order to secure more efficient supervision of police work in the province.

(*c*) A statement giving the information is laid on the library table.

(*d*) Yes. The post was created in 1915, to meet the demands of increased work at headquarters.

(*e*) The present strength of the cadre of Superintendents is including 6 temporary appointments. The cadre was originally fix at 44 on the constitution of the Presidency in 1912. The posts of Ad tional Superintendents were first created in 1908 in Eastern Ben and Assam, and 13 officers are at present holding such posts in Bengal.

(*f*) Three appointments are held by Indian officers substantive and three substantively *pro tempore*. These appointments are ma by selection from among both promoted and directly recruited Depu Superintendents.

(*g*) The present percentage of Indians on the cadre of Superinte dents is 10.

The Secretary of State has passed orders after consideration of t recommendations of the Public Services Commission, fixing a defin percentage (33 per cent.) of appointments to be made from India, which effect will now be given.

(*h*) Yes. Copies of the memorial and of the order fixing t revised rates of pay for the Indian Police are laid on the library tab Indian Officers will be entitled to the benefit of these rates. The Indian officers who were in the service on the 30th April 1924, will eligible for overseas pay.

(*i*) The matter is under consideration.

(*j*) No.

Deputy Inspectors-General and Second Assistant to the Inspecto General of Police.

261. Babu HEM CHANDRA NASKER: (*a*) Will the Hon'b the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased state the number of appointments in the rank of Deputy Inspecto General of Police before the partition in 1905 when Bengal, Bihar ar Orissa were united, and the districts administered by them each, ar the number since added to the cadre and the districts now administere by each, and the dates on which each appointment was sanctioned t gether with the reasons for the creation of these appointments?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the amour annually spent for their pay and allowance and establishment charge (separately)?

(*c*) Is it a fact that the Inspector-General of Police has a secon Assistant?

(*d*) When was this post created?

(*e*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reasons fo the creation of this post after the separation of Bihar and Orissa fron Bengal?

(*f*) Is it a fact that the post of a Vice-Principal has been created for the Sardah Police Training College?

(*g*) When was this post created, and will the Government be pleased to give reasons for the creation of this post?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) to (*e*) The member is referred to the answers given to question No. 260.

(*f*) and (*g*) A post of Assistant Principal (to be filled by a Superintendent of Police) was created in February, 1921, to assist the Principal, mainly in connection with the practical part of the training of officers.

Demands for grants.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN moved "that a sum of Rs. 200 be transferred from '5.—Land Revenue—Management of Government Estates—Outlay on Improvements' to '32.—Medical' on account of annual contribution to the Ramnagar dispensary in the Contai subdivision in the district of Midnapore."

The note from the Revenue Department explains the necessity of this transfer which has been made at the recommendation of the Board of Revenue and is for a dispensary. I trust that this will be granted by the Council.

The motion was put and agreed to.

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR moved "that a sum of Rs. 31,51,000 be transferred from '5.—Land Revenue—Charges of District Administration—General and Subdivisional Establishments' to '22.—General Administration' in view of the decision of the Government of India that the expenditure of the district officers and their establishment now divided between the heads '5.—Land Revenue' and '24.—Administration of Justice' should be recorded entirely under '22.—General Administration.'"

This is purely a formal matter. Hitherto there has been a somewhat complicated arrangement regarding the allocation of the cost of District Officers and their establishment between the heads "Land Revenue" and "Administration of Justice." The Government of India have now decided that all charges in connection with the District Officers will be debited to a new head "22.—General Administration."

The motion was put and agreed to.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM moved "that a sum of Rs. 1,000 be transferred from '24.—Administration of Justice—High Court' to '41.—Civil Works—Public Works Department' for the construction of a vacuum cleaner for the record room of the High Court."

The motion was put and agreed to.

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR moved "that a sum of Rs. 27,35,000 be transferred from '24.—Administration of Justice—Criminal Courts—General and Subdivisional Establishments' to '22.—General Administration' in view of the decision of the Government of India that the expenditure of the district officers and their establishment now divided between the heads '5.—Land Revenue' and '24.—Administration of Justice' should be recorded entirely under '22.—General Administration.'"

This is supplementary to the resolution which I have just now moved.

The motion was put and agreed to.

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler) moved "that the sum of Rs. 31,000 under '29.—Political—Miscellaneous' be transferred to '22.—General Administration—Civil Secretariat' owing to the decision of the audit officers that this charge should not appear under the head '29.—Political.'"

This is a matter of accounts classification. The provision, as explained to the Council in a memorandum which has been circulated, has reference to the establishment of shorthand writers which is employed for the reporting of public speeches both in English and in the Vernacular. This has hitherto been shown under the head "Political," and it has been ruled by the Accounts authority that it should more appropriately be shown under "General Administration—Civil Secretariat."

The motion was put and agreed to.

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of AGRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur) moved "that a sum of Rs. 15,767 be transferred from the provision of Rs. 1,02,000 under '35.—Industries—Director of Industries—Miscellaneous—Mining Instructions in coal-fields' to '41.—Civil Works—Public Works Department' for the construction of the following:—

(a) Construction of a mining lecture hall for mining classes at Raniganj	6,967
(b) Construction of quarters for the Indian assistant attached to the mining lecture hall at Raniganj ...	8,800"

In doing so I wish to make it clear that I am not asking the Council for any additional grant.

The money has already been voted by the Council and is included in the sum of Rs. 1,02,000 which they have granted under the head "35.—Industries for Mining Instructions in coal-fields." As the works will be carried out through the agency of the Public Works Department it is necessary to transfer the money to the budget of that Department.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER moved "that a sum of Rs. 20,400 out of Rs. 25,000 under '47.—Miscellaneous—Miscellaneous unforeseen charges' be transferred to the heads noted below on account of the following items:—

22.—General Administration—

	Rs.
(a) For printing of electoral rolls in Birbhum ...	51
(b) For grant of honorarium to the ministerial staff of the 24-Parganas district	960
(c) For grant to the Calcutta Corporation on account of expenditure incurred by it in connection with elections	10,853
(d) For grant to the Dacca Municipality for expenditure incurred by it on account of elections	25
(e) For grant of honorarium to the election roll officer of the Calcutta Corporation in connection with a bye-election	50
(f) For expenditure in connection with the bye-election of the Burdwan constituency	1,500
(g) For printing of electoral rolls in Noakhali district ...	956
(h) For erection of polling enclosures in Barrackpore subdivision	790
(i) For expenditure in connection with bye-elections that may occur	5,185
	20,370

24.—Administration of Justice—

(j) Grant of honorarium to the stenographer of the District Judge of Hooghly	30
	20,400

These various items are, on the face of them, connected with the recent Council elections and the bye-elections which have been held in consequence of certain vacancies. The items explain themselves. They cover expenditure incurred for the holding of election. The largest item was incurred on account of elections in Calcutta. A lump provision, in anticipation of charges of this kind, was made under the head "Miscellaneous" and all that I propose now is to transfer it to the proper heads.

The motion was put and agreed to.

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR moved "that a sum of Rs. 2,93,500 be transferred from the head "47.—Miscellaneous—Miscellaneous and

unforeseen charges" to the heads noted below to meet charges on account of contract contingencies: —

		Rs.
7.—Stamps	...	1,000.
9.—Registration	...	1,000
22.—General Administration	...	68,500
24.—Administration of Justice	...	10,000
26.—Police	...	1,00,000
32.—Medical	...	1,10,000
34.—Agriculture	...	2,000
41.—Civil Works—Civil	...	1,000
		2,93,500."

As I explained to the Council in course of the Budget debate the contract contingent grants for the various offices were fixed in 1917. Since then the prices of all miscellaneous articles, stationery, postage and telegrams and so on have gone up very considerably and the District officers and others are no longer able to keep within the allotment which was made in 1917. We accordingly made a lump provision of Rs. 3,00,000 in the budget which was passed by the Council and we now ask the Council to approve of the distribution of that lump sum under various heads as shown in the memorandum which has been circulated.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY moved "that the demand for transfer of Rs. 1,00,000 from the head '47.—Miscellaneous—Miscellaneous and unforeseen charges' to the head '26.—Police' to meet charges on account of contract contingencies, be refused.

The other day we passed a supplementary budget grant for this very Police department and now we are confronted with an extra supplementary budget demand. Perhaps, by next November, we shall meet with another additional extra supplementary Police demand, and so, at every sitting of the Council, this nation-preserving department will continue its demand.

Sir, under what conditions can a supplementary budget grant be demanded? If we turn to rule 94 of the Council Rules and Standing Orders, we will find that an estimate for supplementary grant can only be presented to the Council, when the amount voted in the annual Budget is found to be insufficient for the purposes of the current year. Now, has this been found insufficient? In the Budget we have already granted Rs. 7,29,912 to the Police department alone for contract contingencies. Has the whole amount or such a large slice of it been already

spent during the last five months that the Government now finds itself in an impossible position? And will this additional Rs. 1,00,000 tide it over the remaining seven months? No, Sir, it cannot yet have been found so, for it is impossible for the whole amount to have been already spent within such a short time.

In the Police department there are less number of items which fall under the head "contract contingencies," than in any other department. Items which in other departments come under "contract contingencies": *e.g.*, petty constructions purchase of tents, purchase of clothing, etc., are, in the Police department, fully provided for elsewhere and do not come under "contract contingencies." Cost of photographs, country stationery, hire of boats and elephants, service postage stamps, repairs to accoutrements, lighting charge of police stations and some other minor things fall under this head in the Police department.

In paragraph 8 of Government resolution No. 3597 F. of 1894, which is still in force, it was strictly enjoined that unless a very strong case was made out and unless re-appropriation from other grants be found impossible, no application for an additional grant under the head "contract contingencies" would be entertained and that all disbursing officers must so arrange their expenditure as to avoid the necessity for such applications. This has also been repeated in Government circular No. 11 F. of 1900 and again in No. 375-FF. of 1907. In the latter the Government resolution runs as follows:—

> The Lieutenant-Governor wishes it to be clearly understood that no application for an extra grant will be entertained in future unless it can be shown that the charges for which the grant is required, were abnormal and beyond the disbursing officer's control and could not have been postponed or met by more prudent arrangement.

Sir, the allotments of "contract contingencies" are based on the actuals of the past four years after eliminating all abnormal charges and making due allowance for the expansion of growing departments. The present allotment for contract contingencies, which was made only in 1917, when war conditions were prevailing and prices were very high, was Rs. 7,35,116. It was the maximum fixed after due consideration of the preceding last four years' expenses and was not to be ordinarily exceeded. But what do we find? The Financial Secretary has circulated a note to us showing that even in 1918-19, the actuals of Police contract contingencies amounted to Rs. 8,68,007, in 1919-20 Rs. 9,26,722, and in 1920-21 Rs. 9,12,965 and the average of last three years Rs. 9,02,561. Thus it is patent that although a sanctioned allotment was fixed for five years in 1917, it was fixed only nominally to be exceeded the very next year. Sir, the sanctioned allotment for five years from 1907 to 1912 for the Police department was Rs. 3,08,000 and now it is Rs. 7,35,116. And, Sir, if we compare the ratio of increase and the excess of the average of the last three years over the present sanctioned

allotment of the contract contingencies of other departments, the contrast would be still more striking. Sir, the Secretary in his note has stated that this additional Rs. 1,00,000 is necessary for the increased rates of postage and telegraph charges. But were these rates high too during the last three years? No, but the present sanctioned allotment had all along been exceeded. And the root-cause is that even against the spirit of the letter of the Government resolutions, the disbursing officers exercised no control and they in their turn are not controlled by their superiors. It is this want of control over the finances which is the bane of this Police department that I most object to. Sir, superintendence is mostly confined to the maintenance of a superficial discipline, ability to stand erect, to march steps and to salute with the proper jerk and angular precision and we have got a host of officers enjoying fat emoluments therefor.

Sir, a retrenchment Committee is sitting at present to see if any retrenchments are possible. Cannot the Hon'ble the Hon'ble Member wait a few months to see whether means could be found to do without this extra grant? The demand already granted would surely be enough at least for these few months.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: I venture to think that the Kumar is carrying his inveterate feud against Police expenditure, of which he has so often made himself the champion in this Council in recent months, to extremes which are almost verging on the ridiculous. We have here a grant which covers some fifteen departments, the general nature of the proposal being to transfer certain additional sums in respect of these departments to the contract contingency grant of each from the lump provisions specifically made for that purpose in the budget. The reason for this transfer is common to all these fifteen departments, namely, the fact that these contract grants were settled in 1917, since when the cost of labour and of such things as postage and telegraph charges and other heads of expenditure, which are common to all departments, has gone up to a marked extent. That argument is common to all these 15 departments. The Kumar is perfectly willing to swallow that argument in the case of fourteen departments, but it sticks in his gorge when he comes to the Police department. Is the department of Police in this respect in any way different from the other fourteen in which the same causes are operative? The Kumar has not advanced any single argument as to why the same causes should not be operative in the case of the Police department, except his general indictment, of which I am beginning to get tired, that the superior police officers do not exercise supervision of any kind whatsoever, and his doubtful statement that contract contingencies in the Police department cover less heads than in any other. I know not upon what information his statement is based. The heads of contract contingencies in the Police department—if he wishes to have the details—are the cost

of photographs, repair of boats, country stationery, printing at private presses, temporary boat establishment, country medicine, cost of repairs to steamers and schooners, petty repairs, pay of menials, hot and cold weather charges, tour charges, repairs to tents, purchase and repair of furniture, service postage charges and service telegrams, office expenses, repair of arms and accoutrements, lighting charges of police-stations, miscellaneous, hire of launches, boats, elephants, horses and mules, cost of coal and fuel for launches, cost of cadastral maps maintenance of motor lorries and police investigation. So the list is quite a lengthy one, and I doubt much if it is any less than similar lists in the case of other departments, while, more probably, it is longer.

Now, one of the reasons that we had to ask for this grant in the case of the Police is our action in the past in cutting Police expenditure too low—down to a point below which the department could not be carried on. If the Council will look at the figures, they will see that the budget provision for Police expenditure has been fixed at a very low figure. I am myself responsible for so fixing it. But I so fixed it in pursuance of our constant desire to reduce Police expenditure as much as possible. If the Council will look at the figures, they will see that against the three years' average of Rs. 9,02,561, the budget provision is only for Rs. 7,29,000, and I put it to the Council whether the conditions of this year are in any way different from those of the three years on which the average is based. It is surely not unreasonable to ask for a sum which is even less than the average standard. Further, I cannot assure the Council that we may not have to come up later and ask for more. The Inspector-General of Police says that we shall have to do so, and he writes as follows:—

> Districts are already complaining of the inadequacy of the grants given to them. There has been an all-round increase in the prices of articles, building materials, cost of labour, rates of postage, rates of railway freights and fare, etc., which necessitates an increased expenditure under almost all sub-heads of contract contingencies, e.g., repairs to departmental buildings, repairs to launches and boats, country stationery and medicines, oil for police stations, pay of menials, cost of coal, etc. Besides this owing to the introduction of revised postal rates the expenditure under the head "postage and telegram charges" has been very heavy. Some of the districts have reported that they will be unable to carry on unless substantial extra grants are given to them. Proposals have been received from certain districts for the purchase and renewal of hospital equipment, furniture, clothing, bedding and utensils, but they have been kept pending for want of funds thus causing great inconvenience to patients. A large sum will be required to equip the new Police hospital at Howrah, which is expected to be completed this year, and for diet and travelling allowance of *chaukidars* for guarding railway lines on the occasion of the proposed visit of His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales to Bengal.

I submit, Sir, that this is a simple and straightforward argument, fully justifying the demand which we now make, and, moreover an argument which in every other case the mover of this amendment is perfectly willing to accept as valid.

The amendment was put and lost.

The original motion of the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr was put and carried.

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur moved "that a sum of Rs. 4,661 be transferred from the head '41.—Civil Works—Public Works Department—Repairs' to '22.—General Administration' for repairs to furniture of the Barrackpore Circuit House."

The sum of Rs. 4,661 for repairs to furniture in Barrackpore House was originally shown under "41.—Civil Works" in the Budget, as Barrackpore House was not then declared as a Circuit House. The charges for the maintenance of furniture of Circuit House cannot be debited to "41.—Civil Works," but as the amount required for Barrackpore has already been included under that head it is now proposed to transfer it to "22.—General Administration" to which it is properly debitable.

The motion was put and agreed to.

Resolutions

(under the rules for the discussion of matters of general public interest).

The PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): I think I ought to inform the members that His Excellency the Governor has declined to give any extension of time for the session. The discussion of the resolutions relating to the ministerial officers will now be resumed.

Salaries of Ministerial Officers.

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: As there were comparatively few members present when I began my speech on the Ministerial officers Committee's report last night, I may, perhaps, be allowed to recapitulate very briefly what I then said in regard to the general principles on which we are dealing with the subject. I then explained that as the cost of the scheme, whatever principles we might adopt, would certainly exceed Rs. 15 lakhs, the scheme would require the sanction of the Secretary of State and that under the instructions of the Secretary of State we were debarred from putting our own proposals before the Council or asking the Council for a vote until the Secretary of State had had an opportunity of examining the matter. I said, however, that there was no bar to the Council expressing its views on the subject and that we had arranged for this debate to take place in order to give the Council that opportunity.

Then, I said that there were certain general considerations which might well be taken into account by the Council before it gave its vote

on the various proposals which have been put before it. The most important of these is the standard of enhancement which is to be adopted and I showed that on the whole our safest standard would be an increase of pay based on the figures of the Director-General of Statistics. I showed that his latest returns indicated an increase of prices in India over pre-war rates of 66 per cent. and that there was every likelihood that there would be a fall in that rate within a reasonable period of time. I therefore suggested that as a general guide it would be sufficient to take the Committee's standard in preference to that of the Rai Bahadur which allows a general increase of pay of about 100 per cent.

I showed that the cost of the various schemes would be as follows: the scheme in the majority report will cost about 31 lakhs over the pre-war rates; the scheme of the Rai Bahadur will cost about Rs. 48 lakhs; and if we add to the Rai Bahadur's scheme the various proposals which have been made in these resolutions, we estimate that it would come roughly to another Rs. 10 or 12 lakhs, that is to say, about 60 or 65 lakhs over pre-war rates. Of course, it is difficult to form an accurate estimate about the cost of these schemes in the resolutions as some of them overlap one another and some appear to be contradictory. Then, I said that I did not think that the Council was qualified to go into all the details regarding the different posts which have been raised in some of the resolutions. The House of Commons would certainly not undertake work of that kind, nor would any deliberative body in the civilised world, as far as I am aware, undertake the examination of detailed proposals about such persons as Registration muharrirs and Civil Surgeons' Clerks. I then said that as an illustration of the different points involved, I proposed to go briefly through the proposals in resolution No. 23 and that was the point that I reached when the time came for the adjournment last night.

The first proposal in resolution No. 23, is an important one, because it relates to the initial pay of the ministerial officers in the lower grades in the mufassal courts and offices. The discussions on this point showed that the various speakers had failed to notice the very important principles laid down by the Committee in paragraph 9 of their report regarding the standard value of time-scales. It is, of course, a fact that both for existing incumbents and for new recruits the substitution of a time-scale for a graded system is in itself a great advantage. Under the graded system a man may be stuck in one grade for several years and in the smaller offices, where promotion is bad, a man may stop seven years or even longer in a grade: whereas under the time-scale he goes up steadily with annual or biennial increments, and that factor alone is an enormous advantage to the incumbents on a time-scale as compared with the same man or his predecessor on the graded system. At the same time, of course, it increases very greatly the cost. I will now explain to the Council how these various proposals work out on

the standard values of the time-scale proposed by the Committee and those proposed in these resolutions. Now, taking the ministerial officers of the lower grades, the existing pay is Rs. 25 rising to Rs. 50 in various grades. The Committee propose a time-scale of Rs. 40—80, by increments of Rs. 2. The average of this scale is Rs. 60 and the average of the present scale is Rs. 33; so the average improvement provided for by the committee is very nearly 100 per cent. Allowing, however, for past service to count, the value of the increase to existing incumbents is very much greater. Mr. Roy, who is one of the authors of the report and is now Collector of Bankura, reports that the effect of the application of the Committee's scale to his office will be an immediate increase ranging from 60 to 90 per cent., and even as much as 100 per cent. in the case of individuals. Mr. Roy is apparently shocked to find that his proposals have become so expensive and I must say that I am surprised to find it also. Now, the average of the scale proposed in the resolution is Rs. 76, that is to say, Rs. 16 in excess of the Committee's scale and no less than Rs. 43 above the present scale; and the average increase works out at 137 per cent. and the actual increase in individual cases would of course be much higher for the reasons I have just given. I suggest that an increase of 137 per cent. to the lower grade ministerial officers is altogether more than we can afford. These people are extremely numerous and it may interest the Council to know the actual figures of the total cost. The Committee's proposals would cost about Rs. 47,000 a month or about half a lakh, or Rs. 6 lakhs annually. The extra cost of the proposals in Maulvi Emaduddin Ahmed's resolution would be Rs. 98,000 or very nearly a lakh a month, that is to say, Rs. 12 lakhs a year over the present cost; in other words the extra expenditure is double or rather more than double that of the majority report of the Committee. I do not think that we can afford an extra Rs. 6 lakhs for the ministerial officers in the lower grades in the mufassal. At present, as I have said, they begin on Rs. 25 and we propose to give them Rs. 40 and after they have passed the period of probation they will go up steadily with annual increments; so a young man of twenty or twenty-two years of age will begin to draw Rs. 40 and go up steadily to the top of the grade at Rs. 80. I ask the Council to consider whether this is not sufficient to meet the needs of the ministerial officers of the lower grades especially having regard to the present state of the financial resources of the province.

The next proposal deals with the upper division. The present pay of the upper division is Rs. 60—125 and the average of this scale is Rs. 75. The Committee proposed that this should be raised to Rs. 80—140; the average value of which is Rs. 115, or an increase of 54 per cent. The average of the proposals in the resolution is Rs. 142 or 90 per cent. increase and it would certainly exceed 100 per cent. if we applied it to individuals. The present cost is Rs. 28,000,

the Committee's proposal will cost Rs. 43,000, the Rai Bahadur's scheme will cost Rs. 50,000 and the cost of the scheme in the resolution will be Rs. 53,000, or about Rs. 10,000 or Rs. 12,000 more than the cost of the Committee's scheme; or well over Rs. 1,00,000 a year for the upper division alone.

Then, we come to the case of the sheristadars of Munsifs's courts. Their present pay is Rs. 60 in Eastern Bengal, and Rs. 70 in Western Bengal; the Committee proposed that they should be put on a scale of Rs. 80—100, an increase of 50 per cent. The scale proposed in the resolution is Rs. 120—150; the average cost of the proposal will be Rs. 142 as compared with Rs. 93, which is the average of the Committee's proposal. The proposal in the resolution will cost Rs. 33,000 against Rs. 22,000 under the Committee's proposal, that is, an increase of Rs. 11,000 a month, or above Rs. 1,00,000 a year; so taking the first three proposals that have already been dealt with, they give us an increase of about Rs. 8 to Rs. 9 lakhs straightaway over the Committee's proposals and that is a very large sum indeed.

The fourth proposal is regarding the limitation of immediate increases of pay to 50 per cent. Government is prepared to accept this resolution as we find that the limitation works unevenly and is causing considerable trouble and dissatisfaction in other services. This limitation of increment is a comparatively recent innovation which has been introduced by the Government of India in certain recent re-organisations. We propose to recommend that we should not be bound by this limiting consideration in raising the pay of the ministerial officers. The final decision, however, as I have said, will rest with the Government of India and the Secretary of State, and I cannot say what view they will take of our proposal.

Then, the fifth proposal relates to the head clerks and translators in Judges' offices. There are 11 of these officers, 5 of whom are on Rs. 125 and 6 on Rs. 100. The average pay is Rs. 111. The proposal of the Committee is to increase their pay so as to give them an average of Rs. 163; so the Committee have gone beyond their standard percentage in fixing the pay of these posts. The average proposed in the resolution would be Rs. 212 or nearly 100 per cent. over the existing pay. There are only a few of these officers, but I suggest that the increment proposed in these resolutions is excessive.

Then, there is the case of the head clerks in Civil Surgeons' offices. The proposal in the resolution recommends that these people should be placed on the same footing as the ministerial officers of the upper division. The Civil Surgeons' offices are very small, some of them have three clerks and some have only two. The work is entirely of a routine nature and does not call for anything like the skill required in upper division posts in district offices. The present average pay of the head

clerks in Civil Surgeons' offices is Rs. 40. The proposal of the Committee will raise the average to Rs. 75; the Committee were apparently conscious that their proposal in this respect might be considered extravagant, but they thought that head clerks should be allowed to draw Rs. 75 which gives an increase of nearly 100 per cent. The proposal in the resolution would give them an increase of 250 per cent. on existing rates; here, again, I submit that there is no need to go so far as that.

Before I conclude, I should like to say a few words regarding the important resolution of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta. He proposes to accept the minority report subject to certain additions. I have had an opportunity of going through the matter with him just before this Council meeting and I think we are pretty well agreed on the figures as to what the cost of his proposals is. I do not think I need go into details. The net result is that if Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta's proposal is accepted regarding the specific posts mentioned in his resolution, the cost will be about Rs. 5 lakhs over the Rai Bahadur's report and about Rs. 14 lakhs over the majority report.

The most important point here again is as regards the lower division clerks in the mufassal. These people are numerous. The majority report will give them an increase of Rs. 1,19,000 and the minority report Rs. 1,42,000 and the resolution gives them an increase of Rs. 1,57,000 or Rs. 15,000 over the minority report. Similarly, on the judicial side we get very much the same proportion. So in the lower division alone the proposal of Babu Indu Bhusan Dutta will cost about Rs. 3½ lakhs more than any of the others.

I do not think I need take up the time of the Council by going into further details; if any member wants to have any further information I shall be glad to give it. What I have said, I think, sufficiently illustrates my point that this Council is not a very suitable body for deciding on the pay of individual posts. What it can do fairly is to make up its mind as to the general principles which should be adopted in the revision of the pay. I suggest that we must be guided in our conclusions by what it is reasonable to grant to these deserving officers in order to enable them to meet the rise in the cost of living. A good deal has been said in this debate about invidious distinctions made in the proposals of the Committee, and certainly there are cases in which the Committee's proposals will have to be scrutinised very carefully. But I say that the Committee's report as a whole provides sufficiently for the increased cost of living, particularly as there is a reasonable hope that the cost of living will fall at no distant date. If unhappily this hope is not fulfilled, there is nothing to prevent our reconsidering the scale of pay of ministerial officers at a later date, but I submit that for the present, the Committee's proposals may be taken as a general guide for the purpose of determining what should be given to these

people in view of the increased cost of living. Then we cannot in our present financial position disregard the financial prospects of this Presidency. I submit that some of these resolutions go considerably beyond what is reasonably necessary and considerably beyond what we can reasonably pay in our present financial position. I would ask the Council to consider all these factors before coming to a decision. I should explain that Government have no scheme ready of their own, and as we have no scheme to put before the Council, we do not propose that the officials should take any part in any division that may be called for in connection with these resolutions. A record of this debate and the decision of the Council will, therefore, be submitted to the Secretary of State as representing the unfettered conclusions of the non-official members of this Council, and I urge the Council in view of these considerations to be cautious as to the decisions it comes to. The whole scheme will be scrutinised by the Government of India and in the India Office, and they will compare it with the proposals which have recently been sanctioned or which are now being made for other provinces, and if the Government of India and the Secretary of State find that a pay of Rs. 350 a month has been proposed for certain posts in place of Rs. 100 for similar posts in other provinces, they will naturally be inclined to think that this is rather extravagant. I do not say that we are bound in any way by the decision of other provinces because the conditions may be quite different, but the India Office will naturally look with suspicion on rates of pay which greatly exceed those for similar posts in other provinces. Apart from these technical objections, the India Office will not fail to scrutinise the scheme in the light of the present financial position. We have, as the Council is well aware, been urging upon the Government of India and the Secretary of State for the last eight months that our financial resources are entirely inadequate to meet our requirements even if we utilise our resources in the most economical spirit. We have opponents in other provinces who will think that any benefits given to us will reflect unfavourably upon them and they will naturally scrutinise our demand for a financial re-settlement with the utmost jealousy and care. I say it would be most unfortunate if we gave these people a handle to suggest that we are extravagant in regard to the proposals we send up for the sanction of higher authorities. It is not my business to make any suggestion, as the matter is in its present stage left to the decision of the Council, but I should be inclined to ask the Council to consider whether in view of the facts it is—I say without any disrespect—qualified to deal with individual posts, ecpecially in view of the fact that we must be very careful of our financial reputation. I do feel inclined to suggest that these resolutions might be withdrawn and a general resolution might be substituted recognising the financial difficulties and asking the Secretary of State to consider the case of the ministerial officers in Bengal in as liberal a manner as it is possible for him to do.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: *The clerks are generally poorly paid officers and they should be given increment as early as* possible. Other services have already got sympathetic consideration from the hands of Government and it is only right and just that the clerks also should get similar treatment as early as possible. The Police, the Executive, the Judicial and all other officers have got increments in their pay, and if the ministerial officers are not given increment soon, they would be put to great hardship. Hope deferred maketh the heart sick, and the sooner they get relief the better.

With these few remarks, I beg to support the resolutions Nos. 23 to 38.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: I have much pleasure in supporting the resolution which has been moved by Babu Surendra Nath Ray on behalf of Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri. I know that the prices of food-grains and other necessaries of life have become very high, rather they have become prohibitive, and I know that these ministerial officers have been suffering much on this account, and I further know that their salaries are quite inadequate to meet their demands and, therefore, the sooner the necessary steps are taken for increasing their salaries the better for these clerks as well as for the public at large. But I find that some difficulty stands in the way and that difficulty has been admitted by Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur in his Note of Dissent where he has stated that—

> My greatest difficulty has been this, the financial position of the Government of Bengal is far from prosperous and the revision of the pay of the Ministerial Service has been taken up in a most unfortunate moment . . . I have taken some part in pressing upon Government the necessity of curtailing expenditure in all directions, to provide money for various urgent Reforms.

He has further stated in paragraph 6 of his Note of Dissent that—

> The increased cost involved in the recommendations of my colleagues is about Rs. 41¼ lakhs per annum.

So it appears that if we accept the Note of Dissent of Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur there will be an increase of cost of Rs. 19½ lakhs over that recommended by the Committee. We all know that there has been a deficit of Rs. 2½ crores and at the last session this Council recommended further grants for sanitation and technical education, and there is not the slightest doubt that the Government of Bengal will be pleased to make suitable grants for sanitation and for technical education as well as for primary education during the next year, and therefore I think there will be a deficit of Rs. 3 crores or more next year. The only way to meet this deficit is further taxation and it is with the greatest reluctance that we shall have to give way. We should certainly do justice to these ministerial officers but at the same time we should do justice to the general taxpayer. The resolution which has been moved by Babu Surendra Nath Ray and which has

been accepted by Government, is the wisest step that can be taken in the present circumstances. Let us recommend the suggestions made by the All-Bengal Ministerial Officers' Conference held at Bhowanipore the other day, and I hope and trust that these suggestions will be accepted by Government. As regards the other resolutions, I fail to understand how we can support them. We do not know the details—it will take a long time to go through them and come to a conclusion.

With these remarks, I beg to support the resolution moved by Babu Surendra Nath Ray and I hope and trust that Government will be pleased to consider the suggestions of the Ministerial Officers' Conference favourably and grant relief to the poor ministerial officers.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: In rising to commend Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta's resolution for the acceptance of this House, I am constrained to remark that it constitutes a third report without the advantage of a committee of inquiry. But this unfortunate impasse has been brought about by the natural perversity of Government in not looking for information where the best information is available and in refusing access to the accredited representatives of the ministerial officers when they endeavoured to give evidence before the Committee. The recommendations of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta embody to a large extent the recommendations of the ministerial officers themselves with certain modifications more or less. Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur's minority report is a good-natured, generous report, which has aimed only at increasing the pay of ministerial officers to an extent greater than that recommended by the majority report, and he has, in that report, perpetuated the invidious distinctions which have crept in the majority report. But the remarks of the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr as regards the enemies that beset us in all directions make cowards of us all. However, since we know that the resolutions that we shall send up are not peremptory and are not such that it is incumbent upon the Government to accept, considering that they will go up to the Secretary of State for India for comparison with other provinces, I think the amendment of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta can go without best benisons.

In this connection, I would like to call the attention of Government as well to the representation of the clerks of the Registration department. There is no doubt that the clerks of the Registration department are recruited from sources of less qualified people than the clerks in other departments. Nevertheless, as they have to live like clerks they undoubtedly deserve some consideration and Government, I hope, will be pleased to consider their recommendations at the same time as they consider the recommendations in the report of the Ministerial Officers' Conference. But I would personally like these recommendations to be coupled with certain riders if it were possible to do so. If we, the representatives of the public, desire that the ministerial officers

should have a competence such as would place them above temptation, we at the same time appeal to the ministerial officers that they will deal lightly with the public when chance and the position they occupy brings them into contact with the public. Do we not know many officers placed in advantageous positions, who abuse their powers beyond the needs of temptation, do we not know many ministerial officers who derive a competence very near to the competence derived by the Hon'ble Ministers of Bengal? At the same time I would request the Government to issue circulars to Government officials that in future they should no longer connive at this bribery which they no doubt condone under the general impression that the scale of pay hitherto allowed to the ministerial staff is admittedly insufficient to meet their wants.

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: This subject is of great importance to a large number of educated middle class people, from whose ranks the ministerial officers are generally recruited. Theirs is a case for belated justice. We have followed with very great interest, the lucid statement made by the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr, with regard to our financial position, and some of his counsels are really counsels of perfection; but it is a pity that these counsels of perfection were not taken into consideration by the Government here or by the Government at home, in giving large increases to the Imperial as well as to the Provincial services. Now, we have to look to economy and retrenchment, when we have to consider the cases of our ministerial officers. They should not be treated like ordinary labourers, although market-rates should always be taken into consideration. It is peculiar to our society, that they have a position to maintain and that is a matter which should have been taken into consideration by Government. Many persons have been hard hit by the extraordinary rise in the prices of the necessaries of life; but these officers come from a class, which of all the people has been most hard hit, and it is very extraordinary that the Government was satisfied only by giving them some temporary allowances. This question has been hanging fire for such a length of time, that this suggestion about loss of further time appears to us to be very ingenious. But it has been pointed out by the Hon'ble Member, that in this matter the sanction of the Government of India and the Secretary of State is necessary, and that means a lot of time. Then the formulation of a scheme by the Bengal Government will also take some time. It would have been much better if Government were in a position to give immediate relief to this hard-worked and useful class of public servants, and that would have avoided the necessity of many members of this House giving notices of their resolutions, and we would have been perfectly satisfied if this matter had not come before this House, and Government had dealt with it, to the satisfaction of the people concerned. But when this question has come before the House, it is up to us, to express our honest opinion as

to what should be done in regard to this useful class of people. Now we have been dismayed by the figures given by the Hon'ble the Finance Member. We know our position and we are if not altogether bankrupt, on the verge of bankruptcy; unless some aid or help comes from the Government of India. But, at the same time, I think we should not despair as we have hopes for the future; we hope and trust our financial position will gradually improve and that the Government of India will listen to the voice of the people and will receive the deputation which we are sending sympathetically, and we hope that the result will be satisfactory. But I think this should not deter us from expressing our opinion on this question. It has been pointed out by the Hon'ble Member that our function is simply to express an opinion, and if that opinion be unreasonable, the whole question may be shelved by the Secretary of State. But I think it all depends on how the case is put, and instead of going into details, I think we can very well put that the rise in the prices alone is not to be considered—there are other factors too. I do not share the optimism of the Hon'ble the Finance Member that the position will be easy in the near future. I do not think that it has been exactly our experience: when the prices have gone up once, they stick there, or go still higher.

Now the recommendations of Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur, no doubt, to a certain extent, would relieve these people, but I think that is not enough. The resolution of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta goes somewhat further, and without going into details I think that his proposal is far more reasonable considering all the circumstances. I think every Indian gentleman of this House, be he a Hindu or a Muhammadan or a Christian, knows better than the European gentlemen here of the position of these clerks, and our view is that the resolution of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta ought to be accepted, though it may involve a lump increase of Rs. 3 or 4 lakhs.

There is one other point to which I should like to invite the attention of this House. It has been said that we should not go beyond what has been done in other provinces. I think we are not going beyond what has been given by the major provinces of Bombay and Madras. They have given more; and we should not compare ourselves with the neighbouring province of Bihar and Orissa. Even Assam has given much more than what we propose to give. So, I submit to this House, that if we take into account the amount of relief which has been given to these officers in different provinces, we will not be very generous even if we accept the resolution of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta.

I have one other observation to make, and that is with regard to a certain class of officers, namely, the sheristadars of the Munsifs' courts. I find that both the majority and the minority reports have made a distinction between the sheristadars in Sub-Judges' courts and those

in Munsifs' courts. This distinction, I should say, is most ungenerous; because the sheristadars in Munsif's courts do a greater amount of work and more responsible work too, than the sheristadars in Sub-Judges' courts. The only thing that can be said is that the number of munsifs is very large and so the number of sheristadars must be very large and the expenditure will therefore be considerable. But I think this should not stand in the way of their being placed on the same footing as sub-judges' sheristadars, and I hope this will be favourably considered by Government. With these remarks, I beg to support the amendment of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta.

Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur and **Babu NITYA DHONE MUKHERJEE** moved that the question be put.

The PRESIDENT: There are several important questions involved and I am not prepared at this stage to apply the closure. If you move it a little later, I shall consider it.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: I have listened with very great attention to the speeches that have been delivered in moving these resolutions and in support of them. I may say at once that my sympathies are entirely with the ill-paid ministerial officers who have been crying at our doors from year's end to year's end. I find from the speech of the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr that in this matter the Government has taken up an attitude which cannot but be commended as perfectly fair, reasonable and above board. I understand that the matter is left entirely to the vote of the non-official members and that the Government will consider the various resolutions that the Council may think fit to pass on this important question. It is therefore all the more incumbent upon us to give our best consideration to the several items that have been raised in connection with this important question. I am a little perplexed as to which way to vote in connection with the several propositions that have been placed before us with regard to the different departments of Government. I find that the estimate of increase, excluding menials, as given in the majority report, amounts to Rs. 31 lakhs while that in the minority report to Rs. 48 lakhs. According to the recommendations made in the various resolutions, if adopted by the Council, the cost will come to Rs. 60 lakhs. So, it is quite clear that if we adopt all the resolutions that have been tabled here, we shall have to vote for an expenditure of Rs. 60 lakhs, that is to say, an increase of *over Rs. 30* lakhs to the recommendations made in the majority report. The question is not that we are unwilling to accede to the reasonable demand of our ill-paid officers but the question is how to meet this demand and the final decision does not rest with us. It rests with the Secretary of State. We are confronted with this situation that we have to face a deficit of nearly Rs. 2 crores and that we cannot afford to pay this Rs. 60 lakhs from our depleted funds. How

is this expenditure to be met? Proposals have been made for levying a police rate upon Calcutta. I hope that when that matter will have been considered, it will also be possible for some other member to rise and suggest that another education or sanitation cess be levied in order to make certain holes in the permanent settlement of Bengal. In this way, of course, we can supplement our resources but until and unless we do that, I do not know how we can meet this expenditure. We all know that this is merely a recommendation to Government, and that Government is sympathetically inclined to consider these recommendations in accordance with the funds at our disposal. Therefore, I am inclined to hold that the resolution that stands in the name of Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri is the best which we can conscientiously vote for. This resolution commends to the attentive consideration of Government the representation of the ministerial officers, who met at a conference at Bhowanipur, and it embodied all the suggestions that they had been able to offer to Government. I am sure the Government will sympathetically consider these suggestions and will, as far as practicable, give such increase as will satisfy their present needs. One chief defect of this Committee which was appointed last year or the year before last was this, that there was no representative of the ministerial officers attached to this Committee. It may be said that our esteemed friend Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur represented in a vicarious manner the ministerial officers, but it would have been a great advantage if a direct representative had been taken on in that Committee, because in that case the majority report might have been to a certain extent enabled to meet their wishes after hearing directly their demands. I understand that no delegate was allowed to appear before that Committee. Now, before I sit down, I wish to point out another important fact, that is this—I take it to be an assurance on the part of Government, as the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr has stated, that this need not be taken as the final increase and that if it is hereafter found that the prices have gone up and pressed more upon the ill-paid clerks, the Government would further reconsider the decision, and be inclined to make further grants. That is an assurance, which, I am sure, will to a certain extent satisfy the ministerial officers, who are already hard hit. By no means do I imply thereby that we ought to accept the majority report as a whole, and that no further increase or revision of the recommendations should be made, but what I mean to say is this, that if the Government or the Secretary of State is now unable to accede fully or entirely to their prayer, I hope that Government will leave the question open so that in future years the establishment may be revised.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: The question before us in one of very great difficulty. I think it is futile to whittle away the just claims of poor people by saying that these men earn the salaries of ministers by other means. This is not correct and there can

be no illegal earnings except in Civil and Criminal Courts. The cost of living has greatly increased and, furthermore, a higher standard of living is absolutely necessary for the comfort and for the self-respect of men. The times are changed and you cannot put the lower class down on a lower standard of living. You cannot go against the times. The great differences of salaries and wealth must be done away with. There is no reason whatsoever why a man should get Rs. 5,000 a month and a clerk who does all the work should get only Rs. 100 a month. In all departments of life, the great inequalities of wealth must vanish some day or other. Therefore, it is necessary that the salaries should be increased all round in the lower grades and the salaries in the higher grades should be decreased. This must come some day or other. Therefore, I fully sympathise with the claims of ill-paid people and I would not only give them what the minority report has given but I would give them also the same salary as the civil service officers in England and in the Colonies get, but that requires an adjustment of our finances. That requires economy all round. While doing justice we must at the same time have regard to our present finances. We have just now been told that an additional expenditure of Rs. 60 lakhs would be required if the minority report and the various recommendations that are before us are given effect to. Where is this sum of money to come from? On account of the top-heavy administration, the lower grades have to suffer. We, the representatives of the people however, have to see where the money is to come from. We must wait till we know whether we would get our Rs. 3 crores from our jute. If we do not get it, where shall we stand? We cannot shut our eyes to facts. I know very well that the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr is very kind towards the ill-paid officers and he has given them what he thinks his finances will allow, but we cannot but be dissatisfied with what has been given. I, therefore, having regard to the circumstances of the case, support this resolution of Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri for the present but leave it to the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr to reconsider the matter. I do hope that when this question of Rs. 3 crore is decided one way or the other, we shall re-open the question.

Mr. A. MARR: Before this debate closes, I should like to refer to one small point which has arisen in the course of the debate. Babu Nibaran Chandra Das Gupta said that we should not be inclined to give less than what other provinces had given. All that the Finance Member said was that the Secretary of State in scrutinising our proposals would certainly look to what had been given in other provinces and he would certainly be guided in his final decision by what had been done there. Babu Nibaran Chandra Das Gupta also said that in Assam the ministerial officers had been given a good deal more than what the majority report proposed to give here. I would simply like to point out that this is not correct. The Assam Administration only asked for sanction to give an increase of 30 per cent. all round.

Maulvi A. H. M. WAZIR ALI: I move that the question be now put.

The PRESIDENT: As I have almost finished the list of speakers I shall put the motion to vote.

The motion was then put and agreed to.

The PRESIDENT: I propose first to put the resolution of Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri to the Council as it seems to raise the least controversy.

The resolution was then put and agreed to.

Babu SATISH CHANDRA MUKHARJI: With regard to the resolution moved by Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta, it is by way of an amendment to my resolution. I accept the amendment.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: May I rise to a point of order? We have just accepted the resolution No. 25 under which we have resolved to recommend to the Government the representation made by the All-Bengal Ministerial Officers' Conference for their consideration. Now, Sir, for argument's sake, if we accept the other resolution, especially No. 31 of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta, will it not be inconsistent with the resolution which has just been passed?

The PRESIDENT: I do not think there is any inconsistency.

The resolution of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta was then put and lost.

The resolution of Babu Satish Chandra Mukharji was then put and agreed to.

The PRESIDENT: I believe the rest of the resolutions on this subject fall through.

Salaries of High Court Ministerial Officers.

Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: The resolution that I have the honour to place before this House for its acceptance runs thus:—"This Council recommends to the Government that suggestions be made to the Secretary of State, through the proper channel, to grant the same standard of pay and status to the ministerial officers of the High Court as that suggested by the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee for the Bengal Secretariat and Board of Revenue."

In doing this, I do not propose to take up any time of the Council and I would only mention the important points. First of all, the High Court clerks can fairly claim the same status and position as those of the Secretariat. This claim, I understand, was long ago accepted by Government and I need not go at any length into the correspondence or literature on the subject. The second argument is that the present

scale that has been fixed for them is one in which the pay of the non-permanent staff—I mean the temporary staff—has been included; that is the reason why it has not come up to the proper level. If the temporary staff be left out of consideration—and I submit that it should have been so done, because the Committee was appointed to consider the pay and prospects of the permanent ministerial staff only—then the amount provided plus the pay of these temporary people make it exactly the same as that of the people in the Bengal Secretariat. On that very ground, they urge and ask us to help them in this difficulty; the cost of living of these men is just the same as that of their fortunate brethren in the Bengal Secretariat.

There is another invidious distinction also that is proposed between the men of the Secretariat and the High Court people and that is this. Under the rate as at present worked out while a lower division clerk in the Bengal Secretariat will get Rs. 133 after 25 years' service, a clerk in the High Court will only get Rs. 103. An upper division clerk in the Bengal Secretariat gets Rs. 355, while a High Court man gets Rs. 255. The Head Assistants in the Bengal Secretariat will get Rs. 425—25—500 plus duty allowance, whereas in the High Court a gentleman of that position will get Rs. 300—10—350 with no duty allowance. I do not think that this distinction is at all reasonable or proper. The one pertinent question that arises is this. What may be the reason for this differential treatment awarded to the men in the High Court? I think that the unfortunate paper-book business is solely responsible for this. The amount of money that is going to be spent on the temporary establishment in the Paper Book Department belongs to the permanent staff. I do not know whether the temporary department is going to be made permanent. The chances are that they will not be, but unfortunately the money has been taken away for their use with the result that the permanent staff is suffering. I therefore humbly submit that this differential treatment should be done away with and that the clerks of the High Court and those of the Secretariat ought to be placed in the same position. That is all I have got to submit with regard to this resolution.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I do not want to take up the time of this Council by a lengthy debate. All I want to point out is that the Translators of the Calcutta High Court consisting of a class of men who are known for their intelligence and for their educational qualifications have been treated in a way not consistent with their position. It appears that the lower grade and the upper grade clerks always used to receive a smaller remuneration than the translators. Both Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur and also the majority report proposed to give a decent increase to their emoluments, but I see that the High Court itself has lowered their position and has recommended a lower pay than that of the clerks in the upper division in the High Court. I would

therefore point out to the Hon'ble Member in charge of the Finance Department and Mr. Marr that they should consider not only the majority report but also the minority report along with the recommendations of the High Court in this connection. This is all that I have to submit regarding the High Court Translators.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: It is not within the province of the Government of Bengal to decide upon these proposals. These proposals differ to some extent, from the recommendations of the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee. As is known to this Council the establishment of the High Court is under the control of the Government of India and the Government of Bengal are not responsible for it. Any propsal made with regard to this establishment, must therefore be sent to the Government of India. The position of the Government of Bengal in respect of the matter is that it will take into consideration the proposals made by the High Court, along with the recommendations of the McAlpin Committee and forward its views to the Government of India. At present I am not in a position to make a statement on the proposition contained in the resolution, but I may say, generally, that it does not follow that because certain officers of the Bengal Secretariat are paid at certain rates, therefore the officers on the High Court should be paid at the same rate. It will depend upon the nature of the duties they have to perform and the class of men from whom they are recruited. As regards the men who do the same class of work, it might very well be argued that the remuneration should be on the same scale. Beyond that abstract proposition, I am not prepared to say that the clerks in the High Court should necessarily receive the same pay as the clerks in the Secretariat. If the Council comes to any decision on this resolution, Government will take their decision into consideration.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I beg to support the resolution of Babu Rishindra Nath Sarkar. The claims of the High Court officers seem to be reasonable, and I would strongly recommend it to the members, and I hope their claims will not be overlooked.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: I find my lawyer friends supporting this resolution and on behalf of the public, who have to go to the High Court, I am also willing to lend my humble support to it, but on one condition and that is, that should we be prepared to defray the additional cost for increasing the pay of the ministerial staff of the High Court, we must needs be saved from any further impositions that are wont to be levied upon us, whenever we cross the threshold of the High Court.

The PRESIDENT: Babu Rishindra Nath Sarkar, have you anything to say in reply?

Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: No, I leave it to the Council. The motion was then put and agreed to.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: May I ask permission of the Council to move the resolution on the Assam-Bengal Railway strike, which has been balloted No. 132, as this is a matter of great public importance?

The PRESIDENT: I cannot allow that, unless you tell me that you have obtained the consent of those members who precede you. If you have not done so, I cannot entertain the proposal.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: I think if any member objects to this, he may——

The PRESIDENT: I cannot have the list disturbed by any member who suddenly rises and wishes his resolution discussed out of its turn. If anyone takes the trouble of previously ascertaining the views of those members whose resolutions precede his, I will then be prepared to consider such a proposal.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: But many of these members are absent.

The PRESIDENT: I cannot help that. No attempt has been made on the part of the member to ascertain the views of those whose resolutions precede his.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: May I move for an adjournment of the House to consider this matter? It is of great public importance.

The PRESIDENT: I cannot allow that too. Under the rules you must give notice of such a motion at question time.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: May I have your permission to move No. 87 now, in pursuance of an application made before, and with the permission of the members whose resolutions Nos. 39 to 86 precede mine, and who have given their consent in writing, all of them? I hope you will allow me to take this up.

The PRESIDENT: In a case where resolutions precede that of a member who asks that his be taken up first, I would ordinarily be willing, if others want to waive their right, to take up such a resolution out of its turn, unless there is any good ground for objecting by anybody else. In this case the member has obtained the permission of all those whose resolutions precede his, and in that case I would be prepared to allow him to move his resolution out of its turn unless anyone objects on the ground that he is taken by surprise or is not ready to debate the question. If such an objection be made, either by an official or non-official, I shall consider it.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: I object to a departure from the prescribed rules of the Council, and as I am in charge of this resolution, I may perhaps be allowed to say a few words on this point.

I do not object to the discussion of this particular resolution or any other, but I do object on principle, when the procedure of this Council is governed by rules, that we should, at the instance of individual members, for individual reasons, depart from them. It seems to me that the adoption of such a course will land us in the course of time in hopeless confusion. A body of this size, containing members of different interest and varied views, can only work according to prescribed rules; and if the rules are defective or wrong, let them be altered; but as long as the rules are there, let us follow them, so that we may all know where we are and adjust our procedure in the Council according to what is laid down. For that reason I object to this resolution being now taken.

The PRESIDENT: I have considered this matter, and my opinion is that if those who gain advantage by ballot, want to give up that advantage in favour of another, I should not interfere in the matter. If the other members object on the ground that they are not ready, or are taken by surprise, well, I would consider that as a matter of principle, but I think that those who gain an advantage, if they like to forego it, can do so. But since no objection is raised, namely, that any member is not ready to go on, or is taken by surprise, I think I should allow Babu Surendra Nath Mullick to go on with his resolution.

Recruitment of Assistant Superintendents of Police.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: "This Council recommends to the Government that the further recruitment in England of the remaining 13 Assistant Superintendents of Police, be not made."

Sir, I beg to thank you for allowing me to move this resolution. One word before I go on with the question. The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler states that it is for individual reasons that I wish to move this. This is not so at all.

Before I continue I should like to be permitted to correct one mistake in my resolution. My original resolution mentioned the figure 13; the figure 13 is wrong, it should be 19. I, therefore, ask permission to correct it. It was so on the day I submitted my resolution, but to-day this correction has been made. It was not altered by me, but by the Government.

The PRESIDENT: In the circumstances I allow you to correct the resolution.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I sent in this resolution on the 13th of August; at that time the figure was 13. According to

the Civil List of police officers in Bengal the real number is now 19. I am rather surprised to see that, but was told that after the admission of my motion 6 persons have already been recruited in England, so that my original mistake has been rectified by the Government itself; thus my desire to rectify my own mistake is not so very keen.

My point, the principle, on which I press this resolution is this: I want to assert it before the House, and I want to ask all of them whether I have their entire support in the matter. The principle on which I press this resolution is the broad ground of one of the accepted principles of the Reforms Scheme, namely, gradually introducing a larger number of Indian officers in the Imperial Services, that is, gradually strengthening the Indian portion of the services and also the number of Indians in the administration of the country. The spirit of the times, and the spirit of the Reforms, both demand that there should be a happy mixture of Indians and Europeans in the higher services of the country. Efforts have been made not to allow that, and that is the reason of my resolution. This much is certain—I do not know if I will be contradicted, if I am contradicted I shall be glad—since putting in my resolution, as I have said, I see that the number is not now 13. Very good. The Government of India in their Home Department letter No. 1227, dated the 30th June, 1920, said: "In continuation of the Home Department letter No. 196, dated the 31st January, 1920, I am directed to communicate the decisions reached after discussion between the Government of India and the Secretary of State on certain other recommendations of the Public Services Commission regarding the Police Department." Briefly speaking, they said—I will not take up time by reading all of it—they said that in future police recruitment, "the percentage of appointments to be made from Indians has been fixed at 33, of whom two-thirds will be recruited direct, and one-third by promotion from the Provincial Service." This was intimated to this Government in June, 1920. There are at present 118 officers of the superior police force; 1 Inspector-General of Police, 7 Deputy Inspectors-General of Police and 58 Deputy Superintendents of Police and 52 Assistant Superintendents of Police, in the Imperial Police Service. Taking 33 per cent. of this 118, the figure should be 39, but what is the total number of Indians now? Only 6! Has any Indian been taken in as an Assistant Superintendent of Police? Not at all, and I say this without fear of contradiction. The Public Services Commission recommended that not less than 33 per cent. should be Indians, and I see that no Indian has been appointed or promoted to the rank of Assistant Superintendent of Police, though that 33 per cent was fixed by the Government of India in consultation with the Secretary of State in June, 1920. I gave notice of this resolution on the 8th August, 1921, and I am speaking on the 6th September, 1921. The Public Services Commission recommended that not less than 10 per cent. of the Superintendentships should be filled by promotion from

the Provincial Police Service, and efforts should be made to give effect to this. As regards recruitment; recruitment in England should be stopped and immediate steps should be taken to give 5 per cent. of these Superintendentships to members of the Provincial Service to make a small beginning, and that provision should be made accordingly: In spite of the recommendations of the Public Services Commission and the Government of India's letter of June, 1920, recruitment in England has been going on, and fresh appointments have been made. The Public Services Commission also recommended that there should be no hesitation in putting a stop to recruitments in England. During the period of the war 1916 to 1919 there was no recruitment of Assistant Superintendents at all, I suppose owing to dearth of young men. In 1920, there were 29 vacancies and in 1921 there were 19, and most of these have now been filled up In these vacancies selected inspectors were promoted to the rank of Deputy Superintendents.

From the above it will be seen that provision has already been made for Assistant Superintendents, and appointments already made, and it is not at all necessary to recruit more men from England against the claims of the members of the Provincial Police Service, at the present moment. Therefore, the 20 per cent promotion to the rank of Deputy Superintendentships, and Superintendentships, as recommended by the Public Services Commission, should have been made at least in 1920. Calculating the total cadre, the recruitment of Assistant Superintendents in 1920-21 was unauthorised, and should not have been made against the claims of officers of the Provincial Police Service, and against the interests of our fellow-countrymen who have done excellent service. If the intention of the Government is not as has been interpreted, why not have promotions from the Provincial Service and give preference to that service in the next vacancy in the proportion of one-third, that is 33 per cent. of the total number by promotion and further recruitment of Assistant Superintendents of Police in England should be stopped at once. The province is in a state of distress and political unrest on account of the way in which the European element has been introduced and the Indian element reduced to the minimum in the maintenance of law and order. In this view I ask the Council to consider whether justice should not be done by virtue of the Government of India and the Secretary of State's decision. There should be no further recruitment for the Police this year in England. The chance should be given to members of the Provincial Police Service, otherwise there will be no Indianisation of the police force and public services, and the principles asserted by the Government of India and the Secretary of State will remain unrealised, to the great detriment of the Government in this country. With these words, I beg to commend my resolution to the acceptance of the House.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: In view of the great declaration that has been made by the Government of India Act for the increasing

association of Indians in the administration of the country, it seems strange that there should be any necessity of moving a resolution like this in this House. The matter might have easily been taken up by the Government, and it would have been better and more handsome, if the Government had done it on their own initiative; but as they have failed in their duty, I think it is the duty of this Council to explain the situation to the Government, and show how the Government of India Act should be given full effect to, and not thrust aside in this unceremonious manner.

This resolution refers to the Police Service. I sent notice of another resolution which referred to all the Imperial Services, but unfortunately it is low down in the list of business, and there is no chance of moving it at this sessions; I believe that during the 5 years of the war, there were very few recruitments in the Imperial Services including the Police, and many important posts were managed by officiating Indian officers. I ask the Hon'ble Member in charge—did these Indian officers fail in their duty, did not they manage the affairs of this department as efficiently and as well as the Imperial Service officers, whose place they had taken? If they did not fail, then there can be no justification for refusing Provincial officers a place of honour in this Imperial Service. If they failed, let Government openly declare it. Let there be no insiduous insinuation like this that they are inefficient. It seems strange that even in these days, there should be any distinction between Imperial and Provincial Services. The late Mr. Gokhale, who was a great moderate, raised his protest in no uncertain voice in the Imperial Council some years ago, regarding the distinction between these two services, and the practical prohibition of taking Indians into the Police and other Imperial Services. The grounds of his protest against this artificial division, were first, that those men in the Provincial Service who were abler than even some members of the Imperial Service, should not be overlooked and that this arrangement was an unjust one, and thus the prestige of the department and the nature of the work suffered; secondly, that this artificial distinction gives a stamp of inferiority on our Indian Provincial Service men, which is like marking them with the brand of helot; it takes away all eagerness, all energy and all love for their work.

Then, as regards the question of expense. We have always been crying for a cheaper service. If we can get an efficient and cheap service here, why should we go to the length of importing dearer labour. In the Police department especially where we have been lately hearing a cry that there is hardly any co-operation between the people and the police, it seems necessary that Indians should be taken in larger numbers for the higher grade posts. How can we expect more co-operation between the people and the police when we find here young European officers coming out from England, who hardly know much of the language of

the country, who know nothing of the social atmosphere, the social conditions and the ways of life of the Indian people? It is no wonder that there is no co-operation between the people and such officers. It is only natural that we should ask that those Indians in the Police department, who have had experience, and have officiated as Deputy Superintendents and Superintendents of Police, should be given as fair a chance as they were given during the war. I think that the cry of prestige that Imperial Service men should always be above the Provincial Service officers, should not be maintained any longer. I am pained to find that the spirit of Colonel du Pre, once head of the Survey Department, who said that "it was suicidal for the Europeans to admit that natives could do anything better than themselves, and that they should claim to be superior in everything and only allow natives to take a secondary or subordinate part," is still abroad, even after the Reforms.

It is unfortunate that this sort of arrogance is growing daily. Indians have been tried and have not been found wanting. Let them have a chance. A committee has been appointed to consider the retrenchment of the Police, to find out how retrenchment may be effected. I suggest that the superior services should be Indianised; this is the golden opportunity for bringing this question before this committee, and so giving effect to the suggestion for retrenchment.

My friend, Babu Surendra Nath Mullick, has said that the Secretary of State has recommended that 33 per cent. of the vacancies in the superior services should be given to Indians. Now is the chance for the local Government to give effect to the recommendations of the Secretary of State, and to appoint Indians in this service.

With these words, I support the motion of Babu Surendra Nath Mullick.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: In according my hearty support to this resolution, I hope there will not be a single dissentient voice in the House. The mover has dealt with it in his usual masterly way, and I am afraid I shall not be able to add much to his own inimitable arguments. Only I do not want the appointments to be made at all. What has struck me most is that amongst a permanent staff of 44 Superintendents of Police and 26 Assistant Superintendents, a further number of 25 Assistant Superintendents are being maintained permanently, simply to fill up the leave vacancies of these fortunate 70. It means that at least one out of three officers is permanently on leave, the work apparently being sufficient for the remaining two. And nowhere in any of the other services do we find people being retained and paid to do nothing save to fill up occasional vacancies, when officers go on leave. Perhaps it is for this very retention of unemployed officers that superior Police officers can enjoy leave-holidays even when not necessary. Nay, perhaps their going home on leave is

encouraged, and possibly, senior officers taking pity on their unemployed juniors take advantage of these easy leaves only to let these people have something to do.

Sir, if we compare this service with other services and see how many officers in the respective services are on leave, the contrast becomes still more striking. I quote the figures from the most recent Civil List. Of about 180 members of the Indian Civil Service, who are now employed in Bengal only 39 are on leave, *i.e.*, about 22 per cent. of about 300 Deputy Magistrates, about 34 are on leave now, *i.e.*, about 11 per cent. Amongst 400 Sub-Deputy Magistrates about 24 are on leave which means about 6 per cent. Of about 30 Deputy Superintendents of Police, only 1 is on leave, *i.e.*, about 3 per cent. and of about 70 Inspectors of Police only 3 are on leave, *i.e.*, about 4 per cent. But when we come to the superior police service what do we find? 99 names are at present in the Civil List as serving in Bengal and of them 30 are actually on leave, *i.e.*, 30 per cent. of the officers find it convenient to take leave, and permanently keep away from their duties, of course, at the cost of the Indian tax-payers. These percentage calculations are enough to convince anybody of at least one of the numerous ways in which the superior Police service is pampered.

Sir, there must be real equity everywhere and not merely a tall talk of equity. On an average one year's leave in every ten years' service is enough. So 10 per cent. and no more can be retained in every service to fill up the occasional vacancies. Out of permanent 44 Superintendents and 26 Assistant Superintendents, in all 70 officers, if only 7 extra hands, or say at the most 10, are retained, it must satisfy, in all conscience, all leave vacancies.

And Sir, actually we had not had for a long time the extra people. The posts were kept vacant, and the work was being well managed by Indian Deputy Superintendents although in the meantime 30 officers of the subordinate service had actually gone on leave. So where is the necessity of the paper-vacancies being filled up? The necessity has been disproved by facts.

And, Sir, what would be the cost of maintaining these extra 13. Each would cost us Rs. 6,000 per annum, and so about Rs. 78,000 will be saved this year if we now refrain from the luxury of having unemployed public servants.

Sir, Babu Surendra Nath Mullick deserves our thanks, and especially of the Government, for finding out so soon one of the several means of retrenchment. The Government had been expressing itself eager for retrenchments but knew not where to begin. And Sir, I venture to say this is a splendid opportunity to make a beginning. But, unfortunately, it so happens that reason, when coming through non-official channels, appears otherwise to the Government. However, I hope that

for once at least, the Government would condescend to accept our suggestions.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I support the resolution wholeheartedly. The reason why Assistant Superintendents are recruited in England is that they may, after a few years' service, be appointed as Superintendents of Police. Well, it is a well-known fact, rather a notorious fact, that the Deputy Superintendents of Police who generally rise from the ranks of Inspectors or who are recruited at once from the best graduates of the University, have got greater experience of the country required in a policeman than those who come from England and who are recruited in England. The Assistant Superintendents of Police do not possess the qualifications of the members of the Indian Civil Service; they are not required to pass such a stiff examination, and it is said that it is only the relations and friends of retired members of the Indian Civil Service who are generally appointed to the Imperial Police Service in India, and come out as Assistant Superintendents of Police or in the Customs Department; that being the case, we do not see any reason why experienced men whom we can get not by tens or by twenties but by hundreds here in the province of Bengal among the members of the Police service, should not be promoted from the posts of Deputy Superintendents of Police, or from the posts of Inspectors of Police to those of the Deputy Superintendents of Police and why should we go all the way from India to England to bring recruits from there? The cost would be much cheaper because, if I am right, we shall have to pay only two-thirds of the pay to these Superintendents of Police, that is, one-third less than what we have to pay to those who are promoted from the posts of Assistant Superintendents of Police to Superintendents of Police.

I think the time has come for Indianising the services. Let us make a beginning, and if there is any department of the Government which requires to be Indianised, it is the Police department. (Hear, hear.)

With these words, I beg to support the resolution.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: I confess that, when we received notice of this resolution, we could not understand in the Secretariat the arguments that underlaid it. We did not pursue further inquiries as, under the ordinary procedure, there appeared to be no hope of this resolution coming up for discussion; and therefore, so far as the Secretariat is concerned, we are still left in the state of doubt in which we found ourselves at the beginning. Neither has that state of doubt been cleared up by the speeches which we have heard this evening, since I frankly confess my inability to follow the figures that have been quoted and the statements that have been made. They have flown round every point of the compass, based on figures for the accuracy of which I am not prepared off-hand to vouch. The arguments that

have been advanced follow no sequence among themselves. When we received notice of this resolution, we looked at the Civil List and found that, according to it, there were, on the 1st July, 1921, 13 vacancies, and we assumed that the mover, for some reason or other, was proposing that we should not fill them up. We accordingly proposed to explain to him that in so far as the statutory right of regulation of the strength and character of this service rests with the Secretary of State, and as the present strength of the service has been laid down with the approval of the Secretary of State, so, following the ordinary administrative procedure regarding the maintenance of the service, it was incumbent upon us to take the usual steps to keep the cadre up to its sanctioned strength, and the mover's proposal would therefore have been inadmissible. We then noticed that he proposed that these recruitments should not be made *in England;* and in answer to that it was our intention to explain to him that, under the latest rules laid down under the statutory authority of the Secretary of State for the recruitment of the service, there should be 33 per cent. recruitment from Indian sources, two-thirds being recruited direct and one-third by promotion and that therefore, assuming that there were 13 vacancies to be filled up, under the orders I have referred to, it would not have been the case that all appointments would have been made from England, and, therefore, his resolution on that ground would have failed. That was how we viewed the matter in the Secretariat on receipt of the resolution.

From the speeches that have been made, so far as I can make out, Babu Surendra Nath Mullick is accusing us of having departed from the orders of the Secretary of State in the method we have adopted for the recruitment of these new Assistant Superintendents of Police, and he apparently thinks that on receipt of his resolution I at once flew round and said: "Let us do something to forestall this proposal," and that I seized upon six officers and appointed them to the service. May I explain to the Council that it is not within my power to take any action of the kind, even had I wished to do so? We are bound to abide by whatever orders appertain to the recruitment of this service, and these orders are the orders of the Secretary of State, with whom only, by statute, the power to make these rules rests. These orders are binding on us; and we cannot make appointments to the service without the approval and knowledge of the Government of India. Therefore it is absolutely impossible that we could have maliciously and deliberately—as apparently it has been alleged this afternoon—disregarded the orders of the Secretary of State with a view to prejudicing Indian recruitment. That, as I understand it, is the accusation of Babu Surendra Nath Mullick, and my answer to it is that even if we wished to do this extraordinary thing, it would not have been within our power to do so; and that whatever recruitment is made to the service will be made, and made only, in accordance with the orders of the Secretary of State.

The argument of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta, on the other hand, has taken the general character of a comparison between the merits of the Imperial and Provincial Services, and he says practically that the time has now come to do away with the Imperial Services and thus save money by recruiting from Provincial sources. That is the argument he has advanced, and in answer to it I would only point out that in respect of these Imperial Services under the Reforms Scheme the power has not been given to this Council to make that change. Members may allege that the power should have been given, but the fact remains that it was not given, and, as a part and parcel of the Reforms Scheme the Imperial Services were made definitely subject to the orders of the Secretary of State. It is therefore by his orders we are bound, and it is no use making recommendations to Government in this Council to evade the orders of the Secretary of State and to do what we have not got the power to do. So far as that point is concerned, it is impossible for us to accept it.

The third argument of Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray, again, takes another form and is apparently to the effect that as certain Police officers are at present on leave, the Police are idle, and that therefore it is obvious that, since we have 13 vacancies in our hands, the most economical thing we can do is to decline to fill them up. The Kumar appears to be under the impression that a leave reserve is a feature peculiar to the Police. I can assure him that it is an ordinary incident in the constitution of various services in this country that provision should be made on the strength of the cadre for the men who periodically take leave. He has then given certain figures—culled, as he says, from the latest Civil List—by looking up how many Police officers are on leave as compared with other services. A comparison of that kind is however bound to be entirely fallacious, as there are many conditions affecting the various services in different degrees and at different times which might be fully explanatory of any discrepancies which might appear off-hand. That is particularly true at a time like the present, just succeeding the war; during the war leave banked up in every service, and we had an accumulation of men wanting leave and to whom leave was overdue. Since the war we have granted these men leave, and that is the reason why the number of men on leave at one time in a particular service may have been higher than usual. We have been enabled to allow men to go on leave, not, as the Kumar thinks, by allowing so many to idle, but because in various instances single officers have undertaken double duties and thereby enabled men to go on leave. As instances, it was only the other day that I mentioned that the work of the Additional Superintendent of Police in Mymensingh was being undertaken by the Additional Superintendent of Police, Dacca, in addition to his own duties; so too, another officer, the head of the Criminal Investigation Department, is at present doing double duty. The idea that, because there is a leave reserve in the

Police department, there are a number of idle vagabonds who are merely appointed by a misguided Government for the purpose of sucking their remuneration from the Indian taxpayers, is entirely a figment of the Kumar's imagination.

From the reasons I have given, it follows that we are not prepared to accept this resolution and to stop further recruitment to the service in England. Until the orders binding us are altered, the service will be recruited in accordance with these orders, and constitutionally no other course is open to the local Government.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: If this resolution is beyond our jurisdiction, may I know why it was allowed?

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: It is a matter of great relief to me after all that the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler could not say that these appointments had not been made since the 8th of August last. The reason why we wanted this motion to come was not an individual reason, as was suggested by the Hon'ble Member, but because I felt that the Government had come to understand that this resolution was impossible to be reached by the Council at this sitting, and, therefore, it would lapse. In the meantime, Government could fill up the remainder of the 13 vacancies. That is the reason why I wanted this motion to be taken up now: and I am thankful to my brother councillors for giving me this opportunity.

After all, I have heard the Hon'ble Member's reply with the greatest possible attention, in fact I was taking down everything that fell from him. We all know that whatever he says is certainly worth listening to with the greatest possible respect, because his orders will affect us in this particular instance; but his argument, I am sure, does not satisfy anybody. He has said, amongst other things, nothing in particular, but only this. "We have done something according to the rules of the Secretary of State," or something of that kind. All that he said amounts to this—"Even if we desired to alter the present arrangement we could not do so without the sanction of the Government and the Secretary of State." I suppose we are not children, not knowing how the sanction of the superior authorities is obtained. The sanction is obtained merely on files without anybody looking at them. Here is a recommendation going from the Bengal Council. Am I to understand that the Government of India would scrutinise it carefully and then pass it? I am one who is born here and I know how work is done here—routine work, file work is done automatically—as I have seen many European officers doing it. Am I to understand that the Secretary of State does not accept the principle he has himself laid down that 33 per cent. should be recruited from the Indians? Can the Hon'ble Member say that up till to-day there has been a single Assistant Superintendent of Police appointed from India, so far as the

children of the soil are concerned? And as against that what are these Assistant Superintendents may I know? But the Government of India know it. This is what the Government of India say in a recent circular about these Assistant Superintendents of Police and I need not say anything more than quote the following:—

"An examination of the scales of pay at present admissible to officers of the various departments shows that the Indian Police Service, the service whose pay was first revised, is at some disadvantage when compared with the other Imperial Services. Its time-scale starts at a lower figure and rises to a lower maximum than that of other service, while there is a smaller percentage of administrative and other posts above the time-scale. It is recognised that the Police officer commences his services at a less mature (I lay stress on the words 'less mature') age and has not to incur the expenditure upon technical education which is necessary in the case of members of such services as the Forest and Engineering services. The Government of India consider, however, that these factors should not operate to place him throughout his service at a permanent disadvantage as compared with members of the specialist services; and they are accordingly pleased, with the sanction of the Secretary of State in Council, to announce the following revised rates of pay for the Indian Police Service."

I did not like to say anything about it, I did not refer to all that: I did not use one word that no Europeans should be recruited. I said simply, "Let not that be done at the present time." I further said nothing about those who have already been appointed but not to appoint any more men and no further than this. That was the spirit in which I said about the Indianisation of the service which is indeed a reasonable thing. If that is objected to in this way, then I may say what I know of these Assistant Superintendents of Police. I know that these Assistant Superintendents of Police are not fit for anything except smoking cigarettes—what I think, they have taken to early in life. I have seen them doing it and doing nothing else. When they come here, they do not know the language, they do not know the manners and customs; they do not know anything about offences, as they know well that below them are Deputy Superintendents of Police, very capable Indians and well experienced, and above them are superior officers: and they therefore do nothing but smoke and smoke and smoke away their time. We know what these Assistant Superintendents are—they are no other persons than the undesirable relatives of those in power and who cannot pass the Indian Civil Service examination, and who are smuggled into the Imperial Services to the detriment of India's own children. I did not like to refer to all this; but inasmuch as my resolution, which is merely a request, has been most unsympathetically received, I am bound to bring these facts to the notice of the Council. I claim here only a morsel—only a morsel—of the food for my own men to whom injustice has been done, and is this the way I am going to be treated? Is it the

spirit that reigns supreme under the so-called Reforms? Does it show that you are anxious for Indianising the services and for giving the Indians equal treatment? If that be so, then I must say that the Reforms is merely an eye-wash and an absolute camouflage. 'I am not prepared to accept all that and none of my countrymen is prepared to accept that. You cannot even come down from your high place and give only a portion—only a morsel—and throw it down to these fellows. You are not even prepared to do that. After all, you have got to remember that the money is ours—you will have to give it to us, even if you do not do it to-day or to-morrow—you will have to be forced to do it some time hence. We may be powerless at present but we are a growing nation. We demand our powers and privileges. If you stifle them now, you will only make us stronger and more worthy to insist upon our rights and privileges. This is not how I expected this resolution to be treated. I thought that the Hon'ble Member would say: "Yes, efforts will be made to take Indians into the Police service." But if you say that this cannot be accepted and that we are wrong and, therefore, the Government is absolutely right, we refuse to accept it. You have not been able to satisfy us at all. Mere flow of words from the Government does not satisfy my mind. What are the facts? Up till now not a single Indian has been appointed as Assistant Superintendent of Police. May I ask why? But we know Bengalis—Hindus and Mussalmans—are appointed as Assistant Magistrates, because they are members of the Indian Civil Service. You could not resist them because they had passed the Indian Civil Service examination but you resist our men from being appointed Assistant Superintendents of Police only because it is left to your choice and not left to the result of an examination. Let the Imperial Police appointments be thrown open to a competitive examination and let us see who can get in—whether Europeans or our Indian boys get in. (Hear, hear.) You have not the courage to do it and that is why we are justified in asking for the recruitment being made here. I expected that my request would be at least partially accepted. The prayer made on behalf of my own countrymen was simply, "give us something out of the bread which is legitimately ours. Do not deprive us of even a morsel of it." That was only my prayer and if this is not accepted, then what shall we say of the "Reforms," "Indianisation" and "equalisation" and all that!

Survey of Bengal cotton tracts.

Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: "This Council recommends that the Government of Bengal do represent to the Government of India that the botanical survey of the cotton tracts of Bengal be made as early as possible."

When most of us are not in a mood to hear and are eager to get home let me assure the hon'ble members that I am not going to inflict

a long speech but shall make a few observations and refer to certain salient points only. In the first place, let me tell you that this is a recommendation of the Indian Cotton Committee—a recommendation that was made in 1919, and, as such, I hope it will have the support of the non-official as well as the official members.

In the second place, I request you to realise the present position of Bengal as a cotton-grower and it is really an exceedingly unfortunate position. All of you know, I believe, that India is the second largest cotton-grower in the world, next only to America, contributing about 5 million bales of cotton every year to the world's annual cotton produce of 25½ million bales. But in respect of cotton, Bengal occupies almost the last position among the Indian provinces having 0·3 per cent. of the total area under cotton in India. Whether this is an enviable or at all a desirable position I leave it to you to judge.

In the third place, I should like to point out to you with what interest and enthusiasm the Agricultural Department of the Government is tackling this problem—a problem which is next only in importance to the rice problem. While strenuous attempts are being made to find out newer and better strains of jute, as regards cotton no serious endeavour at all seems to have been made. For if you only take the trouble to consult the reply that was given on the 14th March to my unstarred question No. 56, you will find that I have not only been twitted for framing the question in such a manner as presupposes increase in area or outturn but that the Hon'ble the Minister has, by quoting facts and figures, conclusively shown that increase or improvement is not in the line and that the area under cotton is dwindling since 1914, and that the outturn per acre is almost the same as it was in 1907-08, *i.e.*, when the Agricultural Department was organised under a Director of Agriculture.

My fourth point is that an erroneous idea prevails even in high quarters that the soil of Bengal is altogether unfavourable to the production of cotton and specially long staple cotton. This presumption before any actual serious attempt to improve the outturn of cotton or the area under it is unwarrantable to say the least of it. This is at least not supported by history. Bengal has unlearnt cotton growing it is true. Why, I need not say. But that it produced very good cotton and indeed the finest cotton not long ago is borne out by history and by the testimony not of *swadeshi* preachers but of early English reports and of early English writers. I cannot do better than quote, as has been done by a learned correspondent, the following:—

Letter No. 57, dated the 5th September, 1828.

From—The Secretary to the Court of Directors,

To—The Secretary to the India Board.

The delicate fabrics of Dacca were at all times manufactured entirely from the cotton of that district which is the finest of all cotton in India and is probably the finest in the world.

Again the following extract is culled from T. Ellison's cotton trade of Great Britain:—

"Fabrics as fine as any that can be turned out at the present day by most perfect machinery in Lancashire were produced by the nimble fingers of Hindu spinners and the primitive looms of Hindu weavers before the invasion of Britain by the Romans—in fact, at a period when the inhabitants of the British Isles were attired in the skins of wild animals, the leading people of India were luxuriating in garments of a texture so fine as to have earned the poetic description of 'woven wind' and what is still more astonishing is the circumstance that the cotton with which this wonderful perfection was attained, was the much despised Surats and Bengals."

Does it not prove that Bengal is capable of producing the finest cotton in India, and if so, should not the earliest steps be taken to ascertain the cotton tracts of this province by a comprehensive botanical survey as the first step towards the improvement of the cotton position of Bengal?

With these few words, I commend this resolution to the acceptance of the House.

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: The subject matter of the resolution, namely, the botanical survey of the cotton tracts of Bengal was one of the recommendations of the Indian Cotton Committee. Orders were accordingly passed for the initiation of the survey. The report of the Director of Agriculture is being awaited. I accept the resolution and shall take steps for the completion of the survey as soon as practicable.

The resolution was then put to vote and carried.

Cattle-breeding in Bengal.

Mr. PRASANNA DEB RAIKAT: I beg leave to move the following resolution which was said to have been moved by my friend Mr. Erfan Ali, but dropped then for want of time:—"This Council recommends to the Government that early steps be taken to improve the breed of cattle in Bengal—

(*a*) by providing suitable bulls;

(*b*) by providing grazing-grounds;

(*c*) by encouraging the system of indigenous veterinary treatment; and

(*d*) by offering prizes, rewards and cups in the local *hâts* and *melas* for good cattle."

The matter is of vital importance to the whole community and should no longer be neglected and passed over with indifference and apathy. I feel it my duty to move it now, and I hope I will get the whole-hearted support of the entire House. The subject which I am going to place

before you, to-day, Sir, is neither a political nor a social one. It is mainly a question of general public utility. So, there cannot be two questions upon it and I hope it can claim the sympathy of every one in this House, no matter whether he be a nationalist or a moderate, a Muhammadan or a Hindu.

Now, let me turn to my subject without further introduction. Sir, you all know, that there are few subjects in which Bengal is so very backward as those of cattle and cattle-breading. Bengal is pre-eminently an agricultural country, in which about 75·4 per cent. of the population depend for their living upon agriculture; but the cattle which form the life and soul of agriculture are deficient both in number and in quality. The number of cattle in Bengal is very small in proportion to her population when comparison is made with that of other agricultural countries of the world. Thus, while the number of cattle per 100 of population in Bengal is only about 59, it is 74 in Denmark, 79 in the United States of America, 80 in Canada, 120 in Cape Colony, 150 in New Zealand, 259 in Australia, 323 in Argentine Republic and 500 in Uruguay. In this connection, it may be pointed out that the *communiqué* issued by the Director of Information, Bengal, is misleading as it deals only with the number of cattle of India and other countries without taking into account the proportion of them either to the population or to the acreage under cultivation.

Next the number of bulls and bullocks is not sufficient to bring under cultivation the arable land of this province. A pair of cattle in Bengal has to till about 19 acres of land, whereas it would require in the ordinary course 4 pairs of cattle. This in a large measure accounts for the poor outturn of crops in this province as compared with that of other countries.

Further, the number of milch cattle also is scarcely enough to supply one-eighth of the present population with a fair quantity of milk. The need per individual is reckoned at 2 pints a day, whereas at the present rate of production in Bengal each head can hardly get more than one-sixteenth of a pint a day.

As regards quality also the cattle of Bengal has deteriorated very much and is still deteriorating day by day. The ordinary village cattle of this province might practically be spoken of as the most inferior in India. They are small, over-worked, half-starved animals and most of them in my opinion are also inferior in size and strength. In some parts of Jalpaiguri district of which I have personal experience and about which I can speak with authority, the average height of cattle will not be more than 3½ feet, and, I think, that within the course of about another 20 or 30 years the size of cattle in Bengal will be something like ordinary Patna goats.

This unsatisfactory state of things, both as regards number and quality, has led to an abnormal rise in the price of cattle, crops, milk

and milk products on the one hand, and on the other to the poor physique of many of the population, prevalence of disease and abnormal death-rate among the people, specially among women and children. The reasons of all these evils, we have not to go far to seek. They are, in my opinion, the results of ill or improper breeding, insufficient grazing grounds, infectious diseases amongst the cattle and, lastly, want of proper medical relief accorded to them.

Let me now discuss these reasons one by one. In Bengal, the male off-springs are not generally emasculated until they are three years old. Hence the cows are served by immature and as often as not, diseased, degenerated or otherwise undesirable males. Therefore, it is evident that there is a lack of good bulls for breeding purposes in this province. The Annual Report of the Bengal Veterinary College, 1919-20, goes to show that there are only 124 stud-bulls owned by the Government and the district board, out of 71 millions of cattle that we have in Bengal—the milch cow forming half of this number. The proportion seems to me to be ridiculously small and their number should be largely multiplied to produce any appreciable effect on the country. We can expect little improvement in this line from the ignorant and poverty-stricken cultivators, who form the main breeders of cattle in Bengal. Hence, I would suggest that the Government should extend their helping hand to the poor cultivators and take up this matter in hand in right earnest. In my opinion, every district board should have a model Breeding-stud and every municipality, thana and village union should be made to keep an adequate number of suitable high class stud-bulls which could be utilised by the people free or on payment of a nominal charge.

Perhaps it will not be out of place to mention here another fact in this connection which should receive the kind attention and consideration of the Government. At present, sufficient number of cattle in this province are slaughtered and freely exported with the result that the best breeds of them have been considerably depleted. As for example Angole and Punjab breed are largely exported to Java. Now I would most emphatically request the Government to put a stop to this system at an early date possible.

Another cause of deterioration of Bengal cattle is, as I have said, lack of sufficient pasture-grounds which, as you will know, are being daily encroached upon and turned into cultivated areas, etc., with the hope of getting an increased outturn of crops and one thing or other. But instead of that, the outturn is going to be diminished in proportion to the area that is being brought under cultivation. To obtain thus an increase in the outturn would depend not on increasing the area under cultivation such as by the encroachment of pasture-lands but by the adoption of intensive method of cultivation such as is practised in other civilised countries. Just mark, the proportion of grazing-grounds to the total area in this province is the smallest of all countries. In the

United States of America the proportion is 1 to 16 in Germany and Japan it is 1 to 6, in England in the United Kingdom and in New Zealand it is 1 to 3, while in India it is 1 to 27.

For reference I would mention here that during the rainy season in some parts of Bengal the surrounding lands remain under water and not an inch of ground is left for grazing purposes. So, during this season, the cattle are tied down to a pole all day and night and having no opportunity to graze about freely, their condition becomes very miserable for want of sufficient food and due to constant confinement. In order to relieve this pitiable condition, arrangements should be made to provide for raised grazing-grounds in every village in those parts.

In view of the above Government interference is needed to check further encroachment upon grazing-grounds and to provide for the gradual reclamation of pasture-lands by authorising municipalities, district boards, zamindars and land-holders to spend a portion of their funds and lands for this purpose, and further by the acquisition and proper maintenance of grazing-lands by provincial Governments where necessary.

Thereby in this connection the problem of cattle-diseases should also be properly dealt with. It is well known that in Bengal rinderpests and other common diseases amongst common, low class of cattle appear in most virulent form and is more frequent than in other countries. Therefore, in order to combat this evil, the question of adequate medical relief to be given to the cattle should not be neglected. Though some good results have been obtained through the active veterinary assistants maintained by the Government, yet I think the present arrangement is not quite sufficient to cope with the present situation. Therefore, my suggestion would be that Government should encourage the indigenous system of cattle treatment which was prevalent in Bengal from time immemorial.

As we all know that from the time of the Atharva Veda down to that of Chakrapani Dutta of Asokan times, the indigenous system of cattle treatment appears to have reached a high stage of perfection and that knowledge has been preserved to some extent by *go-baids* (cattle-surgeons) of the country. My suggestion with regard to the point is that this system, which has practically died out for want of State patronage, should be revived by Government as it will prove to be less expensive and suited to the constitution and condition of Bengal cattle and it will further help considerably in checking and curing diseases. It is all the more to be revived because the graduates now turned out by the Government Veterinary College are too few to deal with any outbreak of diseases. Lastly, in order to encourage cattle-breeding amongst the peasantry, annual *melas* and fairs should be held under the auspices of the local board and village unions for good cattle shows. Then prizes and medals should be distributed to the best competitors

after having the cattle exhibited, testified and judged by experts. This sort of prize distribution amongst the best breeders of cattle would serve the double purpose of encouraging breeding of cattle in a scientific and systematic way, and improving agriculture at the same time. Therefore, before I resume my seat, I would once more ask the House to extend their support to this resolution, and then urge the Government to give effect to my suggestions enumerated above, as early as possible, as it is an urgent need of the country.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I have great pleasure to second this resolution. It is known to everybody that the interest of the cow is very dear to all of us, and at the present moment we find that we, both Hindus and Muhammadans, have joined in a common desire to improve the condition of cattle, so far so that the old *Bakr Id* riots have disappeared. This request to Government to help us in a matter on which depends the life of our children is one which we can very well ask the Government to take into favourable consideration, and I earnestly hope that Government will be pleased to grant us the prayer.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: I congratulate my young friend on his moving this resolution. This is a matter which, I am sure, will meet with the unanimous support of the House, both from the official and the non-official quarter. I find that even in Calcutta if we could give effect to this resolution in co-operation with Government, it would really be conferring a boon to the people, and if this resolution is given effect to throughout the Presidency of Bengal, I am sure that will greatly improve the condition of the cattle which is at present deplorable. Touching upon this resolution, I wish to say one or two words on some special points raised in this connection. As regards the supply of suitable bulls, I think the suggestion made by my friend for enabling the municipalities and union committees to keep the requisite number of bulls in their areas for breeding purposes, is an excellent one. I may state for the information of the House that this is a suggestion which was made in the Corporation by me and met with the full support of the members that the Corporation should make arrangements for the maintenance of three or four good bulls in the different *gowkhanas* at their expense for breeding purposes.

I do not want to take up the time of the Council by dilating on the affairs of Calcutta. The question of grazing-grounds is a common factor in all parts of the Presidency. For want of these grazing-grounds many cows are sent to the slaughter-house.

As regards the promotion of indigenous veterinary education, we know to our great inconvenience that we cannot get these veterinary assistants: they are too few in number, and therefore, it is necessary

to encourage these *gobaidyas* or indigenous veterinary doctors. They are practically a dying class. I hope the Hon'ble Minister will be pleased to give this resolution his best consideration.

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: I have no doubt that the Hindu gentlemen who are here will welcome this resolution and also the Muhammadans. Providing of suitable bulls is an act of religion on the part of the Hindus. Formerly, they used to dedicate some bulls to God, and they were called *Dharamshars* and they were not molested by anybody and they used to graze upon everybody's land and thrive upon that. But now times are changed, and therefore, there must be some provision, so that those bulls may be properly kept for the purpose of proper breeding.

In regard to grazing-grounds, there were grazing-grounds in ancient times, but now the grabbing of money is so dear to the people, that these grazing-grounds have been encroached upon and they have been turned to cultivated land. It is now the duty of Government to provide such grazing-grounds in every village so that the breeding of cattle may thrive.

With these words, I beg to support the resolution.

Maulvi SHAH MUHAMMAD CHAUDHURI: I congratulate the mover of this resolution. As to (*a*), I have nothing to say as it will improve the breeding of cattle. As to (*b*), I am quite at a loss to understand how this can be done. This suggestion is beset with many difficulties, such as the question of providing money, the question of getting suitable grazing-lands, etc. I do not think it will be practicable for the Council to take any steps in this direction.

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: The mover has suggested four means by which the breed of cattle in Bengal can be improved. In the first place, he asks for the provision of suitable bulls. I am well aware of the fact that the existing number of bulls maintained by local bodies and Government for breeding purposes is hopelessly insufficient. Matters are therefore being put in train for providing stud-bulls throughout the province. But the matter is not without difficulty as conditions differ widely in the different parts of the province and we will have to take the local conditions into consideration in evolving a race of good milking and draught animals. I am therefore aiming at gradually starting a cattle farm in every district of Bengal where these questions will be studied. In the second place, he asks for the provision of grazing-grounds. I am afraid that Government can do little in this matter. As regards Government estates the Board of Revenue has issued instructions which, if followed, will ensure that grazing-grounds are maintained. In other estates, when a record-of-rights is prepared, if it is found that there is a communal right of grazing over certain lands, the fact is

recorded in the record-of-rights and a list of these lands is attached the record of each village. Beyond this Government cannot go. is out of the question that Government should assume the respons bility of providing grazing land for every village in the province ar it must confine itself to protecting as far as possible existing rights grazing. To me it appears that the setting apart of pasture lands grazing commons is no longer practicable from the economic stan point, and the only possible means of solving the fodder question the intensive cultivation of fodder crops and their storage.

The mover next proposes that the system of indigenous veterinar treatment should be encouraged. My first difficulty, Sir, is that I a not aware of the existence of any indigenous system of veterinary trea ment. There are simple remedies which the cultivators use for th commoner diseases of cattle, but there is nothing which can be calle a system or made the subject of encouragement by Government. A regards the mover's fourth proposal regarding the award of prizes, etc. for good cattle in *hâts* and *melas* I may mention that such encourag ment is given in cattle fairs and shows. I shall inquire and see if i would be possible to give such rewards and prizes on a more extende scale than at present.

Sir, I would like to assure the Council that Government are no neglecting the important question of improving the cattle of Bengal We have already got a trained staff of veterinary assistants an inspectors in the mufassal to treat cattle diseases and to educate th raiyat in the proper care and improvement of their stock. It is the polic of Government ultimately to provide two veterinary assistants—one itin erant and one stationary in each subdivision where there should also b a dispensary. In this respect we look up to the local bodies to giv effect to the scheme, and I trust that they will ere long give tangibl proof of their interest in the matter by increasing the number of veteri nary assistants and veterinary dispensaries.

I would welcome any practical scheme for the improvement of the cattle of Bengal, but I confess that the resolution does not throw freal light in the matter In the circumstances which I have explained I hope that the mover will not press his resolution but withdraw it.

Mr. PRASANNA DEB RAIKAT: I have not much to add to what I have already said. I fully realise the situation, but I beg to submit that unless we have proper grazing-grounds, the cattle-breeding canno be improved, and Government must see to this.

The motion was then put and carried.

The PRESIDENT: I am afraid I cannot proceed further with the list of non-official business. I now call upon the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr to make a statement in connection with the Assam-Bengal Railway strike.

Assam-Bengal Railway strike.

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of COMMERCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): I have been in communication with the members of this Council who come from the Chittagong Division regarding the strike on the Assam-Bengal Railway. They were exceedingly anxious that the resolution on this subject should be taken up out of its turn; but this was not found possible. In discussing the matter with them I communicated to them such information as I had on the subject. They said that much of the information was new to them and that it would be useful if I could make a statement in the Council on the subject. Accordingly I took His Excellency's approval to that course, and I have got your permission, Sir, to make this statement now.

I need not take up the time of the Council by going into the causes of the strike. Suffice it to say that, as it has been admitted both by the men themselves and by their leaders, the men came out in order to express disapproval of the action of the Government in connection with the repatriation of the coolies at Chandpur. At a later stage, certain economic grievances were also put forward; coupled with demands for strike pay and for the re-grant of the gratuities earned by the men previous to the strike. The Government of Bengal have, of course, no control over the Assam-Bengal Railway. That control rests with the Railway Board; but I have been in communication with the Railway Company, regarding these matters and on more than one occasion, I have brought the requests of the strikers and their representatives to the notice of the Railway Company. The Railway Company were unwilling to give way on any of these points, but they let it be known some weeks ago that they were willing to take back any of the strikers for whom they had vacancies. As a result of that the strikers have been dribbling back in considerable numbers. According to a telegram, which I received a few days ago from the Agent, the latest figures show that out of 8,000 men who went on strike last May, 3,500 have returned to work up to date. Approximately 3,400 new men have been appointed to vacancies on the line and there are therefore still 1,100 vacancies on the pre-strike establishment to be filled. The Railway Company have authorised me to say that they are still perfectly willing to take back any of their old employees for whom vacancies exist, but that they are still recruiting new men and it is desirable therefore that those persons who wish to take advantage of the Railway Company's offer should do so without delay. The strike may, therefore, be said to be practically over. The Railway Company have ample men to run the full service of trains at the present time. Their present difficulties arise from the attempts which are now being made to wreck trains on the railway line and which became so serious about a fortnight ago that the Railway Company had to stop night running. Unfortunately, we have not been able to apprehend the perpetrators of these dastardly acts;

so I have no right to blame the strikers or any body of persons. But I do say,-and I am sure the Council will agree with me, that the persons who are responsible for these outrages have been guilty of the most dastardly conduct. I can imagine no act more wicked than the act of a man who deliberately goes out at night to remove rails from a railway line in the certain knowledge that he is thereby risking the wrecking of a train carrying hundreds of innocent passengers, mostly his own fellow countrymen. I do not think the Council and the public realise how serious this train-wrecking business has become; since the end of May last there have been no less than 18 attempts in which fishbolts have actually been removed from rails on the line; and no less than 8 attempts took place in the first half of August. Fortunately in only two of these cases was the train actually derailed, but unfortunately one Indian passenger lost his life, while three others received serious injuries. It is only the mercy of Providence and the vigilance exercised by the Railway employees and the police which have prevented further loss of life. I am very glad that Mr. Gandhi, during his recent visit to Chittagong, has condemned these acts of "sabotage" in no uncertain voice; but there has been very little about it in the newspapers and now that the facts have been publicly stated, I trust that public opinion will manifest itself against the cowardly perpetrators of these crimes.

That, then, is the present situation. The strike is practically at an end and the only obstacle in the way of resumption of complete and safe running are these attempts at train-wrecking which will, I hope, be condemned in no uncertain voice by the public of this country. In these circumstances, there is no necessity for Government to intervene in the matter of the strike, but they will take all the steps that are possible to secure the safe running of the trains and the safety of the general public; and they feel that they are entitled to rely on public opinion to support them in their action.

Prorogation.

The PRESIDENT: His Excellency the Governor has declared the Council to be prorogued.

The members then dispersed.

B. S. Press—21-11-1921—2128J—2,006—F. T. R.

INDEX

TO

THE BENGAL LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL PROCEEDINGS.

(Official Report.)

VOLUME IV.—FOURTH SESSION.

August 29th to 31st, and September 1st, 2nd, 5th and 6th, 1921.

Abolition of Divisional Commissioners, 187.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone
Calcutta Police, 280.
Phuka on milch cows, 515, 516.
Royal visit, 122.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 534.
Women suffrage, 406, 407.

Afzal, Nawabzada K. M., Khan Bahadur
Dafadars and chaukidars, 17.
Malarious districts and subdivisions, 30.
Mortality in jails, 18.
Proficiency of members of the Indian Civil Service in Bengali and Urdu, 47.
Royal visit, 117.
Sheristadar of Dacca Collectorate, 29.
Sub-Deputy Collectors, 18.
Sub-Registrars, 28.
Unbearding of Muhammadan prisoners, 20.
Undergraduates rendering war service appointed as Sub-Deputy Collectors, 20.

Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin
Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill, 132.
Local Boards, 178.

Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin
Royal visit, 120
Typists and copyists, 254.
Woman suffrage, 448, 451.

Ahmed, Maulvi Azaharuddin
Bakrid disturbances, 20.
Mufassal Jurors, 21.
Muhammadan Marriage Registrars, 21.
Record suppliers, 4

Ahmed, Maulvi Emaduddin
Liquors and drugs, 302.
Local Boards, 176.
Royal visit, 120.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 478.
Typists and copyists, 261.
Woman suffrage, 454.

Ahmed, Munshi Jafar
Leave to District Judge, Noakhali, 440.

Ahmed, Maulvi Rafiuddin
Efficiency bar for Judicial officers, 347.

Ahmed, Maulvi Yakuinuddin
Calcutta University, 164.
Cattle-breeding in Bengal, 563.
Liquors and drugs, 304.
Royal visit, 119.
Woman suffrage, 341.

Aley, Mr. S. Mahboob
Sealdah Police Court, 514.
Woman suffrage, 403.

Ali, Maulvi A. H. M. Wazir
B.A. Examination, percentage of failures in classical language in 1921, 417.
Census office at Barisal, 447.
Indians and the Imperial Police Service, 366.
Muhammadans on the staffs of the Private Secretary and Military Secretary, 445.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 541.
Woman suffrage, 395.

Ali, Mr. Syed Erfan
Bengal Civil Service, 351.
Diet allowance in Medical College Hospital, 4.
School of Tropical Medicine, 9.
Study of English History in secondary schools, 427.
Withdrawal of Resolutions, 312.
Woman suffrage, 399.

Ali, Mr. Syed Nasim
Abolition of Divisional Commissioners 195.
Anti-malarial scheme for the 24-Parganas, 434.
Appointment of special constables at Hajigunj (Chandpur), 510.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 496.
Woman suffrage, 369, 371.

Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar
Typists and copyists, 263.

Arrests and Convictions
Due to drunkenness in Calcutta and its suburbs, 353.

Assam-Bengal Railway
Strikes on, 565.

Assistant Maulvies
Pay of, 186.

Assistant Secretaries, 359.

Assistant Superintendents of Police
Recruitment of, 545.

Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mohamed
Medical School, Dacca, 16.
Mitford Hospital, Dacca, 14, 15, 16.
Royal visit, 120.

Azimganj
Sub-Registry office, 25.

B.A. Examination
Percentage of failures in classical language in 1921, 417.

"Bakrid" disturbances, 20.

Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath
Amendment of the Calcutta Municipal Act, 41.
Anti-malarial scheme for the 24-Parganas, 434.
Bengal Village Self-Government Act, 1919, 501.
Charitable dispensary at Kotalpur, Bankura, 420.
Civil and military assistant surgeons, 3.
Dacca Medical School, 17.
Election and nomination of officials on local and district boards, 502.
Excessive death-rate in Bengal, 443.
Expenditure of the 24-Parganas District Boards on tanks and roads 421.
Filtered water-supply in Calcutta, 444
Grants to dispensaries, 427.
Grants to Local Boards for original works, 437.
Grievances of the people of Chamberia (Jessore), 434.
Local Boards, 179.
Malarious districts and subdivisions, 30.
Medical College Hospital—
Admission into, 507.
Admission of patients into, 443.
Cholera Ward, 39.
Cost per patient, Indian or European, and governing body, 35, 38.
Cottage Wards, 39.
Diet allowance, 4
Endowments and Trust Funds for, 441.
Nursing staff, 24.
Out-door work, 41.
Motor car stand under portico of, 24.
Medical practitioners of Munshiganj and Manikganj, 31.
Milk supply, 22.
Mitford Hospital, Dacca, 15, 16.
Municipal rates in Calcutta, 419.
Officers of the Public Health Department, 511.

Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath

Preventive measures taken for cholera during tea garden coolie migration in various centres in Bengal, 418.

Procedure for calling statistics of diseases, 418.

Roads in Dinajpur, 440.

Roads and road cess in Faridpur, 40.

School of Tropical Medicine, 9.

State Medical Faculty, 287.

Supply of quinine to dispensaries, 433

Ward Commissioners of the Tollygunge municipality, 42.

Weights in vogue in several districts, 361.

Woman suffrage, 386, 388, 394.

Banerjee, Rai Bahadur Abinash Chandra

Local Boards, 178.

Woman suffrage, 466.

Barisal

Census office at, 447.

Barma, Rai Sahib Panchanan

Woman suffrage, 464.

Barton, Mr. H.

Royal visit, 115.

Salaries of ministerial officers, 497.

Basu, Babu Jatindra Nath

Calcutta University, 2, 153.

Bengal Children Bill, 123.

Bengal Civil Service, 351.

Bengal Cotton Tracts

Survey of, 556.

Bengal Secretariat Press

Alleged differential treatment of employees in, 27.

Apprentice lino-operators, 26.

Confidential section, 26.

Bengal Village Self-Government Act, 1919.

Enforcement of, 501.

Bengali speeches

Reporting of, in the Legislative Council, 26.

Bhattacharji, Babu Hem Chandra

Bengal Secretariat Press—

Alleged differential treatment of employees of, 27.

Apprentice lino-operators, 26.

Confidential section, 26.

Chaukidari tax, 25.

Labour Unions, 364.

Payments to Press employees, 27.

Press strikes, 44.

Reporting of Bengali speeches in the Legislative Council, 26.

Royal visit, 121.

Work-houses, 44

Bills

Bengal Children Bill, 1921, 123.

Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill, 1921, 123

Bonarpara-Parbatipur

Proposed railway line, 416.

Book Depôt

Removal to Chetla of, 356

Bose, Mr. S. M.

Cinchona plantations, 12

Expenditure under 41—Civil Works—Public Works Department, 138

Scheme of Local Self-Government for Darjeeling district, 11

Woman suffrage, 313, 317, 472

Calcutta University Budget, 358.

Butwara fees, 42

Calcutta Electric Supply Corporation, 180

Calcutta Municipal Act

Amendment of the, 41

Calcutta Police, 264

Calcutta Technical Evening School, 431.

Calcutta University, 138.

Budget, 2, 358.

Financial transactions of the, 426.

Post-graduate staff of the, 415.

Cases

Expenditure incurred by Government in defence of, 518.

Cattle-breeding

in Bengal, 558

Census

Office at Barisal, 447.

Chairmen

Constitution of panel of, 1.

Chandpur

Coolie affairs, 345, 360.
Military guards at—and elsewhere on the Assam-Bengal Railway, 354.

Chauberia (Jessore)

Grievances of the people of, 434.

Chaudhuri, Babu Kishori Mohan

Abolition of Divisional Commissoners, 188.
Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill, 1921, 128.
Bengal Village Self-Government Act, 1919, 501.
Calcutta University, 163.
Educational service scheme, 9.
Financial position of Bengal, 477, 478
Lecturers and Demonstrators, 345.
Registration Department, 10.
Royal visit, 115.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 495.
Subordinate Educational Service, 9.
Vice-Chancellor, Dacca University, 413
Waterways on the Issurdih-Serajganj and Issurdih-Santahar lines, 344.
Woman suffrage, 407.

Chaudhuri, Babu Tankanath

Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill, 1921, 130, 135.
Local Boards, 175, 180.
Roads in Dinajpur, 440.
Royal visit, 116.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 534.
Woman suffrage, 410.

Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad

Cattle-breeding in Bengal, 563.
Royal visit, 121.
Woman suffrage, 463.

Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath

Anti-malarial scheme for the 24-Parganas, 434.
Arrests and convictions due to drunkenness in Calcutta and suburbs, 353.
Expenditure of the 24-Parganas District Boards on tanks and roads, 420.

Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath

Extra passenger traffic owing to extension of port limits, Calcutta, 43.
Ferry service in suburban areas of Calcutta, 362.
Licensing Boards (Excise), 352.
Liquors and drugs, 303.
Royal visit, 121.
Survey of Bengal Cotton Tracts, 556.
Woman suffrage, 334.

Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur

Amalgamation of Krishnagar Road and City stations, 348.
Arrests and convictions due to drunkenness in Calcutta and its suburbs, 353.
Bonarpara-Parbatipur. Proposed Railway line, 416.
Calcutta Technical Evening School, 432.
Cattle-breeding in Bengal, 563.
Demands for Grants, 522, 528.
Department of Industries, 428.
Expenditure under 41.—Civil Works—Public Works Department, 438.
Jute-lands, 11.
Licensing Boards (Excise), 353.
Light railway from Contai to Contai Road, 11.
Liquors and drugs, 305.
Passenger trains on Howrah-Burdwan Chord line, 344.
Railway station between Tarkeswar and Bahirkhund, 6.
Silk industry in Murshidabad, 357.
Survey of Bengal Cotton Tracts, 558.
Veterinary Service, 358.
Waterways on the Burdwan-Howrah Chord Railway, 355.
Waterways on the Issurdih-Serajganj and Issurdih-Santahar lines, 345.

Chaukidari tax, 25.

Chetla

Removal of Book Depôt to, 356.

Cholera

Preventive measures taken for—during tea garden coolie migration in various centres in Bengal, 418.

Cinchona plantations, 12.

Civil and Military Assistant Surgeons, 2.

Clerks, sub-jail, 46.

Committee

On budget estimates, 6.
On public accounts and next year's budget, 6.

Coolie affairs

At Chandpur, 345.

Copyists and typists, 254.

Dacca

Collectorate, Sheristadar of, 29.
Medical School, 16.
Officers of the—University, 415.
Vice-Chancellor of the—University, 413.

Dafadars and Chaukidars, 17.

Das, Babu Bhishmadev

Depressed classes, 350.
Drinking water on passenger steamers, 516.
Royal visit, 121.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 480.

Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra

Calcutta University, 169.
Committee on public accounts and next year's budget, 6.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 536
Withdrawal of Resolutions, 313.
Woman suffrage, 401.

De, Babu Fanindralal

Coolie affairs at Chandpur, 345
Increments to officers officiating in higher ranks, 504.
Inspectors of Bengal Police, 13.
Madaripur *bil* route embankment, 8
Subordinate staff of the Sundarbans area of the Irrigation Department, 4.

Death-rate

Excessive—in Bengal, 443.

Demands for Grants, 521.

Depressed classes, 350.

Department of Industries, 427.

Deputy Inspector-General

—and Second Assistant to the Inspector-General of Police, 520.

Deputy Superintendents of Police, 420.

Diet

Allowance in Medical College Hospital, 4.

Dinajpur

Roads in, 440.

Diseases

Procedure for calling statistics of, 418

Dispensaries

Grants to, 426
Supply of quinine to, 433.

District Boards

Election and nomination of officers on local and, 502

District Judge

Leave to—, Noakhali, 440.

Division Lists

Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill, 1921, 130, 137.
Calcutta Police, 285.
Calcutta University, 174
Liquors and drugs, 311.
Woman suffrage, 476.

Divisional Commissioners

Abolition of, 187

Doss, Rai Bahadur Pyari Lal

Woman suffrage, 459.

Drinking water

On passenger steamers, 516

Dutt, Mr. Ajoy Chunder

Calcutta Police, 264.
Charitable dispensary at Kotalpur, Bankura, 419.
Deputy Superintendents of Police, 420.
Ministers' salary, 46.
Municipal rates in Calcutta, 419.
Separation of judicial and executive services, 7.

Dutt, Rai Bahadur Dr. Haridhan

Calcutta Police, 275.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 538.

Dutta, Babu Annada Charan

Salaries of High Court ministerial officers, 544.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 493.
Typists and copyists, 260, 261.
Veterinary service, 357, 358.
Woman suffrage, 320.

Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan

Abolition of Divisional Commissioners, 189, 192.
Appointment of special constables at Hajigunj, Chandpur, 510.
Calcutta Police, 279.
Calcutta Technical Evening School, 431.
Calcutta University, 166, 168.
Government appointments of Rs. 1,000 and above, 364.
Military guards at Chandpur and elsewhere on the Assam-Bengal Railway, 354.
Recruitment of Assistant Superintendents of Police, 547.
Salaries of High Court ministerial officers, 544.
Salary of ministerial officers, 489.
Typists and copyists, 258.
Woman suffrage, 395.

Education, nautical, 45

Educational Institutions

and non-co-operation movement, 417
Educational Service scheme, 9.

Electric Supply Corporation, Calcutta, 180.

Embankments

Within prohibited areas, 503

Excise Licensing boards, 352

Expenditure

Incurred by Government in defence of cases, 518.
Under 41.—Civil Works—Public Works Department, 438.

Faridpur

Roads and road cess in, 40.

Ferry service

In suburban areas of Calcutta, 362.

Financial position of Bengal, 477.

Gaibandha

Witness shed at—Courts, 414.

Ghatak, Raj Sahib Nilmanie

Liquors and drugs, 304.

Ghose, Mr. D. C.

Calcutta University, 165, 174.
Medical College Hospital, out-door work, 40.
Royal visit, 113.
Woman suffrage, 376.

Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder

Calcutta University, 145, 146.
Recruitment of Assistant Superintendents of Police, 554.
Royal visit, 121.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 589.
Salaries of High Court ministerial officers, 543.
Woman suffrage, 318, 476.

Government appointments

Of Rs. 1,000 and above, 364.

Government Bills, 123.

Government servants

Resignation of—owing to the non-co-operation movement, 448.

Grants

To Local Boards for original works, 436.

Hajigunj

Appointment of special constables at—Chandpur, 510.

Haq, Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul-

Calcutta University, 166.
Officiating Deputy Superintendents of Police, 367.
Pay of assitant maulvis, 186, 187.
Woman suffrage, 372.

Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul

Azimganj Sub-Registry office, 25.
Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill, 1921, 138.
Liquors and drugs, 305.
Local Boards, 176, 180.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 497.

High Court

Salaries of ministerial officers, 541.

Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.

Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill, 1921, 128.

Howrah-Burdwan Chord line

Passenger trains on, 344.

Huq, Maulvi Ekramul
Royal visit, 121.

Hussain, Maulvi Mahammad Madassur
Calcutta Police, 281, 282.

Imperial and Bengal Police Services, 11.

Increments
To officers officiating in higher ranks, 504.

Indian Civil Service
Proficiency of members of the—in Bengali and Urdu, 47.

Industries
Department of, 427.

Inspector-General of Police
Deputy Inspector-General and Second Assistant to the, 520.

Inspectors of Bengal Police, 13.

Intoxicating liquors and drugs
Restriction on, 288.

Janah, Babu Sarat Chandra
Embankments within prohibited areas, 503.
Revaluation cess in Midnapore, 430.

Judicial officers
Efficiency bar for, 347.

Jute lands, 14.

Karim, Maulvi Abdul
Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill, 1921, 135, 137.

Karim, Maulvi Fazlal
Grants to Local Boards for original Works, 436.
Woman suffrage, 467.

Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.
Assam-Bengal Railway strike, 565.
Bengal Secretariat Press—
Alleged differential treatment of employees, 27.
Apprentice lino-operators, 27.
Confidential section, 26.
Calcutta Electric Supply Corporation, 180.

Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.
Committee on budget estimates, 6.
Committee on public accounts and next year's budget, 6.
Demands for Grants, 521, 522, 523.
Drinking water on passenger steamers, 517.
Extra passenger traffic owing to the extension of port limits, Calcutta, 43.
Ferry service in suburban areas of Calcutta, 363.
Financial position of Bengal, 477.
Increments to officers officiating in higher ranks, 504
Labour Unions, 364.
Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee and ministerial officers of the High Court, 426
Nautical Education, 45.
Payments to Press employees, 28.
Press strikes, 44
Record-suppliers, 4
Removal of Book Depôt to Chetla, 356.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 497, 500, 528
Work-houses, 44.

Khan, Babu Devendra Lal
Calcutta University, 145, 175.
Primary schools in Midnapore and Ghatal subdivisions, 346.

Khan, Maulvi Hamid-ud-din
Bonarpara-Parbatipur. Proposed railway line, 416.
Royal visit, 122.
Weights in vogue in several districts, 360.
Witness shed at Gaibandha Courts, 414.
Woman suffrage, 460.

Khan, Mr. Razaur Rahman
Liquors and drugs, 291.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 487.

Khulna
Distress in, 349.
Partition of Tauzi No. 127, 435.

Kotalpur
Charitable dispensary at—(Bankura), 419.

Krishnagar
Amalgamation of Krishnagar Road and City stations, 348.

Labour Unions, 364.

Lecturers and Demonstrators, 345.

Licensing Boards (Excise), 352.

Light Railway

From Contai to Contai Road, 10.

Liquors and Drugs, 288.

Local Boards, 175.

Grants to—for original works, 436.

Madaripur "bil" route embankment, 8.

Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble

Abolition of Divisional Commissioners, 197.
Appointment of ministerial officers by District officers, 505.
Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill, 1921, 126, 136, 138.
Butwara fees, 43.
Cinchona plantations, 13.
Demands for Grants, 521.
Embankments within prohibited areas, 504.
Khulna distress, 349.
Madaripur *bil* route embankment, 8.
Partition of Tauzi No. 127, Khulna 436.
Revaluation cess in Midnapore, 431.
Sheristadar of Dacca Collectorate, 29
Subordinate staff of the Sundarbans area of the Irrigation Department, 5
Well irrigation, 5

Makramali, Munshi

Salaries of ministerial officers, 492.

Malarious districts

and subdivisions, 30

Mallik, Babu Surendra Nath

Abolition of Divisional Commissioners, 194.
Calcutta Electric Supply Corporation, 185.
Calcutta Police, 283.
Calcutta University, 146, 149.
Calcutta University. Post-graduate staff of the, 415.
Cattle-breeding in Bengal, 562.
Coolie affairs at Chandpur, 360.
Dacca University. Officers of the, 415
Ministers' salary, 46.

Mallik, Babu Surendra Nath

Pay of European officers of the Imperial Police, 518.
Recruitment of Assistant Superintendents of Police, 545, 554.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 495.
Salaries of High Court ministerial officers, 544.
Typists and copyists, 258.
Woman suffrage, 380.

Marr, Mr. A.

Salaries of ministerial officers, 540.

Medical College

Admission into—, Calcutta, 507.

Medical College Hospital

Admission of patients into the Calcutta, 442.
Cholera ward, 38.
Cost per patient, Indian or European, and Governing Body, 35.
Cottage wards, 39.
Endowments and trust funds for th Calcutta, 441.
Motor car stand under, 24.
Nursing staff, 24.
Out-door work, 40.

Medical Practitioners

Of Munshiganj and Manikganj, 30.

Middle English Schools

Primary and—at Rangpur, 31.

Midnapore

Revaluation cess in, 430.

Milch-cows

Phuka on, 515.

Milk supply, 22.

Ministerial officers

Appointment of—by District officers, 505.
Salaries of, 478, 528, 541.
In Courts in Rajshahi Division, 33.
Salaries' Committee and ministerial officers of the High Court, 426.

Ministers' salary, 46.

Mitford Hospital, Dacca, 14, 15, 16.

Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra
Calcutta Police, 266.
Calcutta University, 152.
Department of Industries, 427.
Liquors and drugs, 301.
Public Health Department. Officers of the, 511.
Removal of Book Depôt to Chetla, 356.
Royal visit, 115.
Waterways on the Burdwan-Howrah Chord railway, 355.
Woman suffrage, 340.

Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
Azimganj Sub-Registry office, 25.
Calcutta University, 145, 170, 171.
Calcutta University Budget, 2, 358.
Calcutta University, Post-Graduate Staff, 416.
Dacca University officers, 415.
Educational institutions and non-co-operation movement, 418.
Educational service scheme, 10.
Financial transactions of the Calcutta University, 426.
Lecturers and demonstrators, 346.
Muhammadan Marriage Registrars, 21
Pay of assistant maulvis, 186.
Presidency College. Admission into, 506.
Primary and Middle English Schools at Rangpore, 32.
Primary schools in Midnapore and Ghatal subdivisions, 347.
Registration Department, 10.
Study of English History in secondary schools, 427.
Subordinate Educational Service, 9.
Sub-Registrars, 29.
Vice-Chancellor, Dacca University, 413.

Moitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath
Calcutta Medical College—
Admission into, 507.
Admission of patients into, 442.
Cholera ward, 38.
Cost per patient, Indian or European, and Governing Body of, 35, 38.
Cottage wards, 39.
Endowments and Trust Funds for the, 441.
Calcutta University, 153.
Civil and Military Assistant Surgeons, 2.
Roads and Road Cess in Faridpur, 40.
Royal visit, 122.
Woman suffrage, 337.

Mortality in Jails, 18.

Motor car
Stand under Medical College Hospital, 24.

Mufassal Jurors, 21.

Muhammadan Marriage Registrars, 21.

Muhammadans
On the staffs of the Private Secretary and Military Secretary, 445.

Mukharji, Babu Satish Chandra
Salaries of ministerial officers, 483, 541.
Travelling allowances to Sub-Inspectors of Police, 435.

Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhon
Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill, 1921, 131.
Cadre of higher police service, 348.
Calcutta University, 165
Liquors and drugs, 310.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 538
Woman suffrage, 332.

Mukherji, Professor S. C.
Calcutta Police, 285
Calcutta University, 160, 162, 168.
Liquors and drugs, 288, 290
Royal visit, 115
Woman suffrage, 393, 394

Mullick, Babu Nirode Behary
Royal visit, 115.

Municipal rates
Calcutta, 419.

Murshidabad
Silk Industry in, 357.

Nasker, Babu Hem Chandra
Assistant Sub-Inspectors of Police, 353.
Calcutta University Budget, 358.
Deputy Inspector-General and Second Assistant to the Inspector-General of Police, 520.
Financial transactions of the Calcutta University, 426.
State Medical Faculty, 286, 288.

Nautical Education, 45.

Noakhali
Leave to District Judge, 440.

Non-co-operation movement

Educational institution and, 417.
Resignation of Government servants owing to the, 448.

Pahlowan, Maulvi Muhammad Abdul Jubbar

Salaries of ministerial officers, 497.
Woman suffrage, 409.

Pal, Rai Bahadur Radha Charan

Amendment of the Calcutta Municipal Act, 41.
Appointment of special constables at Hajigunj (Chandpur), 510.
Calcutta Police, 276, 277.
Cattle-breeding in Bengal, 562.
Grievances of the people of Chauberia (Jessore), 434.
Royal visit, 119.
Salaries of High Court ministerial officers, 543, 544.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 538.
Typists and copyists, 260.
Women suffrage, 454.

Passenger trains

On Howrah-Burdwan Chord line, 344.

Pay

Of assistant maulvis, 186.
Of European officers of the Imperial Police, 518.

"Phuka"

On milch cows, 515.

Police

Assistant Sub-Inspectors of, 353.
Cadre of higher police service, 348.
Calcutta, 264.
Court, Sealdah, 514.
Deputy Superintendents of Police (Officiating), 367.
Indians and the Imperial Police Service, 366.
Pay of European officers of the Imperial, 518.
Recruitment of Assistant Superintendents of, 545.
Service, Provincial, 501.

Port limits, Calcutta

Extra passenger traffic owing to extension of, 43.

Presidency College

Admission into, 505.

President

Calcutta Police, 276.
Calcutta University, 144, 145, 146, 147, 155, 157, 159, 162, 165, 171, 174.
Cattle-breeding in Bengal, 564.
Liquors and drugs, 291, 311.
Recruitment of Assistant Superintendents of Police, 545.
Resolutions, 528.
Salaries of High Court ministerial officers, 543, 544, 545.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 483, 487, 494, 500, 538, 541.
Woman suffrage, 317, 323, 325, 331, 371, 403, 407, 410, 411, 451, 452, 458, 464, 472, 475, 476.

Press

Bengal Secretariat—confidential section, 26.
Employees. Payments to, 27.
Strikes, 44.

Primary schools

Middle English and—at Rangpur, 31.
In Midnapore and Ghatal subdivisions 346.

Provincial Police Service, 501.

Public Health Department

Officers of, 511.

Public Works Department

Expenditure under 41.—Civil Works, 438.

Quinine

Supply of—to dispensaries, 433.

Rae, Mr. W. R.

Royal visit, 119.

Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-

Bengal Children Bill, 1921, 123.
The Bengal Land-Registration (Amendment) Bill, 1921, 123.
Census office at Barisal, 447
Demands for Grants, 521.
Efficiency bar for judicial officers, 347.
Expenditure incurred by Government in defence of cases, 518.
Ministerial officers in Courts in Rajshahi Division, 33.

Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-

Mortality in Jails, 18.
Mufassal Jurors, 22.
Salaries of High Court ministerial officers, 543.
Sub-Jail clerks, 46.
Typists and copyists, 262.
Unbearding of Muhammadan prisoners, 20.
Witness shed at Gaibandha Courts, 414
Witness shed at Rangpur Courts, 356.

Raikat, Mr. Prasanna Deb

Cattle-breeding in Bengal, 558, 564.

Railway station between Tarkeswar and Bahirkhand, 6.

Railway strike

Assam-Bengal, 565.

Rajbansis of Rangpur, 5.

Rajshahi

Ministerial officers in Courts in Division, 33.

Rangpur

Primary and Middle English Schools at, 31.
Witness sheds in—Courts, 356

Rauf, Maulvi Shah Abdur

Assistant Secretaries, 359
Election and nomination of officials on local and district boards, 502
Grants to dispensaries, 426.
Ministerial officers in Courts in Rajshahi Division, 33
Primary and Middle English Schools at Rangpur, 31.
Typists and copyists, 259.
Witness sheds in Rangpur Courts, 356.

Ray, Babu Surendra Nath

Committee on budget estimates, 6
Expenditure incurred by Government in defence of cases, 518.
Liquors and drugs, 299.
Recruitment of Assistant Superintendents of Police, 551.
Royal visit, 115.
Salaries of High Court ministerial officers, 542.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 480.
Woman suffrage, 452.

Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar

Abolition of Divisional Commissioners, 201.
Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill, 1921, 124, 129.
Bataera fees, 42.
Calcutta Police, 268.
Calcutta University, 162.
Demands for grants, 524.
Recruitment of Assistant Superintendents of Police, 549.
Royal visit, 115.
Woman suffrage, 323, 325, 404, 451, 475

Ray, Mr. Bijoy Prosad Singh

Imperial and Bengal Police Services, 11.
Jute lands, 11.
Light Railway from Contai to Contai Road, 10.
Provincial Police Service, 501.
Travelling allowance of Sub-Inspectors of Police, 414
Woman suffrage, 400.

Ray, Mr. Tarit Bhusan

Medical practitioners of Munshiganj and Manikganj, 30

Ray, Rai Bahadur Upendra Lall

Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill, 1921, 136, 137
Passenger trains on Howrah-Burdwan Chord line, 314
Royal visit, 122
Typists and copyists, 261.
Woman suffrage, 404

Ray Chaudhuri, Babu Brojendra Kishor

Milk supply, 22.
Motor car stand under Medical College Hospital portico, 24.
Nursing staff, Medical College Hospital, 24.

Ray Chaudhuri, Mr. Krishna Chandra

Royal visit, 120.
Typists and copyists, 259, 263.
Woman suffrage, 325, 395.

Ray Choudhury, Raja Manmatha Nath

Abolition of Divisional Commissioners, 195.
Liquors and drugs, 300.
Royal visit, 116.
Woman suffrage, 384.

Record suppliers, 4.

Recruitment

Assistant Superintendents of Police, 545.

Registration Department, 10.

Resignation

Of Government servants owing to the non-co-operation movement, 448.

Resolutions, 138, 254.

Withdrawal of, 312.

Roads and road cess

Faridpur, 40.

Royal visit, 113.

Roy, Babu Jogendra Krishna

Educational institutions and non-co-operation movement, 417.
Nautical education, 45.
Resignation of Government servants owing to the non-co-operation movement, 448.
Salaries of ministerial officers, 494.

Roy, Babu Jogendra Nath

Local Boards, 177.
Partition of Tauzi No. 127, Khulna, 435
Woman suffrage, 458.

Roy, Babu Nalini Nath

Woman suffrage, 405.

Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra

Amalgamation of Krishnagar Road and City Stations, 348.

Roy, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh

Death-rate in Bengal, 443.
Preventive measures taken for cholera during tea garden coolie migration in various centres in Bengal, 418.
Procedure for calling statistics of diseases, 418.
Well irrigation, 5.
Woman suffrage, 378, 403.

Roy, Raja Manilall Singh

Calcutta Police, 279.
Local Boards, 176.
Railway station between Tarkeswar and Bahirkhand, 6.
Royal visit, 120.
Woman suffrage, 331, 466.

Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Saifaja Nath

Khulna distress, 349.
Supply of quinine to dispensaries, 433.
Woman suffrage, 470.

Salaries

High Court ministerial officers, 541.
Ministerial officers, 478, 528.
Ministers', 46.

Salaries Committee

Ministerial officers, and ministerial officers of the High Court, 426.

Sarkar, Babu Jogesh Chandra

Rajbansis of Rangpur, 5.
Sub-Jail clerks, 46.

Sarkar, Babu Rishindra Nath

Calcutta University, 138, 158, 174.
Coolie affairs at Chandpur, 360.
Filtered water-supply in Calcutta, 444.
Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee and ministerial officers of the High Court, 426.
Presidency College. Admission into, 505.
Salaries of High Court ministerial officers, 541, 544.
Ward Commissioners of the Tollygunge Municipality, 41.

Scheme of local self-government

Darjeeling district, 11.

School of Tropical Medicine, 9.

Sealdah

Police Court, 514.

Secondary Schools

Study of English History in, 427.

Separation

Judicial and Executive services, 7.

Silk Industry

Murshidabad, 357.

Sinha, Babu Surendra Narayan

Local Boards, 177.
Ministerial officers—
Appointment by District Officers of, 505.
Salaries of, 494.
Silk industry in Murshidabad, 357.
Woman suffrage, 411.

Special Constables
Appointment of—at Hajiganj (Chandpur), 510.

Stark, Mr. H. A.
Woman suffrage, 333.

State Medical Faculty, 286.

Sub-Deputy Collectors, 18.

Sub-Inspectors of Police
Travelling allowance of, 414, 435.

Sub-Jail clerks, 46.

Subordinate Educational Service, 9.

Subordinate staff
Sunderbans area of the Irrigation Department, 4.

Sub-Registrars, 28.

Suhrawardy, Dr. A.
Calcutta Police, 276.
Calcutta University, 155, 157, 158, 159, 160.
Woman suffrage, 329, 331.

Suhrawardy, Dr. Hassan
Salaries of ministerial officers, 487
Woman suffrage, 455.

Suhrawardy, Mr. Huseyn Shaheed
Calcutta University, 145, 147, 148, 175
Salaries of ministerial officers, 535
Woman suffrage, 390

Survey
Bengal Cotton tracts, 556.

Tauzi No. 127
Partition of—, Khulna, 435.

Tollygunge
Ward Commissioners of the—Municipality, 41.

Travelling allowance
Sub-Inspectors of Police, 414.

Typists and copyists, 254.

Unbearding of Muhammadan prisoners, 20.

Undergraduates rendering war service
Appointment as Sub-Deputy Collectors, 20.

Veterinary service, 357.

Vice-Chancellor
Dacca University, 413.

Water-supply
Filtered—in Calcutta, 444.

Waterways
On the Burdwan-Howrah-Cho 355.
On the Ishurdih-Serajganj and Ishurdih-Santahar lines, 344.

Watson-Smyth, Mr. R. M.
Calcutta Police, 282.

Weights
In vogue in several districts, 360.

Well irrigation, 5.

Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry
Appointment of special constables at Hajiganj (Chandpur), 510, 511.
Assistant Secretaries, 359.
Assistant Sub-Inspectors of Police, 354.
Bakrid disturbances, 21.
Bengal Civil Service, 352
Cadre of higher police service, 348
Calcutta Police, 270, 277
Chaukidari tax, 25.
Coolie affairs at Chandpur, 345, 360.
Dafadars and chaukidars, 17.
Demands for grants, 522, 523, 526.
Depressed classes, 351
Deputy Inspector-General and Second Assistant to the Inspector-General of Police, 521
Deputy Superintendents of Police, 367, 420.
Government appointments of Rs. 1,000 and above, 365.
Imperial and Bengal Police Services, 11.
Indians and the Imperial Police Service, 366.
Inspectors of Bengal Police, 13
Leave to District Judge, Noakhali, 441.
Military guards at Chandpur and elsewhere on the Assam-Bengal Railway, 355.
Ministers' salary, 47.
Muhammadans on the staffs of the Private Secretary and Military Secretary, 445.
Pay of European officers of the Imperial Police, 519.

Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry

Phuka on milch cows, 516.
Proficiency of members of the Indian Civil Service in Bengali and Urdu, 47.
Provincial Police Service, 501.
Rajbansis of Rangpur, 5.
Recruitment of Assistant Superintendents of Police, 551.
Reporting of Bengali speeches in the Legislative Council, 26.
Resignation of Government servants owing to the non-co-operation movement, 448.
Salaries of High Court ministerial officers, 545.
Sealdah Police Court, 515.
Separation of Judicial and Executive services, 7.
Scheme of Local Self-Government for Darjeeling District, 12.

Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry

Sub-Deputy Collectors, 18.
Travelling allowance to Sub-Inspectors of Police, 414, 435.
Undergraduates rendering war service appointed as Sub-Deputy Collectors, 20.
Woman suffrage, 328, 475.

Witness shed

At Garbandha Courts, 414.

Woman suffrage, 313, 369, 448.

Work-houses, 44.

24-Parganas

Anti-malarial scheme for the, 434.
Expenditure of the—District Board on tanks and roads, 420.

B.S Press—24-4-1922—4081J—2,006—R D'S